Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences: Bi-Annual

PATRON
Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan
Vice Chancellor, University of Karachi
Karachi, Pakistan

EDITOR
Nasreen Aslam Shah

ADVISORY BOARD
Prof. Dr. M. Nizamuddin
Chairman, Higher Education Commission, Punjab, Pakistan

Prof. Dr. Profulla C. Sarker
Pro-Vice Chancellor,
European University of Bangladesh

Professor Dr. Mehtab & Karim
Vice Chancellor
Malir University of Science & Technology, Karachi, Pakistan

Asutosh Pradhan
Associate Professor
School of Social Sciences
Central University of Himachal Pradesh, India

Kazuyo Yamane
Professor
Ritsumeikan University, Japan

Steven M. Sharidlow
Professor in Social Work
Head of the School of Public Policy & Professional Practice
Keele University, UK

Amara Soontherndhada
Associate Professor
Institute for Population and Social Research
Mahidol University, Thailand

Timothy Stainton
Professor and Director
UBC School of Social Work & Centre for Inclusion and Citizenship
2080 West Mall
Vancouver, BC, Canada

Israil Baba
Professor
Social Work Programme
School of Social Development
College of Arts & Science
University of Utara, Malaysia

Nazmunnisa Mahtab
Professor, Department of Women and Gender Studies
University of Dhaka
Dhaka 1000, Bangladesh

Nasem Ahmad Khan
Assistant Professor
Department of Social Work
Aligarh Muslim University (A.M.U)
India

Nasreen Aslam Shah
Dean, Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Price Per Copy:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Surface Mail</th>
<th>Air mail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>US$35.00</td>
<td>US$40.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic</td>
<td>US$30.00</td>
<td>US$35.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Articles published in PJASS do not represent the views of the Editors or Advisory Board. Authors are solely responsible for the opinion expressed and accuracy of the data.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We are obliged for the financial assistance of Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan for publishing the 9th volume of Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences.
Pak Journal of Applied Social Sciences

Volume-9

March, 2019

CONTENTS

Nasreen Aslam Shah

Editor’s Note

1

Ansar Waseem & Yasir Rashid

Exploring the Role of Phronesis in Social Innovation: A Case Study of Dr. Ruth Pfao

1

Iram Batool, Muhammad Saqib & Abdul Sattar Ghaffari

Attitude towards Third Gender: A Case Study of Southern Punjab, Pakistan

19

Noor Elahi

Changing Dynamics of Gendered Livelihoods Practices in Post Crises of Swat Northwest Pakistan

37

Rana Saba Sultan, Nadil Shah & Ambreen Fazal

Gender Representation in Public Schools Textbooks of Balochistan

55

Siraj Bashir, Muhammad Arshad & Sadia Barech

Local Communities Participation in China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): The Case of Balochistan

71
Editor’s Note:

We are pleased and enthusiastic about presenting the ninth volume of Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences. It is not an easy task to maintain and preserve academic publishing. To maintain the quality and consistency of an academic journal multifarious challenges are faced. But it is possible with the warm welcome and appreciation of students and faculty of the Department of Social Work, from its alumnae and from friends around the country. The task before us is not easy; indeed we confront multifarious challenges: from collecting the much needed financial resources to securing crucial human assistance and help. I am glad to report that the initial seven volumes generated an unprecedented interest among the social scientists, researchers and authors. This is amply evidenced first by the diversity of topics of papers published in these volumes and secondly by the institutional affiliation of the authors. This journal mainly focuses on the diversity of research topics to highlights social, economic and political issues.

The Journal is bi-lingual, publishing papers in Urdu as well as in the English language. It reflects one of the challenges that the academia in Pakistan confronts at every step- in writing a research dissertation, teaching in a class-room, or even in everyday encounters. Thus, the Journal is close to the reality of the academic life of Pakistan.

This volume contains total six articles, five articles in English and one article in Urdu which we believe you will read with great interest. The articles examine various social and economic issues. The topic ranges from linking up the theory with social work practices as a case study of Ruth Pfao to behaviour of society towards transgender. It also focus on livelihood practices in post crises areas of Pakistan and participation of local communities in CPEC.

I would like to thank the esteemed academicians and researchers who submitted articles, and the referees, who kindly devoted their valuable time. Higher Education Commission (HEC) has recognized PJASS in “Z” category. To further improve the quality of the journal we are continuing our efforts. We are also thankful to the generous support and patronage of our Honourable Vice Chancellor, Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan who has supported us in our work at every step.
Exploring The Role Of Phronesis In Social Innovation: A Case Study Of Dr. Ruth Pfau

Ansar Waseem

&

Yasir Rashid

School of Business & Economics

University of Management & Technology, Lahore

Abstract

Although recent literature on social innovation proclaims its virtue in addressing unmet social needs. Yet little is known about the relationship between phronesis and social innovation. This paper aims to explore how a social entrepreneur uses phronesis in addressing a social problem. Taking case study as qualitative research inquiry, this paper uses the interviews and life account of Dr. Ruth Pfau (Late) on how she incorporated her phronesis in treating patients suffering from leprosy. The empirical evidences collected were analyzed using GIOIA data analysis. The results of the data analysis show that a social entrepreneur employs his/her practical wisdom, experiential knowledge, and value judgment in combating a social issue, and in doing so, uses phronesis in addressing a social problems and creating social innovation.

Keywords: Phronesis; Practical Wisdom; Value Judgement; Social Innovation.
Introduction

Social innovation is a remedy to deal with the ‘wicked problems’ (Desouza & Smith, 2014) faced by deprived section of community. These are extra ordinary initiatives taken by seemingly ordinary people to tackle the problem faced by them or their fellows (Baker & Mehmood, 2015). Social innovation is the process of designing and implementation new and creative ways to solve a social problem or fulfilling some previously unmet social need(s). It attempts to achieve workable new ideas and approach which help in achieving social goals or addressing a social challenge in a new way (Lyon, 2012; Manzini, 2014). According to Bulut, Eren, & Halac (2013) social innovation has three characteristics. First, the innovation is created to meet a social need. Second this innovation should produce a change in society, and third it should be readily acceptable for all stakeholders. Social innovation is the journey towards a better world (Reinstaller, 2013).

Phronesis of social innovator may prove to be beneficial in ensuring social inclusion of the special children. Aristotle coined the term *phronesis* in his book *Nicomachean Ethics* which is regarded as a comprehensive work in the role of ethics during human action (Noel, 1999). Phronesis is described as “wise practical reasoning” (Eisner, 2002). However, what set phronesis apart from other forms of knowledge are its emphasis values and ethics. Phronesis emphasizes on the action which ought to be an “ethically practical action” (Grint, 2007). It is believed to be the ability to take action rather than being just a body of knowledge. Thus it can be considered as an experiential knowledge. Phronesis appreciates the sensitivity of context, and deals with application of value judgment in particular situation at hand.

There are a number of social problems which are prevalent in underdeveloped countries. Unfortunately, governments of these do little work in combating these issues. Accordingly, the private sector has to step forward and fill this void. Being an action oriented field, social innovation can benefit from the application of phronesis and value judgment of social entrepreneurs. These social entrepreneurs are motivated by their value judgment and their propensity for common good. However, literature is silent about regarding the role of phronesis in social innovation. Less is known how a social innovator employs his value judgment and experiential knowledge in bringing about a social innovation. This leads to an important yet unattended question in research becomes: How social innovator uses experiential knowledge and value judgment in social innovation initiative? And in doing so, how phronesis can be helpful in addressing a social problems and creating social innovation?
The objective of this study is twofold: To explore the role of phronesis of social entrepreneur in social innovation, and how these knowledgeable agents applies their practical knowledge and value judgment in combating a social problem? For this, a qualitative research inquiry using case study methodology is used. To study social innovation in Pakistan, there is no better person than Late Dr. Ruth Pfau. Known as Mother Teresa of Pakistan, she was instrumental in bringing down leprosy to a controlled level. The data is collected through interviews conducted by different people with Dr. Ruth Pfau which are readily available on internet. The data collected through the interview is analyzed using the GIOIA data analysis which complements ground theory methodology. This type of data analysis is helpful in determining first and second order themes which are then distilled into aggregated themes using an inductive approach.

Researchers, practitioners and governments started to take interest in social innovation during 1990s because of weak global and domestic economy (de Bruin & Shaw, 2013). Despite being a buzz word, umbrella term or container concept, the field of social innovation is generally underexplored and a great deal of work can be done in this field (Chalmers, 2013; Phillips et al, 2015; Reinstaller, 2013). This research strengthens the literature on social innovation by providing evidence that it is “more than a discursive fad” (Sinclair & Baglion, 2014, p. 470). Majority of studies claims that social innovation spreads in a society through social enterprises. As such the extant literature focuses on the role of for-profit and non-profit organizations in diffusion of social innovation, an important premises is often missed i.e. what motivates social innovator in satisfying social need. Secondly, the specific traits of social innovators are often neglected i.e. what prompts these people to engage in social activities. This study proposes that the value judgment and ethical consideration of these people urges these people to concentrate on social issue in lieu of traditional economic activities.

**Literature Review**

**Social Innovation: Tackling Social Problems**

Social innovations are ventures developed by those organizations whose primary purpose is social, and they come up with innovative ideas to meet a social need. Similar to technical innovation, social innovation are conceived by an individual or a group of individuals when they confront a social problem and realize a dire need to find innovative solutions for it (Westley et al, 2014). However contrary to technical innovation, social innovation desires to produce long term outcomes that are important for the entire society (Bekkers, Tummers & Voorberg, 2013). Therefore, social innovation has emerged as a mean to produce change in the
society, and transform “basic routines, resource and authority flows and beliefs of any social system” (Westley & Antadze, 2010, p. 2) to meet some social goals.

Social innovation became popular among social scientists, researchers, practitioners and governments in 1990s (Sinclair & Baglion, 2014). Since then, social innovation programs are on the rise and are expected to grow because of the on-going economic crises, budget constraint, economic stagnation, austerities, and lesser spending of the government on social welfare projects. Moreover, prolong periods of recession has severely hit the profit of corporate enterprise limiting corporate philanthropy. In some countries, this has created divide, exclusion, and inequality in the society. There is growing concern that the old practices to address these problems have failed miserably (Urama & Acheampong, 2013). The need for social innovation has risen from people’s suffering in the deprived areas, unemployment, closure of factories, and lack of government support (Baker & Mehmood, 2015). Now society as a whole is engaging in social innovation to deal with social and economic challenges in order to make real changes in people’s life. At micro level, social innovation is aimed at improving standard of living, quality of life, and enhancing capabilities of individuals; while at macro level it attempts to change social norms and culture to combat inequality and injustice; thereby producing a sustainable development.

Social enterprise, social innovation and social entrepreneurship lie at the extreme end of private sector continuum (Phillips et al, 2015). The locus of social innovation has changed considerably over the last decade. Instead of relying on state-sponsored ventures to answer social problems, social innovation programs developed by the civil society are now gaining prominence (Chalmers, 2013). A number of stakeholders are involved in the process of social innovation but the most pertinent ones include social activists or third sector, and Schumpeterian social entrepreneurs (Edwards-Schachter, Matti, & Alcantara, 2012). Individuals have become torch bearers of driving social change by establishing social enterprises that blend social and commercial purpose of the organization. Thus, “the concept of social innovation pays attention to the individual embedded in social groups and focuses on the collective responses to social problems as a way to reinforce these capabilities” (Miquel, Cabeza & Anglada, 2013, p. 156).

Social innovation is an umbrella term and a number of different approaches come under its purview. A number of concepts such as social entrepreneurship, social innovation, third sector organizations, community initiative, social movement, social economy, come under the umbrella term of social innovation (Cajaiba-Santana, 2014; Sinclair & Baglion, 2014). The concepts of social innovation has been explored from different domains of social sciences such as sociology,
management, business administration, public policy, political sciences, social entrepreneurship, urban and regional development, and human development economics (Ruede & Lurtz, 2012). For example, Pol and Ville (2009) have conceptualized the literature social innovation in four overlapping approaches. In the first approach, the social innovation is identical with institutional change as it tries to modify the cultural, normative and regulatory structure of these public institutions. The second conceptualization concentrates on improving the quality and quantity of life through social innovation. The third strand emphasizes on public welfare and good while the last one entails the role of social innovation in satisfying those social needs which are neglected by civic organizations and market.

Phronesis: The Revival of Aristotle’s Moral Judgment

Aristotle in his seminal work *Nicomachean Ethics* coined the term phronesis. Nonaka & Toyama (2007) define phronesis as “the ability to determine and undertake the best action in a specific situation to serve the common good”. Since, there is no direct translation of the work Phronesis in English, therefore, different authors have used terms to explain phronesis. Noel (1999) uses terms such as practical reasoning, moral insight, and moral discernment to explain phronesis, along with a range of interpretations for phronesis like ‘state of capacity’ and ‘characteristic of a person’. Grint (2007) declare phronesis as moral knowledge whereas Saugstad (2005) considers it as practical knowledge. Nonaka and Holden (2007) closely equates phronesis with prudence and practical wisdom, while Halverson (2004) considers it as ‘experiential knowledge’. Breier and Ralphs (2009) have complemented these descriptions with terms like practical judgment and intelligence.

Phronesis is generally regarded as moral form of knowledge which stems from virtues of character. As Aristotle (1999) describes it “The agent also must be in a certain condition when he does them; in the first place he must have knowledge, secondly he must choose the acts, and choose them for their own sakes, and thirdly his action must proceed from a firm and unchangeable character.”

Therefore, ability to make moral judgment about the common goodness is the core characteristics of phronesis (Nonaka & Toyama, 2007). Moral component of phronesis focuses on the pursuing good quality life by taking into consideration wider good for community (Breier & Ralphs, 2009). It is a conscious attempt to reach *Éudaimonia* (happiness) by focusing on the greater cause. It calls for virtues of character and thoughts, rising beyond personal interest and do task which is good for all (Grint, 2007). Gallagher (2007) holds the view that a person having the moral agency possesses the capacity of phronesis.
Phronesis is action oriented (Flyvbjerg, 2004; Grint, 2007; Surprenant, 2012) based on the character of a person, experiential knowledge and practical wisdom. Phronesis is high level of tacit knowledge which enables a person to make practical decision based on the moral and ethical values (Nonaka & Toyama, 2007). It is basically exercise of skills which cannot be fully described. It deals with the practical rationality and judgment of a person which is in turn related with experience in a particular domain. For this reason, phronesis cannot be taught (Breier & Ralphs, 2009) since there is no formula to learn moral judgment and prudence (Grint, 2007). Wisdom is only be learned through experience and a person becomes wise when he passes through difficult and vague situations (Schwartz & Sharpe, 2006).

Phronesis, just like expertise and wisdom, is a highly context dependent as oppose to episteme which is context free (Grint, 2007). Phronesis pertains with the particulars (Aristotle, 1999). Gallagher (2007) believes that the target of phronesis is the person itself, who works as a moral practitioner in very particular situation. Instead of developing overarching principles or rules and procedures; phronesis deals with the ability to adjust knowledge of the possessor to particular situation (Halverson, 2004). Phronesis insists that expertise should be used within a particular context for collective good. This means that the moral knowledge should be adjusted to the particular demands of the situation at hand. It is imperative for a phronetic practitioner (the one who is excising phronesis) that he must understand the unique characteristics of the situation in which she is operating. This calls for ‘emotional attunement’ and ‘spontaneous action’ to adjust with the idyonsnecracy of the situation (Shotter & Tsoukas, 2014).

**Research Design**

Identifying and using a suitable research methodology is essential for execution of a successful research (Cho & Lee, 2014). However, the choice of research methodology is contingent upon the researcher’s belief about nature of reality. In this study, we are assuming a relativist stance. We are refuting the existence of an objective reality. Rather we are taking subjectivist epistemological position believing that there can be multiple realities which are social constructed and vary with person to person (Mills, Bonner, & Francis, 2006). For the purpose of this study, our focus is on social innovation, which is ontologically and epistemologically different from technical innovation. As social innovation is a social process, the breadth and width of the concept cannot be captured by statistical techniques (de Bruin & Shaw, 2013). In addition, phronesis is also lived experienced of the individual. Hence, it is hard to measure phronesis in term of quantitative research and positivist paradigm.
There are different research approaches available within qualitative paradigm, but this study employs case study methodology. A case study “investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; when the boundaries between the phenomenon and context are not clearly evident; and in which multiple sources of evidence are used” (Yin, 1989, p. 23). The term case in a case study involves an individual, an entity, an organization, a feature or even a unit of analysis (Noor, 2008). Case study pertains with the study of practice that makes it easier to study phenomena such as social innovation and phronesis. Moreover, case study yields context bound knowledge which makes it suitable for studying phronesis as the latter is also highly context dependent. As stated above, Dr Ruth Pfau and her achievement in bringing leprosy in Pakistan to a controlled level is the case for this study. As Dr Ruth Pfau passed away on 10th August 2017, it is not possible to conduct an interview with her. But, her interviews conducted by different people are readily available on internet. For this study, we are using these interviews to collect empirical evidence.

Data Analysis

The data collected was analyzed through GIOIA data analysis developed by Denis A. Gioia and colleagues. This method provides an impression of qualitative rigour to the readers by representing results with the help of visual aids (Gioia, Corley & Hamilton, 2013). Data analysis starts with first order analysis by staying faithful with the terms used by the informants. Different interviews of Dr. Ruth Pfau available on internet were analysed to find different first order categories. These were then labelled by using the words and phrases of the informant.

Then the researcher, being a knowledgeable agent, analysed the statements of informants in the light of the contextual factors and theoretical concepts to distil first order categories into second order themes. The interviews were listened again and again to achieve better understanding. Due to this analysis, different second order themes are generated. As compared to first order categories, the second themes are at higher level of abstraction. These second order categories are possible answer to our research questions. From these second order themes aggregated dimensions were driven inductively (Nag & Gioia, 2012) which correspondence with both the major concepts in the study.

All these findings are presented with the help of visual aid termed as data structure (Gioia, Corley, & Hamilton, 2013). This makes it easier to understand how findings have been obtained from the data. Figure No 1 shows the results of the data analysis.
Figure No 1: Data Structure

First Order Categories

- Early death of brother encouraged me to become a doctor [so that other may be prevented].
- After visiting leper colony decided that I can’t leave these people.

