Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies: Annual

PATRON
Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan
Vice Chancellor, University of Karachi
Karachi, Pakistan

EDITOR
Nasreen Aslam Shah

ADVISORY BOARD
Prof. Dr. M. Nizamuddin
Chairman, Higher Education Commission, Punjab

Prof. Dr. Profulla C. Sarker
Pro-Vice Chancellor, European University of Bangladesh

Prof. Dr. Parveen Shah
Vice Chancellor, Shah Latif University, Kharipur, Pakistan

Muhammad Ahmed Qadri
Dean, Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

NaheedAbrar
Department of Social Work, Federal Urdu University, Karachi, Pakistan

M. Abuzar Wajdi
Ex. Dean, Management and Administrative Science, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Sarah Safdar
Former Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Peshawar, Pakistan

Amoosh Khan
Department of Gender Studies, University of Peshawar Khyber Pakhunkhwa, Pakistan

Aslam Shah
Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Badar Alam Iqbal
UGSM-Monarch Business School, Monarch University, Switzerland

Kamala Liyanage
Centre for the Study of Human Rights, University of Peradeniya, Sri Lanka

Kazuyo Yamane
Ritsumeikan University, Japan

Kristi Poerwandari
Program Study Kajian Wanita, Kampus Universitas, Indonesia

Marilyn Porter
Department of Sociology, Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada

EDITORIAL TEAM
Shagufta Nasreen – Assistant Editor
Asma Manzoor
Aliyah Ali
M. Nadeemullah
Seema Manzoor
Dua e Rehma
Rukhsana
Syed Faisal Hashmi
Muhammad Faisal Zia

CIRCULATION MANAGER
Tabinda Shahnem Jafri

FORMATED BY
Muhammad Fareed Ahmed

COVER DESIGN BY
Faizan Yasir (Student, Women’s Studies)

PUBLISHING, ADVERTISING & SUBSCRIPTION OFFICE
Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi, Karachi-75270

Tele/Fax @ 92-21-99261654, 92-21-99261300-7 Ext.2441
E-mail: cewku@yahoo.com

ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION

International
Institutions
US$ 65.00

Individuals
US$ 55.00

Domestic
Institutions
US$ 70.00

Individuals
US$ 60.00

PK.RS. 500.00

PK.RS. 400.00

Surface Mail
Air mail

Articles published in PJGS do not represent the views of the Editors or Advisory Board. Authors are solely responsible for the opinion expressed and accuracy of the data.
Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies

Editor
Nasreen Aslam Shah

Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies
University of Karachi
Karachi – Pakistan

Acknowledgement
We are obliged for the financial assistance of Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan for publishing the 15th volume of Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amna Saeed &amp; Noreen Zainab</td>
<td>Gender Role Stereotyping of Women as Housewives in Conventional Pakistani Society</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anmol Ahmad &amp; Fizza Farrukh</td>
<td>Analyzing Speech Acts in the Pakistani Social Media Scenario: A Gender-Based Comparison</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniya Hasan, Umm E Rubab Kazmi &amp; Kanzal Jawahir</td>
<td>Gender Differences in Adjustment Issues, Quality of Life and Psychological Resilience among Hostel Students</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Shaban Rafi</td>
<td>Screen Image of Muslim Women in the Popular Post-9/11 Films on War on Terror</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nagina Kanwal &amp; Qamar Khushi</td>
<td>Construction of Subversive Gender Identities: A Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis of a Television Play, Chal Jhooti</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naima Saeed, Tansifur Rehman &amp; Hina Shazhadi</td>
<td>Socio-Economic Conditions of Hindu Women in Karachi with Special Reference to Narainpura Karachi</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nooreen Mujaheed &amp; Azeema Begum</td>
<td>An Assessment of Trade Openness on Gender Inequality: An ARDL to Co-Integration Approach (A Case Study of Pakistan)</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubeena Batool &amp; Musarrat Jabeen</td>
<td>Assessment of Political Literacy among Female Students at the University of Balochistan</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rukhsana &amp; Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>The Role of Women Labourer in Agricultural Development of Karachi, Sindh</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shazia Sharafat &amp; Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>An Analytical Study on Role of Trade Association for Women Entrepreneurship and their Capacity Building</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sumera Batool, Maria Naeem &amp; Feroza Batool</td>
<td>Gender Construction and Media Narratives: Representations of Gender in Animated Movies</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sundus Yousuf &amp; Bushra Khan</td>
<td>Challenges Faced by Women Orphans’ Caregivers: A Qualitative Study</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gender Role Stereotyping Of Women As Housewives In Conventional Pakistani Society

Amna Saeed 
&
 Noreen Zainab
Department of Humanities
COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the short story, The Spell and the Ever Changing Moon (2014) by Rukhsana Ahmad, from the feminist perspective. A close reading of the text reveals that facing everyday challenges and juggling between multiple roles is a common practice for middleclass house wives in Pakistani society. The economic instabilities added with emotional, psychological as well as physical abuse plays a vital role in their oppression and humiliation on regular basis. These roles as assigned to them define their social standing and suffering becomes their destiny. Multiple roles of such women and social expectations outside and inside the house define their way of living. Each and every movement and thought becomes codependent on their social familial roles. Being selfless becomes an obligation and 'sacrifice' becomes convention for middle class women who spend their whole lives living under the thumb of their men folk. Moreover, the movement and status of women inside and outside the home is also a major concern addressed in this paper including the concept of home, and its significance in lives of Pakistani women.

Keywords: Housewives, Gender Roles, Stereotyping, Domestic Abuse, Power Practice.
Introduction

The present study aims to investigate the gender stereotyping of women as housewives in Pakistani society through the experiences of the character Nisa in Rukhsana Ahmad’s story *The Spell and the Ever Changing Moon* (2014). The study is focused on the issues of gender roles assigned to middle class housewives in Pakistan as viewed from the feminist lens. In Pakistani society, men usually have the dominant roles in family and home like the ‘decision maker’ and the immediate ‘authority’. The “power gradient” granted to them by the prevailing culture assists them in suppressing women as a natural process. This typically puts men in roles of bread earners and decision makers in the family while women are expected to take care of the household chores and serve men (Ali, Krantz, Gul, Asad, Johansson & Mogren, 2011). The power granted to men also marks the position of women in Pakistani society as weak, defenseless and dependent on men for their basic needs including finances (Chaudhary, 2005). They are culturally confined within the limits of the home and their major/only role in the family is perceived to be re/producers/caretakers of children (Jalal-ud-Din & Khan, 2008). Men therefore, are the decision makers and women are forced to adhere to the decisions men make for them in the name of family honor and to maintain the patriarchal ideologies prevalent in society (Saeed & Khan, 2017). This dependence and passive acceptance of the power men practice on women in different forms is the central concern in the lives of middle class housewives.

In Pakistani society where women are trained as efficient housewives from early childhood, boys are taught to be strong and domineering in the confines of the house. The role of men in the household is that of custodians and protectors of family interests and family honor. They are taught to preserve the family name in an honorable fashion no matter what measures they have to adopt to achieve the said aim (Fikree & Pasha, 2004). Men are trained to rule their women as their natural right; they therefore see women only as means of conjugal consummation, reproduction, and the caretakers of the household chores. Bhattacharya (2014: 186) explains that “the trend of male dominance becomes a factor causing violence to the other gender. Women are viewed inferior to be ‘reined in” by men for the better or, in the majority of cases, for the worse.” As a result, many a time men fail to differentiate between abuse as power practice on their part since such practices are made to appear as ‘normal’ male behavior in the household setting.
most common forms of abuse in a marital relationship, for women as housewives, are thus economic, sexual, physical and emotional. The pious character of women and closeness to religion associated with women’s identity is the reason she bears this physical humiliation by her husband. Spence & Helmreich (1980) talk about the individual view of sexuality which refers to the identity of an individual as a masculine or feminine.

Rukhsana Ahmad’s story The Spell and the Ever Changing Moon (2014) is a deep criticism on the social structures which always place men in dominant roles in family. This story being written specifically in Pakistani context deals with the lower-middle class characters, specifically the housewife in a conventional Pakistani family. The whole story revolves around the life experiences of Nisa, each and every aspect of the story is the clear representation of social structures which impose gender roles on men as well as women. Women being less powerful suffer the consequences of this power hierarchy. The reader from the very opening of the story becomes engaged in the life of Nisa, whose each and every movement is ruled by fear. Nisa the main protagonist of the story is the center of attention, the word Nisa is basically an Arabic word which means “a woman”, it gives us an indication that this character stands for the face of femininity, womanhood in general and circumstances associated with being woman in Pakistani society. From outside towards inside of her house the reader can see through her fears and struggles being a woman belonging to a strong patriarchal background. Nisa being a woman living in conservative society, a small town community was expected to perform multiple roles at the same time, each role with a set of expected characteristics. We come to know at many instances that she is obliged to perform those roles, as those social roles are imposed on her from the very early stages, reinforced by her mother and other members of family as well as society.

**Methodology**

The present study is qualitative in its nature and the short story The Spell and the Ever Changing Moon (2014) is critically analyzed from feminist perspective via a close reading of the text. Feminist literary criticism not only examines the status/role/sufferings/issues of women in society but also challenges the very structure of the culture that gives rise to them. It is therefore a social critique of all the forces/laws/institutions that assert domination on women in a culture (Ruthven, 1984). A close reading of the selected text here essentially draws upon the persona of the character of Nisa and analyses, through her social position/actions, the gender stereotyping of a housewife in the context of Pakistani middle class society (Kusch, 2016). Furthermore the study is based on the framework of relevant theories of gender and feminism. Through selected events/actions in language of the text, the study critically examines the gender status/roles of
women as housewives and what are the socio-cultural implications of such stereotyping of women. In addition, the role of men as dominant caretakers of the house is also studied in the context of domestic violence/abuse and women’s sufferings since feminist literature typically incorporates ‘gender and politics’ and while it affirms the issues of women in general, it also caters to the position of men in relation to the social status/position of women (Kuhlemann, 2016).

**Construction of Gender Role Stereotypes**

Gender is much more than biological sex of a person; it is the socio-cultural definition of men and women. Worell (2002) defines sex as “biological difference” among individuals and gender is considered to be the “physiological, social and cultural characteristics being associated with the biological categories both female as well as male” (p.265). Gender is defined not only by the biological differences but also on the basis of social expectations and social roles of both men and women (Kruger, 1997). Moreover, it is the cultural power politics and social understanding of relationships that define not only human nature/identity but also the gender performative roles of men and women (Butler, 1990). Lorber & Farrell (1991: 104) state:

> Gendered people emerge not from physiology or sexual orientations but from the exigencies of social order, mostly from the need of a reliable division of work of food production and the social (not physical) reproduction of new members.

