Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies: Annual

PATRON
Prof. Dr. Muhammad Qaiser
Vice Chancellor, University of Karachi
Karachi, Pakistan

EDITOR
Nasreen Aslam Shah

ADVISORY BOARD
Prof. Dr. M. Nizamuddin
Chairman, Higher Education Commission, Punjab

Prof. Dr. Profulla C. Sarker
Pro-Vice Chancellor, European University of Bangladesh

Prof. Dr. Parveen Shah
Vice Chancellor
Shah Latif University, Khairpur, Pakistan

Moonis Ahmer
Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Naheed Abrar
Dean, Faculty of Arts
Federal Urdu University, Karachi, Pakistan

M. Abuzar Wajdi
Ex. Dean, Management and Administrative Science
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Sarah Safdar
Dean, Faculty of Management and Social Sciences
Iqra National University, Peshawar, Pakistan

Anoosh Khan
Department of Gender Studies
University of Peshawar Khyber Pakhunkhwa, Pakistan

Aslam Shah
Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Badar Alam Iqbal
UGSM-Monarch Business School
Monarch University, Switzerland

Kamala Liyanage
Centre for the Study of Human Rights
University of Peradeniya, Sri Lanka

Kazuyo Yamane
Ritsumeikan University, Japan

Kristi Pearswoodari
Program Study Kajian Waniter
Kampus Universities, Indonesia

ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Surface Mail</th>
<th>Air mail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>US$ 65.00</td>
<td>US$ 70.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>US$ 55.00</td>
<td>US$ 60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>PK.RS. 500.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>PK.RS. 400.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Acknowledgement

We are obliged for the financial assistance of Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan for publishing the 13th volume of Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aamir Hafeez &amp; Syed Manzoor</td>
<td>Gender Differences in Determinants of Medical Career Choice</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hussain Shah</td>
<td>Rural Women’s Workload: Implications for Socio-Economic Development of Baluchistan</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Rasheed, Riffat Arshed &amp; Zeenat Sana Baloch</td>
<td>Gender Differences in Modernization of Leisure: Changing Trends in Sports and Recreation in Rural Punjab</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abida Perveen</td>
<td>The Constitution of Pakistan (1973) and Women Rights: An Interpretation</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambreen Fatima, Syed Faizan Iftikhar &amp; Khurram Iftikhar</td>
<td>Impact of Micro-Credit on Women Empowerment: A Case Study of Rural Pakistan</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayesha Farooq &amp; Khalil Ahmed</td>
<td>Gender Differences in Modernization of Leisure: Changing Trends in Sports and Recreation in Rural Punjab</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azka Khan &amp; Sarwat Rasul</td>
<td>Representation of Muslim Women in E-Media Caricatures</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hussan Ara Magsi &amp; Faraz Ahmed Wajidi</td>
<td>SAARC Female Prime Ministers Policies for Women Empowerment in their Region</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubna Karim Naz &amp; Umar Rafique</td>
<td>Insight Into the Lives of Female Nurses in Lahore: An in Depth Analysis</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubna Zaheer &amp; Amber Mubeen</td>
<td>Role of Mass Media and Interpersonal Communication in Promoting Awareness about Woman Rights in Pakistan</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Athar Hussain, Imtiaz Ahmad &amp; Amber Qadar</td>
<td>Attitude Towards Acceptability of the Girl Child in Families Belonging to Upper and Lower Socio-Economic Class</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musarrat Jabeen, Saima Bibi &amp; Awais Ali Shah</td>
<td>Exploring the Link between Women Economic Empowerment and Energy Conservation</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Women Working in Fisheries at Ibrahim Hydri, Rehri Goth and Arkanabad</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seema Manzoor, Dua-e-Rehma, Mishbah B. Qureshi &amp; Muhammad Shahid</td>
<td>Analyzing Level of Sexual Harassment and Exploitation of Female Domestic Workers</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shagufta Jahangir &amp; Asma Manzoor</td>
<td>Cross Border Marriages (CBM’s) between Pakistan to Developed Countries: A Socio-Economic Perspective</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tania Haque</td>
<td>Exploring Uncounted Contribution of Women in Bangladesh: Barriers, Implications and Opportunities</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gender Differences In Determinants Of Medical Career Choice

Aamir Hafeez
&
Syed Manzoor Hussain Shah
Department of Education
Hazara University, Mansehra

Abstract

This study aimed to identify the determinants of medical career whether these determinants varied across gender. Drawing from extensive study of existing literature, twenty determinants of medical career were shortlisted. A 60-item purpose-specific reliable instrument, designed to assess the comparative influence of determinants, was administered on cross-gender sample of 550 respondents from four public and private medical colleges in Hazara Division of Pakistan. The sample was selected through systematic random sampling, giving gender representation due weight; 293 female students were selected against 253 males. The results showed significant gender-based differences across determinants. The female medical students were found to possess greater social motivation and stronger personality traits than their male counterparts who, with weak personality traits, suffered social and economic compulsions and were only motivated by pecuniary considerations. In the light of findings of the study, it is recommended that due caution be exercised in forming gender-related opinions and sanctifying age-old ‘established’ views. It is preferable that natural inclinations are nurtured to eventually pave way for a psychologically healthy society comprising individuals seeking success through inner fulfilment than through adjustment to unbending and arbitrary social dictates.

Keywords: Gender, Career Choice, Determinants, Medicine, Social and Economic Motivation, Personality Traits.
Introduction

The question of gender continues to provide stimulating substance for research. Despite the worldwide deliberate effort to narrow gender differences through legislative and procedural provisions, the differences continue to somewhat spontaneously surface, thereby demonstrating the resilience of the hardened and long-accepted social and economic norms in a society. The history of gender discrimination is most avowedly interpreted as the history of transformation in the role of women in society. In Pakistan, this transformation in women’s role is most palpably observed in the nation’s medical colleges. Females make up the largest majority of students studying medicine. For many years, an official embargo kept male students’ quota in medical colleges at 80%, leaving 20% to women. With the scrapping of this condition by the Supreme Court, now an average of 80% to 85% students in Pakistan’s medical colleges are women (Zikriya, 2014). Men only outnumber women in the medical colleges located in deeply conservative regions of the country, like in some areas of Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. In Punjab and Sindh, however, women overwhelmingly dominate. This could largely be considered as a positive sign for women’s prospects in Pakistan. Alternatively, there is a noticeable lack of avenues for women to enter careers that are traditionally available to men alone (Ali et al., 2009).

The confines of a patriarchal society impinge more upon its weaker section (William, 2000). The choices available to men for entering an economically stable and socially respectable vocation in Pakistan are visibly greater than females (Ali et al., 2009). Relatedly, the reasons put up for the larger number of female medical students in medical colleges range from thirst for social status and magnitude of studies involved to males’ distractions and attraction of other financially-rewarding occupations. Nevertheless, the consequences of women participation in labour force are irreversible and include the natural corresponding decline in the size of family, female sharing in the overall economic development, improved living standard of family and greater opportunities to harness children’s talent (Hyde, 2005). Studies in the field also point to the fact that this relative feminine economic independence also paves way to a steady development of democratic ideals and domestic environment that weakens male influence (Fortin, 2005).

Studies on dynamics of pursuing a career indicate the presence of a number of determinants that exercise their influence in society through wider social perceptions.
about a profession, societal compulsions of one’s circumstances, domestic pressures, prestige and reverence of a profession, etc. Economic motivations and pressures dictate a future vocational choice through market competitiveness, instinctive evasion of past deprivations and growth prospects. Then, there are determinants with basis in individual personality traits, whereby a similar situation may elicit a different response from two individuals. The study of gender differences in response to these career motivations and compulsions would reflect on the existing gender-effective social, economic and personality-based conditions in that society.

Literature Review

Extrinsically, female students in medicine have been shown to obtain greater success in comparison to men (Ferguson et al., 2002). This is also the case with higher education (Kilminster et al., 2007). Woolf (2009) has discovered that men as students are less conscientious than women. One reason for this could be the interpersonal skills, which have shown to be more different between the sexes than within one sex (Cameron, 2009). On the other hand, in the more practical domains, men have been shown to lead the way. A study by Adler (2007) found men to be possessing better leadership traits. Even in the field of academic medicine, Nonnemaker (2000) discovered that while there were more female entrants in the field, their promotion rate was perceptibly lower than that of the males. Also, becoming a successful woman it takes great effort to reach the same status as men (Taylor et al., 2001). Elton (2009) has deduced, due to these consequences, men in medicine earn more than women.

It has been demonstrated that women in medicine suffer greater anxiety than men (Eurydice, 2005) and are less satisfied than their male counterparts (Lepnurm et al, 2006). The career satisfaction of doctors may also be determined by environmental factors. Byars & McCubbin, (2001) detected that women took to child-related tasks more readily. Moreover, women medical practitioners with children were found less satisfied with their careers as compared to their counterparts with children (Furnham 2005).

The conventional thought in societies maintains that there are inborn differences between sexes and, therefore, they are meant to take up different roles in life (Lapan et al., 2000). Turner et al (2008) found differences between males and females as to their roles and activities in most societies and that males enjoyed greater access to resources and autonomy for career decisions. This approach sees biological and, therefore, permanent differences between the genders. The implication is that men and women are attuned to disparate vocations, i.e. public roles for men because of their being physically stronger with greater mechanical, spatial and numerical abilities; and private role for women, owing to their early maturing, being better at verbal skills and having a better oral and aesthetic perspective (Lubinski & Benbow, 2006). It follows from this view that education should attempt to mould men and women to their respective roles.
The progressive approach sees gender roles being crafted under historic, cultural and social influences in the broader patriarchal setups. Gibbons (2009) found that the transition in society was visible in the change in aspirations of women, irrespective of their being increasingly burdened by keeping jobs despite marriage because of increased economic burden. Hyde (2005) found that both genders possessed similar psychological traits. Education, thus, ought to lessen coercive influences and pave way for equality of sexes (Turner & Lapan, 2005).

Paechter (2000) asserts that study material in most countries is built on gender specific assumptions and does not address gender equality issues. For instance, it is assumed that men take readily to Maths and Science and women to languages and literature. It has been argued that the narrow choice of subjects limits gender differentiation, while whenever the choice is offered, the boys and girls converge on subjects generally identified with their gender (Eisenhart, 2008). It has been showed that while the use of technology is the same by both genders, boys use technology more for entertainment purposes (Papastergiou & Solomonidou, 2005). Plant et al. (2009) showed that boys related to Physics better than girls and the aspects of science they were interested in were different. Also, that girls were more interested in counselling, arts and medicine, while the boys were more attracted to Physics and other technical fields. Margolis et al. (2002) states that men were more motivated by Science and Maths and women by biology. Further, among both with scientific mindset, men were more likely take up non-medical careers like engineering, etc, a fact attested by gender demographics in Pakistan’s medical colleges. Social and economic necessities also oblige improved academic performance (Cool, 2010), especially when (as in Pakistan) there are larger professional avenues available to males than females.

Lubinski and Benbow (2006) maintained that hidden curriculum impacts social interactions between students and reinforces gender differentiation. Boys have been found to wield greater influence, take greater school space and teacher-time than girls (Myers et al., 2007). Eccles (2006) asserted that patterns of male and female roles established at schools are repeated later in the society itself. Self-concept developed during their school days endures at later stages of students’ lives. Boys have been found to display truancy, indifference and disruptiveness (Van de Gaer et al., 2006; Seed, 2006).

Researches point out to both gender-based similarities and differences in vocational aptitudes and inclinations. Greenberger (2002) substantiated that boys are continually propelled towards the traditional masculine vocation, which are economically more rewarding, while there is a constant expectation that girls went into the more traditional areas such as medicine, childcare, nursing, etc. Contrarily, Bourzgui (2012) contended that both men and women have similar ambitions and influences in joining medicine. Roter et al (2002) demonstrated that female doctors have greater interpersonal skills and are able to relate more to a patient than male doctors. A study by Correll and Benard (2005) showed
that by general perception, men were thought to be better managers than women. Another study showed women applicants for a job who were mothers subjected to greater rigorous assessment than men who were fathers. Goldin and Rouse (2000) found a similar male-oriented conditioning during musical auditioning comprising males and females. Similarly, the results of a study by Sinclair and Kunda (2000) revealed greater negative evaluation of female teachers than that of males. In a glaring finding, Livaditis (2003) stated that successful women were especially disliked for appearing competent. At workplace too, women experience ‘invisible’ differentiation, with their advice or input ignored or given less value than men’s (Ridgeway and Correll, 2004). Relatedly, Lafontaine, & Monseur (2009) had found that more than 72% women scientists encountered discriminatory behaviour against them compared to men’s 13%.

It has been found motivation to enter medicine differs in men and women, with men valuing working conditions and women value the family, human and welfare factors (Buddeberg-Fischer et al, 2003). Also, women regard compassion and egalitarianism more than men and the urge for power or conformity less than them (Gjerberg, 2002). Reed & Buddeberg-Fischer (2006) detected that female students preferred working part-time in future. All said, a number of factors combine to dictate career decision. Melhuish et al. (2008) showed the continued impact of attainment of a wide range of family and home-learning factors on career choice.

A cohort of globally-recognized elements seem also to apply to Pakistani medical arena. These combine to reinforce the female fascination for medical profession, such as high social standing of medical profession (Gibis et al., 2012), respectable living standards enjoyed by the medical practitioners (Dorsey et al., 2005), stable future prospects (Good et al., 2003) and monetary satisfaction (Lefevre et al., 2010). Also, the unabated developments in medical profession over the past years have seen the occupational diversity and absorption in the field expand exponentially with the career options extending beyond the stereotypical physicians and surgeons to include such career lines as health administrators, occupational therapists, medical educationists, and clinical researchers (Siddique, 2012). The mushroom growth of private medical colleges in Pakistan over the past decades (from 16 in 1981 to 88 presently) has added another intricate strand to the dynamics that are not extensively researched in the first place (Jafarey, 2009). On the other end of the spectrum exist the compulsions that wean female doctors away from their clinical practice, like the rising demand for a doctor spouse, social inacceptance, rampant anti-feminism and characteristic apathy in Pakistan’s patriarchal society (Ali et al., 2009). The above-mentioned developments are certain to drastically change not only the demography and dynamics of the health sector and medical career, but with it the responses of its largest affectees, i.e. women in medicine, both in Pakistan and the world over (Sanfey et al., 2006).
Research Methodology

The study was focused on finding out the determinants of medical career among students of medical colleges in Hazara region. This exploratory research employed one-shot cross-sectional survey as data gathering instrument. Among other objectives, it sought to find gender-based differences in comparative influence of career determinants within the social, economic and personality domains.

Participants: The population for the study comprised MBBS students of four public and private colleges in Hazara region [n = 2750]. With the majority from upper-middle and lower-middle class, they aged between 18 to 25 years and belonged to all stages/years of MBBS. The sample of the study was derived through systematic random sampling technique. The proportional representation of the institutions and gender was ensured (53% females to 47% males). The appreciable representation from both public and private medical colleges made the findings broadly applicable to both categories of medical students (45.5% public to 54.5% private). 54% of sample came from urban areas, while about 24% and 22% belonged to suburban and rural areas respectively.

Scale Development and Pilot Study: Extensive review of literature yielded twenty broad determinants representing the most significant motivations and compulsions for entering a career in medicine. These wielded their respective influence under the wider domains, viz. social motivation, social compulsion, economic motivation, economic compulsion, strong personality traits and weak personality traits. A reliable instrument, framed to meet the specific requirement of study with due consideration for Pakistani ethos, was developed to measure the respective impact or influence of career determinants. This ‘Impact profiler’ represented determinants through three manifestations each, making it a self-report inventory of 60 multiple-choice questions based on Likert Scale. A 5-tier sociability construct was developed against which the students’ aggregate impact scores were to be compared to gauge the influence of given determinants and domains. The instrument was treated to a pilot study upon mix-gender group of 40 students from the medical colleges, considering the similarity of students to the ones in the actual sample.
The pilot testing results gave a good reliability figure of 0.965 on Cronbach Alpha testing, thus validating the instrument as reliable through test-retest procedure and valid through internal consistency method. Personal data including the students’ family background, SES, area of origin etc were gathered through a ‘Personal Data Form’ administered along with the instrument.

**Data Analysis:** Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS version 17.0) was used for data analysis. Data were analyzed through descriptive statistics including means and standard deviation. Mean scores received from results when compared against the construct gave the relative strength of determinants and domains. t-test was used to generate results bearing highly instructive differences on the basis of gender. Results were worked out both in relation to 20 earmarked determinants as well as the 6 domains of social motivation and social compulsion, economic motivation and economic compulsion, and strong personality traits and weak personality traits.

**Table: 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Motivation</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>30.28</td>
<td>6.74</td>
<td>-3.37**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>32.16</td>
<td>6.38</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Compulsion</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>14.58</td>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>2.96*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>13.35</td>
<td>4.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Motivation</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>15.50</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>2.87*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>14.19</td>
<td>5.24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Compulsion</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>21.42</td>
<td>8.36</td>
<td>3.91**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>18.78</td>
<td>7.47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong Personality Traits</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>48.60</td>
<td>12.97</td>
<td>-5.25**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>54.00</td>
<td>11.18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weak Personality Traits</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>34.07</td>
<td>13.65</td>
<td>4.83**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>28.97</td>
<td>11.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* = p < 0.05, ** = p < 0.01

Table-2 informs that t=3.37 (p<0.05) for social motivation; t=2.96 (p<0.05) for social compulsion; t=2.87 (p<0.05) for economic motivation; t=3.91 (p<0.05) for economic compulsion; t=3.5.25 (p<0.05) for strong personality traits; t=4.83 (p<0.05) for weak personality traits. Hence, there is significant difference between male and female students with regard to the influence of all six domains. Further, the values of t indicate that male students are more influenced than females by social and economic compulsions, though they also carry significantly greater economic motivation than the females. Their personalities are more constrained as to choice of medicine than females. The results also show that female students are socially more motivated, carry personalities with significantly greater positive tendencies and motivation than males.
Table 3
Difference between influence of career determinants on male and female medical students (N = 550)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Determinant</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nobility and reverence of profession</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>12.11</td>
<td>2.59</td>
<td>-3.93**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>12.86</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reassuring social perceptions</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>9.49</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>-2.94**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>10.22</td>
<td>2.90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social status &amp; prestige</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>8.67</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>-1.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>9.09</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic &amp; Familial Pressures</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7.61</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>2.60**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6.97</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broader societal compulsions</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>6.97</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>2.36*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6.38</td>
<td>2.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future growth prospects</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>8.14</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>1.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>7.73</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emulating prosperous examples</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7.37</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>3.68**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6.46</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcoming past deprivations</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7.32</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>3.43**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6.37</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job market competitiveness</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7.67</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>2.35*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>7.02</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future Economic Uncertainties</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>6.43</td>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>4.08**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5.39</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal drive and determination</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>9.97</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>-3.80**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>11.00</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambition and aspiration</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>9.95</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>-5.27**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>11.60</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talent and aptitude for medicine</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>8.71</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>-3.84**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>9.81</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiative and resourcefulness</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>8.84</td>
<td>2.98</td>
<td>-1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>9.25</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Altruism and compassion</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>11.13</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>-4.54**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>12.34</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gullibility &amp; Lassitude</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>6.67</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6.43</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myopic and disorganized</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7.51</td>
<td>3.78</td>
<td>4.54**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisiveness and reluctance</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>6.52</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>5.19**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5.15</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diffidence and reserve</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>6.63</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>4.82**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>2.93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yielding despite different aptitude</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>6.74</td>
<td>3.30</td>
<td>2.78**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5.97</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* = p < 0.05, ** = p < 0.01
Table-3 indicates that \( t=3.93 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for nobility and reverence of profession; \( t=2.94 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for reassuring social perceptions; \( t=2.60 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for domestic and familial pressures; \( t=2.36 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for broader societal compulsions; \( t=3.68 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for emulating prosperous examples; \( t=3.43 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for overcoming past deprivations; \( t=2.35 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for job market competitiveness; \( t=4.08 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for future economic uncertainties; \( t=3.80 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for personal drive and determination; \( t=5.27 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for ambition and aspiration; \( t=3.87 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for talent and aptitude for medicine; \( t=4.54 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for altruism and compassion; \( t=4.54 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for myopic and disorganized; \( t=5.19 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for indecisiveness and reluctance; \( t=4.82 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for diffidence and reserve; and \( t=2.78 \) (\( p<0.05 \)) for yielding despite different aptitude. Hence, there is significant difference between male and female students on these aspects. Further, the \( t \) values indicate that males are more influenced by domestic pressures and broader societal compulsions. They hold a significantly greater urge to overcome past deprivations and are more conscious about job market competitiveness and grappling future economic uncertainties. They are also more primed to emulating prosperous examples. The results show that males are more myopic and disorganized; they lack decision-making, are more diffident and reserved, and yield more pressure for joining medicine despite different aptitude. The results show that female students are more influenced by nobility and reverence of medical profession and reassuring social perceptions about it. They also carry significantly greater personal drive and determination, ambition and aspiration, talent and aptitude for medicine, and altruistic tendencies than their male counterparts. There is no significant difference between male and female students with respect to the influence exerted by social status and prestige; initiative and resourcefulness; and gullibility and lassitude.

Findings

On the basis of \( t \)-test, significant difference between genders was found in all six domains. At 0.01 level, significant difference between male and female students was found in the domains of social motivation, economic compulsion, strong personality traits and weak personality traits. At 0.05 level, significant difference between male and female students was found in the domains of social compulsion and economic motivation. The results reflect greater influence of social and economic compulsions on males, though they also carry greater economic motivation than the females. Their personalities are also more constrained with respect to choice of medical career than the females. On the contrary, the female students are socially more motivated and carry personalities that hold greater positive tendencies and motivation than males.

As regards the career determinants, significant difference between genders was found in 16 out of 20 career determinants. At 0.01 level, significant difference between male and female students was found in the determinants of nobility and reverence of profession; reassuring social perceptions; domestic and familial pressures; emulating prosperous examples; overcoming past deprivations; future economic uncertainties; personal drive and determination; ambition and aspiration; talent and aptitude for medicine; altruism and
compassion; being myopic and disorganized; indecisiveness and reluctance; diffidence and reserve; and yielding despite different aptitude. At 0.05 level, a significant difference between male and female students was found in the determinants of broader societal compulsions, and job market competitiveness.

The results reflected that male students are more influenced than females by domestic pressures and broader societal compulsions. They hold a greater urge to overcome past deprivations and are more conscious than females about job market competitiveness and grappling future economic uncertainties. They are also more primed to seizing future growth prospects and emulating prosperous examples. The results show that their personalities are more affected by being myopic and disorganized, and betray greater lack of decision-making, diffidence and reserve, and yielding to pressure for joining medicine despite different aptitude than their female counterparts.

The results also established that female students are more influenced than males by nobility and reverence of medical profession and reassuring social perceptions about it. They also carry greater personal drive and determination; ambition and aspiration; talent and aptitude for medicine; and altruistic tendencies than their male counterparts.

Conclusions and Discussion

The present study found differences between males and females on a number of determinants, including nobility and reverence of profession; altruism and compassion; ambition and aspiration; personal drive and determination; reassuring social perceptions; talent and aptitude for medicine; job market competitiveness; domestic and familial pressures; emulating prosperous examples; overcoming past deprivations; being myopic and disorganized; broader societal compulsions; yielding despite different aptitude; diffidence and reserve; future economic uncertainties; and lack of decision-making. This went counter to McNay’s (2000) contention that both men and women had similar ambitions to joining medicine and the factors influencing their decisions are also generally the same.

Female students were found to possess greater motivation based on social factors. This manifests ambition and aspiration of women in Pakistani conservative setting. It also reflected the desire to make their mark through higher social status and prestige accorded to the working women in a predominantly patriarchal society where males and females are expected to fill their separate roles in society (Saad et al, 2011) and where men have power over women (Kao et al, 2000). Moreover, the increased density of female medical students in Pakistan is negatively counter-balanced by lack of alternative career opportunities for females (Abbasi & Sarwat, 2014). It has been substantiated that boys choose economically-rewarding vocations, while girls are expected to enter into traditional areas such as medicine, childcare and nursing (Greenberger, 2002). However,
the change in perspective on women has led to ‘gender mainstreaming’ and during 1990s
the thinking about women’s conventional roles changed dramatically (Redman, 2009). In
the contemporary developed societies of Europe, emerging education reform altogether
ignores gender as an issue (Magno & Silova, 2007). The relative feminine economic
independence paves way to democratic ideals and domestic ethos that reduce male
influence and authority (Fortin, 2005).

The study found that female students hold the nobility of medicine in greater regard than
males. This echoed Booth and Bennett’s (2002) finding that males were more affected by
prestige than by nobility of the medical vocation. Allied to nobility and humanity in
Pakistani society are the religious elements of piety and success in afterlife. Medical ethics
in Pakistan is dominated by religious overtones and religion holds a central position in
health-related issues (Hyder & Nadeem, 2001). The findings affirmed that female
students were more influenced by reassuring social perceptions about medical profession.
Since a number of social perceptions become effective through domestic environment,
Riska’s (2010) assertion that female students make career decisions relying more on
familial advice stood verified. Better chances of matrimonial life and opportunity to have a
better spouse could be other strong stimuli for entry into medicine (Zikria, 2014).

The study showed that social compulsions and domestic pressures impacted males more
than females. By implication, this observation ran counter to studies that maintained
women to bear greater difficulty in balancing work and family responsibilities (Mason et
al., 2009) or that female spouses were more affected by family responsibilities than men
(Stack, 2004). In the context of emerging Pakistani social perceptions, particularly that of
Hazara region, the study did not support the assertion by Drinkwater et al (2008) that
female students more readily compromised career aspirations for family life and domestic
compulsions or that family traditions exerted greater pressure on women than on men. It
may be apt to quote Kinser’s (2004) observation here who maintained that political,
cultural and economic circumstances are exclusive to every era.

The study did, however, concur with the opinion of Marks and Houston (2002) that
women restricted themselves to professions in there exist a precedent of their feminine
predecessors fulfilling both domestic and vocational requirements (such as teaching and
medicine in our case). This has evidently much to do with the economic openings and
societal sanctions, rather than observing domestic duties, as Xie and Shauman (2003)
observed that women the world over enjoyed less access to opportunities, resources and
independent decision-making. On the general influence of family, relatives and domestic
environment, Chak-Keung & Jing (2010) had revealed that attitudes of close family
relatives towards occupations significantly affect the career choice. Saad et al (2011) had
stated that nearly 90% Pakistani medical students joined medicine as a result of familial
influence.
The study revealed that males in their conventionally accepted role bore social compulsions more. Broader societal compulsions impacted individuals by converting larger social perceptions and pressures into individual ambitions. The more an individual interacted with his society, the more he imitated others. It follows, therefore, that men (ostensibly more susceptible to vocational pressures) suffered greater societal compulsions. At societal level, social perceptions about medical profession gave rise to compulsion to imitate and found a potent expression through domestic pressures. These broader societal compulsions are invariably linked to economic issues. The financial prospects, stability of the job and opportunity to improve conditions are compelling elements dictating entry into medicine (Sikandar et al, 2013). Hence, the widely-accepted stability of medical career becomes a constraint and prevents exploring of other fields.

Simard et al’s (2008) finding that the future direction of medical students is predominantly guided by monetary considerations was supported by the study. Maguire (2007) had confirmed that doctors the world over enjoy respectable living standards, stable future prospects and monetary satisfaction. However, the exclusivity of material goals impacts the nobility and prestige of the profession (Sikandar et al., 2013). The symptoms of these are the aversion to serve for low salaries in the public sector and the repeatedly substantiated aim of moving abroad (Mushtaq, 2013). Two decades ago, Hasan (1995) had warned about the economically transitioning of medical practice and underscored “the pressures of making two ends meet in an environment of enormous inflation and unreasonable basic expenditure on self and family sustenance”.

Men were shown in the study to bear greater economic compulsions and correspondingly stronger economic motivation than women, presumably owing to imposition of their traditional role and constant refrain of fulfilling domestic responsibilities. Male students felt more the brunt of market competitiveness. The claim by Johansson (2007) that men are more interested in financial standing and particularly prone to economic motivation when subjected to social pressures in a conservative setting was borne by the findings of the study. Sanfey (2006) substantiated the primacy of monetary-based lifestyle expectations, career progression, remuneration and prestige among men and of patient care and balanced life among women in medicine (Buddeberg-Fischer et al, 2003). Thus, apart from the fact of universally persisting gender-based wage gaps (Drolet, 2011), the study did not support Baker’s (2010)the assertion that both genders accorded similar importance to salary or that females chose career pattern based on economic motivations.

The study also confirmed the imitational value of nurturing ambition. Males showed themselves to be more influenced by successful examples, thus verifying Tyler et al’s (2009) claim that inspiring examples and respected specialists attract students towards medicine.

The study found that female students possessed greater strong personality traits than males. This reinforced the view that gender-based identity is shaped by social and historic forces.
(Weeks, 2000). It also alluded to women’s greater intrinsic motivation, which is necessary for a career in medicine (Kusurkar, 2011). Women have been shown to display greater determination to overcome hardship, act independently and persevere towards success, in spite of social embargoes (Dweck, 2008). This personal determination could be the result of independent nature of medical vocation, which is one of the biggest incentives (Rogers et al, 2010). The study also found the women to possess greater ambition and aspirations. A number of studies have departed from the conventional approach and established that women are as much ambitious as men (Good et al., 2003; Grant & Dweck, 2003; Dweck, 2006). The personal aspiration to enter medicine is sown early in childhood, more often by the parents (Stratton et al, 2005). The domestic culture also mentally conditions students to venture into one kind of vocation (Barbour & Gray, 2011). Women and men have been shown to have similar IQ (Haier et al., 2005) and the gender differences in cognitive abilities have been proved to be inconsequential (William, 2000).

The findings also established women to have greater intrinsic aptitude for medicine, as has been discovered in the case of Pakistani students (Akund, 2010). Academic achievement and studiousness are predictors of entry into medicine (Saad et al, 2011). The study found women to have greater intrinsic interest in the medical field. This reinforces the assertion that girls are less interested in maths, computer science, engineering, or physical sciences and more inclined towards life sciences, social sciences and humanities (Jacobs, 2006).

Altruism and compassion were found to be a very strong sentiment among the medical students, and thus an influential determinant of medical career choice. A number of researches have established that most medical practitioners derive motivation and satisfaction from human values (Dugan et al., 2005). Female students were found to have greater spirit of altruism, compassion and egalitarianism than men, a finding affirmed by earlier studies (Bickel, 2001; McNay, 2000; Redman et al, 2004). Women have been found to be more welfare-oriented and less conforming or power-hungry than men (Konrad et al., 2000).

References


__________________________

**Aamir Hafeez** is Ph.D Research Scholar in the Department of Education, Hazara University, Mansehra.

**Prof. Dr. Syed Manzoor Hussain Shah** is Chairman in the Department of Education, Hazara University, Mansehra.
Rural Women’s Workload: Implications for Socio-Economic Development of Baluchistan

Abdul Rasheed  
Department of Commerce  
University of Baluchistan

Riffat Arshed  
Department of Economics  
University of Baluchistan

Zeenat Sana Baloch  
Department of Balochi  
University of Baluchistan

Abstract

This paper is based on the descriptive sample survey carried out mainly to highlight the issues of heavy workload of rural women within the conceptual framework of triple burden in two districts of Pishin and Mastung and also to explore its research and policy implications in the broader context of province. The key findings include: The burden of reproduction is directly related with domestic workload and was found high in both the districts indicating high fertility with serious health implications. Comparatively speaking, Women in Mastung were found to be involved in greater number in economic activities than Pishin reflecting their high level of deprivation and relatively more cultural freedom. Moreover, they have more control over their income indicating their higher degree of empowerment. Spending priorities reflect that women in Mustang give more importance to education and health. The study concludes heavy workload of rural poor women in terms of domestic chore and reproductive activities provides meaningful insights and suggestions to cope with the problem of exploitative workload.

Keywords: Empowerment, Implications, Gender disparity, Triple burden, Workload.
Introduction

Traditional women work load in the context of rural areas of Baluchistan may be defined in terms of inside and outside activities they normally render and are supposed to be heavier and exploitative. The problem of heavy workload, in case of worst scenario, is further explained as the composition of triple burden (domestic, reproductive and economic) and is compounded by poverty and illiteracy widely prevalent in the most backward rural areas of province (UNICEF, 1995). Another characteristic of women living in worst scenario is that they experience vicious circle of dependencies and vulnerabilities perpetuate their lower and degraded status.

The issue of women’s heavy workload and its implications for socio-economic development is highlighted both through national and cross country empirical studies that women who are under heavy traditional work burden are more vulnerable to diseases and poverty (UNICEF, 1993). Heavy traditional household activities have physical and psychological implications (Bennett, 1992). One of the most serious and wide spread occupational health hazards for poor women is the carrying of water, fuel and other heavy loads widely prevalent in the rural areas. Because of their triple burden, as mentioned above, the effects of poverty hit women particularly hard. Similarly empirical evidence on time use show that in most developing countries women work longer than men do; when the invisible work done inside the home is included (World Bank, 2001).

Rural poor women in Baluchistan are even in more critical conditions. The scholarly evidence in this regard, categorically confirms their plights & vulnerabilities. They have been experiencing challenges and problems with respect to their empowerment (Roath, 2008). Particularly Baloch tribal society being patriarchal, in nature, puts heavy burden in the form of domestic chore and reproductive activities particularly for giving birth to male children (Dashti, 2008). There is also increasing evidence that recent drought and other climate change have increased the volume of workload on rural women of the province. The severe drought spreading over 7 years (1998 -2005) may be considered as one of the worst in the history of province with negative implications for health of women especially on account of water scarcity (Baluchistan Board of Revenue, 2006).
The irony situation of such workload is that their role is not acknowledged at the family and policy levels in the tribal context of province. Consequently their low socio-economic status keeps their talents hidden and underutilized, constraining their participation in the formal labor market; and thus, remain vulnerable and dependent.

In view of the above, the need arises to conduct a detailed survey into the causes, pattern and highlight the problems of rural women load work, especially living in the most backward areas of the selected districts.

**Objectives of the Study**

The overall purpose of this study is to assess the pattern of women’s workload especially living in the rural backward areas of two districts in such a way as to find out its implications for their socio-economic development. The sub objectives are as under:

1. To compare and contrast the workload of rural women living in the study area of two districts.
2. To discover the factors affecting their capacity to work outside the home.
3. To identify the dependencies and vulnerabilities hidden in the traditional workload.
4. To formulate recommendations for durable interventions.

**Significance of the Study**

As regards, the nature of study, it is diagnostic in the sense that it was designed to find out the research and policy implications of heavy workload of those rural women who are living in the worst scenario of socio economic environment of province. The study covers important aspects of gender development providing a strong base for other gender related studies, which has not been academically explored so far in the province. The findings and their implications will be helpful in formulating recommendations for appropriate interventions related to women development. Since most of the NGO’s are working to reduce women’s workload in the rural area therefore the existing empirical work will help them to strategize their interventions especially for those areas that are experiencing the worst scenario of women’s conditions.

The paper is organized within the conceptual framework of triple burden of rural woman in terms of home, reproductive and economic responsibilities which are the outcome of vicious circle of deprivations resulting mainly from poverty and illiteracy. Following the introduction, research methodology is described in the second section. The third section discusses domestic workload. The fourth section comparatively describes and analyzes the reproductive and economic activities of women in their respective districts. Finally, the major findings and their policy and research implications will be presented in the fifth section.
Figure 1: Conceptual Framework

Research Methodology

The mini survey method was adopted to unfold the burden of women with respect to productive and reproductive work. This method is useful in case of specific topic containing fifteen to thirty questions mostly closed-ended with tiny size of sample (Casley & Kumar, 1988). The concept of triple workload was further translated and measured in terms of household, reproductive and economic activities. The conceptual framework developed on the bases of literature review, assumes that there is positive relationship between domestic workload and reproductive activities. Moreover, an additional burden was also found in the form of their involvement in the unpaid economic activities. These three burdens, therefore are supposed to reinforce each other in a vicious pattern.

A: Study Area

A cross-district survey was conducted by the commerce department with the financial assistance of University of Balochistan Quetta. The primary data were collected by using the instruments of questionnaire and observation note book, in the two districts of province, Mustang and Pishin during 2012. The districts were selected for the following reasons. Both the districts, Mastung south of & Pishin north of Quetta are situated at the equal distance from Quetta (Capital of Baluchistan.) have more or less equal level of socio and economic indicators, and are pre-dominantly rural population with more than (90%) (District Profiles, 2011) (MICS, 2004). However, culturally they have somewhat different backgrounds having different implications for their work load. For example, Pishin district generally holds stronger patriarchal society; therefore men’s control of women is extreme. Ethnically, they are also different. Pishin is exclusively dominated by Pashtoon, whereas the majority of Mastung are Brahui. Three different backward villages of the worst scenario in terms of workload were chosen from each district on the bases of socio-economic conditions such as population, distance from the urban centre, sources of income, level of physical infrastructure etc. In District Pishin, the sample (Thrata, Kazhawala, and Klli Machan) were chosen. While in Mastung the (Khdkocha, Dharanger and Killy Raith) were selected as sample villages.
B: Sample Size

As regards the sample size, 50 households from each village were selected by way of simple random sampling. The criteria adopted for the selection of respondents include; a married woman, potentially under triple burden was taken as a sampling unit with the following features (a) age group between 20 to 50 years (b) illiteracy (c) Poverty (d) high fertility and maternal mortality rate and therefore, are supposed to be more vulnerable to diseases and deprivations. Comparable data were collected on the selected factors related to triple work load and income spending by the trained women as in a tribal setup, like Balochistan, they cannot be accessed without female enumerators.

C: Method of Analysis

The cross-sectional data were analyzed within the conceptual framework of domestic, maternal and productive role by using descriptive statistical tools such as mean and relative percentages for the sake of comparison. Time use data were utilized to determine the volume of inside work load where as economic activities were measured in terms of frequency of involved respondents. The total burden was measured in percentages and presented in figure (1). Moreover, the suggestions of respondents were illustrated with pie charts (2).

Empirical Results and Discussions

The fact is established by researches that rural women are under heavier workload than their counterpart in the urban area due to deep rooted traditions (Malik, R., 2004). Traditional household activities among poor women are believed to be experiencing the following triple burden in terms of domestic chore, reproductive and unpaid economic role and thus having physical and psychological stresses.

Domestic Workload

The Survey findings show that in both the sample areas, women are under burden of heavy workload of different household activities, like cooking, dish washing, washing and pressing cloths, cleaning of house, sewing, taking care of children. The structure and time spending were almost the same as is described and shown in table (1).

The survey brings out the fact that cooking is the daily compulsory routine activity taking on average three hour daily. It includes preparation of two meals and breakfast, the entire responsibility of providing food to family lies upon women. It was observed that the majority of women did not take care of nutritional status of food, which reflects not only in their appearance but is also found in the children. Fetching water is another daily activity of
female family members. On the average mostly half hour daily spent on these activities. It is due to lack of piped water, and aftermath of drought which dried the water inside well of houses. The recent drought especially overburdened the women than men. Washing and pressing clothes is another household responsibility of women. The survey results reveal that both activities take on average two hour daily in both the study areas. Sweeping rooms and grounds is an important daily activity, which is normally performed by housewives and young girls on average; time spending was calculated one hour in both the study areas. Women also perform the function of cleanliness of toilets, washrooms, mopping which has an important implication for the hygienic environment of family.

As regards the question whether poor women spend more time on domestic chores, the results (Table 1) confirm the validity of heavy workload in the sample areas; therefore, the need arises to reallocate time to domestic chores in a way that can reduce so called time poverty Hessing, M. (1994). In doing so, they can spare it for both better nurturing of their children and can also enhance their role at the community level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Pishin</th>
<th>Mastung</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cooking</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breakfast</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dinner</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dish washing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pressing and washing clothes</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fetching water</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal care</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning house</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child care</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking food to field</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other engagements</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source sample survey, 2012 (by author)

Note: It is difficult to establish time spending on various activities, as women do not calculate time in hours however, an estimate has been made to get time in hours for performing activities as shown in the above parenthesis.

Reproductive Activities

The second major burden of traditional women is related with heavy reproductive responsibilities stemming from their maternal role which is supposed to be occurred mainly
due to early marriages. According to Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey of Baluchistan (2011), on average early (7%) girls were married before reaching their 15th birthday and (35%) before 18th birthday. In addition to early marriages, poor fatherhood, health services both pre and postnatal also put heavy burden on women to bear this specific responsibility. In addition, lack of communities’ involvement in safe motherhood program was also found one of the reasons for persistently high mortality rate.

The survey found positive relationship between poor health and reproductive activities in the study area. The burden of reproductive activity in the instant case, are measured in terms of proxy indicators such as high fertility rate, reproductive health related diseases and child care activities. High fertility rate is common in both study areas more than (6%) respectively. Child delivery at home through traditional midwife is reported to be (80%) in the sample area of area of Pishin and (68%) in Mastung. High fertility rate has serious implications for their health as it is evident from their experience of pains and stresses as explained in section V. Child bearing and rearing activities increases the manual work among mothers who are already under the vicious circle of poor nutrition and thus vulnerable to diseases especially anemia, and toxemia.

**Women Involvement in Economic Activities**

In traditional societies which are characterized by lack of market system, the business of everyday living is usually carried out on gender division of labour (Ivan Illich, 1982). However, it was noted that Baloch and Pashtoon, especially in nomadic life, do not have any segregation of sexes. To examine women’s economic role in the sample areas, the majority of respondents were found uninvolved in any outside income generating activity due to limited cultural freedom and therefore, hardly contributed to family welfare (Mohyuddin, Choudhry & Ambreen, 2012).

To simplify the situation, direct income activities were taken into consideration within the four walls of house or in the neighboring centers. The survey results confirm that the majority of women prefer doing some economic or business activity within the acceptable cultural norms. Out of the total involved respondents in the sample area (42.65%) were involved in sewing on non-commercial bases while (35%) adopt it for income generation. About (4%) engaged in poultry. Similarly (1.23%) were involved in farming and farm related activities as unpaid work. However, findings in Mastung district showed a higher share in income generating activities. 60% respondents were found in embroidery and handicraft business. As women have significant role in the development of livestock sector in Balochistan (Shafiq, 2008), therefore the study also found them in income generating activities related to livestock and poultry (6.8%, 4.35%) respectively.

The comparative profile of their respective role in economic activities as is illustrated in (table, 2) clearly reveals the higher percentage of Mastung district. Cross district
comparison of women involvement shows that the higher percentage of respondents in Mastung were involved in income generating activity both inside and outside of the home, their role in agriculture and livestock is comparatively dominant though the majority of them do it as unpaid family laborers. Moreover, respondents in Mastung district have more economic mobility for the reasons of relatively less rigid environment and higher poverty level.

While analyzing the causes of poor involvement in economic activities, the survey has found the factors such as cultural barriers; dearth of economic opportunities, lack of information and poor economic incentives. However, both positive and negative views on the issue of women workload were found in the study area. Mastung was found less rigid in terms of male attitude towards working of women outside the home. The dominant perception prevailing among male members in Pishin is that women cannot pay any productive role, as they are physically and culturally inferior to male as such their contribution should be confined to the four walls. This finding is in line with the previous regional study conducted in Naseerabad area of province thus, indicating external validity (Rashid and Zainab, 2011).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Pishin Frequency</th>
<th>Pishin Percentage</th>
<th>Mastung Frequency</th>
<th>Mastung percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Farm activities</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10.2%</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cattle</td>
<td>5.23</td>
<td>5.33%</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>4.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vegetables</td>
<td>20.12</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hand Crafts</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10.2%</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sewing clothes</td>
<td>42.65</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>58.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoe making /others</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10.2%</td>
<td>8.85</td>
<td>8.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>98</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td><strong>102</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Sample Survey, 2012 (by author)

Comparing the different burdens, the study has found the different level of triple work between two districts as are evident from the following (figure2) showing the sum of total burden. Women in Pishin carries more burden in terms of reproductive activities 55% for the reasons of high fertility rate due to early marriages. The same region was also found more backward in terms of economic role just 10% as compared to Mastung.
Pattern of Income Spending

Pattern of income spending is an important indicator of judging women’s autonomy and control over family resources therefore, it has important implications for workload. Women, who are generating income through economic activities, are believed to be less vulnerable to the stresses of heavy domestic workload. According to the survey findings, the majority of respondent were found doing economic activities without receiving any economic reward. However, a few number of women 9% were involved in income generating activities in Pishin district spend their earned income on children schooling. 29% allocate on food and 20% on clothing, whereas 7.8% on day to day expenses like children pocket money and 4% income go to the family medicine. The pattern results therefore, suggest more autonomy for women in this regard. On the other hand, in Mastung, 53% respondents spend on education, which is 10% higher than Pishin. Respondents 17.7% spend on food 12% on cloths, 7. 3% spend on daily expenses and 7% consume on medicine. Comparing the pattern of expenditure between two districts, one can say women in Mastung have more control over their income indicating that they are less dependent on their male partners. Their priorities also reflect that they give more importance to education whereas women in Pishin give less priority to it.

The Impact of Heavy Workload on Health

One of the objectives of survey was to assess the impact of traditional workload on health. The main purpose of asking health related questions was to assess the level of consciousness of women about the consequences of workload on their health keeping in view the prevalent cultural values. Since there is positive link between heavy work load and ill health especially maternal and neonatal health, therefore, it was assumed that if they care for their health during housework or economic activities, they are unlikely to be vulnerable to diseases. Similarly in case they are experiencing diseases, but persist in doing work are likely to prolong their diseases and thus will remain under the burdens of
dependencies and vulnerabilities. The studies also confirm the complex interaction of women workload and their health due to socio economic conditions in the province (Balochistan conservation strategy, 2005).

As per survey results, in Pishin the majority of respondents (33%) are not paying proper attention to their health during housework activities. Similarly, 31% respondents pay attention to their health doing housework. The reasons they mentioned were that there is no other option but to continue house job as there is no work load sharer. In fact, such women are more vulnerable to ill health and exploitation that cannot give care to their health during housework activities. 31.30% respondents stated that they pay due attentions to their health. In case of illness, they avoid doing any housework activities. To some extent, 23% respondents care for their health.

As compared to Pishin, Mastung presents better situation with respect to health consciousness, as the sample women were found more conscious about their health. This is largely because of customary role of birthing specialists’ midwives locally known as (Baluk) who socially mobilize them practically give home grown drugs and back rub (Dashti, 2008). The Majority of respondents (60%) in the Mustang study area said that they cure and maintain their health with traditional herbs.

Moreover some traditional beliefs were found in the both sample areas about the burden of work load and its negative outcomes on health. The dominant views especially among aged women contradict the idea that physical work leads to negative outcome rather it is sort of exercise keeping women healthier. So much so they also deny the negative effects of more children. What is needed is to the change traditional beliefs regarding workload and health through education.

**Suggestions for Reducing Workload**

Reducing workload is a key indicator of women development. There is a consensus among the development practitioners that the projects with positive impacts on work load should be considered successful and sustainable. Realizing its importance, the project impact studies give considerable importance to this issue in their assessment.

Using the open ended questions, the views of respondents were sought as how to reduce their workload. The survey found most of the suggestions pertinent with the social sector development. With minor differences, the availability of drinking water was found on top of the list simply because in most cases they fetch water from distant sources, followed by social services such as health particularly TBA services, education, shortage of electricity, poor transportation as is illustrated in the following figure:
Findings and Recommendations

One of the objectives of this study was to bring out the policy and research implications of rural women workload therefore; the observations and suggestions based on the findings are presented as under.

1. The overall paradigm shift is needed in the government policies and programs, as the current programs do not address the needs of women. More specific projects with the clear cut identification of women as beneficiaries and as an agent have to be launched. In this regard, more institutionalized efforts are needed.

2. Women workload with respect to child bearing and rearing in terms of time consumption is very low in both the districts due to high fertility rate. Therefore, the need arises to improve the access of respondents to family planning services and get the existing reproductive health centers more functional.

3. Women’s workload regarding fetching and managing water is increasing day by day mainly due to two reasons: persistent drought and load shedding. More efforts are needed to improve the situation.

4. During the survey, a strong link was found between education and vulnerability of women to poverty and diseases. Since the girls’ literacy rate is negligible, more strenuous efforts are needed to improve the female enrollment ratio.

5. Keeping in view the socio-cultural rigidities of the sample areas, an approach preferably at grass root level must be adopted to enhance the “inside” role of women in the fields of motherhood and family care.

6. During the survey, it was observed that women’s awareness about gender development activities is very poor in spite of the fact, that NGOs like BRSP, SPO, and international organizations such as UNDP and UNICEF were found working in such activities in both the districts. One of the reasons noted was the perception of respondents about bad reputation of NGOs. What is needed is to coordinate the efforts of development agencies, government health department to increase the awareness level of women through local media. We also need to change certain traditional beliefs and perceptions regarding reproductive health causing heavy workload with the help of education and dissemination of knowledge.
7. Women’s involvement in direct income generating activities was found very poor in both the sample areas due to cultural rigidities despite the fact that the majority of respondents were willing to work at home. Stimulating home based economic activities like embroidery, gardening livestock, poultry and developing small scale cottage industries at community level can serve the purpose.

8. Another important policy implication arises from the perception of women that they cannot bring about any change unless male attitude is favorably changed especially in Pishin. Gender development interventions through social mobilization of male can address the issue of the burden of women.

Conclusions

The study has made an effort to bring out the issues of traditional work load of rural poor women on the surface within the conceptual framework of triple burden. While evaluating the main findings, the study has found that women are suffering from the exploitative domestic work load. As a result, social exclusion and vulnerability perpetuate the poor status of women in a vicious way. The proportion of reproductive burden was found higher than other two burdens. However, the role of women in community management was found weaker due to cultural and social rigidities especially in Pishin district. Another finding may be drawn from the pattern of income spending that women involved in economic activity has contributed to family welfare by way of spending on education, nutrition and other child care activities suggesting positive intergenerational effects. The recommendations and findings of the study need to be incorporated into any local gender development strategy. Moreover deeper micro level studies at village level are needed to be carried out to capture the women’s work inside and outside the houses within the above nexus of triple burden.

References


Dr. Abdul Rasheed is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Commerce, University of Baluchistan, Quetta.

Mrs. Riffat Arshed is Chairperson in the Department of Economics, University of Baluchistan, Quetta.

Dr. Zeenat Sana Baloch is Professor in the Department of Balochi, University of Baluchistan.
The Constitution Of Pakistan (1973) And Women Rights: An Interpretation

Abida Perveen
Sheikh Zayed Islamic Center
University of Karachi

Abstract

Women Rights are part of Human Rights, which are considered important in every society. These rights are inalienable and indivisible rights held by all, and are the basic standards of equity and justice without which people cannot live with dignity. The situation of Women Rights in Pakistan is complex as a result of country’s diversity, large population, its status as a developing country and a sovereign Islamic Republic as well as Islamic democracy with a mixture of both Islamic and secular laws, which include freedom of speech, freedom of thought, freedom of information, freedom of religion, freedom of association, freedom of media and freedom of assembly. The constitution of the country (1973) carries Human Rights different and this article debates certain classes with are respected in practice. The main purpose of the study is to explore the reasons why women Rights Situation in Pakistan has not been satisfactory.