Second Order Themes

- Propensity for common good
- Value judgment
- Experiential knowledge and practical wisdom

Aggregated Dimension

- First Order Categories
- Second Order Themes
- Aggregated Dimension

Phronesis

- Experience of misery of Second World War
- Went to India to learn about treatment for leprosy.
- Even now, learned and tested new treatment

Value judgment

- they (patient) have such as miserable life at least I can’t sit back and watch it.
- Didn’t marry because you cannot be on two boats at the same time.
- Decided not to have kids because they won’t let me do public service.
Exploring the Role of Phronesis in Social Innovation: A Case Study of Dr. Ruth Pfau

Overview of Findings

The main objective of this study is to investigate the role of phronesis of social innovator in bringing about social innovation. For this purpose, interviews of Dr Ruth Pfau were analyzed. Analysis of the interview revealed that the first and second order themes can be condensed into two aggregated dimensions: phronesis and social innovation. This highlights that Dr Ruth Pfau became a social entrepreneur under the influence of her value judgment, and employed her practical wisdom in helping people with leprosy. Our overview of findings
contains the explanation of the two aggregated dimensions that are revealed by data analysis.

**Phronesis**

This aggregated dimension contains second order themes which different researchers have used to describe phronesis. These include: *Propensity for common good, value judgment, experiential knowledge and practical wisdom.*

**Propensity for common good:** The journey to become a social innovator starts with a motivation. In case of Dr. Ruth Pfau it started from a personal tragedy. She explains that

“It was Second World War, and I was young at that time . . . We were five sisters and one brother. My brother died at the age of 9 due to war. He was suffering from pneumonia and curfew was imposed at night in our city. My father run to call a doctor, but the doctor didn’t consider it worthwhile to risk his life for someone else. Eventually my brother died in the morning due to no medical treatment. That day I decided to become a doctor.”

It was this personal tragedy which encouraged Dr. Ruth Pfau to become a physician. Later, under the influence of her spiritual calling she joined Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary. Under activities of this mission, she initially intended to go to India. But, due to certain visa issues she had to stay in Karachi, Pakistan, and here her life changed.

“My fellow sister (nun) took me to leper colony in McLeod Road (Karachi) . . . I saw the patients who were barely resemble human. After visiting the leprosy colony once, I realized that I can’t leave this place. If I left, I won’t be able to sleep and I will always have this pain in my heart. Who will look after these people?”

It was under the influence of these factors, Dr Ruth Pfau took the decision to become a physician and help the leprosy patients. It was her propensity for common good that encouraged her to take these difficult decisions, and she devoted herself to help people suffering from a serious ailment.

**Value Judgment:** Her decision to stay in Karachi and help the leprosy patients gives a clue about her value judgment. She could have used her education for better earning or career prospects. But, she gave more importance to moral values than her personal benefits. She made helping these people mission of her life as she was convinced it was her destiny.

“My first motivation really came off as human being like me and you. People have only one life to live and then it’s over. . . If they
She even did not give attention to her personal life. Her decision to become a nun and devote her life for public service was guided by her value judgment that God has created her for this purpose. As she narrates:

“I had two romantic relationships in Germany. . . . But you cannot do or get everything in your life. But it was my decision . . . You cannot be on two boats at the same time.”

Experiential Knowledge & Practical Wisdom: An important facet of phronesis is the use of experiential knowledge and practical wisdom of the person to achieve common good. Past experiences encourage a person to strive to make present better than past. A person experiencing a particular misery in past is better aware about the pain and agony of others.

“The conditions in the McLeod road were sub human. I mean I have seen much misery during the war because I am a war generation. But, I didn’t see misery without a hope which I saw in McLeod Road.”

When Dr Ruth Pfau reached Pakistan, there was no doctor who specialized for leprosy treatment. Even her own background and education is not related with it. During her formal education, she didn’t receive any education related to this particular ailment. But, she was determined to help others so she started by educating herself about it. She consulted literature to study how leprosy developed and how it can be cured. She even enlisted help of others so she may become more equipped in treating people. She narrates her journey as under.

“I am a gynecologist, and I knew nothing about leprosy. When I saw there is no chance (of learning) in Pakistan. . . . I searched in Karachi for any doctor having specialization of leprosy. So, I started by reading a book on leprosy treatment. Since, I was a doctor I had basic know how. After that, I went to Madras (India). Madras had higher rate of leprosy patient, so the doctors there had more experience about it. I remained there for few weeks, learned treatment there and came back to Pakistan.”
This is how she applied her practical knowledge in helping others. She didn’t stop at this. Rather, she constantly upgraded her knowledge base and learned of new treatments for leprosy. As she explains herself:

“Even now, I have learned and tested new treatment which previously made it difficult for the patients to have a profession.”

**Social Innovation**

Dr Ruth Pfau used different facets of phronesis to heal people. She not only spotted an *unmet social need* but also applied an *innovative solution* to deal with this. She didn’t stop at this. Rather, she ensured that her initiatives become *sustainable* and lasting, and these will grow to have a positive influence on the life of others.

**Unmet Social Need:** Dr. Ruth Pfau employed her phronesis to help deprived section of community. She was able to feel the misery of people which others ignored. When she came to Pakistan in 1960, there was no institution or treatment facility for leprosy patient and it was assumed to be an incurable disease. People were ignored about any potential treatment or cure for these patients. As Dr Ruth Pfau commented in one of her interviews:

“There was a treatment for leprosy since 1942. But, we in Pakistan didn’t know it. It was only in 1960 people came to know that it is a disease which is curable. It is a normal disease”.

Such was the condition at that time that there was no doctor who treated for these patients. As a result, these people were either confined to a leper colony or restricted to McLeod road were they used to lay on road sides in mutilated conditions. As Dr Ruth Pfau narrates:

“In 1960, there was no single doctor for leprosy. One of my sisters took me to the McLeod Road. This was a Mexican pharmacist who came just before I came, and she was instrumental in get me to Pakistan. Because she kept on writing *I need a doctor, I need a doctor. I need a doctor*. I had just completed my studies and it was a challenge which I thought was worthwhile”.

**Innovative Solution:** Dr. Ruth Pfau was so moved with the agony of these people that she decided to help them. She with the help of other people of her mission managed to build a makeshift arrangement to treat leprosy patients. She didn’t wait for government support. Rather, she decided to work on her own and started from a humble beginning. She recalls those days by stating:

“Before me, our fellow sister started treatment of leprosy patient. We started from a hut as it was impossible at that time to establish a hospital. (Leprosy treatment) started all of a sudden. We didn’t have the time to think. We have to get medicine and start treatment.”
With the passage of time, her efforts began to materialize. People around the country started to visit her facility for treatment of leprosy. She emerged as a beacon of light for these people. Patients from far flung areas even Afghanistan visited Dr Ruth Pfau for treatment. Her efforts were acknowledged by government of Pakistan as well as donor agencies of Germany. This led her to found Marie Adelaide Leprosy Centre which became a sign of life for underprivileged people:

“The hut was later upgraded into Marie Adelaide Leprosy Center. We established relationship with people. Local governments and doctors helped us. But the majority of funds came from Germany.”

**Sustainable initiative:** Dr. Ruth Pfau and her team didn’t stop at this. They expanded their operation and established leprosy treatment centres throughout Pakistan. Government of Pakistan supported them and provided them with requisite resources for expansion their operation. CEO of Marie Adelaide Leprosy Center shares this achievement as:

“The out-reach program for leprosy treatment started with the help of federal and provisional governments. Government helped us and offered their facilities to us. We hired and trained staff, and government absorbed it. These people were deputed in basic health unit. There are now 157 centers working all over Pakistan. You name the place; you will find our center there.” (CEO of Marie Adelaide Leprosy Center)

Due to this strenuous efforts and stoic determination, Dr Ruth Pfau was able to control leprosy in Pakistan. In 1996, World Health Organization declared Pakistan to the first Asian country which has brought leprosy to a controlled level. However, but for Dr Ruth Pfau this was not the end of journey. With leprosy under controlled, she turned her attention to other social problems prevalent in Pakistan and employed her experience and base of operation for helping other deprived communities of country:

“Once we managed to bring leprosy to a controlled level, we have later developed treatment centers for tuberculosis for Northern Areas and Azad Kashmir as well as blinded prevention in Balochistan.”

She didn’t remain restricted to health sector. Rather, she used her reputation to help oppressed segment of community. She states that

“Another NGO with the name Raah-e-Nijat is working to help the oppressed Hindu community of rural Sindh.”

**Positive Influence on People:** All these activities had a positive influence on other life. An important silent revolution which Dr Ruth Pfau brought was the change in the perception of people. Initially, Leprosy was considered to be incurable. Patients
of leprosy were considered to be cast out and other people hesitate to interact with them. These patients were forced to spend their life in sub human conditions, and they had no respectable occupation or normal life. Her activities and efforts brought a positive change among people. She narrates another story.

“The people once sufferings from leprosy once cure are rehabilitated. They go back to work. On my way to church a young man stopped me and asked: you don’t know me. I said: I am sorry; you tell me your name. He said: I am son of one of the beggars (leprosy patient) of McLeod Road, and I have just passed my BA.”

Discussion on Findings

Aristotle was the first person to advocate the virtues of phronesis. However, it was not until recently scholars have started to emphasize on the role of moral practices and value judgment in organizational routine. By the end of last century, social innovation has become a buzz words among researchers, and this concept has been applied to different fields. This study aims to combine these two concepts and suggest how a social entrepreneur employs his/her phronesis to produce social innovation. For this purpose, we have chosen Dr Ruth Pfau as our case study as she exhibited different aspects of phronesis and social innovation. From her life accounts, it is evident that she was driven to become a social innovator under the influence of her moral judgment and ethical consideration. Furthermore, her phronesis was instrumental in developing programs to combat social challenges, and creating an inclusive environment for special people.

Many definitions concentrate on the impact of social innovation, and encourage the social entrepreneur to give preference to collective benefits. Social innovation benefits from the value judgment of social entrepreneurs. According to Breier & Ralph (2009) “phronesis is said to have a moral or ethical component, to be geared towards the achievement of a good life, in a manner that takes account of a wider community, and to be acquired with experience.” After completing her education, Dr Ruth Pfau could have become a professional doctor and earn a handsome living like majority of counterparts. But, she rose above her personal interests and valued common good. Herphronesis encouraged her to find out solution which serves the common good. Her value judgment made her capable in dealing with a social problem by utilizing her resources voluntarily.

Social innovation is much more than a theoretical field. It is “wisdom of practice” (Sinclair & Baglion, 2014). Therefore, it requires practical wisdom and experiential knowledge of the entrepreneurs. As succinctly described by Hawkins (1966) “[these are such] times in human history when there is much more wisdom in practice than in the academy, when gamblers know more about probability than statisticians, and when sailors know more about the heavens than astronomers” (p. 3). Phronesis and value judgment of Dr. Ruth Pfau drove her to become a social
entrepreneur. Instead of discussing the issue in private gathering, she jumped into the practical field and tackled a social issue head on. Dr. Ruth Pfau employed her experiential knowledge to help a neglected sector of community.

As with any technical innovation, social innovation requires domain related expertise of the entrepreneurs to come up with new answers to social challenges. In her battle against leprosy, Dr Ruth Pfau realized that she should have practical knowledge against this disease. For this purpose, she went to India to learn more about treatment for leprosy. She constantly upgraded her knowledge base and equipped herself with new treatments of leprosy. The skill and domain related knowledge of Dr Ruth Pfau helped her to solve social problem.

Conclusions

Lately, scholars have displayed profound interest in phronesis. Furthermore, social innovation is asserting its dominance and replacing corporate social responsibility. By combining these two different concepts, this study aims to provide evidence on how phronesis of a person can be used for the purpose of social innovation. By doing so, it is revealed that these two are not just theoretical concepts. Rather, they hold practical relevance. This has been proved by the life account and achievements of Dr Ruth Pfau who has used her inclination for common good, value judgment, experiential knowledge, and practical wisdom to combat and defeat a social issue which was previously ignored by government and private sector alike. By doing so, she has left behind her a legacy which can guide others to follow. As Dr Ruth Pfaudescribe succinctly: “Not all of us can prevent a war; but most of us can help ease sufferings—of the body and the soul.”

References


---

**Ansar Waseem** is Ph.D Scholar in the School of Business & Economics, University of Management & Technology, Lahore.

**Dr. Yasir Rashid** is an Assistant Professor in the School of Business & Economics, University of Management & Technology, Lahore.
Attitude Towards Third Gender: A Case Study Of Southern Punjab, Pakistan

Iram Batool
Department of Applied Psychology
Bahauddin Zakariya University

Muhammad Saqib
School of Global and Urban Studies
RMIT University, Melbourne, Australia

Abdul Sattar Ghaffari
Institute for Financial Studies, School of Mathematics
Shandong University

Abstract

Transgender community faces insulting remarks and people treat them in a bad way. Discrimination is being faced by transgender at all levels such as at school, in family, at places where they live. The purpose of the present study was to explore the attitude of people towards third gender. A sample of 600 were selected through purposive sampling and snow ball sampling techniques. Data was collected from Two cities of Pakistan Sahiwal and Multan. Demographic variables of participants used in this research are age, gender, monthly income, qualification and marital status. Attitude towards Hijras scale was used in this research. Results showed that females have more acceptances of Hijra’s (transgender) rights and status as compared to males. Males and females don’t want any close relationship with Hijras (transgender).Sexual issues (SI) are significant in males as compared to females. Education has more impact on people’s attitude towards Hijra community. People belonging to religious groups have more negative attitude towards Hijras as compared to other groups.

Keywords: Transgender, Attitude of People, Third Gender.
Introduction

Transgender is used as an umbrella term which is defined as looks and gender identity of people that differ from the cultural boundaries of gender related with individual’s birth sex i.e., female or male (Davidson, 2007; Valentine, 2007). This umbrella term also consisted of individuals whose individuality is outside the binary gender in which the only categories included are boys/men and girls/women or somewhere between girl/woman and boy/man. These types of people may refer to themselves as gender queer, gender independent, gender nonconforming, gender fluid, gender non-binary or gender creative (Vance, Ehrensaft, & Rosenthal, 2014). The transgender define their individuality as gender queer, transgender man, transgender woman, femme queen, butch queen, bi-gender and they try to express their individuality in different ways, which may differ from culture to culture according to socioeconomic status, racial/ethnic background and their place of residence (Valentine, 2007). Socially transition for example change their name, gender identity, pronoun and medically transition for example use techniques like surgery, cross-sex hormones in order to line up their individuality according to gender expression (Davidson, 2007). Transgender people in US are considered deviant because their individuality is not according to the assigned birth sex and due to this they experience stigma (Bockting et al., 2013; Grant et al., 2011; Lombardi et al., 2002). Population of transgender assessed is 0.03% to 0.05% (Conron et al., 2012; Gates, 2011; Reisner et al., 2014a).

In the year of 2009 in Pakistan, when the transgender community was first granted their official CNIC’s, the estimated number of CNIC card registered under the category of transgender was 4000. However, this number is not a correct representation of the transgender community. According to a report from United Nations AIDS (UNAIDS), the current estimated number of the transgender community is around 150,000. The report also suggests that the total number of sex workers among this population is around 50-60,000. Trans Action Alliance/Blue Veins estimate total number of 40-50,000 transgender in the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Gender Interactive Alliance (GIA) in Karachi estimates the transgender population around 15-20,000 (Nazir & Yasir (2015).
Number of theories exist which tell about the existence of transgender but some scientific consent still needed. Most of the theories on transgender are psychological, cultural, biological and medical. Psychology theorists said that there is a link between the structure of brain and the identity of a person. According to the cultural theory, identification of individuals varies from culture to culture, people defined in two categories by some cultures, while some cultures define people in three categories depending on their roles in society and what their status was at birth. According to biological theorists, normal sex of a person is determined by his/her number of chromosomes. If the number of chromosomes is not normal then it is called as intersex or a transgender. Medical theorists believed that hormonal imbalance in mother’s womb result in intersex or transgender. While feminist theory accepted the identity of transgender (MacDonald, 1998).

It is a well-established fact that transgender community has been a serious target of hate crimes for the past countless years. Due to the lack of awareness and sensitivity in our society, they are constantly harassed and are a victim of resentment, ridicule, malice and hostility from fellow citizens. In Pakistan, on August 9, 2016, a transgender woman named Sumbal was shot thrice in her abdomen when she tried to resist abduction and rape. Later when she was found by her friends and was taken to the hospital, the doctors and nurses refused to treat her because they were uncertain whether to admit her in the male or female ward. During this useless battle, Sumabal lost the bigger battle, her life. This incident screams the blatant neglect of not just the Police but also the medical staff members who are equal culprits in the rescinding their basic human rights (“Pakistan: Attacks on Transgender Women Surge”,2016).

Another case occurred in Pakistan last year. Ayesha, a 22 year old transgender woman reported her house was broken into. She stated that a mob broke robbed her house and threatened her life. But when she went to the Police station to get file an FIR, the guard wouldn’t even let her inside the station. The Police started mocking her at the doors of the Police station. No one was ready to pay any heed to her complaint just because she was a transgender. Trans Action Alliance’s vice president, Paro, reported during a news conference that the SHO of the Nowshera cantonment SHO had called several members of their community and had ordered them to leave the city. Not just this, he kept them in the holding cell for 10 hours and later and they were subjected to physical violence as well as sexual abuse (“Pakistan: Attacks on Transgender Women Surge”,2016).

Unfortunately, there is a very low tolerance rate for the third gender not just in our society but universally as well. They are a constant victim of derogatory behaviour and snide remarks from a very young age. Their acceptance amongst their peers is minimal from the beginning which leads to some major self-esteem
and mental health issues. Most of the times this gender is ambushed at the hands of their own family by being disregarded or thrown out of the house at a very tender age. These people are subjected to bullying more than a person from the binary gender system is. The third gender is barely accepted in our society which naturally effects their acceptance at school or at workplace. Since they are religiously bullied in schools, they are most likely to drop out and resort to professions that are deemed highly abominable by the society (Nazir & Yasir, 2016).