The Cognitive Developmental Theory describes the process of gender awareness and realization as a two-step process. First step is the realization of one’s sex, and second step is the association with masculinity or femininity with one’s character (Freud, 1927; Kohlberg, 1966; Chodorow, 1978; Weitzman, 1979). Among the multiple socio-cultural institutions it is the family that plays the most important role in the construction of gender identity/roles in children which become a part of their personalities as adults. During this process of gender awareness parents play the most important role for children (Hussain, Naz, Khan, Daraz & Khan, 2015)

Gender role stereotypes are the specific characteristics that are associated with the roles of the masculine and feminine in society (Stets & Burkes, 1996). When gender roles become part of our culture they grow into gender stereotypes which then define the way of life for people of a particular society (Welter, 1966). Although different institutions in society play vital role in the construction of gender stereotypes in society, however family is considered to be the most important in inculcating gender specific behavioral norms in people. Parents’ perceptions regarding the competencies of their children based on gender become the most crucial factor in developing gender role stereotypes in society. Based on these parents’ classify activities/ performances and roles for their children
which remain a part of their characters for the rest of their lives. (Eccles, Jacobs & Harold, 1990). In Pakistani society, where boys from early childhood are taught to rule women, construction of gender stereotypes affects girls more than boys. This gender stereotyping allows “differential treatment of parents to view their daughters as delicate, weak, emotional, sensitive, and dependent, and sons as strong, aggressive, brave, and independent encourages children to behave respectfully” (Hussain, et al. 2015:9). As adults, therefore, the same stereotypical patterns of gender unconsciously allow women to submit to violence, abuse and unequal treatment when it comes to their rights of education, health and employment. This typical unequal treatment of women is based on the fact that women are considered important only for reproduction and house hold service (Hussain, Habib & Akhter, 2014).

**Womanhood and the Ideal of Morality**

Gilligan (1982) in her theory of “difference feminism” argues that the idea of morality for women is related to the concept of “care and responsibility” so being moral for a woman is to be caring and sacrificing for her loved ones. Ali, Krantz, Gul, Asad, Johansson & Mogren (2011) explain the position of the “woman” in Pakistani household as:

A ‘good woman’ could be either educated or uneducated, characterized as being unselfish, calm, tolerant, empathetic, reliable, able to organize, compromise, coordinate and maintain hospitality within the house and in keeping good relationships. A good woman was expected to do household chores, care for her children, husband and in-laws and when needed provide the home with external income. A woman was expected to hide her emotions, to compromise with her opinions and to sacrifice her own dreams. The informants reported that some women perceived their husband to be their owner and ruler and therefore they should acquire their husbands’ permission to perform any activity.

Piety is strength of women in our society; so they are taught to be pious from early childhood as they are considered responsible for improvement of this world, to bring goodness and revolution. Welter (1966:152) observes that “religion and piety are considered to be the core of women’s virtue”. On the other hand, she is also considered to be the one who brings downfall of man, from heaven to earth a reason for evil, for first murder and all the sins, which followed (Nashua, 1849).

**Household as Unpaid Domestic Labor**

One important factor which leads to exploitation of women in the stereotypical role of a house wife in Pakistani society is the fact that they are not independent financially. Isran & Isran (2012, p.454) observe:
Women are economically invisible. By gaining economic empowerment, they will gain both visibility and a voice in decision-making process within the household, workplace and in society. By giving equal economic opportunities, they not only would contribute to the earnings of household but also become major contributors or equal to men to nation economy. As women gain economic strength, the attitudes of their family members and society, as a whole towards them would change.

Another important gender stereotype regarding third world countries is the division of labor among men and women. Household chores are included in the responsibility list of a housewife and husbands don’t generally play any role in management of house instead they are associated with employment and earning finances (Eagly & Steffen, 1984). Godey (1839) says that women should make house a happy place for their men so they come to home and forget all the frustrations. The expected role assigned to women is to take care of their children, perform all the household chores and make her children and husband happy and content in all the possible ways. Men on the other hand are responsible for the economic affairs of the house (Welter, 1966). Delphy (1984, p.60) states that “marriage is a labor contract that ties women to unpaid domestic labor”. She further says that this unpaid labor is the “housework” which further is not considered important enough to be considered part of the debate and problem. The most important part of her research states that “it is not because their work is less important or involve less effort and labor but because patriarchy defines women in their domestic roles as non-workers” (p.61). The unpaid nature of housework and an inferior position assigned to housewives is because of the established fact that it is instinctive responsibility of women to take care of their houses and their children (Waring, 1998). Also as socio-cultural practice, men are preferred over women on the basis of their “value, and participation in work force” whereas women on the basis of their sexual identity (Guillaumin, 1996:73).

Therefore, Salter (1970) claims that “the housewife is nobody” since it is the husband who provides for the maintenance of household. He becomes powerful and his status is increased to the extent where he can look down upon his own wife and think of her as dependent on him, for everything which makes him the ultimate power and authority.

Nonetheless, the paid nature of men’s job does not make him supreme power, if money is the way to run household than without housewife it is not possible to have a house. Riesman (1964) reminds us that without women nothing could be done. The whole super structure of economy rests on the shoulders of housewives. If women don’t care for the households and workers, government would be responsible for it, as in case of military while women do it for free.
Data Analysis

Nisa, like any other girl in a conservative Pakistani family, from the very early stage of life is repeatedly being told by her mother through words as well as practical examples, the norms of right and wrong. For example, the behavioral patterns “allowed” to follow when in company of men and the ones that are not. Who is the in charge and authority in household. The role of a woman, as a wife, a daughter and a sister in the limits of the house is reinforced by mothers during the period of character development and identity formation of girls which ultimately becomes part of their cognitive system.

In the very opening of the story we come to know that Nisa is going somewhere, a place where she knows that “it’s not permitted” and thus she is “trembling a little with guilt and fear, her heartbeat quickening” (Ahmad, 2014:144). This physical description of her fear, being a married woman, an adult individual seems to be the part of cultural practices where men decide for their women what they can and cannot do and what is permitted and what not.

The role and authority of men outside the house is also portrayed beautifully by the writer in the very next scene of the story. Two men working as mechanics on the road “looked up from their sweaty labor each time a woman went in or out of the green door of Talat’s house” (Ahmad, 2014:144). The role of men in society is also reinforced by their role models and their peers and become the mainstream attitude of people, which becomes the standard of normality in society. It is a ritual, a routine for those men to stare at each and every woman who passed through their way, “they were not discouraged by the veils and cloaks. If the outline or gait indicated the presence of youngish woman they did their best to draw her attention by shouting or humming a snatch of film song” (p.145). The reaction of Nisa when those men stare at her is ironically a reflection of the male dominated society of Pakistan and a kind of behavior preferred, adopted, practiced and taught by all women to avoid conflict and any unpleasant situation in public sphere by women.

_The women had been trained for years to side step and ignore this kind of behavior. They all scurried past hastening their footsteps just a little. Nisa, skilled in that strategy quickened her pace_ (Ahmad, 2014:145).

The important words here are “trained” and “skilled” as they show us the deep rootedness of these practices in society, to the extent that they become part of culture. Multiple generations of women are raised teaching and learning these skills, the rules for their survival in the male dominated society in Pakistan. In order to restore their piety women have to adopt such ways and learn such skills. This is what is expected of them by society and by all their family members other women included. Resistance by women to male chauvinism is taken as negative attribute, even evil at times by the society.
The movement of women and their status in the world outside their homes is also depicted wonderfully in the given situation of the story:

*Her mother had always stressed the dignity and value of reserve ‘A good woman’ she used to say, knows how to keep the family secrets.*

She further recalls her mother’s teachings “if possible you manage to survive without letting the world know” (Ahmad, 2014:145). Nisa considers herself a bad woman as she could not hide her “dark secret” from the neighbors, when her husband screams at her and abuses her physically very late at night. The term used for such teachings is silencing where the possessed is forbidden to say something.

Nisa when sees an elderly relative lecturing a bride at a wedding ceremony loses control. She fails to remain quite when she hears her using words “forbearance and forgiveness” again and again. These two principles are very commonly taught to women when they are married off, in order to cope up with their new lives. The questions she raises are not welcomed and she is being criticized for expressing her unsettling view, questions no one had an answer to. A few questions she asks are the questions every girl in our society asks herself or her family, friends, and relatives at one stage of her life or another:

*How much exactly is she really supposed to endure, chichi? How many tears does it take to make a home? She asked in a sharp tone. ‘If she was drowning in her own tears and choking on her own screams, would you still not want her to walk through the door of this house?’ (Ahmad, 2014:147).*

These emotions beautifully express the intensity of pain which Nisa feels when she goes through the physical, sexual, psychological, and emotional and all other kinds of abuses at the hands of her husband in her most cherished and protected space of being i.e. her very own home. Welter (1966:162) enlists the attributes associated with feminine and masculine, women in this scenario are always expected to be weak, timid and dependent. Men on the other hand are supposed to be strong, wise and forceful. Teman and Miles (1936) attributed women as delicate, loving, caring and men quite the opposite. This work was made standard and used by Morawski (1985) and many others. These emotional responses also make women vulnerable to depression and anxiety women because of all the responsibilities they are loaded with by the society.

To what extent a woman should try to become what society wants her to be, and how much should she sacrifice for the sake of her home, her family when her family is ready to sacrifice none. The sacrifices made by Nisa were never acknowledged, she tolerated all the injustices, all the humiliations and forgave her husband every time, in hope for better future, hoping for change which never came. The concept of sisterhood, which is often associated with third world women, and interracial
differences of women is also applied in the context where women living in similar community face circumstances of oppression and violence and support each other. But in this context the gender roles assigned to women are so strong that they cannot unite against men to liberate themselves.

In the text, Nisa is aware of the fact that the role of her husband as breadwinner plays a vital role in her oppression and humiliation.

Towards the end of month when the money began to run out. A deep bitterness filled her. She had to turn to him again for more and had him spit on her face. These had always been the worst nights; his anger had sharper, more rigorous edge to it (Ahmad, 2014:154).

Nisa becomes aware of her role as a housewife, as a woman, as a wife and as a mother but in her heart she never acknowledges the way she is treated. She “resented him as deeply as he resented her demands” (Ahmad, 2014:154). It was not the house hold labors which humiliated her, house work alone was not the source of her oppression it was not the daily chores of cooking, cleaning ad nursing which made her miserable but “it was that physical humiliation, borne in silence five nights out of ten, which was consuming her” (Ahmad, 2014:152). This physical humiliation is not only a reference to his beatings, his physical violence but “overbearingly vicious assertion of his conjugal rights” (Ahmad, 2014:152). It was always against her will and she hated it, hated him deeply for this. She remained silent and performed it as part of her obligation, like other house hold chores. But from inside she felt resentful, she felt ashamed of herself and it was deeply disrespectful for her physical being to be humiliated like this every other night.

Regardless of social roles and gendered expectations one must define his/her own gender and define its attributes accordingly. Nisa does not submit to her husband’s will and she refuses to be defined or labeled by the social norms though she secretly expects and hopes for her husband to change, to become a better person, “each time she saw the moon she prayed for the better month but things did not change – except within her heart, her attitude to her own body changed subtly” (Ahmad, 2014:154). Nisa grew into someone stronger, someone more powerful, not fearful to defy. She became empowered and it was all on her own, she was enlightened and she refused to be humiliated in the worst possible way every day. It was her first step towards understanding her own power she knew there is no magic in this world which can give her power. She had to empower herself through resistance. So, for a woman to empower herself, it takes double the strength and courage as a man since society never aids this empowerment.

The growth of Nisa’s character and many other women we see around us into powerful beings is in itself rejection of ideas given by Foote (1956) and Bernard (1976) presented
Gender Role Stereotyping of Women as Housewives in Conventional Pakistani Society

in the theory of outgrowth related to gender roles, where housewives being stuck in dead end profession are not able to grow and husbands outgrow them. Here in this case, Nisa being a housewife outgrows her husband who never tried to change or grow into someone better.

_The knowledge that Talat had imparted on her of that strange sinful spell had given her a sense of strength. From a shivering, huddled creature Nisa had changed into a much calmer, more pensive woman_ (Ahmad, 2014:155).