Keywords: The Constitution of Pakistan (1973), Women’s Rights.
Introduction

The constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan makes it binding that there will be no discrimination on the basis of gender (The Constitution of Pakistan, Article 25 (2) (1973). In pursuance of this, the planning and policies for ensuring gender equality, women rights and empowerment of women have developed gradually, considering their significant contribution to sustainable socio-economic development of Pakistan. Women constitute 51 percent of the total population and 22.7 percent of the labor force (Planning Commission, 2015).

The National Policy for Development and Empowerment in Pakistan ensures women equal access to all development benefits and social services. Pakistan has pledged to promote gender equality and empowering women, improving health. Pakistan is signatory of the United Nations convention for elimination of all forms of discrimination against women. The Pakistan National Policy for Development and Empowerment also ensures women’s equal access to all development benefits and social services. Despite their defined constitutional, legal and religious the status of women is under shadows.

The position of women in society is mainly determined by attitudes and behaviour towards them. Even where women’s rights are recognized by civil and religious laws, in pradica, cultural traditions and men’s ingrained attitudes towards women often deny them in their proper status. For example, men and women have equal rights in marriage, and in almost all Muslim countries, education for both boys and girls is obligatory. In addition, some countries have introduced laws to offer better job opportunities for women in public sector. However, these laws have not generally made much difference to the status of women, and little will change as long as the attitudes and behaviours towards women in a society remains a plethora.

Related Research Work

The researcher has gone through a plethora of different relevant studies during the writing of this paper. The purpose is to view the empirical literature related to present article. The constitution of Pakistan (1973) is supreme law of the country. Article 8 to 28 of the constitution describe the fundamental human rights which are available to the citizen of Pakistan both men and women. The executive is bound to implement these rights while the judiciary is bound to take article of any violations and provide redress on individual complaints of any gross violations of a collective rights.

Timothy, M. Shaw stated that there is an incredibly widespread assumption that human rights is a western concept, meant for a certain group of people and not for all human
beings universally. This is a political propaganda perpetuated by the developing world leaders with their vested interests.

Bhalla (1991) stated that one of the significant aspects of contemporary international relations is the importance attached to the promotion and protection of human rights. Institutions of grant importance spend an increasing amount of their time on questions of human rights and an increasing sector of the membership of international institutions accords human rights question a priority that in many cases even exceeds questions of peace and security. The increasing inter dependence of modern world economically, politically, technologically and strategically has made concern for human rights a major international fact.

Forsythe (1989) said that problems of human rights have been viewed in different ways, especially the question of how much emphasis should be placed on each category of rights of civil, political, economic or social and cultural. Arguments have been advanced in favor of economic and political rights on the other hand; it has been argued that civil and political rights are preconditions for the realization of economic and social rights.

In 1977, UNESCO mentioned that the human rights approach is not surprising when it is remembered that at least half of the population of the globe are effectively deprived of their basic human rights, the up routed the oppressed, the illiterate, the unemployed, the starving and soon.

Brounlie (2006) narrates that the United Nations has set some standards. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights and charter of United Nations provide full explanation of every basic human rights with complete implementation of these rights.

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights was adopted by the United Nations general Assembly in 1948. It urges member Nations to promote a number of civil, economic and social rights, asserting these rights as part of “foundation of freedom, justice and peace in the world” (Henkin, 1987). The declaration was the first international legal effort to limit the behavior of states, press, for their citizens following the model of rights and duties. The Declaration was framed by members of the Human Rights Commission, with former First Lady Eleanor Roosevelt as chair, discussed an International Bill of Rights in 1947.

The members of the Human Rights Commission did not immediately agree on the form of such a bill of rights, and whether, or how it should be enforced. The commission proceeded to frame the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and accompanying treaties, but the Universal Declaration of Human Rights became the priority. Professor John Humphrey (Canadian Professor of Law) and Mr. Rene Cassin (Lawyer in France) make the cross national research and the structure of the document respectively, where
the articles of the Declaration were interpretative of the general principle of the preamble (Henkin, 1987).

The document was structured by Cassin to include the basic principles of dignity, liberty, brotherhood and equality in the first two articles, followed successively by rights pertaining to individuals; rights of individuals in relation to each other and to groups; spiritual, public and political rights; and economic, social and cultural rights (Ball & Gready, 2006).

The Universal Declaration was divided into treaties, a covenant and civil and political rights and another on social, economic and cultural rights due to questions about the relevance and propriety of economic and social provisions in covenants on human rights. Both covenants begin with the right of people to self determination and the sovereignty over their natural resources. This debate over whether human rights are more fundamental than economic rights has continued to the present day.

Sulibian (2003) said that now the human rights have been promoted through legal standards, to vast degree human rights have been protected in fact, If we take ten of the most fundamental instruments of human rights, we find that there is an array of measures amiable for the implementation of human rights. He suggests that international area is the most obvious area for the promotion of human rights.

Mumtaz, & Shaheed (1987) analyzed, the role and status of women are not isolated social phenomena, and women’s struggle do not take place in a vacuum. Both are determined, enhanced or impeded, by the social, political and economic development of a people’s history. The Islamization campaign in Pakistan to curtail women’s rights and to resist this, women’s movement has been formed and both are the result of ongoing processes. Noam Chomsky (1978) discussed that Western intelligentsia continue, in a significant measure, to exploit the substantial freedom that they enjoy to construct the system of beliefs that is required to defend privilege and power and justify its exercise, as the poor and oppressed of the world seek ways to take this future in their own hands.

William Talbott (2007) said that basic human rights are the rights necessary to enable all people to develop and exercise autonomy to become the authors of their own lives, Human Rights with normal cognitive, emotional and behavioral capacities, have the ability to become autonomous. He stated that in order to identify the basic human rights that should be universal, it is necessary to investigate the conditions necessary for autonomy.
Ali (2011) wrote that much awareness has been created concerning the rights of women throughout the globe and Pakistan. In a domestic setup the women have their role and they also face hazards of social behaviours. The education plays a vital role to maintain dignity of women and the economic circumstances also have their own effect.

Most of the studies related to human rights stress that human being is a social creature and wants to live in a society with the protection of its basic human rights. Islam has emphasized so much on basic rights of parents. Other religions as compared to Islam have not discussed about the rights of parents although it is an important aspect of human life. Other religions has not explained the basic rights of humans in detail. If we compare the human rights charter and Islamic teachings there are a lot of similarities between the two. Therefore, we can argue that Islam gave the concept of Human Rights the initially in the world. Women enjoy a special status and protection in the rights given by Islam. In fact, Islamic law (Shariat) provides a sound cover to women against all sorts of exploitation and safeguard them from exploitation of the society.

**Women Rights in Pakistan (Interpretation)**

The constitution (1973) is the supreme law of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan and all laws passed should be in line with the constitution. The constitution has undergone various amendments which have weakened the guarantee it provides for equal rights; Articles 8 to 28 describe the fundamental Human Rights.

All citizens (men and women) are guaranteed: freedom of speech, expression, freedom of to assemble peacefully, freedom of association and the right to move freely throughout Pakistan to reside any part of the country. The dignity of men and women and the privacy of home are declared inviolable. Every man and woman is guaranteed the freedom to enter upon any lawful profession or occupation or to conduct any lawful trade or business.

The constitution grant fundamental rights to safeguard against discrimination in services on the ground of race, religion, caste, residence, sex. However, special provisions could be made for women and children.

The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan is an independent, non-profit organization founded in 1987. It is voluntary, non-governmental organization registered under the societies Registration Act (XXI of 1860). Its mission is to implement the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other related charter, covenants, protocols, Resolutions, and internationally adopted norms. It cooperates with aid national and international groups, organizations and individuals in protection of Human Rights charter and to take
appropriate action to prevent violations of human rights and to provide legal assistance to victims of those violation The Human Rights Commission (2015) noted:

“A proliferation of instances of the so called honor killing, rape, acid, attack, domestic violence and assaults against women was evident. Infants bore the brunt of the prolonged drought in Tharparker, where over 650 paid with their lives for the apathy in high places”

Pakistan lagged most Asian countries in educating a significant proportion of its children especially girls. The health care system, already among the weakest in South Asia, continued to deteriorate at a fast pace. Targeted attacks on healthcare workers and their security escorts posed a serious challenge to what some already considered Pakistan losing battle against polio. “In 2014 the high incidence of polio in Pakistan broke the country’s own previous record. Child and bonded labor remained rampant and laborers including children, continued to work in hazardous conditions (The State of Human Rights, 2015).

Throughout the history of Pakistan women have always been deprived of a part of their human rights. According to international Human rights law, the ruling principle is equality of man and women. Due to their human being, no difference should exist between them and the principle of equality should rule. This is an important principle from the viewpoint of observing human rights for women. Women have economic, socials political and judicial rights which were considered especially for men in social customs and traditions throughout the history.

The adoption of women rights in the category of human rights is linked with the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women, in December 1979, which became law in September 1981 (Baxi, 2009).

To modify the social and cultural pattern of conduct of men and women with a view to achieve the elimination of prejudices and customary and other practices which are based on the idea of interiority or the superiority of either of the sexes or on stereotypical roles for men and women. The rights of women are often violated not in the civil and political sphere but in the realism of culture, customs and practices as well (Baxi, 2009).

There are considerable differences between countries in regard to their philosophy concerning women and the actual enjoyment of basic rights by women, and these are inextricably linked with the culture and values of furthering the rights of women is of particular importance and should be considered in relation to their central role in regard to the family and the welfare of the children. There is a need to encourage and prepare women to accept new and wider responsibilities in society. This can be done through educational programs and the positive role by women’s organizations. Although women
constitute a majority of the population, there is no society in which women enjoy full equality with men. The UN has always advocated that the promotion of the human rights of women must eliminate all forms of gender based discrimination and enable them to participate fully in all spheres of civil and social, economic and political cultural life.

In Pakistan, laws governing family and marriage were reformed under the military regimes of general Ayub Khan (1958-69). Moreover, women’s access to labor market and to education improved somewhat in the context of government economic reforms. To follow western liberal traditions, Ayub Khan cast doubt on the world view of religious leaders (ulemas) whom he considered retrogressive. Ayub Khan invoked Islam, in response to the rising tide of Bengali nationalism in East Pakistan (Now Bangladesh) in 1960s.

In 1965, the president Ayub gained unexpectedly the support of religious leader to context the candidacy of Ms. Fatima Jinnah (woman) in the name of Islam. Islam was manipulated in Pakistan for political ends. Some religious leader, who had denounced the participation of women in political life, endorsed the candidacy of Ms. Jinnah for reasons of political exigency (Burki, 1991).

During Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto’s regime (1971 to 1977), conditions for women were, however, improved significantly. During this period, the equality of men and women was recognized in law, for the first time in the history of Pakistan. The number of women in services grew considerably. A commission on the status of women in Pakistan was established in July 1976. The commission gave its report after eight months indicating legal reforms, but the report was never ratified by the National Assembly, nor it was made public. Ziaul Haq, took over the power in 1977 and a number of rights which had been granted to women during Bhutto’s regime were compromised. Ziaul Haq used Islam for political purpose.

Ziaul Haq (1977-1985) suspended fundamental rights entrenched in the constitution, including rights for guaranteeing the equality of men and women before the law. He advocated to reinstate in the country “the moral purity of early Islam” and to return to the “The sanctity of the chardivari”, that is the confinement of women within the four walls of the home. He legislated the Haddood Ordinances, the Qanun-e- Shahadat (law of evidence) and the Bill concerning Qisas-e- Diyat (Retribution), which help to deteriorate the status of women in Pakistan (Jahangir & Jilani, 2003). Later on during Benazir Bhutto, and Nawaz Sharif regimes the status of Women’s rights remained skeptical except during the 90 days rule of the Interim Government of Moin Qureshi in 1993, both private and public media condemned the discrimination against women in Pakistan and particularly discrimination related to the Hudood Ordinance (Matsui, 1990).
The United Nations adopted the standard and principles concerning women’s rights in the first 30 years of its existence of the various international principles pertaining to the status of women, on political rights of women and the conventions on the abolition of slavery. In spite of the recommendations of various Pakistani and international Human rights organizations, Pakistan has yet not ratified the Convention on the elimination of all forms of discriminations against Women, which unites in a single instrument (United Nation Centre for Human Rights, 1993).

The constitution of Pakistan (1973) was substantially modified in the context of Islamization of the society under the regime of Ziaul Haq (1979 to 1988). However the current constitution recognizes the equality of men and women before law and prohibits all forms of discrimination, especially sexual discrimination, within the civil service and grants women the rights to participate fully in all activities in the national arena (Patel, 1979). However, many women’s rights observers and activists believe that these constitutional clauses do not provide Pakistani women with equality in the reality of life. For example, the commission setup by the government in 1955 incorporated many recommendations into the Muslim family Law Ordinance (1961). Under law the husband must obtain the prior consent of his first wife before marrying a second wife, but actually that is not practiced in the society.

Under the law, all marriages must be registered, which eliminates the much abused customary practice of divorce by declaration, that is, a divorce obtained by uttering the word “Talaq” (Divorce) three times. Moreover, the law grants women the right of divorce on a condition that a clause to this effect was written into the “Nikah Nama” (Marriage contract), at the time of marriage. Because a high rate of illiteracy in women, they are not aware with this clause. The rate of literacy for women must be encouraged by formulating policies by the government.

Article 25 (2) of the constitution of Pakistan mandates that there shall be no discrimination on the basis of gender alone. Further, Article 34 makes it incumbent upon the state to take up to ensure full participation of women in all sphere of national life. It is a fact that women are human being like men and women’s rights are human rights. Human rights of women has been defined as collective rights for a women to be seen and accepted as a person with the capacity to decide or act on her own behalf and to have equal access to resource and equitable social, economic and political support to develop her full potential, exercise her right as a human being and to support the development of others.

Violence is an action or policy or an attitude that causes bodily or mental injury and debars or dehumanizes a person. The violation of the rights of women is a human rights violation of her body and her right as a person. The violation of women’s rights takes
many forms such as sexual or physical assault and harassment, female feticide and infanticide, female circumcision and dowry deaths, Sati, wani and denial of her autonomy and authority over her body.

Women rights are very important, these right should be same for all woman no matter what their background is their race, origin etc. People deserve to be accepted like we are. They have their rights which are the same as ours and should be respected.

The Federal Government of Pakistan established the full fledge, Ministry of Human Rights in November 2008. While the announcement of the creation of National Human Rights Commission was made in 1993 in the tenure of the caretaker government, need was felt for establishment of Human Rights Cell. The cell was established in December 1993, Ms. Banazir Bhutto, the former Prime Minister on ardent advocate for democracy and for human rights of the most vulnerable sections of society, particularly children, and minority rights, upgraded this cell to the status of an independent Ministry in November 1995. However, in December 1996, due to serious financial crisis in the country, the ministry was degraded to Human Rights Wing, which was attached to the Ministry of Law and Justice making its the Ministry of Law, Justice and Human Rights. The same wing was upgraded to the level of a division in November 2007 and then to the current Ministry of Human Rights.

Pakistan is an Islamic State and follow its path according to Islamic teaching. Islam introduced fundamental reforms to customary law and introduced rights for women in marriage, divorce and inheritance, by providing that the wife, not her family, would receive a dowry from the husband, which she could administer as personal property, the Quran made women a legal party to the marriage contract. Islam has given the right to women to marry man according to her choice. The Quran says:

“And they (women) have right similar to those (of men) over them in Kindness, and men are a degree above Allah is mighty, wise” (Al Qur’an, 2:228).

The Quran protect women and their right for the prevalent misguided stereotypes of women and to give them a respectable position in society. Good teachers us that superiority in this presence is a not on gender, but rather on one’s fear and respect of Allah faith, good character, devotion and dedication. Islam accept the equality of men and women.

Human rights are interdependent and inter related. Each contributes to the realization of a person’s human dignity through the satisfaction of his or her development physical, psychological and spiritual needs. The fulfillment of one right often depends, wholly or in part, upon the fulfillment of others. For instance, fulfillment of the right to health may
depend in certain circumstances, on fulfillment of the right to development, to education or to information.

It we see the Pakistan’s laws on Human Rights, we can take guidance from father of the Nation Muhammad Ali Jinnah, in which in his presidential address to the constituent Assembly of Pakistan in 1947, he said:

“History shows that in England, conditions some time ago, were Mule worse than those prevailing in India today. The Roman Catholics and the protestants persecuted each other. Even now there are some states in existence where there are discriminations made and bars imposed against a particular class. Thank God, we are not starting in those days. We are starting in the day where there is no discrimination, no distinction between one community and another, no discrimination between one caste or creed and another. We are starting with fundamental principle that all citizens and equal citizens of one state” (J. J. Ziegler, 2011).

Equal rights for women, and full participation for women in all fields of social life are “a necessity for the full and Complete development of a country, the welfare of the world, and the cause of peace” (UNDEDAW, 1980).

An appeal contained in the Declaration on race and racial prejudice, unanimously adopted by the General conference of UNESCO (1978) needs to be in this context “The mass media and those who control or serve them as all organized groups within national committees, are urged with due regard to the principles embodied in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, particularly the principle of freedom of expression to promote understanding tolerance and friendship among individuals and groups and to contribute to the eradication of racism, racial discrimination and racial prejudice, in particular by refraining from presenting a stereotyped, practical, unilateral or tendentious picture of individual and of various human groups” (Many Voices One World, 1980).

The violation of human rights, the most systematic, widespread and entrenched is the denial of equality to women. There is no country in the world where women have achieved although making up half or more than half of the population, women are treated as a minority group, disadvantaged and powerless often the burdens of poverty, unemployment and the educational backwardness weigh more heavily on woman than on men (Many Voices One World, 1980).

More than two thirds of the illiterates in Pakistan and the education given to girls as compared to boys tends to be inferiors and is more often curtailed at early age. Women need free access on equal terms to education, social participation and communication the
social, political and religious problem of the country. But in Pakistan, this access is hindered by traditions, by prejudices based on social customs or sometimes on religion by discriminatory laws in the country, and also by imposing on women a imbalance of responsibility for care of the home and work on agricultural land, as the country rural area is dependent on women workforce and even in urban setup, they hold tremendous responsibilities.

Lack of education is a major hindrance to choice of occupation, women hardly gain an opportunity for gain economic independence, social security and proper consciousness of their own value. Public attitudes regarding the role of women in society the country are major determinants in deciding the status of women. Women are confined to domestic sphere or also as secretaries, assistants and similar roles as compared to those of men. Even in domestic and personal situations, women seems as incapable of making decision without male guidance. The Report by the International Commission for the study of communication problems stressed:

“The achievement of full equality for women is a matter of justice and human rights; it is also necessary so that society can mobilize all its focus for social progress and especially for efforts of development. The world cannot afford to waste the great resources represented by the abilities and talents of women. This is the thought that should be constantly in the minds of those responsible for decision in communication” (Many Voices One World, 1980).

In a seminar on “self employed women in Pakistan” organized by center of excellence for women’s studies, University of Karachi, Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah stressed that women need to be strong to fight for discrimination they face. Domestic violence and child abuse are the major issues that need to be addressed for a better and peaceful society. The role of women in the development of country should not be ignored as they are a key segment of our society. The speakers advocated the need of a safe atmosphere in the country, in which women can get education and also fulfill their duties without any fear. The seminar urged the government to take measures to promote technical and vocational education among women so that they could be empowered financially. The government should create awareness of women protection laws through media so that women in all parts of Pakistan could known their rights. In this context, the recently passed bill pertaining to protection of women against harassment was commendable (Express Tribune, 2016).

The principal of fundamental rights guaranteed in the constitution of Pakistan (1973), which says all citizens are equal before the law and entitled to equal protection of law. No person should be deprived of life or liberty save in recordance with the law. There should be no discrimination on grounds of religion, race, caste, sex, or place of birth with regard to access to places of public entertainment, recreation, welfare or utility. All forms
of slavery, servitude, forced labour, torture or cruel or inhuman treatment or punishment were declared illegal. The constitution guarantee non-discrimination in respect of women and children. The ruling principle is the equality of man and women. Due to their being human, no differences should exist between them and the principle of equality’s should rule. Women have economic, social, political and legal rights, which are considered especially for man in traditional customs. The United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All form of Discrimination against Women was adopted in December 1979 and became (lord) in September 1981. Article 25 (27 of the constitution mandates that there shall be no discrimination on the basis of sex alone. Mention further article 34 makes it incumbent upon the state to take step to ensure full participation of women in all sphere of life. The constitution grant human rights of women, collective rights for men and women, and women are accepted as a person with the capacity to decide or act on her own behalf and have equal access to resources of the country. The violation of the rights of women’s right is human rights violation of her body and her right as a person. Gender justice remain a far cry all over the world as has been highlighted by Prophet Muhammad (Peace be Upon Him) long time ago.

Conclusions

In order to follow the example of Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) we should see how he treated women. He never lifted a finger at any of his wives or daughters throughout his life. He said “the best of you are those who are the best to their wives, and I am the best amongst you, to my wives” (Ahmed, 2016).

Once a man’s complaint that his wife became violent with him, Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) advised him to bear his wife’s treatment with patience. Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) consulted Bibi Fatima regarding Hazarat Ali’s marriage proposal for her. In Pakistani society mistreats wives, furring them physically and mentally, cutting off their nose and ears, disfiguring them by throwing acid on their face, Kidnapping and raping them and even killing girls if they express their preference in the choice of husband are a common feature.

In Islam, marriage is a social contract between man and woman. At the time of Nikah, the bride is asked if she is willing to marry the groom, meaning that she has a choice. A forced marriage is un-Islamic and haram or forbidden, while a talk (Divorce) is halal or permissible, if a woman does not want to live with a man, for any reason, that is her prerogative. Domestic, psychological and verbal violence, economic abuse are common in the society. Woman are harassed by men who are trying to harm them because of their proposal had been refused.

The aggrieved women shall be proofed under the criminal procedure code, 1998.
Nilofar Ahmed (2016) in the Dawn refers specifically that sometimes people quote from Surah Al Nisa, in the Quran to set their own purpose. Here the word “qawwam” mean ‘protector’, ‘provider’ and ‘supporter’, but it is traditionally translated as ‘ruler’ and ‘lord’. The word ‘mushur’ which can be translated as ‘disloyalty’ is often translated as ‘disobedience’. Besides the father and husband, ‘ar rijall’ or man as a whole including the government are responsible as’ protector’ and ‘supporters’ of women.

Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) said the most perfect man in his faith among the believers is ‘the one whose behaviour is the most excellent’ and the best of you are ‘those who are the best for their wives’. Good manners and good behaviour are frequently emphasized both in the Quran and Hadith. Lack of civility and good manners in Pakistan’s society is rampant and this is partly due to the lack of education and Islamic teaching and also to the examples set by religious and political elites. If our opinion leaders become those who preach hatred against women and people with different views and who incite superficial emotions based on irrationality, people will become crude, callous, disrespectful, intolerant and be left with little dignity. Pakistan need a greater commitment to accelerate efforts towards gender equality. We have different laws and initiatives for the protection of women’s rights including the Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act, 2013, the domestic violence (Prevention and protection) Bill, 2013, the protection against Harassment of women at workplace 2010 and the Anti Women practices Act, 2011. But, we still lack the infrastructure to implement the laws. In spite of the existence of laws, there is rampant disregard of women right in society. There is need for eliminating discriminatory policies and attitudes against woman.

The Quran repeatedly stresses on equality of men and women by saying that human are created from on soul (Al Qur’an, 4:1). While the Holy Qur’an emphasizes on the equality, it also reorganize the diversity among human kind. for example indicates that Allah has purposefully created different comities, or else. He could have made all humankind one community. For example in one verses a Allah Says’ mankind we have created you male and female, and made you into nations and tribes, so that you may know one another” (Al Qur’an, 49:13). Similarly, in another verse, the Quran says “To each among you have. We prescribed a law and an open way, If Allah had so willed, He would have made you a single people” (Al Qur’an, 5:48) the Quran also teaches “one to tolerate differences and not to impose one’s faith on others” (Al Qur’an, 2:256). Likewise, many examples can be in the teachings and life of Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) that stress as the unity of human being and respect for women. The prophet (Peace be upon him) repeatedly reminded humankind to be respectful and helpful to each other. We can conclude that there are plenty of messages in the Quran and in the teachings of Prophet (peace be upon him) that stress on the respect of women in a society.
References


Al Qur’an 2:228.

Al Qur’an, 2:256

Al Qur’an, 4:1

Al Qur’an, 49:13

Al Qur’an, 5: 48

Al, Quran, 4:34


__________________________

Dr. Abida Perveen is an Associate Professor and Director in the Sheikh Zayed Islamic Center, University of Karachi.
Impact Of Micro-Credit On Women Empowerment: A Case Study Of Rural Pakistan

Ambreen Fatima
Syed Faizan Iftikhar
&
Khurram Iftikhar
Applied Economics Research Centre
University of Karachi

Abstract

It is widely argued that discrimination on the basis of gender leads to social exclusion and locks people into long-term poverty traps. Thus the need for poverty alleviation schemes that target women and children have long been a priority for development of communities around the world, and also including Pakistan. It is also a widely recognized fact that poverty can be overcome if women are provided access to economic and educational opportunities, as well as autonomy to take advantage of such opportunities. The provision of credit, especially micro-credit, has now become an effective tool and successful strategy for poverty reduction among women. The main objective of this study is to determine the impact of micro-credit on women empowerment, specifically on women mobility. The study analyzes the impact of credit on women’s role in decision-making, besides estimating the changes in their confidence level. It also evaluates the advantages of women keeping assets in their name. Consequently, the study concludes that the impact of micro-credit has played a positive role on women empowerment, specifically in raising awareness in enhancing their capacity to build assets, move around freely and contributes to various household level economic decisions.

Keywords: Micro-finance Institutions, Gender, Empowerment, Socio-Economic Constraints, Poverty, Rural Areas of Pakistan.
Introduction

This paper is an attempt to explore issues pertaining to credit services among rural females of Pakistan. Microcredit programs for women are seen increasingly as an effective poverty alleviation intervention by development agencies, and widely assumed that there is a clear and direct relationship between access to credit and an increase in the status of women within their households and communities. The provision of credit is believed to lead to empowerment of women (Kabeer 1998; and Mayoux 1998). The basic theory behind this concept states that microcredit programs empower women by giving capital in their hands which allows them to earn independently. This economic empowerment is expected to generate self-esteem, respect and other forms of empowerment among beneficiaries. Although the ability of a woman to transform her life through access to credit services also depends on other factors as well, some of them are linked to her personal abilities while others are dependent on her surroundings and environment, like socio-economic and cultural background. The social and cultural norms dictate the status of women in a society.

Several studies have documented the improvement in women’s status within the household resulting from access to credit, mainly focusing on female employment, concluding that the magnitude of female labor force participation is larger in enterprises financed through credit. For example, Rahman (1986), Rahman and Khandker (1995) and Pitt and Khandker (1998) observed that female labour force participation rate shows a positive response towards micro-credit program. Self-employment of women and total household employment is higher in areas with credit programs. However, how much this employment generation can be considered as a step towards empowerment, will depend on the interlinked changes that result due to changes in employment opportunities. Gibbons and Todd (1993) observe that credit help those poor women with less assets to increase their earning and as a result their social position within the family and community improves remarkably.

Also, Zohir (1990) observed a positive influence on the status of woman in society and her social influence pertaining to security. Zohir also concludes that former (status of
women) arises due to credit disbursement to female members who now have greater influence on family matters. Zohir (1990) obtained positive impact of empowerment on social aspects, while Kabeer (1995) observed that success of microcredit program, especially empowering women, are understood in a more wider perspective. A comparison of women's self-employment with women's wage employment in large scale industries in the urban areas shows that women's wage employment is observed to bring about even a greater social change, as it promises a regular source of income. This change in wage employment brings more rapid changes than earnings in rural areas (Rahman 1994).

Moreover, most of these case studies on the impact of micro-credit for women empowerment have been undertaken for South Asia (mainly in Bangladesh), given the longer presence of micro-finance institutions here. The picture presents positive evidence as well as limitations of the program to bring changes in women status (Dubel, 2002). This may be because of the complex relation between social and gender norms in South Asian countries. The non-availability of sufficient quantitative data also limits the demonstration of the impact. Assessment of poverty, empowerment and inequity requires quantitative information as well as qualitative information. Given the dynamic and complex processes involved in social changes, monitoring over a long term is also required.

Mayoux, (1997) pointed out that provision of credit leads to the setting up or expansion of micro-enterprises which provide a range of potential impact on women. Some of these are: increasing women’s income level; and control over income. This leads to greater level of economic independence, access to networks and markets, wider information and vast experience of the outside world than within the home, possibilities for development of other social and political roles, enhancing perceptions of women’s contribution to household income and family welfare, increasing women’s participation in household decisions regarding expenditure on women’s welfare, more general improvement in attitudes towards women’s role within the household and in the community.

Finally, the role of gender in development is hard to understand without understanding the socio-economic and cultural background. The concept of empowerment is meaningful only within specific context. However, the degree of consensus on the conceptualization of empowerment is not readily apparent in any literature, because of the variation in terminology used therein. The literature contains a range of terms, concepts, and data that are relevant to assess “empowerment”. Various efforts have been made in recent years to develop comprehensive frameworks delineating the various

Considering such diversified dimensions of empowerment mentioned in these studies, the main objective of our study is to measure the extent of empowerment, given those various dimensions reflected in the literature. The study will also analyze the impact of credit and factors related to women’s own capabilities and socio-economic status of the households on empowerment, as well. The study first develops an analytical model to measure empowerment and after developing appropriate indices to measure empowerment, logistic model is analyzed to determine the impact of credit on empowerment.

The introduction (Section 1) of our study is followed by the analytical model which measures empowerment in Section 2. Section 3 discusses the factors influencing empowerment other than the credit and data employed for the assessment. Section 4 evolves the results of our findings, whereas the conclusion and some policy recommendations are presented in Section 5.

**Analytical Models to Measure Women Empowerment**

An important part of the process in generating an analytical model to measure women empowerment is to identify culturally appropriate indicators for it\(^1\). The choice demonstrates an important but complex process of combining quantitative and qualitative knowledge of a setting. It has always remained a matter of concern for measurement to identify appropriate measures of empowerment and other associated behavioral indicators. To accomplish this task, AERC (1998) data is used in combination with a theoretical model developed by an earlier qualitative research undertaken by Hashemi and Schuler (1993); to be called HM hereafter.

The qualitative research undertaken by HM identifies the dimensions of empowerment through in-depth interviews of credit participants for Bangladesh. The work of HM (1993) provided a starting place for the development of a theoretical model in measuring women empowerment, and identified six dimensions of empowerment based on activities pointed out by women as important aspects for their day-to-day functioning. Moreover, HM (1993) also discussed that these dimensions to be interrelated, pointing out that any change in one dimension would likely affect other dimensions, as well.

HM (1993) also argued that some dimensions of empowerment are conducive to quantitative measurement while others are not. Therefore, dimensions of empowerment should be modified for quantitative analysis based on the availability of appropriate measures. Although some dimensions are identified as theoretically important, but their
measurements prove to be problematic, specifically from the data of AERC (1998). Hence, out of these six dimensions of empowerment used by HM (1993), only four are being used by us in our present study. The detailed discussion on these four dimensions is given in the following section.

The first dimension used is “mobility”, which is limited to measure the extent of women’s mobility within or outside the village. HM (1993) argued that information related to women’s mobility can be elicited by asking questions about where they go, how often, and with whom they moved around. The AERC (1998) data includes a battery of questions regarding women going alone or with someone to various places such as hospital, bank, market, field and other’s houses. Within these questions it was desirable to measure general mobility and not place-specific mobility. Hence, these questions were again repeated by asking individuals whether they visited these places, outside the village. The coding of these indicators presumes that women going outside the village alone are the most empowered.

The second dimension used in our study is “economic security”. It includes ownership of property and/or other economic assets. The ownership of both productive and non-productive assets, as well as ownership of house, are considered for measuring this dimension, which HM assumes to be necessary for the provision of economic security to women.

The third dimension of women empowerment pertains to the “status and decision-making power within the household”. It includes decisions on allocation of resources within the household, control over money and purchases, and enhanced status in the family. According to Alam (2000), even small purchases for the household are usually done by men in rural areas. However, HM (1993) reported that the ability to make small purchases is common for women and thus not a meaningful measure of empowerment. Therefore, a distinction exists between the abilities of women to decide in making small and large purchases. To account for the possibility that making small and large purchases reflect different aspects of women’s power, two separate dimensions were again taken into consideration; viz. (i) the ability to make small purchases and (ii) the ability to make large purchases.

The fourth and final dimension used in our study is linked with the “participation of women in non-family groups.” This dimension includes participation in NGO programs, and in a forum for creating a sense of solidarity with other women, besides taking group actions. In rural areas women typically lack an identity outside their home, which reduces their emotional dependence on their families and, by building alternative support networks, increase their potential to assert themselves within the family, and as well as, in the community. The AERC (1998) asked questions about women’s group membership
and involvement in-group actions, but variations in these questions are too small to be useful. Very few women in the survey reported their participation in group actions. Since HM (1993) argued that this dimension is significant because it indicates women’s level of interaction with non-family members, another related variable is chosen. The AERC (1998) asked women whether they visited other homes, markets, banks, fields, and/or hospitals in other villages alone, and going out of the village is often assumed as visiting non-family members. Therefore, this is also considered as an appropriate measure of interaction with non-family members. In the model, this dimension is specified towards those women who go to other villages, and those women who visit to places outside the village alone, are considered as the most empowered.

The original theoretical model of women empowerment proposed by HM (1993) is thus transformed into the theoretical model with four dimensions of empowerment and reported as indicators of empowerment. The differences in the models stem from data constraints. The indicators are constructed as scale variables. The components are given proper weights. All of the operational measures of empowerment employed in this analysis reduce the empowerment data into dichotomous variables. The cutoff points for empowered versus underpowered is based on percentage distribution of each dimension. Each dimension attempts to separate those women who stand out as being relatively more empowered than others. The cut-off points for women empowerment indicators are made at around 25th to 50th percentile. Since in most cases, a one space downward move on the scale classifies more than half the respondents as empowered. Whereas one space upward move excludes most of the respondents. Hence, the decisions on the cut-off points are easily noted down.

The variables used to develop empowerment indicators are discussed below.

**Operational Measurement of Empowerment Indicators:**

Details of the four indicators: (i) decision making; (ii) mobility; (iii) ownership of assets; and (iv) self-confidence, which cover a wide range of attributes are comprehensively measured are mentioned below.

**i) Decision Making Index (DMI)**

DMI refers to the extent of women’s ability to make decisions regarding financial matters (making small and large purchases, as well), including purchases made for personal use (i.e. cosmetics and jewelry), in coordination with other family members. The small purchases include household items of daily use while large purchases refers to purchase of land and houses, etc. One point each is given for purchasing small items whereas two points each for purchasing large items. As far as decision regarding the purchase of jewelry and cosmetics is concerned, one point each is given again to the respondent having the power to make purchases
on her own. A respondent with a score of one or better is classified as empowered and coded as one.

ii) Mobility Index (MI)
MI refers to the physical mobility of women either alone or with others, within or outside the village. Considering degrees of mobility [allowed to move alone or with others] and issue concerning whether the mobility is restricted within or outside the village, different weights are assigned. First of all, one point each is given if the respondent is allowed to visit any of the following places within the village:
   i. Markets
   ii. Fields
   iii. Hospitals
   iv. Others’ houses

Then two points are assigned if the respondent is allowed to go to the banks within the village. Furthermore, a four point rating scale is used to measure the degrees of mobility. Four points are assigned for visiting each of these places alone, three points for visiting with children, two points for visiting with females and one point for visiting with male only. Additional two points is given if the respondent has visited these places outside village/near village. A respondent with a score of twenty or better is classified as empowered and coded as one.

iii) Ownership of assets/Economic Security Index: (ECSCI)
Three types of assets, comprising of different items are selected for the development of index regarding ownership of assets. These assets provide economic security to females and include:
   i. Productive assets – Livestock, Cash Saving and Land
   ii. Unproductive assets – Jewelry and household daily use items (radio, TV, etc)
   iii. Ownership of house. This item consider separately (not included in the unproductive assets) because ownership of house means women is far more empowered than those women who only own jewelry or household daily use items.

One point each is given if the respondent owns jewelry and items of daily use by the household. Two points are assigned if the respondent owns a house whereas three points are given if she owns any of the productive assets (livestock and land). Again, two extra points are given to the respondent who claims that they themselves own these assets and one point is further assigned to those who respond that they have some kind of joint ownership of these assets. However, females who stated that their family or spouse own these assets are considered to be economically underpowered and assigned the score of zero. A respondent with a score of three or better is classified as empowered and coded as one.
iv) **Self-Confidence Index (SCI)**

SCI refers to the extent of women’s ability to participate in non-family groups. This dimension includes participation in CBO’s, NGO and Bissi Committee programmes that involve group actions. Participation in such programmes creates sense of solidarity with other women. One point each is given to individual who participated in these groups. As discussed earlier it also includes visits to places alone within or outside the village as another indicator of women’s self-confidence. Hence, one more point is given, if they visited the places alone. The respondent is classified as empowered if she has a score of one or more.

v) **Cumulative Empowerment Index (CEI)**

A composite/cumulative index is calculated by summing up all the indicators. A woman is classified as empowered if she attains a score of two or more.

**Determinants of Empowerment**

Indices developed to compute cumulative empowerment index (CEI) are then used to carry out multivariate analysis by using logistic models, in order to measure the degree to which borrowing and other specific autonomous factors affect these indices and CEI. The Model includes other autonomous factors as determinants of women empowerment as well. Mizan (1994), while working on Grameen Bank’s participation concluded that credit places a significant impact on women's decision-making power after controlling for demographic factors and other household characteristics. The inclusion of some of these factors introduces the problem of endogeneity. For example, Basu (2006) argued that empowerment itself is endogenous. According to Basu (2006) the literature modeling the impact of intra-household balance of power on decision-making tends to ignore the opposite relation i.e., the effect of household decisions on balance of power. According to Roushdy and Namoro (2007), male and female decision-making power relatively depends on their individual and some common household or social characteristics, determined within the model.

Hou (2011) working on Pakistan Standard of Living Measurement Survey data, on the other hand, rejected the endogeneity assumption if the index is based on the women’s control over resources, contribution in decision-making process, social networking and basic human nature or conducts. Hou (2011) argued that bargaining power is often measured in the literature by the relative income of the male and female or by the ratio of number of years of schooling by female to male, on the assumption that women bringing more income or having a higher level of education have greater bargaining power. These two indicators are often endogenous because income and education are major determinants of budgetary share, as well. Following Hou (2011) view point, this study also considers the index constructed as exogenous.
Although a number of attempts were made in the formulation of the model based on the level of statistical significance, five models appeared to be more appropriate and within our scope. These models primarily involved fixed set of independent factors (along with borrowing either to generate economic activity or for consumption) regressed against the four indicators and a cumulative index of empowerment. Since all the indicators of empowerment computed reduce the empowerment indices into dichotomous variables as explained earlier, Logit Model is used to express any relationship between borrowing and indicators of empowerment. The specific model tested is based on the following function:

\[ EI_l = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \sum_{i=1}^{2} CRDT + \beta_1 \sum_{j=1}^{n} HHSP + \beta_1 \sum_{k=1}^{m} FMSP + \mu \]

Where:
- \( EI \) = Empowerment Indices (mobility, decision-making, economic security, self confidence and cumulative index).
- \( CRDT \) = Credit specific variables (credit for consumption and productive purpose).
- \( HHSP \) = Vector of Household level variables
- \( FMSP \) = Vector of female specific variables
- \( l \) = number of Indices, here 5 in number
- \( i \) = type of credit, here 2 in number
- \( j \) = Indicators of household characteristics, here 13 in number
- \( k \) = Indicators of Female characteristics, here 6 in number

Separate regressions are estimated for the four indices included in \( EI \). \( HHSP \) stand for the vector of household specific variables. Variables included herein are household socio-economic, cultural and occupational status, such as ownership of land, household income and its regional background. The literature also pointed out that female’s own characteristics (\( FSP \)), such as woman’s marital status, age and her contributions to household income, indicate important factors determining her empowerment (Goetz et al 1996, Hashemi et al 1996). As such these variables are included in the model as well. The detailed description of the variables included in the model is given in Table 3.

**Data Employed**

In order to analyze the empowerment reliance on quantitative structured surveys, rather than on qualitative participatory research methodologies, many limitations emerge consequently. Firstly, quantitative surveys are limited in number and secondly, quantitative surveys have often been conducted by micro-finance organizations to evaluate their programmes. Hence only their target areas or clients are covered in these surveys, particularly in case of Pakistan, these kinds of surveys are hard to locate and
deemed to be less useful. The only reliable and viable study taken into account from both qualitative as well as quantitative aspects of the programme, was undertaken in 1998. The study was commissioned by the State Bank of Pakistan and conducted on rural financial markets in Pakistan, as part of a series of studies by the AERC. To date, this is the largest study on the subject covering more than 6,000 households and 24,000 respondents and hence, assists us in empirical assessment. It uses the data collected by AERC (1998). Furthermore, considering the objective of this study data of individual female above 14 years of age is selected. Thus, the final data used for this study consists of 8,663 females covering 4,392 households.

**Empirical Analysis**

In the rural areas of Pakistan, traditions and restrictions imposed by the family often influence ability of women to take control of their own lives. However, from Table 4, it is evident that most of the females with provisions of credit are more empowered than females otherwise. According to the cumulative index of empowerment out of 1005 borrowers, 84% are empowered, whereas from among the non-borrowers, 74% females are empowered. It is also evident from the Table that except for self confidence and decision-making indices, other two indices and the cumulative index depict a significant impact of borrowing on empowerment. For example, index related to economic security shows that 71% of borrowers are empowered while for non-borrowers this percentage is only 53%, which further confirms the positive impact of credit on empowerment.

Although it is evident from Table 4 that credit did empowers women but this impact may vary with their age, education and socio-economic position within their household. Since it cannot be assumed that all women can participate and benefit from the micro-credit programmes, with the same degree or level, it was considered meaningful and viable to control the above stated factors in the model. This will assist us to gain full knowledge of the impact of credit on women empowerment. To analyze any possible association between empowerment and factors determining empowerment (including credit) simple averages are estimated.

**Association between Factor Affecting Empowerment and Empowerment Indices**

Table 5 presents the average values of empowerment indices by gender, amount of credit, female and household characteristics. It is evident from the Table that average values of empowerment indices increase with the raise in the amount of credit. Except for the amount of credit higher than 25000, average values of empowerment indices show increasing trend, which enhances the decision-making aspect of females. However, no affect on other indices is evident from the Table. The average values fluctuating from the
lowest amount of credit to the higher value of male credit are, of course, evinced in the Table.

Females between the age group of 31 to 60 years also appeared to have higher average values of empowerment indices, which traced out non-linear assumptions between age of females and empowerment (average values of empowerment indices increased with the increase in age up to 60 years and then declined). The education among females education was also seen to be positively associated with the average values of empowerment indices as reflected among females having education level higher than Intermediate.

Comparing average values across different marital statuses (married/widowed/divorced/separated) shows that except for decision making average values of empowerment indices are higher for them. Average values across age group of household head exhibited no particular pattern. However, average value of cumulative empowerment index was higher among the household head belonging in age group between 31-50 years. It was also very interesting to note that females belonging to same age groups also claim higher average values. No particular pattern is once again apparent for the education levels and employment status of household’s head.

Furthermore, farm size (a symbol of social norms and prestige) presents an interesting scenario. Females belonging to families having large land holding had greater say in decision making and were economically secure (as evident from the higher average values of indices) while on the other hand women belonging to families having land holding just subsistence to support the family needs have higher values of mobility and self-confidence indices. In cumulative empowerment index, females with subsistence land holding have higher average values of empowerment index. Finally, on exploring the effect of region (keeping aside the females residing in AJK), the study finds that the females belonging to rural Punjab have higher values of mobility and confidence indices while females from Sindh have greater say in decision-making and sustain greater economic security.

Logit Analysis

Keeping in view the association presented in above section, logit estimate of factors determining empowerment is analyzed. The empirical findings are presented in Table 6 and discussed below:

a) Credit

Results presented in Table 6 provide strong evidence of the positive effect of credit taken for productive/development purposes on women empowerment. The
results are consistent with the hypothesis that women participation in micro-credit programmes help in employment generation which bring autonomy, leading further to their empowerment. The phenomenon works in the following manner: credit enhances women participation in economic activities outside home that increased their financial contribution within the house. Their enhanced support to the family’s financial need brings self-respect to them and the family. This ultimately increases their role in decision-making, provides them greater access to financial and economic resources, and enhances their mobility, subsequently leading to recognition of self-worth and autonomy. Therefore, in the context of credit it can be concluded that it has increased autonomy of females not only within the household but also in the community and has increased their ability to take control of their own life. This might ultimately affect poverty and vulnerability among females in the long run. All component indicators show the same positive relationship. However, the affect of credit is not significant on decision-making power and on self-confidence.

As far as loan for consumption purposes is concerned, it affects the overall empowerment index significantly but on component indicator its affect is positive and significant only for mobility and in providing economic security. The possible reason behind the negative effect of consumption loan on female decision-making power and self-confidence increases in debt burden. The consumption loan often results in increase in debt burden on females that ultimately reduces their ability to work efficiently, which further increases their dependency and confidence. The literature also stresses that women who control their loans and invest efficiently for productive purposes have greater chance of being empowered, whereas women who hand over the loans to their husbands are less likely to be empowered. The same effect was expected for the consumption loan as it does not translate into capital formation. Although male credit has significantly enhanced the overall empowerment but negative effects on three of the indicators of empowerment are apparent widely. It negatively affects their say in the decision-making process, and their abilities in acquiring assets in their name, besides their interaction outside family.

As discussed earlier, the ability of a woman to transform her life through access to financial services depending on other factors as well, not only on the availability of credit. Some of these aspects are linked to her abilities and household characteristics while others are dependent upon social and cultural environment they live in.

The following discussion explores and provides detailed clarifications on some of these factors.
b) **Employment Status**
Females being employed had enhanced overall empowerment of women further confirming the hypothesis that employment had generated income leading to financial assistant to families which brought self worth for the females in the eyes of household members; hence had positive impact on empowerment. As far as household head occupation status (either self employed or employee) is concerned it was found out to be discouraging females overall empowerment. In the component indicators the affect was significant only for the mobility index.

c) **Marital Status**
Marital status also affects female empowerment. In the overall empowerment scenario unmarried female have lower probability of being empowered while married females do enjoy some forms of empowerment, but the affect was not significant on the overall empowerment.

d) **Age**
Female’s age have non-linear relationship with empowerment indices (as evident from the sign of the coefficient of age and age square). An increase in age first increases the probability of females being empowered reaches its maximum point and then decline (as evident from Table 5 that after 60 years of age, average values of empowerment indices decline). Women age between 30 to 60 years enjoy greater autonomy. For the overall empowerment index and mobility index positive coefficient of household head age and negative values of its square again shows the non-linear relationship between household head age and empowerment of females. The reason could be the cultural values that prevail in rural areas and often limit females to take control of their life in the presence of elders. Considering the component indicators separately, inverse relation appeared for the indices of decision-making power, assets keeping and for self-confidence index. The possible explanation could be that in presence of elders, free mobility of females is restricted but after a certain age women do gain some power to exercise it on other dimensions of life (power to decide and keep assets).

e) **Education**
The effect of female education on their empowerment indicates that education had improved their well being by providing them more economic security and improving their decision making power. However, its affect is insignificant on overall empowerment of females. As far as years of education of household head is concerned, this variable is found to have significant negative impact on overall empowerment of females. Considering the impact separately on individual indicators, result show that total years of schooling is positively and significantly influencing power to take decisions and keep assets by their name while for mobility and self confidence its influence was negative. The study concludes that
education brings some respect and self-worth for females to take decisions and keep assets but enhancing female mobility and self-confidence required changes in the patriarchal values embedded in the local traditions and culture that predetermined the social value for gender which restricted female’s mobility and their free interaction in groups.

f) **Regional/Cultural Variation**
The provincial dummies, representing cultural and regional values, also show significant barriers in the provision of empowerment to females. In such patriarchal society, women are often confined within the house rendering household work and taking care of children. They are restricted to undertake any economic activity and thus always live under the shadow of male who consider as the dominant member in the household and in community. In such situations, it was noteworthy that culture does not restrict females to keep assets by their names, because buildings or keeping assets by household by both members, was seen as enhancing social and economic status.

g) **Social Norms**
The effect of variables explaining social status of the household was overall insignificant. In the cumulative empowerment index the effect was negative for females belonging to household having large landholding while, for other categories its impact was positive. For individual indicators, females belonging to families having large land size were allowed to take decisions, keep assets in their names and allowed to interact freely with others in the village and outside, even alone (enhancing self-confidence among them). Females belonging to families having medium or small land holding were empowered in all the dimension of empowerment. Hence, our study concludes that these norms influence different dimensions of empowerment differently; i.e. If females belonging to families having different sizes of land holding are restricted in this dimension, they find a way to gain empowerment in other dimensions.

h) **Household Demographic Situation**
Although dependency ratio is found to be empowering females to take decisions and keep assets but self-confidence retards their capabilities to take control of their lives. An increase in this variable implies greater workload, reducing their ability to take employment opportunities outside home which in-turn impacts their autonomy. As evident from the literature that micro-Finance programmes have raised legitimate concerns about the potential negative impact that programme can have on women. Among such impact was the increase in workload. Due to involvement in income generating activities and the responsibilities within the household micro credit programmes often resulted in overwork for females which ultimately impacted their economic activities outside home, such as their
interaction in non family groups thus reduced their self-esteem and affected their confidence level. Moreover the proportion of adult women in the households, included in the model to assess the effect of household composition on the respondents ‘empowerment’ indicated that it had enhanced overall empowerment of females through promoting their free mobility and their ability to interact freely with others outside home but it was reducing the women ability to keep assets by their names and their say in decision making. Since the increase in the proportion of females or individuals (household size) in the house accumulation of assets and transformation of power to individual decline, may hamper their empowerment.

i) Household Economic Status
Although household per capita annual income promotes females to keep assets in their name, take decision and move freely, its influence on overall empowerment positively and significantly apparent, but will not enhance their self-confidence. Surprisingly, it is found to be reducing their ability to poise. The self-confidence index is based on female ability to interact freely with others and it is determined by the household’s economic status. It is rather dependent on women’s own potential that could be influenced by giving credit to generate employment (also evident from the positive significant coefficient of credit for productive purposes).