**Literature Review**

People whose gender identity is not according to the suggested cultural setups of male or female (gender nonconformity), face high level of stigma, have low well-being, face rejection (Rodgers, 2017). Among sexual minorities gender nonconformity appears as a powerful predictor of poor well-being and higher level of stigmatization as compared to sexual orientation (Baams, Beek, Hille, Zevenbergen & Bos, 2013). Development, mental health, psychological adjustment of sexual minority is adversely affected by stigmatization and increased the health risk behaviors (Toomey, Ryan, Diaz, Card & Russell, 2010) (Bontempo & d’Augelli, 2002). Minority stress model by Meyer (2003) explained that how psychological well-being of sexual minorities are affected by different factors. Some of the stressors that badly affect the LGBTQ (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and questioning) community are discrimination, expected homonegativity, concealing one’s sexual orientation and internalized homonegativity (Meyer, 2003).

Discrimination is being rejected by their family members, friends, and being bullied at schools, and face prejudice (Birkett, Newcomb & Mustanski, 2015; Russell, Ryan, Toomey, Diaz & Sanchez, 2011). Expecting to experience rejection and prejudice events is another major stressor (Birkett, Newcomb & Mustanski, 2015). Concealment means try to hide LGBTQ position in society. They are very conscious about self-monitoring and try to imitate the gender behaviors which are expected by the society. Low self-esteem and moods are commonly reported outcomes (Birkett, Newcomb & Mustanski, 2015). Internalization of negative views of the society based on the social stigma forced transgender to think less about themselves (Lewis, R. J., Milletich, Kelley & Woody, 2012).

Higher the level of stress and poor psychosocial health is reported by Cox, Dewaele, Van Houtte & Vincke, 2010. Higher levels of depression and suicide rates were reported among LGBT students (Hillard, Love, Franks, Laris & Coyle, 2014, Russell, Ryan, Toomey, Diaz, & Sanchez, 2011, Kolbert, Crothers, Bundick, Wells, Buzgon, Berbary & Senko, 2015). Anti-bullying campaigns
greatly improved the environment in schools for these students (Russell, Kosciw, Horn & Saewyc (2010; Rodgers, 2017).

People with gender nonconformity around the world face the stigma throughout their lives and become vulnerable to discrimination and prejudice. They hesitate to reveal their gender individuality at health care centers and it increases level of anxiety. A survey on National Transgender Discrimination revealed that due to the gender identity 19% of the participants refused care, 28% verbally harassed transgender and 2% were physically attacked while taking medical care (Grant, Mottet, Tanis, Herman, Harrison & Keisling, 2010). Such negative interactions lead to avoid or delay in medical checkups and increases the bad experience towards the society. High level of health risks were also reported (Sanchez, Sanchez & Danoff, 2009).

A nationwide survey on more than 7800 LGBT, results showed that because of the sexual orientation 55.5% felt unsafe at school, where as 36.2% faced physical harassment, 74.1% experienced verbal harassment and 49% suffered from cyber bullying (Kosciw, Greytak, Bartkiewicz, Boesen & Palmer, 2012). Continuous bullying in the lives of transgenders was also investigated (Sherriff, Hamilton, Wigmore & Giambrone, 2011; Kolbert, Crothers, Bundick, Wells, Buzgon, Berbary & Senko, 2015). Transgender have lower grades in schools, skip their classes and try to avoid school (Hillard, Love, Franks, Laris & Coyle, 2014).

Different names are given to transgender in Pakistan such as Hijra, Murat, Khawaja Sara or Khusra. Transgender from the childhood face insulting remarks and people treat them in bad way. Discrimination is being faced by transgender at all levels such as at school, in family, at places where they lived (Nazir & Yasir, 2016). Most of the people in Pakistan, due to the old traditions don’t consider them as a part of their society. According to the estimation, the total population of transgender ranged from 350,000- 500,000. Different studies showed that one out of fifty children born is bi-gender. Approximately 2% of population of Pakistan is transgender (Sarfraz, 2017). Transgender in Pakistan are unable to get basic facilities of life such as good education, good jobs etc. Most of them use to dance in weddings, beg or work as sex workers. They suffer from sexually transmitted diseases; they find difficulty in accessing healthcare facilities. Recently in Peshawar a transgender was shot by gun eight times and no health care facility was provided to her as a result she died (Fawad, 2016).

Nazir & Yasir (2016) concluded that transgender do not live in fixed place, rather they keep on changing their residence. The main reason is to keep a distance from those people who know them and their families. Their adopted professions such as dancing, begging are also not acceptable by their surroundings so they keep changing their residences and feel independent. Families of transgender feel
ashamed of their presence and ask them to avoid contact with them. Parents of transgender suffer from huge stigma especially in Pakistani society. Low literacy rate in our society forced parents of transgender to send their child to eunuch community and deprived from good facilities of education, living and earning. It was found that population of uneducated eunuchs in Pakistan is 79%. A very common reason for illiteracy is sexual and verbal abuse, lack of finances, being beaten up by the teachers and gender discrimination (Nazir & Yasir, 2016).

Rude remarks and the discrimination that transgender faced by their school fellows and neighbours forced them to stay apart from the main stream. The Constitution of Pakistan emphasize on the equal rights to all citizens. Provisional and federal governments talked about equal share of transgender in inheritance, education and employment. A right to vote was also given by Supreme Court of Pakistan to transgender community and for the first time in 2013, five transgender contested the elections (Nazir, Yasir, 2016).

McGuire, Doty, Catalpa, Ola (2016) researched Body Image in young Transgender people. This was a qualitative research and a community based research which generated data through in-depth interviews from 90 transgender from United States, Canada and Ireland. With the use of queer perspective, qualitative analysis disclosed two conceptual categories: Body satisfaction and body dissatisfaction. The results revealed that there were greater deal of dissatisfaction with their body image which was a direct cause of great distress and self plus public criticism. The participants reported to not feel comfortable in their bodies but they actually felt that they are trapped inside of someone else’s body and lead a different life. They accounted for less acceptance and more bashing from their peers as well as their community. This derogatory behaviour lead to them feeling ashamed of their appearance and developing body dissatisfaction.

Griff, Kreukels, Elfering et al. (2016) explored the results of a pre and post operation for mastectomy of 33 transgender in Body Image in Transmen. Body satisfaction of the participants was measured through Body Image Scale for Transsexuals, Body Image Quality of Life Scale and Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale. These participants were measure 6 months pre and post-operative period. The results showed that after the operation, these transsexuals had a greater sense of body satisfaction and a higher and a more positive self-esteem. They could match their minds with their body now, so they didn’t feel conflicted with their bodies anymore. There seemed more acceptance for them from their peers since they fell more in one of the category of the binary gender system.

Neumann and Wolfradt (2001) explored whether postoperative male-to-female transsexuals differ I with regards to measures of self and body image from a non-
transsexual control group. The total sample size included 90 people in total among which 30 were transsexuals, 30 were women and 30 were men who were a part of the control group in this research. Both the groups completed self-report measure on self-esteem, body image, gender identity traits and depersonalization. The results depicted that the transsexuals and the male participants rated higher on the self-esteem and body image dynamics than the females. There were no differences between both the groups in terms of depersonalization. Naturally, the females and the transsexuals described themselves more feminine than the male participants. And regarding sex-role orientation, more bi-gendered or transgendered traits were found among the transsexuals than in the control group.

The main aim of the study was to explore the attitude towards transgender community. Furthermore it was aimed to investigate gender differences on level of Social Distance, Right & Status and Sexual Issues about third gender. Moreover the current study aimed to investigate the difference of attitude among people having different educational background and level of religious practices.

**Objectives of Study**

The main objectives of the study are:
1. To explore the attitude of individuals from different walks of life towards transgender community.
2. To investigate gender differences on level of Social Distance, Right & Status and Sexual Issues about third gender.
3. To investigate the attitudes of people towards transgender from different educational backgrounds.
4. To find out the religious group’s attitude towards transgender community.

**Methodology**

**Participants**

A sample of 600 participants of age range 18-70 years were selected through convenient sampling technique. Both males and females participants belong to different walks of life were included in the sample. Data was collected from two Districts of southern Punjab i.e. Sahiwal and Multan.

**Instruments**

**Attitude towards Hijra Scale (ATH)**

Attitude towards Hijras Scale developed by Humaira Jami (2015) was used for data collection. This scale measured three factors. Factor I is “Right and Status RS” referred to the beliefs, feelings, behaviours and behavioural intentions
extended towards providing basic human rights to Hijras including right for occupational opportunities and right to be loved and accepted. This included 13 items (no. 7, 8, 9, 10, 22, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32 in final version).

Factor II is termed as Social Distance (SD) referred to how much closeness a person can accept in having any relationship with Hijras for example as a neighbor, colleague, relative, interacting or talking to or about them, accepting as a leader in electoral process, so on. This included 11 items (no. 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 23, 26 in final version).

Factor III is named as ‘Sexual Issues’ (SI) referred to the attitudes towards different sexual issues related to Hijras like promiscuous behavior, spreading HIV/STDs and homosexuality, indulging in sex business, transgenderism, etc. It included 8 items (no. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 11, 12 in final version). On the basis of three component model of attitudes based on behavioural intentions (Allport as cited in Hogg & Vaughan, 2005), 8 items (items 13, 14, 15, 17, 19, 20, 21, 32) pertained to behavioral intentions and remaining revolved around cognitive, feeling, and behavioral components.

**Procedure**

Participants were approached at their places, purpose of the study was explained to them. Confidentiality of the information was ensured to participants. All the respondents filled the informed consent; it took 10-12 minutes to fill out the questionnaire.

**Results**

The data was analyzed on the basis of study objectives. The demographic details of the participants were also.

**Table: 1**

Demographic attributes of whole sample (N=600)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Variable</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Groups</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working Class</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Group</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House wives Retired</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Handicapped</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-35</td>
<td>384</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-53</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Demographic sheet was designed to get information about gender, age, family’s monthly income, marital status. As indicator of religiosity no. of prayers offered daily, fasting in holy month of Ramadhan [ninth month of Islamic year], and paying Zakat [offering 2.5% of share in property to poor people] rated as 0 for do
not offer" to "5 regularly offer" were used. Participants had different educational level (Table 1). Reliability of the scale was measured (Table 2).

### Table 2
Cronbach’s alpha of scales

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
<th>Items No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATH</td>
<td>.738</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3
Mean, standard deviation and p-value of gender groups on right & status (R_S)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATH (R_S)</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>52.92</td>
<td>7.70</td>
<td>-4.01</td>
<td>.000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>55.21</td>
<td>5.85</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P (.005 < 0.05) R_S= Right and Status

Table 3 shows gender difference on Right & Status (R_S) and results revealed that there is a significant gender difference on this domain. Mean scores of females (M=55.21) is higher than males (M=52.92). The difference between two groups was significant (P<0.05) which shows females have more acceptance about hijra’s right and status as compare to males.

### Table 4
Mean, standard deviation and p-value of gender groups on social distance (S_D)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATH (S_D)</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>32.00</td>
<td>8.76</td>
<td>0.450</td>
<td>0.653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>32.32</td>
<td>8.48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P (0.653> 0.05) S_D= Social Distance

Table 4 shows gender difference on Social Distance (S_D) and results revealed that there is no significant gender difference on this domain. Mean scores of females (M=32.32) is higher than males (M=32.00) but the difference between two groups was not statistically significant (P>0.05). Results revealed that females and males have no difference on this domain which means both don’t want any close relationship towards Hijras.

### Table 5
Mean, standard deviation and p-value of gender groups on sexual issues (S_I)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATH (S_I)</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>23.95</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td>0.000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>22.85</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P (.001<0.05), S_I= Sexual Issues
Table 5 shows gender difference on Sexual Issues (S_I) and results revealed that there is a significant gender difference on this domain. Mean scores of males (M=23.95) is higher than females (M=22.85). The difference between two groups was significant (P<0.001) which shows males have more awareness about hijra’s sexual issues (S_I) as compare to females.

**Table: 6**  
One way ANOVA analysis on education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>SS</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>2574.2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>643.5</td>
<td>9.662</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>39626.3</td>
<td>595</td>
<td>66.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>42200.5</td>
<td>599</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. P >0.05, Edu= education

Results in table 6 showed that there were significant differences between education groups of participants on attitude (F=9.662, p=<.001).

**Table: 7**  
One way ANOVA analysis between different religious groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>SS</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>3389.7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>847.4</td>
<td>12.991</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>38810.9</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>65.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>42200.6</td>
<td>599</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: P< 0.05,

Table 7 showed that there was a significant differences between different religious groups on attitude (F=9.662, p=<.001).

**Discussion**

The aim of the study was to explore attitude towards third gender. Furthermore it was aimed to explore if there is any gender difference and difference among different age groups. Moreover it was aimed to explore the difference of attitude towards transgender among people having different educational background. Even though, Hijra community shows their existence in Pakistan. Literature shows that there is a dearth of related research evidence. A very few work has been done on third gender issue. That dearth of work might be of many reasons like due to some Islamic ideology people do not like to work on that phenomenon.

Limited findings talked about non-heterosexual identity, behaviour and stigma that discourages investigators to explore LGBTs (Hughes & Eliason, 2002). Present study was conducted to explore further in this area. Main focus was on attitude toward third gender and for that purpose Attitude towards Hijras (ATH)
scale was used. Scale was consisted of three factors. First factor was named as Right & Status (RS) as items included referred to attitude related to right for identity, mental and physical health facilities, educational and occupational opportunities and right to be loved. The results of comparison between males and females showed that females have more acceptability towards Hijras that they should get their all rights and status as they are a part of our society. This might be because of the fact that females are more emotional and sensitive to any situation as compared to males. Being a human being, all basic rights and facilities should be provided to them.

Previous investigator (Sharma, 2000; see Totman, 2003 for Kathoey of Thailand) found that these sexual minorities are isolated part of main stream society. This marginalization come up with minimum interaction between society and sexual minorities (like hijra community). It was also summarized that accessibility and strength of attitude is rooted in level of interaction and experience with the social object (see Bohner & Wanke, 2002; Hogg & Vaughan, 2005;King et al., 2009; Mário et al., 2006).

To get the answer to the question that how much people want to be closer to or have relationship with third gender. Second factor measured by the scaled used in this study is Social Distance (SD). Social Distance referred to how much closeness a person can accept in having any relationship with Hijras for example, as neighbors, colleague, class-fellow, relative, interacting or talking to or about them, so on. The results of the study revealed that both are not ready to have any sort of relationship with Hijras like at workplace, relative etc. Evidence of such dimension is also available in previous measures (see King et al., 2009). These findings indicated the negative attitude towards this community. This discriminative attitude is already reported by previous investigators. Discrimination is being faced by transgender at all levels such as at school, in family, at places where they lived (Nazir & Yisir, 2016).

Third factor was Sexual Issues (SI), it refers to attitudes towards different sexual issues attached with Hijras like related to AIDS/ STDs, sex business, homosexuality and so on. The findings of this study concluded that males have more information regarding sexual issues related to this gender. This might be because of their more frequent interaction with them as compared to female. People generally blame Hijras for sexual relationships (Jami, 2005, 2012; Riaz, 1996).

Low literacy rate deeply affects the attitude of people towards Hijras. As this research reveals that literate people have positive attitude towards Hijras as compared to illiterate people. If the level of education increases the chances of positive attitude towards Hijras will also be increased. The religious group showed the hatred attitude towards Hijras of Hijras community (Jami, 2015).
While, Miller (2015) considers that an increase in the visibility of transgender people, whether in the clinical setting or the wider community, may not bring about understanding and acceptance. However, Sharma (2000) pointed out that in western countries, transsexuals can easily live in mainstream for their ability to pass as a woman, but Hijras are quite visible and people never perceive them as woman as they look very different.

**Conclusions**

From the present study, we conclude that people know about hijras' rights and status. But no one wants to have any relationship with this community. Males have more information regarding their sexual issues. Majority of people believed that hijras are individuals who are born with sexual deformity. Females have less interaction than males with hijras on daily basis. Education is a dominant factor which has impacted on people’s attitude towards Hijras. Groups from religious background showed different attitude towards Hijras as compared to other groups.

**Recommendations**

This study was conducted in one region, could be extended with larger sample. More intensive investigation is required on the problems faced by third gender which are related to such attitudes of society members. Need to investigate the factors which can play role in formulating positive attitude towards this marginalize population. It is highly recommended that transgender should be incorporated in the main stream. Positive attitudes of people can work as a bridge between this deprived population and normal population.

**References**


Dr. Iram Batool is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Applied Psychology, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.

Muhammad Saqib is Research Scholar in the School of Global and Urban Studies, RMIT University, Melbourne, Australia.

Abdul Sattar Ghaffari is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Zhongtai Securities, Institute for Financial Studies, School of Mathematics, Shandong University, Jinan, Shandong, China.
Changing Dynamics Of Gendered Livelihoods Practices
In Post Crises Of Swat Northwest Pakistan

Noor Elahi
Department of Development Studies
COMSATS University Islamabad, Abbottabad Campus

Abstract

This research attempts to focus on the changing dynamics of livelihoods practices among gender, and how conflict and flood crises (2005-2010) affected the various needs of livelihoods of the social classes in Swat valley of northwest Pakistan. Qualitative methods; formal/informal interviews, focus groups discussion, key informant interviews and participant observation, were used to explore the dynamics of changes in occupations, household dependency and those factors which influenced the changes accessing livelihood resources. The paper revealed that those households depending agriculture, small business and labour in market have been highly affected during conflict and flood crises in comparison to those households who were depending on remittances, public and private jobs and skilled works. The study found that the livelihood dependency of the households in all villages was based on agricultural and natural resources, which has changed to market and jobs based oriented resources. The factors like economic development, migration, conflict and displacement, and post conflict development have created diverse opportunities of livelihood resources for men and women, which brought social and cultural changes in the livelihood practices between genders at household level. The research emphasizes on the long-term livelihoods strategies and gendered equal opportunity policies by government and NGOs after the crises, which may improve the social statuses of the men and women.