The word “spell” and “sinful” here are very significant specially related to the title of story “the spell and the ever changing moon” each and every image here carry symbolism. Many symbols out of these carry significance related to gender roles and gendered identity of women. The spell given by Talat to Nisa is not a conventional magic, it’s the secret of power, power every woman possess but never dream to achieve. It is referred as “sinful” as it is not permitted by society, nor encouraged. Women asking for their rights and resisting against male superiority is still considered to be associated with sin and evil. When an older woman in neighborhood sees Nisa with “the black eyes, the swollen lips or bruised face” which became more frequent after she denied her husband the right of physical humiliation (conjugal rights) she condones to her by saying “oh! That man, beti. God will reward you for your patience” (Ahmad, 2014:155). This very comment tells us a lot about the society and social approval of domestic violence/abuse of women at the hands of the men who are supposed to be their protectors. Resistance is never encouraged, instead women are being praised for all the sacrifices and such women become the ideal face of feminity. The role models represent to the holy, gentle, caring, sacrificing, submissive and pious nature of women. As these are the traits required by the females whether from upper or lower class of society, Nisa is the face of every housewife, every woman who refuses to be great and instead become human only.

Different forms of female resistance to avoid violence/abuse include use of language, leaving the home, poisoning, physical violence, being armed, and being rebellious (Katrak, 2006). Different forms of resistance are adopted by Nisa in the story. After going through the long and painful journey of self-realization, When Hameed, her husband tries to hurt her physically, by using force her reaction is more shocking than anticipated by the reader.

_She became hysterical. No. No. No. She was screaming. Don’t touch me. Don’t come near me. I’ll kill you. I’ll stab you. I’ll poison you. Words poured out of her as fast as the blood that sprang from her wound_ (Ahmad, 2014:157).
This form of resistance is an indicator that she does not wish to tolerate the injustices of her husband anymore and does not care about the society either, their expectations and consequences. Moreover, after reading the story till its very end reader come to know that Nisa leaves her house, her husband and two of her children and goes to her mother’s house. With her youngest child she leaves next day. She knows it will be very hard. She did not leave all her children and did not wanted to leave her house but she knew it will be impossible for her to live here after knowing that she can never change Hameed. He would always hurt her and disgust her. She did not want to earn she never wanted to work outside her house. But in crucial circumstances she was ready to face challenges. “If nothing else, I can wash dishes and cook. If Hameed won’t keep Safia and Kareem let him dump them in Sialkot too” (Ahmad, 2014:158).

Her strength and determination with a little hint of hope is evident in the concluding lines of the story:

As Nisa turned away and walked out of the courtyard, clothing both Zafar and the silver trunk, her steps were slow but firm and determined in her heart, Nisa wished she knew a spell that worked (Ahmad, 2014:158).

The strength of Nisa pass chills through his spine of readers and her determination gives hope. Reader feels extremely happy for her to get out of an abusive relationship which most of the women are never able to do. At the same time, one feels deep pain for her misfortunes, all her struggles, her rough circumstances and obstacles she is yet to face. The very last words of story are even more painful as the reader realizes that she never wanted to leave. She wants to stay. She wished she could have done anything differently, or there was some magic if there is any which could change her husband. Make him a better person which she was not able to accomplish in six long years of her companionship. Jalal-ul-Din and Khan (2008:489) state:

Under such situation, frequent training and awareness programs are needed to be arranged periodically to make women aware of their rights and equip them for exercising just demands. As has been suggested, various cottage industries by the public as well as private sectors should be established to provide job opportunities to rural women so that they can earn income and help their heads in household’s expenses.

The character of Nisa, in the story, is symbolic for all the women who live in abusive relationships thinking that the conditions might change, their partners may change and transform in future. But eventually the realization should come that the only change they are looking for is yet to come from them. Domestic violence must be resisted, to preserve one’s own self and for the betterment of coming generations. When Nisa has choice to become a saint, a holy woman who submits to the will of her husband as
expected by the society or be a human who wants to live a happy life, where she can respect her own self, her physical being, her body and sexuality. She chooses to be a human. She chooses herself. It becomes a difficult decision, very difficult to act upon. But she knows she ultimately has no choice. She has to do it to live. She could not hope for her husband to change for another six years. She had waited enough. “Nisa decided she preferred the bruises to humiliating forced sex. She wasn’t sure she wanted rewards in heaven; she only wished she had to suffer less on earth” (Ahmad, 2014:155). Nisa, thus stands for the experiences of women in general instead of singular experience and becomes the epitome of a woman who can be a mother, a daughter, a good wife and so much more without being a saint who has to sacrifice herself for the sake of her husband’s will.

Conclusions

A Pakistani middleclass housewife needs more than just women empowerment; she wants to live happily, with her family her children where she can serve them joyously, work for them and care for them. In exchange she only needs some words of appreciation, a little respect from her husband and some confidence to believe in herself. Moreover, economic freedom can be a catalyst to women empowerment in our society. As Isran & Isran (2012:853) pose that “as woman’s economic dependence on men is seen as a consequence of patriarchal structure, women’s economic participation is essential for removing their persistence subordinate position.” A Pakistani housewife thus does not want to revolt, she is not a rebel, and she is a powerful woman who needs a little acknowledgement and small amount of love in exchange with all the hard work and physical labor she puts in for the betterment of her household. She doesn’t want to get rid of her responsibilities, but she wants a little help from her spouse. A tiny bit of encouragement and she will be the most loyal, selfless being for her whole life. Who will not think of anything but betterment of her house, her children and her family.

References


Dr. Amna Saeed is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Humanities, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad.

Noreen Zainab is Research Scholar in the Department of Humanities, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad.
Analyzing Speech Acts In The Pakistani Social Media Scenario:  
A Gender-Based Comparison

Anmol Ahmad  
Department of Humanities  
COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad

Fizza Farrukh  
Department of Humanities  
Air University, Islamabad

Abstract

Gender studies have been an invigorating field of study under numerous lenses. Such explorations explore the inimitable distinctiveness and resemblance between the two genders. Correspondingly, this study focuses particularly on written communication of Pakistanis. Utilizing Searle’s Taxonomy for Speech Acts (1969) and Wulandari (2014)’s Taxonomy for Speech Act Functions, this research investigates differences and similarities of language use among Males and Females on the online social platforms of Facebook and Twitter. Data comprises of a thousand utterances accounted from selected social mediums. Results reveal Pakistani Males tend to use Expressive Acts often within their language while updating their status messages on Facebook and Twitter; contrastingly, Pakistani Females prefer to employ the Directive and Assertive Acts frequently in their language used in Facebook and Twitter status updates. Furthermore, Pakistani Males utilize the medium for informing their potential audience about various topics. While, Pakistani Females make use of the status messages to achieve multiple purposes, including: informing, suggesting and asserting. Through application of ANOVA, study’s results validate linguistic differences in language use of Pakistani Males and Females. It corroborates the fact that gender-based differences are part of the identity of a person and these are reflected through the medium of language elaborately.

Keywords: Speech Acts, Social Media, Gender Study, Language Use, Communicative Functions.

تخير

تخير مراجع

تخير مراجع
Introduction

Humans’ mediums of communication have changed with the passage of time. Now, communication does not mean that humans always meet face-to-face with the other people to converse. They may interact with each other without having to meet. Facebook and Twitter are two such popular online social networking websites, which provide a virtual platform for the masses to converse, negotiate their identities, use various linguistic repertoires and strategies, encode and decode messages, share opinions and express their emotions in multidimensional ways via language use. Understanding this complex process is one of the motives which instilled the current study on social media users’ language.

According to Crystal (2000, p. 212) language is a vital instrument for human communication. It means that language is systematic, and makes conventional use of sound signs or written symbols for interaction and self expression. Within this gigantic world of language use, it is important to narrow down to a particular unit of analysis. This study delimits itself to exploration of Pakistani Social Media users’ use of Speech acts and Communicative Functions in their language. Deciphering speech acts, through a critical analysis, can unearth the actual intent of the writer/speaker (Singh, 1991). According to Kreidler (1998:26) an action through utterance is called as a speech act. Furthermore, he stated that an utterance is “an act of speech or writing; it is a specific event at a particular time and place and involving at least one person, the one who produces the utterance, but usually more than one person”. Thus, speech acts can more specifically include linguistic actions such as complaint, argument, invitation, apology, promise or compliment.

Moreover, an utterance (particularly on the social media) is made voluntarily and is properly planned by the writer to achieve a particular goal and to communicate a particular feeling towards his/her potential readers (Vladutescu, 2015). The utterance which takes place in such a way, involves certain communicative functions, while it is being produced.
by the author. This functionality can only be deciphered by critically analyzing the semantics of the words, phrases and the context of that particular utterance. Hence, the current study aims to address both speech acts and communicative functions to provide a multifaceted output regarding the language used in the Pakistani Social Media scenario.

For a further deep understanding of the subject matter, gender differences, in terms of language use, formulate the basis for this research. To what extent is the language of males and females different or similar is a question that has been constantly interrogated by scholars (Newman et al., 2008). Since language is seen as a reflection of identity, it has been estimated to be helpful in deciphering and understanding how men and women utilize the tool of language. Furthermore, it is imperative to comprehend these gender-based distinctions for realizing the uniqueness which each gender has. Hence, the current study attempted to comprehend the language use – its differences and similarities – between the Pakistani males and females on social media, in order to grasp their distinctive identities.

Assumption of the Study

There is a visible difference among the speech acts being used by Pakistani males and females on the social media.

Research Questions

This study attempts to answer the following questions:
1. What types of speech acts are being used by Pakistani males and females on the social media websites, Facebook and Twitter?
2. Which speech act(s) is / are most frequently occurring among the Pakistani males and females over the social media websites, Facebook and Twitter?
3. What are the similarities and differences in the use of Speech Acts by the Pakistani males and females on the social media websites, Facebook and Twitter?
4. What are the communicative functions of the Speech acts used by the Pakistani males and females on the social media websites, Facebook and Twitter?

Objectives of the Study

The aims of this study include the following:
1. To explore the use of language in context by Pakistanis on the social networking websites of Facebook and Twitter.
2. To study communicative functions which emerge from the analysis of the status updates by the Pakistanis.
3. To decipher the similarities and differences in language use by the Pakistani males and females on the social networking websites, Facebook and Twitter.

**Significance of the Study**

This particular research study aids to understand how people use social media to express their personal experience, emotion, feelings. Moreover, it helps explore the various linguistics trends and repertoires being used by the Pakistani social media community in particular. Furthermore, it provides an overall idea on how the Pakistani people update regarding their day to day activities, share their experiences, their reaction to every day issues and, ultimately, discuss anything which affects them.

**Delimitation**

The study is delimited to a random set of data only. Population of this study included all Pakistani males and females who use Facebook and Twitter which amounts to more than 7 million users combined, according to the Statistics by Social Bakers (2012a; 2012b). Utilizing the formulae for Sample Size Determination, a minimum of 600 samples was needed to produce reliable results for the study. To generate elaborate results, the research sampled 1000 status updates and delimited the study to them. The technique of purposive sampling and random sampling were used to select 500 Facebook Status Updates and 500 Twitter Status Updates of Pakistani Males and Females, respectively. Furthermore, random sampling was conducted so that the collected data could be generalized for the whole population of Pakistani people using social media as a mode of communication.