Conclusions and Discussions

Feminization of poverty is an economic problem and its importance in raising women’s economic productivity has been increasingly recognized as a crucial element in the design and implementation of development projects to create alternative strategies for reducing it. To achieve the goal, “Power” is assumed to be an essential element for women empowerment. However, power is referred to be the sense of internal strength, right to determine one’s choice of living, and the right to influence the direction of social change. In recent years, micro-financing and micro-credit for women’s small and micro-scale enterprises are viewed and discussed to be the most effective ways to promote and support women’s self-employment determinants that ultimately provides an effective and significant impact on women empowerment. This article evaluates the role of micro-credit in empowering women.

The analysis used survey data of rural financial market conducted by AERC in 1998 to measure the affect of credit on the four dimensions of empowerment besides working on a composite indicator of empowerment. It also addressed the issues related to female own characteristics, household characteristics and regional values which influence their empowerment. The study concludes that credit empowers women by strengthening their economic roles and eventually increasing their ability to contribute in support of their
family. It is also argued that there are certain other mechanisms that also assist to influence empowerment of women, like older age, female being employed, proportion of adult females in the house, male credit, per-capita annual income, along with age, education, occupational status of household head, and regional dummies.

One most important factor that hinders the enhancing empowerment is found to be ‘education’, although its role is assumed to have greater and effective significance in empowering women. Information dissemination, raising awareness, capacity building, and translation of skills into practice (all being the resulting outcome of education) are assumed to increase women’s economic options and promote their sense of worth in the family, locality and elsewhere. Basic literacy often helps women to acquire knowledge and skills for improving and developing their tasks in all the fields. Poor rural women lack such types of educational resources, which help in improving skills and enhancement of knowledge to use capital (credit) efficiently.

In addition to other factors mentioned above, credit is found to be an influential element to enhance female’s abilities to control assets and as well as in helping them to establish an identity outside the family. Such activities provide them due experience and wider self-confidence to move freely around, and take decisions regarding large and small purchases, along with purchases related to their personal and individual own self. On the whole, this study confirms the hypothesis that credit impact women empowerment positively.

End Notes

1. A theoretical framework based on in-depth knowledge of the culture and norms that define behavioral expectations for women must be developed before analysis can be performed.
2. In all the empowerment variables “not empowered” is coded as zero.

References


Alam, Nurul (2000). Women, Households, and Communities and Care of Sick Children in Rural Bangladesh, Faculty of Medicine, University of London, London.


### Table: 1
**Dimensions of empowerment proposed by selected authors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Dimensions of Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CIDA 1996</td>
<td>Legal empowerment&lt;br&gt;Political empowerment&lt;br&gt;Economic empowerment&lt;br&gt;Social empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jejeebhoy 1995</td>
<td>Knowledge autonomy&lt;br&gt;Decision-making autonomy&lt;br&gt;Physical autonomy&lt;br&gt;Emotional autonomy&lt;br&gt;Economic and Social autonomy and self-reliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kishor 2000a</td>
<td>Financial autonomy&lt;br&gt;Participation in the modern sector&lt;br&gt;Lifetime exposure to employment&lt;br&gt;Sharing of roles and decision-making&lt;br&gt;Family structure amenable to empowerment&lt;br&gt;Equality in marriage&lt;br&gt;(lack of) Devaluation of women&lt;br&gt;Women’s emancipation&lt;br&gt;Marital advantage&lt;br&gt;Marital advantage&lt;br&gt;Traditional marriage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hashemi et al. 1996</td>
<td>Mobility and visibility&lt;br&gt;Economic security&lt;br&gt;Status and decision-making power within the household&lt;br&gt;Ability to interact effectively in the public sphere&lt;br&gt;Participation in non family groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schuler et al. 1996</td>
<td>Mobility and visibility&lt;br&gt;Economic security&lt;br&gt;Status and decision-making power within the household&lt;br&gt;Ability to interact effectively in the public sphere&lt;br&gt;Participation in non family groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schuler et al. 1997</td>
<td>Mobility and visibility&lt;br&gt;Economic security&lt;br&gt;Status and decision-making power within the household&lt;br&gt;Ability to interact effectively in the public sphere&lt;br&gt;Participation in non family groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stromquist 1995</td>
<td>Cognitive: Psychological; Economic; Political</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Sen 1999</td>
<td>Absence of gender inequality in:&lt;br&gt;Mortality rates&lt;br&gt;Natality rates&lt;br&gt;Access to basic facilities such as schooling&lt;br&gt;Access to professional training and higher education&lt;br&gt;Employment&lt;br&gt;Property ownership&lt;br&gt;Household work and decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator of Empowerment (as dependent variable)</td>
<td>Intermediary variables used in calculating dependent variables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decision making</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Ability to make purchases of Jewelry.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Ability to make purchases of cosmetics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Ability to make purchases of physical assets related to daily life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Ability to purchase house</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Ability to purchase land</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Ability to make investment / savings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mobility (Nearby Village/Own Village)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Can go to Market</td>
<td>Alone With Children With Adult Female With Adult Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Can go to Bank</td>
<td>Alone With Children With Adult Female With Adult Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Can go to Hospital</td>
<td>Alone With Children With Adult Female With Adult Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Can go to field</td>
<td>Alone With Children With Adult Female With Adult Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) Can go to other houses</td>
<td>Alone With Children With Adult Female With Adult Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Security</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Own House</td>
<td>Self Spouse Family Joint Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. Own Livestock</td>
<td>Self Spouse Family Joint Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. Own Jewelry</td>
<td>Self Spouse Family Joint Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv. Own Household item</td>
<td>Self Spouse Family Joint Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self confidence</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participate in Bisi/Committee or NGO/CBO saving programs Ability to move freely within or outside the village alone.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3
Explanation of the variable used in the estimation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent Variable</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Empowerment Indicators (EI)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>MI</td>
<td>Mobility Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>DMI</td>
<td>Economic Decision Making Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>SCI</td>
<td>Self Confidence Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>ECSCI</td>
<td>Economic Security Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>CEI</td>
<td>Cumulative Empowerment Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Independent Variable</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Credit Specific (CRDT)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>LNPREC</td>
<td>Loan for productive/development purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>LNPREC</td>
<td>Loan for consumption purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Household Specific (HHSP)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>EDHOH</td>
<td>Number of years of education of head of the household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>AGEHH</td>
<td>Age of the household head in years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>DEPRAT</td>
<td>Member aged under 14 plus those over 65, divided by household size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>PADWHH</td>
<td>Proportion of females aged 15-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>TOTY</td>
<td>Household income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>DPUN</td>
<td>Dummy variable for Punjab province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>DBAL</td>
<td>Dummy variable for Balochistan province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>DSIND</td>
<td>Dummy variable for Sindh province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>DNWFP</td>
<td>Dummy variable for NWFP province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>DAJK</td>
<td>Dummy variable for AJK province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>DSEMP</td>
<td>If Household head is self employed equal to one otherwise zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>DEMPLE</td>
<td>If Household head is employee equal to one otherwise zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>DUNEMP</td>
<td>If Household head is currently unemployed equal to one otherwise zero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Female Specific (FSP)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>Age of women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>EDUC</td>
<td>Number of years of education of women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>EMP</td>
<td>Dummy variable, 1 if women is employed 0 if not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>FMAR</td>
<td>Dummy variable, 1 if women is married, 0 if not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>FSWD</td>
<td>Dummy variable, 1 if women is separated/divorced/widowed, 0 if not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>FSING</td>
<td>Dummy variable, 1 if women is single, 0 if not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cumulative Index</td>
<td>Decision-making Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non Borrowers</td>
<td>Borrowers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Empowered</td>
<td>1977</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25.8%</td>
<td>16.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowered</td>
<td>5681</td>
<td>844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>74.2%</td>
<td>84.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7658</td>
<td>1005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: % represents column percentage.
Source: Authors Estimation.
Table 5

Association between selected factors affecting empowerment and empowerment indices (Averages)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female Credit</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Borrowers</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>31.81</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LT 999</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>32.34</td>
<td>4.34</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>37.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001-5000</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>32.09</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>37.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001-10000</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>37.94</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>43.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10001-25000</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>41.15</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>46.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25001-hi</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>36.17</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>42.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Male Credit</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Borrowers</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>32.78</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>36.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LT 999</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>32.23</td>
<td>2.76</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>35.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001-5000</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>30.53</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>34.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001-10000</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>31.69</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>35.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10001-25000</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>32.05</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>35.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25001-50000</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>29.49</td>
<td>2.94</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>33.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50001-100000</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>27.86</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>31.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100001-150000</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>37.38</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>40.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150001-hi</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>28.41</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>33.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-20</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>29.07</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>31.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>30.67</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>34.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>33.40</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>38.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>34.86</td>
<td>3.51</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>39.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>36.54</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>40.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61-70</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>34.64</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>37.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71-80</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>32.12</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81-hi</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>25.96</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>28.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decision Making</td>
<td>Mobility</td>
<td>Economic Security</td>
<td>Self-confidence</td>
<td>Cumulative Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>31.89</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>31.50</td>
<td>2.56</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>34.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>31.99</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>34.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>32.88</td>
<td>1.96</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>35.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>32.38</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduation</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>39.47</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>43.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>38.14</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>44.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital Status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>29.82</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>31.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>32.44</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>36.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>38.61</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>41.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>32.60</td>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>35.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>32.91</td>
<td>1.68</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>35.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household Head age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-20</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>30.29</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>34.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>31.21</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>35.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>31.76</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>32.06</td>
<td>2.91</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>32.52</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>36.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61-70</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>32.82</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>36.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71-80</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>32.21</td>
<td>2.92</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>35.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81-hi</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>25.99</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>29.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household Head Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>31.75</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>35.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>32.43</td>
<td>2.76</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>36.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>33.50</td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>37.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>31.51</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>35.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>30.09</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>34.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduation</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>28.93</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>34.71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Impact of Micro-Credit on Women Empowerment: A Case Study of Rural Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Head Occupation</th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>32.60</td>
<td>3.79</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>37.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>32.55</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>35.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Employed</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>31.84</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>32.20</td>
<td>2.76</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>35.74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Income</th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LT 15000</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>33.86</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>37.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15000 - 30000</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>31.73</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>35.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30000 - 45000</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>31.57</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45000 - 60000</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>32.76</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>36.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60000 - 90000</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>31.93</td>
<td>2.89</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90000 - HI</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>31.46</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Provinces</th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>27.14</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>31.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>37.07</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>40.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>26.13</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>30.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>16.27</td>
<td>3.41</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>20.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJK</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>43.10</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>46.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Farm Size</th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Landless</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>32.15</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>35.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsistence</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>33.97</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>37.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>31.58</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>35.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>29.10</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>32.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>26.06</td>
<td>3.51</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>30.48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors Estimation.
Table – 6
Dependent variable: indices of empowerment
(if empower equal 1 otherwise 0)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-Confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.15 (0.37)</td>
<td>2.9 (4.92)*</td>
<td>-0.698 (-1.72)**</td>
<td>-4.09 (-5.34)*</td>
<td>2.37 (4.24)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credit</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productive Loan</td>
<td>0.02 (0.4)</td>
<td>0.23 (2.42)**</td>
<td>0.17 (2.62)**</td>
<td>0.11 (1.46)</td>
<td>0.257 (2.54)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumption Loan</td>
<td>-0.06 (-2.33)**</td>
<td>0.58 (1.62)**</td>
<td>0.13 (4.6)*</td>
<td>-0.14 (-2.97)**</td>
<td>0.104 (2.83)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Loan</td>
<td>-0.045 (-3.7)*</td>
<td>0.023 (1.5)</td>
<td>-0.055 (-4.24)*</td>
<td>-0.0028 (-0.14)</td>
<td>0.027 (1.78)***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female Characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.02 (2.89)**</td>
<td>0.05 (5.5)*</td>
<td>0.023 (2.82)**</td>
<td>0.11 (7.82)</td>
<td>0.055 (5.97)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Square</td>
<td>-0.0002 (-2.31)**</td>
<td>-0.001 (-5.2)*</td>
<td>-0.0004 (-3.9)*</td>
<td>-0.001 (-6.52)*</td>
<td>-0.001 (-5.78)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>0.041 (3.89)*</td>
<td>-0.022 (-1.7)***</td>
<td>0.035 (3.2)*</td>
<td>-0.003 (-0.18)</td>
<td>-0.018 (1.46)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>0.21 (4.06)</td>
<td>0.61 (9.62)*</td>
<td>0.26 (4.85)*</td>
<td>0.27 (3.14)</td>
<td>0.677 (10.85)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>0.228 (2.23)**</td>
<td>-0.23 (-1.7)***</td>
<td>0.794 (7.56)*</td>
<td>0.185 (1.14)</td>
<td>0.054 (0.42)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>0.227 (1.8)***</td>
<td>-0.40 (-2.5)**</td>
<td>-0.90 (-6.8)*</td>
<td>0.076 (0.36)</td>
<td>-0.388 (-2.5)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household Characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per-capita Income</td>
<td>1.97E-05 (6.09)*</td>
<td>6.80E-06 (2.966)***</td>
<td>1.44E-05 (4.66)*</td>
<td>-6.96E-06 (-1.54)</td>
<td>1.07E-05 (3.16)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Education</td>
<td>0.031 (5.25)*</td>
<td>-0.022 (-3.04)*</td>
<td>0.017 (2.799)**</td>
<td>0.039 (4.28)*</td>
<td>-0.012 (-1.707)***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Age</td>
<td>-0.012 (-1.48)</td>
<td>0.015 (1.41)</td>
<td>-0.013 (-1.48)</td>
<td>-0.028 (-2.016)**</td>
<td>0.0129 (1.258)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Age Square</td>
<td>0.00012 (1.49)</td>
<td>-0.0002 (-1.92)**</td>
<td>0.00015 (1.67)**</td>
<td>0.0002 (1.44)</td>
<td>-0.0002 (-1.68)***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Self Employed</td>
<td>0.114 (0.44)</td>
<td>-0.945 (-2.56)**</td>
<td>-0.17 (-0.65)</td>
<td>0.93 (1.53)</td>
<td>-1.743 (-2.14)**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head Employee</td>
<td>0.18 (0.68)</td>
<td>-0.71 (-1.9)</td>
<td>-0.2 (-0.46)</td>
<td>1.02 (1.68)**</td>
<td>-0.595 (-1.71)***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Impact of Micro-Credit on Women Empowerment: A Case Study of Rural Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decision Making</th>
<th>Mobility</th>
<th>Economic Security</th>
<th>Self-Confidence</th>
<th>Cumulative Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Large Land Size</td>
<td>0.572</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.177</td>
<td>0.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5.18)*</td>
<td>(-2.5)**</td>
<td>(1.5)</td>
<td>(1.8)**</td>
<td>(-1.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Land</td>
<td>0.0184</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2.67)**</td>
<td>(0.92)</td>
<td>(0.97)</td>
<td>(1.81)**</td>
<td>(0.267)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsistence Land</td>
<td>0.268</td>
<td>0.157</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3.77)*</td>
<td>(1.76)*</td>
<td>(0.74)</td>
<td>(0.75)</td>
<td>(1.123)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Land</td>
<td>-0.0395</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>-0.085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-0.64)</td>
<td>(2.10)**</td>
<td>(0.34)</td>
<td>(-0.8)</td>
<td>(1.236)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependency Ratio</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.016</td>
<td>0.096</td>
<td>-0.124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2.99)**</td>
<td>(0.40)</td>
<td>(2.9)**</td>
<td>(-2.39)**</td>
<td>(0.063)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Women Proportion</td>
<td>-1.44</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>-0.62</td>
<td>0.569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-0.90)</td>
<td>(2.72)**</td>
<td>(-3.63)*</td>
<td>(2.2)**</td>
<td>(1.79)*****</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>-1.04</td>
<td>-1.67</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>-0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-8.7)*</td>
<td>(-5.9)*</td>
<td>(1.56)</td>
<td>(-7.03)*</td>
<td>(-6.35)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>-0.912</td>
<td>-3.29</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>-1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-6.9)*</td>
<td>(-11.4)*</td>
<td>(5.41)*</td>
<td>(-8.62)*</td>
<td>(-11.3)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>-0.595</td>
<td>-2.94</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>-2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-4.68)*</td>
<td>(-10.25)*</td>
<td>(9.27)*</td>
<td>(-14.42)*</td>
<td>(-11.03)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>-1.543</td>
<td>-4.44</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>-1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-10.74)*</td>
<td>(-14.98)*</td>
<td>(8.199)*</td>
<td>(-8.85)*</td>
<td>(-15.7)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample</td>
<td>8663</td>
<td>8663</td>
<td>8663</td>
<td>8663</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Log Likelihood</td>
<td>-5706</td>
<td>-3829.99</td>
<td>-5193.2</td>
<td>-2604.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR statistics (25 df.)</td>
<td>519.3</td>
<td>1768.5</td>
<td>1534.2</td>
<td>600.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probability LR statistics</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Numbers in parenthesis are t-statistics.

*, ** and *** represents significant at 1%, 5% and 10% respectively.

Source: Authors estimation.

Ambreen Fatima is an Associate Professor in the Applied Economics Research Centre, University of Karachi.

Syed Faizan Iftikhar is an Assistant Professor in the Applied Economics Research Centre, University of Karachi.

Khurram Iftikhar is Lecturer in the Applied Economics Research Centre, University of Karachi.
Gender Differences In Modernization Of Leisure: Changing Trends In Sports And Recreation In Rural Punjab

Ayesha Farooq  
Department of Sociology  
Govt. College University Lahore

Khalil Ahmed  
Department of Sociology  
University of Punjab

Abstract

The main objective of present study is to measure changes in leisure activities of a rural community in the Punjab, Pakistan. Gender differences and changes in participation of sports are also assessed over a period of fifty years. The changes have been identified from 1960s through 2008 retrospectively. Data are taken from a larger sample survey covering various social institutions in the village. An interview schedule permitting multiple responses was developed to interview persons, age 55 + years. Out of 223 eligible persons, 109 respondents (54 males and 55 females) were systematically selected. Our findings are based on descriptive and trend analyses. It is found that watching television is a popular leisure activity in the village. Leisure activities such as folklores, visiting neighbors and smoking huqa disappeared during the last two decades. Traditional sports are almost replaced by modern ones such as cricket, football and badminton from 1990s and onwards. Girls have also started participating in outdoor games which used to be exclusively meant for boys.

Keywords: Gender Differences, Leisure Activities, Television, Sports, Rural Community.

تلخيص

زيت الظهر طالما كان جيدًا متغيرًا، خاصة في فنون هنالك وكان المركز مريرًا محمود فيه كحريمة حازلًا في النيابة. كتب 50 سنة من طول الفيديو في فترة الديك تEXPR تجربة مشاركًا مع التجهيزات كاستخدامها الديكية. هو يتبع فينا ماجي مع مراقبة بروسير فين. إعدادات التجهيزات للأنبياء من مروحة تنظيم نادي 2003، ككتب كناراً وдобاميل كانوا تغييرًا في الجنرالات. نادي 2003، ككتب كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إصدار الجرائد كخريجي. عادةً ما يكتب في كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إصدار الجرائد كخريجي. تأثيره في 2003، ككتب كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إصدار الجرائد كخريجي. تأثيره في 2003، ككتب كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريجي، ودورناه في إذاعة كناراً وDOBAMانتش. كان تحتفلاً بالدوامات كخريج...
Introduction

This paper intends to observe various leisure activities that used to prevail in a village of the Punjab (Pakistan) named Mohla. Participation of young girls and boys in various sports over the period of five decades is also covered. Leisure is an institution that has its own social dimensions. Gender, age, education, economic condition and availability of technological items make the difference in the utility of free time. Leisure activities provide us pleasure, enjoyment and mental relaxation generally during free time. Social aspects such as age and ethnicity determine the recreational activities (Katz-Gerro & Shavit, 1998). Leisure activities may also vary with gender, education, caste, occupational status and socio-cultural environment. Those who find less opportunity to socialize at work preferably spend their leisure time with friends and family (Wilson, 1980). According to his analysis, early family experiences also influence the recreational activities of adult members. Watching television, craft making, participation in social, political and community activities are examples of various types of leisure (Peterson, 1981).

Like all other limited resources, free time is also unequally distributed among the people of a society (Wilson, 1980). He finds that poor seems to have more free time than rich people. However, he mentions that free time increases with level of education because educated people know how to manage their time efficiently. Katz-Gerro (1999) has also found in his study that social aspects like education, gender, race, and class determine the types of leisure activities. For instance, a research suggests that single adults adopt leisure activities more for personal satisfaction (Kelly, 1975). Generally, interests of people vary greatly with age so are their involvement in various recreational activities. Age and gender are often observed significantly associated with physically active recreational activities (Laakso et al., 2008). It states that more young than old people and males than females participate in physically active leisure activities.

Review of Literature

Leisure is a relative concept that may vary in its subjective meanings. For instance, watching television and listening to music are leisure activities for some individuals. Others may enjoy playing different games, spending time with friends, travelling and doing meditation. Individual interpretation of leisure may vary on the basis of occupational and gender differences. For instance, gardening, playing sports, household
maintenance and reading might be leisure activities for some and work for others (Clark, Harvey & Shaw, 1990).

Messener & Blau (1987) have mentioned three macro perspectives that link leisure activities with social organization. First, such activities are expression of social integration. Second, leisure is an outlet of social discontent. Third, leisure promotes disorganization and at times aggression too. Deducing from these perspectives, leisure in a way, becomes an important aspect of social structure. Social context of leisure may provide varied definitions for different strata such as age group, gender and social class.

There are also variations in the leisure activities of urban and rural settings. Generally, there are more internationally recognized leisure activities in urban as compared to rural areas. Most of the rural communities lack entertainment facilities such as cinemas, public parks, society clubs etc. that are found in the cities. However, Kelly (1978) is of the view that leisure is more than sports, community programmes and use of special facilities for the purpose.

The growing influence of foreign media in Pakistan also has its advantages and disadvantages. Cable television and internet are accessible almost equally and easily to almost all segments of society whether rural or urban. Media, particularly cable network exposes us to various other cultures. Apparently, influence of Western and Indian culture is among the most prominent in Pakistan. Cultural impact not only includes the material aspects but also carries social influence. It can be observed in social norms, values, traditions and other non-material aspects of a society. For instance, media images of gender roles may have the ability to influence social attitudes towards cultural stereotypes of males and females. Media portrayal of social roles needs to be factual to some extent, so that people may relate to these gender images (Murphy, 1998).

Listening to radio, a common source for entertainment Skuse (2005), is getting replaced by television due to technological shift occurred over time. Television viewership is the highest among the non-working females, elderly person, children and poor people (Peterson, 1981). Watching television has increased over recent years though it has negative impact on social relationships and traditional values by encouraging individualism (Melvin, 1974). A study of the USA suggests that older people watch more television than younger ones due to isolation (Chayko, 1993). Computers also have influenced many aspects of human life including work, economy, information management and even leisure activities. Utility of technological item may vary in rural and urban settings. For instance, use of computers would be considerably high in cities whereas listening to radio or television viewership could be popular leisure activity in villages. Some studies have also focused on the transition of free time activities. Fischer (1994) has indicated three main types; firstly, organized pastime replacing spontaneous
activities. Secondly, commercial entertainment and sports substituting informal and active leisure. Third transition highlighted by Fischer is individual indulgences which are replacing collective recreation.

Social and cultural patterns are also reflected in the types of sports that are generally popular in a region. Besides leisure, sports is an important social institution through which culturally constructed gender roles are reinforced (Wesely & Gaarder, 2004). According to functional perspective, sports socialize young people by transferring them social values and norms (Hanson & Kraus, 1998). They state that participation in sports provides identification and also have group integration function. Conversely, they add that conflict perspective views sports as mechanism of reproducing gender differentiation by providing men more access to sports than women.

Men are generally involved in more aggressive and violent sports than women (Washington & Karen, 2001). Moreover, differences are also expected to be found in cultural specific gender perceptions for indoor and outdoor sports. In conservative societies women are mostly discouraged to participate in outdoor games (Wesely & Gaarder, 2004). Therefore, sports reflect many social patterns other than just a leisure activity (Leisberson, 1997). People of the Punjab are fond of many local traditional games including wrestling, horse riding, bull fighting, kabbadi, cock fights etc. (Quddus, 1989). Over the period of time, some of the traditional games might have lost popularity while some of these games are modified into modern form.

**Methodology**

The data of present study is derived from a larger probability sample survey which included various social structural aspects of the village. The extended survey covered various social institutions and changes there in over the period of fifty years. This paper assess patterns of leisure activities prevailing and changing over the decades also relevant reasons in a retrospective way. Perceptions of the villagers are observed to assess the general social trends in the given time periods.

**Sampling**

The village comprised of 350 households that was taken as sampling frame. The population included 2374 individuals. Since our focus was on changes that have occurred over the period of fifty years, the selected age of the respondents was 55+ years. This age group in particular was assumed to have observed changes over the period of time. Out of total village population, there were 223 eligible persons. Systematic sampling technique was used for the selection of the respondents. Every second household with respondent in eligible age group was selected which resulted in 109 successful interviews.
Data Collection

An interview schedule permitting multiple responses was constructed comprising of both open and closed ended questions to interview the respondents. Interview schedule was developed instead of questionnaires as majority was illiterate. The instrument was developed in English then translated in native language for interviewing the respondents. Since the responses are based on recollection of memories, we specified ten years as point in time for obtaining required information. It was expected to reduce the influence of any memory lapse. Moreover, questions were asked about general social patterns prevalent in various decades instead of specific events. This was assumed to have further enhanced the validity of the responses.

Changes in Leisure Activities

A general question is asked about leisure activities of the villagers over the decades. Proportions of the respondents stating various leisure activities of the villagers by time periods are shown in Table 1. It shows that about three-fourth of the people used to visit neighbors for chatting and sharing activities in their free time during the first two decades (1960s and 1970s). It declined significantly in 1990s and 2000 onwards (from about 28.0%).

Over two-third of them were also involved in various types of sports as part of their leisure activity in 1960s. Participation in sports substantially declined in 1970s. It started to rise gradually as a leisure activity afterwards. Perhaps, traditional rural sports declined drastically which are being replaced by modern sports such as cricket. Plausible reasons may include awareness of various sports such as cricket or football by watching television. In 2000 onwards, about one-fourth of the respondents state sports among the leisure activities of the villagers.

In 1960s, a significant proportion (about 60.0%) of persons used to listen to folklores for entertainment. Folklores are stories based on cultural myths, traditions and popular beliefs. In the villages, generally males get together for listening or watching (performed by artists of mobile theatres) these folktales. *Sussi Panu, Heer Ranjha* and *Saiful Maluk* are among the popular folklores of the region. Eglar (1960) studied some cultural aspects of the same village about five decades ago. She has also mentioned these folklores except *Sussi Pannu* that particularly, belong to the region (Gujrat) under study. Occasionally, folklores are lyrical recited by an individual in a poetic way. Villagers gather around the person and enjoy listening to it. Some of these folklores are also symbolic expressions showing the connection between man and God. Popularity of folklores appeared to decline in 1970s and 1980s. It almost vanished during the last two decades, probably due to availability of other sources of entertainment such as television, radio and computers.
Table: 1  
Percentages of the respondents stating leisure activities in the village by time periods, mohla 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visiting relatives/ neighbors</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>67.9</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td>27.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playing sports</td>
<td>69.7</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Folklores</td>
<td>59.7</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>25.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watching T.V</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>94.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watching Movies</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening Radio</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>26.6</td>
<td>25.7</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others(Smoking Huqa, Rest, Household work)</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>60.6</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Average No. of Responses | 2.7  | 2.2  | 2.2  | 2.0  | 2.1  |

* Multiple responses were permissible. Sum total of percentages may exceed 100.0

Our results show that doing household work and smoking huqa (traditional device for smoking) as a leisure activity declined during the recent past. These activities were stated by a substantial proportion (about 60.0%) during the first three decades. Generally, men used to sit together and chat over huqa in the evening at a central place in the village. On the other hand, women used to stitch clothes, make handicrafts and other household items in their free time. It declined drastically in 1990s and reduced to about seven percent in 2000 onwards. Technology provides us with more leisure time as most of the chores of earlier time periods are not replaced by modern and readymade items (Carlson et al., 1999). It may have resulted in due to decrease in informal social interaction among community members who used to get together regularly to share interesting activities.

Some of the villagers used to listen to radio as a leisure activity in 1960s. Listening to radio increased to about one-fourth in 1970s and 1980s. It then declined in 1990s and reduced to about nine percent in 2000 onwards. This trend indicates the effects of availability of television in the village. Watching television as a leisure activity emerged in 1970s. Plausible reason for this may be that there were no television sets in the village before 1970s. Increasing trend is observed in watching television for entertainment. Substantial increase is observed in watching television in 1990s. There were few televisions in 1990s (about 13.0%, Data not shown) and probably majority of the people get together to watch it (about 81.0%) due to homogeneity and close interpersonal relations. A study conducted in Pakistan also revealed that a reasonable proportion of people watch television but do not own (Miller, Kayani & Javed 1998). In 2000 onwards, overwhelming majority of the people prefer to watch television programmes during their free time (about 95.0%). It may
be due to the fact that significant increase in the possession of television in 2000 onwards (about 68.0% of the households, Data not shown).

Some people have radio but they prefer to watch television s over listening radio. There were rare cases of watching movies from 1960s through 1990s. It increased to about 17.0% in 2000 onwards. Use of computers started during 1990s in the village. About one-fourth of the respondents state that mostly young people use computers for watching movies, listening to music and chatting etc.

On the average, about three responses are given in 1960s that are reduced to about two responses in 1990s and onwards. Decreasing average number of responses shows that villagers have fewer leisure activities in the recent than the earlier decades. It can be inferred that in earlier decades people had strong social ties. Women and men used to get together in their respective groups in the afternoon or evening. It worked as a mechanism of problem sharing and discussing matters. It has significantly declined during the last two decades. It is replaced by watching television within the households during the latter decade. Interpersonal interaction at community level has declined significantly over the period of time. McBride (1998) also holds similar viewpoint that television is destroying social fabric and social capital by causing individualism. Social ethics are changing due to rapid change in technological items (Melvin, 1974).

Respondents are also asked about their own leisure activities at the time of survey in 2008. The proportions of respondents stating their leisure activities are shown in Table 2. A study conducted in Israel found that age and ethnicity affects lifestyle of the people including their recreational activities (Katz-Gerro & Shavit, 1998). As respondents for the present study belong to relatively older age group, differences are expectedly found in their leisure activities and those of the villagers (of all ages) in 2000 onwards. Majority of the village population belong to young age groups and for them, there are limited sources of entertainment in the village. Therefore, probably they watch more television as compared to older group.

Table 2 shows that about one-fourth of the respondents visit neighbors and relatives for chatting. Similarly, some of the respondents prefer to take rest in their free time. Old age of the respondents might be one of the major reasons. Surprisingly, a new response category emerged when asked from the respondents about their leisure activities, that is, worship. A sizable proportion of the respondents state that they draw pleasure from praying and meditation. It may be due to the fact that respondents belong to old age group.
More females than males offer prayers, meditate and recite Quran (holy book of Muslims) whenever they get time from other responsibilities. Generally, females are relatively more religious than males perhaps due to their restricted mobility. About one-fourth of the respondents also listen to radio during free time. Of those who have television, about two-third of the respondents watch it. Probably, elderly people are involved in limited activities and feel socially isolated at times. As a result, most likely they spend their free time by watching television in households. Findings of a study conducted in the USA also suggest that elderly people watch more television than young or middle aged group due to social isolation (Chayko, 1993). The present study supports these findings as our respondents belong to old age group and they generally have limited social activities.

More males than females watch television for entertainment. One of the reasons may be that generally televisions are placed in the guest room that is, particularly meant for men in the village. More males than females also smoke huqa as a leisure activity. Probably, women are generally discouraged to smoke in Pakistani culture. Participation in family activities and resting are among the leisure needs that separates work and leisure (Kabanoff, 1982). In the present study, a small proportion of the respondents (about 15.0%) also like to spend time with their grandchildren, look after their animals and do reading during their free time.

Types of Radio and Television Programmes

Respondents are asked about types of radio programmes they like to listen. Total number of the respondents is relatively small (26). However, Table 3 shows that of those who listen to radio, more males (over 90.0 %) than females (about 58.0%) listen to news. Plausible reason may be the interest of men in political matters and current affairs.
About one-half of males and females also listen to religious and informative programmes on radio. Half of the male respondents also prefer entertainment-based programmes such as songs etc. Over one-third of the females also listen to songs and music. On the average, 2.0 and 1.4 responses are given by male and female respondents respectively.

A question is also asked on types of television programmes that the respondents prefer to watch for entertainment. Total number of the respondents stating watching television is 58 (33 males and 25 females). Percentages of the respondents stating various types of television programmes by gender are shown in Table 4. Of males who watch television, majority watch news bulletins. However, a study conducted in Israel suggests that generally males are more inclined towards religious information (Katz-Gerro & Shavit, 1998). On the contrary, our results show that males are more interested in political and informative programmes than religious ones.
In the present study, over three-fourth of the females are found to watch religious programmes. Probably, females are more interested in religious. Abelman (1987) also finds that strong religious belief is associated with viewing of religious programmes. Miller and Stark (2002) have mentioned three theoretical explanations for gender differences and religious levels. These explanations given by them include: the way females are socialized make them more passive, traditional role of women as mother and family caretaker, and lack of social and economic power of women in most societies. These three factors are assumed to encourage high religiosity among females.

In a conservative village community such as ours, females are generally confined to their houses and have limited exposure. This may contribute to their stronger religious beliefs. Perhaps, it is one of the reasons for greater interest of females than males in watching religious programmes. Various programmes on television are stated to have different impact on people. These impacts vary with gender, age groups or social class. For example, dramas presenting crime and violence may have strong negative effect on males whereas news are more fear producing for females (Eschholz, Chiricos & Gertz, 2003). Our results show that political discussions and news are watched more by males than females. It may also reflect greater interest and involvement in political activities of men than women.

On the contrary, dramas are watched more by females than males (60.0 % and 36.4% respectively). Plausible reason may be that mostly dramas are based on domestic issues that may interest women more than men. It is found that more males than females are interested in watching sports programmes like cricket match etc.. Men generally participate more in outdoor activities like sports than women. This may explain the gender difference. Comedy programmes are almost equally watched by both the male and female respondents. Some males and females also watch fashion shows as part of their leisure activity.

**Impact of Television**

Information technology is generally believed to influence various aspects of social life. Technological innovations that affect social structure of a community are television, computers, mobile phone etc.. These may bring about changes in lifestyles, family relationships, gender roles and social values of the people.

The social impact is a relative term which is subjective in nature. It can be both positive and negative. Findings of our study show that television has become part of many households. To see the impact of watching television and its various programmes, a question is asked about its impact on various aspects of social life. Table 5 shows that a very high proportion (about 94.0%) state that television is changing the lifestyles of the people. Lifestyle may include learning new things (cooking, décor etc.), dressing, utility of items etc. People adopt many things as they are exposed to information through this medium.
Table: 5
Percentages of the respondents stating impact of television programmes on various social aspects, by gender, mohla 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Aspects</th>
<th>Respondents’ Gender</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifestyle</td>
<td>90.7</td>
<td>96.4</td>
<td>93.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Relationships</td>
<td>64.8</td>
<td>61.8</td>
<td>63.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Roles</td>
<td>53.7</td>
<td>61.8</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Values</td>
<td>77.8</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>78.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average No. of Responses</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Multiple responses were permissible. Sum total of percentages may exceed 100.0

About three-fourth of the respondents state that family relationships are changing due to television. In their view, interaction within the family members has declined which has negative influence on family relations. Over 50.0% also perceive that change is occurring in gender roles as young people are exposed to various programmes. Generally, dramas and movies show different dimensions of stereotypical gender images. This is probably influencing the traditional attitudes towards gender roles, particularly of females. Mostly young females wish to do various jobs such as teaching etc. Moreover, awareness of rights may also make young boys and girls question the traditional attitudes and existing value system.

The factors discussed so far may also contribute to the change in overall social values of the people in the village (about 79.0%). Respondents state that young boys and girls prefer to spend their free time in watching television rather than helping or sharing work with elders. As a result, mostly elders of the household may feel somewhat isolated and ignored. Therefore, television is considered to have more negative than positive influence on the lives of people.

Percentages of the respondents stating programmes perceived inappropriate and its reasons are shown in Table 6. These programmes include movies, dramas, advertisements, sports and fashion shows. Overwhelming majority (about 93.0%) disapprove movies perhaps due to vulgarity and indecent dressing. Higher proportion of males than females consider dramas and fashion shows inappropriate for watching with family members. Probably, such programmes interest females more than their male counterparts. Over 40.0% of both the genders state that advertisements are also not worth watching with family members. These may include advertisement on family planning, AIDS etc.. Over one-fourth of them also perceive some sports as inappropriate. These may refer to dresses in females sports such as swimming and tennis etc. of those who watch television, about three-fourth consider various programmes not worth watching with family members.
A vast majority (about 81.0%) mentions vulgarity among the reasons for perceiving various programmes inappropriate. Indecent dressing is another reason for not watching some programmes with family as stated by about one-third of the respondents. It may be due to religious (Islamic) and relatively conservative values of the community members. Particularly, females dressed up in Western or exposing dresses is generally discouraged by the cultural standards. Nearly one-fourth of them are also of the view that romantic dialogues in dramas or movies make them feel embarrassed if watching with family. Plausibly, it is due to the traditional value structure of the village.

Table: 6
Percentage of the respondents stating programmes considered inappropriate and its reasons, by gender, mohla 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inappropriate Programmes</th>
<th>Respondents’ Gender</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>47.1</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movies</td>
<td>95.8</td>
<td>88.2</td>
<td>92.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>47.1</td>
<td>43.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>26.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fashion Shows</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>70.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average No. of Responses</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reasons For Considering TV Programmes Inappropriate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vulgarity</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>88.2</td>
<td>80.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic Dialogue</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>24.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecent Dressing</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>35.3</td>
<td>34.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average No. of Responses</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Multiple responses were permissible. Sum total of percentages may exceed 100.0

Sports and Gender

Sports are not just considered leisure activities but also depict many of the social processes (Leisberson 1997). This institution also represents the cultural heritage and other social aspects of a region. Messener, Duncan & Jensen (1993) observe that not just the type of sport but its language also reflects social meanings, biases, stereotypes and inequities within a society. Sport is an important social institution through which social construction of masculinity and femininity is learned (Wesely & Gaarder 2004). On the individual level, participation in sports is found positively related with self esteem (Tracy & Erkut 2002).
Percentages of the respondents stating sports of boys by the time periods are shown in Table 7. Sports of boys include *kabbadi*, *gulli danda*, cricket, football etc. Most of these sports are outdoor in nature. The table shows *kabbadi* (a game played in the sub-continent) was the most popular sport of the boys (about 98.0%) in 1960s. A substantial proportion of boys used to play *kabaddi* till 1980s. Drastic decline in the game is observed in 1990s that reduced to about six percent in 2000 onwards. *Gulli danda* was another game played by majority of young boys in the village during the earlier decades. Over 80.0% of the respondents mention *gulli danda* during the first two decades. Proportion for *gulli danda* declined significantly in 1990s and further reduced to about 14.0% in 2000 onwards.

Over three-fourth of the boys used to play marbles during the first two decades. It declined to about two-third in 1980s. Playing marbles almost vanished during the last two decades. Cockfight and dogfight were among the sports stated by about one-third of the respondents from 1960s through 1980s. It reduced to about 20.0% in 2000 onwards. Cards and *ludoo* are indoor games that used to be played by some of the village boys.

**Table: 7**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Kabbadi</em></td>
<td>98.2</td>
<td>94.5</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Gulli danda</em></td>
<td>87.2</td>
<td>88.1</td>
<td>78.9</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cards</td>
<td>25.7</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td>29.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cricket</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>94.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Football</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>48.6</td>
<td>49.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ludoo</em></td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playing marbles*</td>
<td>78.0</td>
<td>77.1</td>
<td>65.1</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cock fight/ Dog fight</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td>33.0</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>20.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average No. of Responses</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.4</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.5</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.3</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Traditional games of the rural Punjab
**Multiple responses were permissible. Sum total of percentages may exceed 100.0

Overall, consistency is observed in playing cards among boys. Over one-fourth of the respondents stated playing cards during all the decades. *Ludoo* is also played by some boys in the village throughout the decades. Although it declined slightly in 1990s and afterwards but no significant change is observed in the trend. Due to lack of television, cricket was little known in the villages. As the use of television increased, it appears to have gained popularity. This might be a reason for a very small proportion of boys playing cricket during the first two decades. Substantial increase (about 92.0%) in playing cricket is observed in 1990s resulting in as the most favorite sports of young boys.
in 2000 onwards. There were negligible cases of football among the games during the first two decades. It started to increase afterwards. About one-half of the respondents state football in 2000 onwards. It is observed that there were few popular traditional games for boys such as kabbadi, gulli danda, playing marbles etc. during the first three decades. These sports appeared to be replaced by modern ones like cricket and football, mostly due to television.

On the average, about four responses are given in 1960s as compared to about two responses in 2000 onwards. Decreasing average number of responses is an indication that boys used to play more games previously than the latter period. Overall, the trends show that some traditional games of boys have almost vanished over the period of time. Cricket and football are among the popular games of boys during the latter decades in the village.

Washington & Karen (2001) state that men are generally involved in fast paced and violent sports whereas women are more into slow paced and less violent sports. Social and cultural stereotypes of gender also influence the participation in sports by males and females. Wesely & Gaarder (2004) find that females are traditionally discouraged to participate in sports and other outdoor activities.

In our study, respondents are asked about the sports of girls in the village by time periods. Table 8 shows that over one-half of the respondents state that girls do not play any game. Of those who acknowledge participation of girls in sports, about three-fourth of them mention stappoo, playing marbles and hide and seek from 1960s through 1980s. Most of these games played by girls are indoor in nature. Proportions for these games declined moderately in 1990s onwards and remain at the level of over 50.0% in 2000 onwards. Skipping is also among the games played by over one-third during the first three decades. It reduced to about 17.0% in 2000 onwards.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ludoo*</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>48.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skipping</td>
<td>34.6</td>
<td>34.6</td>
<td>34.6</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>17.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stappoo*</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>53.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hide &amp; Seek/ Playing Marbles</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>73.1</td>
<td>57.7</td>
<td>55.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badminton</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average No. of Responses</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Traditional games of the rural Punjab
** Multiple responses were permissible. Sum total of percentages may exceed 100.0
*** Only those respondents were asked about types of sports who stated that young girls play games in the village.
There was a very small proportion of the respondents stating playing *ludoo* by girls during the first two decades. It appears to increase steadily during the following decades. Slightly less than half of the girls play *ludoo* in 2000 onwards. A very small proportion of girls started playing badminton in 1990s. It increased to about one-fourth in 2000 onwards. It may be due to separate school for girls in the village that provides facilities for modern sports.

Messener, Duncan, & Jensen (1993) state that increased number of females participation in various sports is associated with the change in the attitudes. In the present study, we also find that girls started participating in outdoor games that used to be considered a taboo previously. It is observed that games such as *stappoo* and playing marbles are declining whereas playing *ludoo* and badminton are increasing. Expectedly, boys participate in more outdoor games whereas girls have fewer options and that are mostly indoor in nature.

**Discussion**

Our study shows that visiting neighbors or other community members was the most favorite free time activity in 1960s. Participation in sports, listening to folklore, smoking *huqa* and household work were also popular leisure activities during this period. These activities significantly got reduced in 1990s and onwards. Simultaneously, watching television increased substantially during the last two decades. Peterson (1981) also observes in a study of the USA that television is a prime source of news and information. Media industry and information technology got expanded during the political regime of President Musharraf (2000 onwards). Use of computers also appears to have emerged as a leisure activity during this period. There are certain other activities through which respondents draw pleasure including worship, resting and playing with grandchildren. An Australian research conducted by Kabanoff (1982) also suggests that family related work and taking rest are among the leisure activities. Global influences through media can be observed from communities in different parts of the world inclusive of the one under study.

People are observed to have a wider range of leisure activities as compared to the earlier time periods. The trend shows, technology, particularly television have significant impact on the change. Informal social activities such as visiting neighbors and getting together for smoking *huqa* have faded away over the period of time. In the recent past, watching television has become the most popular means of entertainment. It partially becomes a disintegrative factor for the family members as perceived by the villagers. Economic factors are also responsible for bringing about the change in leisure activities due to affordability of such technological items. A study conducted by Farooq & Kayani (2012) suggests changes in economic structure of the village. Perhaps, better financial conditions
and availability of technological items influenced this change. Global influence, particularly through media and migration is influencing the group ties and unity. Leisure activities of the people have also changed from more collectivist (socializing, chatting over smoking huqa in a group, visiting neighbors) to individualized (watching television) ones. Similarly, modern sports are replacing their traditional forms. For example, cricket has taken the place of gulli danda. Participation of girls in sports appears to be a new phenomenon in the village. It can be well associated with influence of media and their enrollment in formal educational institutions (games in schools etc).

Trend analyses of sports of boys and girls show that gender differences prevail in the village. A study conducted in Pennsylvania by Kreager (2007) reveals that gender inequalities are reinforced in displays of aggression, independence and competition by men participating in various sports. We also found that traditional sports such as kabaddi, gulli danda and playing marbles were among the popular games of boys during the first three decades (from 1960s through 1980s). These games declined substantially during the latter period. It can be derived from the comparative analysis from the East and the West that certain aspects of traditional and modern societies are similar to each other. Modern sports such as cricket and football increased significantly in 1990s and onwards. Perhaps media, particularly television, played role in the promotion of these sports among boys during the last decade. Buysse and Embser-Herbert (2004) also conclude that media preserves male domination through presenting superiority of men in certain sports. Probably, it is one of the reasons that male participation in physically active outdoor sports is much more than that of females in the village.

A study of the USA by Wesely and Gaarder (2004) show that females are generally not encouraged to participate in outdoor games in conservative societies. Our results confirm their findings that young boys participate more in outdoor sports whereas females participate more in indoor ones. Girls used to play indoor games including marbles, stappoo, skipping, hide and seek during the first three decades. Significant decline is observed in these games in 1990s and onwards. On the other hand, ludoo and badminton increased during this period.

Modernization has its influence on various social aspects such as education, family and technology, it also becomes a source of strain in traditional structures (Divale and Seda 2001). The gap might produce disturbance in the system which used to be functional in the distant past. Analysis of Pakistani society by Qadeer (2006) suggests the imbalance in the system due to gap between material and non-material culture, particularly, when the former is developing at the expense of the latter one. Melvin (1974) states one such example of television as having negative impact on family relations and traditional values. It is confirmed by our findings of changes in family system and leisure activities.
It is a general observation that television has reduced social interaction and integration which is considered negative, particularly by the elderly members of the village.

**Conclusions**

Trends show that leisure activities of the villagers have changed over the period of time. It shows that visiting community members, playing sports, smoking *huqa* and doing household work were popular leisure activities during the earlier decades. These activities are replaced by watching television during the last two decades. News and religious programmes are favorites for those who listen to radio or watch television. Popular games of boys were *kabbadi*, *gulli danda* and playing marbles during the first three decades. These games are replaced by cricket and football during the last two decades. Girls used to play marbles, *stappoo*, skipping, hide and seek during the earlier decades. Decline in these games with simultaneous increase in *ludoo* and badminton is observed over the period of time.

Keeping in view the above trend, it is expected that in future, popular leisure activities will include watching television, using computers etc. Impersonal means of communication and entertainment will likely replace the social interaction among the villagers. People will rely more on technology such as computers and mobile phones than family or community members for social networking. Less social interaction and interdependence among the family and community members may become the norm. Trend analysis of participation in sports of boys suggests that traditional sports such as *kabbadi* and *gulli danda* will be likely replaced with the modern ones such as cricket and football in near future. Girls will participate more in outdoor sports than indoor in following years.

**References**


---

Dr. Ayesha Farooq is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology, Govt. College University Lahore.

Dr. Khalil Ahmed is an Associate Professor in the Department of Sociology, University of Punjab.
Representation Of Muslim Women In E-Media Caricatures

Azka Khan
&Sarwat Rasul
Department of English
Fatima Jinnah Women University

Abstract

This paper attempts to gain an understanding of the ways in which Muslim women are presented on the E-media in the broader world community by identifying and examining the linguistic and visual signifiers used in the caricatures. The sample selected for the current research work consists of 22 caricatures disseminated on the World Wide Web between years 2012 - 2013. From a theoretical perspective, the socio-cognitive approach to CDA introduced by Van Dijk (1992, 1993, 2000, 2012) on communication of ethnic biases and racial prejudices is combined with the visual semiotic model by Roland Barth (1978). The two approaches are merged to examine linguistic and visual aspects of caricatures for identifying signs which construct certain identities of Muslim women. This paper argues that in the collected caricatures the identity of Muslim women is constructed as distant and different from the (Western) social norm. The iconic images or visual identifiers used, function to transfer all the biased imagery and prejudice about Muslim women to the actual situation. Thus they serve the purpose to authenticate the stereotypical identity. This paper claims that the social caricatures collected, depict racial and ethnic prejudices against Muslim women.

Keywords: Muslim Women, E-Media, Caricatures.
Introduction and Literature Review of the Current Research

The groundbreaking work by Edward Said - *Orientalism* (1979) - increased an interest in the construction of Muslim identity. This included newspapers, film industry, personal blogs and academic books. The recent research works in the domain of identity construction have mainly focused on film industry, Shaheen (2003) print media (Akbarzadeh & Smith 2005) fictional and non-fictional writings (Ridouani, 2011) etc.

Neo-Orientalism and Identity of Muslim Women

Alloula (1986) demonstrate the effects of the French colonization of Algeria, (1830-1962) through postcards of Algerian women produced and circulated in France. The Algerian Muslim women were portrayed as an evidence of backward, exotic and strange customs of Algeria. Most of the women shown were victims of war, prostitutes or orphans who were asked to pose for the camera but the postcards portrayed as if the camera is capturing a real moment of everyday life. Aloula (1986) claims that these photos carry no names and the impersonal captions such as “Women from the south” and “Women from Algiers” project an image of the Oriental women with common names like “The beautiful Fatima”. This study exposes the practice of conceptualizing and reinforcing an image of erotic Muslim women.

Bullock (2002) suggests that after World War II, orientalism took a new shape and has transformed into neo-orientalism. The western world analyzed the non-Western world with the assumption of the inherent superiority of Western culture considering it a pre requisite for progress. This resulted in suggestions that in order to progress, the under developed or third world countries need to evolve into Western style institutions. Bullock (2002) suggests that the mainstream Western electronic and print media rely and propagate this belief which is at times used to establish a case against Islam (Bullock 2002).

Politics of Veil

nor oppressed by the presence or absence of the veil but by the presence or absence of economic, political, and family rights both on national and international levels. Rashid (2013) uses the title “Veiled Threats” for exploring the stereotypical notions attached to veil. She argues that the trope of ‘the Muslim woman’ must be deconstructed and individual differences must be understood.