Keywords: Gender, Livelihoods, Changing Perspectives, Post Crises Development.
During recent decades, Swat has suffered various intense crises in the form of militant conflict, followed by Pakistan military operations against the militants, and floods disaster. In the Swat district, militant conflict got momentum after 9/11 incidents and during 2005-08, the militant occupied the major areas of the Swat including urban area of Mingora City. After a number of peace deals with militants, the Government of Pakistan (GoP) carried out a military operation RahiRast (strait path) in 2009, however, at the same time more than 1.2 million of population were displaced only from the Swat valley (WB and ABD, 2010). The operation was successful in term of ousting the militant from the Swat. The government along with support of NGOs were in process of the resettlement and rehabilitation of the internally displaced people that historical flood disaster occurred in 2010. Both these crises (militant conflict 2005-09 and flood 2010) have had devastating effects on socio-economic aspects of the Swat valley (Salman, 2012). The livelihood needs of the people increased and priorities changed due to the internal displacement of more than 141,582 families from the Swat and physical losses to agricultural land and crops in 2009-10 (CPPR, 2010). The closure of the tourism sector further reduced the extent of private jobs and related business. A survey conducted during the conflict period in Swat showed that most of households before the conflict were able to cover the cost of food, utilities, education, health and transportation by themselves (Khan, 2009; SDPI, 2012). However, “the conflict and flood have changed this for many people by severely constraining households’ ability to secure a stable and decent income” (SDPI, 2012: 11). The people of Swat have had to carry a huge burden in terms of losses to the local economy and their livelihoods (Salman, 2012). To recover the losses, a rehabilitation and reconstruction (R & R) process was initiated jointly by the Government of Pakistan including the Pak Army, international/foreign donors and NGOs. The crises themselves besides the humanitarian aid during and after the crises, have to some extent changed the dynamics of gendered livelihood practices and accesses to resources for all groups of people in the region.

Gender roles and relations in accessing livelihood assets (physical, financial, social, natural, and human) are not always the same, mostly in underdeveloped countries, because of different cultural perspectives, resources and living patterns (Sen, 2001). The argument is that gender roles and responsibilities are socially and culturally constructed in livelihood practices, following the patriarchal
structure of the society to legitimize the unequal gendered division of labor and access to assets. In the Swat Valley, people have multiple livelihood sources; the livelihood assets in the area are closely linked with each other and gender roles are more prominent in respect of some assets for example social, human and natural, while they appear to be of little significance in physical and financial (Khalid, Nyborg & Khattak, 2015). The Swati people are involved in a variety of occupations to fulfill the livelihood needs of their households (Shah, 2010). All the ethnic groups depend on multiple sources of income. In the rural areas of Swat, over half of the working populace is associated with agribusiness, forestry resources and fishing, while 27% work as representatives in government and private sectors, trailed by 12% deals small scale businesses, lodgings while the rest of households are engaged with development, transport, and skilled work (CPPR, 2010). Women work in both government and private sectors and constituted almost 30% of the total employed population in 1998 (District Census Report, 1998). Majority of the population in Swat valley belong to patriarchal Pukhtoon ethnic group and accept Pukhtoonwali (a code of ethic or way of life). Overall, social framework in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa including Swat district, where this study has been conducted expect that male should be the fundamental provider for food subsistence in a family, while females are mostly confined to a reproductive works and household activities (Ahmad, 2006; Lindholm, 1982; Qayyum, 2010). In Pukhtoon society, women have a very limited role and level of power in relation to decision making and access to resources, because of male dominance and a patriarchal structure (Naz & Rehman, 2011). According to Seigmam & Sadaf (2006), women confinement inside the spatial limit to the household as because of their sexual behavior connected to male honor; and similarly women's motilities are controlled to ensure the family respect. In Swat females are for the most of time engaged with family inside the household while males are made responsible for external works following the cultural norms (Rahim & Viaro, 2002). However, a number of socio-economic, media, education, migration and lastly the conflict and flood crises factors have highly effected the gender roles and relations during the last couple of decades.

This paper focus on how are decisions made at household level in Swat society about division of labor in earning livelihoods, child care, income distribution, and access to resources? Who is responsible for what activities, and who carries out such activities? How the conflict and flood crises have changed these assigned roles to men and women, boys and girls particularly in relation to livelihoods accesses in post conflict development?

**Literature Review**

Gender has been defined as the cultural and sexual division of works between male and female (Smyth, 2007). In the developing countries the word gender has been confused and often used for women. Gender relations explained as the type of social and cultural diversity among people relating to stake in assets, livelihood
decision making, communal aspects as well as future plans for families and overall society (Momsen, 2010; Jane, 2002). Such kinds of gender differences are developed based on ethical, religious, traditional, financial and cultural elements (Moser, 1989).

Chambers and Conway (1992) defined livelihood as the relations of people with assets and choices they possess to practice the alternatives options so as to fulfill the subsistence needs required for survival. The researchers and development professionals applied various livelihood and gender analysis frameworks in relation to poverty reduction, vulnerability strategies and the sustainability of interventions. Schafer (2002, 16), defined livelihood analysis framework (LAF) ‘an instrument for analysis intended for providing foundations, which consists of the multifaceted sources of income of the society in a particular time, and most importantly include the trajectories and changing aspects’. There are several well-known LAFs, such as the framework for Policy Analysis of Rural Livelihoods e.g. Scoones and Carney, 1998; and Ellis, 2000; and the Sustainable Livelihood Framework (SLF) e.g. DFID, UNDP and Care International. These frameworks contain more or less the same basic elements, namely livelihood resources, strategies, and outcomes. The guiding principles are common to the different organizations that work with sustainable livelihood approaches, although the details of the frameworks and methods may differ (Carney, 1999). A livelihood analysis framework emphasis on how households access their livelihoods and classifies the various sorts of resources and activities which families embrace to access and meet their basic needs (De Satge, 2002). Although, the above mentioned LAFs do not focus accessibility problems of different ethnic groups to assets, or gender relations in the community.

The DFID (1999), LAF focuses on livelihood strategies of households, the dynamics of changes in livelihood resources and the way in which people can influence the institutions and process that impact on their lives. On the other hand, a gender analysis framework (GAF) is a method for better understanding of culture, expressed in the construction of gender identities and inequalities (Pasteur, 2002). GAF uncovers the aspects of different men and women problems for example livelihood activities, relationships, accesses to and control over and other requirement because it has been designed at grass root level (DFID, 2002). Therefore, to focus on the issues of accessibility to various livelihood assets and dynamics of changes among both men and women to livelihoods assets, LAF and GAF of the DFID (2002) are used in this study. Further, a GAF also helps to understand the way in which gendered livelihood practices are constructed and how they change. Since Swat is the Pukhtoon ethnic dominant society, therefore, it might be necessary to understand the values articulated to construct the gender characteristics as well as accesses linked with HHs economies.
Methodology

The area selected for the research was Swat district lies in the North of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP). The data was collected for my PhD study during 2013-14 while the area was revisited in 2016 for more indept information. The Swat district borders Buner and Malakand to the south, Lower and upper Dir districts on the west, Shangla and Kohistan to the east and Chitral and Gilgit to the north. The total area of the district is 5 065 km2 with a population of about 1.80 million (Salman, 2012). Historically Swat remained very famous for rich natural resources and scenic beauty. The people use multiple sources for their livelihood to fulfill the survival needs of the families. Most of the people still depends on agri related resources along with government and private jobs, foreign and domestic remittances (Shah, 2010).

The study employed qualitative approach, keeping in view the interpretive nature of the research. The methods used for primary data collection are formal/informal interviews, focus groups discussion, key informant interviews and participant observation. For selection of villages, households and respondents, purposive sampling method applied. Purposive sampling is a strategy in which decision concerning the individual or households to be included in the sample are taken by the researcher on the basis of some criteria in order to get relevant information and specific information (Palys, 2008). In total five villages, two each from upper and lower swat and one from central area were selected to have in-depth information of the diverse effects of crises and the changes occurred in the livelihood patterns. 50 households were selected 10 each from the villages and at average 2-4 households were selected on the basis of ethnic and social status differentiation including Puhktoon, Syed/Mian, Gujjjar, Kohistnai, tenants, shopkeepers, govt. and private employees and general labour class. Formal interviews were conducted with 28 heads of the households including six women headed households and 22 male non-headsof households (other member than head of the household). Key informant interviews were conducted with (six men and two women) including academic researchers, local political and religious leaders, and government and NGOs officials working in the study area to make the data reliable and informative.

For more in-depth and relevant information five focus group discussions one each in village with men group of 6-8 persons were held, however, focus group discussion with women was not possible due to cultural and social constraints. Besides these, applying participant observation methods, informal interviews were held with different categories of the populations while visiting and staying in different part of the Swat. The researcher used to participate in agricultural activities, marriage and death ceremonies, and attended the community livelihood and skills development trainings imparted by government of Pakistan and NGOs.
To support the primary data, secondary data was collected from government and NGOs offices in Swat, Peshawar and Islamabad. Furthermore, Online sources (websites, published journals, books), development project reports and case studies were made part of the search. Households survey was analyzed through MS Excel while interviews were analyzed through N-Vivo 10 software, and interpretive method was used for analysis of qualitative data. Some of the information presented in discussion are based on personal observations documented during field work in 2013-14.

Results and Discussion

People of Swat are involved in a variety of occupations to fulfill the livelihood needs of their households. All the ethnic groups depend on multiple sources of income. In all the selected villages the people have various occupations. Traditionally the hierarchy of occupations is Khans (landlord), Mian/Syed (Holy descent group), Paracha (trader), Sunar (goldsmith), Karigar (blacksmith), Muzdoor (daily wage worker), Mazari (tenant) and Naiye (barber). (See also Ahmad, 1980: Barth, 1965, 1981). Although the same occupations are currently found in the villages, but the roles in relation to different livelihood sources have changed over the last two decades. Several respondents in the villages stated that because of opportunities of education and foreign countries migration, several households occupations have changed to labor and from tenants to businessmen, skilled workers and government designators. For example, among paracha, Sunar, karigar, and tenant groups, there were teachers, lady health workers (LHWs), clerks, and persons working in other government administrative positions. Over 80% of respondents agreed that Pakhtoonwali is the accepted way of life for all these groups. However, some non Pukhtoon group such as Nayee, Kaarigar and Gujjars are not bound to follow the Pakhtoonwali. Although majority of these groups have changed their status because of migration in and outside the country and earned handsome money and purchased properties in the Swat. Nevertheless, differentiation remains in social relations and class hierarchy between Khans/Syed groups and other professional groups.

Livelihood Dependencies of Households

The Government of KP and UNDP Report (2011) shows that at average livelihood dependency of HHs monthly income in KP is that crops and livestock which make up 15% of total income, while international and national remittances make up 18%, and the rest are based on multiple livelihood resources and there is diversification in the different regions. A rapid assessment report conducted by Save the Children (Khan, 2009) in Swat reported that before the crises, agriculture was the main source of livelihood of 44% of surveyed communities, followed by skilled jobs in government and private industries (29%), remittances (8%), with
the remaining proportion in semi-skilled or unskilled, retail and labor. This study found through the household socio-economic survey that livelihoods in the selected villages depend mainly on agriculture, including forestry, livestock and fisheries, followed by government and private services, national and foreign remittances, and daily wage labor. Details of household dependency on various livelihood sources in both the selected villages are given in Figure 1.

Figure 1: Dependency of the people on various sources of livelihoods in percentages

Source: Field survey 2013-14

The figure shows that the important source of income of the 31 percent households in upper Swat is agriculture while 25 percent in lower swat. The trends towards the government and private services are high in lower areas because of access to urban areas and opportunities of small scale industries. In upper Swat dependency on labour of daily wages in hotel, restaurants, transports etc. was greater. The reason for this is that during the summer season when tourism is on peak, the working groups in upper areas are therefore, engaged in the hotel and restaurants businesses, transport and labor in agricultural sectors. The dependency on remittances (national or international) is 14% in upper swat while 23% in lower areas households depending on family type and size (the average household size in Swat was nine persons per HH as per CPPR report 2010), the percentage may increase. For example, extended family income depends on multiple sources, while nuclear family income may depend on only one or two sources such as government service, agriculture or labor or remittance. According to the HH survey in the selected villages, almost 70% of the population lives within an extended family system, and the rest are in a nuclear family system. The following section discusses how men and women within the HHs perform different types of activities.
Gender Based Daily Activities at the HH Level

Daily activities within households based on gender involvement vary among different ethnic groups in all the selected villages. Details of the major activities carried out by men and women are given in Table 1. The table does not include salaried jobs, the labor market, business, or any other livelihood activities, because in the majority of cases only men are involved in these activities.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Upper Swat Villages</th>
<th>Lower Swat Villages</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural activities</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grazing livestock</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel wood collection</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fodder collection</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water collection</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock care</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local poultry farming</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooking/cleaning/washing</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child care</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping at the market</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

0 = No involvement 1= little involvement 2= Much involvement 3= Main task

Source: Field survey 2013-14

Women perform the bulk of work within households, including cooking, cleaning, washing clothes, dishes, child care, livestock care, storage of crops, and collection of water. All these are unpaid jobs with little recognition in society. Among males
these are culturally assigned tasks to women and women do it without any hesitation. An employed woman of NGO at Madyen said ‘the patriarchal system demand women like us to perform all the households works as other (non-employed women)do. Such kinds of social obligations increase the working load on women, and they have to perform at one time the triple roles’.

Razavi and Miller (1995: 27) claim that ‘it is through gender relations that men are given a greater capacity than women to mobilize a variety of cultural roles and material resources in pursuit of their own interest’. Women respondents were of the view that there is no such compulsion on men and women to perform domestic activities in the Islamic religion. However, due to cultural orientation male avoid participating in domestic activities. However, men were of the view that doing household domestic works such as cleaning, washing and cooking are considered as despicable demonstration and in defiance with the values of Pakhtoonwali. Moreover, women mobility outside the home for buying food item or shopping is considered violations and condemned in the society.

Based on observations and discussions with various people in the selected villages, the analysis shows that the functioning of households and fulfilling livelihood needs of families are both important responsibilities, for each gender respectively. Men perform outside work and earn a livelihood for their HH members, while women support them by performing equally important domestic activities within the household. According to Collier(1994, 140), ‘one is a worker only because of one’s relation to the employer, a husband only because of one’s relation to the wife, a buyer only because of one’s relation to the seller……’. In this society domestic activities at household level are related to women identity because external work related to men personality.

The Changing Trend in Practical and Strategic Gender Needs in Terms of Livelihoods

Pakistan’s development indicators under the Millennium Development Goals are not encouraging. According to the Human Development Report (2013), Pakistan is ranked at 146 in terms of the gender gap and the Human Development Index. Nevertheless, with international organizations support such as the UNDP, CEDAW, and international donors, the struggle for promotion of gender inequalities brought about change to a certain extent while working towards the achievement of Millennium Development Goals. The ‘glass ceiling’ that separates women from their male colleagues by restricting them to within the boundary of the household is now less rigidly enforced. Furthermore, factors such as education, the media and economic development have strengthened the concept of gender equality and raised awareness about women’s rights.

Despite of moderate development in Swat, the consecutive crises of the militancy conflict during 2005-09, followed by the flood disaster in 2010, have reduced the
extent of progress towards gender equality. These crises caused huge internal displacement and losses to livelihood assets and infrastructure, which significantly affected the practical and strategic gender needs of the entire population of Swat (Shah, 2010). Fortunately, after the crises, gender equality has remained one of the core areas in government and NGO strategic and development plans. Similarly, rehabilitation and reconstruction activities are on full swing but until 2013, no specific gender policy has been developed.

Practical gender needs refer to food, water, shelter, health and security issues, where roles assigned to men and woman have been affected in several ways. The social structure in Swat expects men to fulfill the practical gender needs of their HH members. However, a key informant in Swat said that during the displacements, and even in the flood disaster, women participated equally in mitigating the needs of families. For example, while living in camps during displacement the male had no source of income, families were totally dependent on aid provided by the government and humanitarian agencies basic needs. Foods and other necessary items distributed by government and NGOs were collected by women and children. Female headed HHs were more prone and faced difficulties in for attaining livelihoods as the cultural system does not allow women to work outside the home. Due to the loss of family income, the burden on poor people with little or no cash income increased, particularly for mothers who were restricted to their traditional roles (Bari, 2010). The majority of respondents revealed that women and children were badly affected by the crises in terms of health, nutrition, shelter, privacy and food accessibility. Before the Army operation, women were restricted to their houses by the Taliban and were prohibited from continuing with their jobs. During an interview, one of the LHW/Visitor told that in 2008-09, the majority of LHW (V) stopped the provision of services to mother and children in different assigned areas, this not only reduced the regular income of the LHW but increased the suffering of the lactating mothers and new born children. Although some the LHWs have left their jobs because of murder and kidnapping threats, currently there are no such restrictions and the trends are changing; and in the study areas all the LHWs found able to take up their duties again and at the same time many other women have been hired by government and NGOs.

Strategic gender needs refer to equality and the right to access education, health services, wages and resources. The crises destroyed the local infrastructure of roads, schools, health facilities, hotels and other small industries, and in turn reduced rural and urban livelihood resources (WB and ADB, 2009). The gendered differences in accessing strategic opportunities increased during the conflict. Women were restricted from education, jobs and gaining skills. A Social Welfare Department officer at Mingora said “by destroying 60 percent and above women’s vocational training centres and steeling of equipment by militants, women
participation in community organizations and vocational trainings, has been adversely affected”. However, in this study, we observed that post-conflict development has, to some extent, changed the trend among men and women from labor to self-employment in all the selected villages.

According to the household survey and interviews, the changing livelihood trends among males are towards international migration for labor and business, followed by government and private sector services, local level small-scale businesses like property, transport, shops, electrical and mechanical works, with agriculture being the lowest priority. The majority of poor households surveyed in the villages responded that before the crises they were totally dependent on labor in agriculture, but this sector was highly affected by the crises, and in response a number of poor households were financially supported by humanitarian aid.