**Literature Review**

This section aims to connect the basic terminologies of the aforementioned topic and explain their relative importance in relation with the society and people. Furthermore, the study intends to highlight the niche developed for the current study within the pool of previous studies related with speech act analysis in particular.

**Speech Acts: An Introduction**

The notion of Speech Act and its theory was initiated by Austin (1962) and further developed by Searle (1969). Basically, Speech Act implies to utter a statement which is equivalent to performing an action. Every speech act, once uttered, changes the context amid the speaker and the listener. For instance, common speech acts include promising, inviting, welcoming, thanking, congratulating etc. This impact of Speech Acts makes them viable for studying and deciphering the intentions of the speakers hidden under the
communicated message. Thus, Searle (1969) rightly remarks that, within this field, the concern of linguistic analysis revolves around the speaker’s and the hearer’s capability to manage, create and decode the meaning of words that they have uttered for communiqué.

If somebody uses language for explaining their sentiments or starting a debate or even for degrading somebody – all of it falls under the category of Speech Acts (Illyas & Khushi, 2012). Furthermore, Sadock (2009) briefly explains the speech acts that they are those actions which are done through the medium of speaking.

Speech act investigations have taken numerous structures and have been connected to numerous circumstances. Henceforth, it appears relevant to consider how messages are developed in various mediums to understand how individuals communicate and make their opinions significant through language.

Analyzing Speech Acts

The presence of the speaker and the hearer is a compulsory necessity for the conduction of any kind of speech act in the world (Das, 2005). Furthermore, once the message is delivered from the addressee to the addressee, it is left upon the addressee to decode the point and respond accordingly. While investigating these particular utterances, research scholars (Das 2005; Sadock, 2009) suggest that the following three things need to be observed:

1. The language use within that utterance
2. The intent of the interlocutor
3. The social context in which the interaction took place.

Moreover, according to Sadock (2009), during the process of communication, three different kinds of speech acts can be possibly produced:

i. **Locutionary act:** It implies that those particular sounds, which are uttered out of a speaker’s mouth comprise of certain identifiable features which the listener can understand. Not only this, but those sounds have particular reference points too, that is, they are not randomly uttered by the speaker.

ii. **Illocutionary act:** This emphasizes the intention of the speaker, who is delivering the utterance to the hearer. For example, if a person at a restaurant asks about his order ‘Is the dish ready yet?’, his basic aim is not to seek information about the dish, rather his intention is to convey the fact to the waiter that he is hungry and is anxiously waiting for the dish to be served, and, furthermore, he implicitly demands the waiter to bring it as soon as possible in an indirect manner. Moreover, the illocutionary acts can be guided by particular cultural norms as well. Its range and tendency for acceptance in a society, varies from culture to culture.

iii. **Perlocutionary act:** This basically points towards the psychological effect a particular utterance can have on a hearer (Holtgraves, 2002, p. 10-11). This is also
a significant factor which will be studied in the present research as well. It particularly pertains to the function of the particular utterance.

**Searle’s Speech Act Taxonomy (1969)**

The theory presented by Searle (1969) utilizes the illocutionary purpose of the speech acts specifically. It addresses classes of expressions, each with a particular open reason and every arrangement thoroughly discrete from others. Searle (1969) explained five categories of speech acts: assertive, directives, commissives, expressions and declarations. The taxonomy, which he presented based on his theory, helps to illuminate the context, the speaker’s psychological state, the intention and how the utterance conveys meaning to the intended audience.

For the current research the taxonomy presented by Searle (1969) will be used because it is comprehensive. Thus, according to Searle, there are five categories of speech acts, which have been explained below:

(i) **Assertive acts**: It explains a particular notion, belief or a proposition. If a person asserts, concludes, predicts, informs or reports then it will be termed as an assertive act. For example:
   1. ‘The earth is flat.’
   2. ‘The name of our country is Pakistan.’

(ii) **Directive acts**: Such acts are employed when the hearer has to be asked to do something. For example, if somebody is ordering, requesting, suggesting, or commanding then it falls within the Directive act (Holtgraves, 2002).
   For example: ‘Pass the salt!’, ‘I order you to leave school immediately.’

(iii) **Commissive Acts**: This act is used to commit something (Cutting, 2002). It can be in the form of promising.
   For example: ‘I will give you my address tomorrow.’, ‘I promised to tell him truth.’

(iv) **Expressive Acts**: These acts are used to express something. To express emotions or feelings etc, those which can be said as happy, sad, and angry etc.
   For example: ‘Thank you for telling the truth!’?, ‘I apologize, please forgive me!’

(v) **Declarative Acts**: These acts are used to declare something and modify the situations by the uttering of some words (Cutting, 2002).
   For example: ‘Fall 2014 semester result has been announced.’, ‘I divorce you!’
The Social Media

As new media technologies rise, it is essential to take a view of the shared characteristics and contrasts in attributes and utilizations of these communication devices. One developing innovation rapidly turning into a social staple is the social network site (Boyd & Ellison, 2008). One of the most famous web administrations is Facebook.com, which has more than 68 million dynamic clients. With millions of clients on these social network sites (SNSs) taking part in both presentation toward oneself and relational communication, SNSs bear the cost of another lens through which to consider human connection (Boyd & Ellison, 2008). Language is used in these asynchronous media in ways that are similar or different from the ways language is used in the asynchronous applications of a traditionally-synchronous media such as Instant Messaging applications. This study looked to see how language (and hence character) is developed in rising SNSs.

Social Media are sites and applications that empower clients to make and offer substance or to take part in person to person communication. Social networking alludes to the method for communications among individuals in which they make, impart, and/or trade data and thoughts in virtual groups and systems. This digital communication deals with Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, Foursquare, YouTube, Daily Motion, Vimeo accounts and many more. However for this study, we have chosen Facebook and Twitter.

Message – Reflecting Point of View

Communication and brain study researchers have long comprehended that there is an association in the middle of speech and action. Past experimental exploration has shown that the messages a man conveys can influence that individual's mentality around a subject, actually goes as far as to transform an unfavorable disposition into an ideal one (Freedman & Fraser, 1966). According to Schwartz et al. (2013), a critical outlook on language on social media can bring accurate deductions about the user’s personality, particularly regarding the gender differences.

Effects of Social Media

The social media affects our face to face conversation. They are not physically present in front of one another; rather they are connected through this media. Even if some people are altogether sitting in the same room they are so busy in using these sites that they cannot communicate with each other. Connection establishes as the relationship moves from a face to face to an online setting. The growing trend of using Social Media for
staying connected with your close ones led to exploration of speech acts and online messaging, by looking at how people utilize the status messages in informal community destinations (particularly Facebook and Twitter) to impart their perspectives, socially and to develop their personality.

Interestingly, from the feminist perspective, there have been numerous studies highlighting how constructively social media is being used by females for activism (Cullen, 2013). Furthermore, Carstensen (2009) is of the view that this virtual platform has become a useful place to know about gender struggles. Hence, the current study deemed this platform as a suitable area to investigate gender differences.

**Popular Social Media Platforms**

The following two social media platforms’ data was selected for the study, based on their immense popularity world:

**Facebook**

Facebook is considered the world's biggest informal community, with more than 1.32 billion month to month dynamic clients (Solo-Anaeto & Jacobs, 2015). Clients make an individual profile, and then they include different clients as companions, and trade messages, including announcements. Brands make pages and Facebook clients can "like" brands' pages.

**Twitter**

Twitter is like a micro-blogging juncture that permits people to stay associated through the trading of short status messages (Kwak et al., 2010) within the limited space of 140 characters per one update. Every status update is publically viewable to everyone and, hence, this feature makes it a viable platform for people to openly share their views with the world.

**Language Use: The Gender Differences**

There is a difference in language used by men and women as established by past researches (Holmes, 1995) within the field of language and gender. According to majority of such studies, language that is used by men is significantly related to aggression, adventure, competition etc. Their language is also less expressive and less emotional. Language that is used by women is sensitive, compassionate, open and illuminating. Women communicate to make relationships, express feelings, on the other
hand men communicate to have power and they believe on reality mostly. Women’s language is polite and men’s language is aggressive because they have a greater position than women in the society, generally, owing to their masculinity. Men and women’s written discourse is not the same.

According to Lakoff (1975), men and women use language that is mainly related to their interaction with other speech communities. The same issue was highlighted by Bavelas et al. (2000), moreover, they pointed out that the gender differences in written discourse provides a unique perspective to study language. Furthermore, Holmes (1997) highlighted that there is a lot of evidence of inequality in the matter of language among men and women. Hence, for comprehending the unique linguistic qualities of both genders, belonging to Pakistan, the current study aimed to investigate their written status updates on Facebook and Twitter.

**Research Methodology**

In this segment, the whole process of research sampling, design and method has been elaborated. The data is qualitatively analyzed according to the selected framework. After that, the analysis is modified into a quantitative structure to get a clear idea.

**Population**

A huge group of people or objects that become a research source of data is known as research population. A set of population comprises of all of the components, for instance, objects, events or even individuals (Burns & Groove, 1993). In this research, the social media users of Facebook and Twitter on the Pakistani social media have been taken as the population for this research.

**Sampling**

The sample size determination formulae had been employed to obtain an estimate of the required samples from the population. The minimum number of samples needed for the results to be reliable was 600. The researchers selected 1000 samples in order to establish the reliability of the study’s findings. For the research, 250 statuses of Pakistani Females were selected from Facebook and Twitter each, making it a total of 500. The same numerical figure was kept for the Pakistani Males. It was ensured to select only those statuses which were public for everyone to read – so that their privacy is not disturbed.
Purposive Sampling implies that the researcher already knows what kinds of samples are needed for the research (Patton, 2001) and only those are picked which match the particular criteria. This technique was employed for separating out the Pakistani individuals updates from the rest of the people’s statuses. It enabled the study to stay focused on its aim. The profiles were thoroughly investigated to confirm that the person is a Pakistani national. Once this was assured, then the person’s public statuses were selected for the study’s purpose. For choosing a status from the huge pool, random selection was employed so that every status gets an equal chance of being selected (Frerichs, 2008). These techniques were employed for ensuring reliability of the samples, so that, generalizable findings can be generated.

Method of Research

The research incorporated a mixed procedure of qualitative and quantitative methods. This methodology is handy in utilizing the best of both approaches (Creswell et al., 2003) and giving out results, which can be generalizable on the target population. To suit this purpose, firstly, the qualitative approach was utilized in analyzing the utterances in accordance with Searle’s Taxonomy. After this, the quantitative approach was utilized in converting qualitatively analyzed data into numerical figures. These numerical findings were then tabulated and then, illustrated in the form of graphs for a clear representation. Lastly, ANOVA was applied to validate a significant similarity or difference in the data.

Analysis of Data

After a careful examination of speech acts used in the language by the males and females on Pakistani social sites, the researchers examined, classified and sorted under the guidance of the theoretical framework. This analysis included qualitatively analyzing data, then converting the data into quantitative form having frequencies and percentages to give a clear estimate of the result. This inference facilitates in displaying the results properly. Hence, such a combination of both the qualitative and quantitative procedures assists in acquiring a more dynamic reflection of the analysis.