Bullock (2002) suggests that West has at least three different notions attached to the Muslim veil. The crudest and most unsophisticated view of the veil emerging out of an unconscious adherence to liberalism and modernization theory is held by people of the mainstream and pop culture who consider veil a symbol of Muslim women’s complete subjugation by Muslim men. Another comparatively convoluted view is held by the people who are usually more knowledgeable about Islamic history. This group is also concerned about the Muslim women’s rights but their majority does not listen attentively to the voices of the veiled women or do not find Muslim women’s arguments persuasive. The result is their continued belief that even a satisfying life in the veil is an oppressed life. The third school of western thought consists of the anthropologists and historians who listen to the marginalized voices of covered women. Their subject demands to understand veil as a social practice but their methodological approach helps them reach a different conclusion from that of the mainstream Western liberal thinking. This group generally blames Muslim society believing that the social upbringing of the Muslim women is responsible for the continued veiling practices.

E-Media Caricatures as a Powerful Weapon

Since the sample of this article consists of selected caricatures, it would be appropriate to discuss the medium of caricatures that is used for the construction of the identity of Muslim women. The term has its roots in the Italian word “caricare” (Encyclopaedia Britannica). A caricature is an impressionistic drawing made to create humorous effects and consists of exaggerated prominent physical characteristics (Walker, 2003). The graphic satire in caricatures can also deal with a group by incorporating characteristics of the group as the subject of a caricature.

Midalia (1999) debates that caricatures are usually not innocent and neutral reflections of the reality and involve an intentional interpretation of it. The message they convey is absorbed easily owing to the seemingly innocent humor. Walker (2003) argues that this humorous intervention in the construction of a caricature leads to shaping the public opinion. Oz (2014) argues that caricatures are contextualized activities which consists of exaggerated forms of conceptual metaphors, symbols and illusions. The concretization of these concepts is vital enough and even does not need objectivity or truthfulness.
Bisson (2014) explores the heavier side of the caricatures and claims that at times the political cartoons not only evoke anger but also offend, either intellectually or accidentally. Bisson’s conclusion demands serious attention that some of the political cartoons not only become hate speech, they also incite violence. She quotes, a radical cartoonist, Art Young who said, “To have a life as a cartoonist of the kind whose pictures “never hurt’ is my idea of futility” (Dewey n.d. as cited in Bisson, 2014, p.68).

Problem Statement and Significance of the Research

In today’s world ideologies are created, maintained and exploited to practice the relations of power and dominance. The media is covering Muslim women not only in news articles and works of fiction but they are also portrayed in cartoons and caricatures in a negative way. Owing to the commonsensical nature of caricatures, these discriminatory discourses have a stronger impact. They function to legitimize the ideological discrimination tacitly. In this context the current research is an effort to deconstruct the stigmatized representation of Muslim women by identifying the representational strategies used in the art of caricaturing.

Aim of the Current Research

The general aim of this research is to gain an understanding of the ways in which the E-media presents and shapes the identity of Muslim women in the broader world community. This includes identifying different semiotic signifiers and examining linguistic devices used in the selected caricatures.

Research Questions

The current research is guided by the following questions:

- What images of Muslim women are most frequently represented in the E-media; and how certain identities related to them are being created in E-media caricatures?
- What socio-semiotic symbols are used in the collected caricatures to construct the Muslim women identity; and how do these semiotic symbols relate to the accompanying linguistic expressions?

Sampling Strategy for the Current Research

For the current research non-probability purposive sampling strategy is used which involves selecting cases with a specific purpose in mind (Neumann, 1992). The sample caricatures for the current research work are collected with the main aim to explore the representation of Muslim Women. The selection of caricatures is not systematically
controlled per artist or per news websites. A general search on the Google Images search engine is carried out by using the following key words:

- Muslim woman caricatures/cartoons
- Pardah caricature
- Burqa caricatures
- Muslim woman images
- Islam phobic caricatures

A conscious effort is made to keep the statements neutral in their connotation but to find out whether there are “unsupportive” or “negative” imagery dispersed on the World Wide Web, another “counter search” is also carried out with these keywords.

- Funny Muslim woman caricatures
- Ridiculing Muslim Women through caricatures

The change in keywords had no effect on the results. At a third research level, the terms “Muslim women images” is used and the word “caricatures” is omitted. The word caricature in itself carries a negative connotation as it is a visual satire. The consistency in the search results implied that similar caricatures related to Muslim women identity are widely used on different blogs and websites. The collected sample is further filtered for the presence of at least one linguistic statement. Finally only those caricatures are included which are disseminated on the E-media in the two year time from January 2012 – December 2013.

**Theoretical Framework**

Since the sample consists of caricatures and accompanying linguistic items, an in-depth analysis demanded that Socio-cognitive approach to CDA by Van Dijk (1991, 1992, 2012) is merged with the semiotic analysis of Roland Barthe (1978).

1) **Semiotic Model and Tools**

Barthe’s model utilizes two orders of signification for deriving meaning from the images. The first order of signification or the denotative meaning is the literal or descriptive meaning apparent to every skimmer of the caricatures. The second order of signification or the connotative meaning is derived when the first order of signification is inserted into the value system of that culture.

2) **Cognitive Dimensions of Social Attitudes By Van Dijk**

Van Dijk’s socio-cognitive approach (SCA) (1987, 1992, 2012) to CDA is based on the assumption that biases are communicated because of the prejudiced social attitudes of the
in-group members about the members of out-group. He explains that prejudice is something more than negative ethnic attitudes of in-group members. (1987, P.181) Communication of prejudiced ideas cannot be simply described as a "mental state;" rather it involves flexible strategies. These flexible strategies function at different cognitive levels of the speaker or writer which are called social information processing by Van Dijk. These strategies not only involve just "what" people think about the Other, but it also involves "how" they do so” (Van Dijk, 1987, p.182).

Strategies for Communicating Biased Attitudes as Given by Van Dijk

i. Social Categorization
Expression of biased discourse involves perception of real or imagined differences between the in-group and the out-group. It is termed as the Social Categorization by Van Dijk. These differences between groups may range from differences of origin, nationality, ethnicity, race, language, gender, class, occupation, status, education, or appearance. etc. (Van Dijk 1987, p.196).

ii. Negative Evaluation
The next strategic step, negative evaluations are a logical result of social categorization. SCA suggests that the in-group assumes that a specific out-group possess properties which are incompatible with those of their own, they will definitely be evaluated negatively.

iii. Empirical "Bias"
The third step explained by Van Dijk, is development and expression of empirical bias about the other. This bias may have its roots in individual perceptions and experiences but ends in generalized models and attitude about the oppressed group. Based on these theoretical underpinnings, analytical categories for the current research are devised.

Analytical Categories Devised for the Current Research

Two analytical categories have emerged out of the collected sample of the Muslim women caricatures which have been divided into following sub-categories:

1. Muslim Woman’s Appearance
   1.a Muslim woman as a Stooge
   1.b Muslim woman as Cuckold
2. Muslim Woman’s Social Role
   2.a Muslim Woman as Oppressed and Ignorant
   2.b Muslim Woman as a Social Recluse
1. Muslim Woman’s Appearance

It is observed that the distinctive dressing practices of Muslim women is a favorite topic of discussion for the caricaturists. Twelve caricatures are found directly involved in the identity construction of Muslim women on the basis of her appearance. Veil and hijab as the most frequent iconic representation of a Muslim woman appeared in all the caricatures collected for this study and thus it seems reasonable here to explain what is meant by the word *hijab*. The word *hijab* comes from the Arabic word “*hajaba*” which means to hide or conceal from view. Muslims live in diverse cultures and civilizations, so the dress of a Muslim woman usually carries the expression of their local customs expressed through the terms including Hijab, Chador, Nikaab/ Niqab, Burqa, Jilbab etc. It is found that all the caricatures included in this section make fun of the dressing of the Muslim women but they differ in two ways. In six caricatures the target of ridicule is the practice of veiling. No other issue of significant importance is discussed in these whereas in the rest of the caricatures the Muslim woman is represented as lustful and unfaithful. Based on these two basic differences the caricatures have been arranged under the following headings:

1.a Muslim woman as a Stooge
1.b Muslim woman as Cuckold

1.a Muslim Woman as a Stooge

The caricatures included in this section (fig1-7) make fun of the Muslim woman’s appearance and the target of ridicule remains burqa, hijab or veil. Two caricatures are discussed as exemplars of the 7 caricatures included in this section. Fig 2 is one such caricature in which four human figures are visible. A burqa clad woman is shown standing in front of three other male human figures. The linguistic item in the speech bubble tells the viewer about her inability to understand the reaction of common people to her burqa. The speech bubble carries the statement, “I don’t understand why people react to me with fear and suspicion.”(Fig 2) The humorous nature of the intended message of the artist may be understood by cautiously examining the appearance of human figures present in the cartoon. After observing carefully the viewer realizes that the burqa clad women is standing in front of a small group of hooligans, scoundrels and rogues. Two of them are holding dangerous weapons in their hands, an axe and a revolver. These unreliable people have covered their faces and they are not identifiable. The underhandedness in this caricature is nullifying the objection made by the women in burqa. The question posed by woman becomes meaningless when her appearance is compared with the human figures in front of her. She should realize it that by covering her face completely she is standing in the category of suspicious people of society. She should expect to be treated with the same feelings of suspicions and mistrust which are found in
the society for the scoundrels. The third human figure has got a specific historical background. The costume confirms a person from an organization called Klu Klux Klan. This organization was originally founded as a social club in Tennessee in 1865; however, later on it was blamed for involvement in political and social terrorism.

The presupposition working in this type of caricatures is that the choice of dressing must be in accordance with the demands of the society. If someone chooses to follow one’s personal choices which are unacceptable to the society, one should be ready to face undesirable consequences. Thus the burqa clad woman should not be amazed or irritated by the suspicion which she arouses because of her appearance. Such racist discourses serve the purpose of normalization and naturalization of the bias. They make the discriminating attitudes appear natural. Instead of raising voice against discrimination, they serve the purpose of silencing the marginalized voices.

Fig 4 belongs to the category which is termed as multi-phasic picture by Sonesson (1988). The caricature consists of three panels arranged in a chronological order. This arrangement helps the reader to develop a minimal narrative statement which shows spatial and temporal relationship between these panels. The first panel has two burqa clad women and serves the purpose of engaging the skimmer. The subsequent panel is arranged immediately after the first one without leaving the “gutter” between the panels. This decidedly builds up the curiosity of the reader but the message is still not clear. The second panel shows the amplified and blown up image of the woman in burqa in the background. This exaggerated figure keeps the reader wondering but the mystery is not solved until the skimmer observes the third panel. The third panel carries a speech bubble in which the word “gesundheit” can be read. This term demands explanation.
The word gesundheit (German origin) is one of the sneezing etiquettes. We are accustomed to hearing “bless you” in English but in Germany it is more polite to say gesundheit (Upton, 2012). It is surprising that the caricaturist did not use the Arabic phrase “Alhamdolillah” which is more common in the Muslim countries. This word consists of two words, “gesund” which means “health” whereas the suffix “heit” which means “hood” (Merriam-Webster's dictionary, 2003). The word gesundheit literally means “healthy hood”. The image can be now analyzed for its temporal and spatial relations of the panels as a humorous story. The temporal relation of these panels is of immediate succession. This implies that the initial position of the second panel comes immediately after the final position of the first panel. This temporal arrangement leaves no room for the mediate or delayed succession which is suggested by the absence of gutter too (Hébert, 2006).

A relation of unilateral dependence can be easily traced between burqa and the Muslim women. It is also suggested that this relation is unidirectional. This implies that the presence of a burqa presupposes the presence of a Muslim woman (since women of no other religion use this dress), but the presence of a Muslim woman does not presuppose the presence of a burqa (since there are many Muslim women who do not use this sort of robe for covering). The linguistic item written in a speech bubble has a pointed line in the direction of the Muslim woman placed in the foreground. It is easy for the skimmer to realize the cartoonist’s take on this issue. It presents the Muslim women as a stooge. The purpose of this temporal set is nothing but making fun of the practice of wearing burqa. Even the linguistic item used to conceptualize the message is ironical in the situation. The appropriate sneezing etiquettes for this scheme should be Alhamdolillah. Instead of this common practice, a queer term gesundheit is used. The phenomenon may be explained by borrowing terms from Sonesson (1988) who called such a scheme monkey business because of the disconfirmed expectancies in pictorial schemes (p.40). This means that the
skimmer does not expect the woman shown in the caricature to use this German etiquette of sneezing.

Figures 1, 5, and 7 (See appendix) also ridicule the Muslim woman by changing her into an unidentifiable object whereas fig 3 shows a car which is wrapped in a burqa. The language accompanying this figure not only points out the condition of Muslim women in Iran but also makes fun of the veiling practices of Muslim women (See appendix).

1.b Muslim Woman as Cuckold

Kahf (2010) suggests that the image of Muslim women has changed in the recent Western representations from "odalisque" to "termagant". She suggests that representing Muslim women as submissive and oppressed has under gone a change as some of the European writers have started portraying Muslim woman as a forceful queen of wanton who intimidates sexuality. The interesting thing about Politics of Muslim women oppression is that if a Muslim woman expresses her own desire to cover herself and chooses to use veil, the expected (and oft repeated) answer of the western scholars is quoted here in Kahf’s words,

*The classic Western and secular Muslim feminist answer to this sort of thing is condescending: women who aren’t bothered by veiling just don’t know any better, and one day, with guidance and continued freedom, they will be enlightened and stop veiling”* (p.34, 2010)

Sample of the current research contains five caricatures that address the issue of burqa from a different angle: the concept of veil as an embodiment of modesty is a myth and veiled Muslim women are using it as a disguise to hide their lustful desires and waiting for the right moment to throw it away.

FIG 7

"I'm quite pleased with your new appearance. Now you are finally behaving like a proper woman!"
Fig 7 is a visual manifestation of Muslim woman as a termagant. A long bearded man is standing in the middle of the image, pointing his figure to a burqa. His loose robe along with a traditional Muslim headdress helps his identification as a Muslim man. His widely open mouth and protruding big eyes make him appear as an unpleasant personality. The setting shows an inside home scene and the relationship appears to be of a husband and wife. He has uttered the statement written underneath. “I’m quite pleased with your new appearance. Now you are finally behaving like a proper woman!” The incongruity of the situation becomes clear to the skimmer by two things. One is the fact that the man is talking to a burqa standing erect on a wooden stand. This can be realized after observing the image carefully. The second thing which helps to realize the irony of situation is the image of a woman in a very brief bathing suit tiptoeing at the backdrop. She is holding a suitcase and appears to escape without telling her husband. The presence of the suitcase indicates that the stay would be overnight. Thus she is an embodiment of a cuckold woman who is unfaithful to her husband. Figs 8 to 12 (See appendix) suggest that Muslim women are trying to escape the strictness of Islamic rules.

2. Muslim Woman’s Social Role

Majumdar (2009) had explored the processes that rendered Muslim women invisible in the social and political context of Bengal by tracing the past histories. Before her Jarmakani (2008), and Alloula (1986) have made similar proposition regarding role of Muslim women in different eras and area. The appropriateness of traditional clothing, particularly the head covering worn by some Muslim women, has been the focus of recent fierce media debates. In the debate over hijab, Muslim women are portrayed as veiled victims by the Western media in two ways: either as victims in need of liberation or as dupes who lack free choices. These two different representations helped in dividing the data into two sub-categories:

2.a Muslim Woman as Oppressed and Ignorant
2.b Muslim Woman as a Social Recluse

Both these categories are discussed below along with the sample caricatures.

2.a Muslim Woman as Oppressed and Ignorant

This section contains five caricatures portraying the idea that the practice of Muslim woman covering herself up is not her choice.
The idea presented in the five caricatures included in this section is that the Muslim woman is in need of help which generates the idea that foreign invasion is something inevitable and desirable. Muslim woman in burqa is used as a representative of humans clearly in need of “assistance”. These images reinforce the belief that the religion Islam justifies oppressive cultural practices against women and reduces not only their status, freedom, ability to work, opportunity for proper education, facilities of healthcare but also the ability to exercise political rights.

A cursory glance at Figure 13, may not help the viewer realize that there is a woman in burqa placed in the middle of a heap of garbage bags. Through this unheeded appearance of the woman in burqa a very powerful and obvious statement is made about the Muslim society. The image under discussion illustrates two contradictory objects: a human being, presumably a Muslim woman clad in a burqa, and loads of bags of garbage. The placement of these two objects as well as the similarity of color implies that both are analogous. This placement of a Muslim woman in the midst of ‘trash’ gathers significance as the word *trash* is defined in the Word Web dictionary as: 1. “Worthless material that is to be disposed of”; 2. “Worthless people”; and 3. “statements or beliefs that are untrue or make no sense”.

Thus Muslim women are equated to worthless or discarded material or objects. The lens used to view them is highly biased and prejudiced which serves to perpetuate the stereotype of the helpless, worthless, subjugated, devoid of intellectual activity, and
voiceless Muslim woman. More importantly, her image in burqa intends to make the viewer believe that her liberation is necessarily related to removal of her burka. It is also worth noticing that if she was not wearing a burka, then the linguistic statement “oppressed women are easily overlooked,” would no longer be valid for all the Muslim women only. The burka is receiving an inordinate amount of attention at the expense of other more important issues of health, education etc. The same idea is reiterated in Fig 15.

This caricature, which is yet another physical manifestation of an oppressed Muslim woman, shows a lone figure clad in “Chador” facing the viewer (Fig15). Two hands are shown behind the bars holding the bar tightly inside veil depicting powerlessness of a Muslim woman. The whole concept of chador is associated with that of a prison by making bars instead of a face. A callout “HELP” in capital letters is a cry for help. The ellipses show that the Muslim woman has much more to say but is silenced by the social pressures. The caption is reinforcing the overall message. The generalized statement “Woman in Islam” is meant for all Muslim women. The signified and signifier mutually reinforce the message received by the viewer. The strong contrast of black and white background is not without purpose. Black is always associated with oppression and horror. Instead of a face, inside of veil is shown black. No facial identity is given to this iconic representation of Muslim women, thus emphasizing their dehumanized image.
2.b Muslim Woman as a Social Recluse

The identity creation of Muslim women as a social recluse is an outcome of a serious misconception about Islam and the Muslim society. In contrast to the Western idea of equality of sexes, Islam emphasizes the natural differences in their creation leading to the realization of different roles for both the sexes.

Fig 18 shows a woman covered in a black attire with only her eyes and hands visible. The caption reinforces the ideas suggested by Alloula (1986) that the name “Fatima” is a general name used for all the Muslim women. Here the cartoonist is mocking a Muslim woman dressed like a bat woman by saying that her veil has deprived her of all the social opportunities. The only option available to her in a fancy-dress show is to dress like a bat man and cover her face under a mask. Fig 9 is a reiteration of the same views in a different way whereas Fig 19 shows a burqa clad woman searching for something in a shopping area. The caption underneath is “COSMETIC AISLE OXYMORON All She Needs is some Eye Shadow” (Fig 19). The intended message is that due to veil and hijab
most of the makeup accessories are useless for her. All she needs is an eye shadow to make her eyes look beautiful. Thus, she is presented as a social recluse who has very limited opportunities of participation in social life.

**Conclusions**

The representation of Muslim women in the sample caricatures serves the purpose to authenticate the stereotypical identity of an oppressed and secluded set of women. The iconic images function to transfer the biased imagery and prejudice about Muslim women to the actual situation. They base their arguments on physical appearances so for instance Burqa is often ridiculed as a sign of aberrancy in these caricatures. Muslim women are presented not only as half-witted but also as cuckold and wayward. Representations in these caricatures gather significance because the mass audience of the West which has little interaction with real life situations of Muslims considers this subjective and biased conceptualization of Muslim women as objective and authentic. This paper claims that these caricatures operate as a rhetorical tool to construct a fabricated view of Muslim women as stooge, cuckold, oppressed, ignorant and a social recluse.

**References**


APPENDIX

1. Muslim Women’s Appearance
1.1 Muslim woman as a Stooge

FIG 1
http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/

FIG 2
http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/
FIG 3
http://dr1.com/forums/clown-bin/133560-car-muslim-women.html

FIG 4

FIG 5
http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/
Representation of Muslim Women in E-Media Cartoons

**FIG 6**
http://www.cartoonstock.com/directory/i islamic.asp

**FIG 7**
http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/
1.2 Muslim Woman as Cuckold

![Cartoon](http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/)

**FIG 8**

![Cartoon](http://www.cartoonstock.com/directory/i/islamic_beliefs.asp)

**FIG 9**
FIG 10
http://dr1.com/forums/clown-bin/133560-car-muslim-women.html

FIG 11
http://funnymuslimcomedy.blogspot.com/2012
2 Muslim Woman’s Social Role
2.1 Muslim Women as Oppressed and Ignorant

FIG 12
http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/

FIG 13
http://freethoughtblogs.com/taslima/2012/06/03/we-have-enough-muhammad-cartoons-why-not-some-burqa-cartoons/
FIG 14
http://www.cartoonstock.com/directory/i/islamic.asp

FIG 15
FIG 16
Republished in 2012
http://www.patheos.com/blogs/mmw/2012/01/how-are-muslim-women-doing-in-political-
http://irishislamicstudiesstudentblog.wordpress.com/2013/06/13/symbolism-of-the-
veil-in-islam/http://thesocietypages.org/socimages/2012/02/22/questioning-definitions-
of-freedom/

FIG 17
http://www.funny-joke-pictures.com/2013/09/funny-muslim-adam-even-garden-
eden.html
2.2 Muslim Woman as a Social Recluse

**FIG 18**

**FIG 19**
http://dr1.com/forums/clown-bin/133560-car-muslim-women.html
Azka Khan is Lecturer in the Department of English, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi.

Dr. Sarwet Rasul is Chairperson and Associate Professor in the Department of English, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi.
SAARC Female Prime Ministers Policies For Women Empowerment In Their Region

Hussan Ara Magsi  
Department of Political Science  
University of Baluchistan

Faraz Ahmed Wajidi  
National Bank of Pakistan

Abstract

This article aims to assess the perceptions and practical steps of All female Prime Ministers of SAARC Countries (Benazir Bhutto, Indra Gandhi, Sheikh Hasina Wajid, Begum Khalida Zia and Sirimavo Bandranaike etc), had taken for the betterment of women in their respective countries etc. The socio-economic and geographical approach will be applied in this research paper to gauge to progressive measures introduced by the female prime ministers of SAARC countries. The female prime ministers rose to such a high position due to dynastical family background. These female prime ministers are symbol of female empowerment and representation, and they are gender sensitive and gender conscious to promote the womenfolk in every walk of life. All of them had worked in the areas: health, education, and economic, political representation, control the violence etc. The mirror is placed among the SAARC female prime ministers that how they wore the gender lens to prove themselves as a dynamic leader and also worked by rejecting the orthodox traditions in a patriarchal society to empower their women in their regions. They had signed different international instruments i.e. CEDAW (Convention regarding the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women) 1979, Beijing Declaration 1995, in order to transform their national policies according to the principles of these documents. They were highly aware that SAARC region is less gender sensitive, and had taken various steps to promote the womenfolk in every walk of life. They had accepted all the national and international challenges to tread upon the path of modernization and progressiveness and to bring at par their women with men. Their progressive policies laid far-reaching imprints upon the sand of SAARC soil that they realized that nation cannot progress until and unless our women are supported to participate in national building activities.

Keywords: Women Empowerment, Modern World, Gender Policies, Female Prime Ministers.
Introduction

The female Prime Ministers of SAARC region are the icon of female empowerment not only in their own region, but they also introduced policies regarding the empowerment of women in their respective countries. The geographical socio-economic approach will be applied in this research paper to analyze those practical policies which these female five prime ministers of their respective region introduced for womenfolk in different framework. All SAARC prime Ministers were conscious that in patriarchal society, the women’s position is subordinate, and they are still confined within the four walls of the houses to fulfill their domestic responsibilities. These female SAARC prime ministers are gender conscious, gender blind and gender sensitive and realized the miserable plight of women. They transformed their policies according to the international instruments and UN charter and Human rights Declaration of 1948, CEDAW 1979 and Beijing Declaration 1995. They tried to improve the women’s status in various sectors: health, education, economics, politics, and social mobilization and tried to provide the constitutional safeguards. They did legislation to curb all social evils which are discriminating between men and women and are source of exploitation of women in oriental culture. They realized that women enjoy subordinate position in male dominated society and are the victim of cruel clutches of customs. They addressed the issues of women trafficking, harassment, domestic violence, gang rape, forcible marriages, kidnapping, abduction, bride burning and dowry. Their far-reaching policies laid down the ineffaceable imprints on the sand of SAARC soil.
Literature Review

Amirta Basu, explores in book “Women empowerment, social mobilization and politics in Asia”, published by Research Institute established by UN for Social Development, in research work about female prime ministers of SAARC countries. There is a close relationship between political parties and social movements in order to organize women to participate in the party politics. Political Parties have increasingly directed their appeals at particular group, including women by addressing their distinctive interests and identities and by having women organize electoral campaigns. There is a strong relationship between women’s leadership and women’s representation in political parties. From Srimavo Bandaranaike to Chandrika Kumaratunga, Khaleda Zia, Sheikh Hasina, Indra Gandhi and Benazir Bhutto, South Asia has had the largest number of female head of any region in the world (Basu, 1999).

Benazir Bhutto Progressive Policies

Nuzhat Wafa (1988) signifies “Benazir Bhutto dynamic leadership and women empowerment, Benazir Bhutto (Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto daughter) became the first female Prime minister of Pakistan, and the first woman elected to head a Muslim country. During her election campaign, she voiced concerns over social issues of women, health and discrimination against women. She also announced plans to set up women’s police stations, courts and women’s development banks. She also promised to repeal controversial Hudood laws that curtailed the rights of women However, during her two incomplete terms in office (1988–90 and 1993–96), Benazir Bhutto did not propose any legislation to improve welfare services for women. She was not able to repeal a single one of Zia-ul-Haq's Islamisation laws. By virtue of the eighth constitutional amendment imposed by Zia-ul-Haq, these laws were protected both from ordinary legislative modification and from judicial review. The First Women Bank Ltd. (FWBL) was established in 1989 to address women's financial needs. FWBL, a nationalized commercial bank, was given the role of a development finance institution, as well as of a social welfare organization. It operates 38 real-time online branches across the country, managed and run by women. MWD provided a credit line of Rs. 48 million to FWBL to finance small-scale credit schemes for disadvantaged women. The Social Action Programme launched in 1992/93 aimed at reducing gender disparities by improving women's access to social services (Bhola, 1995).

Significance of Research Study

This research is of immense value that it is extracted from Ph.D. thesis “Female Prime Ministers of SAARC: A Critical Study”. The world is very much concerned regarding women empowerment and gender issues. The concept of female leadership is emerging
in the world. The global changes are effecting national and local boundaries. The constitutions of the countries aim to protect the weaker sections of society: women, children and minorities. The SAARC female Prime Ministers have proved themselves as best administrators, leaders and Chief Executives. These female Prime Ministers introduced progressive policies of womenfolk by realizing and understanding their problems. Their policies were fruitful and laid positive impacts on women’s life. They were aware that it is not easy to play a role as woman in our culture. In most of SAARC Countries customs dominates on law and religion. The women have to break the cruel clutches of male-dominated society. The certain areas: Education, health, political mobilization and economic empowerment are neglected areas for women. They not only did legislation and brought improvement in different areas, but also opened new avenues for women.

**Objectives of Research and Research Questions**

1. To explore the role of female Prime Ministers of SAARC countries as highly concerned about women empowerment in their particular regions.
2. To assess and analyze that what practical steps and measures have been taken by these SAARC female Prime Ministers in their respective countries for the women’s progress in different sectors.
3. To find out those challenges that the SAARC female Prime Ministers overcame by turning revolutionary by breaking the orthodox traditions and social values to protect womenfolk through legislative policies in their respective countries.

The study addresses the following research questions:

**QNO.1**: What legislation has been done by these SAARC female Prime Ministers for the betterment and protection of womenfolk in their respective countries?

**QNO.2**: The womenfolk consists of more than half of the population of the country, they realized that their contribution is essential for nation-building activities.

**QNO.3**: What type of progressive policies have been introduced by these SAARC female Prime Ministers for betterment of women in every walk of life.

**Methodology**

In this research paper the descriptive research methodology is applied to understand the geographical and socio-economic approach of the female prime ministers. The different Prime Ministers belonging from the different regions by keeping in to consideration their socio-cultural values and prevalent economic condition tried to promoted women empowerment in their countries. Although SAARC Region is one, but every country’s geographical, economic, political and social features are poles apart.
Data Collection

The data for research paper is collected from different sources. This paper is extracted from Ph.D. thesis “The Female Prime Ministers of SAARC: A Critical Study.” The other sources are different books, magazines, newspapers and speeches of these prime ministers on television, which are analyzed in this research paper. The autobiographies of these female Prime Ministers are the great source to express their vision about gender issues in their respective countries.

(a)  Benazir’s Bhutto: Her Perception and Policies for Women Empowerment

Benazir Bhutto was called as “gender conscious leader. She was very much concerned about the empowerment of women of Pakistan. She showed her concern for women’s social and health issues. She established first Women Bank and first women police station in order to facilitate women for getting micro-credit scheme and lodging FIR (First Information Report) for occurred crimes. She fought against the black law of Hudood Ordinance 1979, and demanded to scrap out it. She fought against the honour killing that women of Pakistan is subject to brutal murder. She introduced the computer literacy programme because of highly of significance of IT (Information Technology).” She opened forty (40) women computer centers to equip them with the computer skill. Benazir Bhutto addressed the Women’s committee that the men and women ratio is in term of population is 48:52. The future prosperity of Pakistan lies in the equivalent participation of women in various fields. Islam has given very unique position to women by giving them ample rights. Women’s progress fully coincides with Quranic Injunctions” (Wafa, 2000).

Benazir Bhutto was symbol of empowerment in modern world. Her presence as a political leader in a patriarchal society appeared both as a paradoxes and as denotative of a psychological revolution, where she represented democracy to the people of Pakistan and appeared to reverse the masculinisation of public space brought about the military regimes. She always endeavored to empower women in every walk of life. On International Women’s Day, she had always the mission and vision to ensure equality in all walk of life to enable women to play them due role in economic development of country. There are lot of challenges involved in the pursuit of gender equity and women’s emancipation. She said that the International Women’s Day fully realizes that women of the past proud, the women of present inspired and the women of the future envisioned. This day affords a unique and global opportunity to reassess our national strategies to inspire our women to channelize their energies in their struggle for equal rights. The male and female ratio in population is about 52:48%. The Pakistani government is embarked upon the policy to bring at par to women with men. She placed importance on social issues, health and discrimination against women (Skard, 2014).
I put my maximum efforts to topple down military dictator and restoring democracy in Pakistan. We are switching towards competitive market. I want to empower women by introducing micro-credit scheme for them. I addressed issue of domestic violence against women.

She wanted to wipe out gender discrimination in society by giving women an equivalent position. She faced multiple changes to introduce modern changes by rejecting the stereotype trends in the society. Her policies were beacon of light for the coming generation.

Benazir Bhutto stressed to promote gender equality, female literacy, narrowing down of gender gap, special protection for girl child, and safe motherhood programme in order to reduce the mortality rate. She attended the UN International Conference on Cairo on Population and Development held in September, 1994. She discussed the issues of family planning, high mother’s mortality rate, genital mutilation, abortion and health issues related to mother in her own country. The plan of action adopted in Cairo Conference are included in the Millennium Development Goals of United Nations. She participated in the Beijing Conference 1995 and also highlighted the problems of womenfolk in her country. She also signed the Beijing Declaration in order to transform her policies for the betterment of womenfolk.

She was the member of the council of women world leaders. She proved herself at par with other female leaders to work for the womenfolk’s betterment in her country. Benazir Bhutto said:

“Pakistan social fabric differs from other countries. My life is full of difficulties but I feel successful that I had broken the chains of old tradition by proving herself as a first female Prime Minister of Muslim world. The election results proved that woman can be elected as chief executive of the country. She is accepted as a leader of nation. I am highly thankful to people of Pakistan” (Bhutto, 1988).

Benazir Bhutto confronted lot of opposition on the part of ulamas and Islamic scholars that woman cannot become the head of the Islamic state. Often quoted Hadis is that Holy Prophet said “A nation cannot prosper, when women become the head of the Islamic polity” (Sahih Bukhari). She defended herself that Islamic history is throbbing with the numerous examples i.e. Hazrat Khadija was a businesswomen and Hazrat Ayesha was an eminent scholars, and she said Allah has given her such a supreme position.

(b) Indra Gandhi: Her Policies For Women’s Empowerment

Indra Gandhi as a women leader was highly concerned regarding the plight of women in India. Females are victim of poverty, subordinate position and exploitation in the Indian
Hussan Ara Magsi, Faraz Ahmed Wajidi


society. The gender discrimination is very common in India. There are lot of socio-economic and cultural problems the Indian women is still facing. She as a female prime minister wanted to uplift the status of women in every walk of life. The dowry, bride burning, domestic violence, women trafficking, harassment and poverty are common problems of Indian women. Prime Minister Indra Gandhi said women should upon the post for it she is best fitted. She justified her position as a prime minister of the India. There is no discrimination exists in the Indian constitution. She said:

“I don, t think as a woman in regard to this task. If a woman has the necessary qualifications for whatever profession, she should be allowed to work in that profession…I am not a feminist; I am a human being. I don, t think of myself as a woman when I do my job. According to the Indian Constitution, all citizens are equal, without distinction regarding sex, language or state. I am just an Indian citizen and the first servant of the country, deshvika” (Aroge, 2011).

“The Indian constitution provides equal status to both men and women. The article, under right to equality, states: "Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any special provision for women and children" (Aroge, 2011). The directive principles of policy states that: The State shall, in particular, direct its policy towards securing— (a) that the citizens, men and women equally, have the right to an adequate means of livelihood.

Indra Gandhi adopted the humanistic or feminist view about the role of men and women in society. She was highly aware about the fact that our women have to perform double duties as compared to man. The women life is tougher as compared to man in India.

“We don, t want to be regarded as separate species. We are human beings. All we say is to treat us as normal human beings. There is no doubt that woman faces far greater resistance in coming up or tackling any job than a man would. It is to their credit that they have been able to overcome this resistance. In India as well as in developing countries as a whole, this has been achieved by and large with harmony and without any confrontation .Women do have to work much harder and longer. Many roles are expected from them-responsibility for running their homes in addition to whatever they do professionally …both men and women are conditioned by man-oriented society. The women tend to accept the norms which men have made. They talk of equality but they really do not examine it closely. Women in India, in theory at least, always occupied an honoured position” (Kagzi, 2001).

Indra Gandhi said that old traditions and cultural values are preserved by women. She should accept the new changes of modern world .She should be dynamic to prepare her
role according to fast moving events. She is source of linkage between ancient and modern changes.

Indira Gandhi introduced a maternal friendly programme under the title Conditional Maternity Benefits (CBM), and Indira Gandhi Matritva Sahyog Yojana (IGMSY) for the sake of improvement of health standards of women. This scheme includes the cash incentives for the expecting mothers to improve their nutrition and health in order to produce the healthy generation. This scheme was implemented on October, 2010 in 53 districts in India. The major objective was that due to the element of poverty the womenfolk cannot get the proper nourishment, and due to which the health of mother and child gets effected. The women was given the amount through the Bank Accounts and Post Office Accounts when they were really found deserving according to survey report. This schemes was for those mothers who have attained the age of nineteen (19) and for two live births, because the element of family planning was also kept in to consideration. The scheme was federally controlled scheme and element of transparency was kept in to consideration.

Sheikh Hasina Wajid Policies for Women’s Empowerment

Prime minister Sheikh Hasina Wajid played a pivotal role in empowering women in different sectors i.e. Education, economic fields, politics, vocational skills and computer literacy. She addressed the social issues of women confronted in Bangladesh such as harassment, women trafficking, violence, malnutrition, poverty and backwardness.

“She realized that Bangladeshi women is subject to domestic violence. She worked a lot for the controlling the domestic violence against women and children. The only laws are not sufficient to provide security to women against violence. The Bangladeshi women commit suicide after being raped and acid-throwing incident. A large numbers of women are abducted, trafficked and subjected to violence” (Gandhi, 1984).

She did legislation for the empowerment of women and enhancing women seats in Local Body System and Parliament. A large number of women contested the elections of Local Body System and were allocated the seats in local body system. Today, Bangladeshi women is occupying the key position as a Chief Executive, leader of opposition and speaker. As a woman politician she assured the organizers of the conference of working together in building women's leadership and for their empowerment in Asia (Waqas, 2004). She gave the highest attention towards the education of girls and also enhanced the budgetary allocation for girl’s education. Her efforts were highly appreciated for the cause of girls by NGO, s and International Organization.
Sheikh Hasina Wajid introduced the laws favoring female equality in property and inheritance rights for women in Bangladesh. The Islamic parties have fully protested that women should get the equivalent share in the property, which is repugnant to the Islamic and Quranic Injunctions.

Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina Wajid wanted the participation of women in the broad spectrum at national, provincial and state level. The increasing participation of women in political sphere, policy making and decision-making will improve the legislative process and enable the state to achieve the desired goal of high progress.

The priority of our government is to develop such an agenda for the betterment of women health, education and employment. Sheikh Hasina Wajid said the vision of the father of Bangladesh “Sonar Bangla” cannot be materialized without the involvement of women in all walks of life. The women leadership will bring to limelight all the challenges and problems confronted to women and can represent them on political forum.

She declared national Developmental Policy in these words, “We stand up for political and socio-economic empowerment of our rural women to ensure their access to food, services, resources, and reduce their poverty” (J. Lee, 1990).

She has launched various developmental schemes for women in business sector by providing them with soft loans and micro-credit schemes to initiate their business at small and medium level in order to empower themselves. She highly encouraged women to work in developmental works at local level to provide the redressal for the grievances of the masses. She has increased the Bangladeshi labour force from 24% to 36% in 2010.

The top priority of her government is the MDG (Millenium Development Goals) to empower the Bangladeshi women in every sector. Awami League reserved seats for women in local government system to provide maximum political participation to women. On the same lines she enhanced women seats in administration, judiciary, army, foreign service and in other fields. She sent women in UN peace keeping force.

She introduced multiple health reforms for women. A healthy mother is essential for producing healthy child. She introduced the concept of “healthy mother, healthy child, health family and healthy nation. “As regard MDG 5 on maternal health, our success is on track and will be reached by 2015. The latest maternal mortality survey report 2010 indicates that our maternal mortality rate (MMR) dropped from 574 per 100,000 live births in 1990 to 194 per 100,000 live births in 2010 – a 66% reduction. To improve the situation further, we have introduced a maternal health voucher scheme which covers
274 000 poor pregnant women every year. It costs US$ 25 per pregnancy and covers ante-natal checkups and medical tests. An additional cash incentive of US$ 27 is given for child birth by a skilled provider. Its success calls for its expansion all over the country and in different parts of the world there exists inequities and uneven well-being. Moreover, there is urgent need for safe and effective family planning for about 215 million women of the world who lack it. In Bangladesh, although we have reduced our total fertility rate from 2.7 in 2007 to 2.47 now, and satisfactorily improved contraceptive acceptance rate, the rate of unmet family planning needs is still 18%. I hope the global community would continue their support to our effort to make population an asset instead of being a burden” (Derich & Flechhebburg, 2011). The ratio of mother mortality during pregnancy is 350000 every year in Bangladesh. WHO is working upon to improve the health standards of women? The UN MDG are laying positive effects upon women and children.

(c) Khalida Zia’s Policies for Women’s Empowerment

Begum Khaleda Zia was highly concerned for women empowerment and progress of women .She took lot of practical steps for the betterment of women in her country of Bangladesh .She was highly aware the problems of Bangladeshi women.

Begum Khaleda Zia introduced lot of policies for the female education. She provided free books and uniform for both girls and boys. She brought gender parity in the sector of education, and even the female students outnumber the boys students. She introduced free education for girls till class twelve. She also allocated the stipends for the girls education. She established the two new gender cadets colleges for girls, and apart from this three new polytechnic institutes for women were established. She established The Asian University for women in Chittagong with the collaboration of America. She wanted that the literacy rate should be minimized.

“She was highly concerned regarding the health of the women and infant and maternal mortality rate was also decreased due to sound health policies. The Family Planning Programme introduced and population growth was controlled by 1.47 %. The family planning is essential for the mother’s health and life. The maternal mortality rate should be minimized. The living standard of women is very poor still in the world. The gender discrimination should be wiped out in the educational and health sector. We have provide multiple facilities in educational and health sector” (Edwards & Roces, 2000).

She addressed the issue of violence within the home, s sphere and outside the domain of home. She did the legislation regarding the sale of acid and also about acid –throwing attacks upon the girls.
Begum Khaleda Zia signed the Beijing Declaration in 1995, in order to make Bangladeshi women empowered. She said that we want to renew our commitments to the advancement of women. I have sense of optimism that the age-old prejudices against women. The women should stand firm against all challenges, and they should overcome all barriers which are hurdle in the way of progress. We have sense of determination that the women are unshakable in the entire world. And have the door for economic and political opportunities for womenfolk. The 70% of women are poor. They don, t have employment, access to credit, administrative and political representation and equal wages. The issue of violence and discrimination is very high in all societies with women. The issue of women trafficking is the formidable challenge in Bangladesh.

(d) Bandaranaike Policies for Women’s Empowerment

Bandaranaike was very sensitive person and wanted to introduce very progressive policies for the betterment of women. She was interested to improve the lot of rural women’s plight. She allocated the major chunk of budget for the betterment of women’s education and health sector. She was a social worker, and was highly aware regarding the basic problems of womenfolk in Sri Lanka. She wanted to empower the Sri Lankan women in every walk of life. She addressed the issue of domestic violence in Sri Lanka. She was highly aware that politics is volatile and risky in Sri Lanka, and women even men are reluctant to participate in politics due to security reasons. Despite of this, she supported the women to take part in elections at local, national and international level. She was knowing that Sri Lanka is an agrarian country, and more than 85% people are affiliated to agriculture sector, and even most of the women are working in fields of coconut, pineapple and tea. She was to bring reforms in the rural areas of Sri Lanka that women plight should be improved in the rural areas. She want to improve the plight of women labourers and peasants in Sri Lanka. Bandaranaike wanted to comply with all international instruments of Human Rights i.e. CEDAW 1979 and Beijing Declaration 1995 and wanted to transform the country policies with these international standards for the betterment of women’s lot.

Bandaranaike was highly aware that political mobilization is essential to promote gender-balanced politics in Sri Lanka. The government should initiate such policies and reserve the quota and separate seats in the Sri Lankan parliament. She politically nurtured her daughter Chandrika Kumaratunga as the leader of party and of the country, and she rose to position to the president of Sri Lanka.

“She was highly aware that womenfolk are suppressed and downtrodden, deprived of the right of inheritance, victim of customary practices, no say or voice in management and decision-making and social matters. The illiteracy and poverty is common among women. They have no adequate food and basic necessities of life. They have less
opportunity regarding the community participation. They have no role in determining the number of children and family planning. There is no special provision for women’s participation. There is obvious gender discrimination in employment, education, business and economic activity. There is a need of (GEM) Gender Empowerment Measures are essential for involving the women in economic activity and political sphere. In 1997, the women’s participation in local body system was just 2.1%. The prolonged civil conflict between Tamil Tigers and Sinhalese population had promoted the culture of violence in Sri Lanka, and had excluded the women folk to participate in politics. There are separate groups of women in politics i.e. Mothers Front of North and South and Tamil Women, which are only working for insurgency. There is another group named as Women’s Coalition for Peace working for the settlement of civil strife within the country” (Kumar, 2000).

**Research Findings**

1. The SAARC female prime ministers policies were very democratic and progressive for their womenfolk in their regions. They brought tremendous changes in patriarchal society by bringing the revolutionary changes that womenfolk can contribute on equal grounds in every walk of life.
2. The SAARC female prime ministers found lot of socio-economic and political challenges in their countries, and tried to abridge the gap between theoretical policies and implementation in order to break the cruel clutches of the traditions.
3. The SAARC female prime ministers are icon of women empowerment not only within SAARC region but also in the entire world. They proved themselves as dynamic leader at par excellence in terms of shaping the foreign policy of their countries and addressing various socio-economic problems of women in their countries.

**Measures (Assessment)**

The SAARC female prime ministers arose to such a high position as a part of dynastical legacy. They were highly aware regarding the difference exists oriental and occidental culture that how our women is subject to gender discrimination in every walk of life. The religions has exalted the position of women in social and other spheres. The three prime ministers (Benazir Bhutto, Shaikh Hasina Wajid and Begum Khaleda Zia) belonged from Islamic states, and Islam has given a very respectable position to women as mother, sister, wife and daughter etc. The prime minister Indra Gandhi belonged to secular state but dominated by hindu ideology and hindu religion also believes in the ethical codes of humanity and also gives a lesson that women should be treated fairly. The Prime minister Bandaranaike belonged from Bhuddist state and the spiritual leader Mahatama Buddha also preached a very venerated position to women in family and society. The religion is not
practiced by the common people in their day-to-day affairs. The state laws are not sufficient to provide the protection to women within the family sphere. The customs and social values are the stronger force and chain to determine the status of women in the society. These female prime ministers realized that either with help of policies, laws, the women can be assigned with the better position in the society and state. The women are the assets of the nation, their services are essential in agricultural, industrial sector in order to get the desired results of stabilized economy.

Analysis

The plight of women is common in the SAARC region because this region portrays a model of patriarchal society, where the gender discrimination is common in every walk of society. The almost situation of SAARC countries is almost same in terms of exploitation of women’s rights and lack of secure policies for them in all walks of life. These SAARC female Prime Ministers themselves confronted enormous challenges as prime minister in male-dominated society. In the third world countries, the women is the symbol of suppression and subordination. She is sacrificed at the altar of social values and customs. They did legislation and implementation of policies in order to protect them with the family domain and outside the family sphere. When the religion and constitutions is the guarantor of fundamental rights of citizens, then why there is gender discrimination in every walk of life. The crime rate is very high with respect to women i.e. acid throwing, body mutilation, murder, kidnapping, abduction and violence. Most of the crimes are going unnoticed in the societies and even most of women cannot lodge the FIR (First Information Report) due to the honour of family. So, these prime ministers tackled that these crime should be controlled with the help of legislature, executive and judiciary, because justice delay is justice denied, and it is very difficult for women to get justice.

Discussion and Results

This research paper is of the immense importance and following results can be extracted from this research work.

1. It is encouraging sign that female have been rose to such a high position in SAARC region belonging from third world countries. These women had highly realized the plight of their women’s lot and introduced lot of reforms for their betterment in various sectors and these reforms laid down the far-reaching impacts upon the women’s lot in their respective countries.

2. The female SAARC prime ministers were highly aware regarding the oriental culture and the respect of traditional and social values. The women are the victim of cruel customs and tradition and they turned revolutionary to break the chains of cruel clutches of these customs with the help of education, media and legislation.
3. The SAARC countries are densely populated countries and the women had outnumbered the man in terms of population ratio. The prime ministers realized that women are the source of great power and strength for country and their talents are wasted in table serving and domestic activities. They launched various programmes in i.e. education, computer literacy programme, social welfare programmes. Skill development and vocational development programmes to utilize their services in various walks of life. The nation cannot reach at lofty position without involvement of womenfolk in nation-building activities.

**Outcome (The Effects of Results)**

1. The progressive policies introduced by these female prime ministers laid down indelible prints on the sand of time by improving the women’s lot in their respective countries and addressing their issues at national and international level.
2. These female prime ministers are trend setters in streamlining the process of leadership not only in their respective countries to mobilize womenfolk to participate in the sphere of politic. They had proved themselves as best leader and accepted all challenges for betterment of women in their countries.
3. The female prime ministers had laid down the first brick of the paradigm of women empowerment. It has opened the gate of reforms for the other followers to realize the existing women plight and their problems and also suggest the strategies for the betterment of womenfolk. The policies they introduced proliferated the chain of reaction for other policies by conferring various acknowledged rights to women.

**Conclusions**

The SAARC female Prime Ministers are ranked as dynamic leader on the basis of these parameters: dynamism, leadership, motivation and lofty ideals. These SAARC female prime ministers were the representative of women empowerment itself and they also believed to solve the problems of women in their respective region by mobilizing them in every walk of life at par with men. They introduced their policies for educational uplift, health care, political representation, to control domestic violence and women trafficking, to wipe out the discrimination between the male and female, enhance women quota in jobs and to empower women in every walk of life. These female SAARC prime ministers had accepted the challenges of patriarchal society and broken the chain of orthodox traditions and cruel clutches of the society by promoting the womenfolk in their respective regions. They have high vision and ambition for the women that they are subjected to gender discrimination in every walk of life. Their lives decision is taken by the male member of society and they have less say and voice in social matters. These prime ministers reflected the socio-political plight of women at international forum in
order to win the sympathy from the international community that it is hard nut to crack to break the cruel clutches of society. They are the champions of women’s rights and heralder of innovation and modernation in the present scenario. These are the daughters of SAARC soil and had sown the seed of revolution, reformation, progressiveness, equality and transparency in the system and one day the new tree will sprout with the branches, leaves and fruit of gender balance, justice, women empowerment and developed SAARC. These female prime ministers are the role model that although themselves belonged from elite class, but they can realize the problems of common poor women. There far-reaching policies laid ineffacible imprints on the barren land of SAARC and golden words are embedded on the socio-political and economic fabric of SAARC. The three prime ministers i.e. Benazir Bhutto, Bandranaike and Indra Gandhi became the legendary figures due to their lofty ideals and immortalized themselves for reformatory steps for women in their respective countries. They had added the glorious chapter in the history and as the water of Ganges and Indus rivers will flow, these female prime ministers vision of women empowerment will remain alive.

References


---

**Hussan Ara Magsi** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science, University of Baluchistan, Quetta.

**Dr. Faraz Ahmed Wajidi** is an Assistant Vice President, Head of Research and Development (L&MDD) National Bank of Pakistan.
Insight Into The Lives Of Female Nurses In Lahore: An In Depth Analysis

Lubna Karim Naz
Center for Media and Communication Studies
University of Gujrat

Umar Rafique
Department of Sociology
University of Gujrat

Abstract

Present study aims to understand the life of female nurses working in public sector hospitals in Pakistan. An effort is being made to collect maximum amount of information about the nurses’ lives. This study is conducted in one of the largest public sector hospital in Lahore. Snowball sampling technique has been adopted for collecting data from the nurses. 20 in depth interviews have been conducted. This qualitative data has been analyzed by the Hesse-Biber & Leavy (2006) technique for conducting a rigorous analysis of the data. Three categories were emerged in the collected data. Life at hospital, Societal Response toward nurses and views about government policies. Toughness of job, issues of harassment, low salaries, daunting respect and honor, Issues in marriage prospects, lack of any service structure were the common themes under these categories. This study has immense importance as it has added more in existing knowledge about the nurses’ lives. Present study reveals other issues of their lives as well other than harassment issues. Recommendations were being made to improve the lives of nurses.