Such factors influenced movement to private sector jobs and self-employment, and a trend away from agri-based work to the services sectors. A woman NGO official in Upper Swat said that ‘the trend among women towards skills development has increased, but the issue of women’s mobility is hindering the interest and progress’. Nevertheless, the policies and strategies adopted by the government and NGOs to address strategic gender needs are pleasing. According to government and NGO official’s, the livelihood policies cover gender needs equally, through various income generating interventions. The rehabilitation and construction of over 75% schools, improvement in existing health facilities, restoration of vocational centres, and infrastructure development of official buildings, roads, hotels, and agricultural development as well as tourism development has brought changes in livelihood opportunities for both males and females. According to an impact assessment report (Surani, 2011), the USAID job project imparted skills training to 1375 workers including 30% women in various sectors in Swat. The report reveals that 30% of the beneficiaries changed their occupation from agricultural wage labor to skilled work. As a result, the overall economic condition of 56% of households has improved. Such kinds of opportunities have changed the decision-making processes about the use and accesses of livelihood resources.

**Decision Making at the HH Level and Division of Labor in Livelihood Activities**

It is always difficult to gain an accurate picture of decision making at the household level and the division of labor in livelihood activities. This section discusses how decisions are made at the HH level, and who makes the decisions, particularly in terms of access to livelihoods assets.
The anthropological and sociological researches conducted by Barth, Ahmad, Lindholm, Benedicta, Amine Ahmed and many local historians on Swat and other parts of northern Pakistan found that men are the main breadwinners and decision makers within and outside the home. Confinement of women in the household boundary-walls of the home, and to reproductive and community roles, and their sexual behaviour is linked to upholding the households’ honor. During field work, questions were asked from both men and women: Do men and women have equal access to the distribution and use of income sources like land, property, cash income and skills at the HHs? The reply was always “No”, accompanied by the explanation that men have the authority and access to all resources and decision making. Only two female respondents – one teacher and one NGO worker – replied “Yes” but qualified this by saying that only a few households give equal access to such resources. Other reasons given for their agreements that earning women have major roles in decisions about livelihoods as well as access to resources within the household.

Using the ethnographic tool of probing by asking sub-questions, the majority of respondents of either gender revealed that sometimes women within the household are very strong, particularly among the wealthy class referred (Khan families). In such households, men are expected to seek advices from woman (their mother, wife) concerning the sale or purchase of land, property, or a business; house construction; education of children; and particularly marriages of either sons or daughters. This trend particularly got momentum in the post crises development of NGOs and government organizations where women participation in livelihood earning have been prioritized in reconstruction interventions.

Pukhtoon culture is centuries old where males are not bound to give equal share to female in land and other properties. Male respondents emphasized that there is no harm to pay shares to sister, daughter or wife, however, to avoid any kind of mishap in the family and to defend families from paighoor (ostracism) by outsiders and to keep Namous (women honour), the Pukhtoonwali code of ethics must be adhered to. Similarly, women believe in the same values, namely that if they ask for land rights from their father or brother, this would bring paighoor and shame to women and would be detrimental to the family honor. ‘In Pukhtoon culture, the importance of Zar (gold), Zan (women) and Zamin (land) are the core values of Pukhtoonwali, which further shape the local ideology where the inheritance and property rights go in favor of males’ (Naz and Rehman, 2011: 27). However, due to recent increases in literacy, awareness through media and communication and access to judicial courts supported under post crises development initiatives, women have started to claims their share in land and properties and this has changed the tendencies toward equal rights to women. There are several cases found in which women have been granted their rights. In view of above discussion, the research can argue that by creating more
opportunities for women in various fields may bring changes in social and culture perspectives, and women can get more access to livelihood resources and this will gradually improve gender equality.

Conclusions

The gender perspective is often applied to a variety of social phenomena, and is critically explored on the basis of women’s interests regarding sex discrimination, inequality, rights, male dominance, gender bias etc. The theoretical approach of social constructionism and theories developed on feminism and gender, provide basic knowledge and ideas based on historical facts, but in reality, these theories may not necessarily be applicable in the same way in which they were developed. Based on observations and discussions with various people in the study area, the analysis shows that the functioning of households and fulfilling livelihood needs of families are both important responsibilities, for each gender respectively. Men perform outside work and earn a livelihood for their household members, while women support them by performing equally important domestic activities within the household. The ontological and epistemological aspects of gender relations explore to uncover what types of roles, relations and reality exist in various historical and cultural backgrounds. The research investigated various aspects of gender functions, not only for biological needs but also in terms of practical and strategic gendered livelihood needs. In Swat District of Pakistan, gender roles in daily household activities are socially and culturally constructed in the context of the Pukhtoonwali as a code of conduct. Gender roles in the rural study area remain very conservative and different from the practices accepted in more developed societies. Accessibility to livelihood resources including education, health, jobs and socio-political aspects among gender of various ethnic groups is not equal. The Khan families have still dominated political and economic roles and controlled the overall structure of the Swat valley.

This study found that there is diversity in livelihood dependency and occupations of different social and ethnic groups in the selected villages. However, there is evidence of an increasing trend in changing occupations, particularly after the crises of 2009 (conflict and displacement) and 2010 (flood). Although, the analysis shows that households depending on agriculture, labor, and local business were more affected in terms of livelihoods during and after the crises, while people in government services or professional occupations like education, skills and remittances were less affected in terms of economic losses. Recent changes in policies and strategies of the government and NGOs after the crises have created opportunities for both men and women to participate in several livelihood interventions in both the agricultural and non-agricultural sectors. The majority of male household members now seek migratory labor, jobs and business, followed by services in the government and private sectors. Although, women still have limited productive livelihood opportunities in Swat.
Women’s mobility to the market for shopping and for leisure time is still restricted in rural villages, due to cultural values of honor and avoiding shame; however, trends towards education opportunities have increased. However, mobility and accesses to social and economic resources has been provoked by conflict, post conflict development, displacement and current economic development, and media attention. On the other hand, the crises adversely affected social relationships and cooperation between various ethnic and social groups. The key informants stated that the crises had improved the livelihood conditions of the majority of poor households through the provision of diverse livelihood opportunities to men and women; while income of the majority of wealthy and middle-class households has been significantly reduced. Government and NGOs should prioritize the strategic gender needs in their development policies and strategies so as to provide equal opportunities to men and women for secure as well as sustainable livelihoods resources.

Recommendations

This research based on responses from the community as well government and NGOs officials suggest the following recommendations for future planning and research.

- In-depth researches on the post crises development policies of government and NGOs are needed to fulfill the gap of gender marginalization in term of provision of equal opportunities in the development interventions.
- Long-term development strategies should be adopted particularly in the post crises situation in comparison to focusing on short term policies, this will not only help the affected communities in compensation of the initial damages but will provide multiple livelihoods opportunities to both genders.
- Strategic gender needs should be prioritized in the development strategies of government and NGOs to provide equal opportunities to men and women for secure as well as sustainable livelihoods resources.

References


__________

**Dr. Noor Elahi** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Development Studies, COMSATS University Islamabad, Abbottabad Campus.
Gender Representation In Public Schools Textbooks Of Balochistan

Rana Saba Sultan
&
Nadil Shah
Department of Sociology
University of Karachi, Pakistan

Ambreen Fazal
Department of Media Studies
Sindh Madressatul Islam University

Abstract

Gender became the attention of contemporary scholarships when women were found in domestic issues as well as gender inequality in terms of job opportunities, education, health, political participation etc. Many studies have been carried out regarding women issues and provided policies and laws to provide opportunities for women to contribute in the society. So, gender presentation in school textbooks is newly emerging field of study in the academia. The present study focuses on women presentation in school textbooks of Balochistan. The English Books for Class I, to V were taken as sample for present study. These books were selected through purposive sampling. All conversations, texts and images related to women misrepresentation were taken from selected books. These data were analysed by the help of Michal Foucault’s theory of power/Knowledge and Discourse Analysis and also Cultural Hegemony by Antonio Gramsci. The findings of the present study suggest that textbooks of Balochistan are clearly misrepresenting women and promoting the male hegemony. The women are shown in domestic works and teaching jobs which are considered soft works. On the other hand, men are shown in school administrations, public domains, ownerships and in those jobs which need more power and energy. So, it is clear that schools textbooks promote the gender biased approach because men are shown in powerful, prestigious, well reputed and respectable jobs and women are shown in less respected and less valued positions.

Keywords: Balochistan, Textbooks, Gender, Cultural Hegemony, Power/Knowledge, Discourse.

تلخيص

تیلیکس
Textbook is defined as “a book used as a standard work for the study of a subject (i.e. Urdu, English, Science etc.)” (Simpson & Weiner, 1989, P. 1483). These textbooks are the main sources of socialization of young generation. By study these books, children to know about their heroes, history as well as their material and non-material culture. Instead of these, they also learn their statuses and roles such as father who is breadwinner or judge who can make decisions of other family members. On the other hand, girls learn the role of mother such as cleaning, caring and cooking etc from these books because textbooks are usually reflect or represent the social structure of society to the children. Society will function effectively if the young generation learns and adopts these statuses and roles in their daily lives. As Michal Foucault (2012) argued that school is one of the disciplinary institutions which can create a disciplinary society because the children are taught their roles by the educational institutions in the shape of images, conversations and stories in the textbooks which are instructed by the state/government. This study explores the Gender stereotypes for female (i.e. dependent, submissive, follower) and for male (i.e. Courage, independent, competent and leader) portrayed in images and stories or characters in children’s textbooks. Stereotype is defined “an image or idea of a particular type of person or thing that has become fixed through being widely held (Oxford English Dictionary, 1989, p. 1408)” and gender stereotype refers to fixed ideas and beliefs about males or females which are mostly not correct such as for female: unintelligent, silly, emotional etc or sometimes based on 3Cs (Caring,
Childrearing and Cleaning) and for male: intelligent, rational, strong etc. Therefore, these stereotypes are taught to the children by teachers through the recommended schools textbooks.

Textbooks are the only sources where children learn their cultural traits and construct their social world. These textbooks are shaped by men as well as women but the patriarchal structure is dominated though women are the part of curriculum developing but they are cannot question and they are vulnerable. The vulnerability of women gives the chance to men to create gender stereotypes/biasedness and add those materials which support the interest of men or patriarchal structure of society. Due, which these are full of hidden traditional gender, stereotypes, statues etc. As Stromquist, Lee & Brock-Utne (1998) argued that the textbooks are the main source of gender socialization due to which hidden gender stereotypical messages are taught to the children through these textbooks. This study tries to discover how the men use education to maintain their dominance in the society.

As Marxist believed that education is a tool used by Haves to exploit Havesnot and maintain the exploitative social structure. Same is the case with Education and Men. Education is a tool used by men to exploit women and the contribution of women in the development of society is completely hidden on the pages of textbooks. This study was conducted in Balochistan and critically reviewed the textbooks of Balochistan Text Book Board, Quetta, and how gender stereotypes are presented in these books.

**Literature Review**

Education being one of the social institutions and an agency for socialization of younger generation. It's plays a pivotal role in shaping the social structure of a society which is very important for smooth functioning of society. As functionalist like Talcott Parson and Emile Durkheim believed, that education bring universality in values, transformation of culture to the next generation and bring strong solidarity and it is maintenance of morality of a society (Faiz, 2015). On contrary, Education is also successive tool used to maintain the class society where oppressor benefits more and they maintain their dominance on civil society. As James M. Henslin (1981) writes in his book *Essentials of Sociology: A down-to-earth Approach* that Conflict theorists believe that education is the tool used by elite to exploit the poor. This approach is not only limited to the elite rather it is also used by men to maintain their dominance on women through textbooks, gender socialization in day to day lives and through other domestic roles and status to women.

Gender stereotype is practiced in all social institutions such as politics, education, health, media, and economy by men against women. It is greatly practiced in education such in hidden curriculum –teaching materials which are taught to the
students in the class but actually they are not written in the syllabus-(Henslin et al., 2015) and as well as through the textbooks which are tough in each levels of the students in educational institutions. The textbooks have important roles in socialization of young generation because all the social norms, values and the social structure is represented and promoted through these textbooks. Taylor (2003) gives similar argument about gender role. As he said that textbooks are the main sources by which children, learn their respective gender roles such as mothering for females and breadwinning for male. Kittelberger (2002) also agreed that gender stereotype is constructed through books by using gender discriminatory languages, pictures, contents and illustration in children’s textbooks. Further Ya-Lun Tsao said that most of male characters are titles, pictures and texts but female are not only underrepresented but also they are portrayed as unimportant in the children’s books (2008).

It is usually showed in the children’s textbooks that women or girls have less important roles in the society than the men or boys (McCabe et al, 2011) because they are portrayed in less important roles in school textbooks (Weitzman et al, 1972). Stacay, Chick and Kendal (2006) also gave related argument about gender role as she said that in U.S history textbook of K-Grade 12, women roles in the contribution in the world wars is usually neglected in history textbooks of America. Further, McCabe et al, (2011) write that patriarchal structure of society is legalized, reproduced and maintained through the textbooks which are taught to the young generation. Moreover, Books are the main sources of gender socialization and shaping the gender identities through which the thinking and acting pattern of children are shaped according to broader social structure.

It is clear that teaching and reading these gender-biased materials engender the self-identities of children. Moreover, by learning these gender biases from books, children try to adopt those roles and behaviours, which will become the part of their socialization process (Tsao, 2008). Because reading these texts, children construct their ideas and compare the learned knowledge to the external structure of society and finally they construct their own ideologies, beliefs and values (Mendoza and Reese, 2001, cited by Ya-Lun Tsao, 2008). As Singh (1998) argued that by accepting these ideologies, children make their own self-images and act according to learned image such as girls consider herself women and boy as men. These pictures and language of books greatly affects their development because it is their learning and development age. Despite perpetuating ideologies, textbooks also portray gender roles in which women are assigned traditional gender roles, which are less important in the society.

In children schools books male characters are shown more potent, powerful and active than women. So, these gender stereotypes are hurdle on the ways of girls for being the role models in the society (Tsao, 2008). In the pictures of conventional places, female are assigned passive roles and male are active.
Female are shown dependent, silly, emotional, clumsy and lacking intelligence in the textbooks. So, Trepanier-Street and Romatowski (1999) said that it is possible to influence the children attitudes through the children’s literature by portraying such gender roles in images of textbooks. On contrary, Koble and La Voie (1981) said that children books not only reproduce gender stereotypes rather these can eliminate the sexism and gender discrimination if equal or positive gender roles are portrayed in children's textbooks. Similarly, arguments developed by other researchers and they said that teaching egalitarian books can change the gender attitudes and beliefs of children through a period of time (Barclay, 1974; Trepanier-street and Romatowski, 1999 cited by McCabe et al, 2011). Many pieces of research are available around the world about Gender representation in children's textbooks as mentioned above. Likewise, some researches were also conducted in Pakistan about textbooks and gender representation in Pakistani textbooks.

Pakistan, being a developing country, with less education ratio, adequate literature available where gender disparity exists. From children's textbooks to the other general books such as about history etc. Many sociologists and educationalist questioned despite this phenomena exist in Pakistani textbooks. Khurshid et al (2010) conducted a research on representation of female images in Urdu and English textbooks and found that women are working in private domain such as housewives and home-related activities and men are working in public domain such as political or religious leaders and breadwinner etc. This research depicts that women are only limited to home and leading qualities and earning is responsibility attached to men. A similar study has been conducted on textbooks of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa by and found that women/girls are greatly underrepresented in children textbooks (Ullah & Skelton, 2013). Further, they argued that men are given authoritative positions in the images of children's books and women are given traditional gender roles such as mothering, caring, and cooking etc. Additionally, Jabeen &Ilyas (2012) carried out a research on gender modelling in Textbooks in Sindh Province argued that women roles are limited to nurturing, cooking, cleaning and sewing in Pakistani textbooks. Despite these traditional roles and stereotypes, images and texts in children’s textbooks also depict gender disparity in games.

Further, Ullah and Skelton said that they did not only found the traditional gender roles and stereotypes in education, housework etc rather they had found that there is great gender biasedness in sports as well. As they found that girls were portrayed as playing with dolls, or swinging in the water but boys are playing football, hockey, and cricket (2013). Hazir Ullah (2016) also carried out another research on textbooks and gender about teaching domain where he founded that children textbooks portrayed images where it is showed that teaching in primary schools is a profession for women and universities for men because primary is directly attached to the domestic positions where children need love and care and university teaching harder or far from village which performed by men. The studied literature proves that gender stereotype exists in all schools textbooks in
the world and these materials should be reformed for creating an egalitarian and proper society in national and international level.

Theoretical Framework

For this study, Discourse Analysis will be used to analyse these text and images of textbooks. Discourse analysis is used by scholars and researchers to analysis any social phenomenon to know the hidden messages behind any text. This approach believes that how power is established and reinforced by language. For Foucault (1980), it is “through discourse (through knowledge) that we are created; and that discourse joins power and knowledge, and its power follows from our casual acceptance of the “reality with which we are presented” (Pitsoe & Letseka, 2013, p. 24; Shah, Sultan & Kaker, 2018). The main concern of discourse is to know the power relation and how powerful create biased and stereotypical discourse to exercise their power on the weaker segment of society or propagate their ideology. Here powerful means men and the weaker segment of society are women. Foucault also believed that morality, truth, and meanings are constructed through discourse (Pitsoe & Letseka, 2013). This study tries to know, how men are using schools textbooks against women to main their dominance in the existing social system. How school textbooks portrayed those pictures and texts which present traditional roles and status on the base of sex. Despite, discourse and power/knowledge, the theory of hegemony by Antonio Gramsci was used for analysing the data because this theory gives the critical lens to the researcher to find out the hidden ideologies and politics behind any text shown in books, media or other sources to the public. Gramsci defined as culture hegemony -rules and regulations, which are implemented by elite/political society on civil society and civil society, believe that these are their benefits but actually, they may not be (Anderson, 1981). Further, Terry Eagleton (1991) writes that for Gramsci ‘hegemony means the dominant power wins consent to its rule from those it subjugates’. In Hegemony, “oppressed class gives permission to oppressors to oppress them” (Pitsoe and Letseka, 2013, p. 24).