Theoretical Framework

Theoretical framework binds the data by centering the attention on important variables and describing the important point of view that researcher should take in examining and understanding the data that is collected. Theoretical framework requires the researcher to have sufficient data to generate the theory in the research context (Leedy & Ormord, 2005). A theoretical structure is a structure of orientation that is a basis for description of ideas, clarifications, explanations, research plans and overviews as the structure that rely on a groundwork defining the general plan of a house (LoBiondo-Wood & Haber, 1998). The current study utilizes Searle’s Taxonomy (1969) which is based on the Speech Act
Theory. It gives the linguistic markers and description for demarcating and categorizing Speech Acts into the following five categories:

- **Assertive Acts**: They include the acts of conclusion, prediction, assertion etc.
- **Directive Acts**: They include the acts of giving order, suggestions, requests.
- **Commissive Acts**: These comprise of the acts of vowing, offering etc.
- **Expressive Acts**: These acts include expression of feelings of happiness or sadness.
- **Declarative Acts**: Such acts which change the world with their declaration and announcement.


The current study found some new functions as well by analyzing the Pakistani context in particular.

**Research Tool**

The written statuses of males and females Pakistani on the social media were examined by the researcher using the structure and its procedures. In this scenario, content analysis of the status updates was the research tool used to scrutinize the language of the status updates. Findings from the samples were then quantified to make valid interpretations.

**Triangulation**

The current research employs Investigator Triangulation in order to establish the reliability of the findings of the current study. Within this technique, the same analysis is conducted by different researchers and if their results match, then it indicates that the findings are reliable and thus, valid. This research incorporated analysis of four different investigators for establishing reliability.

**Results and Discussion**

The aim of this chapter is to elaborate the findings and interpret them. The resulting analysis would be quantified for depicting the implication and importance of the current study. The findings have been compared with one another through ANOVA and, lastly, an overall analysis has been presented.
Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Males on Facebook

After analyzing the status updates of Pakistani Males on Facebook, the following findings have been deduced from the collected data and have been presented in a tabulated form:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of speech acts</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>24.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>25.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>21.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>27.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>257</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The total number of speech acts found in the respective 250 Male’s Facebook statuses was 257. Hence, this figure implies that one status update could include more than one speech act in it. The results indicate that the most extensively used speech act is Expressive act (27.23%) by the Pakistani Males on Facebook. The second mostly used Speech act is the Directive speech act with a percentage of 25.29%. Lastly, the Commissive act is least employed by the Pakistani Males on Facebook, according to the findings of this study.

An illustrative graphic representation of the findings is as follows:

![Pakistani Males' Speech Acts on Facebook](image_url)
Communicative Functions of the Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Males on Facebook

Furthermore, the functions of the speech acts used by the Pakistani males on the platform of Facebook have also been extensively studied. The results have been tabulated for clarity, as below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Functions of Speech Acts</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disappointing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thanking</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informing</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>42.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibiting</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hating</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asserting</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>12.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wishing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requesting</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggesting</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asking</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congratulating</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaring</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>9.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commanding</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoping</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sorrow</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greeting</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confusing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressing</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>6.19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dislike</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yearning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warning</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordering</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advising</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exciting</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>420</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Out of the 250 Status Updates of Males on Facebook, 420 communicative functions were found. This implies that Pakistani Males tend to achieve a variety of communicative goals, while uploading their status - instead of achieving just one communicative function at a time.

The results from the above table display the fact that a total of 30 communicative functions were performed by the particular speech acts jotted down by the Pakistani Males on Facebook. If we study these findings more elaborately, we can see that there are 3 functions of Assertive act which include: describing (0.48%), asserting (12.14%) and informing (42.14%). Furthermore, there are 8 functions of Directive act as well, which include: prohibiting (2.61%), requesting (1.42%), suggesting (4.04%), asking (4.76%), commanding (2.14%), warning (0.23%), ordering (0.71%), advising (0.71%). Moreover, the Commissive act has only 1 function which is committing (0.48%). Additionally, the declarative act has also only 1 function too, which is declaring (9.04%).

Lastly, the Expressive act has 18 functions, which comprises of the following: disappointing (0.95%), anger (0.95%), thanking (1.19%), hating (0.23%), wishing (0.23%), congratulating (0.48%), hoping (0.23%), sorrow (0.95%), supporting (0.48%), greeting (0.71%), confusing (0.48%), expressing (6.19%), pleasure (4.04%), dislike (0.23%), yearning (0.48%), longing (0.95%), exciting (0.23%). Hence the total functions of speech acts that appear in Facebook statuses of males are 30 within the selected 250 updates of Pakistani Males’ status messages. The tabulated data has been graphically represented as follows:

![Communicative Functions of Pakistani Males' Speech Acts on Facebook](image-url)
Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Females on Facebook

Based on the findings, Pakistani Females language use while penning down status updates, is majorly pertaining to the use of Directive Acts. This result elaborates that the social tool of Facebook is utilized by them to give suggestions, requests, and pieces of advice or commands through their status updates. The following table explains the frequency and percentages for each category of speech acts, as utilized by the Pakistani Females in their language use:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Speech Acts</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>45.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>27.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>250</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A total of 250 speech acts were found in the 250 status updates of Pakistani females on Facebook. This number is quite near to the quantity of speech acts found among Pakistani males (i.e. 257 speech acts) on Facebook. However, a closer view on the speech acts’ application brings out clear differences.

The above given Table 3 depicts that Directive acts were most extensively used by the Pakistani Females on Facebook as their percentage use amounts to 45.6%. The next most frequently used speech acts were the Expressive acts as their percentage comes out to be 27.2%. Furthermore, the third most used speech act was the Assertive Act as its percentage appeared as 22%. Lastly, the Declarative act was used quite rarely as its use reaches to 5.2% percent. Another notable fact is that the Commissive Act was not found in use within this category, which is why, the percentage of it dropped to zero percent.

The illustrative chart for clarifying the findings within this category is as follows:

![Pakistani Females' Speech Acts on Facebook](image-url)
Communicative Functions of the Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Females on Facebook

Analyzing the communicative function of a particular utterance not only helps in deciphering the meaning of the statement, but also aids in exploring the vast variety of means which language serves for the speakers to convey their message towards a particular set of audience explicitly or implicitly. A total of 23 communicative functions were found within the selected Facebook utterances of the Pakistani females. The following table gives a clear understanding of the various communicative functions performed by every status update of the Pakistani Females on the platform of Facebook, along with their respective calculated percentages for each particular function:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Function of Speech Acts</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disappointing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thanking</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informing</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>11.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibiting</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>10.21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asserting</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>18.27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wishing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requesting</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggesting</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>16.12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaring</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commanding</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sorrow</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greeting</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressing</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longing</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loving</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Begging</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inviting</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ending</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrating</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>186</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interestingly, the total communicative functions found in 250 status updates of Pakistani females are 186. It indicates that there is more variety of communicative functions employed by males of Facebook as compared to females (males’ communicative functions were 420 in total, within the 250 status updates limit). This numerical output also highlights that some statuses of females (approximately 64 status updates) were
uploaded not for the sake of fulfilling a communicative goal with perspective from the audience. Rather, these statuses were neutral (in terms of achieving a communicative goal) and were not uploaded for gathering reactions or responses from the audience.

From the above table, it can be deciphered that there are 3 functions of Assertive act as describing (0.26%), asserting (9.06%) and informing (56%). Furthermore, there are 5 functions of directive as well, which includes prohibiting (5.06%), requesting (1.06%), inviting (0.26%) suggesting (8%) and commanding (0.26%). Moreover, the declarative act has only 2 functions within it, which comprise of declaring (2.13%) and begging (0.26%). Additionally, the expressive act was found to have 12 communicative functions, as shown here, which include disappointing (0.53%), boring (0.53%), loving (1.33%) celebrating (0.26%), anger (3.2%), thanking (0.53%), wishing (1.06%), sorrow (1.06%), greeting (0.53%), expressing (4.53%), pleasure (2.93%) and longing (0.8%). Hence the total functions of speech acts that appear in the Facebook status messages of females are 23 contained in the selected 250 updates. In addition, we can also see that the most frequently occurring communicative function was asserting. Furthermore, a graphical representation, as presented below, helps to give a bird’s eye view of the various communicative functions:

![Communicative Functions of Pakistani Females’ Speech Acts on Facebook](image)

**Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Males on Twitter**

Based on the findings of the current study, the Pakistani males have been observed to make use of Expressive Acts more extensively on the social platform of Twitter. Followed by this particular act, the next most extensively utilized act is the Assertive act. The following table gives a clear idea about the findings:
A total of 259 speech acts were found in 250 status updates of Pakistani males on Twitter. This finding indicates that status in above given table depicts that Expressive acts were most extensively used by the Pakistani males on Twitter as their percentage reaches up to 38.61%. Another notable fact is that the Commissive Act was the least used act within this category, which is why, the percentage of it dropped to 5.4%.

These findings are further elaborated in the following pie chart:

Figure 5: Pakistani Males’ Speech Acts on Twitter

**Communicative Functions of the Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Males on Twitter**

A total of 35 communicative functions were found within the selected Twitter utterances of the Pakistani males. The following table gives a clear understanding of the various communicative functions performed by every status update of the Pakistani Males on the platform of Twitter, along with their respective calculated percentages for each particular function:
### Communicative functions of Pakistani males' speech acts on Twitter

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speech Act</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appeal</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asking</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>6.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asserting</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advice</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9.86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confusing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappointment</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>9.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Describing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dislike</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaring</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informing</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>22.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persuading</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoping</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5.99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stating</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinion</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loving</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joy</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thanking</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prays</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sorrow</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Praise</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greetings</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satire</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7.39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helping</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiredness</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggesting</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wishing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>284</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The communicative functions achieved by 250 males’ statuses on Twitter totaled to 284. This numerical value indicates that certain statuses performed more than one communicative function.

From the above table, it can be easily seen that there are 4 major communicative functions performed by the speech acts of Pakistani Males on Twitter, which comprise of: informing (22.54%), disappointment (9.51%), satire (7.39%), and asking (6.69%).

### Communicative Functions of Pakistani Males’ Speech Acts on Twitter

![Communicative Functions of Pakistani Males' Speech Acts on Twitter](image)

#### Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Females on Twitter

The findings under this set of data reveal that the most extensively used Speech act by the Pakistani Female Twitter users was the Assertive act (41.0%). After this, they most frequently utilized the Expressive act (34.7%). The results have been tabulated as follows:
The Pakistani females’ status updates contained a total of 268 speech acts enclosed within them. This value indicates that certain status updates enclosed more than one speech act within them. The above tabulated data has been graphically illustrated as following:

### Table: 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of speech acts</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>41.0 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>20.8 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.23 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>34.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.11 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>268</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The intended implication of the particular speech is clarified once we analyze the communicative function of a speech act. The following table presents the various thematic communicative functions of all the speech acts employed by the Pakistani Females on the social platform of Twitter:

### Communicative Functions of the Speech Acts Used by Pakistani Females on Twitter

- **Assertive Acts**: 42%
- **Expressive Acts**: 35%
- **Directive Acts**: 20%
- **Declarative Acts**: 2%
- **Commissive Acts**: 1%