Keywords: Nurses, Harassment, Government Policies, Lahore, Respect & Honor.

تخصيص

تهدف هذه الدراسة إلى فهم حياة كبار الحاملات في مصانع القطاع العام في باكستان. يتم الجهد للجمع بأعلى كمية ممكنة من المعلومات عن حياة الحاملات. هذه الدراسة تم التنفيذ في منشأة طبية رئيسية في لاہور. تم استخدام نموذج نموذج التصريف للجمع البيانات من الحاملات. 20 ورشة زيتعمية تم تنفيذها. هذا البيانات الكمية تم تحليله بواسطة تقنية Hesse-Biber & Leavy (2006) للقيام بإجراء تحليل صارم بيانات. تطورت ثلاثة فئات من البيانات المجمعة. الحياة في المستشفى، الردود الاجتماعية نحو الحاملات وآراءهم عن سياسات الحكومة. الصعوبة في العمل، التعرض للتحرش، الرواتب المنخفضة، الاحترام وال 존انة، شروط الزواج، 缺乏任何服务结构是这些类别的常见主题。这项研究具有巨大的重要性，因为它为护士的生活增加了更多的知识。这项研究揭示了其他问题，除了骚扰问题。提出了改善护士生活的建议。

 ключيات: الحاملات، التحرش، سياسات الحكومة، لاہور، الاحترام وال 존انة.
Introduction

With the rapidly modernizing world females are increasingly participating in labor force for the development and progress of their countries. In Pakistan as well, females slowly but steady are increasingly getting into the labor market. Recent World Bank 2014 statistics 25% females are participating in the labor force World Bank (2014). They are getting into different fields like medical, Teaching, Banking and corporate sectors etc. One of the oldest and traditional jobs which females have adopted in all the times that is a profession of caring the patients commonly known as Nursing. Their role has immense importance throughout the history and in medical care. 80% of total health care is given by nurses. If a health system has registered and trained nursing staff, that health system goes successful (Royal College of Nursing, 2008).

Different countries have promoted this field a lot. As they consider nursing staff an important pillar of health care system so they have developed specified trainings, diplomas, and certifications for them and develop them to the extent where they can actively and efficiently work with the doctors for the health promotion. For the said purpose they have also given a secure work environment, a job structure and above all a respectable status in society.

But nursing as remaining a females’ dominated profession have problems and concerns in most of the developing countries where there is still greater levels of gender inequality prevails and women have to work a lot for achieving a respectable endorsement as a working women. This issue always remains critical which leads to a decrease in the females’ labor force participation as well in these countries (Jayachandran, 2015). Their problems, issues and concerns do vary in the type of job they are doing.

Pakistan is also facing gender related serious problems. Pakistan is on 147th number on Gender Inequality Index which is a lowest position in the Gender related human development rating Human Development Reports, UNDP (2015). Because of a patriarchal society working women have to go to an extra mile in getting themselves well adjusted breaking all the shackles of society. Even one of the very basic challenges faced by Pakistani women is their right to work in a safe and respectable environment (Ferdoos, 2005). According to an estimate at least 50 percent of women in public sector face harassment at work place in Pakistan (NCFJAP, 2007).
In a similar vein, nurses are also facing a tough time in the hospitals. American Nursing Association (2016) defines nursing as “It is the protection, promotion, and optimization of health and abilities, prevention of illness and injury, facilitation of healing, alleviation of suffering through the diagnosis and treatment of human response, and advocacy in the care of individuals, families, groups, communities, and populations.” According to the Royal College of Nursing UK, the use of clinical judgment in the provision of care to enable people to improve, maintain, or recover health, to cope with health problems, and to achieve the best possible quality of life, whatever their disease or disability, until death. So simply nursing is a profession which aims at helping patients to cope with their diseases and to remain healthy. It is also clear from the above statements that why is it called the noble profession because its main duty is to help the patients to improve their health and to take care of them.

As nursing belongs to a white color profession, have virtually no any power and authority in our society and as mostly females are into this profession, so they face a tough situation in our society. They are being named as “sex workers” “prostitutes” harassed and threaten by the people. They have not being given proper respect and honor which they deserve (Yusufzai, 2006).

This is also evident from the frequent strikes and protests of the nursing staff in Pakistan, demanding for their rights, service structure, and a peaceful and comfortable work environment. This all scenario calls for a serious investigation into the lives of nurses. In this paper an effort is being made to understand the lives of nurses that how they are spending their lives in hospitals? What are their concerns and issues? What is societal response toward them? These all questions are being discussed in this paper.

**Objectives of Study**

Following are the important objectives of the present study.

- To study the lives of nurses extensively.
- To understand the problem which nurses face at work place
- To know what sort of response nurses get from the society.
- To know nurses’ perspective on the government policies regarding nurses.

**Significance of the Study**

This study has manifolds importance. This helps to understand the realities of nurses’ lives on many different levels. First of all this paper calls for attention to the working women of our society. What kind of problems and issues working women are facing in our society.
Second significant aspect of this study is that a plenty of research work has done on doctors’ life, their duties etc. But very limited literature gives coverage to the lives of nurses; a coverage which can reveal some facts about their lives. As nurses are very important for any health care system but they are not given their due share. They work so hard but their salaries and other incentives are not in accordance to the hard work which they perform. This is evident from the frequent strikes of the nursing staff of the province Punjab demanding for their rights and for having a concrete service structure. In this study researchers want to analyze the existing situation of government hospital from the perspective of nurses. How are they spending their lives? What are the problems which they are facing there? What are their views regarding government policies for nurses?

Indeed this study is an investigation into the life of nurses. This study will add into the knowledge about nurses in Pakistan. It will give an opportunity to researchers as well as readers an understanding of nurses’ lives. It will give us an opportunity to realize the importance of nurses in hospitals. This study can also air some voice for the rights of the nurses. This study can also lead to the debate over the role nurses are performing and the reward which they must be given in return.

Last but not least, this study has also importance as to give an insight in the lives of working women, having white color jobs. So this is a significant addition in the gender literature and about the situation of working women in our society belong to middle class, white color professions.

**Problem Statement**

Present study aims to understand the lives of nurses working in the public hospitals of city Lahore in Punjab, Pakistan. Nurses are facing a tough time in our society. This is evident from the frequent strikes of the nurses and the hectic routine of nursing staff in public hospitals of Pakistan.

This study will reveal the facts about the lives of nurses in following dimensions. i) This study will reveal the problems which nurses face in hospitals. ii) It will also help to understand the nurses’ perspective on the government policies regarding nurses. iii) Lastly it will also explain the problems which nurses face in the society.

**Literature Review**

Following are some of the studies which have been already conducted on nurses’ lives. Malik et al. (2014) analyzed the relationship between sexual harassment, self esteem and job satisfaction among the in-training nurses in four hospitals in Lahore and Islamabad. 120 females participated in this research. Data was collected using Sexual harassment
Experience Questionnaire, Self esteem scale and Job satisfaction scale. Pearson Correlation and regression analysis shows that sexual harassment is the significant predictor of low self esteem and low job satisfaction among in training female nurses. It has been recommended that smooth work environment free from all kinds of sexual harassment must be needed for providing best health care services to the public.

Malik & Farooqi (2014) conducted a research to examine the impact of general and sexual harassment on post traumatic stress symptoms. 300 medical staff, constituted the sample which was drawn from five public hospitals of Lahore city. A significant positive relationship has been found in general and sexual harassment and post traumatic stress symptoms. Awareness must be raised in order to reduce work place harassment and its negative consequences.

Somani & Khowaja (2012) in their case report discuss the devastating effects of workplace violence. They were of the view that workplace violence among nurses is common in every health care setting. Nurses do not get enough respect and honor in Pakistani society which leads to workplace violence towards nurses which includes both psychological and physical violence. There are many incidences of reported and unreported rape, unwanted sexual deeds, work place bullying and other related issues from patients, family members and other paramedical staff. According to the researchers these incidences went unreported because of the fear ad more disrespect in society. A safe work environment is direly needed for the nurses satisfaction and their better performance.

Mushtaq et al. (2015) collected the data from 200 nurses for analyzing the impact of sexual harassment on their mental health in four public sectors hospitals of Lahore. They have found sexual harassment as a significant predictor of negative mental health in the form of depression, anxiety, and stress in nurses of public hospitals.

Shaikh (2000) conducted a study to understand the extent of sexual harassment of female nurses by different people in Islamabad public hospital. He has found that male physicians, patients and their relatives are the major committer of sexual harassment. It is recommended that nurses in their own capacity and hospital administration should protect nurses and provide them a secure work environment.

Khan et al. (2015) conducted a study with 150 nurses to assess the exposure rate by the type of harassment, awareness level of Sexual Harassment policy, contribution to raising voice and consequences on nurses and their performance at three tertiary care hospitals in Peshawar. Descriptive analysis was conducted and concluded that awareness about sexual harassment can lead toward a reduction in such incidences. Sexual harassment is found to have serious negative effects on nurse performance, health, morale, self-esteem and entire
personality. They have recommended that Pakistan penal code about the protection of women at workplace must be implemented truly. This law should also be made part in nursing education as well to enable them to fight against this evil more powerfully.

Audrey, J. (2010) tested a model for workplace violence and sexual harassment for health care professionals predicting personal and organizational consequences. This model suggests that violence and sexual harassment leads to negative mental health. This includes fear, negative mood, perceived injustice which leads towards poor commitment and withdrawal intentions and poor performance in hospitals.

Chaudhri (2006) has also shared similar findings in health sector in Kolkata. He stated that sexual harassment is common in health sector and it basically refers to the norms of society about sexuality and masculinity in the workplace. Attitude towards this among people is normal and considered to be harmless. This acts as a occupational hazard for the women.

**Methodology**

The population for the present study was the nurses working in the government hospitals of Lahore. One of the largest public hospitals in Lahore was selected as field of study and non probability sampling was used in which snowball sampling has been used. This sampling design has been used as the willingness and availability of the respondents was very limited. Although researchers did build rapport with the nursing staff to understand maximum issues of their lives but respondents were reluctant to participate in this study in order to reveal the problems they were facing because of gender related issues. So in order to achieve maximum reliability and validity of our data we only took those nurses who were fully interested in the present study. And for that we used snowball or referential sampling design. We started with the data collection process with a nurse in the hospital and then develop contacts with other nurses.

We managed to have an inclusion criterion which was all those nurses who are regular employee of the hospital with at least three years for working experience. The reason for having this criterion is that they have an experience of working in the government hospital and quite aware of the working of the government hospital.

In depth interviews have been used a tool of data collection for the present study. As in-depth interview relies on individuals in the research process and considers individuals as important and knowledgeable resources about the social world which can be shared through verbal communication (Hesse-Biber & leavy, 2006).

Researchers did not have a complete interview guide. Questions were started generally about the problems which they are facing at hospital and then probed for more information for getting more relevant information.
Three aspects were mainly discussed in the interviews. Socio-economic profile has been discussed in the interviews. Secondly nurses were interviewed about the life in public sector hospitals, their issues and concerns were discussed deeply. Third they were asked about the government policies regarding nursing staff. Fourth it has been discussed that how do they feel about themselves in the society. What is the response they get while being in the society?

Total 20 interviews have been conducted where it has been made sure that saturation level has been achieved and full information complete in all possible respects have been achieved. Interviews were conducted in Urdu language and then transcribed into English for further analysis.

Consideration of research ethics is most important concern for a social scientist. It’s the moral and professional responsibility of the researcher to maintain the ethical standards. In the present research the researcher has followed all ethical considerations. The researcher has got prior permission from respondents for interviews and briefed them about the research objectives. The respondents were thoroughly briefed about the purpose of the research. The respondents have been told that their names would not be disclosed and all their information and discussion would be kept highly confidential. All interviews have been conducted after getting their approval.

**Data Analysis Procedure**

The researchers have used the following model in analysis and interpretation of qualitative data (Hesse-Biber & Leavy 2006).

- Data Preparation
- Data Exploration
- Data Reduction
- Data Interpretation

**Data Preparation**

The data were collected in the form of in-depth interview. It was saved in the form of audio recording. The researchers have also taken field notes and maintain their dairy on daily basis. The researcher was very active in transcription of data on daily basis as it is very crucial to analysis and interpretation (Hasse-Biber & Leavy 2006).

**Data Exploration**

In this phase the researcher has read the field notes and then listened to the recorded interview of the respondents very carefully. This practice was repeated several times. It has provided a chance to highlight important themes and inferences. The researcher has noted it down in a note book. This practice was very helpful to decide about most important themes and inferences. Through this practice the researcher has pointed out some very important quotes and put them in *Italics* in the data analysis.
Data Reduction

Data reduction stage plays a significant role in coding of the data. In the present study the researcher has used Neuman’s (2006) model for data coding

- Sorting and Classifying
- Open Coding
- Axial Coding
- Selective Coding
- Interpreting and Elaborating

Data Interpretation

In this stage the data were interpreted under different themes. Field observations and memo writing facilitated the researcher to create scientific text in the form of different themes and inferences (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2006). The statements supporting the themes were quoted to provide evidence to the inferences. Most important quotes were given into boxes to highlight the imperative hidden meaning into local reality construction.

Demographic and Socio-economic Profile of the Respondents

Brief review of socio-economic and demographic profile is given below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Number of nurses</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bsc Nursing</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post RNA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Number of nurses</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Mentioned</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Number of Nurses</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20-25</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-30</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-35</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Above table shows the qualification, marital status and age of the respondents. Their monthly income ranges from 35000-65000 which changes according to their span of job period.
Life at Hospital

In this section following themes have been extracted which are being highlighting the issues which nurses are facing in the hospitals; at their work place.

Nursing; A Very Tough Job

This has been revealed from all the interviews that all the nurses repeatedly shared that their job is very tough and very demanding. They opined that it is fine to have a tough job routine but this always compensated with the reasonable salaries. So as their salaries are not in accordance with the services which they are performing so it becomes more hectic for all the nurses to perform. Job is also tough in a sense that it needs serious attention at the workplace for even all the minutes which nurses spent over there. They need to be all the time over anxious and concerned for the patients. Their job becomes tougher as they have to face the pressure from multiple sides the doctor side, the patients and their attendants. This is stated by all the respondents. Following are the comments shared by the respondents

“Our life is very tough; we have to remain all time attentive and concerned.” For another instance one of the respondents said “we face pressure from many sides so that’s why overall our job becomes really difficult.”

This job is also tough in a way when we have to perform night duties. “Night duties are very hard to perform. We find so many problems while we are on night duties. For instance we are unable to find a transport which can take us to the hospital etc.” They sometime have to miss family functions and other gatherings because of this job. This adds up in the toughness of this job. Like a respondent said “I usually remain unable to attend family functions and other gatherings.” Another respondent said “I usually miss my family functions because of night duties or other related emergencies.”

Harassment

Sexual harassment is a very harsh problem in the workplace and a major social issue with serious negative effects (e.g. Richman et al., 1999).

Harassment is a most debated topic regarding females in any society. Developed countries have somehow made their workplace secure for their females. But in third world countries this is still a big issue for so many females. Fitzgerald (1993) found that sexual harassment remains prevalent in overall society throughout the history. He suggested that approximately 1 out of 2 women were harassed at some point during their
academic and or working lives. He suggested that sexual harassment has psychological, health related and job related serious consequences.

Women working in low level jobs in our society faces more stereotypes and stigmas then other women who are working in some more sophisticated and upper level jobs. As nursing is also a white color job so nurses also face this problem at work place. So incidence of harassment is more frequent than in any other profession for females. Very confidentially nurses stated that the major problem which they face at work place is of the harassment. Harassment has multiple definitions and descriptions.

For instance Saeed (2003) states harassment as the abuse of Authority and creating Hostile Environment. It includes unwanted or unwelcome behavior, which can offend, humilities and intimated a person while creating un pleasant working environment

Phillips (1993) said that “Sexual harassment is unwanted, unwelcome and rude behavior that makes you feel intimidated, victimized, uncomfortable, embarrassed, and threatened. It creates an intimidating, hostile or offensive environment for employment, study or social life. When this includes unwanted and unwelcome sexual advances, request for sexual favors or other verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature, it is called Sexual Harassment.”

Pryor (1995) reported that Sexual harassments can occur in a variety of situations. Often the harasser is in a position of power or authority over the victim (because of differences in age, or social, political, educational or employment relationships) or expecting to receive such power or authority in form of promotion.

Barton (1990) reported that sometimes sexual harassment takes a verbal form that is directed at the females like calling a women doll, babe, sweetie, etc. Sexually harassing conduct without words include looking at person’s body, gazing at someone, blocking some one’s path, following the person, giving gifts, hanging around a person, touching, make sexual gesture, messaging etc. These all different forms have been found in the nurses’ interviews in varying capacity.

Here in this research study harassment is from many sides and this actually ruins the mental peace of the nurses at work place. As one respondent said “Mostly relatives of the patient harass the nurses. They have a habit of gazing at us. And use to pass comments loudly without any reason. They are also cracking silly jokes which are sometimes very shameful.”

As many respondents have shared this view so this has been emerged as a theme out of all these interviews.
The other side by which nurses are also being harassed is from the doctors’ side. This has very different manifestation of the harassment. Respondents categorize it in different forms. Respondents describe different levels of harassment. Sometimes doctors explicitly ask for sexual favors. But sometimes considering us just females they try to create an environment which really irritates us. As a respondent expressed that “Just the fact we are females, they behave in a very awkward way. They keep on calling us with no reason, asking about the patients’ condition unnecessarily. Simply they make a very difficult situation for us to work peacefully.”

Another respondent opinioned “Doctors behave really badly. One thing which really irritates me is the unnecessarily touching of doctors to the nurses while handling them injections or other related items to the doctors.”

On third dimension nurses discussed that how patients also harass the nurses. Nursing is a profession in which a close contact between the nurse and patient is required so sometimes it becomes unpleasant for nurses to handle patients. As one of the respondent quoted “Patients also behave in a pathetic way. They do not respect us. They call us unnecessarily with all lame excuses.”

Above account shows that nurses face different kinds of harassment which includes, commenting, gazing, staring, discussing about the nurses’ looks. So this happens with the nurses from multiple sides which have been elaborated above. According to them this has serious consequences for their mental and physical health and they feel unsecure at work place. They were of the opinion that they sometimes become extremely fearful because of these all situations.

Nurses also shared this view that they do not share these mishaps with any one because of multiple issues. This includes that they feel it troublesome to tell someone about the behavior of the patients, their attendants and the doctors. Nurses shared that change in work environment, leader trust; norms of society, their own attitude towards reporting can help themselves in reducing the chances of the harassment. These views are also supported by Clarke’s findings. (2014)

**Views about Government Policies; Unavailability of Service Structure**

Nurses highlighted their main concern which is unavailability of service structure for the nursing staff. This has been a grave concern of the nursing staff and a bone of contention with the government. They were of the view point that there is no regard of higher qualification in the nursing field. Nurses who have done post RNA diploma or other diplomas they are not given any incentive.
Other issue is that there is no procedure of promotion, regardless of the fact how many years one has served. There is no rapid promotion or even a defined way for the promotion of the nurses.

As a respondent shared “I have higher degree in nursing but do not have any benefit of that as in other departments where you have got higher education allowances”. “Our one of the very prime concern because of which we have launched so many strikes and protests is the unavailability of any service structure for the nurses.”

Another respondent said “There is not a proper way for our promotion.”

Societal Response

Nurses highlighted many concerns about society. Whatever they feel in society, its brief description is stated below. By society here means that how people generally behave toward them.

Daunting Respect and Honor

An important theme has been drawn from the nurses’ discussion about how people behave toward them. They were of the view that they receive a mix kind of treatment from people. They respect us and give honor to them when they are in need. Like it happens that whenever they are having any emergency in their homes, they come and ask for help very politely but it’s not the case otherwise. As a respondent exclaimed “It happens that whenever they (neighbors) need my help, their males truly calls me Sister but ironically they never give me respect as a sister.”

As in Pakistan is traditional society where self medication and taking medicines on the advice of unqualified allopath is very common, so people usually take medicines on their own or with the little advice of any man who has just a any knowledge about medicines or the related things. So for that kind of help respondents referred in the interviews that when they need us they give respect to us otherwise not.

They also shared a view that “even though whole mulalla (Residential block) know that they (nurses) are nurses and they have to perform sometimes evening or night duties but still they never trust them fully. Like people are always susceptible toward them. Sharing her views about this issue a respondent said “I have to always make sure that whenever I have night duties my whole family especially cha-chas (Parental uncles) and my cousins must know that now a days I m on night duty. With this close neighbors are also have to be reminded of that I am now a days on night duties.” Another respondent said “My whole Muhalla (Residential Block) knows that I am a nurse but I really do not like their
eyes when stare at me and the accents when they talk to me or talk to my family about myself. This is really unbearable.”

**Marriage Issues**

As like other working women nurses also face many marital and family related problems which they highlighted. These were all common and like other females who are doing other jobs like the dual role which a working woman has to play, managing family, kids, in laws, husband. All married respondents highlighted the same issues. One thing which is very startling here that is the marriage prospects for the nurses. Respondents shared the point that they face relatively a tougher situation in getting an appropriate marriage proposal for them. The reasons according to the respondents were multiple. Among them is to find a suitable mate for the unmarried nurses is a basic problem. They do not find an appropriate mate who has a noble and respectable status in society. According to the respondents the reason is that society does not really give respect so they suffer all these problems.

**Discussion & Conclusions**

The present study encompasses various dimensions of nurses’ lives in Pakistan. There are multiple studies which describe the prevalence of sexual harassment and its impact on nurses’ lives. This research goes beyond this point and covers some other aspects of the nurses’ lives. This study broadly covers many areas of their lives. The themes have been extracted from in depth interviews which are mentioned above. For some themes researchers found some prior studies with them researchers found relevance some other issues which are being analyzed in this study are unique and quite new.

First of all their age, qualification and marital status have been described. Secondly some other aspects are also been discussed. Among them the first major category is described as the “Life at Hospital”. In this category the first theme, extracted is the toughness of the job. All the respondents have shared that their job is very tough. This job requires full time dedication and commitment even sometime they are not able to fulfill their domestic responsibilities just because of the hardiness of the job. And even according to them this is not being compensated in a right manner with the salaries and other facilities. Second theme which has been emerged in this category is of harassment which remains common and is also supported by previous researches in the same field. (Malik et al (2014), Malik & Farooqi (2014), Somani & Khowaja (2012).

Like numerous studies cited above and other related studies it has been found that nurses become a serious victim of harassment. Present study has this capacity to elaborate the type of harassment which nurses face and secondly from various sources they face these
kinds of advancements. This has been made clear in this study that nurses face sexual and
general harassment from patients, their attendants and from doctors. In harassment
includes asking for sexual favors, gazing, staring, passing comments, cracking immoral
jokes, unnecessary touching etc. are included in the harassment. This is being also
confirmed by the previous studies cited here. Malik et al. (2014), Malik & Farooqi (2014),
Somani & Khowaja (2012). Nurses expressed deep concern about this harassment;
sharing the view it has serious consequences for their mental and physical health.
According to them this all leads to an uncomfortable work environment. They are
uncertain about their own security at work place. It has been recommended by the nurses
that their work environment must be made safe and sound so that’s why they can work
with all peace of mind. This idea is also supported by Yusufzai’s (2006) study. Hamid
(2010) also stated that in Pakistan the sexual harassment cases are very common but these
cases are not usually reported, all the people have their own way to deal with it. Recently
Government has passed a bill against sexual harassment. The purpose of this bill (2010)
against sexual harassment to create the safe environment at working place free from
harassment, abuse and intimidation. Code of sexual harassment is 509c and it is passed
by Pakistan penal court in Last year (2010). The need is to encourage people to take
serious steps for eradicating this problem.

Second category which has been emerged from these qualitative interviews was “Views
about Government Policies” in which “unavailability of service structure” has been
emerged as a theme. This theme is a new dimension in this study which has not been
explored by the previous studies. Nurses clearly identified that government has not
developed a road map for our promotion and has not given any other facilities. They are
not getting higher qualification allowances as other people get in other fields. They said
that one of the causes of frequent strikes of nurses is the unavailability of service
structure by the government.

Third category was “Societal Response toward Nurses” in which daunting respect &
honor and marriage issues have been emerged. Nurses shared the view that they find an
ambiguous situation in the society in the matter of respect and honor. People never give
them a respectable status by heart. People give them respect whenever they need nurses
in medical emergencies. Otherwise people never give them a respectable status. They
shared that whole _muhala (Residential block), (people from whole residential block)_ their
uncles, cousins show unnecessary concern for their jobs and night duties. They pass
weird looks to them and make their stay uncomfortable in different family gatherings.
Other theme was of marriage related issues. First it’s hard for the nurses and their
families to find out a suitable marriage proposal for them as being nurse they are being
viewed as inferior then females belonging to other professions. It’s very hard for them to
find a respectable and noble man for marriage. Mostly they get proposals from very down
trodden families and those mostly unemployed or involve in immoral activities. Married
women face usually the same issues as other working women face like dual burden of job and family responsibilities etc.

Present study precisely reveals many facts about the lives of nurse how they view their jobs, government policies and societal response towards them. Recommendations have been made that nurses should give a comfortable environment free from all kinds of harassment and distractions so they can work peacefully. The law against sexual harassment must be showed in hospitals so people remain careful about the act. Societal support must be given to the nurses so they can fully express their concerns about people with their seniors or family members. Government must settle all the issues with the nurses so they can work peacefully for promoting the health of the patients. New trends and initiatives must be taken for raising the status of the nurses in our society.

References


___________________

**Dr. Lubna Karim Naz** is an Assistant Professor in the Center for Media and Communication Studies, University of Gujrat.

**Umar Rafique** is an Associate Lecturer in the Department of Sociology, University of Gujrat.
Role Of Mass Media And Interpersonal Communication In Promoting Awareness About Woman Rights In Pakistan

Lubna Zaheer & Amber Mubeen
Institute of Communication Studies
University of the Punjab, Lahore

Abstract

Women rights have always been a debatable issue in almost every society. Being a watchdog, media is expected to give voice to all members of the society regardless of their gender, background and ethnicity. Media can play a vigorous role to educating people about women-rights by addressing their concerns and anxieties. This study aims to investigate the role of mass media (i.e. television, newspapers and social media) and interpersonal communication in promoting awareness about woman rights in Pakistan. Using quantitative survey method with a sample of N=358, results of One-way ANOVA show comparison among various types of media. The study figured out that mass media in Pakistan especially print media, play a positive role in promoting awareness about women rights. However, the role of interpersonal communication has been found more effective as compared to new and old media. The study also expresses that demographics play significant role to attaining the awareness about women rights.

Keywords: Women Rights, Mass Media, Television, Newspapers, Social Media, Interpersonal Communication, Socio-Economic Status.
Role of Mass Media and Interpersonal Communication in Promoting Awareness about Women Rights in Pakistan

Introduction

Women rights have always been a profound area of deliberation for most of the nations. Different societies signify women rights according to their social, religious and political structures. It is believed that all people including marginalized groups require the protection of their rights in order to contribute in social, cultural, political, civic, and economic development of the country. Particularly, a fair gender treatment is an essential criterion to ensure a balanced face of any society. In this regard, there is a need that both males and females be treated and represented equally so that females could contribute towards creating a stable and comfortable environment to make certain the unceasing momentum of the society.

Women rights include all the social, economic and cultural liberties and choices that all people are entitled to. In many parts of the world women are denied to their basic rights even (Concern Worldwide, 2013). Although women rights are considered vital part of human rights schema (Ginsburg, 2007) and there are laws that guarantee equal rights to women in order to ensure their health care, education, social participation and economic development, however, despite all these rights, women are victims of harassment, discrimination and assault at offices and domestic level (Dunning et al., 2007). According to United Nations (2014), certain groups of women have to face added forms of discrimination based on their religion, nationality, age, marital status, disability and education level etc.

The fact remains that, being important segment of society, women play undeniable roles in different walks of life globally. Same is the situation in Pakistan where women are getting higher education and doing jobs even in those professions, which were specific for males in the past. It is a need of the hour that females must recognize their positive roles and placement in society to contribute effectively. As shared by Karl (1995) “women must be organized, articulate, persistent and representative to have an impact”. Although, in Pakistani society women rights have become constant feature to much extent, even then females are prone to various types of difficulties and discriminations while working outside the homes or sometimes even staying at home. Moreover, when different segments of society start ignoring the discriminatory acts against women and pretend to be ignorant it results in the deprivation of women from their rights. In this scenario, women become more vulnerable and their voices are rebuked at relevant
platform. According to Salinas (2015), this deprivation prevents women from full and equal participation in social, economic and political life”. Sometimes, same situation is experienced in Pakistan.

In Pakistan almost 80 percent of women especially young females are unaware of their basic legal rights. Especially they are ignorant of their rights and privileges regarding marriage and divorce. Most of the time these rights are not even demanded (Concern Worldwide, 2013). Various organizations regularly monitor human rights issues in Pakistan and produce regular reports. Women rights are part of Islamic laws as well as a constitutional requirement. Governments in different regimes also have been taking legislative and administrative measures to protect women rights and empower them (Asia Report N, 2015). Regardless of all these, state of affairs is not satisfactory towards women.

Being a watchdog, mass media is expected to give voice to all members of society and educate people about their rights as well as responsibilities. Mass media is considered to be an important tool to propagate any agenda or policy and subsequently judged as an effective tool in perspective of gender representation (Malik & Kiani, 2012). Similarly social media is considered important tool to enhancing women participations in various facets of their lives (Salem et al., 2011). It provides platform to women to discourse gender related issues that are under-reported in traditional media and convey their voice to policy-makers. However the impact of social media on policy makers is ambiguous thus far (The Guardian, 2015). But then again the importance of social media can’t be unheeded and the example of Saudi Arabia may be quoted especially where women campaigned for their rights on social media and subsequently influenced the Saudi authorities (Altalebi, 2016).

Insofar as media’s role towards women representation is concerned, it has become a global debate. It is often conversed that electronic and print media of world are continuously busy in promoting stereotypical image of women. Most of the time, physical beauty and apparent look of women are focused for the purpose of enhancing sale of the product(s). This kind of predisposed portrayal hinders the development of any society (Purnima, 2011). In Pakistan, media play its role to discourse and highlight human rights issues. Occasionally, it also affects policy and decision-making (Sial, 2009). However, it has been observed that the way Pakistani media portray the women, makes them more vulnerable and receptive to physical and symbolic violence (Asif, 2011). Moreover, women issues and problems are not highlighted adequately. One of the reasons is that most of the time, top-level and executive positions in various media organizations are mostly held by men and consequently female representation is deficient (Pak Tribune, 2007).

Keeping in view the above-discussed argument, this study examines the role of new (i.e. social media) and old media (i.e. print and TV) in Pakistan towards promoting awareness
about women rights to general masses. Moreover, interpersonal communication (i.e. discussion with family, friends and/or colleagues etc.) has also been added into this discourse. The study also aims at considering the role of demographics (i.e. education and income) in getting awareness about women rights.

Hypotheses

Following hypotheses have been examined in this study:

1. Pakistani print media promotes more awareness among public about women rights as compared to social media
2. Pakistani TV Channels promote more awareness among public about women rights as compared to social media
3. Interpersonal communication is more effective in disseminating awareness about women rights as compared to mass media in Pakistan
4. Demographics have a significant relationship with awareness about women rights

Theoretical Framework

The study has been conducted within the theoretical structure of Uses and gratification theory (Katz, Blumer, & Gurevitch, 1974) of mass communication. This theory is audience centered which puts emphasis on audience’s selection and usage of different types of media for gratifying their different needs. The theory highlights the use of the media by different people. Being active audience, people can identify their needs and media, which is required to gratify those needs in a more contented way.

Methodology

In order to test the hypotheses of the study, survey method was used. The questionnaire was utilized for the purpose of data collection. The respondents (N= 358) were selected from four different universities of Lahore namely Forman Christian College (A Chartered University), The University of Punjab, Superior University and the University of Lahore. In this regard, random sample technique was adopted. For data analysis, SPSS version 21 was used and One-way ANOVA with multiple comparisons of Tukey HSD was applied in order to explore the role of different types of media to promoting awareness about women rights.

Results

Results of One-way ANOVA show the statistical verification of this assumption that type of media has a significant relationship with the women rights awareness. Table 1 shows the output of ANOVA analysis and describes the statistical difference exists between the groups. The significance level (p=.002) is below 0.05. Hence, there is statistically significant difference in the mean of different types of media. Table 1 shows the
descriptive results (F= 5.025, p=.002) of different types of media in creating awareness about women rights in public i.e. newspapers (M= 1.9681, SD=.57698), television (M= 1.9682, SD=.60304), social media (M= 1.6835, SD=.54993) and interpersonal communication (M= 2.0000, SD=.62361).

### Table: 1
Descriptive (ANOVA) analysis of different types of media

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Media</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Lower Bound</th>
<th>Upper Bound</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>ANOVA F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>1.9681</td>
<td>.57698</td>
<td>.04859</td>
<td>1.8720</td>
<td>2.0642</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>5.025</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>1.9682</td>
<td>.60304</td>
<td>.05750</td>
<td>1.8542</td>
<td>2.0821</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>1.6835</td>
<td>.54993</td>
<td>.06187</td>
<td>1.5604</td>
<td>1.8067</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOM*</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>2.0000</td>
<td>.62361</td>
<td>.11785</td>
<td>1.7582</td>
<td>2.2418</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>358</td>
<td>1.9078</td>
<td>.59281</td>
<td>.03133</td>
<td>1.8462</td>
<td>1.9694</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 1.1
Multiple Comparisons (ANOVA) analysis of different types of media

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) IP2 Which type of media you find more active in promoting awareness about women issues</th>
<th>(J) IP2 Which type of media you find more active in promoting awareness about women issues</th>
<th>Mean Difference (I-J)</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>Television</td>
<td>-.00010</td>
<td>.07417</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>-.1915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>.28454*</td>
<td>.08194</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>.0730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM*</td>
<td>.03191</td>
<td>.12063</td>
<td>.994</td>
<td>.3433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television</td>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>.00010</td>
<td>.07417</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>-.1914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>.28464*</td>
<td>.08598</td>
<td>.006</td>
<td>.0627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM*</td>
<td>.03182</td>
<td>.12341</td>
<td>.994</td>
<td>.3504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>-.28454*</td>
<td>.08194</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>-.4960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Television</td>
<td>-.28464*</td>
<td>.08598</td>
<td>.006</td>
<td>-.5066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM*</td>
<td>-.31646</td>
<td>.12823</td>
<td>.067</td>
<td>-.6475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOM</td>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>.03191</td>
<td>.12063</td>
<td>.994</td>
<td>-.2795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Television</td>
<td>.03182</td>
<td>.12341</td>
<td>.994</td>
<td>-.2867</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>.31646</td>
<td>.12823</td>
<td>.067</td>
<td>-.0145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level.

* WOM stand for words of mouth, used for interpersonal communication
Multiple comparisons test shows as to which type of media is more successful in promoting awareness regarding women rights. A significant difference has been found between print media and social media and similarly between social media and electronic media.

ANOVA analysis indicates statistical difference (p=.003) between print and social media in terms of promoting awareness about women rights. Similarly, significant relationship (p=.006) has been found between television and social media. However, insignificant difference (p=1.000) has been found between television and newspapers as well as TV and WOM (p=.994) (see Table 1.1).

Table 2 gives the results of One-way ANOVA in which level of women rights has been checked against academic qualification of the respondents. Results indicate that there is significant relationship between both variables. Table 2 shows output of ANOVA analysis and describes the statistical difference exists between the groups. The significance level is 0.000 (p=.000), which is below 0.05. It means that there is statistically significant difference in the mean of various education groups. Data describes that education is an important variable that determines the level of women rights awareness amongst people. Value of mean varies in different categories i.e. M= 1.5769 for under matriculation, M= 1.6500 for Matric to Bachelors and M= 2.1058 for postgraduates and above. Results of ANOVA test indicate (F= 22.244, p=.000).

### Table 2

**Descriptive (ANOVA) analysis of education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</th>
<th>Lower Bound</th>
<th>Upper Bound</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>ANOVA</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under Matric</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1.5769</td>
<td>.57210</td>
<td>.07934</td>
<td>1.4176 to 1.7362</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22.244</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matric-Bachelor</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1.6500</td>
<td>.58756</td>
<td>.06193</td>
<td>1.5269 to 1.7731</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-grad-Above</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>2.1058</td>
<td>.51861</td>
<td>.03596</td>
<td>2.0349 to 2.1767</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>358</td>
<td>1.9078</td>
<td>.59281</td>
<td>.03133</td>
<td>1.8462 to 1.9694</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Multiple comparisons (ANOVA) analysis of education

Table 2.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Multiple Comparisons</th>
<th>Tukey HSD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(I) D3 Education</td>
<td>(J) D3 Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under Matriculation</td>
<td>Matriculation-Bachelor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post graduation and Above</td>
<td>Under Matriculation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduation and Above</td>
<td>Matriculation-Bachelor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under Matriculation</td>
<td>Under Matriculation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matriculation-Bachelor</td>
<td>Post graduation and Above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduation and Above</td>
<td>Matriculation-Bachelor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*. The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level.

Multiple comparisons test has been applied to the data collected from sample. Table 2.1 shows the difference between the groups. ANOVA analysis shows that there is statistical difference in relationship between awareness of women rights in under matriculation and post-graduation and above (p= .000), as well as matriculation-Bachelor and post-graduation and above (p= .000). However, no significant difference has been found between under-matriculation and Matriculation-Bachelor (p= .869).

Table 3
Descriptive (ANOVA) analysis of income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</th>
<th>Min.</th>
<th>Max.</th>
<th>ANOVA F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Income (In Rs.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
<td>Upper Bound</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-49000</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>1.8738</td>
<td>.60520</td>
<td>.05963</td>
<td>1.7555</td>
<td>1.9921</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>3.857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50000-99900</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>1.8012</td>
<td>.61456</td>
<td>.06746</td>
<td>1.6670</td>
<td>1.9354</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100000-149000</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>1.8436</td>
<td>.54126</td>
<td>.06564</td>
<td>1.7146</td>
<td>1.9766</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150000 and above</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>2.0673</td>
<td>.57055</td>
<td>.05595</td>
<td>1.9564</td>
<td>2.1783</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>358</td>
<td>1.9078</td>
<td>.59281</td>
<td>.03133</td>
<td>1.8462</td>
<td>1.9694</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
One-way ANOVA was applied to the data collected from sample of people belonged to different socio-economic backgrounds. Results show that socio-economic background has significant impact on the level of awareness about women rights. Table 2 shows that output of ANOVA analysis and describes that statistical difference exists between the groups. The significance level is 0.01 (p = .01), which is below 0.05. Therefore there is statistically significant difference in the mean of different income groups. Thus, data describes that income level is another important variable, which determines the level of women rights awareness among people. Table (2) shows that there is difference between the mean value of categories with high and low income i.e. M= 1.8738 for respondents with 0 to 49000 income and M= 2.0673 for respondents with income 150000 and above income. There is difference (M= .1935) in means of both categories. Results of ANOVA test indicate (F= 3.857, p = .010).

Table: 3.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Multiple Comparisons (ANOVA) analysis of income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tukey HSD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(I) D4 Monthly Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(J) D4 Monthly Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean Difference (I-J)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Bound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-49000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50000-99000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.07258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.08641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.1505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.2956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100000-149000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.02820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.09154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.2081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.2645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150000 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.19352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.08144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.084</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.4037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.0167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50000-99000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-49000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.07258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.08641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.2956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.1505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100000-149000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.04438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.09582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.2917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.2030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150000 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.26610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.08622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.4887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.0435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100000-149000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-49000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.02820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.09154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.2645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.2081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50000-99000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.04438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.09582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.2030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.2917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150000 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.22172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.09136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.4575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.0141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150000 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-49000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.19352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.08144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.084</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.0167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.4037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50000-99000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.26610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.08622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.0435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.4887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100000-149000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.22172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.09136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-.0141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.4575</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*. The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level.

Multiple comparisons test has been applied to the data collected from sample, which shows the difference between the groups. ANOVA analysis shows that there is statistical difference among relationship between awareness of women rights in people with 50000-99000 income and 150000 and above income (p = .01). There is no significant difference between people with income between 0-49000 and 50000-99000 (p = .835), as well as 0-49000 and 100000-149000 (p = .990). The results show that there is significant difference between low-income and high-income groups about the awareness of women rights (see Table 3.1).
H1: Pakistani newspapers promotes more awareness among public about women rights as compared to social media

Multiple comparisons show statistically significant difference ($p = .003$) between both categories. Mean value of newspapers (M= 1.9681, SD= .57698) has been found higher than social media (M= 1.6835, SD= .54993), which means that print media brings more awareness about women rights as compared to social media. Results of ANOVA indicate that $F=5.025$, $p = .002$ (see Table 1 & 1.1).

H2: Pakistani TV Channels promote more awareness among public about women rights as compared to social media

Multiple comparisons show statistically significant difference ($p = .006$) between both categories. Mean value of television (M= 1.9682, SD= .60304) has been found higher than social media (M= 1.6835, SD= .54993), which means that television brings more awareness about women rights as compared to social media (see Table 1 & 1.1).

H3: Interpersonal communication is more effective in disseminating awareness about women rights as compared to mass media in Pakistan

Descriptive results of different types of media show that mean value of Interpersonal communication (M= 2.0000, SD= .62361) is higher as compared to newspapers (M= 1.9681, SD= .57698), television (M= 1.9682, SD= .60304) and social media (M= 1.6835, SD= .54993). It means that interpersonal communication is more effective in generating awareness about women rights as compared to other mediums (see Table 1 & 1.1).

H4: Demographics has a significant relationship with awareness about women rights

It has been found that education is another important variable to determine the level of women rights awareness among people. Multiple comparisons show statistically significant relationship ($p = .000$) among awareness of women rights in under matriculation (M= 1.5769), and up to bachelors (M= 1.6500) and post-graduation and above students (M= 2.1058). It means that people with low level of education are less aware of women rights as compared to the people with high-level of education. Results of ANOVA test show that $F=22.244$, $p = .000$ (see Table 2 & 2.1).

Similarly, results have shown that socioeconomic status (i.e. income) is one of the significant variables in determining the level of women right awareness amongst people. Table 3 shows significant difference (M= .19352) in mean value of high-income (M=...
2.0673) and low-income (M=1.8738) categories. It means that people with low-income has less women rights awareness as compared to high-income people. Results of ANOVA test indicate F=3.857, P=.010 (see Table 3 & 3.1).

**Conclusions**

Findings of the study show that these three mediums (i.e. television, newspapers and social media) play important role in promoting awareness regarding women rights. However traditional media (i.e. TV and newspapers) has been found to play more important role in creating public awareness about women rights as compared to new media (i.e. social media). Exceptionally, interpersonal communication has been found to be more functional to promoting awareness about women rights compared to traditional and new media.

Thus according to our results, Pakistani people consider interpersonal communication more vigorous to addressing women issues and to educating people about women rights. It is also found that although, globally, social media is considered one of important avenues for creating awareness among masses about certain issue, however, results of the study indicate that in Pakistani society social media is not an effective tool as compared to traditional media. Furthermore, socioeconomic status has been discovered one of significant variables to determine the level of awareness about women rights in public. Thus it has been learned that people with high-level of education and/or income are more aware of the women rights compared to the people with low-level of education and/or income.

At the end, it may be said that media play an important role in creating awareness about women rights and awareness may be promoted among general public through its content and subsequently attitude of people may be transformed gradually towards women rights and their status in the society. It is also deduced that even in the presence of new media, traditional media has its own importance in Pakistani society. Thus all types of media along with interpersonal communication may be utilized to promote awareness among people of Pakistan about the women rights.

**References**

Altalebi, L. (2016). Saudis Take to Social Media with Campaign Supporting Women's Right to Drive in the kingdom.


Concern WorldWide (2013). Women’s Rights: How can we ensure that all women have equal access to their rights? *Global concern classroom, U.S.A.*


Lubna Zaheer is an Assistant Professor in the Institute of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore.

Amber Mubeen is a Ph.D Scholar in the Institute of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore.
Attitude Towards Acceptability Of The Girl Child In Families Belonging To Upper And Lower Socio-Economic Class

Muhammad Athar Hussain
Department of Education
The Islamia University of Bahawalpur

Imtiaz Ahmad
Department of Teacher Education
University of Karachi

Amber Qadar
Department of Management Sciences
The Islamia University of Bahawalpur

Abstract

The present study was an attempt made to determine the discrimination as practised against the girl child and as expressed through the attitudes of girl children themselves and their parents. In order to test the hypotheses, an A x B factorial design (A denoting subjects and B socioeconomic status) with each variable at two levels: girls and mothers, and upper and lower class areas, respectively and 50 replicates in each cell (N=200), was employed to study the differences on the main effects and their interaction. One hundred girls ranging from seven to 13 years of age and those having brothers were selected along with their mothers. Their responses were obtained on the two Attitude Scales (one meant for the girl child and the other for the parent) having fairly high test-retest reliability and criterion-related validity. These responses were verified by an interview of the subjects taken later on. The attitude scores of subjects, computed as per standard procedure, were subjected to statistical tests to determine differences in discrimination. The results showed the F-ratio calculated for the main effect ‘girls and their mothers’ and ‘upper and lower class’ to be highly significant.

Keywords: Acceptance, Attitude, Girl Child, Socio-Economic Status, Families.
Introduction

Perception Regarding the Birth of a Girl Child

Most of the underdeveloped and developing countries nurture bias against females. To reorient the social attitude and government policies, the year 1990 was declared the 'Year of Girl Child' for the SAARC countries indicating that the girl children in these countries faced problems in addition to the problems faced by children in general. The year 1990 for the Girl Child was followed by the SAARC decade (Ghosh, 1990).

The problems of girls in Pakistan and other SAARC countries are not only the problems of the privations of poverty and general issues associated with conditions in the developing countries, but they refer to situations rising from their being girls (Munir & Neman, 2013). The Pakistani society, despite being divided on the basis of baradari, wealth and region, universally regards the birth of the girl child as unwelcome. On the contrary, the birth of a male child is celebrated with sweets, music and gaiety. He is looked upon as a saviour on whom the parents will be able to lean in their old age, the one who will perform their last rites and carry the family through ages (Ashiq, Azeem, Shazia & Azra, 2011).

The girl child faces many odds in her struggle for survival, caught in a maze of cultural practices and prejudices that strip her of individuality and mould her into a submissive, self-sacrificing daughter and then a mother. Her labour as an important contributor to the family income either as a domestic worker, an agricultural hand, or a caretaker for her

---

1 Baradari means ‘Brotherhood’ originating from the Persian word Baradar meaning "Brother". In Pakistan it is used to denote a number of social strata.
younger siblings, robs her not only of her childhood, but also her innocence, making her ignorant and weak in the process (Ambreen & Mohyuddin, 2013).

Shabbir et al. (2003) indicated that “the girl child's perception of herself and her role is conditioned by her early socialization, a process which eventually moulds her into the stereotyped prisoner of her gender.” They further explained the situation as:

“At each and every step of life, the girl follows her mother. She sees her mother working through sickness and pain and suffering ill health without complaining. She also sees her mother subsisting on leftovers and she learns to do the same. Told to talk, softly and dress modestly, the girl child gradually acquires the qualities of submissiveness, meekness and self-sacrifice which allow her to accept the domination of male oriented values. Whatever she acquires from her family and especially from mother, she tries to transmit all this to her daughter (p. 306).”

The root of the problem of discriminatory treatment being meted out to girls lies in the status of women in society and their expected roles. Girls are socialized into docility, blind obedience and total dependence. This situation prevalent at home is reinforced by the society. Socializing the girls from their childhood to accept their status and the ideology of male supremacy assures continuance of the discriminatory treatment.

Afzal (2000) interviewed girl child parents for the child-rearing practices and the parental attitudes towards the observed children. A significant discrimination was found in the parental attitudes towards the girl child. The parents genuinely believed that girls should not be treated the same way as boys, and they have to be trained for their difficult adult role as wives and mothers. Some common explanations given for the differential treatment were that the sons carry the family name that one can stay with them in old age and that girls are the other's property.

A somewhat similar study was conducted by Rafiq (2000) on 200 respondents. It revealed that the mother's child - rearing practices overall as well as in three aspects: independence, motivation and social mobilization, as perceived by girl children, were significantly poorer than boy children. But no significant differences were found between the perceptions of the child -rearing practices of rural and urban children.

A few studies are related with the different child-rearing practices for the boys and girls. Mumtaz and Shaheed (1987) point out that there is differential socialization of girls and boys with greater emphasis on achievement, competence, independence and assumption of responsibilities in sons and in interpersonal relations in daughters. Rukshanda (2005) reported that fathers encouraged boys in mathematics and girls in interpersonal skills. Chaudhary, Chani and Pervaiz (2012) also observed that boys are encouraged in risk-
taking, freedom, independence and are left unsupervised in younger ages; while girls are 
encouraged for cultural conformity and dependency. Akhter (2011) observed that family, 
society and culture play a major role in socialization and development of sex roles.

Studies mentioned above indicate that the girls in the Indian society face discrimination 
in their early childhood as well as later life. Obviously, there is still a long way to go 
before both society and parents accept that girls have the equal rights to those of boys.

It is therefore true that, in Pakistan, the family structure and values function in such a way 
that the daughters grow up looking upon themselves as inferior and subservient, entitled 
to much less of everything than sons: less opportunity, less authority, less property, low 
status, less power and virtually no choices.

Dwelling on the problem of bias towards the girl child, the present study was undertaken 
to determine the discrimination- against the girl child as expressed through attitudes of 
girl children themselves and their parents (Aware Girls, Young Feminists Movement & 
Mamacash, 2014).

Attitudes being the ways by which people organize and categorize their information and 
feelings on various matters, an attempt was made to gauge the attitudes of girls and their 
parents regarding the rearing of girls versus boys. In other words, it was sought to 
determine the social status of girls especially as prevailing at home.

By means of conducting the present study as a public opinion survey, the investigator 
sought to indirectly create public awareness towards the rights of the girl children. Of 
course, highlighting the attitudes towards the girl child amounted to implicitly changing 
the negative or discriminatory attitudes towards her as prevalent in household and society 
at large.

**Methodology**

*Problem and Hypotheses*

As the study entailed approaching the girl children to determine what they think about 
themselves in view of their parents' attitude towards them, an impressionable age-group 
of female children was selected in order to get genuine and honest responses. Similarly, 
to lend authenticity to responses, efforts were made to study the attitudes of parents 
towards their female children vis-a-vis male children. Also, as the discrimination and bias 
may be found to be more in lower class than upper class due to the lower social 
awareness of residents and general environmental conditions, the sample was taken from 
both the socio-economic statuses to present a realistic picture. Care was taken to
generalize the data by including families engaged in different occupations and those having different economic status.