Method of the Study

The Textbooks of Balochistan are taken for the present study as unites of analysis because very little researches have been conducted on this area, which is a hard topic in the context of Balochistan. The textbooks of class I to V were taken in the present study because these books are more important in children’s socialization. In this age, a child can learns most of the cultural traditions from society coupled with information and knowledge receives from schools as well as peer groups within the schools. Inclusively, English Textbooks of these classes were taken for the study because these were easier for the researcher as well as the official language of the country. Secondly, English language is considered a more liberal language, by teaching English to the children; they would become more modern
and liberal. Despite this, how textbooks are going toward contrary to predetermined beliefs and propagating the traditional mindsets. Moreover, Qualitative approach was used for carrying out the current study. There were two reasons of taking this approach. First, all data were images, conversations and textbooks. Such data need deep critical analysis by the interpretation of researchers. Secondly, the researchers’ expertise was in this method. The researcher also selected Purposive sampling technique for selection of textbooks because it allows researchers to select those materials, which are very important and appropriate for the ongoing project. Finally, Antonio Gramsci (See theoretical framework) analyzed data through the theory of Michael Foucault Discourse and Power/Knowledge and theory of Culture hegemony.

Findings and Results

Promoting Male Supremacy in Schools Textbooks

Textbooks promote and protect the male supremacy. It can be seen from the text in a school children book that a six year boy setting around a table with his all family members and introduces his family.

*My name is Saad. I am six years old. I have six members in my family. My grandfather and grandmother love us. I have a brother and a sister. My father is a doctor. My mother is a house wife. We love each other* (Unite No 4. I and My family. English Book for Class I, page. 34).

Similarly, females are believed to work in private sphere and males are responsible for public sphere. Males are breadwinner and they are responsible to buy the goods for family from markets and being a shopkeeper is also a male oriented work. As shown in *English book for Class I, Page. 50* two small boys meet each other in front of a fruit and vegetable shop and they are conversing with each other.

*Ali:* AssalamoAlaikum Masood, how are you?
*Masood:* Walakum Assalam, I am fine! Thank you.
*Ali:* I am here to buy fruits for my gusts.
*Masood:* And I am here to buy vegetables for dinner.
*Ali:* Do you like fruits too?
*Masood:* Yes, I do. Fruits are good for health.

*Ali:* Which fruits do you like most?
*Masood:* I like apples and bananas.
*Ali:* But I like Mango. It is called the King of all fruits.
*Masood:* Uncle, please give 1kg turnips and 2 kg potatoes.
*Ali:* Please give 2 kg mangoes and one dozen bananas.
Likewise, females are depicted with temporary, love and soft objects. On other hand, male are attached with hard jobs and ownership in Children’s school textbooks.

She has a cat. They (two boys) have a football. He has a ball. I (a boy) have a bat. We (two men) have a big house (English 1, Page. 60).

Cat is attached with female because cats are believe to be innocents and loved by everyone. On other hand, male are attached with football, ball, bat and big house. Football and Cricket are considered male games because these games need a lot of energy and physical power. The society believes that women have no capacity to play these games. Moreover, the concept of ownership is also attached with male due to which only men are the owner of houses and women are alike guests who would come or go after her marriage.

**Gendering the Roles**

Roles are given according to the gender of the individual because roles are socially constructed. Women are portrayed with traditional 3Cs (Caring, Cleaning and Childrearing) (Henslin, 1981) while men are represented as owners, strong, independent, responsible for family affairs and other socially respected positions in the society. As mentioned in *English Book for class II* (P. 59)

Sadaf has a doll. Ajmal has a book

Similar gender biased role are shown in a picture in *English Book for class II* (P. 97)

My mother can cook food. She cannot play tennis.

He can drive a car.

Above, both statements are clearly showing the gendering the roles according to his or her sexual orientation. In first statement Sadaf (girl) is attached with doll and Ajmal (boy) is with book because Ajmal need to get education and should get a lucrative job for running the family in future. A detailed story is presented in *English book for class IV* (P. 19) which is totally based on gender biased discourse.

Sana is a student of class four. She has three brothers and two sisters. Her father is a laborer. He wants his children get education. Sana, her brothers and sisters work hard to fulfill their father’s dream.

She is a brilliant student. She always gets a good position in her class. She takes part in the debate competitions. She has taken good positions in different debate competitions. She respects her teachers very much. She is a very obedient student. Her behaviour is good with everyone at school. She always abides by the time and does her work properly. She helps her class fellows. She knows the safety precautions for playing in the school ground and takes care of herself and others. She also
tells her class fellows to take care of others while playing and running.
In the evening, she completes her school work and learns her lessons. She also helps her younger brothers and sisters in their studies. She teaches them all subjects every day.
She also helps her mother in the kitchen and waters the plants. She spends some time with her grandmother and goes to bed early at night.

The above-mentioned story clearly depicts the gender-biased roles. It is a story of a girl who is study in 4th class. First paragraph represents the hegemonic power of father where all family members act according to the expectations of him. Second paragraph is showing that girls should be obedient. Third paragraph depicts that women should play the role of caring and look after others. In Fourth Paragraph, it is showing that women are responsible for all family internal affairs. In fifth, It is showing that cooking and running the kitchen is the responsibly of females in home.

Caring is a Female Job

Traditionally, the role of a woman is to be the servant of man, which is very common in South Asian countries. Because caring for children, making children ready for schools, ironing the clothes of husband/brother responsibility of women in the home.

Image I and II clearly represent the same scenario, taken from English 1, taught to students of first grade students of public schools of Balochistan. There are two conversations shown in this picture. In the first one, a small boy is sleeping in bed and mother wakes him up. In second, a child is going to school and mother is saying goodbye. This picture is clearly showing caring the children is the job of a female (Mother) in the home. As common in our society, the mothers get up early and prepare breakfast for family members. After which she wakes up all the children and make them ready for schools, feed them breakfast and sometimes
children are taken to school by her if a school is near to home. Similar, message is communicated in Image I. In first conversation, Mother has prepared breakfast and went to Saad to wake him. In second conversation, she has fed breakfast and made him ready for school. Image ii is also taken from the same book in which father is standing near the bed of his son and asking him to sleep well and the child is responding the father with respect. If both pictures are compared, the traditional gender role is reproduced which we can say that caring is the job of female. The most important thing in both pictures are time difference. The mother has visited her son on morning and father on night because feeding breakfast, making him ready for school is the job of mother. On the other hand, father goes to office in daytime and he would be back at evening and just asks the children about day activities because he is the head of family. The second difference between both pictures is behaving pattern. If we see the picture of child, it can be seen that, when mother enters in the room, child wakes up and greeting mother in an impolite way but replies his father with respect and polite manner because love and affection are female characteristics. Moreover, mother has raised her hand and replying her son but father is standing in a distance and asking his son because boss would be friendly with other people. So father is the head or boss in the family.

**Promoting Glass Ceiling in Children’s School Books**

Glass Ceiling is a term used by different Sociologists to study the gender discrimination in different aspect (i.e. Education, Economics, Politics etc) of society. Federal Glass Ceiling Commission defined that it is “the unseen, yet unreachable barrier that keeps minorities and women from rising to the upper rungs of the corporate ladder, regardless of their qualifications or achievements (1995, P. 4). Generally, Pakistani society believes that woman cannot run administration system due to different weakness.
Similarly, stereotypical realities are propagated in schools textbooks. There are four pictures in Image iii. Image is taken from an English book, which is taught to third grade students in government schools of Balochistan. In Image iii, first picture is a Headmaster/principal who is a man, second one is a female teacher with her students, third one is a librarian who is a man and fourth one is a male sport teacher. This image clearly depicts that male can only be a head of institution as well as homes because males are serious, energetic, strong and leaders. Leading jobs are signed to males and females are considered weak and followers. So such jobs are assigned to females in the society. On the other hand, second picture, female teacher who has put her hand on little child which is the sign of love. Teaching is a feminine job because females are sober, lover and easy job for females. Though women can be the head of institutions, they are not given the chance to go upper positions because of Glass Ceiling (Wiley, 2012) and bamboo ceiling (Hyun, 2005).

Discussion

As social constructionists, believe that social realities are constructed by society according to the normative and social structure of society. As French Sociologist Pierre Bourdieu believed that power is constructed by society and it is legalized and justified by social structure and agencies (Pitsoe&Letseka, 2013). Similarly, it is society who determines the social position and roles of individual the society. Karl Marx also added that material condition such as technology, ability to produce and social relations production determines the society’s superstructure (Seligman, 1901).

So, the factors of production, capacity of producing material goods and social relations are owned by most powerful segment of society who are “men” and women are vulnerable, alienated and marginalized group in the society. The social realities are construct by society which support supremacy the dominancy of men and subordination and inferiority of women.

Similarly, it is clear from the above given data that women are represented as inferior, obedient, subordinate and men are portrayed as owner, dominancy, supremacy of male members of society in School Textbooks of Balochistan.

School Textbooks of Balochistan are promoting and perpetuating male supremacy and dominancy. On the other hand, women are rendered as inferior, submissive and dependent. The young generation are taught these biased and discriminatory approaches and they would adopt and practice them in their daily life activities. As Michal Foucault (1980) said that discourse creates knowledge and knowledge has power. The power and knowledge would create and recreate the social
realities in which we are represented (Pitsoe & Letseka, 2013). Most importantly,
the women have accepted and justified the male hegemony and women believed
that realities are in favour of them. The women never resist against male
hegemonic power because they believe that it is for the betterment, development
and help women to be mainstreamed in the society but actually it is not
(Anderson, 1981). It is very necessary to create Counter-Hegemony (Pratt, 2004)
against male dominant discourse in school textbooks for promoting equality and
egalitarian approach towards women in the society.

The findings of the present study clearly highlights that school textbooks have
also representing roles according to the gender of the person. Women are depicted
as doing domestic works, which is believed to be in private domain. On the other
hand, men are involved in public domains (Ullah & Skelton, 2013). Male
members are found driving, ownership the houses, decision-making position and
external affairs of the family. On the other hand, female members are depicted as
teaching, doctors, cooking, cleaning, playing with dolls and emotional and soft
works and dealing with internal affairs of the family (Chiponda & Wassermann,
2011).

Most importantly, the result of the current study highlighted that women are
mostly represented in lower positions and men are rendered in highest status
which glass ceiling (Cotter et al., 2001). The above Image No III and IV are
clearly showing that women only can teach which is a soft job which is caring and
looking after the children in school while men are represented as librarian which
is managing position. So, women do not have management qualities and they
cannot reach on this position because women are believed to be inferior and weak
in the society. So, breaking the discriminatory approach, it needs to follow the
counter hegemony against glass ceiling in offices, homes as well as other public

Thus, the school textbooks of Balochistan are promoting women biased
approaches and perpetuating men supremacy to the young generation. It is dire
need to adopt the egalitarian approach while developing the curriculums and
schools textbooks for the children. Otherwise, our children would learn negative
attitudes and behaviors from textbooks against women. Inequality between men
and women would be continued forever which is very dangerous in this modern
society.

Conclusions

The present study is conducted to know the representation of gender in school
textbooks of Balochistan. It is found from the study that school textbooks are
promoting and perpetuating the women biased and discriminatory messages to the
next generation. Women are portrayed in traditional 3Cs (Cooking, Cleaning, Childrearing) while men are represented as bread winners, head of families, decision making about family affairs and involved in works which are representing the public domains. Even a small boy can be the head of family and he can introduce the family instead of above 70 years mother. These are occurring due to gender discourse created by society and social structure because school textbooks usually represent the social realities that are prevailing in the society. So, the women should be taken in consideration while developing the curriculums and women should also get equal chance to be presented in textbooks. Textbooks are the only sources from which the children learn the social realities of society. Stereotyping and biased messages should be considered while developing the curriculums for school children.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the issues of women and women should be taken in confidence while developing the policies and laws regarding education, otherwise, women would be victimized and would be most disadvantaged group in the society. This study is very limited in scope, more studies can be carried out for bring equality and balance in schools textbooks of Balochistan as well as Pakistan because women have similar representation in all schools textbooks of the country. After completion of the curriculums and textbooks, there should an independent committee to check such bigots and prejudiced images, texts, exercises and other literatures in children school textbooks. The curriculums should be non-sexist as well as anti-sexist so that women and men get equal chance of presentation.

References


---

**Dr. Rana Saba Sultan** is Professor in the Department of Sociology, University of Karachi.

**Nadil Shah** is M.Phil. Scholar in the Department of Sociology, University of Karachi, Pakistan.

**Ambreen Fazal** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Media Studies, Sindh Madressatul Islam University.
Local Communities Participation In China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): The Case Of Balochistan

Siraj Bashir  
Department of Social Work  
University of Balochistan

Muhammad Arshad  
Department of Social Work  
University of Karachi

Sadia Barech  
Department of Social Work  
University of Balochistan

Abstract

In development, community participation has become a crucial aspect to encourage community interest, ownership and sustainability of projects. Development by itself relates with human development, therefore the participation of the people in their own development is very essential. This mega Chinese plan is to spend 62 billion US dollars to build China Pakistan Economic corridor and the Gwadar port. China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) is a collection of development projects, which is intended to rapidly expand and upgrade Pakistani infrastructure, as well as deepen and broaden economic links between Pakistan and China. According to Government of Pakistan, the corridor Gwadar-Kashger would be a game-changer for Pakistan and will certainly put the province of Balochistan in new ranks of development sector. This research paper discusses the involvement and participation of local communities in CPEC project in Pakistan using a case study of local communities in Balochistan. The study examines two key opinions: community membership in the CPEC decision implementing process; and the contribution of CPEC project towards Balochistan development. The study includes interviews and document analysis. A sample of 100 multi-stakeholders (ordinary community members, politicians, Government officials, NGOs representatives, fishermen and businessmen) will be selected through a pre-structured interview schedule using random and purposive techniques for primary data. The data will be analyzed with the help of Chi-Square. The findings of the study may help to policymakers, project experts and national and international organizations to introduce new participatory approaches to ensure local communities participation in development projects, particularly in the CPEC project.

Keywords: Local Communities Participation; China_ Pakistan Economic Corridor, Balochistan.
Introduction

Development is a method to enhance and build the social, political, economic and cultural advancement in a particular area or community for the betterment of that selected area, this include justices, equality, well facilitate living slandered, equal opportunities as well as security and improved facilities for health, education, welfare, housing etc. As Liebenberg & Theron (1997) indicated that development itself could be a process of enhancing and empowering individuals to get higher management over their resources or lives as people and as a member of a community. It suggests that development aims to build individuals’ skills so as to prepare and improve native resources toward meeting the fundamental desires.
economic improvement however conjointly the advance in human dignity, self-sufficiency, security, equity and value (Khwaja, 2004). According to Davids (2005), development means improvement in the whole walk of life, which includes the economic, social, political, cultural, psychological and environmental.

The concept of development gained a great value after World War II. The simple way to measure development with different indicators such as gross per capita income. This perspective was linked with economic development and economic growth. The countries with sustained growth of GNP or per capita income were measured as developed. This idea of development supported by international organizations such as World Bank and other regional trends and national governments in the world. World Bank, uses Gross National Product per capita (GNP p.c.) to divide the countries of the world into development categories. Low-income countries are defined as those with a GNP p.c. figure in 2001 of US$745 or less, lower-middle-income countries have US$746–2,975, upper-middle-income countries US$2,976–9,205 and high-income countries are those with GNP p.c. of US$9,206 or more (Willis, 2005).

During 1970s-80s, a new idea of development appeared where development was considered as a condition of human well-being rather than as the condition of GNP. According to declaration (1974) "the basic concern should be human; human beings have basic needs: food, shelter, clothing, health and education. Any process of development that does not lead to their realization or even worse disrupts them is a travesty of the proposal of development" (United Nations, 1974).

In the late 1980s, the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), this measure divided into three dimensions of development in relation to human well-being: a long and healthy life, education and knowledge and a decent standard of living. The general concept of this approach was to eliminate poverty and inequality in different societies. After this approach, development is understood and measured not only in economic feature but also in terms of social well-being: health, education and political structure and a standard live. That's why, it has been said that development is not only to be measured in terms of growth, but is to be described as growth and social change (UNDP, 2014).

The human well-being concept of development referred that all human being should achieve moral and material well being. "the ultimate purpose of development is to provide every one with ever increasing opportunities for a better life. It, therefore, requires an equitable distribution of income and other social resources in order to promote justice and efficient production, to raise levels of employment substantially to expand and improve facilities for education, health, nutrition, housing and social and cultural well-being. The qualitative and structured changes that development thus imposes on society must go hand in hand with economic progress while racial, ethnic and social inquility must be
substantially reduced. There are decisive factors in hastening development and hence must be handled with dynamism. The concept of development in this study, linked with the enhanced living standard of people at first place in communities through executing of development programs (Food Agriculture Organization, 1975).

In development programs, community participation has become an important facet to encourage community interest, possession and sustainability of projects. Development by itself relates to human development, so the participation of the folks in their own development is extremely essential. Therefore, Communities' participation has a very high status over the last three decades. According to Marsland (2006) participation is a joint process, the public in general voluntarily, or due to arguments, accord to work together with remotely decided advancement venture, regularly by contributing their work and assets as an end-result of some normal advantages. World Bank (1990) elaborated that participation as a method through that shareholders manipulate and shares management over development programs and choices and resources that have an effect on them.

Therefore, based on the above concepts of participation and development, we will say that participation may be a vital method of empowering people within the development process. In a simple way, participation may be a process which provides power to the individuals to advance their lives. On the other hand, the involvement is important for voluntary action and not forced by external. So as for the people to participate effectively, they need to be willing to participate in development projects (Pawan, 2014).

The Chinese plan to invest over than $ 62 billion dollars in Pakistan to strengthen the relationship between each country. China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) is a gathering of improvement ventures, which incorporates network, vitality, and foundation ventures. Evaluated to be about 3,000 km long, it may connect Gwadar port to China's Xinjiang region. Which is planned to quickly extend and update Pakistani foundation, and also develop and widen monetary connections among Pakistan and China (Malik, 2014). This Chinese mega venture has not just offered extraordinary open doors for the monetary flourishing of China and Pakistan, however, will likewise give an incredible enhance to their key significance. As indicated by Bhattacharjee (2015) the passage Gwadar-Kashgar would be a distinct advantage for Pakistan and would assume a vital job in the advancement of Balochistan. The CPEC is viewed as a one of a kind key task that guarantees to thrive in Pakistan and has shepherded in another time of closeness with China.