![Pakistani Females' Speech Acts on Twitter](image-url)
The total communicative functions performed by Pakistani Females’ Speech Acts on Twitter are 318. This total is higher than the communicative functions produced by Females’ status updates on Facebook (i.e. 186). This indicates towards another finding that females tend to be more communicative on Twitter rather than on Facebook. Furthermore, the communicative functions performed by Females on Twitter are more than Males on Twitter. This finding strengthens the previous conclusion of Pakistani females achieving more communicative goals on Twitter than on Facebook.
From the above table, it is depicted that there are 4 functions of Assertive act, which include: describing (4.08%), asserting (1.25%), informing (26.7%) and boring (0.31%). Moreover, there are 6 functions of Directive act which comprise of: prohibiting (0.62%), requesting (2.20%), suggesting (8.80%), asking (5.66%), offering (2.51%) and commanding (0.31%). The Declarative act has also only 1 communicative function, which includes: declaring (0.31%). Lastly, the Expressive act has 15 functions which include: disappointing (16.3%), anger (5.34%), thanking (2.83%), congratulating (1.25%), hoping (2.51%), sorrow (3.77%), supporting (2.83%), greeting (0.31), confusing (0.62%), expressing (0%), pleasure (1.88%), dislike (6.91%), yearning (0.31%), longing (0.61%) and scaring (1.24%). Thus, the total communicative functions of speech acts that appear in the status updates of Twitter’s Pakistani Female Users are 26. The tabulated data has been illustratively presented as follows:

![Figure 8: Communicative Functions of Pakistani Females’ Speech Acts on Twitter](image)

**Comparison of Pakistani Males’ and Females’ Speech Acts: The Overall Findings**

The findings reveal that Pakistani Males tend to use the Expressive Act most extensively on both of the Social Media Platforms (Facebook and Twitter). However, this is not the case with the Females use of Speech Acts; the Pakistani females tend to use the Directive Acts and Assertive Acts mostly on the Social Media Platforms (Facebook and Twitter). This evidence itself validates that there is a difference in the use, intention and meaning of the language used by a man and woman.
Using SPSS Software, ANOVA test was applied on the complete data set in order to compute verified differences and similarities in the use of Speech Acts by the Males and Females on Facebook and Twitter. The results are in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speech Act</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>.955</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.955</td>
<td>4.667</td>
<td>.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>211.161</td>
<td>1032</td>
<td>.205</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>212.116</td>
<td>1033</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>2.660</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.660</td>
<td>13.412</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>204.679</td>
<td>1032</td>
<td>.198</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>207.339</td>
<td>1033</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>3.504</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.504</td>
<td>42.435</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>85.208</td>
<td>1032</td>
<td>.083</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>88.712</td>
<td>1033</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>.090</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.090</td>
<td>.412</td>
<td>.521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>224.952</td>
<td>1032</td>
<td>.218</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>225.042</td>
<td>1033</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>.191</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.191</td>
<td>10.128</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>19.423</td>
<td>1032</td>
<td>.019</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>19.613</td>
<td>1033</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the last column of this table, the significant values have been determined. We can see that the values for Assertive, Directive, Declarative and Commissive acts are less than 0.05 which implies that the differences of these values among the groups of males and females are significant. Whereas, the significant value for Expressive acts is 0.521 (which is less than 0.05) and this implies that the use of trend of using Expressive acts is similar in both males and females. Thus, overall, we can conclude that there is a significant difference in the use of language between Pakistani males and Pakistani females on the social media platforms.

It also shows that the Males, being aggressive in their language use, prefer to vent out their emotions on such an online platform, where they know that they will be listened to. On the other hand, Females being calm and sophisticated in their language use, tend to employ Directive acts where they might like to suggest, request or sometimes even order
something; and, also they prefer to utilize the explanatory strategy of Assertive acts where they tend to discuss, negotiate and explain a particular notion, instead of simply expressing it.

Furthermore, there is a noticeable gender-based difference in the communicative functions as well. Pakistani Males tend to use their status for the purpose of informing most widely. However, Pakistani Females not only exercise their status for the communicative function of informing, but they also utilize it for asserting and suggesting as well.

Thus, the analysis displays that the Social Media is not just a platform for general communication or chit-chat; rather it is a space where a person is heard as well. From every statement, there is an implicit meaning deduced by the hearer, this makes it a useful platform to study the society in general. Self-expression in the current digital world is done through such online forums easily (Ilyas & Khushi, 2012). In such a way, people reveal their gender-based identities as well, which have been deciphered by the current study. The use of language shapes up the perspectives and mind set of the person and that is how these platforms are, as Hills (2009, p.115) remarks, ‘powerfully linked to forms of self-identity, self-expression and self-display.’

Conclusions

The study aimed to investigate and highlight the differences and similarities of language use, particularly with the use of Speech Acts, on the popular online social platforms of Facebook and Twitter. Results revealed insights into gender-based differences in language use. Pakistani Males tend to use the Expressive Acts more often within their language while updating their status messages on Facebook and Twitter; on the other hand, the Pakistani Females prefer to employ the Directive and Assertive Acts more frequently in their language on the Facebook and Twitter status updates.

Furthermore, the Pakistani Males utilize the status messages as a source of informing their potential audience about something. While, the Pakistani Females make use of the status messages to achieve multiple purposes, which majorly include: informing, suggesting and asserting, according to the findings of the current study.

Thus, the study’s results bring awareness that there is a linguistic difference in the language use of the Males and Females of Pakistan as well. It helps to validate that gender-based differences are part of the identity of a person and these are reflected through the medium of language, and thus, such a linguistic study can elaborately reveal these differences.
References


__________________

Anmol Ahmad is Lecturer in the Department of Humanities, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad.

Fizza Farrukh is Lecturer in the Department of Humanities, Air University, Islamabad.
Gender Differences In Adjustment Issues, Quality Of Life And Psychological Resilience Among Hostel Students

Daniya Hasan
Umm E Rubab Kazmi
&
Kanzal Jawahir
Department of Applied Psychology
Lahore College for Women University

Abstract

The present study explores gender differences in adjustment issues, quality of life and psychological resilience among hostel students. Purposive sampling was used and 400 hostel students (female=183 and male=217) were taken from public and private sector colleges/universities. Students from 1st year, BS (year1) and MS (year1) with 18-25 years were taken. The College Adjustment Test CAT was translated in Urdu language and administered on the students along with PR, Short form survey (SF-36) and demographic form. Results show that reliability of the scales was found to be significant CAT $\alpha=0.72$, SF-36 $\alpha=0.80$ and PR $\alpha=0.62$. The first hypothesis showed significant result ($p = 0.03$) that 1\textsuperscript{st} year students tend to face more adjustment issues rather than BS (year 1). The second hypothesis verified that female students encounter more adjustment problems as compared to male students. Male students show higher psychological resilience (PR) as compared to female students. While there are no gender differences found on the variable of QOL which was assessed through SF-36. PR showed negative correlation with adjustment issues $r=-0.11$ and SF-36 $r=0.20$. This research will help university administrators, counselors and student affair officers to design appropriate policy/programs with varieties of support packages to address the needs of the students.

Keywords: Adjustment Issues, Quality of Life, Psychological Resilience.
Introduction

Transition from school to college is difficult and has an impact on the adjustment of student. There are many factors that influence the students adjustment whether they are living with parents and residing in hostels e.g. loneliness, freedom, confusion, competition, homesickness (Dennis, Phinney & Chuateco, 2005; Moore, 2006, & Tuna, 2009) student teacher interaction, difficulty in concentrating (Yalew, 2003) feeling oneself inferior from other classmates, feeling anxious (Fischer, 2009).

Students in hostels are more affected by these adjustment challenges as compared to students living with parents. Homesickness is the most common problem faced by students who are residing in hostels. A research indicated that more or less 90% of the students usually experience some sort of homesickness (Urani, Miller & Johoson, 2003). Watton (2001) reported that students residing with their families tend to adjust more rather than students who reside in hostels. All of these above mentioned factors have an impact on one’s quality of life (QoL). QoL is defined as one’s subjective view about positive and negative dimensions of life (WHO, 1998). It includes psychological and physical aspects which combine have an impact on satisfaction with life (Diener, 1984; Diener, Suh, Lucas & Smith, 1999).

To have better quality of life, a person must be resilient. Mowbray (2011) defined resilience as the bouncing back from a dreadful event, i.e., to have the potential to deal with or the capability of a person to look at things through the end. According to him, resilience is all about the survival, endurance and growth from the situation. Psychological resilience among students refers to the ability to cope or fight the difficulties and complications such as notes taking, preparation for exams, presentation anxiety etc related to academic life (Wasonga, Christman & Kilmer, 2003). It is a mechanism that works or survives in the presence of stressful event (Bonanno, 2004 & Masten, 2001). All these factors significantly contribute to student adjustment to college.

This area has not been explored in Pakistan especially with reference to hostel students. This research will be helpful for university administration/campus counselors to assess the problems of hostel students and to provide them counseling regarding their problems.

Literature Review

Adjustment problems occur when students are unable to deal with societal, educational and psychological burden successfully. There are gender differences seen in this regard
as Lama (2010) reported that the female students have greater tendency to encounter adjustment problems than the male students. It is seen that students reside in hostels experience more adjustment problems because they are far away from their homes. Hostel students experience many adjustment issues such as new setups, security problems, accommodation issues, transport system, loneliness, difficulty to interact with new people (Berry & Sam, 2006).

Adler, Raju, Beveridge, Wang, Zhu and Zimmermann (2008) assumed that students’ poor performance in their later life correlated with adjustment problems experienced in their student life. The inability to cope or adapt to these stressors and responds negatively to these stressors linked with bad quality of life.

The quality of life is affected by several factors such as physical or psychological health concerns, sleep problems, homesickness, social issue, relational problems, education, accommodation problems, personal beliefs and other environmental features (Ruzevicius, 2006; Juozulynas & Cemerych, 2005). Madhuchandra and Srimathi (2017) conducted research on psychological health and illness among college students. Results reveal that female college students are more socially dysfunctional as compared to male students while male students are more severely depressed than female students.

Academic performance and psychological resilience are correlated with each other. This connection is seen through the research carried out by Allan (2014). On the sample of 1534 students it was concluded that there is a link between academic performance and resilience. He further revealed that female students have more resilience power than male students.

It was seen that students having no/low resilience power were more prone to adjustment problems as compared to those with resilient capabilities (Rouse, Ingersoll, & Orr, 1998). Contradictory findings of another study by Erdogan, Ozdogan and Erdogan (2015) highlighted gender differences that male students are more resilient than female students.

The objective of the study is to explore the gender differences in adjustment problems, quality of life and psychological resilience among hostel students. The study is significant in a sense that it will assess and rule out some implications/recommendations so that hostel students may get assistance.

Hypothesis

It was hypothesized that

- First year students would face more adjustment problems as compared to BS (year 1) students.
Female students would face more adjustment problems, poor quality of life and psychological resilience as compared to male students.

There would be negative correlation between psychological resilience and adjustment problems.

Method

Research design

Cross sectional research design was used.

Sampling strategy

Purposive sampling strategy was employed.

Sample

Sample was consisted of 400 hostel students. Total 52% were residing in private hostels while 48% were from university hostels. Intermediate students were 36.5%, BS 31.5% and from 32.0% MS.

Criteria of inclusion

Hostel students of 1st year, BS (year 1) and MS (year 1) with age range of 18-26 years.

Measures

Following were the measures of study.

Written Consent Form: Was duly filled and signed by all participants of the study.

Demographic Sheet: It includes age, gender, hostel details, occupation of parents, whether living or dead, names of friends or hostel inmates, name of home-town, marital status, education and so on.

PR Scale: Urdu translated version of PR scale was used (Jawahir & Kazmi, 2013). The scale was originally developed by Windle, Markland and Woods (2008). This scale is made up of mutual control taken from Paulhaus Spheres of Control, self esteem extracted from Rosenberg Self Esteem scale and personal competency/efficacy scales extracted from Wagnild and Young Resilience Scale respectively. Three scales were picked from the aforesaid scales i.e. Competence (consists of 6 items), interpersonal Control (consists of 5 items) and self-esteem (consists of 8 items). In total, It consists of 19 variables which
employ a 5 point Likert rating, starting from 1(strongly agree) to 5(strongly disagree). The reliability of the final scale is 0.83.