The present research was conducted under the following two hypotheses:

1. Girl would report more discrimination against the girl child than what their parents would report.

2. Girls and their parents from the lower socioeconomic status would report more discrimination against the girl child than those from the upper class families.

**Design**

An AxB factorial design, A (Subjects) denoting the two levels of girls and their parents and B(SES) denoting the two groups, with 50 replicates in each cell (N=200), was employed to determine the differences on the main effects and their interaction. The design in the tabular form is given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B Socioeconomic Status</th>
<th>A (Subjects)</th>
<th>Parents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A1B1</td>
<td>A2B1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls Belong to Upper Class = 50</td>
<td>Upper Class 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents Belong to Upper Class = 50</td>
<td>Lower Class 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A1B2</td>
<td>A2B2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls Belong to Upper Class = 50</td>
<td>Lower Class 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents Belong to Upper Class = 50</td>
<td>Upper Class 50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sample**

One hundred girls ranging from seven to 13 years of age and those having brothers were randomly selected as subjects in equal number from both the lower as well as upper SES groups. In addition to girls, their parents (mostly mothers) were also approached for their responses. As originally planned, the study also envisaged the interview of fathers of girls for ascertaining their attitudes towards the girl child, but they, being preoccupied with jobs or business, could hardly be contacted during day time. Despite this, the investigator did succeed in contacting and obtaining responses from twelve fathers (ten from upper class and two from lower class) on holidays. However, this sample, being insufficient, was not taken into account in the present study and responses only from mothers were considered.
As the study required genuine responses to a sensitive issue, female children falling within the age-group of seven to thirteen years were chosen as subjects. The said age group seemed to have an advantage of excluding children below the age of seven years who could not properly express their attitudes as well as those above the age of thirteen years who could project their feelings in a distorted manner. In view of the delicate age-group chosen, an affectionate rapport was established with the young subjects that were further strengthened by the offer/provision of incentives in some cases.

Subject to the basic requirement of girls having brothers, care was taken to ensure random selection of subjects by means of covering all lanes or mohallas of town and also including a sufficient number of slum areas in the sample. Care was also taken to study families engaged in different occupations. The sample of parents also constituted working and non-working mothers.

**Apparatuses**

Two Attitudes Scales, one for girls and the other for their parents, each scale consisting of five statements of questions were used in order to obtain attitudinal responses of girls and their mothers who endorsed ( ) the statements in terms of ' Yes ' or ' No ' or certain choice responses.

The selected statements or questions represented real life situations. An attempt was made to include in the scales almost every major aspect of child-rearing in respect of which discrimination and bias between the male and female children could be reported. Such aspects as household work, nutrition, sharing love and affection, educating children, fulfilling their needs and desires, and belief in old customs and traditions in general were sought to be studied.

After selecting the statements, they were given to four judges for evaluating whether the same could obtain appropriate responses from subjects. The judges generally belonged to the fields of psychology and education. A graduate housewife and a working lady also judged the statements. The modifications as suggested by judges were incorporated, as far as possible, in the finalized format.

The selected statements were tried out in the case of six or seven children who, along with their mothers, responded to the issues raised therein. The questionnaire approach was supplemented by the interview of respondents so as to get reliable information. After having verified the practicability of the selected items, the final data were gathered.

In the case of both the Attitude scales, the test-retest reliability was determined. A part of the total sample i.e. 25 girls and their mothers, drawn from upper class (N=15) and lower
class (N=10) areas was tested and retested on the different scales after a period of approximately three months. The reliability correlation coefficients were found to be 0.95 in the case of girls and 0.90 in the case of mothers, both significant beyond the .01 level.

The criterion-related validity of the Attitude Scales was also determined. For this purpose, opinions about subjects relating to the original statements constituting the two Attitude Scales were sought from the 25 peers (16 from upper class and nine from lower class), one peer for each of the 25 girl children and their mothers. These peers were those persons who kept in close contact with the respective subjects. They constituted family members, friends and neighbours of the subjects. Using the original scoring system for their answers, their scores were correlated with those of the subjects and product moment correlation was computed between the two sets of scores. The criterion-related validity coefficient of correlation was found to be 0.78 in the case of girls and 0.54 in the case of mothers, both significant beyond the .01 level.

**Procedure**

The subjects were approached individually and their responses were obtained after establishing rapport with them and clarifying their doubts, if any. In addition to specific answers, details of their views were sought from them.

After having obtained the responses; the same were scored. In the case of girls, their responses which reflected no discrimination against the girl child or even favoured her over the brother, were each given a score of three (3), the responses that reflected an equal favour for the girl and her brother, were given a score of two (2), and the responses which reflected the discrimination against the girl child and favour for the brother, were given a score of one (1). In the case of parents, their responses reflecting discrimination against the girl child were given a score of (1) and those showing no discrimination were given a score of three (3). The scoring system was so devised as to maintain the uniformity between the scores of girls and their parents' responses. Thus, the maximum score and the minimum score could be fifteen (15) and five (5), respectively, in both the cases.

Following further the criterion of uniformity, the ranges of scores for the responses of the girl children and their parents were determined as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table: 1</th>
<th>Range of scores for the responses of the girl children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discriminated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 – 5</td>
<td>6 – 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The 'moderate' category devised for the girl children implicitly corresponded to the
moderate category in the case of the parents as it contained scores from 6 to 10.

Using the aforesaid scoring systems, scores of upper class and lower class, and
simultaneously mothers were determined (for upper class girls, M = 8.28, S.D. = 7.63 ;
for lower class girls, M = 7.6, SD = 11.65. For upper class mothers, M = 14.08, S.N).
2.23; and for lower class mothers, M = 10.88, S.D. = 10.67).

Findings and Discussion

The present study intended to determine the attitudes towards the girl child, employed the
analysis of variance technique to determine the differences and the interaction between
the main effects (Subjects and SES). The results are shown below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S #</th>
<th>Source of Variance</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A (Subjects)</td>
<td>1030.58</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1030.58</td>
<td>252 .16</td>
<td>&lt; .01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B (Socioeconomic Class)</td>
<td>188.18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>188.18</td>
<td>46 .04</td>
<td>&lt; .01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>A X B (Subjects X SES)</td>
<td>79.38</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>79.38</td>
<td>19 .42</td>
<td>&lt; .01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Error: Within treatment</td>
<td>801.04</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2099.18</td>
<td>199</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 reveals that the F ratios obtained for the main effects of A (Subjects) and B (SES)
are highly significant (for A, F = 252.16, df = 1/196, p<.01; for B, F = 46.04, df =. 1/196, 
p<.01). The interaction between the main effects was also found to be highly significantly
(for A X B, F = 19.42, df = 1/196, p<.01).
The results explain that there is a clear-cut difference between the attitudes of girls and their mothers. The girls reported more discrimination against themselves as practiced by their mothers than did their mothers. The lower mean attitude score for the both SES groups’ girls combined i.e. 7.94 than that for the mothers i.e. 12.48 also shows that the girls expressed significantly more discrimination toward themselves than did their mothers. These results are in line with the first hypothesis stated earlier.

Shahid et al. (2013) in their study noticed discrimination in the parental attitudes toward the daughters. The parents genuinely believed that girls should not be treated the same way as boys as the sons carry the family name, one can stay with the son in old age, whereas the girls are the other's property. In the present study, majority of the parents belongs to the upper as well as the lower socioeconomic classes were also found to believe the same when they were individually interviewed.

The F ratio for the main effect B i.e. the sample belongs to the both upper and lower SES was also found to be significant beyond the .01 level. This explains that the urban Ss (girls and their mothers) differed in terms of discrimination scores from the rural Ss. The mean score of the upper class sample (girls and mothers) was found to be 11.8 and the mean score for the lower class sample was 9.24. This again indicates that the discrimination in the upper SES was much less in comparison to discrimination in the lower SES where it was reported to a greater extent by both the girls and their mothers. The significant difference confirms the second hypothesis as mentioned earlier. These results are supported by the study by Shahid et al. (2013) and Singh & Prabhakar (1991) who reported that there were significant differences in the attitude towards the girl child between the upper and lower class subjects.

The interaction between the A and B main effects was found to be significant. This implies an interdependent relationship between the subjects and the areas. In other words, it means that the difference between the responses of A₁ (girls) and those of A₂ (mothers) is not independent of the levels of the effect B i.e. upper and lower socioeconomic statuses.

Apart from the main effects being analyzed by analysis of variance, individual responses were also analyzed by means of chi-square analyses. These analyses merely indicated differences and, at best, supplemented, in part, the results already obtained through the analysis of variance. The results are given in Table 4.
Table: 4
Chi-square analyses for frequencies of responses of girl children and their mothers from upper and lower socio-economic statuses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S #</th>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Response Categories</th>
<th>X^2</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Discriminated</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Girls (N=100)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>85.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mothers (N=100)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>2 &lt;.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Upper Class Girls (N=50)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Class Girls (N=50)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>23.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Upper Class Mothers (N=50)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>23.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Class Mothers (N=50)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>65.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Upper Class Girls (N=50)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>65.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Upper Class Mothers (N=50)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>65.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Lower Class Girls (N=50)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>32.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Class Mothers (N=50)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>32.16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To begin with, a small part of the girl children's sample i.e. five Ss reported that they were discriminated whereas only two mothers reported such discrimination. A larger portion of the sample of girl children (N=82) reported that they were moderately discriminated by their parents. They felt discriminated due to different childrearing practices adopted for them by their parents, especially mothers, who were evidently more generous towards their sons rather than daughters. On the other hand, only 20 mothers reported that they had a moderate discriminatory attitude towards their daughters and were more inclined to their sons.

It may be noted that the discriminatory attitude towards the girl child still exists whether it is the upper class or the lower socioeconomic class, although the parents of the girls from both the SESs mostly deny this. But on the basis of the reports of the girls children...
it can be said so as out of the total 100 girls children, 87 reported themselves to be discriminated against (five reported discrimination and 82 moderate discrimination). The chi-square analysis for this comparison was found to be significant beyond the .01 level. This lends some support to the first hypothesis.

This finding resembles, in part, the one obtained by Rai (1991) who studied the child-rearing practices of mothers as perceived by boys and girls. It was found that the girl child was less acceptable to the mother in comparison to the male child as per child-rearing practices.

When scores of the upper and lower class girls (Table 4) were compared, it was found that five upper class girls reported that they were discriminated whereas no lower class girl so reported. The reason for that may be that, in the present study, all lower class girl children (except one) were found to be getting education. Education being a criterion of non-discrimination, no lower class girl could be said to be discriminated against. The one girl belong to this group who was not studying was herself not willing to study, as was found when she was personally interviewed. She was not compelled by her parents to stay at home. In the upper class area also, all the girl children were found to be getting education when they were individually assessed. However, discrimination against them was found in respect of birthday celebration. It was found that, mostly their sons' birthday was celebrated more enthusiastically by their parents. Majority of the girls also reported that they were not allowed to remain cut of their homes for a long period. They could not go to the market alone, especially at odd hours.

Out of the 50 lower class girls, 46 reported moderate discrimination towards themselves. Although a sizable sample of upper class girls i.e. 36 also felt the same, yet their number is less than that of the lower class sample. The results explain that the people are still caught in the web of socio-cultural traditions and customs. It is more evident in the lower class families than in the upper class families. They consider girls as a burden and sons as the caretakers of their old age. A small part of the upper class (9) and the lower class (4) sample of girls reported that they were not discriminated. They were cared for, attended to and loved by their parents as were their brothers. A few girls even reported during interview that they were better cared for and loved by their parents as compared to brothers. In view of the total, girls' responses indicating moderate discrimination, it can be pointed out that the lower class girls are more discriminated against than the upper class girls. The significant value (p<.02) partly confirms the second hypothesis mentioned earlier.

The samples of the mothers of both upper and lower socioeconomic class were also compared. It was found that no upper class mother reported that she discriminated against her daughter and only two lower class mothers agreed to be discriminatory. Only one
upper class mother accepted that she discriminated moderately against her daughter; whereas 19 lower class mothers accepted the game. On the other hand, the larger portion of the upper class sample i.e. 49 mothers completely denied the fact that they ever discriminated against their daughters whereas 29 lower class mothers did so. Statistically, a significant chi-square strongly confirms the second hypothesis. The upper class mothers did not express their discriminatory attitude against their daughters perhaps due to their sophistication in maintaining double standards. The acceptance of discrimination by the lower class mothers may be due to their innocence. In any case, they did not attach much importance to the issue of discrimination between the boy and the girl child due to their belief in the old traditions.

In a comparison made between the responses of the upper class girls and their mothers, five girls reported that they were discriminated against, but no mother reported so. Out of the 50 upper class girls, 36 expressed that their parents did have clear-cut preferences for their brothers and they were at least moderately discriminated against. However, with the exception of one mother, 49 mothers denied any discrimination at all. Nine girls also reported that they were not discriminated against. This analysis was also found to be significant at the .01 level which again confirms the first hypothesis in part.

A somewhat different result was obtained when the scores of the lower class girls and their mothers were compared. Surprisingly, no girl reported that she was discriminated, whereas two mothers reported such discrimination. Upon interviewing the girls, it was found that both of them belonged to very poor families and had four to five sisters but only one brother. So, their parents considered them as a burden on the family and favoured their only sons. The girls apparently did not report out of inhibition. Forty-six lower class girls reported themselves as being moderately discriminated against whereas only 19 mothers accepted this. Twenty nine mothers disagreed that they ever discriminated against their daughters and four girl children also reported that they were not discriminated. However, on the whole, the results bear out the second hypothesis, the chi-square being significant at the .01 level.

Conclusions

The investigator found that the girl children did get discriminated against in their families, more so in the lower class setting. It goes without saying that an integrated and holistic approach to the girl child's development is essential for the creation of a new environment in which she can be valued and nurtured. The search for new and bold efforts to give the girl child her due, to allow her to evolve to her full potential involves a process of social mobilization that will make her everyone's concern. Every effort should be made to remove the disparities under which the girl child is born and grows up if she is to be taken out of the maze of neglect in which she has been lost for centuries.
References


Aware Girls and Young Feminists Movement in Collaboration with Mamacash (February- 2014). Survey on the Perceptions and Attitudes of People Towards Domestic Abuse in Pakistan.


Dr. Muhammad Athar Hussain is Lecturer in the Department of Education, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalpur.

Dr. Imtiaz Ahmad is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Teacher Education, University of Karachi.

Amber Qadar is Lecturer in the Department of Management Sciences, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalpur.
Exploring The Link Between Women Economic Empowerment And Energy Conservation

Musarrat Jabeen
Faculty of Contemporary Studies
National Defense University

Saima Bibi
Department of Development Studies
COMSATS Institute of Information Technology

Awais Ali Shah
Department of Electrical Engineering
COMSATS Institute of Information Technology

Abstract

Women and energy conservation strategies purport earning, borrowing or the skills for energy conservation. The datasets for household energy management do not identify the grant of economic decision making to women delegate households by the earning men households as an entry point to initiate and encourage the healthy mindsets for energy conservation. The objective of this study is to explore the link between economic decision making and the women economic empowerment for energy conservation and to assess the energy conservation trends among the economically empowered women. Delphi focused proved 70% correlation between energy women economic empowerment based on economic decision making and energy conservation. The energy conservation trends found positive 80.20% and negative 19.80% in economically empowered women, positive 55.80% and negative 44.20% in not economically empowered women. The study suggests that the economic decision making is a significant tool for women economic empowerment; and women economic empowerment does not depend only on the facts that women earn, have micro finance loans or skills to manage or produce energy. The study is a contribution to organize civil society to conserve energy for sustainable societies and cities.

Keywords: Women’s Economic Empowerment, Energy, Conservation, Pakistan.

تلميح

تلاخيص

لتحقيق تعلق قطاعات النساء في تدفق النشاطات، وإنجاح النساء في轉换 وإنتاج الطاقة، نجد أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أن النساء في الفناداتقية كما تم التعرف على أنه Delphi
Introduction

Studies have shown strong correlations between energy, sustained economic growth, and human welfare, underscoring the need for energy security. Concerns for environment have added new pressures on energy users for the sustainable use of energy. Jackson (2006) states that all countries in the world are vying with each other to secure their energy supplies from known sources of traditional energy and also discover new, cheaper and sustainable sources of energy. Since 2006 in Pakistan on average, the demand supply deficit was around 5,000 MW it touched the peak of over 7,000 megawatt (MW) July 2014. Out of 67 Million Tonnes of Oil Equivalent (MTOE) of total primary energy mix for 2013-14, 46.4 per cent share is of natural gas, 35 per cent oil, 11.4 per cent hydro, 5.4 per cent coal and 02 per cent nuclear (Ministry of Planning and Development, 2014).

Disproportionate reliance on the imported oil, that is, 85 per cent of the total oil supply, is exerting a strain on the balance of payments besides making the energy mix unfavorable. Due to controversies about major dams e.g. Kalabagh dam Pakistan harnesses only 6750 MW (11.25 per cent) out of its hydro potential of about 60,000 MWs. Thermal power is relied upon natural gas, expensive furnace oil and high speed diesel oil in the electricity generation, adversely affecting its affordability in due course. Danish (2014) commented, “Pakistan is mired in an acute energy crisis with immense implications for both the nation’s floundering economy and its volatile security situation.” Energy shortages have cost the country up to 4% of gross domestic product (GDP) over the past few years causing the shutdown of industry and impeding the investments in development and infrastructure (Pakistan Economic Survey, 2010-11). In 2005, the Energy Security Action Plan (2005-2030) was approved to meet the requirements of Pakistan’s Vision 2030 for reliable and quality energy supplies. The main objective of the plan was to enhance energy supply through an optimal mix of all resources including hydropower, oil, gas, coal, nuclear and renewable energy such as wind and solar. Conventional energy policies have tended to focus on energy supply, with little attention to manage the demand for energy. It is imperative to establish institutions and stipulate mechanisms and procedures for effective conservation and efficient use of energy in Pakistan (The Pakistan Energy Efficiency & Conservation Act, 2014). In Pakistan the lapses in energy management systems at all levels are correlated to un-thoughtful decisions and practices at national-
provincial-district levels due to its centralized wisdom and concentrating more on the supply side. Rationale of this study rests with demand management by applying the idea of energy conservation through women economic empowerment.

**Energy Conservation**

Saving energy, increasing efficiency leads to reduce energy consumption. The drivers of energy conservation are: to care for the society and future generations, and money saving through less energy bill. Conservation helps us to mitigate the adverse impacts associated with energy production and consumption. These include air pollution, acid rain and global warming, oil spills and water pollution, loss of wilderness areas, construction of new power plants, foreign energy dependence and the risk of international conflict over energy supplies. Energy conservation extends the lifetime of equipment and reduces the maintenance cost by operating in less maximum capacity.

Energy conservation depends on style of energy use as it is used invisibly. The energy systems are complex regarding daily practices. In social terms the system is also limited in terms of appliances over which it is based. The energy systems continuously use gas or electricity until stopped manually or by automatic control set by human factor. Comparatively the energy conservation regarding these systems is difficult as the use of liquid or solid fuels is finite as it can be seen, weighed or poured. The energy systems at domestic level involve many factors; infrastructure, social norms, comfort level and the control options. (Lutzenhiser, 1993; Shove, 2003; Bugess and Nye, 2008) establish in their studies the importance of factors are normally within the control of households. The frequent highlights in this regard are the daily routines and practices, comfort standards and expectations.

Wilhite (2008) concluded the study, “Combined roles of knowledge, routines, and technology influence the energy use actions. The energy conservation interventions are specific to time and space and they cannot be applied universally. The evidences suggest we may not conserve energy with the application of technology and economic factors alone the sociological and cultural factors drive the energy system as well.”

**Women Economic Empowerment**

The literature bearing the thought of energy and women economic empowerment propose the two ideas; first is that how much the energy services are available to women and the second is economic status of women determines the type and style of energy use. Cecelski, (2008) studied that the reduction and eventual eradication of poverty is tied to access to modern energy services; because the household activities like cooking, heating, lighting, and irrigation depend on energy. It is found that income plays significant role in energy consumption and conservation patterns. The higher income earning households
more convenient and efficient sources of energy and people with less income use less efficient and less convenient sources of fuel wood.

Economic behavior depends on social and financial prompts and effects the energy use practices (Schultz et al, 2008). Energy consumption is inelastic as it is relevant to inelastic energy demand e.g., energy demand for transportation to approach the education and health services, and to live in though weather conditions; but social systems of household economy affect the energy utilization system as well. The energy conservation related practices depend on decision to investment in energy efficient measures in home (Lutzenhiser, 2002). Fischer, in her 2008 energy conservation review highlighted the features of interaction and choice for households based on economic factors for energy conservation.

Saline (2012) argues regarding economic empowerment, “Both the ability to succeed and advance economically and the power to make and act on economic decisions.” The study bends to social psychology to establish the working definition of women economic empowerment in conservation perspective of self and the society (see Box 1). In this study the ability of delegate women households in making and acting the economic decisions depends on the decision making power granted by the male earning households.

**Box 1 - Conservation and social value orientation.**

Source: Murphy, (2011)

“In social psychology, social value orientation (SVO) is a person's preference about how to allocate resources (e.g. money) between the self and another person. SVO corresponds to how much weight a person attaches to the welfare of others in relation to the own. Social value includes social capital as well as the subjective aspects of the citizens' well-being, such as their ability to participate in making decisions that affect them.”

**Link between Women Economic Empowerment and Energy Conservation**

There exists a link between energy conservation and women economic empowerment. Women with the decision power regarding finances will utilize the energy more economically than the other women without this power. Women with control in running house expenditures will try to limit expenditures through economic utilization of energy by making the others to do the same. Human activities are identified as crucial aspect while aiming to reduce energy demand. Consumption can be seen as the part of human activity that spends energy (Daly, 1996). Energy consumption is unavoidable (Korsunova, 2010). Consumption can be distinguished in two domains. One relates consumer behavior to the context and infrastructure emphasizing physical assets, taxation and pricing policies, technological innovations etc. The second reduces consumer behavior to be the end of psychological and social drivers (Mont and Power, 2009). The energy system can be considered as socio-technical system focusing on operating conditions, actor
dependencies and organizational aspects (Jonsson et al., 2011). The combination of purchase and product-use decisions is crucial (Princen, 2006). Gynther et al. (2011) argue in this context that 90% of energy-related behavior is habitual driven by attitudes and contextual factors. Literature is scarce on energy conservation efforts directed at household level. The latent incentives like the economic empowerment without earning as social construct for energy conservation is nominal. Literature provides a grey area in respect of delegate women’s role in energy conservation with and without economic empowerment. The broader objective of the study is to contribute innovative social capital into energy conservation societal strategic planning. The specific objectives are as follows:

1. To identify the correlation between economic decision making and women economic empowerment for energy conservation in women delegate households.
2. To assess the level of energy conservation drivers and activities in women delegate households.

The measureable items are: the income of the population, the existing level of thinking to conserve energy for state, society, future generations, and for the less energy bill under the caption of drivers for energy conservation; opting warm clothing, harvesting sun energy, purchasing and using energy efficient appliances under the caption of activities for energy conservation.

To highlight the women economic empowerment based on making and acting economic decision making the following are the questions of study:

1. What is the significance of relationship between economic decision making and women economic empowerment for energy conservation?
2. What is the level of energy conservation drivers and activities existing in women delegate households?

**Methodology**

The methods the guiding principle was: the implied economic power to make and act upon economic decision impacts the drivers and activities as behavior to conserve the energy. In this study the behavior is themed under two captions; drivers for energy conservation and activities for energy conservation.

**Theoretical Framework for Exploring the Correlation between Women Economic Empowerment and Energy Conservation**

The energy conservation may not be conditioned only with the energy conservation technologies but it is contextual to social construct of energy utility. Societal promotion of women economic empowerment matters for energy conservation by reducing energy consumption or using less energy for a constant service. The variables in this study are the following:
• Socio-economic construct for energy conservation = change variable
• Energy conservation = outcome variable
• Women economic empowerment = linking variable

The theoretical framework of this research measures the link between women economic empowerment and energy conservation (see Fig. 1).

**Fig: 1**  
Theoretical framework for exploring the link between energy conservation and women economic empowerment

Source: extracted by author
Methods of Data Collection

Human behavior persists diversely to respond different challenges as per their societal and personal dispositions in contact to economic empowerment. The scheme of this study tries to explore the link between women economic empowerment and energy conservation among the delegate households in terms of economic decision making. Delphi focused activity was held in February, 2015 and Delphi exploratory activity was organized and undertaken from February 2015 to June 2015.

Questionnaires

Delphi focused: The questionnaire is designed to get the consensus from 16 experts to explore and identify the link between women economic empowerment and energy conservation. It was composed of following three questions:

- Round 1. Can there be a link between energy conservation and women economic empowerment?
- Round 2. How much is the possibility to practice the link between energy conservation and women economic empowerment?
- Round 3. How much can be the intensity to practice the link between energy conservation and women economic empowerment?

On the basis of results of the first question in round 1 the question is constructed for second round and on the basis of results of the second question in round 2 the question is constructed for the third round.

Delphi exploratory: The questionnaire is designed specific to energy conservation behavioral patterns. The questions were worded simple and clear, the options provided an opportunity for easy and unambiguous response. In total, 100 respondents were selected on the bases of purposive sampling from delegate women households to assess the habitual behaviour for energy conservation. 50 delegate households were selected having full liberty to make and act economic decisions while the other 50 were not having power to make and act economic decisions though both the categories were not earning. The structured questionnaire is composed of two themes: drivers for energy conservation and activities for energy conservation (see Annexure 1).

Drivers for energy conservation include concepts of thinking which may drive the human behviour pertinent to some activity means the energy conservation.

- Thinking to reduce energy consumption to help the society is positive (+) as it leads to less energy consumption. Not thinking to reduce energy consumption to help the society is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.
- Thinking to reduce energy consumption to help the future generations is positive (+) as it leads to less energy consumption. Not thinking to reduce energy consumption to help the future generations is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.
• Thinking to reduce energy to reduce energy crisis of Pakistan is positive (+) as it leads to less energy consumption. Not thinking to reduce energy consumption to better response to energy crisis of Pakistan is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.

• Less dependency on energy is positive (+) as it leads to less energy consumption. More dependency on energy is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.

• Non satisfaction with energy bill is positive (+) as it leads to opt the activities for reducing the bill. Satisfaction with energy bill is negative (-) as it does not lead to opt the activities for reducing the bill.

Activities for energy conservation include:

• Opting for warm clothing is positive (+) as it leads to less consumption of energy. Not opting for warm clothing is negative (-) as it does not lead to less consumption of energy.

• Harvesting natural light is positive (+) as leads to less energy consumption. Not harvesting natural light is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.

• Purchasing energy efficient appliances is positive (+) as leads to less energy consumption. Not purchasing energy efficient appliances is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.

• Using energy efficient appliances is positive (+) as leads to less energy consumption. Not using energy efficient appliances is negative (-) as it does not lead to less energy consumption.

• Switching off of the appliances instead of standby is positive (+) as it leads to less consumption of energy. Not switching off of the appliances instead of standby is negative (-) as it does not lead to less consumption of energy.

Observations

Data collected through structured questionnaires was corroborated on the basis of personal observations.

Data Analysis

Data was analyzed by using mode (frequency distribution, standard deviation, SPSS (20) is used to compute the values and significances.

Findings and Discussion

The energy conservation depends on the women economic empowerment delegated by earning households on the bases of trust to make and act economic decisions to manage the household economy. The findings are leveled under three captions.
Relation between Women Economic Empowerment and Energy Conservation

The study explored and identified the link between women economic empowerment and energy conservation. 70 percent results tell us that there is a substantial link between energy conservation and the women economic empowerment. The comments are concluded from the open ended questions answered by the 16 expert respondents (see Box 2).

Box 2-Delphi Focused Results

- There is a significance relationship between economic decision making and economic empowerment for energy conservation. A women with the decision power in contact to finances will utilize the energy more economically than the other women without this power. Women with control in running house expenditures will try to limit expenditures through economic utilization of energy by making the others to do the same.
- Women can be empowered through trust and involvement and in domestic management of resources in terms of finances and hence results in abstention or efficient utilization of energy resources.
- Electronic and print media, seminars and workshops, and curriculum can be used to realize and gain the benefits of link between energy conservation and women economic empowerment. It can be practiced at household and commune levels leading to societal change.

Women can be empowered through involvement and in domestic management of resources in terms of finances and hence results in abstention or efficient utilization of energy resources.

Relationship between Women Economic Empowerment and Drivers for Energy Conservation

The study measured the income of the sample population, the drivers for energy conservation (see Table 1-3). The women economically empowered are found with positive trend 77.2% and negative trend 22.8% in their thinking drivers for energy conservation. While the women economically not empowered are found with positive trend 62% and negative trend 38% in their thinking drivers for energy conservation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monthly Income of the respondents</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>20000</td>
<td>250000</td>
<td>51200</td>
<td>41145.355</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Energy conservation activities are the support to social energy conservation system. It is found that there is significant relation between women economic empowerment and the activities for energy conservation. The women economically empowered are found with positive trend 83.2% and negative trend 16.8% in their activities for energy conservation. While the women economically not empowered are found with positive trend 49.6% and
negative trend 54.4% in their activities for energy conservation (see Table 4-5). The study gives a practical approach for earlier energy conservation studies. According to Kiplinger, with turning off the lights when there is no need of, you can save several dollars without sacrificing your comfort. “People get excellent return on their investment through energy efficiency” (Kiplinger 2001). Energy conservation has been prompted as a win-win option, it provides benefit to both environment energy consumers, and society with the net economic gain (Grubb, 1992). Reduced energy bills free up income to be spent on other critical needs (Ryan and Chambel, 2012). There are two main benefits of energy conservation that individuals may consider.

**Table 4**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities for Energy Conservation</th>
<th>positive response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time opt for warm clothing</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time harvest natural light/energy</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time spend money for energy efficient appliances</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time prefer energy efficient appliances</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time switch off the appliances</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

women economically empowered without earning

**Table 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities for Energy Conservation</th>
<th>positive response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time opt for warm clothing</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time harvest natural light/energy</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time spend money for energy efficient appliances</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time prefer energy efficient appliances</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most of the time switch off the appliances</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

women economically not empowered without earning
Conclusions and Recommendations

The facts make us to underscore that women economic empowerment promotes energy conservation though they are not earning. The Delphi focused 70% results establish the significance link between women economic empowerment and energy conservation. The Delphi Exploratory measurement about the manifestation for energy conservation among economically empowered women by using the concepts of drivers and activities for energy conservation allow us that the delegate households trusted by the earning households are better energy conservatives. Women’s involvement in energy conservation is found to be significantly positively related to make and act economic decisions. The energy conservation trends found positive 80.20% and negative 19.80% in economically empowered women, positive 55.80% and negative 44.20% in not economically empowered women. The social value orientation (SVO) of drivers for energy conservation were itemized as the existing level of thinking to conserve energy for state, society, future generations, and for the less energy bill under the caption of drivers for energy conservation; opting warm clothing, harvesting sun energy, purchasing and using energy efficient appliances under the caption of activities for energy conservation. The outcome of this study is advantageous as it considers the economically empowered women the source of motivation for constructing civil society to conserve energy. The idea to empower women without earning will substantiate the sustainability of the society. The existing socio-economic practices are limited in its posture and practice of women economic empowerment. The idea of women economic empowerment held by this study needs a mindset change that women may prove better delegate household by having the economic empowerment without going out for earning. The society and media should highlight the men rendering economic power to their women delegate households at home as the source of energy conservation for sustainable societies.

References


Pakistan Economic Survey, 2010-11, Economic Adviser's Wing, Finance Division, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad


Annexure 1. Exploring link between women economic empowerment and energy conservation

Questionnaire (Delphi Exploratory)
Categories of Respondents:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women economically empowered without earning</td>
<td>Women economically not empowered without earning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Section A
Drivers for Energy Conservation

Tell us to assess the drivers for energy conservation

1. Would you like to reduce energy consumption for helping the society as the energy you save can be used by others?
   (a) Yes          (b) No
2. Would you like to reduce energy consumption for helping the future generations as the energy you conserve can be used by next generations?
   (a) Yes          (b) No
3. How would you like to respond to energy crises of Pakistan in your personal capacity?
   (a) By reducing energy consumption  (b) By using energy efficiently
4. How much you are dependent on energy in your daily life activities?
   (a) 50%          (b) 80%
5. Are you satisfied with the monthly billing of electricity and gas as percentage of your total expenses?
   (a) Yes          (b) No

Section B
Activities for energy conservation

Tell us to identify the activities for energy conservation

1. Do you opt warm clothing to reduce the energy consumption in winter?
   (a) Sometimes  (b) Most of the time
2. Do you conserve energy by operating windows and doors as per timings of the day and weather conditions in summer and winter?
   (a) Sometimes  (b) Most of the time
3. Do you like to spend on energy efficient appliances?
   (a) Sometimes  (b) Most of the time
4. Do you like to use energy efficient appliances?
   (a) Sometimes  (b) Most of the time
5. Do you arrange the complete switch off of the appliances instead of standby?
   Sometimes     (b) Most of the time

Dr. Musarrat Jabeen is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Contemporary Studies, National Defense University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Saima Bibi is MS Student in the Department of Development Studies, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Abbottabad, Pakistan.

Awais Ali Shah is MS Student in the Department of Electrical Engineering, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Abbottabad, Pakistan.
Women Working In Fisheries At Ibrahim Hydri, Rehri Goth And Arkanabad

Nasreen Aslam Shah
Women’s Studies & Department of Social Work
University of Karachi

Abstract

This article emerges out of my study on fisheries at Ibrahim Hydri, Rehri Goth & Arkanabad, a project assigned by Women Development Department, Government of Sindh. The overall objective of this study is to seek out information regarding the following issues: the status of women in family and community, type of work they are doing, reason of doing work and their system and mode of payment, overall their hygiene and health conditions of the women folk. Both qualitative and quantitative research methodologies were adopted for this study through which the researcher has analyzed different factors and circumstances which these women are experiencing. This study has, therefore, been conducted to explore the factual data about the women working in fisheries at Ibrahim Hydri, Rehri Goth and Arkanabad.

Keywords: Fisherwomen, Health Issues, Working Conditions, Socio-Economic Status, Physical and Mental Ailment.

Introduction

Fisheries play a significant role in the growth of national income. This sector directly provides employment to 300,000 fishermen and in addition to this another 400,000 people
are employed in ancillary industries. Pakistan is gifted with rich fishery potential and it is a major source of earning foreign exchange for the country. There are 16,000 fishing boats which operates fishing trips in shallow coastal waters of Pakistan as we as in offshore regions lasting for few hours to about 25 days depending upon type of fishing. Total production which comes from inland and marine waters is roughly around 0.06 M.tons (Khan, 2016). Sindh province has been bestowed with natural fisheries resources on the marine side, almost 350 Km coastal belt of Sindh is lying virtually untapped, which needs to be exploited for shrimp, crab, oyster, pearl culture etc. in enclosure, pen and ponds. Almost 300,000 hectares area is available in the deltaic area for this purpose. It is being observed that fresh water resources are being depleting fast in the Province of Sindh and Sea intrusion due to ecological changes. 72 Dehs (hamlets) out of 698 Dehs of Thatta and Badin Districts have completely eroded by the Sea. As the main thrust of our fisheries export is based on capture fisheries, which is being depleting day by day, hence aquaculture on marine and brackish water side is the only option to subsidize it, through cage, pens and pond culture techniques. In the fisheries sector of Pakistan the Province of Sindh holds the premier position by commanding 65% of fresh water, 100% of brackish and 71% of marine water resources of the total fisheries resources of Pakistan. These resources have commercially important about 400 varieties of marine, 200 different types of fish and 13 different varieties of shrimp (Government of Sindh, 2015). An exclusive economic zone (EEZ) of Pakistan has grown up by 150 nautical miles (200 nautical miles to 350 nautical miles) with the addition of 50,000 square kilometers of international waters to its seabed territory which allowing Pakistan to benefit from the natural resources contained in it (Sajjad, 2015). According to a statement issued by the Pakistan Navy that United Nations Commission on Limits of Continental Shelf has accepted Pakistan’s claim for extension of its continental sea limits “This adds 50,000 sq Kms of continental shelf to the existing 240,000 sq Kms of EEZ under Pakistan’s jurisdiction”. Pakistan is now fully enjoying its right over the resources of seabed and subsoil and also allowing it to drill for petroleum or lay submarine cables or pipelines in the added territory. This remarkable milestone in the history of Pakistan would bring immense economic benefits through the exploitation of comprehensive natural resources (The Express Tribune, March 21st, 2015).

Literature Review

In economic system of Pakistan Fisheries and fishing industry has vital role. It also provides employment opportunities to people who live in coastal areas. Marine and Inland sources are in abundance in Pakistan. Makran coast (Balochistan) and the coast of Karachi (Sindh) are true distinct grounds for Marine fishing in Pakistan. Karachi is more important port therefore; government has taken steps to develop it as a fishing centre (Fishing Industry in Pakistan).

In Pakistan Fishing and fishing industry plays key role in serving humans as source of protein and increasing foreign exchange for the country as well. It also shares in GDP
growth showing different statistics i.e. 0.3 percent in 2012 (Siddiqui, 2012) and 0.43 percent during the year 2014-2015. Government of Pakistan is now genuinely taking some measures for the improvement of fishing sector by focusing on introducing new strategies, developing value added products, increasing per capita fish consumption, improving social and economic conditions of fishing community (Government of Pakistan, 2014-2015) and along with that providing employment opportunity to these communities almost up to 1.5 million people. In rural areas of Sindh and Balochistan alternate employments do not exist, therefore, fishing is the best source of income generation and is also a way of improving standard of living. Fishing industry in such areas is a way of fulfilling negative gap between the demand and supply of fish (Siddiqui, 2012).

Catching fish is almost a male domain (Saigol, 2011); especially in deep sea waters it has high occupational risks. Whereas, women are engaged in household chores and other activities like preparing meals, mending nets, and women help their male counter parts in various activities, but their efforts remain unacknowledged. They are overburdened in all communities in both productive and reproductive roles (Institute for Community Organization Research, 2011). In small scale and fishing industry women’s prominent role is in post-harvest, along with that in processing and marketing as well (Nishchith, 2000). As per international statistics women especially young women are engaged in fishing industry i.e. 80% women are engaged in marketing. 90% of the women workers are engaged in seafood processing firms in Sri Lanka (Central Bank of Sri Lanka, 2003). 60% in India and 80% workforce in Vietnam consist of female workers. In Bangladesh 60% women contribute in fishing industry and many of them are entrepreneurs. Gender discrimination stems out of the social setup thus keeping these women invisible. They have limited access to loan facilities, technology and capacity building. Various trends are seen as per circumstances e.g. When facilities of preservation and processing are provided then men starts competing women. On the other hand women are less paid as compared to men. These income generating activities and long working hours makes it difficult for women to fulfill their household responsibilities (FAO, 2016).

In fishing sector millions of women are involved in both formal and informal sector and paid and unpaid work. Women are usually engaged in work before and after fish catch, but they can also be seen in catching and harvesting. These women work at artisanal and industrial stage both. At artisanal stage they prepare and mend fishing nets, pots and baskets, hooks (used for baiting) and they even provide their services to the fishing boats whereas, at industrial level they perform post harvest tasks along with processing and marketing. Women work at fish harbours, they sort, and clean, dry, and smoke fish for marketing (Competitiveness Support Fund and Agriculture) while working at harbor women get a chance to keep substandard fish for their family. Though all these tasks which women perform are not that much easy because they have to make sure that during the process of sorting, cleaning and packing the nutritional value of the seafood should
Women Working in Fisheries at Ibrahim Hydri, Rehri Goth and Arkanabad

not be lost as consumer prefer to eat fish with full nutrient value. Therefore, it is needed to recognize efforts of women labour force in order to acknowledge their hard work (World Bank, 2010). In fisheries sector labour force mostly comprises of women e.g. in Western Africa and in Asia 80% of the seafood is prepared, sorted and cleaned by women for marketing (Focus). It is an established fact that women play important role in fish industry, but still actual facts and figures are not available to show women’s involvement in fisheries sector. Women’s work is of diverse nature but remain invisible.

As per recent studies in nine major sea food producing countries almost 46% women are playing a vital role in small scale fisheries. Some other international researches have also exposed that in third world countries women’s economic participation is not highlighted in contrast to men. Women’s role in fishery business is internationally kept hidden even though without women’s participation men cannot do fishery business on their own. Women are very supportive in numerous ways and help their male counterparts but they get hardly anything from the profit amount (World Fish Centre, 2011).

Feminist perspective regarding fisher women is based on the fact that these women are multitasker and perform productive and reproductive roles at a time and doing almost all the household chores in their homes (Swanrangsi, 2003). Feminists raise a question that idea of production should be referred as production of goods as well as production of life. But production of life is not given much of an importance because it is considered as a natural phenomena. Therefore, private life is ignored and no improvement is made in this regard. In order to maintain gender based and equitable working environment in fisheries it is necessary to value and respect relationship between poor and rich, men and women whereas, race and nationality must not be a criteria to benefit the community. Feminist perspective also looks forward to redesign social values to reduce gender gap and it is focused to change the mind set which is the main cause of dominant discourse. Gender issues does not mean solving women issues, but to focus on gender balanced society and to address the roles, responsibilities, ethnicity, age, sex and marital status (ICFJ).

Recognizing this lack of interest in fisher women’s lives and their struggle in life, in 1995, Researcher began to explore the veiled life of invisible fisherwomen. This exercise resulted in a small study entitled, Socio-Economic Study of Women in Fishermen’s Village (Ayub, 1995). The site selected for this small study was Ibrahim Hyderi village, the oldest fishermen’s settlement in Pakistan and known in local traditions as ‘Machi Miani’ (a place where fish are found). This study was conducted with the help of random sample of fifty women of fishermen families living in this village. The data was collected through face-to-face interviews of the respondents. Surprisingly, the profile of fisher women in the study conducted in 1995 and the study conducted in 2012, after an interval of seventeen years, is not different in many ways. The similarities in the life patterns of these two sets of women set apart in terms of years, make one imagine as if time stopped for them at some stage and they were fossilized to the extent that changes occurring in
Karachi by-passed them completely. Fisherwomen of the 1995 study lived a life full of struggle to feed their families one good meal a-day. Living in semi-katcha houses or thatched-roofed quarters, majority of women along with their children fetched water every day on a routine basis. Women collected fuel wood for their kitchen. Children had no or little schooling; majority dropped-out after a few years. Health-care facilities were few. Women were found engaged in small-scale earning enterprises in addition to helping their men in the fishing (Shah, 1997). It is interesting to note that despite the time difference of more than a decade in the above-mentioned research studies, the pitiable working, and living conditions of women of the area has not improved. Indeed, as this study conducted in July 2012 shows, it has worsened the situation in the context of much flaunted development schemes and gender equity claims. This study was undertaken to examine how gender based division of labour in the fishing sector thwarts women’s onward movement and keeps them in an inferior status.

Basic details and data about fisher women in Pakistan is very limited, and this trend is commonly seen globally. Women in all walks of life are ignored and neglected, thus, leaving women to face hardships as a result of this negligence and gender discrimination.

Taura & Passfield (2011) identified that Solomon, Marshall and Tonga islands in 2011 have the same working conditions for fisher women as Pakistan. They both further elaborated that women are neglected because fishing industry is considered as men’s domain (Tuara, 2011(a)). According to them gender stereotyping concepts that women are physically weak hinders in considering them as suitable for fishing industry (Tuara, 2011 (b)).

**Methodology**

To collect primary data for this research the team consisting of six members, including the researcher, made twelve field visits. A total of 309 women respondents were interviewed. A pre-constructed and pre-tested interviewing schedule was implemented to collect the required data to all of them by the pre-trained research team under the supervision of the researcher. Researcher read out the questions to each respondent and in case of any difficulty in understanding the nature of the question, researcher explained the content and the intent as simply as possible. Thus, each questionnaire was completed in at least an hour and a half. Both qualitative and quantitative research methodologies were adopted for this study. The sample for this study has been drawn on the basis of the snowball method. To achieve a better understanding of the situation faced by the women in the fisheries sector, this research undertook a survey which provided an opportunity to open an intensive dialogue with 309 women working in this sector in the selected areas.

**Key Findings of the Research**

We present our findings based on our field notes and observations and data collected by implementing questionnaire to our respondents. During our visits to the coastal villages
of Ibrahim Hyderi, Rehri Goth, and Arkanabad, we saw that most of the residents were living below the poverty line and were deprived of basic human needs such as drinking water, quality education, and primary health.

We found groups of females, from little girls to aged and aging women (Table-1), reflects that high percentage of working women belongs to the age of more than forty years who are mostly illiterate and those who are literate were also not highly qualified (Table-2). The presence of 194 illiterate women, amounting to 62% is a number making government claim of even the poor rate of 35% female literacy rate skeptical. While asking about their marital status we come to know that majority of the respondents were married (Table-3). All of them are poor and they are earning not only for their personal needs but to support their families and to resolve their economic problems (Table-5). According to different researches women involved in other economic activities (other than fisheries community) have better chances to get education and learn different skills even they have better working conditions and salaries as compared to fisheries sector (World Health Statistics, 2010).

We found that they were working under harsh physical conditions; they are not satisfied with the hygiene conditions at work place (Table-8). Women face severe health issues while cleaning shrimps, because they are working in hazardous conditions, and they are not provided any kind of working kit to protect them. We also found women working with bare hands, which damages their skin and constant sitting with uncomfortable posture affects their physical and mental health and complaining severe backache problem, some of them suffer from muscular stress, mental tension, cervical spondylosis problem and reported that their eye sight also affected due to their work (Table-10 & 11). Majority of them replied that their health conditions were better before starting their work and their health is deteriorating after they started work (Table-9). They told us that due to the absence of washrooms and toilets, they have to rush to their homes whenever they have a call of nature.

While asking about the type of work they are doing some of our respondents replied that 77.99% were engaged in shrimp pealing and cleaning, 6.80% were making fishing nets, 4.21% were involved in packing fish in boxes, 2.27% were making chatai (rugs) and 1.62% were engaged in taking out scallop from seashells while some other respondents who were involved in doing different typologies of work replied that they were doing work on adda, karchobi work, ralli making, embroidery, stitching, preparing pickle, making flowers, and weaving carpets.

The most important finding of this research is the story of 32 years old woman who accompanies her male family members on fishing trips, who helps them in catching fish and preparing meals for them on the boat. According to the typology of work out of 309 respondents only one woman goes with their male family members to catch fish in deep sea. Thus, portraying the picture of our society where women are not allowed to accompany men in their work, as women have restricted economic activities (Table-4).
Women in the fisheries are extremely marginalized and exploited due to prevalent norms of gender segregation and their share and contributions remain limited (World Fish Centre, 2010) and were also engaged in the lowest paying jobs. They worked for long working hours and were also not permanently employed, a fact that had adverse effect on their earnings (Siddiqui, 2003). As 80.91% of the respondents said that the wages were paid by weighing the processed fish in kilograms and majority of them (76.37%) were getting their wages on weekly basis whereas, some were getting on completion of consignment and on monthly basis (Table-6 & 7).

Women are an integral part of a community; their status and roles are created, conceived and sustained by the community in which they live. Thus, for this study, Socio-Economic, Political, and Environmental Conditions of Women in Fisheries, awareness and knowledge about the society in which these women live and work, is a pre-requisite. Such knowledge is essential as both the statistical and narrative profile of a community provides the first step for planning future development schemes by identifying areas lacking in basic amenities. In addition, it assists in monitoring schemes and projects already under-way, and is the best tool for the appraisal and assessment of government policies and NGO interventions in the area.

In the coastal villages, fisher folk live an impoverished life; their living areas are the poorest and are marked by the absence of infrastructure and social services (World Bank, April, 2005). Un-kept dirt roads, clusters of shanties, some houses with semi-katcha structures, bunches of children who should be at school running around, toddlers following their mothers with water-pitchers or bundles of firewood on their heads, and young men, who should be at work, loitering around is the usual everyday site of this area. Even a casual conversation with a member of this community soon turns into a tale of misery. Poverty of the worst is the hallmark of the community. To relieve the situation and to eradicate their financial woes, they borrow loans that last forever; entangling them as tightly perhaps as the fish they catch is in their mesh.

**Conclusions**

This study, based on its findings, concludes how deep rooted gender imbalance is within the world of fisher folk, despite the immense crucial role that women play in sustaining fish industry. Women working in the warrahs earn low wages that are settled at ‘piece rate’ or on completion of a unit of work. This system makes women do more work in order to earn more. Long hours of work putting hands in buckets of ice-cold water leads to a variety of ailments, such as headache, muscle pain, and skin rashes.

One significant conclusion arising out of this study is related more to the future of the community and less to its present neglected state. The dismal state of lack of schooling, of the number of more out-of-school children than the number of children at school, and complete lack of health care and proper medication of children presents a bleak hope for
the future. The findings need no explanation as it stands as testimony to the false claims of development and urbanization in Karachi.

The long toiling hours spend by mothers at peeling the shrimps kept in icy-cold water results in providing at best a one-time a-day meal to their children. We conclude this report by raising a question. Daughters of fisher women of today are the women of the next generation of the fishermen villages. Even a casual glance shows what would be the future of these little girls. Would the children of these hard-working mothers remain trapped in the same vicious circle of poverty and deprivation that is cast around their mothers? If no, then what is the way to move out?

Recommendations

1. First recommendation of the study is to urge that there is an urgent need to constitute a high level in inter-ministerial committee to develop and then implement short and long-term strategies to protect lives and resources of the country and to rescue women from the harsh life they are exposed today because of negligence and rickety policies.

2. This Commission should consist, among others social scientists, and researchers from centres of higher learning (universities) to generate more updated data on fisher women

3. Women Development Ministry should create a wider and in-depth sustainable gender sensitive development research for fisher women in all the fishing villages in order to prepare a holistic picture.

4. Formulation of a sustainable fishing policy with focus on ecosystem and its implementation, implementation of Labour Laws in fish warrahs. All the warrahs should be periodically monitored to check the implementation of these Labour Laws.

5. Micro-credit schemes for the fisher folk women should be started in consultation with First Women Bank

6. Skill-training and income-generating training centres for women of the fisher-folk community should be established by the Women Development Ministry.

7. Women of the area should be treated as equal partners in development.

References


Fishing Industry in Pakistan -at: http://www.pakistanfishing.com/fishing-info/fishing-industry-in-pakistan

Focus : Fisheries and Food Security at: http://www.fao.org/focus/e/fisheries/women.htm


Nishchith, V.D. (2000). Role and Status of Women Employed in Seafood Processing Units In India, No.112/1c, 7th Cross, J.P.Nagar,i Phase, India, Bangalore, pp.127-135.

Saigol, Rubina (January 2011). Women’s Empowerment in Pakistan: A Scoping Study by the Gender Equity Program (GEP), Aurat Foundation, p.11.

Sajjad, Syed Baqir (March 21, 2015). Pakistan Seabed Territory Grows by 50,000 square Kilometers, Published in Dawn.