With such a huge investment in a country which is already in a financial crisis and facing some severe issues in local and international politics. Such confederation
Local Communities Participation in China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): 
The Case of Balochistan

will directly affect the business and political conditions of the country at the local level. Furthermore, there are possible changes the development of China Pakistan Economic Corridor will directly influence the business and demographic cycle, one of the major reason for such development is the deepness of sea level of Gwadar and its geostrategic location of Balochistan.

Balochistan is a resource-rich province covering forty three (43 %) percent of the land area of Pakistan. It has an about seven hundred (700) km-long coastline on the Arabian Sea, which connects Pakistan to the Persian Gulf and Strait of Hormuz. It has one of the largest gold mines (RekoDiq) and reservoirs of iron and copper (Saindak mines) in the world (Mir Sher & Muhammad). Under the common frame of the CPEC, a great number of energy, infrastructure and port-related projects have been started in Balochistan. In the past, no concentration was given to the development of local people of Balochistan and historical facts show that the area was totally ignored. The people of Balochistan raised several questions on this regard but no attention was given to them. The CPEC major parts fell in Balochistan province, but the local people of the province is being ignored in the overall process of the project activities. As Quddus stated (2018), that we are not against of the project but demanded due rights of local people under the CPEC and more than Rs5,000 billion is being spent on the project, but local people are not getting even one percent participation. The CPEC can help diminish the distrust among the Baloch people if local people can be involved in CPEC project. The project can succeed with the participation of local people. Therefore, nowadays in the world, every country believes local people participation in development projects and it is also an essential approach for public development.

This research paper discussed the involvement and participation of local communities in CPEC project in Pakistan using a case study of local communities in Balochistan. The study examined two key opinions: community membership in the CPEC decision influence power; and the contribution of CPEC project towards Balochistan development. The research was directed by five interconnected research questions: (1) how local people perceive their attributes towards community participation in CPEC project; (2) what are the responsibilities and duties of local people in CPEC project; (3) to what level do local people participate in the CPEC decision-making process; (4) what are the factors that limited local people in CPEC project; and (5) what are the major consideration of local people on the donation of CPEC towards Balochistan development.

Review Literature

Chinese Economic Corridor’s Mega Venture with Pakistan

China always remains the most trustworthy ally at global political, economic, social and cultural stage. There is no uncertainty that Pak-China reciprocal
relations are solid since the start (Arif, 1984). Every China and Pakistan dealt with their relationship in an extremely valuable and explained strategy. Pakistan and China helped each other at the vital occasions. Pakistan additionally upheld the entrance of China in the UN framework and perpetual individual from the UN Security Council (Iqbal, 2011). On the opposite side, China additionally bolstered Pakistan amid the critical crossroads and upheld Pakistan manufactured its military and financial abilities, for example, Heavy Mechanical Complex, Taxila in 1968, Ordinance Factory in East Pakistan in 1970 and Aero-nautical Complex (Tai, 2017).

In the 1980s, 1990s, and 2000s once sanctions obligatory by the USA, (Dr. Shah, 2016). In November 2014, the Chinese government declared that it will finance Chinese corporations to create $45.6 billion worth of energy and infrastructure projects in Pakistan as a part of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC). China will invest around $33.8 billion in numerous energy projects and $11.8 billion in infrastructure projects-roads, railway lines etc, which is able to be completed by the end of 2020 (Dr. Sadaf & Zafar, 2017). On 20 April 2015, Islamic Republic of Pakistan and China signed an agreement to start work on the $46 billion agreement, that is about 20% of Pakistan’s annual GDP with about $28 billion in immediate projects and the rest allocated for projects in the pipeline (CPECNEWS, 2017).

This Corridor is an assortment of development projects that involve the linking of Gwadar Port to China through highways, railways, oil and gas pipelines, and an optical fiber link. Major physical infrastructure to be designed includes 2,700-kilometre highway stretching from Kashgar to Gwadar through Khunjrab, railways links for freight trains between Gwadar and Khunjrab linking to China and having possible regional connectivity with Afghanistan, Iran, and India, and the Karachi-Lahore motorway. The project will commence the renewal and extension of the Karakorum Highway that links Xinjiang with Pakistan's northern region Gilgit–Baltistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Wang, J, 2015).

It will contain for the most part several areas of cooperation as well as economic and technical joint cooperation, construction of road and rail links, fiber optic cable projects, development of industrial zones and benefits to regional countries can develop relations. The linking of China with Gwadar port provides numerous financial benefits. Gwadar once equipped can link Central Asian Regions (CARs) to outside world. Gwadar-Kashgar Economic Corridor (GKEC) can decrease 12000 miles between China and the Middle East. A smooth access to the Middle East, African, and EU markets for Chinese exports (CPGS, 2014).

China intends to fabricate oil storerooms and a refinery at Gwadar Port, with oil transported to its Xinjiang Uighur Autonomous Region through street and pipeline. This will permit it to move vitality and supplies to landlocked China
while not looking at the Strait of Malacca, that may be hindered by the U.S. or then again India should threat escape inside the locale. The undertaking will result in being developed in western China, where strains are stewing from exercises by central separatists (Qama, 2017).

Pakistan is deliberately an extremely fundamental goal for China since it joins China to three locales, the South Asian district, the Middle East and Central Asia. The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) intended to be produced with Chinese venture is predicates to more help financial and vital participation between the two nations. Chinese Premier Li Keqiang accentuated the improvement of the CPEC amid his May 2013 visit to Pakistan. The passageway can interface Gwadar Port in Balochistan to Kashgar in north-western China, which can assemble Gwadar not just totally operational anyway a huge remote ocean port in the region (Zimmerman, 2015). Opened for tasks in 2007, the control of Gwadar Port was exchanged to China's state-owned China Overseas Ports Holding in February 2013. From that point forward, Gwadar is experiencing a genuine development to demonstrate it into a full-fledged, deep-water beneficial port. When the hallway is developed, it will fill in as an essential passage for exchange among China and the Middle East, and Africa. The hallway is relied upon to cut by 12,000-kilometre the course that Middle East oil supplies should now take to touch base at Chinese ports (Mahmood, 2016).

Balochistan and CPEC

Balochistan covers most of the land mass of country and the smallest in terms of population. When considered against socio-economic ranks of other provinces, Balochistan is the least developed. Its community is still snowed under with tribal structures. The province is rich in resources but has unskilled population due to the negligence of policymakers is an interference in using those resources to the utmost. The failure of provincial governments to improve the capacities of the population and its institutions has also considerably contributed to the underdevelopment of the province.

According to PILDAT report (2012) that Baluchistan's literacy rate sets at fifty-one-point five percent and requires great attention. The unemployment ratio is twenty percent have also reasoned a low annual growth rate. The Institution findings recommend that Balochistan has had a weak development presentation over the past 70 years and its GDP per capita is also the lowest as compared with other provinces of Pakistan. Since the beginning of Pakistan, unusual notice was taken on the province while not have of infrastructure and weaknesses in institutions affected the result and performance of the plans. The development programs that were executed in past did not bring advantageous change, thus which speared disappointment between the residents of the region as their interest for more noteworthy financial improvement was not replied. To
tackle the objections of people, completely different governments tried, however, all of them have failed. However, the provincial government lacks the capacity, moreover because the resistance from the social group leaders, has barred the method.

According to the findings a report (2005), the literacy rate in Balochistan is very low, which was only 26 percent. As compared with other provinces Balochistan also bags behind in other socio-economic indicators, safe drinking water, sanitation, education and health (Maria, 2013). The majority of the population of Balochistan lives in rural areas where majority of them don't have the basic facilities such as education, health, housing and etc. In contrast, 70-80 percent of villages, in other parts of the country, have the basic facilities. Balochistan is the most backward province of the country but very rich regarding natural resources, natural gas is the country's main energy source and accounts for fifty percent of the total energy use. The most produced gas of Balochistan is use in country which is sixty eight (68) percent. But, unfortunately, only four districts in Balochistan get gas. The gas was discovered in 1953 at Sui and it was reached to Rawalpindi 1964. Unfortunately, the capital city of Balochistan, Quetta, received it after forty three (33) years of the discovery.

The anger of local people of Balochistan against government or state has shaped over these matters. A number of people specially nationalist parties and youth have warned the government and state against more development in province unless they are taken into assurance and given equitable share (Frederic, 2006). Out of almost 20,000 students who graduate in Balochistan each year, only 1,800 are able to get jobs. Unemployment and poverty are the major factors behind their anger (UNDP, 2016). Secondly, the lack of human development chances have also created many issues in Balochistan. Without solving these issues it will be very difficult for the government to get success results from the CPEC (Pakistan is a Resilient Country, 2012).

The development of this Corridor agreement is a most important mission which is considered a game changer for the Balochistan, country, and region as well. According to government officials and experts, this project will open up a number of new opportunities for both countries particularity Balochistan. It will be the financial hub and will donate towards the advancement of Balochistan, bringing about tending to the different social financial issue of the province. According to the Ministry of Planning, Development, and Reform the following projects have been planned in Balochistan under CPEC.
Table 1: CPEC-energy projects for Balochistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Projects</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>MW</th>
<th>Estd. Cost (US$ M)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gwadar Coal Power project</td>
<td>Gwadar</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUBCO coal power plant 1X660 MW</td>
<td>Hub Choki</td>
<td>1320</td>
<td>1940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaddani Power Park Project</td>
<td>Bela</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) 2x660MW</td>
<td></td>
<td>1320</td>
<td>3,960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Jetty+ Infrastructure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Energy Projects</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>2,940</td>
<td>7,460</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Planning, Development and Reform, 2017

Methodology

The study was conducted in Makran division (Turbat, Gwadar and Punjgur), Balochistan. The data collected from the local communities and government officials were selected through pre-structured questionnaire from three districts. Quantitative method was used to collect general and focused data and conclusions. The purposive and convenience techniques of non-probability sampling method were applied and the sample size was 100 respondents.

Table 2: Numbers of the respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community people</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government official</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political parties workers</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs representatives</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results and Discussions

The involvement of the local communities in any project is essential to the success of development practice. The absent of local community participation in the project may create problem which leads towards failure. Local people participation is obligatory and indispensable for project success. The majority of the development programs particularly planned by International Organizations such as World Bank, IMF, and Asian Development Bank necessitate including the local people in the structuring, executing and observing of improvement ventures. Be that as it may, the potential advantages joined with participatory methodology are disputable.
Table: 4.1

Respondents knowledge about CPEC projects detail

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Do you know about the CPEC projects detail</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some extent</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Interpretations

The survey indicates that majority of the participate (59%) don’t have any knowledge about CPEC projects detail. The second highest respondents who were 37% said that they know about the projects and the most respondents were government officials and politician who know about CPEC projects.

The findings show that majority of people don't have CPEC projects details. Therefore, it is very essential for the government to involve local people of Balochistan in CPEC because there absent may create problems for the project. For this purpose the Government of Pakistan should conduct different sessions though these sessions people should be awarded about the detail of CPEC.

Table: 4.2

Participant’s contribution in the development planning process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Have you participated in initial process of CPEC programs?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Interpretations

For the above table’s question very low (7% only) belong to government departments and political parties, 93% respondents have not participated in CPEC planning phase. The survey directly indicated that most of the respondents have not participated in any kind to CPEC project which isn’t a good sign for the residents.

From the findings of the study, we conclude that general people are not being involved in the initial stage of the project and just very limited government official were involved. Actually, the success of any project depends on local people participation. All political parties, raised their concerns on CPEC project which is not a positive sign for the project. Therefore, federal government should talks with all parties to finish their concerns regarding it.
Table: 4.3
Respondents’ perception about their Opinion in CPEC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents view point value by related authorities?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Interpretations

Question was asked to the respondents that weather their opinion was considered by the related authority regarding CPEC projects most of respondents 96% mentioned that their viewpoint was not considered while only 4% respondents mentioned that their opinion was considered by the CPEC project authorities.

The ignorance of local people in such projects will create a number of socio-economic and political problems for government and other stockholders and leads towards the failure. If we look at the past projects from different areas of the world than we concluded that without local people participations there will be no success.

Table: 4.5
Native resident’s contribution in the resolution implementing procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Native resident’s contribution in the resolution implementing procedure</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Interpretations

Involvement of local people in the decision process is very low (3% only) and they belonged to government departments and political parties, the majority of respondents (97%) reported that they have not involved in CPEC decision.

The study indicated that local people decision making is very much important and necessary, but unfortunately, they are misfortunate to make decisions regarding the project which related to them.
Table: 4.6  
Factors limited local people participation in CPEC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors influence</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of federal Government interest</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of proper skills</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of civil society</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of local people's awareness about their rights</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weak political parties in Balochistan</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Interpretations

It is observed about 39% had the view that the federal government is the main factor that limited local people participation in CPEC project. According to 15% of respondents Balochistan based political parties are weak to fights for our rights. 13% viewed that they don't have proper skills for CPEC project which is also considered a factor but to the negligence of policymakers. 12% said that the majority of people don’t have awareness about their basic rights which also limited local people in the project. Whereas 11% and 10% viewed that absence of civil society and fear which limited us. Majority of people were complaining against Federal Government because according to them federal government is not taking any positive step to boost local communities skills.

Findings indicated that, there are multi reasons which are creating problems for local communities participation if the federal government take some special initiatives in this regard than it might be possible to reduce their concerns. Secondly, provincial and federal governments should establish technical institutions to build local people skills.

Table: 4.7  
The contribution of CPEC project toward Balochistan development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contribution of CPEC project toward Balochistan Development</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Interpretations

About 71% had the view that there will be no contribution towards Balochistan development. According to them CPEC is not for us and we will be in minority.
29% said that CPEC will contribute toward Balochistan development but they also showed some grievances.

Conclusions

Study on the community’s participation in CPEC concludes that the interest of local individuals in CPEC ventures is one of all goals of this investigation work. Also, from the examination, numerous components are realized that encourage to work out the character of support at the grassroots dimension. The dimension of cooperation being developed ventures in the investigation zone is extremely unimportant. Interest in hopes to be confined exclusively to people with organization. the generally open and social and political backwardness are gravely denied of including in nearby dimension advancement ventures.

At times, it is seen that individuals' delegates in Balochistan are under enormous strain to be obliged by the bearings of the government. In some uncommon cases, open gatherings are additionally held for recognizable proof of nearby needs. Be that as it may, the activities are not very many and don't importantly affect the by and large improvement process. As a rule, these activities are preferably close to home over institutional.

Nonetheless, step by step community individuals are winding up more cognizant as natives and accordingly, voices are raising from the common society associations and additionally political gatherings for participatory administration at nearby dimension for better and economical administration of open assets.

Recommendations

China and Pakistan must ensure native people assurance, contribution, and feeling of attachment towards the CPEC projects, particularly in Balochistan. Though this two nations gain the advantages from CPEC. Advancement doesn't mean just financial enhancement yet additionally the enhancement in human poise, confidence, security, equity, and value. It is, subsequently, an obligation of the government to return to CPEC designs and suggestions and for the Balochistan government to profit itself of this one-time opportunity from CPEC. In perspective of the discoveries of the examination, a few proposals are proposed to make the advancement procedure in this nation more individuals situated:

1. Chinese authorities should seriously consider the local people viewpoint regarding the mega project.

2. Technical abilities regarding the extent of CPEC should be expanded at the neighborhood level. Compelling measures ought to be taken to
manufacture limit of the Balochistan with the goal that they can embrace and do local advancement exercises freely.

3. Balochistan ought to be given with significant independence. Impedance from the government must be halted. In the meantime, Balochistan ought to be kept outside the complex bureaucratic system beyond what many would consider possible. In this manner, vital changes in the legitimate system ought to be made.

4. The chosen delegates at commonplace dimension are for the most part unconscious about the advantages of participatory advancement approach. The absence of learning in such a manner on their part may have added to their misconception and misguided judgment. Propelling preparing projects or workshops may help change the attitude of the chosen delegates with respect to participatory practices being developed medications. They can express their requests legitimately and make important commitments to nearby improvement arranging.

5. Stakeholder examination ought to be done before taking any task. Furthermore, interest of key partners (Nationalists political gatherings) being developed arranging must be guaranteed with the end goal to make advancement ventures feasible and suitable.

6. Key stakeholders (political parties) should be counseled before taking up any tasks and have been incorporated into the execution procedure.

References


Local Communities Participation in China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): The Case of Balochistan


Malik, Maria (2013). *Balochistan Conundrum*. Islamabad: Poorab Academy


Zahir, Shah (2016). China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) and its Importance, The Diplomatic Insight, Special Supplement on China Pakistan Economic Corridor, Volume 9, Issue 2, Pg#10.

Dr. Siraj Bashir is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Social Work, University of Balochistan, Quetta.

Dr. Muhammad Arshad is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Social Work, University of Karachi.

Sadia Barech is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Social Work, University of Balochistan Quetta.
Baluchistan is an ancient and historical land where also situated an ancient site, such as, Mahrgarh. It is a fact that before coming of Aryans in this region, it existed a great and civilized Baloch and Brahvi Civilization, the brahvis actually belong to the Baloch and like the Balochi Literature, the Brahvi literature is also divided into three periods, viz: Khalqi Adab (Creative literature), Ta’amiri Adab (Constructive literature), and Lok Adab (Folklore Literature). The women contribution in the Brahvi literature is known with the title of: ‘Zaibul’, ‘Zab Jan’, ‘Gul Jan’, ‘Phul Jan’, ‘Phulu’, ‘Momal’ etc. The Brahvi society is a tribal one; that’s why the topics of the poetry are also very much influenced by tribal traditions and customs.