CAT: This test was created by Pennebaker (1990) which ascertains a person’s stage in life, mood, shyness/confidence and assumptions of personality to improve coping process in college i.e. college adjustment. It comprises of 19 variables which quantify the number of students who felt ad reflected in different manner as far as college attended in the prior week was concerned. positive effect, negative effect and homesickness were the principal characteristics that were visible. 0.79 is the internal consistency of the full scale with 0.65 test retest reliability and Lexicon equivalence method was used for translation of this scale into urdu language.

SF-36: Short Form Survey (SF) developed by Ware (1993) which is a short, multi-purpose survey comprising of 36 queries in Urdu language. It has 8-scale sketch of a person’s well-being and basic health which assess mental and physical well-being. It is a general measure and does not cater to a particular age, illness or group under treatment. This scale was used to assess quality of life of students.

Procedure

Permission was requested from the Department of Applied Psychology, Lahore College for Women University. In addition to this, approval was also taken from authorities of the hostels. Total five (5) hostels permitted for data collection in which three (3) were university and two (2) were private hostels. Data was gathered by the kind cooperation of the staff of the hostels. Written consent was taken from students. Assurance was also given that the information taken would be solely used for research purposes. Demographic sheet along with CAT, SF 36, PR Scale were given to the participants. They were duly filled in, in about half an hour after giving them the requisite guidance. At the end, participants were acknowledged and thanked for their time, effort and providing the necessary data.

Results

The data of the study was statistically analyzed by using SPSS (20.00 version for windows). Demographic results of the sample are as follows. Age categories were made according to Erikson stages of adolescent with $M=20.6$, $SD=2.59$. Furthermore, the participants for the study were female students (54.3%) and male students (45.8 %) with 36.5% in Intermediate, 31.5% in BS and 32.0% in MS residing in three (3) university (48.0%) and two (2) private hostels (52.0%). The percentage of students from university hostels was 30%, 15% and 15%. About 98.5% of the students were single and 1.5% was married. Moreover, most of the participants were from Punjab (80.8%), 13.5% from Sindh, 4.8% from KPK and 1.0% from Baluchistan.
Reliability of the Scales Used in the Study

Cronbach’s alpha was used to calculate the internal consistency of the scales that were translated into Urdu language which is shown in Tb 2. This analysis revealed that CAT was highly significant (19 items: α = 0.72) with its sub scales revealing significant reliability i.e. homesickness consisting of 6 items (α = 0.54), negative affect involving 9 items (α = 0.81) and positive affect with 6 items (α = 0.53). Moreover, PR also showed significant reliability (α = 0.62) along with SF-36 (α = 0.80) which reports highly significant internal consistency.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scales</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SF-36</td>
<td>0.20**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR</td>
<td>-0.11*</td>
<td>-0.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**P<0.01, *P<0.05

The analysis revealed positive correlation between CAT and SF-36 $r = 0.20$, and a negative correlation between CAT and PR $r = -0.11$ as well as between SF-36 and PR $r = -0.10$.

Table: 2
Correlation among subscales of SF-36, CAT and PR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subscales</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PCS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCS</td>
<td>-0.13**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homesickness</td>
<td>-0.21**</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive affect</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>-0.10</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative Affect</td>
<td>-0.20**</td>
<td>0.15**</td>
<td>0.60**</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self esteem</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.24**</td>
<td>-0.01**</td>
<td>0.14**</td>
<td>-0.10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter personal control</td>
<td>-0.20**</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>-0.12*</td>
<td>0.14**</td>
<td>-0.20**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>-0.21**</td>
<td>-0.10</td>
<td>0.20**</td>
<td>-0.12*</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>-0.03**</td>
<td>0.40**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**P<0.01, *P<0.05
It revealed that there is significant positive relationship between negative affect and homesickness $r = 0.60$ as well as between positive affect and physical component $r = 0.10$. Significant negative relationship was found among interpersonal control, physical component $r = -0.20$ and self esteem $r = -0.20$.

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>Male Students</th>
<th>Female Students</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>95% CI</th>
<th>Cohen’s d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>66.24</td>
<td>12.04</td>
<td>73.82</td>
<td>14.74</td>
<td>398</td>
<td>5.66</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SF-36</td>
<td>83.93</td>
<td>9.60</td>
<td>84.54</td>
<td>9.68</td>
<td>398</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>.532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR</td>
<td>51.83</td>
<td>6.72</td>
<td>40.72</td>
<td>5.58</td>
<td>398</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note.* CI = Confidence Interval; LL = Lower Limit; UL = Upper Limit

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>1st Year</th>
<th>BS (year 1)</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>95% CI</th>
<th>Cohen’s d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>71.15</td>
<td>14.97</td>
<td>67.19</td>
<td>14.43</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>.03</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n=146, n=126

This difference shows that adjustment issues are more faced by Intermediate students than BS students (Year 1).

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>University Hostel</th>
<th>Private Hostel</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>95% CI</th>
<th>Cohen’s d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td></td>
<td>LL</td>
<td>UL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>67.27</td>
<td>13.37</td>
<td>71.96</td>
<td>13.94</td>
<td>398</td>
<td>-3.42</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n^a=192, n^b=208

Table 5 shows that there is significant difference between means of private and university hostel students on CAT. Private hostel students tend to face more issues (M=71.96,
SD=13.94) as compared to university hostel students (M=67.27, SD=13.37), t (398) = .001, 95% CI (-7.37, -1.99), d= -0.17

**Discussion**

Stepping into the college life is a significant period of life in anyone’s life. Students confront a lot of issues pertaining to education and friendships especially adjustment issues in hostel. The current research explores the various adjustment problems, quality of life, and resilience level in Pakistani population that aids students in adjusting to the novel environment.

The study in question concludes that the adjustment problems are usually found in students in their first year of college instead of BS students in year one. This is because students confront more drastic change from school to college life and more problems are encountered in the very first year. As mentioned in earlier researches, students of 1st year find college more problematic (58%) as compared to those in their 3rd year of college life (39%). Main causes could be absence of social support and lack of emotional immaturity (Sharma, 2012). According to Enochs and Roland (2006), those pupils who lack social support are unable to make better adjustments to college life as compared to those who make new friendships and engage in social activities. Research also suggests that students who have the potential to engage in social groups have the ability to make adjustments in a better way and perform well in academics (Yau, 2012). Apart from this, there can be other factors like issues with mates, material sharing, and financial constraints that lead towards poor adjustments (Kabtamu, 2009). Mao and Mei (2008) concluded that major adjustment issues were seen among freshmen upon stepping into college life. Kabtamu (2009) found out that students during their first year are likely to confront more problems and some problems can be overwhelming such as interpersonal issues, academic problems, and poor teacher student bonding. These findings match to those found by Wang (2006) and Chong (2009) that state that family, society, and college life affects the adjustment during the first year. Mudhovozi (2012) found out that first year pupils are likely to have issue pertaining to families, social ties, food, and loss of contact with school friends and many more.

These problems of the students in the hostel result in disturbed patterns of living making the quality of life poor. In the present study, a positive correlation was seen among these variables and the hypothesis was thus accepted. As said in literature review, poor adjustment results in increased stress and makes adjustment more complicated (Wintre & Yaffe, 2000). Peer and parental support aids students to make better adjustments but lack of such support results in issues in making adherence to new life around college. All this makes a student more anxious, depressed, and stressed (Cutrona, Cole, Colangelo, Soulite & Russel, 1994; Holahan, Valentiner, & Moos, 1995). Another study states that homesickness is a major issue in a student’s life and nearly 90% of the students face this problem (Urani, Miller & Johnson, 2003). Other major factors that contribute in poor
adjustment level include irregular sleeping patterns that also result in depression and less satisfaction with life activities (Pilcher & Ott, 1998; Brown, Buboltz & Soper, 2002). Students who are unable to make better social adjustments have low levels of self-esteem (Rice, 1999). Sharda (2003) when exploring relationship among student adjustment and mental health stated that positive perceptions of surroundings aid them to make better adjustments as compared to those having negative perceptions. Students who live in hostels are usually not satisfied with their lives and the major cause behind this could be that they are not adjusted to their environments and confront issues which act as obstacles in their way of having a quality life including non-cleanliness, absence from classes, learning problems, and conveyance issues (Abolfotouh, Baasiouni, Mounir and Fayyad, 2007). Such adjustment issues are more common among female students as compared to male students.

The current study states that adjustment problems are more prevalent in females as compared to males, \( p = 0.000 \). This statement is well supported by literature. Lama (2010) mentions female students face more hassles in way to adjust than males. According to Enochs and Renk (2006), male pupils have the ability to make better adjustments than females and one major reason for this could be that women are more reliant on support and social groups. Likewise, Mudhovozi (2012) stated that majority of the females have feeling of loneliness. They also mentioned having more communication barriers and financial issues. Jemal (2012) confirmed that female students face more adjustment issues and are unable to make social participations.

Abolfotouh et al., (2007) stated that females have more issues when making adjustments to hostel life as compared to males because females face more difficulties to mobilize and are dependent on others for support. Abdullah, Elias, Mahyddin, and Uli (2009) also confirmed that males have the ability to make better adjustments to surroundings and female students have more issues when making social adjustments. They also discovered that males are better adjusted to surroundings as compared to females and this is because males have the ability to manage emotions and make settlements in a better way.

No significant gender differences were found on SF-36 score which was used to assess quality of life. The quality of life was seen to be affected for both female and male students in the same way which contradicts the findings that are present in literature. According to Greblo and Hodak (2012), male students score on health was higher than females. This shows that their quality of living was better than female students. Sabbah, Khamis and Droubi (2013), HRQoL was better for males rather than for females and their score was high on HRQoL. This could be possible because of more males in our society participating in daily households items along with females. Earlier, only females were responsible for every household matters but with passage of time, males support and provide helping hand to females, so the degree of disturbed QOL could be same for both the gender. In order to
overcome these issues, students need to be resilient so they can achieve their tasks more easily and in proper manner.

The present study reveals that male students are more resilient as compared to females. The same findings revealed by Erdogan, Ozdogan and Erdogan (2015). Previous literature shows contradiction in gender differences on resilience. Fishman (2012) stated that female students are likely to have higher score on resilience. Likewise, Allan (2014) reported a correlation among resilience and performance and stated that positive aspects of resilience are more prevalent in female students as compared to male students. The major reason behind this contradiction can be cultural differences. Pakistani population is more emotional and females are likely to show strong emotions and are less exposed to social environments as compared to males that is why the level of resilience is found to be low.

The present research states that there is a negative relation between resilience of students and adjustment issues as well as quality of life. Earlier researches suggest that people who make use of emotion focused plans tend to have lesser achievements as compared to students making use of problem focused plans. So, in order to decrease the level of stress, students have to adapt to an effective technique that is significant for staying resilient (Ward Struthers & colleagues, 2000). Researches have also mentioned that level of resilience in the students has to be updated so that stress factors can be minimized. Likewise, students who are not adjusted to their environment get involved in high risk activities and behaviors and such behaviors are common in non-resilient individuals (Rouse, Orr & Ingersoll, 1998). Another research suggested that there is a relation between task oriented strategies, problem focused plans, and resilience that aids in dealing with various life stressors (Campbell-Sills & colleagues, 2006). Similarly it has been discovered that there is an important relationship between academic behavior and such strategies. If a student tends to adhere to these strategies, it will aid him or her in achieving his goals (Clifton & colleagues, 2004).