Swanrangsi, S. (2003). Technological Changes and their Implications for Women in Fisheries, Fish Inspection and Quality Control Division, Department of Fisheries, Bangkok, Thailand, pp.35-41.


World Bank (April 25, 2005). Socioeconomic Study and Proposal For Livelihood Improvements: Badin and Thatta District, Sindh, Pakistan, Agricultural and Rural Development Sector Unit South Asia Region, Document of the World Bank


World Fish Centre (2010). Gender and Fisheries: Do Women Support, Complement or Subsidized Men’s Small-Scale Fishing Activities?, Issue Brief 2108, Penang, Malaysia, World Fish Centre, p.8.


Annex- Table of the Study Findings

Table - 1
Distribution of respondents according to their age groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age in Years</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5 – 9 Years</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 - 14 Years</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10.36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 – 19 Years</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>12.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 – 24 Years</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>10.03%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 - 29 Years</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 – 34 Years</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>10.03%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 – 39 Years</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 40 Years</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>33.66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>309</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table – 2
Distribution of respondents according to their educational status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Status</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>62.78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>16.83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazrah Quran</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>11.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>0.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>0.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>309</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table – 3
Distribution of respondents according to their marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Un-Married</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>31.39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>64.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>2.59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>1.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>309</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table – 4
Distribution of the respondents according to the type of work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Work</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shrimps Pealing &amp; Cleaning</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>77.99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpet Weaving</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>0.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cropping</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>0.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ralli Making</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>0.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Flowers with Fabric</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>0.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Packing Fish in Cartons</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karchobi</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>0.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stitching Women’s Dresses</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>0.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Making</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking out Scallop from Seashells</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>1.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embroidery on Sindhi Suits</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>0.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pickle Making</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>0.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khokha (Tuck Shop)</td>
<td>04</td>
<td>1.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chatai (Rug) Making</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>2.27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work on Adda</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>0.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going on Boats for Hunting Fish</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>0.32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>309</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table – 5
Distribution of respondents according to the reasons of doing work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons of Doing Work</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>48.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs of Family</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>25.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Problems</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>24.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Needs</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>309</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table – 6
Distribution of respondents according to the system of payment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System of Payment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Per Kilo Gram (Kg)</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>80.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per Dozen</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per Piece</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6.47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per Size of the Length of the Product</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Shop</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>309</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table – 7
Distribution of respondents according to the mode of payment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode of Payment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weekly</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>76.37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Days</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>1.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On completion of Production / Consignment</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>17.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table – 8
Distribution of respondents according to what are the hygiene conditions over here

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What are the Hygienic Conditions Over Here</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>8.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Satisfactory</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>73.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Work</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>17.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table – 9
Distribution of respondents according to are they healthier now or before

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthier Now or Before</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Healthier Before</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>65.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Healthier Now</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>16.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Still Healthy</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>17.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table – 10
Distribution of respondents according to facing any physical and mental ailment due to work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facing any Physical and Mental Ailment Due to Work</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>284</td>
<td>91.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>8.09%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Table – 11**

Distribution of respondents according to if yes, then what type of affect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>If Yes then What Type of Affect</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye Sight Affected</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cervical Spondylosis Problem</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>2.46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Tension</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muscular Stress</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>26.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Backache</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>54.58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Change Occurs</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>8.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>284</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah** is Meritorious Professor & Chairperson in the Department of Social Work and Director, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.
Role Of Women In Development Of Pakistan: A Case Study of Women Participation in Labour Force in Pakistan

Sadaf Mustafa  
Department of Commerce  
University of Karachi

M. Sadiq Ali Khan  
Department of Computer Science  
University of Karachi

Ammad Zafar  
Department of Public Administration  
University of Karachi

Abstract

This paper highlights the “role of women in development of Pakistan”. Women participation is very vital for the prosperity of economy of Pakistan. Pakistan is a male dominated society despite the fact that its major population consists of women. In Pakistan the women face lots of obstacles when they want to utilize their skills for the growth and development of the country such as religious, political, social and environmental, although education, health and nutrition are the main issues on the top of list of severe problems. The Pakistani women are neglected and targeted by the customs and values of their families and relationships. The drastic fact is that majority of women of Pakistan live in rural areas as compared to the urban areas where they are treated as animals. However, it is also a fact that currently lots of metropolitan women in all provinces perform marvelous activities for the progress of Pakistan. The study reveals women play dynamic role in boosting economy. We cannot ignore the astonishing performance of women in building developed countries.

Keywords: Women Participation, Economic Development, Islamic Views, Politics.

talīğčı

تالتخت
Women development is very crucial in the development process of a country whether they are developed or developing countries. History and current statistics revealed that women participation is very remarkable in the war of becoming advanced economies such as United States, China, Turkey, Malaysia, Hong Kong, Thailand, India, United Kingdom, and European countries. Dulfo (2012) clarified that women empowerment and development of a country are straightly associated with each other; in this manner the concerned authorities should maintain equality among men and women in the process of economic development through effective strategic actions and policies.

IMF report (2013) stated that the utilization of skills of women on equal basis with men increased the level of productivity as well as women performed their jobs better than men at managerial level and also increased productivity through excellent decision making. This shows that women have an important role in increasing the level of business activity. World Bank report (2003) also emphasized the importance of working equality of men and women in the following manner:

“There is now a shared understanding with in the developed community that development policies and actions that fail to take gender inequality into account and fail to address disparities between male and females will have limited effectiveness and serious cost implications”.

So in this manner there is no doubt to say that investment on women for the purpose of their education, health and safety is very fruitful in economic growth. Women participation in economic activity brings economic prosperity. This paper also emphasizes on the role of Pakistani women in economic development.

Meng (1998) also contributed their research findings about massive participation of women in three industries which are spinning, electronics and garments respectively in South and East Asian countries for instance in Hong Kong, Thailand, Malaysia, Indonesia, India and China. He analyzed that the rapid economic growth of above mentioned South and East Asian countries are due to encouragement of women labour force in their industries which shows that women contribution is vital at all levels.
Unfortunately, the major part of the population of Pakistani women is victimized by the uncivilized men living in rural areas who have very low mental approach. The Pakistani government and the concerned authorities have adversely failed to avail the opportunities and challenges through the massive part of rural areas agricultural land, minerals, skilled and unskilled cheaper labour (including men and women) etc. The Pakistani government is also incompetent to attract foreign direct investment in all business sectors mainly in manufacturing, service, IT and tourism specifically due to the terrorism and adverse law and order situation and also because of inadequate strategies and policies. Although, in this rapid growing world it is very difficult to share the fact that in Shumali Waziristan, an area of Northern Pakistan the women are not allowed to cast vote in election, even that the women cannot go for shopping for their own necessity and choice as well as if any women take action against these rules she is murdered by the social animal man.

Besides the above mentioned facts, the women of cities play a significant role in the development of economy of Pakistan. The metropolitan citizen women are very efficient and talented to participate the role with men in the progress of the country through availing the opportunities and challenges. Pakistani women are very skillful and performing activities in every field of life such as in IT, research, military, police, aviation industry, teaching and medical science. The Pakistani women also are elected through elections and serving the country as a member of national and provincial assembly.

**Literature Review**

As explained above the encouragement of women as well as the participation with men is mandatory in every field of life for the sake and advancement of economy. Ziv, Habayib and Cinamom (2015) also interpreted that now a day’s most of the countries are very vigilant about the equal opportunity regarding men and women. In this concern the fundamental step required is to educate women on urgent basis. Queder and Asrar (2011) also focused the significance of schooling of women which is very crucial for the creation of gender equality in the progress of economy. He supported his statement by giving the example of Israel, where the ratio of the literacy of Israeli Arab women has increased rapidly therefore they are well committed in economic flowering. This shows that educating women is necessary not only for women itself but also for overall growth of the country’s economy.

Pakistan is a developing country so the government must invest for the education of women and in this connection the prompt strategic actions should be made for the evolution of economy. Fatima (2010) criticized the role of Pakistani government in respect of women education specifically the ground level investment in education in rural areas. She also illustrated the example of Bangladesh, India, Morocco, and specially Pakistan where the position of women education is not satisfactory and fair in all rural areas as compared to urban areas. She also agreed with the above discussion and also
shared his views regarding the injurious situation of women schooling and learning in Pakistan. According to her the education ratio of women and men was little bit increased in 1991 which were 27% and 47% compared to the year 1981 in which the ratio was 16% and 35% respectively. Although in rural areas of Pakistan the trend of acquiring education is very low comprising of 7% of women and 26% of men.

However according to Grunenfelder (2013) between the periods of 1980 – 2000 the ratio of women participation in the progress of Pakistan was very depressed as compared to the other South Asian countries. On the other side the job quota for women is limited which reflected the gender inequality. Even that, in the year 2008 the rate of women employment has increased by 22% for women and 82% for men which is not sufficient for the welfare of Pakistan. As it is already discussed above that there is more population of women in Pakistan than men.

The main hurdle which is caused the declining ratio of employment of Pakistani Muslims women is” pardah” and “hijab” specially in Northern areas such as Abbottabad, Battagram, Haripur, Kohistan, Manshera and also in Shumali Waziristan. K. Besio (2006) also shared the valid arguments regarding the difficulties of Muslims women in abovestated areas. Despite the fact in Pakistan Muslims women are very brilliant and also efficiently playing role in every field of life mostly in urban areas. A. Weiss (1984) highlighted the serious strategic actions for the motivation of those Muslim women who want to work within “pardah” in industries and laboratories. Unfortunately, the above mention actions are meaningless because of restrictions imposed by the family members based on the religious and cultural values.

All the above discussion revealed that active participation of women is very compulsory for the development of Pakistan. The meritorious leader of Pakistan Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah also focused the importance of women role for a country. Wajiha and Aliya (2014) also focused the women empowerment for the growth of Pakistan. Noman, Muhammad and Mujahid (2013) also discussed that the efficient role played by the women of Pakistan increased the productivity of economy in agricultural, industrial and also in service sectors as well as women assistance in the process of economic development also very favorable and helpful by increasing the level of female education, health and employment. Malik, Choudhry and Faridi (2011) also explored that the women cooperation is very helpful to boost the economy of Pakistan like the other developing countries.

Research Methodology

This is an explanatory research based on data collected from secondary source. Literature from research journals is added to this research to identify the “role of women in
economic development of Pakistan” especially participation of women in labour force of Pakistan. This study reviews the literature related to women participation in Agriculture and Politics of the country. It is highlighting the Islamic views about the women empowerment.

Islamic Views of Women Empowerment

Islam is very comprehensive religion in accordance with every field of life. Islam covered and conveyed the laws about the security and welfare of women as recommended for men. Choudhry, Noosheen and Lodhi (2012) elaborated the well and blooming status of women as defined and determined by Islam. Islam empowered women to get knowledge and expertise.

In this regard the prophet P.B.U.H said:
“Seeking knowledge is a mandate for every Muslim (male and female)”.

In Holy Quran Allah declared about the women empowerment in the following manner:
“And (asfor) the believers, both men and women they are friends and protectors of one another: they (all) enjoin the doing of what is right and forbid the doing of what is wrong, and are constant in prayer, and render the purifying dues and pay heed unto God and His messenger” (Al – Taubah 9:71).

Islam is the only religion who gave the venerable rights to the women around 1400 years ago and also provides the concept of equality between men and women and awards the reward to those men who give respect to their mothers, wives, as well as daughters. This concept of giving dignity, respect, equality with men also verified by the following statement of Allah in the Holy Quran:
“For Muslim men and women, for believing men and women, for devout men and women for true men and women who are patient for men and women who humble themselves, for men and women who give in in charity, for men and women who fast, for men and women who guard their chastity, and for men women who engage much in Allah’s praise—for them all has Allah prepared forgiveness and great reward” (Al-Ahzab 33:35).

This concept of equal right of duties, responsibilities and honor between men and women also stated by Choudhry, Noosheen and Lodhi which is powered by the following saying:
“They are your garments and you are their garments. (Al-Baqara 2:187)

There is a worldwide misconception regarding Islam that Islam prohibited Muslim women from working and going out for jobs. The fact is that Islam has allowed Muslim
women to manage and administrate their businesses. Shahida and Iram (2013) also clarified the Islamic conception in respect of Muslim women employment and businesses. They argued with the help of Quran and Hadith and stated that Islam permit the Muslim women to earn but it must base on honesty and fairness. They shared this fact in the following manner by the help of Quran.

“Allah says, and do not covet what Allah has given some of you more than others: The men shall have their due share according to what they have earned and the women shall have their according to what they earned, so pray to Allah for his bounty; most surely Allah has perfect knowledge of everything.”

Shahida and Iram explained the different thoughts regarding the above stated verse such as “earn” is explained to perform excellent and positive acts as well as Qatadah (RA) also agreed that earns men “good action” although according to Ibn Abbas earn means to do efforts for financial prosperity. Imam Qurtabi and some other reviewer also verified the views of Ibn Abbas. This concept of earning also proved by the following saying of Jabir Bin Abdullah:

“Jabir bin Abdullah said; my maternal aunt was divorced and she wanted to harvest her date palms. A man rebuked her for going out, so she went to the prophet (SAW) (inquiring about going out during Iddah) and he said: No, go and harvest your date palms, for perhaps you will give charity or do an act of kindness”.

Pakistan is a country formed on the name of religion that is Islam. Although, the religion followed in Pakistan i.e. Islam has given equal rights to women to work, to get education and stand beside men still the religion is used for not giving rights to women and treating them badly. The country is in developing stage so in this regard the Government of Pakistan should take immediate strategic actions for the active participation of women as declared by Islam especially in rural areas. The active participation of women in businesses will bring economic prosperity in the country improving the standard of living of the population especially the women and will bring gender equality.

Women Participation in Labour Force of Pakistan

Women in Pakistani society are playing vital role in the economic development. According to Labour force survey from 2009 to 2011, 2013 to 2015 data is showing increase in participation of women in labour force of Pakistan. 61.04 million labour force was available for work up to 2015. 46.38 million male labour force was available in different areas of work while utilization of women 14.66 million (See Error! Reference source not found. and Figure 1). Despite of fact of poor utilization of Women Labour force results of survey representing a positive trend with the increase annual women
participation for labour force in Pakistan. This increase in Labour force is directly affecting GDP of Pakistan.

Table: 1
Civilian labour force in Pakistan (Millions)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>National</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both Sexes (15+)</td>
<td>53.72</td>
<td>54.92</td>
<td>57.24</td>
<td>59.74</td>
<td>60.10</td>
<td>61.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>41.91</td>
<td>42.44</td>
<td>43.95</td>
<td>45.98</td>
<td>45.65</td>
<td>46.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Rural</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both Sexes (15+)</td>
<td>37.30</td>
<td>38.17</td>
<td>39.70</td>
<td>41.23</td>
<td>41.14</td>
<td>41.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>27.51</td>
<td>27.77</td>
<td>28.69</td>
<td>29.89</td>
<td>29.10</td>
<td>29.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>9.79</td>
<td>10.40</td>
<td>11.01</td>
<td>11.34</td>
<td>12.04</td>
<td>12.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both Sexes (15+)</td>
<td>16.42</td>
<td>16.75</td>
<td>17.54</td>
<td>18.51</td>
<td>18.96</td>
<td>19.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>2.41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Figure 1
The study reveals in urban areas of Pakistan 19.09 million labour force was participating in work activities. 16.68 million males labour force was engaged in work and 2.41 women were part of work activities. Study found positive growth in labour force for both sexes up to 2015 (See Table 1 and Figure 2). 41.95 million labour force was participating up to 2015 in the rural areas of Pakistan. The women labour force participation is increasing in
rural areas having more rapid growth with respect to urban areas. 12.25 million women were participating different work activities (See Table 1 and Figure 3) which is a good sign for Pakistan.

**Agriculture Industry and Women Participation**

Pakistan is a least developed country (LDC) and its growth is based on agriculture industry. Therefore, Pakistan needs active research and development departments and advance technological tools, techniques and equipment’s to compete in the international market to increase the level of export of the furnished and non-furnished products. Pakistan also known as agro –based economy because its major part of national income based on agriculture which is also the main source of creating of employment of men and women for both rural and urban areas. Razia and Ghazala (2011) also contributed their valuable research regarding the impressive participation of women role in agricultural industry which is the main source of national income but unfortunately the extraordinary role of women of rural areas in agricultural industry is hidden at national level. They also highlighted the major problems suffering by agricultural women mainly are health, education, shortcoming of finance and loan facilities, lack of proprietary rights of land, utilization of advanced technological equipment’s instead of women labor force, lower wage rate etc. Rashid and Abdullah (2013) stated that in rural areas, Pakistani women participation is remarkable and their contribution is greater than men which is about 79.4% and 60.8% respectively. Mir, Ali, Ahmed and Zafar (2009) verified that 50%of the labor force of Pakistan is contributed by rural women but this is miscalculated and neglected by concerned authorities’ surveys and reports. According labour force survey from 2009 to 2011 & 2013 to 2015, in the year 2009 45% of labour force of Pakistan were engaged in Agriculture/Forestry/Hunting and Fishing industry. This situation is also facing by the other various developing countries. 37% males and 74% women labour force were participated in the industry. Participation of women in Agriculture/Forestry/Hunting and Fishing industry is more crucial than men. According data agriculture industry is much more dependent women participation. In the labour force survey 73% of women and 33% men were engaged in Agriculture/Forestry/Hunting and Fishing industry which 42% of participation of total labour forces (See Error! Reference source not found. and Figure 4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Both Sexes (15+)</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is discussed above that the status of women in Pakistan is not very good and they are not given the equal rights as of men. But Pakistani women surprisingly are playing very active and admirable role in Pakistani politics. Pakistani women politician is very competent to identify and resolve the issues and problems regarding women as well as men in the society.

Pakistani politician women’s aim is not only to participate with men in flowering the economy but also work out for the complication, weakness and deficiencies of women living in rural and also in urban areas. Now days the majority of women are also participating in election and elected for the member of provincial as well as national assembly for example Dr. Fehmida Mirza Deputy Speaker of national assembly of Pakistan and Shahla Raza was Deputy Speaker of provincial assembly of Sindh. Prof. Dr. Zakar (2011) also explained the effective and efficient role which is playing by Pakistan politician women for the best democratic government in Pakistan. In this regard the educated, active, sincere, efficient leadership is required to achieve the motive of best democratic governance. The history showed that Pakistani politician women also have knowledge regarding the policy making and legislation as well as planning, organizing and running election campaign. In this connection the formal training should provide to those elected politician women who want to handle the affairs efficiently.
Following figure also very helpful to analyze and evaluate the member of elected women in Pakistani national assembly election 2013.

![National Assembly](image)

Source: Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zakria Zakar (2011)

The above figure demonstrated the considerable participation of Pakistani politician women in national assembly in 2013. The total seat won by women are 60 which are sub divide in Punjab (35), Sindh (14), KPK (8) Baluchistan (3) and no women members are elected in Fata, because there is huge in equality of men and women in the region. The main reason of the in equality in Fata is uncivilized men who treat their women as slaves. The other main reasons are pardah and hijab, a rule provided by Islam for Muslim Women.

**Conclusions**

This research papers explored and analyzed the fact that women participation is very crucial for the development of a country whether they are developed or developing. Another reality is that the Pakistani women are very competent and can achieve difficult task because they are very hard worker. This research papers also highlighted the misconception which is associated with Islamic rules. Islam give equal rights to women as recommended to men. This research paper also focused the difficulties and hurdles which are the barrier in the process of women improvement. Islamic and Pakistan’s history demonstrated the achievements of women which are incredible for example Hazrat Khadija, Hazrat Aisha, Madre Millat Fatima Jinnah, Benazir Bhutto, and Bilqees Edhi. This paper also suggested very significant fact that the government and the concerned authorities must invest on women education, health and nutrition, training, safety and security, empowerment, employment and also for their shelter.
The government of Pakistan is very serious for the progress of women but in this regard implementation of policies and strategies is very mandatory instead of paper work. Besides this government of Pakistan launched the productive plans for the welfare of women such as First Women’s Bank Limited, the Agricultural Development Bank of Pakistan and Khushali Bank (these banks provide finance to rural women), the national fund for advancement of rural women, village-based family planning workers lady health workers program etc. These papers also proved that Pakistani women are playing the role very efficiently for the prosperity of country.

**Recommendations**

The paper find out that woman has a vital role in bringing economic prosperity regardless of the economic group and culture. We also found out that the women of Pakistan are hardworking and have the ability to contribute in the economic growth of the country. The research however suggested that that the contribution of women in economic prosperity of Pakistan is very less as discussed above. The reasons are culture of the country which doesn’t allow empowerment of women. Hence, it is at first recommended that the sick mentality of the people should be corrected by bringing awareness especially in the rural areas of Pakistan where the women are deprived of rights. The women should be provided with education so that they can know about their rights and can be empowered. The women of Pakistan have the ability to contribute in earning with their men to reduce the load from men as the only bread winners. Thus it is suggested that awareness should be created by removing the misconceptions in people that the religion Islam, which is followed in the country doesn’t allow women to work. It is also suggested that the quota system on employment opportunities in the corporations should be removed and all the companies should focus on equal employment opportunities so that the women can have the chance to get on good positions. In Pakistan, the education ratio of females especially in the rural areas is very low and this should be improved. The low ratio is due to the reason of poverty that parents cannot afford school fees hence the government school system should be improved so that the girls get education and know about their rights and can also contribute in business activity to bring economic prosperity in the country.

**References**


IMF Staff Discussion Note, (Sep, 2013). Women, Work and the Economy: Macroeconomic Gains from Gender Equity, pp 4-5.


Sadaf Mustafa is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Commerce, University of Karachi.

Dr. M. Sadiq Ali Khan is an Associate Professor in the Department of Computer Science, University of Karachi.

Ammad Zafar is M. Phil Student in the Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi.
Analyzing Level Of Sexual Harassment And Exploitation Of Female Domestic Workers

Seema Manzoor
&
Dua-e-Rehma
Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Misbah B. Qureshi
Institute of Gender Studies
Sindh University Jamshoro,

Muhammad Shahid
Department of Social Work
University of Karachi

Abstract
This study aims to establish the understanding and producing realistic information about the level of sexual harassment and exploitation of female domestic workers. The study has also tried to analyze the issues which affect the life of women working as domestic workers and facing great challenges. In Pakistan number of female domestic workers is growing due to poverty, lack of education and inflation. By using quantitative research method researcher has analyzed different factors and circumstances which these women are experiencing, different areas of Karachi are chosen as universe of population for this study. Whereas, convenience and purposive sampling techniques of non-probability sampling method are used in order to collect the data by hundred respondents from different areas of Karachi. In Pakistan now more women are connected to labour force due to increased employment opportunities, on the other hand women are doing work outside their homes to gain their economic independence and the rights and social standing like men in the family and society. But they face exploitation, sexual harassment and discrimination.

Keywords: Female Domestic Workers, Harassment, Exploitation, Level of Awareness.
Introduction

A person who manages the household chores of the employer is generally called a domestic worker or a helper. Domestic workers do various household jobs either for any individual member or for an entire family. They have to take care of children and elderly people, because they are partially or completely dependent on them, besides their main responsibilities are cooking, cleaning, laundry, ironing and grocery. Some domestic workers work and leave, whereas, few stay at the employer’s place. Sometimes their skills and efficiency is appreciated and valued, but in most of the cases it does not happen. In many countries laws and policies are formulated to protect their rights, but these laws are not implicated forcefully. In many countries the laws regarding domestic workers are violated and these poor people face many problems like low wages, extra work load, sexual abuse, harassment and even slavery (Anti Slavery International, n.d). Domestic work is not easy to categorize because it involves a variety of activities both indoor and outdoor. Workers who are employed through agencies get benefits from contracts and agreements. But mostly they are employed on individual capacity by the employer. From the days of slavery till today domestic workers have been experiencing various problems based on their backgrounds and class to which they belong. The irony is that usually women and young girls are hired as domestic workers, but their skills and work is unrecognized because it is considered that women are born to do domestic chores either as owner of the house or as a servant. Since their work is not considered as work, therefore, a collection of data about domestic workers is difficult throughout the world. Key reasons of inaccurate and adequate data are huge number of unregistered employees as domestic workers. One of the reasons of under-representation of these workers is considering them as people serving a community and delivering their services on a personal or social level. Therefore, they remain dependent on their employer and their dignity is not recognized as a human being. Employees whose work place is also their residence are fully controlled by the employer, their future and decisions are in their hands. And do not have the job security benefits like pension in old age. All such circumstances make them suffer more and more.
Women and young girls are considered a soft target to harass and are even sexually abused. Scolding is very common and sometimes they are punished by being beaten. Women workers have relatively higher chances of sexual abuse and harassment by male members of the employer family or by the visitors. Studies show that girl domestic workers are victimized sexually and they are even raped. Girl domestic workers face harsh and rough attitude of the owner and other family members and are considered inferior. Sometimes they are not even aware how to protect themselves, which adds to the complexity of the problem (Massey, 1997). Along with sexual abuse another problem they face is low wages, which they cannot claim at any forum to get their rights. All over the world domestic workers are less paid and they hardly get any recognition (Shahid, 2007). Domestic work is considered an easy way to generate income for women. Keeping a house maid is a common trend in developed and developing countries to perform household chores. In Pakistan a larger number of women (local and migrant) are employed as domestic worker. It is an informal form of work, unorganized and non-regulated. In Pakistan, women work as housemaids due to poverty and lack of education. They try to share the economic burden of the family’s male members.

There is no fix pay scale for part-time and full-time domestic workers, but it varies as per location, type of work and economic status of the employer. Full-time domestic workers earn between four to five thousand rupees, live-in-workers earn between nine to twelve thousand rupees, whereas, workers who work for two to three hours and they carry out single job, earn between two to three thousand rupees. Carrying out single job for two to three hours is called “Khula Kaam”, “Chutta Kaam” or “part-time work”. In Pakistan, housemaids are employed on word of mouth through relatives, neighbours or friends, no contract system or documentation is done before hiring them. Very few people contact employment agencies because usually people think it is a waste of money to pay to that agency also for providing them domestic employee. In such case employee’s record is not maintained through which they can be monitored or can be tracked. Getting employee from agencies is safe because they maintain records of these domestic workers by keeping their CNIC, finger prints, address and other details attested by the area councilor and then this record is given to the area police station to track them in any type of suspicious activity from them. Since there is no specific law regarding the pay scale and working hours of domestic workers, therefore, wages and working schedule is according to the financial status and need of the employer. This working criterion becomes the reason of exploitation of domestic workers. Domestic work has different definitions regarding workplace for employee and the employer, i.e. one’s workplace is the home or property of another and for the employee someone’s private space becomes the public space that is their workplace. Some employer claims that their employee is part of their family, but on the other hand, they exploit them and even they become the victim of sexual abuse, they are degraded and humiliated and their dignity as human is not maintained. Because it is a power relationship, where one is stronger and the other is sub-
ordinate, even their basic rights are not given to them like the right to rest, right to privacy and right to take off from work timely. This power relationship has widened the class differences in our society. Employing a domestic worker highlights status of the employer and keeping more than one employee has become the status symbol in Pakistan. These workers are not called by their real names rather they are called as “Maasi, Ayah Amma, Bua, Jamadarni” and the employer by the names which shows their higher status like “Begum Sahab, Shab Ji, Baray Sahab, Kahn Ji”. The term domestic worker is specifically used for employees who work in someone’s private space. Women work as a domestic worker in a huge ratio, but remain unrecognized. These women are either local or they migrate to big cities in search of a better life and employment “Rozgar” (Little, 1842:934).

Employing women as domestic worker demonstrates the clear gender inequality in our society, because women as hired on low wages for domestic chores like cleaning, washing dishes and clothes. Whereas, men are employed as drivers, cooks, etc. and they get comparatively better salary than women. In order to improve this situation it is needed to have clear policies regarding domestic work, especially to protect women from any kind of exploitation and abuse. Secondly, domestic work should be considered as a separate sector in the service industry, and thirdly domestic work should be considered as work so that it can get full coverage under labour laws. These steps will definitely improve the social and economic status, as well as will improve their inferior state from housekeepers to productive labour. According to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, Article 17 states that “every citizen has the right to form associations or unions, subject to reasonable restrictions imposed by law in the interest of sovereignty or integrity of Pakistan, public order or morality”. But there are no specific unions or organizations to support women domestic workers. If these unions and organizations provide their full support to domestic workers than their issues can be resolved to a certain extent (Shahid, 2014). Media and other social mediums can also raise awareness and can play a productive role in enhancing the dignified status of domestic workers in the society (Government of Pakistan, 2005). Above all, the most important thing is to provide them adequate health facilities, basic facilities and education. Along with this “Zakat System” should be made effective by keeping a welfare approach in mind, thus making Pakistan a welfare state on the basis of Islamic principles for the welfare of needy and poor people (David, 1992).

Theoretical Framework

Feminist theories try to give a theoretical perspective of women’s socio-economic and political status (Barrington, 2009). Feminism has basically focused on gender issues while stressing on women’s issues, their experience and traditional knowledge (Boonzaier & Shefer, 2006). Though gender is the main structure of feminism, but along
with that feminism also focuses on analyzing other social inequalities like race, class, caste and patriarchy. Feminism does not agree with the concept that human functioning based theories can be derived from researches conducted by men only. In fact it recognizes the fact that people may have different approaches, identities and communication skills, and women can have different experience on the basis of environment, culture in which they live with various social issues. Feminism floats the idea that identities and experiences of women are the creation of a wide range of social barriers and restrictions which they face in their life (DeVoe, 1990).

**Review Literature**

The basic aim of review literature is to give readers an analysis on a specific topic through the prism of quality research material which is appropriate, relevant, valid and important by compiling them into one complete report. It also creates a space for other researchers to research on the same topic by exploring its new dimensions. With time people’s perspective has changed worldwide, things and concepts which were not of much importance before have now become the commodity and a social necessity. Social changes are occurring world over and with time the need and demand of domestic workers and their services have increased considerably. Among all social classes this trend is increasing more in the middle class (Cohen, 1991; de Regt, 2009). Thus more women are seen engaged in domestic work. According to studies in 2004, in South Africa domestic employment sector was the second largest employment sector and around 755,000 women were engaged in domestic work (StatsSA, 2005). It is obvious that usually women who lack in formal education acquire employment as domestic workers (Mkandawire-Valhmu et al., 2009). These changing trends in informal employment South Africa took measures to formalize the domestic sector employment. Many laws regarding minimum wage and protection of employees, under labour laws were the major step. However, these laws made not much of a difference as still many women suffer from exploitation and hazardous working conditions, and worst is that they face sexual assault from their employer (Cock, 1981).

Lower class women find domestic work quite tempting, because in this employment sector sometimes they get income and protection also. If the employees are migrants then the employer might provide shelter also which is their prime requirement (Mkandawire-Valhmu et al., 2009). Even unskilled or women having low level of skills get job easily because domestic work is considered an inborn skill of women. (Gaitskel et al., 1983). Therefore, household chores can be referred to as a usual form of work for the employer. Many researches are conducted on domestic workers, mainly focusing on the nature of domestic work, the level of harassment and exploitation, social inequalities between the employee and the employer (Cohen, 1991; Cock, 2011; Mkandawire-Valhmu, 2010). Domestic workers are also considered the subject of research by the social scientists
(Griffini, 2011; Guo, Chow & Palinkas, 2011; Lycklama, 1989; Ukwata, 2010). But the subject of the problems which domestic workers face is not much explored (Acher, 2011). Female domestic workers due to their inferior social status, face gender discrimination, class and racial oppression and sometimes they even face violence from their employer. And this violence is due to power hierarchy (Cock, 1980; Cohen, 2000). The violence and abuse are usually in the form of extra work load, food deprivation and even hitting. These women suffer worst attitude and behaviour of the employer in the form of verbal abuse, humiliation and physical abuse. Their low status, economic dependency of employer and racial inequality creates room for violence and abuse of all forms.

The hardships which domestic workers, especially young girls and women face are because of weak support system for being away from home. They are mostly unaware about their rights thus, become easy victims of abuse and exploitation. Working away from home, health issues due to inadequate access to health resources and hazardous working conditions add to their miseries. Studies have identified that domestic work is not categorized as proper job and these workers face critical issues due to lack of recognition of their work. They are considered as helpers rather than workers, which makes them more vulnerable to abuse and exploitation. If they live with the employer then they have to bear their behaviour even if it is worst in the shape of heavy labour and abusive working conditions. People engaged in domestic employment sector are either called domestic worker or helper but still there is no proper definition of this concept. Ignoring this sector is actually causing problems and adding to the troubles of domestic workers. In 1951 ILO gave a general idea about the domestic work in a meeting, but failed to cover all the problem areas of this employment sector which is definitely an informal sector. At that time domestic employees were considered wage earners, but still nothing has changed much. Domestic workers are not considered as a contributor in the informal sector, in fact, they are just income generators. These workers work in a private household and their mode of work and salary depends on the employers will. Sometimes their salary is even deducted if they get sick and cannot perform their work as per schedule (ILO, 1951). The range of nature of work performed by these workers is very wide. The nature of domestic work is not well defined; everything within the home premises is included in domestic chores and is considered low skilled tasks. In domestic work employee has no capacity to do things by their method or skills tend to emotional and psychological turmoil, thus creating an unbalanced and unequal power relationship between worker and employer. It is usually considered as a work which women perform therefore, it is commonly perceived as women’s job (M. Gallotti, 2009).

Research findings estimate that in Pakistan around “8.5 million” domestic workers are women and young females. Women being weak and having a low social status become easy victims of all sorts of discrimination and exploitation which includes: fear of losing job, long working hours, extraordinary workload, lack of rest, no holidays, less salary,
sexual abuse and even the accusations of robbery. Employers do provide some facilities occasionally and offer clothes, food, other items and financial and medical assistance from Zakat. But these occasional acts of charity are no alternate to human dignity and their rights which they should be entitled legally. Such charity acts humiliate them more by lowering their dignity. Currently worldwide, there is no specific law regarding domestic labour (Hisham, 2015).

Pakistan is a developing nation and has a huge poor population, who are unable to access the resources needed to lead their life in a proper manner by all means. Therefore, they seek any possible opportunity that guarantees income. More than 8.5 million domestic workers in Pakistan are engaged in this employment sector. Such poor living conditions promote domestic employment which has no future security. Under age children and even senior citizens are forced to do work to generate income for themselves and their family. Elite class heir domestic servants to carry out their domestic chores and also to maintain their status symbol. Mostly the entire family men, women and children are involved in income generation by doing odd jobs, but it is not enough for their survival due to inflation. In Pakistan people migrate from rural areas to big cities to earn money. The nature of job and payment is decided by the hirer, which is definitely not according to the work. Some employer provides the travel expenses or pick and drop, but this happens rarely (Shehzadi, 2014).

The constitution of Pakistan assures the rights of education for women, children and minorities. It also ensures the social, economic and political independence and providing decent living by providing decent employment and security. Article 3 and Article 11 prohibits all kinds of discrimination and forced labour. Similarly, some other Article e.g. Article 17, Article 25, Article 27, Article 37 and Article 38 also guarantee justice, equality, social well-being and abolition of equitable adjustment of rights between employers and employees (Iqbal, 2015). If these laws are implicated as it is then only labour can get the benefit, else they will keep facing discrimination.

**Methodology**

This study analyzes the level of harassment and exploitation of female domestic workers. Therefore, the study focused on collecting data regarding their harassment issues by using quantitative research method and descriptive survey method from women working as domestic works. Convenience and purposive sampling techniques of non-probability sampling method are used in order to collect the data by hundred respondents from various areas of Karachi, Sindh like Gulistan-e-Johar, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Malir & Bahadurabad etc. Descriptive method is used to get the insight and exact situation about the harassment and exploitation issues of women working as domestic workers, to highlight the affects of work on their lives and its impact on their physical and mental health.
Results and Discussion

This study analyzes the level of harassment and exploitation faced by female domestic workers while working in different houses. Despite their important role, these female workers are very vulnerable to sexual harassment and are supposed to become easy targets. It also examines the level of harassment these workers are facing. The report is based on the interviews conducted with a total number of 100 female domestic workers engaged in doing multiple duties such as cleaning, washing, cooking, caring for children or the elderly etc. All these domestic workers interviewed alleged their owners had also verbally abused them by shouting at them and using abusive language. According to the findings of the study data shows that 28% of respondents belong to the age group of more than 30 years, 22% belongs to 16 – 20 years, 21% belongs to the age group of 21-25 years whereas 15% of the respondents belong to the age bracket of 26-30 years and 14% belongs to the age group of 11-15 years. These figures identifies that females of all ages are involved in domestic work because of their weak economic status and lack of education which is clearly reflected from the data that when asking about the educational status of the respondents 64% of the respondents said that they were illiterate while 36% were literate. This figure clearly indicates that majority of the domestic workers were illiterate and those who are literate were also not highly qualified (Table-1 & Table-2). It also shows that 33% of the respondents were unmarried, 29% were married, whereas 14% were divorced while 12% each were widowed and temporarily separated. All of them were poor and worked as domestic worker to support their families. The income of the respondent as reflected from the data that 36% falls in the category of 1000-3000, 20% in the category of 3100-5000, 18% were earning between 5001-7000, while 16% falls in the category of 7100-9000, and 10% were those who were earning more than 9000 per month to meet their daily needs. Remuneration paid to these female domestic workers are usually low as compared to male workers both in absolute terms as well as compared to other occupations (Table-3 & Table-4). Data has shown that 48% of the respondents said that they started work just to improve the financial status of their family, 29% said that they started work because their other family members do not earn and 23% said that they started doing work for their children (Table-5).

Data has clearly reflects the behaviour of the employer with their female domestic workers that 32% of the respondents said that their owner were moody, 29% said that their behaviour towards them was good, 20% said that they were carrying and 19% said that their behaviour was bad and they mistreated them (Table-6). While asking about the awareness about sexual harassment 66% of the respondents replied that they were aware and 34% said that they do not know about sexual harassment (Table-7) whereas 54% of the respondents said that they were several times sexually harassed by their owner while 46%
of the respondents were never been sexually harassed by their owners (Table-8). In this connection when enquired about the extent of the sexual harassment occurred 36% of the respondents said that they had never been harassed, 33% reported touching and holdings hands, 16% said that their owners were making love to them and 15% said that they faced extreme level of sexual harassment (Table-9). Female domestic workers face potentially many problems during their job they were extremely insecure, were face sexual harassment, physically and verbally abused by their employer or other family members of the employer which is clearly reflected in this study. Data has also shown that 26% of the respondents said that they got angry when they were sexually abused, 22% show their rude attitude and 16% said abusive words to the perpetrator (Table-10). When asking about that did they inform any one about the incident of sexual harassment 40% said that they were never been harassed, 31% said that they inform someone about the incident awhile 29% said that they did not inform anyone because they have the fear that no one can believe them nor help them (Table-11). As per data 36% of the respondents keep silence after the incident and 24% of the respondents were those who warned their female relatives about sexual harassment after being victimised. It also reflects that 50% of the respondents said that other female domestic workers also share the incidents of sexual harassment they faced (Table-12 & Table-13) and 37% of the respondents said that they also gave advice to their colleagues to be careful and vigilant while working that no one can take any undue advantage and harass them (Table-14) whereas 30% respondents said that they were very much disturbed and face mental stress and depression due to sexual harassment (Table-15). Female domestic workers are subject to various kinds of abuses; being beaten and being shouted is a common punishment for working slow or doing any mistakes. These female workers are at high risk of sexual harassment not only by the male members of the employer’s household but also by their male visitors. Some victims choose to remain quiet and not to report the incident to anyone as they safeguard their future by doing this because they have a fear of losing their jobs though this fear is not entirely reasonable. Some times when they share their incident to their relatives they persuaded them to stay quiet by telling them that the incident would put their future in danger and they might not be hired again because of their bad repo due to this incident.

When asking about that do they know about the sexual harassment bill 46% of the respondents said that they do not know about the existence of any such bill (Table-16). While giving their opinion about sexual harassment 31% said that men always exploit women, 26% said that women are physically weak and become harassment victim easily, whereas 24% said that women should be strong enough so that men cannot harass them and 19% of the respondents said that men manipulate women and exploit them (Table-17).
Conclusions

The study has been carried out to identify and evaluate the issues faced by the working women in domestic employment sector. The study reveals that in the presence of legal cover and labour laws, domestic workers are exploited and face abusive behaviour of their employer. Which clearly indicates the violation of the constitution of Pakistan and it is because these laws are not implemented forcefully. Another reason of exploitation is lack of awareness of rights among domestic employees. Their ignorance becomes the reason of their victimization. Low status of women contributes in increasing their troubles and they cannot complain against the abusive behaviour of their employer, because they are powerful. Such worse working conditions lead to humiliation of domestic workers. Women’s contribution in informal domestic employment sector is remarkable without any doubt, but unfortunately their efforts, hard work, triple burden and weak support system make them more vulnerable and their work remain unrecognized. This study has also analyzed the level of harassment and exploitation which directly affect women working in this specific field. The economic activities of this sector can be enhanced to its highest limits only by delegating these workers their rights lawfully, which include limited working hours, proper pay scale, and implementation of laws regarding domestic employment. As per findings of this study by interviewing hundred respondents it was evident that women’s involvement in domestic employment is due to the fact that they do not have access to quality education and career opportunities. Since women are a major contributor in the informal sector and especially in domestic employment sector because it is considered that doing household chores is a woman’s job, therefore, their domestic work should be properly recognized as work and any kind of discrimination should be eliminated. Maintaining their dignity as a woman and as a human is the need of the time.

References


Hisham, Zeenat (2015). Hidden Worker: Published in Dawn, January 27th, 2015, Karachi, PILER.


## Annex

| Table: 1 | Distribution of the respondents according to their age groups |
|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Age Groups in Years      | Frequency | Percentage |
| 11- 15 years            | 14         | 14%            |
| 16 - 20 years           | 22         | 22%            |
| 21 – 25 years           | 21         | 21%            |
| 26 – 30 years           | 15         | 15%            |
| More than 30 years      | 28         | 28%            |
| **Total**               | **100**    | **100%**       |

| Table: 2 | Distribution of the respondents according to their educational status |
|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Education               | Frequency | Percentage |
| Literate                | 36         | 36%            |
| Illiterate              | 64         | 64%            |
| **Total**               | **100**    | **100%**       |

| Table: 3 | Distribution of the respondents according to their marital status |
|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Marital Status          | Frequency | Percentage |
| Unmarried               | 33         | 33%            |
| Married                 | 29         | 23%            |
| Divorced                | 14         | 14%            |
| Widowed                 | 12         | 12%            |
| Temporary Seperation    | 12         | 12%            |
| **Total**               | **100**    | **100%**       |

| Table: 4 | Distribution of the respondents according to their monthly income |
|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Monthly Income of the Respondent | Frequency | Percentage |
| 1000 – 3000             | 36         | 36%            |
| 3001 – 5000             | 20         | 20%            |
| 5001 - 7000             | 18         | 18%            |
| 7001 - 9000             | 16         | 16%            |
| More than 9,000         | 10         | 10%            |
| **Total**               | **100**    | **100%**       |
### Table 5
Distribution of the respondents according to reason of doing domestic work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason of Doing Domestic Work</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Other Family Members Do Not Earn</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For Their Children</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Improve Their Financial Status</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6
Distribution of the respondents according to behaviour of owner with them

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Behaviour Of Owner With Them</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bad</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moody</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caring</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 7
Distribution of the respondents according to awareness about sexual harassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Awareness About Sexual Harassment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 8
Distribution of the respondents according to have they ever been sexually harassed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Have They Ever Been Sexually Harassed</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 9
Distributions of the respondents according to what extent of sexual harassment occurred

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What Extent of Sexual Harassment Occurred</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To The Extremes</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Touching And Holding Hands</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Love</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Harassed</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table: 10
Distribution of the respondents according to their reaction after sexual harassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Their Reaction After Sexual Harassment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Said Abusive Words</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Got Angry</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rude Attitude</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Harassed</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 11
Distribution of the respondents according to did they inform any one about their sexual harassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did They Inform Their Owner About Their Sexual Harassment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Harassed</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 12
Distribution of the respondents according to did they warn their female relatives about sexual harassment after being victimized

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did They Warn Their Female Relatives About Sexual Harassment After Being Victimized</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not harassed</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 13
Distribution of the respondents according to did anyone share their sexual harassment incident with you

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did Anyone Share Their Sexual Harassment Incident With Them</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table: 14
Distribution of the respondents according to did they give any advice to sexual harassment victim

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did They Give Any Advice To Sexual Harassment Victim</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: 15
Distribution of the respondents according to do you face mental stress and depression due to sexual harassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Do They Face Mental Stress And Depression Due To Sexual Harassment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Harassed</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: 16
Distribution of the respondents according to do you know about sexual harassment bill

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Do They Know About Sexual Harassment Bill</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not harassed</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: 17
Distribution of the respondents according to your opinion about sexual harassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Their Opinion About Sexual Harassment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Men Always Exploit Women</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Are Physically Weak And Become Harassment Victim Easily</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men Manipulate Women And Exploit Them</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Should Be Strong So That Men Cannot Harass Them</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Seema Manzoor is Lecturer in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.

Dua-e-Rehma is Lecturer in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.

Dr. Misbah B. Qureshi Professor & Director in the Institute of Gender Studies, Sindh University Jamshoro.

Dr. Muhammad Shahid is an Associate Professor in the Department of Social Work, University of Karachi.
Cross Border Marriages (CBM’s) Between Pakistan To Developed Countries: A Socio-Economic Perspective

Shagufta Jahangir
&
Asma Manzoor
Women Studies
University of Karachi

Abstract

According to many researches, the third world youth crave to go to developed countries just merely to get sustainable economic development. To accomplish their wish they use every possible way like cross border marriages (CBM’S) is one of them. The basic and main purpose of CBM’S is financial sustainability neither culture nor religion or others. The findings shows that most Pakistanis leave Pakistan only for economic stability, 10 per cent for better education, 10 per cent for improving living standard, while 16.6 per cent for economic (These all are simply economic reasons to pay court to women on inter-racial grounds) and education reasons while 3.4% leave for political or criminal issue. Due to these thoughts these people flipside to their native areas with only economic firmness rather social attitudes, moral attitudes behaviors, norms, myths and religion. The study shows that men do CBM’S to get firmness even they have families in their native areas. Second family formation is the easy way to get their desires, i.e. legal cover and residence. After satisfying their needs they come back to their native areas, even they leave behind their offspring because they give priority to their inhabitant families. In this situation foreigner wife or offspring face problems economically, socially and mentally. This article aims to describe that economic reasons are the basic phenomena of CBM’S for the third world countries’ people who prefer to go to developed countries and to live without facing legal issues.

Keywords: Cross Border Marriages, Moral Attitudes, Native Areas, Flipside, Norms.
Introduction

Cross Border Marriages (CBM’S) have become an important and an under studies issue in immigration developed countries, particularly from third biosphere states to first biosphere states. It is also a new topic for the researchers of economics and social scientists. Gradually CBM’S have become an important socio-economic phenomenon. In this paper researchers aimed to understand CBM’S from the perspective of the persons concerned by investigating their performance, strategies, and depiction of relatives, gender, traditions and the consequential divergence. According to Morokvasic (1983) women do CBM’S for economic stability, financial and future security while according to Phizacklea (1983), Pessar & Mahler (2001), Danneker (2005), Palriwala (2005), Suzuki (2005), Thai (2008) said that women do CBM’S to look after their families and to overcome the scarcity and personal dissatisfaction. According to Yang & Lu (2010) CBM’S are the product of the lower – class – men who suffer the disadvantaged position in the domestic marriage market, thus, utilizing globalizing capital to get better their marriageability.

The main phenomena of CBM’S for Pakistanis is to get economic sustainability and luxuries stability, get rid of poverty and to provide money to their innate families to improve their standard of living. Before 1970’s CBM’S was not famous in Pakistan as Lu & Yang (2010) pointed out that in Asia due to CBM’S late marriages are occurring and its result are biased sex ratio, sexual harassment, infertility and divorce rate.

Literature Review

According to L. Melody (2007) the meaning of CBM’S is terrestrial, national, ethnic, class, gender and racial borders created in the hosting societies. These borders are mostly
mediated by the states as well as other social actors in regulating to discriminate the “WE” and the “OTHERS”. Rendering to Tseng (2010) determined that through CBM’S females are moved from third world countries to first world countries for economic stability. According to Wang & Chang (2002) very little research has been done on CBM’S. Hugo (2005a) implies that the history of CBM’S started from the arrangement of European’s in Australia. At that time the sex ratio between genders was unequal. Now this phenomenon is increasing day by day. According to Wang & Chang (2002), Jones & Shen (2007) and Yang & Chia (2010) CBM’S are quite common between South-East Asia and East Asia since last ten years. While according to Buijs (1996), Asis (2001), Nguyen & Hugo (2005), Belanger & Pendakis (2009) and Tseng (2010) CBM’S are fairly common from under-developed nations to developed nations. After the event of 9/11 CBM’S grew to alarming point, especially significant numbers of CBM’S from Pakistan to other developed countries are quite alarming because the main focus of it is to get financial stability, neither cross culture nor kinship obligations. According to Stoler (2003), Belanger & Khuat (2002), Constable (2003), Phan (2005), Belanger (2007), Ghosh (2009), Stoler (1991), Belanger & Khuat (2002), Constable(2003), Phan (2005), Belanger(2007) and Ghosh (2009) CBM’S is also making the disparity in different economic factors like per capita income and economic growth. Socially it makes dissimilar new concepts, attitudes, cultures, norms, gender sex ratio, marriageable age between the crowded and abode country society. It means that CBM’S is becoming a factor for changing the world’s social structure. According to Zhao (2003) CBM’S also creates world labor market. Shih (1998) and Li (2001) noticed that CBM’S are the burning questions in the world because due to it globally constructed values have often changed.

circumstances at homes as well as communities. East Asian countries that see CBM’S as a solution to low fertility rate and shortage of wives and reproductive labor. Toyota (2008) argues that people get CBM’S just only to maintain social, political and economic stability. The demand of Asian unmarried and young men is too much in the first world countries regarding CBM’S. Another reason of CBM’S is unemployment within the country because a man is usually anticipated to have attained some measures of economic steadiness before he marries (G. Shahnaz, 2010). According to Constable (2005) CBM’B in Asia places the changing social positing before and after CBM’S at the center in the migratory process. She proposed the concept “Paradoxical hyper gamy” that migrants may find that their economic position and opportunities have improved after migration to rich country while, their social positions in the native society and in the husbands kin groups are lower than the ones to migration in their host society. Young Pakistani gender doing CBM’S as a shortcut to exit in developed countries. Frustrated and instable economic, political and limited opportunities provoke the youth for this action.