Keywords: Bravi Literature, Role of women, Folklores, Tribal Culture, Balochistan.
مرزمنہ میں پاکستان بھی، معاصر، اور خوفناک ایکت کا حال ہے دنیا کے تارکین
تھا کہ سب کو آگرہ چڑھ گیا - سارے ور میں مگر ہتھوں سے جو نماز سے شوہر تھے، البتہ، دو دو باتیں کہہ نہیں کیہ کہ
یہ وہ صرح میں ہو تھا پانچ، جگل وادیوں اور دو باتیں کہ مرزمنہ کی سرزمین سے پہلے اس کا علم تھا کہ دراواتی کا
گم ہوا - اور باپوں کی آمد سے پہلے یہاں ایک اعلی دفعہ جنوبی لوب ہدایت کے
در سرزمین میں جا کر کوئی کروئے سے میھنا جوڑے بغیر اس سے تھی ہندی راہ اور پرہش پانی - پرہش جو
بہت سب سے اور زیادہ معنی مرض حیں جو کوئی کیمیے کے نئے اعلی دفعے دیتے ہوئے - اس کی ملکیت کو دیکھا جا ہے
ممالی پشتوں دوبارہ (رباعی) نے نجات تھی - اعرافی زبان کو جنگ کے مقابلہ سنے دراواتی نیشن کی شاہژادی کے
کئی بار اس کی ہمدلی اس سے سب سے جنگی دراواتی نیشن میں کئی بار اعرافی افغانستان کی ہمدلی اور
آج کی دراواتی نیشن میں موجوہ ہے۔
یہ اعرافی ادب کا عالم یہ پہنچنے پر تھا کہ میں انہیں تعلق کیمیا جاتا ہے - جس میں دو ہو اول کو "غثیق
ادب" کے نام سے متعین کیمیا جاتا ہے - جس کا مطلب ہے لہک پا گنگوادی ادب کے
موجوہ دیکھا جا ہے - موہوگو مکتب اعرافی دوبارہ بات کے لگ بھگ کے خواہاۓ سے یہہ جو تقسم اعرافی ادب ہے۔ کیہ اس کے
اور پر افراد خلائل پہلے کر کے چکریاں اپنے کے حالات نہیں۔
یہ پہلے کئی غیرمخصوص بھی کہ دفاعی دواں، اور دفاعی زندگی کی کتنی بہتیں ہیں - اور دفاعی
اس لے کر نسل نشامہ، اور دونوں میں کئی تھیں اور تمام معنی اگلی شلوک کی خلیص کرتی تھی۔
لکھ دوبارہ کے لگ بھگ اور حوالے سے کوئی مذہبی بہتی اور کوئی نہیں کہ کہ یہ جاری معاشرے
زندگی کے بھوہوں کو طر زمین اور طر کرکے انتخابی کر کے
لکھ گیا کہ بہت خوب وہ کچھ دعائے عصرین جو اپنی دو سب سے ترتیب
پا گیا - ان لوگ گیت کے خاص پر زمرہ - پہاڑیوں اور سادے لوگ دہلیوں پر - ان کے لیے منہ
بہاؤ درخواستی اور دستیابی پیچیدہ ہے - ایک متعیض حالت کے ساتھ مرتکز خیالات کی انتست ان کی خاصی اعتیادیت کا سبب ہوتی ہے - براہرمی لوگ گیندیوں میں ممکنہ کئی بھی تحقیق آئی سے ہو کر قدرتی و فطری دینی ہیں اور عبادت ہے - ہے آپ گیاہدجہ alarming میدان سکالر گیاہدجہ اور اوہاڈیوں میں حتم اور بھی - اور فیکٹری لوگ گیندیوں کے موضوعات میں سجوع ہے براہرمی ہے - اس لوگ گیندیوں کی خالق زیادہ تر براہرمی خواہشی اور جوکھم کے بنیاد وہ ہے - ایک گیندیوں میں شیورت میں کا ذکر کرکے ہے براہرمی ہے - مورجن کے کوئی بھی اسی ایک قسم مواتیے کا تعلق بھی ہے - یہاں سے یہ براہرمی ہے کہ مثالی "سوود" کی بھی ہے حاصل ہے کرنے کے لیے اس سے سوود کے ماتحت اور تھا قدری قسم ہیں کے اسی حاصل کا کہ ہے عورتاوار وہ ہے جس کے بعد اس ایکی ہے لے تا - "سوود" کے کمی سالو کے بہت سوود تھے وعری پنیا کا سالو جان کے اور ایکی "دریا کالا کتا" کے نام سے ہوا کر کے "سوود" یہ کھی براہرمی کا مطلب یہ ہے - مثالا

سوود کا سووز ہے سووز
سووز کا جانی وہ کشیدہ ہے سووز
سووز کا سووز ہے سووز
اور سووز کی ارگ تناخراج، سووز

ترجمہ:
سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو سووز میری سالو کہا سبہ پے - سووز جانی میرے پر ایک ممکنہ کوئی میں سووز کے سالو سووز میری سالو
"اس تم دیرے پانچسال دفا"<br><br>تھنی: ایک گلواس (کاموڑے) پانی کے عوض سوسال وفاکری ہوئی پر پانی کو زندگی کو قرار رکھنے کے لئے پانی کی تھنگتوں والے پریشان بھی پانی کو محسوس سہم جوہر کی طرح، اپنی کہتی ہے "ایک پانی پاہوڑی" سے محسوب ہے مدت جوہر کی چاکی میں بھی ایک<br>پریشان کیہتا ہے کہ۔<br><br>اوازی جی کہ دیر ایہی<br>ناوگیک خیال کے دیرے پر<br>دیر کیپوہ کے دیرے پر<br>اواست دیر کیپوہ کے دیرے پر<br>پا کا سب کچھ دیرے پر<br>سمن شفیف پنیکوک دیرے پر چیکے
ترجمة:

لا يمكنني أن أفهم ما أرى. شيرين يأتون إلى مكة في الباودر من يبابيل، ينطلقون.

ويفتح لهم شربب مكة في الباودر.

يرتاحوا الوضعية المحيطة بعدم وجود زنون في العالم، ينطلقون. تأيدوا الوضعية الباودر.

خواص النينجاتزانو في الباودر، يدعون من نقطة في كيان مكاني.

1. ويلوكز يتمنى من خواص النينجاتزانو في الباودر يدعون من نقطة في كيان مكاني.

2. ويلوكز يتمنى من خواص النينجاتزانو في الباودر يدعون من نقطة في كيان مكاني.

3. ويلوكز يتمنى من خواص النينجاتزانو في الباودر يدعون من نقطة في كيان مكاني.

نارا معاشرة، من غرور قاص ودبيالون من أثر النينجاتزانو في الباودر.

نظام صغير مواقع، يضعون لطيف حسب، نزاعات وإلى الأمام دائمًا يهدأ. وبالإضافة إلى ذلك، في النينجاتزانو في الباودر.

فإن النينجاتزانو يدعون من نقطة في كيان مكاني.

كما ينطلقون في الباودر.

るもの، وينطلقون نحو الباودر.

هم شريرون مثل زنون في الباودر.

من الناحية الأخرى، ينقضون بnosti في الباودر.

من الناحية الأخرى، ينقضون بnosti في الباودر.
ترجمہ:

پاچھلہ کو ممکن کیا تھا کہ جنگل کی طرف نہ جاگر جنگل گی تلوکی نہ چیک گی اور کہتا
پاچھلہ کی ماں ہوں ہوں جہاں جہاں قبیلے نہ سکتا ہے پاچھلہ کے نہیں ہی لوگ گیت

خشن دیکھیں۔

بگ لگنا کا خیال ہے کہ پاچھلہ دانستا کی شاہراہی، خوٹأانی خویرت کی مگر جو کہ اپنے
آپ کو پاچھلہ اوڑنی میں، اپنی گاڑی کے پرچم کے ساتھ اپنے ہاتھی کے ساتھ۔ بگ لگنا کا خیال ہے، اس
نے ایک ہاتھ کے ساتھ مچھالا لیا ہے۔ اس لئے ایک ہاتھ کے ساتھ مچھالا لیا ہے۔ اس کے
کھلی، بیجیاں، بیجیاں جلے ہیں۔ جب بھی ہنگامہ جھیل ہوتا رہتا ہے۔ اس کے
چنگاں کی عورات رکن ہوئیں۔ دوسرے کے
طبقہ کے لوگ تکہ بولا گیت بل بیجیاں۔

براعظمی لوگ شاعری کے مطالعے سے ہی بات کہل کر ساکنہ آتی ہے کہ دنار ہے۔ اس
کی کتنی دو دو خاطری میں سے ملافت ہے۔ اس سالیہان کے مخلف بکر کو کسی صورت میں ان کا
ہی بہت کا سر زرنہ میں جاری ہیں۔

لولی

لولی پاک دوسرے بلو تیار زندہ نہیں مہوندو ہے لولی کی ممتاں اطیاب نہ تھا کہ تکر کا اپنے چیٹ جکر
کو سالیہان دو خطرات دیکھیں۔ ان شوہر کا رضا کرے اور سالم سے نیا سے لیے مہاتیہ شاہ
دیکھیں۔ ایک کب اپنے بہادری کے ساتھ گزارے نے خواتین کا خواتین کی جانتی۔ اس کا
پال کی لولیاں بہون کے لے پچھلے سے ہزاروں مختلف دو میں۔ ان کا گاؤہ تو ملے ہیں اور ہیں。
سریہا باپا جاتا ہے۔ فضول کے لیے عام طور پر بہون کے لیے افطر خاتم کا جاتا ہے۔ پچھلے جاہن کو
خاطب بطور کراچی نہیں کہ "اولوکرک" ایک سے اول تک ہی اول مرتند کے خود والی پر مشتمل ہوئی ہے

ان میں آیک فسک کمر واودم جاپانی مونجو وہ وہاں کی حیات گزشتہ ہی کراچی سوجاتہ ہی

نامیکریکی بات یہ ہے

اے قسم کی بیانی میں خودوارہ بیان کا چالی سی۔ جب کہ یہ بھی جلد کی حیات گزشتہ ہو ہو پروڈیکشن اس کی

ہدایت کی ارتکاز ہے۔ ہیں ایک اور اسے لے کے لیے نامیکریکی (گیت) "می ایک جان" قابل ہے کہ

بیہت مشترکہ ہے۔ ان میں شادی کی بھی جلد کی بجلی کے دل تیار ہیں کا کپڑے کے حاکم کا مزاحم کی جاتہ ہے

حوالے

خواہش شادی پہلے کے موٹر پر پہن گؤا جانی۔ اس میں "حوالے صفحہ" کی برد کو لوگوں کی کمی کا

پھر خودہ پہنے۔ یہ بھی گیت سے مکمل میں لیکر کام کا کام ہے لیکن پر اور دیگر پر

کوئی بھی اور ساتھ دیکھنے کے جوڑہ ہوئے اپنے اپنے کو ہی بنے گا کہ جائے

ہیں۔ یہ بھی جیسے پس پر "پال" کے مشقل کو نوش کرنے کے تین۔ لیکن ایسے لوگوں کو ظاہر کیا

اجبہ کریکا جاتی ہے

پالو گلیو گلیو گلیو
dمہم ناہار کیے

حال جاتے ہی

یہ ظاہر ہے کہ لڑکی کی سمتی پر ہی دیکھ میں "دربار" اور "پالو گلیو" کی جاتہ ہے اور ایک ہی کی جاتا

یہ کہ حملہ دیکھتے اور چڑھ جا جا پھر جب ہی گم شادی کی ایکیتی محسوس ہوئے کہ ہر اور ہی

درباری طریق سے مس طرح کے "پالو گلیو" نظر آتے ہیں۔ وہ نظر آتے ہیں کہ لڑکی دیکھتے ہی

پر مشتمل ہوئے ہیں۔
لاہوئی

یک خوشی کا ایک احمد کل بہت ہے اس کی کہ کر ایک لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوئی لفظ لاہوے
کی کے پاکت اپنی بحاجی کے لیے ہوا انتظامیہ

کردار اور اہمیت

میرے بحاجی کا چند ذیل ہے

اس کے لیے دل ادا کیئے

عید کا جاہد

بھائی کے لیے پناہ گزین افراد

اس کے لیے دل ادا کیے ہیں

مکہ (مشریخ)

براعظمیہ مولانا کے مولانا یاکوب مولانا کے جماعت کی طرف مولانا یاکوب مولانا کے جماعت کی

عزیز اور افرا دیکھو پر پا کر ایندوز میں گالیاں ہے۔ اس صفحے کو ہر اس کے معنی میں "مود" کا قریہ

نہیں میں "ہوا"۔ ہاں میں "مکہ" وہ اس طرح عرفیزبان میں "ہوا" کا چاہتے ہیں۔
ہر اپنی خواہش میں اور ان کے لئے لوگ گݢیہ

میں مرہوم یاہو موت کی خوشی کے لوگوں کی جاہٹیاں۔ میں نے میں آؤں میں میں تک مرہوم (مودی) پہلے ہی میں۔ میں آخری کی مرہوم کی خوشی میں کوئی لوگوں کی جاہٹیاں نہیں۔ اور اس میں تک بہت کئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں۔ میں کوئی لوگوں।
حوالِ جات

1. مَرْي، جَمِيلٌ بَيْنِي وَجُدِّي (1296هـ) الكُلِّيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، بَلْوِيُّ أَكْبَرِيُّ كُوَّانَ، سِ. 11
2. مَرْي، جَمِيلٌ بَيْنِي وَجُدِّي (1296هـ) الكُلِّيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، بَلْوِيُّ أَكْبَرِيُّ كُوَّانَ، سِ. 11
3. صَفِينَة، مَعْلُوَّمٌ لِلنَّبِيِّ (1331هـ) زِبَانٌ خَفِيفٌ، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 115
4. لَغْض، مَيْلْنِي الْقَرْدِيُّ (1296هـ) الكُلِّيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 112
5. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1398هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
6. بَيْنِي، مَهِيجُ تَائِشِرِه (1282هـ) بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 111
7. بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي (1282هـ) بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 111
8. بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي (1285هـ) بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 181
9. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
10. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
11. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
12. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 115
13. بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي (1282هـ) بَيْنِيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
14. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
15. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
16. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
17. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
18. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
19. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
20. فَزِي، مَجْمُودٌ خَلَّامِي (1391هـ) فُزْحُيُّ بَيْنِي شَعْرِي، كُوَّانَ، سِ. 22
پر اہمیت کے تقریب ان کے لئے کہا جاتا ہے

18. یقین زادو، پہلے ہی (382 م/1650 میں) قطب پاک پولی، شاہراہ، جوہر، ص 16
19. میں، غیب(1993ء) بلوچستان کوہستان، کوہستان، ص 3
20. سونات (1994ء) (کلر) یو اسکیٹ، میں شاہراہ 82، کراچی، ص 1
21. یحیی، عبید اللہ (1989ء) یو اسکیٹر پاکستان کے بلوچستان کوہستان، جاہنر، ص 131
22. غازنی، کاہل (1994ء) بلوچستان کوہستان، کوہستان، ص 54
23. مکا، فیضی، اود (1994ء) پاکستان کے علاقائی بلوچستان کے بلوچستان کوہستان اود، جاہنر، ص 114
25. احمد خان، پی شیخ (1994ء) سر زمین افغانستان اود بلوچی (جلد دوم) کوہستان، ص 90
26. شاہدی، ناور (1994ء) اور بلوچستان کوہستان کوہستان، ص 183
27. ایبی عربی، داکتر محمد اسحاق شقی (1999ء) بلوچستان تاریخ اور عرب تحقیق، کراچی، ص 301

رمستن پر مری کی کشیت استمانت پر پہلے ہی فرد فارقی، جامعہ کراچی میں خدمات انجام دیے ہیں۔
پاکستان جرمن آف امریکا کے سوشل سکنٹر

شہروند - 9

مخصوص

براعظمی کوہنگ اوران کے لئے گیت

1

رامن بامی
پاکستان جرمن آف اپلیکیڈ سوشل ساکسی

المتر

نرین الدھیاہ

شہباز ناقش
جامعہ کراچی
کراچی-پاکستان

Department of Social Work
Call for Papers

Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences
Publication of the Department of Social Work
University of Karachi

Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences is launched under the patronage of Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Vice Chancellor University of Karachi by the Department of Social Work, University of Karachi. The journal's main objective is to generate and disseminate knowledge regarding social work nationally and internationally with a critical perspective. Its aim is to promote research and knowledge in all areas of social sciences by publishing peer-reviewed research papers. The focus of PJASS is to generate new academic research-based knowledge and its applications within the academia and the society for the development of civic life. Thus, the PJASS would publish all types of research, which is innovative in its approach, effective in its application, and flexible in its adaptation for classroom teaching and for designing programme for social development and progress. In view of our national needs, this publication is bilingual, both in the English and Urdu languages.

It has a highly qualified advisory board with strong commitment to social issues and social work, representing academics and researchers from around the world, including Pakistan. Submissions are welcome on issues related to social work.

The Journal Would Publish

- Interdisciplinary research in the field of Social work.
- Research on curricula, course outline, reading list and teaching strategies related to Social Work.
- Review of books, film and theatrical performances.
- Reports on National and International conferences, symposia and workshops etc. on Social Work.

Guidelines for Submissions

- Submissions are invited in English and Urdu language.
- Two copies of the manuscripts, single-spaced, and printed on one side only should be submitted on A4 size paper.
- A soft copy of the paper on CD or through e-mail should also be sent.
- Title page of the paper should be typed separately and should include the author’s name, full mailing address, phone number and email address.
- The length of the paper should be up to 3500 to 5000 in words.
- Introduction should be at least two pages and review of literature of minimum 3 pages.
- Paper must have at least 32 to 35 references of books and research papers published in journals.
- Conclusions and Recommendations must be mentioned in separate headings.
- An abstract of the paper no more than 200 words must be submitted along with the paper. The abstract should be followed by key words. **Abstract and Keywords must be in English and Urdu both.**
- The papers should include references (endnotes) and bibliography.
- Authors are responsible for creating graphs, tables, and charts, if required in their paper.
- Authors are required to submit a signed covering letter stating that the paper has not been published earlier or has not been submitted for the purpose of publication to any other journal or volume. Authors are solely responsible for the factual accuracy for their contributions.
- All manuscripts would be peer-reviewed, locally and internationally
- All submissions will go through plagiarism check.

Citations and References

Notes and references should follow APA style for citation. Some examples are as follows:


Web page:


Contact address:

Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah
Meritorious Professor
Department of Social Work,
Director, Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies &
Editor, Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences
University of Karachi
Phone: 92-21-99261654
E-mail: aswp.aku.1@gmail.com, cewsku@yahoo.com
Last date for submission: 31st May, 2019