Methodology

Qualitative and quantitative methods were employed for this study. 30 respondent taken under consideration in this research with review of global literature. Interviews were conducted for data collection at the respondent’s home. Researcher collected data from December 2011 to 2015 residing in Karachi and Islamabad. Purposive sampling method was used for data collection. Researcher chooses this area of research because large number of marriage migrant had left Pakistan over the past three decade. According to Guthrie (2010) almost social scientists follow the scientific research method and apply quantitative methodology. The purpose of the quantitative interview was to know about the economic position of the respondents and their families before CBM’S. Interviews are the fundamental starting place of many facts because interviews are a productive way to gather remarkable information from the respondents. Open-ended and close-ended format of questionnaire is used. In this way it is easy to acquire quantitative facts from the assorted choice options. Through this method researcher gets an obvious picture about the CBM’S and this gave respondents the opportunity to state their opinions without being restricted by limited multiple choice options and explain their answers properly and detailed.

Key Findings

The study was conducted to find out the main reason, why Pakistani youth as well as adults want to go to developed countries. Findings show that the main reason for leaving their own country is, improving economic stability in their lives, poverty and unemployment. Secondly the reason is to improve education, among many other reasons improving family status and family honor in the community and society. It is supposed
that men satisfy their sexual desires and successfully prevent the issue of being alone. In Pakistan Joint family system is quite common as well as nuclear families are also established, in both systems native families support their bread earners to get better job opportunity by all means because they expect that they will give economic stability in future establishment. Due to this reason their family especially wives suffer, whereas, other family members have usual lives, even their husbands have advantage of polygamy with the foreign women and gets a legal cover to their stay in a foreign country.

60% respondents were leaving abroad for economic stability. 10% go for better education. 10% go for improving standard of living. 16.6% go for economic and education while 3.4% go for political asylum or escape from cases being registered criminal issue and cases (Table 1). According to the International Migration Organization, in 2009, the number of international migrants under the family meeting system specially CBM’S accounted for around 35% of the total number of international migrants around the world. It means CBM’S provide a great opportunity to enhance the economic remuneration and geographical mobility. It changes the economics rather social myths and norms because the people have the desired to leave their norms, myths, customs, traditional values, patriarchal dominancy and terrorism etc.

46% CBM’S happen just for economic stability. 8% CBM’S for sexual satisfaction. 3.3% CBM’S for second family formation & residence while 23.3% to avoid loneliness in foreign country (Table 2). Results clearly show that economical need is a main issue of CBM’S. Asian youth clearly understand that for International migrant CBM’S is an actual protected mode of migrating overseas. It shows that socially it makes dissimilar new concepts, attitudes, cultures, norms, gender sex ratio, marriageable age between the crowd and abode country society. It means that CBM’S is becoming a factor for changing the world social structure.

53.3% males get financial stability, 16.7 get level of satisfaction, 20% were far from their loving native families while only 10% fulfilled all of their desires (Table 3). It means through CBM’S respondents fulfill their all anticipations, intentions and desired.

It is important that 93.33 % people don’t want to come back to their innate families because they suppose that if they come back then they will become economically unstable and also they become habitual of luxuries life which is not available at their inborn countries. Only 6.7% want to come back to their country (Table 4).

Education qualification of the men was varying. Study shows that 13.3 % were matriculate. 20 % were Intermediate and 6.7% were graduate, while 10% were post graduate, 26.7 had technical education, whereas 23.3% were having any professional degree (Table 5). Results shows that all the people who want to go to abroad were educated.
Due to CBM’S 53.3 % respondents native wife suffered, 40 % foreigner wife suffered while only 6.7 % man suffered by themselves (Table 6). According to Constable (2005) CBM’B in Asia places the shifting social situation afore and later CBM’S at the midpoint of the migratory development. Women in Asia usually are strictly socially, religiously, spiritually and economically prohibited to entertain her without their husbands so they are mentally and physically disturb. She also propose the concept of “PARADOXICAL HYPER GAMY” that asylum seeker may find that their economic position and opportunities have upgraded after CBM’B to wealthier state while their social places in the receiving society and in the husbands kin groups are lower than the ones to migration in their sending society.

Gender was not considered by the researcher during research, randomly selected 80% respondents were male. The researcher was most interested in the person irrespective of gender, who could explain either one or more aspects of CBM’S. All the male and female respondents had his/her own mentality regarding their myths, norms, customs, religion, ethnicity, socially constructed values and surrounded environment but one thing was same that all the respondents needed better lives. Due to this mentality they used CBM’S.

Before CBM’S the families of respondents were from poor income families. They all belonged to low class families with large family size. They earn money by all means but 25% respondent never left their education, even they did odd jobs to continue their education. 25% earned money by the working in the different political parties. Educated respondents earned money by home tuitions in the upper class families.

According to a British Higher Education Statistics Agency Report, Pakistan accounts for 54 per cent of UK’s (non-EU) international students. In 2009-2012 there were over 9, 815 Pakistani students enrolled in higher education institutes. Furthermore, popular countries such as Canada, North America, several North European countries, including Sweden and Finland are attracting thousands of Pakistani students to their universities. More than 8,458 Pakistani students studied in Australia in 2009-2010, increase of 11.4 % over 2008-2009. Once these men secure their enduring visas, to attain their goal they take the alternate ways. Left they are troubled and mentally distressed women who have no alternates but to either wait due to family commitments or face social challenges if they leave their families behind. Pakistani families need to be cautious about assessing prospective spouses for their dear ones by thorough background check, assess their emotional involvement towards their spouse to-be, getting personal information and assessing their trust worthiness. A time where Pakistan already faces political, economic and social challenges nationally and in the internationally, the country cannot afford individuals to damage its image any further.
Through CBM’S men is not only pampering the lives of acquitted women in Pakistan for their self-vested curiosity abroad but sendoff a communal disgrace for both these women residing overseas and in Pakistan.

**Recommendations**

- The state should be able to create employment in easy way in government, public or private sector because a man is usually anticipated to have attained some measures of economic steadiness before he married
- Try to change the social norms, customs and myths regarding marriages. There is a need to raise and facilitate the CBM’S couples in first world countries as well as third world countries.
- Workshops, open seminars should be held for awareness rising in common public.

**Conclusions**

According to Constable (2005) CBM’S do not occur in random geographic topologies but are rather shaped and limited by exciting and gives rise to cultural, social, historical, political and economic factors. The researcher also noticed that by global marriage chains, referring to a phenomenon in which inter-ethnic marriages a cross border are often triggered by a previous wave of within group marriage migration. The people who do CBM’S suppose that the host society provides financial stability. According to F. Michele & L. Lenore (2008) CBM’S between Pakistani men and Japanese women occurred only for job opportunities, economic motivation and culture practice. It was also noticed that Japanese women want to establish their home at UAE rather Pakistan because of the modern lifestyle and less control from their husband’s family and enjoy the social support of some kin members as well. CBM’S create many answerable questions for the social scientists like:

- How to delineate this type of family component?
- Is CBM’S providing the level of gratification to the 3rd world republics folks?
- How gender kindred are being prearranged in CBM’s?
- How do family members interconnect and interact across the border?

The growing number of CBM’S in the European Union creates kin groups of different national origins to a new social unit and creates affiliations and obligations across different states. L.Jutta (2010) describe that partners living in “mixed marriages” have to develop new strategies to cope with the dispersed family network and to organize interaction with family members within and beyond the borders. CBM’S are considered that it is the ticket for immigration of developed countries. The research found out that through CBM’S third world countries gender fulfill their financial needs and enjoying luxuries life but usually they lose their moral attitudes and native family love. It was also
found that the major reason is economic perspective rather other factors. education is also a priority given by the respondents.

References


Cross Border Marriages (CBM’s) between Pakistan to Developed Countries: 
A Socio-Economic Perspective

Hugo, G. & Nguyen. THX. (2007). Marriage Migration between Vietnam and Taiwan: A 
View from Vietnam. Attane.I. and Christophe. Z. Eds. Watering the Neighbor’s 
Garden: The Growing Demographic Female Deficit in Asia. Guiimoto, CIRED: 

Jones, G. & H.H., Shen. (2007). International Marriage in East and Southeast Asia: 

Case Study of Greek-German Couples in Athens WPTC-02-10.

Review Issue.

Phizacklea. Ed. One Way Ticket: Migration and Female Labor. London: 
Routledge & Kegan Paul.

from Vietnam. Seminar on Female Deficit in Asia: Trends and Perspectives. 
Singapore. December.

Hakka Community. 17-33. Cross-border Marriages. Gender and Mobility in 
Press.


Across Transnational Spaces. Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power 7: 
1-16, 441-459.

Taiwanese men, Ho Chi Minh City.

Kegan Paul: London and Boston.


Annex: Tables of the Study Findings

Table 1
Distribution according to reason for leaving home country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason For Leaving Home Country</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economics Stability</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve Standard of Living</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics &amp; Education</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political or Criminal Issue</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2
Distribution according to reason for CBM’S

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for CBM’S</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economics Stability</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexuality</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd Family Formation &amp; Residence</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loneliness</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3
Distribution according to through CBM’S respondents gets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Through CBM’S Respondents Gets</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial Stability</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>53.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of Satisfaction</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Far From Their Loving Native Families</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fulfill Their All Desires</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4
Distribution according to people wants to come back to Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason For Back To Pakistan</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>93.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 5
**Distribution according to education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post Graduate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6
**Distribution according due to CBM’S which wife suffers more, native or foreigner**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survival by CBM’S</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Native Wife</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>53.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreigner Wife</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Himself</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Shagufta Jahangir** is Ph.D Scholar in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.

**Dr. Asma Manzoor** is an Assistant Professor in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.
Exploring Uncounted Contribution of Women in Bangladesh: Barriers, Implications and Opportunities

Tania Haque
Department of Women and Gender Studies
University of Dhaka

Abstract

Work is typically divided along gender lines with men being responsible for the outside work and as the main income-earner and women for housework and child care. Women’s unpaid work is not recognized and therefore, women are considered as passive dependents. Non-recognition of women’s activity not only leads to undervaluation of economic contribution but also contributes to their lower status in society relative to men in Bangladesh. Therefore unpaid work is not a gender-neutral bundle of chores that women perform out of comparative advantage or lower resources but instead it is an integral part to the reproduction of unequal power relations between men and women.

Keywords: Unpaid Work, Empowerment, and Recognition of Unpaid Work.

Introduction

At the macro and micro levels of gender analysis, the gendered division of work and responsibilities imply labor immobility and less income on the part of women. Men on the other hand dominate the market economy and consequently have more income. This further translates into unequal power relations in the household as a consequence of gender imbalance in terms of income (World Bank, 2001). The widespread entry of
women into labor work since 1980’s has challenged the presumption that women’s primary role is that she is the caretaker for home and family only (Shelton, 1996). In Bangladesh, a husband's ability to provide economically for the family is intimately linked with the notions of masculinity as well as personal and family honor. But this social content is changing. Education and employment have provided them with new avenues to assert themselves. More importantly this particular paid work suggests new ways for women to identify their values, reclaim their identities and define success of their own terms (McKenna, 1997). It has expanded the number of women who are able to achieve self-reliance, economic agency within the family which had made their significant economic contribution to their families. At the same time, it also challenges the myth of the male breadwinner model of the family in Bangladesh (Mahmud 2002). Although women are the major producer of non-market economy but current system of GDP measurement excluded them from mainstream and made them invisible in national statistics.

The paper argues that inclusion of unpaid work will reflect women’s actual contribution to the national income. The major objective of this paper is to develop a new system of counting unpaid work through decomposing the conventional GDP by gender in Bangladesh. The current paper is analyzed by socialist –feminist perspective to address some limitations in the conventional theories. Since socialist feminist thought is based on the premise that the public and private spheres are interwoven and interdependent through the idea of reproduction and production. The paper consists of five sections: The next section of the paper sketches the background of the study. It highlights that unpaid work is creating the secondary status for women and demonstrates how contextual factors sustain their subordinate position in Bangladesh. This section also documents some major changes of women’s involvement in the labor market that have taken place in recent decades. Although these changes are related to the expansion of women’s opportunities and choices, there is a new crisis for women to bear the “double burden”. The section three stated the definition of work, unpaid work and perception towards work. Section four critically explains the side effect towards women due to this unrecognized work such as; economic costs and social costs. Section five pointed out the need for measurement and value creation of unpaid work through which invisible work will become visible and non-worker women will be recognized as worker.

**Background of the Study**

The economic crisis especially of the lost decade of the1980’s has increased the importance of women’s contribution to the household; it also has placed heavy burden on women to meet the rising cost of living, cuts in government services and high levels of unemployment (Safa 1995:82-3). Policies based on market models ignore women’s domestic and reproductive roles (Pearson, 1992). Moser (1993:2) opines that women,
because of their multiple responsibilities assume disproportionate share of the burden of adjusting adverse economic circumstances. Socio-cultural expectations and norms constrain the development of women’s capabilities, resulting in women’s concentration in unpaid household work (Kabeer, 1995). In patriarchal society women’s mobility is synchronized in order to control their sexuality, production and reproduction. Women’s devalued status within the family and society in Bangladesh is reinforced by Purdah remain and confine them to their reproductive responsibilities and those forms of productive work that can be carried out within the home (Kabeer, 2008). These unequal social and cultural circumstances depict women with unequal human capabilities and women are simply not treated as equal with men in the sphere of individual rights. The religious misinterpretation also creates some major obstacle for women to go out as worker. They encourage women to stay at home as ideal homemakers. In a context in which women have learnt from childhood to internalize the inferior status ascribed to them by their society (Kabeer, 2008). Women are generally regarded as subordinate to their male counterparts, have less voice, less autonomy, fewer opportunities and lowered self-esteem. This to a certain extent has to do with the informal cultural norms, inequitable practices and ideologies that affect the women’s ability to secure their entitlements and access to opportunities. The United Nations System of National Accounts (SNA) as applied to Bangladesh and the country’s labor force statistics both take into account only market work and provide estimates of national income which describe the outcome of the economy but fail to capture the total production of the country since it excludes the portion of non market production which is mainly produced by women (Hamid, 1996). Since women are the major contributors of the economy through their involvement in non market labor, such theoretical application have effectively barred them from being reflected in national statistics and have hidden their actual efforts (Hamid, 1996). Thus this study will mark out the economic significance of unpaid work and or its inclusion within macroeconomic framework of national income accounting.

**Labor market Participation of Women in Bangladesh**

According to World Bank report female labor force in Bangladesh was 41.10 in 2009, published in 2010. Labor force comprises people ages 15 and older that meet the International Labor Organization's definition of the economically active population. In Bangladesh 3.25 percent of employed women are working in the government sector and 8.25 percent in the private sector. The remaining 89.5 percent are employed in the informal sector. Women worked longer hour than men, contributing 54% to 60% of total work time, in subsistence economy women contributed 60% to 80%, in domestic sphere 84% to 95%. 


Exploring Uncounted Contribution of Women in Bangladesh: Barriers, Implications and Opportunities

Labor force Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2002-03</th>
<th>2005-06</th>
<th>2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td>49.5</td>
<td>56.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>36.0</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>39.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>17.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>35.0</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>43.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>27.4</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>30.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: labor force survey, 2010.

How Much Unpaid Work is done and by Whom?

The total work time contributed by women both in developing and developed countries two third is spent in unpaid work and one third in paid work. Men in developed countries, the shares are reversed and in developing countries roughly one forth (ILO, 2007). The unequal distribution of unpaid work between women and men are substantially linked to sex segregated labor market and sexual discrimination (Gibson, 2006). The most striking feature of unpaid work is women and men perform it disproportionately in developing and developed countries alike.

Non-market production both subsistence work and housework is a major sector of economy in Bangladesh (Hamid, 1996). Women’s contribution is underrepresented in Bangladesh since labor force surveys have been unable to capture their multiple activities adequately. Hamid (1996) has shown that women spend more time in unpaid work than men. Bangladesh time allocation studies articulated that women’s total work load ranged from 50% to 58% and women’s hours to total work remained more or less for all socio economic groups (Khuda, 2008). Further findings included that:

a. Conventional GDP estimates capture 98% of men’s production but only 47% of women’s production.

b. Under the presence of United Nations System of National Accounts (UNSNA) production boundary definitions 95% of nonmarket production is excluded.

c. In rural areas women contribute 53% and men 47% of total time.

d. Of the total time spent on the non-market work, women contribute 89% and men 11%.
Men have 12 percent more leisure time than women

Table: 1
Percentage distribution of population aged 15 years and above by economic category, residence and sex, 2005-06

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic category</th>
<th>Bangladesh</th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Rural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Both sex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population aged 15+ (million)</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>43.0</td>
<td>41.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor force</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>86.8</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not in Labor force</td>
<td>41.5</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>70.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total labor force</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>95.8</td>
<td>96.7</td>
<td>93.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not in labor force</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household work</td>
<td>68.7</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>80.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>65.4</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: http://www.bbs.gov.bd/dataindex/labour_force05-06.pdf

Women in Bangladesh work on average 16 hours a day are involved in various unpaid housework. Therefore women work about 771.2 million hours a year at household work with an estimated value of somewhere between US$69.81 and 91.03 billion, if these work were added to GDP than GDP would more than double (Biswas and Ruma, 2007). Islam (2006) an estimate of the Bangladesh Home workers women association (BHWA) discovered that that annual contributions of home based workers to the GDP is about Tk 150 billion (US $2.59 billion). This paper also shows that women contribute 41 per cent to total GDP. Hamid(1996) found that the average women in Bangladesh contribute 4,765 taka (US$133.14) annually economy through her unpaid work of which 3% is from subsistence production and 95% from household work. For men the figure is 219 taka (US$6.19) 29% from own account subsistence production and 71% from housework. Hamid calculated that annually over 188 billion taka (US$5.25 billion) worth of work uncounted in national statistics. Hamid further calculated that Bangladesh’s GDP in 1989/90, calculated at 638 billion taka (US$17.83 billion) would increase by 29% to 825 billion taka (US$23.05 billion) if unpaid work were included. Similarly Hamid calculated that the percentage of national production attributed to women would increase significantly from 25% to 41% if unpaid work were included in the national economy. The amount contributed by men automatically would fall 75% to 59%.
Women entrepreneurs constitute less than 10% of the total business entrepreneurs in Bangladesh whereas women in advanced market economies own more than 25% of all businesses. Moreover the constitution of Bangladesh has failed to guarantee women’s equal opportunity as well as safety in every formal and informal sector irrespective of sex, race, caste or ethnic group. In addition tasks performed simultaneously are often under reported and the intensity of effort is not counted: -the burden of unpaid and paid work respectively is distributed unequally between men and women. As a result men receive the lion’s share of income and recognition for their economic contribution –while most of the women’s work remains unpaid, unrecognized and undervalued (UNDP, 1995).

Why workers particularly women workers are under counted and why women’s work invisible? Why women’s work is predominantly seasonal, intermittent and uncertain as they work frequently work as unpaid workers on family farms or in informal sectors, which are not properly recorded. Considering these questions this paper seeks to address the policy response to the empowerment of women in the informal economy through the national gender policy. It would help to ensure more equitable linkages between the formal and informal economies and would likely lead to mutual benefits of operating formally or informally (Chen, 2004). These are wider structural factors that need to be taken into account as they determine whom accesses resources and the markets, who benefits and who does not.

**Sequencing the Methodology and Data Collection**

The approach used in this study is based on a feminist standpoint, engaging a level of consciousness about one’s social location and that location may justify their social position (Harding, 1992). Using women’s lives as a starting point decreases the partiality and distortions in our images and perceptions of social relations (Harding 1992:181). Articulating experience according to Harding (1992; 178) is a crucial means of creating knowledge for all and all women’s lives are valuable for generating feminist knowledge. This process of articulating knowledge is central to consciousness-raising and for women’s voices to be heard. Thus there is a need for them to speak from their standpoint,
perspective and experience. The analysis is based on the secondary data in nature and relies on multiple resources. Academic contributions in books, journals, government documents as well as published and unpublished works were explored. In addition numerous updated websites on this particular issue covering contributions and innovations worldwide are also included. The literature facilitated both the theoretical understanding of the care economy concept as well as challenges.

Research grounder in this type of inquiry provides a set of sensitive and complex analytical tools for understanding the structures, processes and outcomes of unpaid work towards women. The construction of reproduction and production with its emphasis on unpaid and paid work highlights the artificial boundaries amongst market, the family and the state. However, this paper is simply a way of enabling to share women’s experiences and make their voices heard. Therefore, the aim of our review is to offer readers a comprehensive outlook on complex and ample new data on unpaid work. It represents a timely effort to synthesize the available literature and to shed light of different levels of analysis adopted by researchers. The data has been analyzed by using gender lens.

The following section questions the dichotomy between work and non-work. The analysis clearly stated that the dilemma between paid and unpaid work started from the way in which work is generally defined.

**What is Work; Unanswered Questions**

What constitutes work as an activity? Work is a source of personal identity. Consequently work and occupation are important bases of social evaluation. Therefore, work and occupation are solid social facts that condition life chances (Coleman, 1978:47). Particular values and functions of work are specific to time and place and the meaning of work responds to variations in social structure. In the case of Census of Population the term work has been defined as any productive work for which remuneration is paid and is market related and “worker” is a person employed in “work”. Thus Mills defined

> Work is a source of income; the amount level and security of pay and what one’s income history has been are part of work and in the general community... work also carries various assorts of power, over materials and tools and machines but more crucially now over other people (1953; 230).

There have four crucial features for defining the definition of work such as:

Firstly, formal work endorses the wider social participation or citizenship of the individual. Formal employment means ‘the right to accede to the public, economic sphere through one’s work is a necessary part of the right citizenship. Work gives the individual access to an important source of public legitimating and status (Shelton, 1996). Secondly, work is that which is within the public sphere. Activities carried out under an agreed
contractual agreement, in a particular time and place, which are declared for the purpose of taxation. Thirdly, work involves some form of exertion or effort is relatively self-explanatory. Fourth, work is only productive activity. The official definition of work in Bangladesh is based on ILO definition:

A person aged 15 years or above who was either working one or more hours for pay and for profit or working without pay in a family, farm or enterprise or organization during the reference period or found not working but had a job or business from which he/she temporarily absent during the reference period.

**Unpaid Work/Non Work; As an Analytical Tool**

Unpaid work can be understood to comprise all productive activities outside the official labor market done by individuals for their own households or for others. Unpaid work includes all non-remunerated work activities, which lack social recognition. Unpaid work is ‘non-market’ work and includes activities such as housework, care for children, the sick, and the elderly voluntary community work, work in political or community organizations; subsistence, agriculture, fuel and water collection. Reproductive labor is defined as unpaid work that is necessary to ensure the daily maintenance and ongoing reproduction of the labor force. Reproduction is of two types: one is biological and another one is social (Beneria, 1982).

a. Biological reproduction refers to giving birth to new human beings, an activity which only women can perform.
b. Social reproduction refers to all caring and nurturing activities necessary to ensure human survival and maintenance.

Folbre (2000) defined that housework which services other members of a household and family. These definitions may not always enable differentiation between work, non-work and leisure. Caring is predominantly female activity and its study appears both to demand an analysis rooted in the gender order and facilitate the development of knowledge on the oppression of women (1980). Definitions of care are complex because it is multifaceted. The concept of care is based on seven distinct interlocking variables.

a. The social identity of carer: gender is the social identifier for this dimension of care. Such as wives, mothers
b. The social identity of the care recipient; care recipients in terms of dependency group such as children, older people, disabled, social group such as family.
c. The interpersonal relation between carer and carer recipient: friendship, neighbors
d. The nature of care: an activity and feeling state.
e. Social domain within which caring relationship is located; social division of labor in capitalist society
f. Economic character of cares relationship; waged and unwaged status of caring work.
g. Institutional setting in which caring is delivered; home as the main institutional setting.

| Table: 1 |
|---|---|---|
| **Different variables of Care** | **Accepted phenomenon** | **Expected phenomenon** |
| Social identity of care | Women | Men and women |
| Social identity of recipient | Dependents | Dependents |
| Interpersonal relationship | Familial | Familial |
| Nature of the care | Work activities | Work activities |
| Social domain | Domestic and Private | Domestic and private |
| Economic relationship | Unwaged | Recognition or waged |
| Institutional setting | Home | Home residential institution, long stay hospital, community social service unit like day care centre, old home etc. |

The feminist movement of the late 1960’s and 1970’s had major impact on popular and social science definitions of work and created a new language to describe unpaid work and domestic work. Sociologists were more receptive than economists to seeing work as socially constructed category (Hartman, 1976). This new focus extended the concept of work to include labor that was not directly economic (Glucksmann, 1995) and also Marxist feminist (Hartman, 1981) and labor economists (Becker, 1991) to explore the hidden economic value of these bundle of works.

The increasing lack of formal employment opportunities forces many workers to take up self employed work, often at or from the home. On the other hand, global contracts is forcing many to cut costs through more flexible work contracts or subcontracting thus leading to the increase in the number of women employed as piece rate workers. To capture the variation in available work opportunities and available opportunities in the context of Bangladesh we organized four categories of work: a) paid work and b) unpaid work c) subsistence work d) economy inactivity or voluntary work. Women remain concentrated in invisible areas of informal work, which offer precarious employment status, low, irregular or no remuneration, no access to social security and human rights (Heintz, 2006). Economic analysis will not tell us how much a woman investing her time on cooking, cleaning or childcare or how much time they are using for informal work and what kind of life they are continuing. Women’s contribution is not counted as formal work in such sector even though they are responsible for the majority of the work done is
these sectors and often these works are associated with subsistence economy, which is not counted in the GDP. The following explanation will clearly state that unpaid works are situating women’s vulnerable condition where women are working as an active agent but perceived as passive dependents.

**Housework in Bangladesh; Inequality between Men and Women**

Although large numbers of women in one part are doing outside activities, women in most other parts of the country are fully involved in household activities that mean they are housewives. Thus, the female labor participation rate in table is low as it covers women in a country as a whole. The distribution of time allocated to unpaid work across non-poor and poor households shows a lot of variation (Hochschid, 1989).

**Table: 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment Category</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban housewives/household work</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural housewives/ household work</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total housewives/ Household work</strong></td>
<td><strong>43.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.9</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban Employed</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Employed</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>26.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Employed</strong></td>
<td><strong>9.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>34.3</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BBS 2005; Numbers in million

Women living in rural areas perform a wide range of activities related with the household than women in urban settings. It is important to note that there is a difference in time spent on housework between rural and urban areas:

I. **Urban Sector:** Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics report wise 53.2 million people are engaged in housework full time where 43.3 million are women and 0.9 million are men (BBS, 2005), working about 16 hours day on an average. In Bangladesh time allocation studies estimated that women’s contribution to total work load ranged from 50% to 58% and that for women hours of total work remained more or less constant for all socio economic classes (Khuda,1982).

II. **Rural Sector:** To understand the extent of sex-based activity in rural Bangladesh it is important to have knowledge of rural settlements. Their primary unit is a Bari, which consists of two or six houses around a square or rectangular courtyard. The existent social system dictates that women specialize in the task that can manage the Bari. They fetch water, clean house, and cook, serve meals, wash dishes, and care children raising poultry, tending of livestock, and growing vegetables. Rural people in Bangladesh are dependent on traditional technology for household management. So water collection is almost a female activity. Women in rural
Bangladesh spend nearly five hours daily on housework and about an hour on subsistence production (Mahmud, 2002). In addition men spend a negligible amount of time on housework and devote less than half an hour daily subsistence work. In case of women aged group 10 to 64 shares the burden of work almost equally. Mobility and employment opportunities of women have traditionally been restricted in rural Bangladesh. Barkat E Khuda focus that work is seasonal fluctuations in the employment structure in rural areas. Moreover men and women from nuclear households enjoy the highest leisure compared to extended family. Women sometimes work with husbands in nearby fields to harvest pulses, mustard or at ponds to clean jute. So the activity pattern of rural women in Bangladesh is dependent on gender, class and age and religion, traditional technology and season.

Housework increases with the size of the household but appears to be different on the ratio between men and women. In addition the size of female space for paid and unpaid varies regionally in Bangladesh as the district of the country differs from each other in economic condition and in practice of purdah (Kanti Paul, 2012). The proportion of time spent on unpaid or domestic activities conforms to that abstract notion of ‘work’ and work is becoming more and more concentrating in the ‘paid economy’. The activities remaining in the home are more personal aspects of domestic life, which are least easily assumed under the dominant notion of “work” and retain the characteristics of invisibility that used to characterize unpaid work. Systematic underreporting and misrepresentation of women’s contribution in the economy …perpetuate a vicious circle of inequality between women and men. These inequalities are based on and linked to gender lines as well as class (poverty, education), rural/urban distinctions, ethnicity, religion, age, etc. In the context of Bangladesh the informal economy is largely unregulated, unrecognized and the informal workers operate as a heterogeneous lot with no fixed station. Organization and representation of the informal economy has thus been a great challenge. However, there is generally lack of pension for these workers and this makes them more vulnerable during old age. The existing legal framework and infrastructure makes it difficult for unions to organize informal workers. This is not only due to insufficient resources but also due to lack of political will.

**Revisiting Unpaid Work through Feminists Lens; Costs of Unpaid Work**

The conventional view of the household as a simple corporate unit (Becker, 1976, 1981) does not encourage investigating the internal diplomacy of the household. But it has been argued by Folbre that there are considerable and persistent gender based inequalities in allocation of productive resources and distribution of benefits (1988). Sharma stated that in ‘the feminist discourse the household is no longer an irreducible unit, it has an inner politics of its own which is not divorced from the politics of the society in which it is
embedded” (1986:3). Opening the black box thus can prove to be the starting point for research which takes a close look at the way power structures within the family are not only generated, reproduced and legitimized and so on. Agarwal (1997) describes household have multidimensional actors with varying preferences and interests and differential abilities to pursues and realize those interest. Housework inequality is a form of exploitation, which is experienced by women in relationship with men. Although Bangladesh is patriarchal, there is a common perception about women staying at home to do particularly home based work and care for the children (Mahmud, 2002).

We can say that economic independence does not bring social independence. The male identity is still entangled with being the “‘breadwinner”’, while the female identity is still enmeshed with being the ‘‘caregiver’’. Women’s work and role have shifted by participating in labor force participation, though there is a new crisis for women to bear the “double burden”. Consequently women should continue to perform acceptable amounts of domestic labor and at the same time men should not have increased unpaid work time at any substantial degree. When financial pressure challenges men’s adequate economic capacity, women get the entry point to tackle men’s position in challenging financial gap but not men’s capacity. It has been revealed, that women’s income is a supplement rather than a replacement for male’s wage. The shifts in women’s labor force participation have not altered the household division of labor, so there is a weak link between labor market and household for women only. The gender perspective implies that women should have less free time than men because women are responsible for ensuring that all housework gets done regardless of how much time they spend in paid work. Findings from cross sectional document that women do more housework and child care than men and marriage, children and employment increase women’s household labor but has little effect on men’s unpaid work (Blau and Ferber, 1986). Parents’ couples spend considerably more time in paid and unpaid work and have less free time compared with non parent’s couple and the difference has increased from 1965 to 1998. Studies of dual career families (Sara1981) have found that even when wives are employed in high-level professional positions they still have to bear major responsibility for domestic chores. Married employed women may show a “toleration of domestication,” changing their family life styles a very little despite the addition of professional roles, because of early socialization patterns for women and supports by the existing social structures (Kandiyoti,1988). Safa’s (1995) study has shown that volume of unpaid work changes and determined by class variables. Upper and middle class have alternative options for replacing their work volume. Gender as an analytical concept focuses on women’s roles and responsibilities in relation to those of men. Okin (1989) points out that ‘gender is the deeply embedded institutionalization of sexual difference’. In this context, it is not surprising that women world over are disadvantaged in terms of access to resources and power in relation to men. Hirway (2000:120-21) argued that this ideal model of household ignores the structural differences that operate as more
interpersonal issues. Women’s continued acceptance of responsibility for these chores can be seen as the other side of the coin to surrendering their capacity to work outside. Overall, women’s share of paid work hours has been increasing at a very high rate. The unequal division of time spent on unpaid work acts as a part of a *vicious circle* that leaves women economically and politically disadvantaged; thus resulting economic dependency which reduces their ability to assert their own time needs in the home and makes them more vulnerable to exploitation and abuse. Housework inequality is a form of exploitation, which is experienced by women in relationship with men. Women as well as men legitimize male control over women’s time and work participation.

Revealing the hidden cost associated with unpaid care work is merely the first step in understanding the complex relationship between the distribution of responsibilities for meeting needs as influenced by public policy and the distribution of costs.

In the context of Bangladesh women are accepted primarily as homemakers, women’s rightful position in the society is housewives that are their first identity. Most of the women are negotiating with outside job but they have no options of negotiation with unpaid care work. Women’s double-day work is one of the most non-controversial issues in this society. As we have demonstrated from a variety of geographical locations, where most of the women seek to redistribute household tasks generally to other women like from mothers to daughters or other female relatives or female maidservants. So housework is *women’s work*.

Failure to recognize the economic value and extra ordinary extent of unpaid domestic and community services have thus led to insensitive and ineffective policies which have also reinforced and undermined women’s lower status in the society. This study will push the boundaries of much current Marxists thought and will seek to expand a materialist framework to account forms of labor that lie ‘outside value’. Politically and in terms of women’s representation, policy approach towards the empowerment of women is silent on shifting opportunities towards equality for women on the supply side. In addition, the dual legal system has been an impediment in terms of the rights for women, which in turn lower their level of economic activity. On the demand side the women’s agency has not been strengthened as there is inadequate representation in policy dialogue and hence women cannot hold policy makers to account on matters affecting them. Sen (1990) has observed that there is frequently reluctance in the development literature to consider the position of women as a separate problem that is important on its own.

**Counting Unpaid Work is the Basic Path of Gender Equality between Men and Women**

Providing paid work for women is one way to become productive labor force but socially prescribed roles leave limited access to economic resources. If we unpack the household no doubt people will get the smell of patriarchy their gendered ideological construction
emphasized several separate prescriptions for women. Empowerment is the only solution for giving equal status to women in any society. There is a need for more sustainable and transformative strategies that address the social issue more comprehensively.

Most of the women’s work fall in the domain of non monetized segment of the economy which has not been counted in national accounts, perpetuating the myth that women have not been contributing as much as men in the economy (ESCAP, 2000). The artificial macro and micro economy perpetuated the belief that women’s unpaid work and reproductive activities were not of any real significance (Hirway, 2000). The care economy of unpaid work that sustains the current labor force raises the future workforce. The underestimation of unpaid work in economic terms is partly due to limited definition of economic activity, which considers economic value synonyms with market value (Hirway, 2000). The failure to recognize the economic value of unpaid work leads to the beliefs that people who spend their time on caring for others without compensation are unproductive, inactive unemployed and outside the business cycle. The importance of recognizing the economic contributions of all forms of work –paid and unpaid- as a precondition for achieving- gender equality. The gender division of labor between paid and unpaid work has resulted in women being concentrated in economic activities with low earnings, irregular jobs where there is little protection of labor laws. Interventions are needed to promote gender equality by allowing women to devote more time to higher productivity and reducing the time spent on unpaid work in rural and urban areas (Hirway, 2000). Through the years, the economic value of unpaid work was ignored and economic theory has supported this implicit gender bias. Analysts have noted that there is no inherent reason why some activities are remunerated and some are not; the same activity may be paid or unpaid depending on the social and economic context.

Measuring unpaid work was one of the major challenges of governments that emerged UN third world conference on women in Nairobi in 1985 and the UN fourth world conference on women in Beijing in 1995. The process of imputation only can make women’s work visible, influencing concepts and policies and questioning values. Demands for the full recognition of women’s economic production culminated in the platform for Action adopted in September 1995 at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing (1995). Becker (1976) conceptualized households as not only main driving economic force for the market economy but also as the most important agent in the grants economy. We note that there has been significant rhetorical recognition of the importance of gender in political economy at the level of policy making. But the shift to counting unpaid work and household work as part of the economy has not been fully implemented. The concept of economic citizenship is used to emphasize the rights of citizens as workers and as economic contributors. Scholars argued that the work of reproductive labor was indispensible to the ongoing reproduction and maintenance of the productive labor force (Hartman, 1976).
The fallacy of ignoring these features of economy first pointed out by Heart (1973) and generated a wealth of literature and debates between those who viewed that unpaid work is marginal and peripheral to economic development and others who considered unpaid work is the dynamic form of development. The time women spend in unpaid work is time women can devote to paid work. Conventional data on GDP do not generally include the goods and services produced for self-consumption within the household. It could raise 50 to 60 percent of National Economy (Peterson, 2005).

It was found that nonmarket work about 190 billion annually, women contribute 95% of which. Own account production answers for only 5 percent of this amount and rest of the amount 95% being created through housework (Hamid, 1999; 35). It was observed that the opportunity cost on average was about 81% of informal wages although the patterns of the two wages are almost equal. The formal, informal and opportunity cost indicated a tendency of self-exploitation and undervaluation of time spent in subsistence and housework production in rural Bangladesh (BIDS, 2005). In this case, the national policies should be reviewed and revised in order to incorporate and include women’s participation in the subsistence economy in the national economy. The perception of the mass people regarding working women and their work should be taken into consideration.

Feminist economists are giving thoughtful attention to the implications of paying for unpaid care work. Most of the feminists are calling for a high degree of modification of unpaid work that the present gender system assigns as duties to the female caste as a means to gender equity (Becker, 1982). We need to measure and value unpaid work; that much is agreed. So we will have to identify the most efficient system, which can open up the other eye of statistical binoculars, with which we view the economy. The importance of policies to address and improve the situation of women cannot be overstressed. The reality is positive changes by which women’s situation not only benefits them but also benefits from other members of their household and society as a whole. Further it is necessary to bring these policies together in a more holistic perspective that encompasses productive and reproductive work.

Policy is usually constructed within a certain ideology that frames the interpretation serving particular interest groups that may be at the exclusion of others. Ideology in this context is a coherent and relatively stable set of beliefs or values. Dominant ideologies appear as neutral holding on to assumptions that stay largely unchallenged. For instance the outlined objectives as stated in the policy assume women entrepreneurs are homogeneous. The policy discourse analysis must examine the framing of the problem in relation to the generation of answers offered. Only then can we see what is implied, suppressed or forgotten. In this sense the policy is not so much in touch with the reality of women entrepreneurs. For instance, the policy is silent on addressing the cultural inequalities that constrains the mobility and ability of women to engage in productive work (Pearson, 2010). The policy has a good ideology of removing barriers that constrain
women’s participation in trade but yet it is not addressing a crucial element of their inability to do so, which in this case is their dual roles. The gender division of labor at household level is embedded in cultural norms and ideologies and for some of these ideologies to change; gender sensitive values must be promoted at the policy level. Therefore, the silence of the policy in addressing cultural constraints amounts to perpetuating the status quo of women because it does not address the stereotypes of women associated with infringement of their freedom and choices. The policy is equally silent on addressing gender sensitive language in communication. The policy is also silent on addressing the contradictions in the legal framework. The dual legal system has been an infringement on the rights of women’s economic empowerment. It has meant women having less access to factors of production. The vision of the government to empower women by removing barriers in trade is not linked to this reality. The policy says one thing and the legal framework says another.

This literature review summarizes the research works and findings, which show that unpaid work is creating unequal situation between women and men in Bangladesh. It argues that women’s contribution has largely been unacknowledged in policymaking process. The present review shows that there is an explicit gender division of labor within the household sector, informal sector and subsistence sector. Men predominantly do market works and women predominantly perform income conserving work including post-harvest activities and domestic work. We turn now to consider different aspects of this changing context, which cumulatively are rising new questions about unpaid work and its future such as- who will do this work? Who will pay for it? How will it be structured and understood? Should unpaid work be given a separate field of policy, provision and practice? In this way the wider contribution of caring might be recognized as a productive contributions rather than social costs.

This is the biggest challenge of the policies designed to lift the position of women, the intent is good but when it comes to implementation there are neither clear channels of execution or monitoring. This in turn has had a ripple effect in producing inequalities in terms of ability to enhance market-relevant skills. Improvement of women’s situation cannot be achieved without an understanding of the difficulties they face and the needs they have. This is what this study has attempted to unearth. Effective relevant action to improve the disadvantaged position of women requires harmonization of research, policy and action.

**Global Study vs. Global Lens to Measure Unpaid Work**

If the unpaid work is given recognition in economic terms we can outline two alternative ways –separate but equal or integrated –in which unpaid work could be counted. Duncan Ironmonger claimed that ‘we need a major change in view of our reality (…)’. The reality of huge unpaid households to economic value needs to be accepted; adopted as a benchmark fact; it would change our social and economic policy (Fraser, 2009; 60). Folbre
(1994) argues that public investments should be made in formal care supports to relieve overburdened family caretakers. Loss of family wage, greater work load and rising women’s labor force participation have intensified stress on parents especially mothers. Across the US employers are voluntarily instituting work/life policies to reduce worker stress. Economists will face critical challenges in integrating unpaid work in their scientific endeavors. Therefore four elements of modern gender equality policy are discussed:

I. Promoting a more equal sharing of unpaid work between men and women: Direct state intervention to persuade men to accept equal sharing of unpaid work. In case of lone mothers, singles of all ages lacks sharing partner.

II. Rearranging of work: Introducing changes in the organization of paid employment in order to facilitate the individual combination of paid and unpaid work. To bring change in formal organizations through adopting family friendly policy such as maternity leave, paternity leave, leave to care for sick dependents are less controversial than the issue of working time.

III. The provision of public services: Palmer, Elson and other scholars argue that publicly financed infrastructure (road, transport, water, market) facilities and other social services can demolish the burden of unpaid work

IV. Commercialization of domestic labor: Policy approach would have to compromise tax deduction

In recent year time use data has facilitated the construction of satellite accounts capturing production outside of the SNA production boundaries. Social accounting matrix (SAM) analysis is an effective way for examining the interconnection between paid and unpaid work (Beneria, 1999). Three different approaches were used for valuation namely the opportunity cost approach, the replacement cost approach and which is also subdivided into specialist coast approach and generalist cost approach. In other words while being aware of the right to be paid for care work they also felt deeply for notions of love, marriage, home which was unfortunately beyond the nexus of cash transactions. Effective and relevant actions are required to improve the disadvantaged position of women which can be achieved by harmonization of research, policy and action. Beneria (1999; 31) has shown few significant policy options in her study, such as:

a. **Universal provisioning:** Under the Nordic Model, state becoming a direct provider of child care, after school programs, eldercare and health care education services. This model stands in direct opposition to the US tax credit programs and that provide an allowance to families allowing them market choice in which market system remains the main provider. This system mainly combined generous parental paid leave and other tax incentive that have indeed resulted higher market participation of women. In addition the majority state employed workers who provide the caring of women and that has raised concerns for few researchers (Ironmonger, 1996).
b. **Employment Guarantee based:** Unpaid work hours coexist with deficits in employment especially for unskilled workers. Structural constraints and insufficient demand for labor market disproportionately excluded women workers. Thus public employment guarantee programs invested much more infrastructure projects such as construction and maintenance of social services. These programs are gender informed in design and implementation and context specific. In can translate the public investment infrastructure that reduces unpaid work such as rural water projects, feeder roads, which will decrease the time allocation to fetching water. The unpaid work can be truly reduced only when redistributing the cost of reproduction by creating jobs both for women and men instead of reinforcing the existing gender based division of unpaid work. If the projects are not gender neutral there is a possible chance to create a typical *double burden* for women.

c. **Family based cash transfers:** This intervention provides a grant of targeted poor households with children on the condition that in exchange for a monthly cash payment the mother of the child will ensure the child’s welfare in short run and employability of long run. Participating in cash transfer programs will be still in need of fetching water, taking care of infants. Women may be happy to contribute their time to their children’s future but they need separate programs that can ensure their own economic security through training and links to employment (Ironmonger, 1996).

d. **Family work reconciliation policies:** The main objective of this policy is to create effective equality opportunity and treatment both for women and men in the labor market. Reducing work–family conflict is in the interest of higher productivity, lower turnover rates and costs and reducing absenteeism (Ironmonger, 1996). Furthermore employment diversity is an important issue where employers can form a way of creating and maintaining competitiveness. Wages for housework is a temporary solution because it may decrease as soon as the children are grown up. Therefore this idea would not enhance women’s economic independence in the long run because it could formally discourage women’s labor market participation. It may contribute of marinating the traditional division of labor between man and women instead unfreezing it.

**Local Study vs. Local Lens to Measure Unpaid Work**

The above literature review on unpaid work carried out an important issue for changing the unequal situation between men and women. As a developing country we need to consider this issue separately in development process. But, there is hardly a few research appears to have been conducted to date to estimate the value of women’s unpaid work, in the context of Bangladesh. Moreover, women’s contribution is under-represented in Bangladesh since labor force surveys have been unable to capture their multiple activities effectively. Government of Bangladesh has acknowledged in its Poverty Reduction
Strategy Paper (PRSP) that the contribution of women through their unpaid work must be calculated and properly credited. In this case, the national policies should be reviewed and revised in order to incorporate and include women’s participation in the subsistence economy in the national economy. For instance Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics could elaborate a list of different tasks like location, age, class, ethnicity which list could be used to calculate the economic value of unpaid work. In Bangladesh the objective of women’s action is still around Bengali women’s issues. The mainstream women’s movement and women’s organizations have not yet touched indigenous women.

Khuda (2008) mentioned about two critical factors: empowerment of women and its relationship with care economy. He explains the importance of women’s empowerment in the quest for holistic and sustainable human development. He has pointed out that women’s contributions in the national economy are only 20% which is neither sufficient nor appropriate. The study has shown that most of the women are preoccupied of doing unpaid work because most of the women love to do this care works and should not have any monetary value attached to it. The study presented a calculation according to which if women’s care works are counted in the GDP then it would constitute 53.4% of the GDP. This contribution is not counted, not recognized and mostly ignored owing to a patriarchal mindset. The study recommended opportunity cost for women’s contributions in Bangladesh. This study only elaborates the interpretations of some quantitative information, where the in-depth analytical vision is missing. It seems that the author has used the time use survey and then tried to incorporate a minimum wage for the hours spent in the household works. This approach seems somewhat relevant with opportunity cost. In addition Hamid (1994) intends to develop a new system of national income accounting, which can better reflect women's contribution to the national income in Bangladesh. Hamid hound that the most relevant methodology for evaluating time spent in subsistence work and housework and create value through market replacement costs.

This is the biggest challenge of the policies designed to lift the position of women, the intent is good but when it comes to implementation there are neither clear channels of execution or monitoring. This in turn has had a ripple effect in producing inequalities in terms of ability to enhance market-relevant skills. Improvement of women’s situation cannot be achieved without an understanding of the difficulties they face and the needs they have. This is what this study has attempted to unearth. Effective relevant action to improve the disadvantaged position of women requires harmonization of research, policy and action. The study spells out that patriarchal structures create gender asymmetries endowments, risks and constraints which penalize autonomous behavior for women but also offer them provision to remain within it parameters. It is very important to shift the focus from approaches that treat women as victims of development who are waiting to be rescued. The planners should consider that woman as a social agent and that is a necessary to take an agent oriented approach on women’s agenda (Sen, 1990). Therefore women need to be assisted through holistic approach and comprehensive programmes
that not only address their lack of productive resources but also their subordinate situation within households and society at large. In sum, there is a need for multipronged policies to address the needs of different categories of women in Bangladesh. Thus social dialogue and public debate is more powerful for transforming traditional mentalities or cultural norms. There is no doubt that social dialogue takes different roots, new ideas and brings diversity. Women should engage themselves more actively in a constructive debate with policy makers and negotiate the conceptual and policy issues that affect them directly. Wieringa claimed that on question of transformation ‘women should learn to define their own problem (1994; 844). Gender equality cannot be attained in the absence of equal rights and women themselves have to be the active agents for this change. Therefore, a more critical understanding and analysis of political, economic and social realities being faced men and women in developing countries is needed, otherwise gender equality interventions designed towards that end will always be a fallacy.

End Notes


References


Exploring Uncounted Contribution of Women in Bangladesh: Barriers, Implications and Opportunities


*Tania Haque* is an Associate Professor in the Department of Women and Gender Studies, University of Dhaka.
Call for Papers

Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies
Publication of the Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies
University of Karachi

Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies is launched under the patronage of Prof. Dr. Muhammad Qaiser, Vice Chancellor University of Karachi by the Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies, University of Karachi. The journal's main objective is to generate and disseminate knowledge regarding gender issues nationally and internationally with a critical perspective. Its aim is to promote consciousness and awareness about gender equity and balance in human interaction including academic work. In this regard, the journal explores what is meant by gender needs and gender perspective and how these can be best met. In view of our national needs, this publication is in English language. Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies is indexed in EBSCO. It is recognized by Higher Education Commission (HEC) in 'Y' category.

The Journal Would Publish

• Interdisciplinary research in the field of Gender Studies.
• Research on curricula, course outline, reading list and teaching strategies related to Gender Studies.
• Review of books, film and theatrical performances.
• Reports on National and International conferences, symposia and workshops etc. on Gender Studies.

Guidelines for Submissions

• Submissions are invited both in the Urdu and English languages.
• Two copies of the manuscripts, single-spaced, and printed on one side only should be submitted on A4 size paper.
• A soft copy of the paper on CD or through e-mail should also be sent.
• Title page of the paper should be typed separately and should include the author’s name, full mailing address, phone number and email address.
• The length of the paper should be between 3500 to 5000 in words.
• An abstract of the paper no more than 200 words must be submitted along with the paper. The abstract should be followed by key words.
• The papers should include references (endnotes) and bibliography.
• Authors are responsible for creating graphs, tables, and charts, if required in their paper.
• Authors are required to submit a signed covering letter stating that the paper has not been published earlier or has not been submitted for the purpose of publication to any other journal or volume. Authors are solely responsible for the factual accuracy for their contributions.

Citations and References

Notes and references should follow APA style for citation. Some examples are as follows:


Web page:


Contact address:

Professor Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah
Director, Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies &
Editor, Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies
University of Karachi
Phone: 92-21-99261654
E-mail: cewsku@yahoo.com
Last date for submission: 31st December, 2016
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title of the publication</th>
<th>Name of the author</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td><em>The Ageing Home-Based Women-Workers in Karachi</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Higher Education Commission, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Department of Social Work University of Karachi, &amp;AnjumanTaraqqi-e-Niswan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td><em>Women Issues: Analytical Researches</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td><em>Bridging the Gaps: Research at the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah (compiled and edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, AnjumanTaraqqi-e-Niswan and University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td><em>Pakistan Mein Self-Employed Women: EkJaiza.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, AnjumanTaraqqi-e-Niswan and University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td><em>Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies Volume: 1 – IV 8 March, 2008 onwards</em></td>
<td>Patron: Prof. Dr. PirzadaQasimRazaSiddiqui (Vice Chancellor) Editor: Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td><em>Karachi kiGadagarLarkiyan: EkJaiza</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi and Higher Education Commission. ILO and Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td><em>Female Home-Based Workers: The Silent Workforce.</em></td>
<td>Dr. KhalidaGhaus (edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td><em>Directory of Experts and Resource Persons in Women and Development in Pakistan</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Tahera Aftab (edited )</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td><em>Literacy for the Girl of Today, the Woman of Tomorrow.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Tahera Aftab (edited )</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>