Like adjustment problems, QOL is also negatively correlated to levels of resilience. Literature suggests that adjustment to the society, homelessness, social groups, and academics are all components of QOL and all these components affect the academic achievements as well as overall health (Abdullah et al., 2009; Quinn, Madon & Lusting, 2006).

Another analysis was made to see the differences of means on college adjustment for pupils living in university hostels and private hostels. The research reveals that those residing in university hostel face less issue as compared to those living on private hostels. This correlates to the findings in the previously mentioned literature. According to Pike (2009), students in university hostels have the ability to adapt to new changes in their lives. Likewise, another study found that university hostel students are more likely to participate in social activities.
and make better adjustments (Lundgren & Schwab, 1979; cited in Rinn, 2004). Besides this, students in university hostels have more facilities and do not have conveyance issues. Such students are more contended. Major reason behind this could be that they reside within university premises and have feelings of association with those around them.

**Conclusions**

It is concluded on the basis of findings that adjustment problems are more prevalent in 1st year students as compared to 3rd year students. Female students face more adjustment problems as compared to male students. Level of resilience is higher in males as compared to females students. However, the findings of the study did not find gender differences in quality of life among the students.

**Limitations and Recommendations**

Following are the limitations of the present research and future considerations,

- Equal number of students was not taken from each hostel.
- Hostel environment along with facilities was not taken into consideration while interpreting results.
- The cultural differences bound the findings of this research to Lahore only.
- In future research, large number of hostels should be included for generalization of results.
- Counseling centers within university should be established so that intervening variables and stressors of students may be minimized.

**References**


Gender Differences in Adjustment Issues, Quality of Life and Psychological Resilience among Hostel Students


Gender Differences in Adjustment Issues, Quality of Life and Psychological Resilience among Hostel Students


___________________________________________________________________________

Daniya Hasan was Student in the Department of Applied Psychology, Lahore College for Women University (LCWU), Lahore.

Umm E Rubab Kazmi is Lecturer in the Department of Applied Psychology, Lahore College for Women University (LCWU), Lahore.

Kanzal Jawahir was Student in the Department of Applied Psychology, Lahore College for Women University (LCWU), Lahore.
Screen Image Of Muslim Women In The Popular Post-9/11 Films On War On Terror

Muhammad Shaban Rafi
Department of English Language & Literature
University of Management and Technology, Lahore

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to deconstruct the screen image of Muslim women in the post-9/11 films on American war on terror. The data was drawn from four popular films (i.e., American Sniper-2014, Jarhead 2: Field of Fire-2014, Zero Dark Thirty-2012 and Body of Lies-2008) depicting the post 9/11 American war on terror in the Muslim countries such as Afghanistan, Iraq, Jordan, Pakistan, Oman, and Syria (henceforth ‘the Muslim society’). The study built its theoretical foundation by drawing from discourse analysis, critical theory and deconstruction. It is observed that social reality projected in the selected films hinges on different discursive practices manifested through linguistic styles, actions, objects, settings, graphic illustrations and sound tracks. In addition to the identification of the Muslim women in the oppressive discourses, the study unlocks some hidden meanings by acknowledging their professional contributions in the social institutions. The Western Caucasian women, usually empowered to exercise their rights, present a huge contrast to the Muslim women who are dangerously marginalized mostly if not always by the abrogation of rights. The study suggests that the representation of educated and professional women along with those who are oppressed can be a powerful strategy to resist misogynist discourse prevailing in the Muslim society.

Keywords: Muslim Woman, Oppressive Discourses, New Women, War on Terror, Post-9/11 Films.
Introduction

There is a plethora of literature available on feminism (Woolf, 1929; De Beauvoir, 1949; Millett, 1970; Foucault, 1976; Spivak, 1996; Clement and Kristeva, 2001; Butler, 2010) that allows me to focus on the missing strand within this available research and bring to the fore limited conversations on the representation of Muslim women in the films on American war on terror in the post 9/11 (henceforth ‘war on terror’). Shaheen (2000, p.37) argues that a few scholars have documented and discussed media images of Muslim women. The representation of the screen image of Muslim women though narrates real account of events seems in contradiction with millions of Muslim women who are spending a successful life in various professions. The kind of work I have outlined seeks to destabilize the established knowledge about the Muslim women especially in the context of popular culture and film.

I aim to investigate not only the image of oppressed Muslim women but also to bring to surface the successful struggles of educated and professional women (henceforth ‘new women’) who are observed to resisting the misogynist discourse. The study is an affirmative deconstruction (Derrida’s phrase) of strategies that filmmakers have been applying to persuade the oppressed Muslim women to enact power. To begin with this investigation, it is very important for us to understand the ethno-cultural landscape prevailing in the Muslim countries in case. Generally speaking, almost two third of the Muslim population is from the rural/remote areas where women work in fields, farms and homes. For many reasons they are restricted by certain norms usually imposed by men to advance economically (e.g., Kasturi, 1996). Mostly if not always, they have to look towards male members of their community for decision making. They are forced to adhere to traditional Islamic barriers, such as limits on mixed-sex interaction, and communication with their male counterparts. They have to wear culturally approved dresses which can cover their bodies. They are bound to live under combined family systems where elders play a dominant role. Further, they are silenced through arbitrary cultural norms and psychological pressures that label them as the ‘honour’ of the family and their immediate guardian (usually husband, father and brother) as the de facto custodian of that ‘honour’. Thus, because of the cultural and psychological demands, the male members of community are forced to limit the social practices and mobility of their female dependants.
The rural women are squarely burdened by religion and patriarchy as has been rightly depicted by Barmak (2003) in his drama film ‘Osama’. For instance, the Islamic Institutions (mainly funded by State) such as Council of Islamic Ideology (CII) of Pakistan allows the husband to beat his wife if needed and prohibits mixing of gender in schools, hospitals and offices (Khan, 2016). The Council also believes that a woman smiling is against the laws of their self-proclaimed *Sharia*. Such decisions confine women who are almost 50 percent of the total population in Pakistan to a very limited social and professional space. Salami and Ghajarieh (2016) conclude that society and state are influenced by patriarchal values. Some people believe that the anti-women position of the CII promotes violence against women and has contributed to an increase in crimes against the gender (Riazul-Haq, 2016). Jamal (2010, pp. 120-139) highlights that the dominant discourses and ideologies surrounding the Muslim women (and their bodies) are further propagated within the contexts of their families, community, and nation. Such discursive practice gives an impression that this is a men’s world and God belongs to them only. From a Lacanian perspective woman does not even exist (Cited in Caputi, 2013:2).

From the foregoing it appears that rural communities have internalized the dominant misogynistic discourse (Ahmad, 2010, p. 8) that is prevalent in their daily life. They feel that men have the right to be in control of their lives and bodies. Tyson (2006, p. 120) argues that man’s dominance has secured an ideological climate of compliance from women. Any resistance to men’s biological, psychological and economic discriminative attitude is met with dire consequences for women e.g., psychological or/and physical torture, divorce, acid attacks and honor killing – usually labeled as *Karo Kari* and *Siyah Kari* (Patel and Gadit, 2008; Lari, 2011; Bhanbhro et al. 2013). With honor killing so rampant women are denied access to education (See e.g., Khoja-Moolji, 2015) maybe to keep them subservient of inhuman rituals. Lazar and Kramarae (2011:217-240) note that women are doubly oppressed and silenced through gender and poverty. Pratt (2016) says that social norms, legal restrictions and gender-based violence prevent women from accessing economic opportunities. Even their economic contribution to society through engaging in different kinds of work is kept secret as explicated by Marx as the only example of zero-work (c.f., Rouse, 2004). They are rarely treated as equal members of society and often find themselves relegated to subversive discourses.

The experience of women varies in the patriarchal discourses mainly due to regional and cultural differences as envisaged by Tyson (2006, 2009, 2015) who argues that patriarchy does not work in the same way in all the countries even within the same country. Foucault (1976:95) has rightly stated that where there is power there is resistance. Unlike the rural women, those who are from the urban areas are mostly educated and formally employed, developments which are shifting the emphasis on the characters of power (c.f., Kasturi, 1996). Women are contributing in all the social institutions such as family,
education, media, politics, army and judiciary. They are independent in their decision making and follow modern trends in clothing, make-up, cuisine, cell phone and so on. The decisions of Islamic councils hardly affect their everyday life. They enact as subjects who contest power (Mills, 2005). It may be unfair to compare them with the women in rural communities. There is a common observation that women who are either less educated or uneducated remain dependent on male members (Khoja-Moolji, 2015). They are subject to oppression in most of the discourses. We find resistance to these discourses in Islam by ‘new women’. Undoubtedly, media is playing a crucial role to support their resistance against the misogynist discourses.

Hollywood has produced numerous award winning films and documentaries on the social life of Muslim women. Tyson (2006:4) says that the screen images of Muslim women convey ideas and feelings regarding how the story-line illustrates a theme or mirrors the prevalent social discourse or communicates the director’s viewpoint. They are often portrayed as being suppressed, controlled, abused and victimized by the Muslim society. These patterns have been regurgitating even in the films on post 9/11 American war on terror. The films on terror appear to be creating the discourse of resistance against the misogynist forces by drawing a parallel to Western matriarchal ideology. The Muslim women are shown being controlled by the self fabricated Islamic ideology often associated with Sharia Law (religious system to govern the members of Islamic faith). For example; in Jarhead 2: Field of Fire (henceforth ‘Jarhead 2’) while punishing Aanush, Mullah Nafees says, “We need to return to our way of life – the Sharia way of life. And for this you will die”. The present study seeks to uncover some deep truth in practices. Said (1978) argues that it is very important for the post-colonial thinkers to see truth in the constructed factual accounts of colonized countries by the colonial powers (as cited in Mills, 2005:75).

Theoretical Frameworks

The present study aims to reveal the oppressive discourses as constituted in intellectual practices of filmmakers (c.f., Spivak, 1996:69). We can achieve this while investigating the screen image of Muslim women through text and dialogue. Van Dijk (2011:3) notes that language users engaged in dialogue accomplish social acts of many kinds by coordinating their action as meaningful in a discourse. He further explains that discourse on the one hand is an important condition for social inequality and on the other hand a prominent tool for resistance. Howarth (2000:4) asserts that the task of discourse analysis is to expose the way in which language and meaning are used by the powerful to deceive and oppress the dominated. Discourse, women and patriarchy are inextricably linked and established in the work of Althusser (1971), Gramsci (1971), Foucault (1972), Lakoff (1973), Thorne and Henley (1975), Habermas (1987), Wodak (1997), Sunderland (2004), Laclau (2007) and Strauss and Feiz (2014). It is hard to delink women and hegemonic practices in the Muslim society – both of them are quite crucially shaped by discourse.
We will look into various discursive practices with particular ideological investments in dominance in the screen image of the Muslim women. Through the close analysis of language texts and multisemiotic aspects such as visual images and sound effects, we will explore how misogynist discourses operate in the Muslim society in general. While applying discourse theory on empirical research objects I draw upon Critical Theory and Deconstruction in order to counter the charge that discourse analysts are no more than armchair theorizers. Howarth (2000:134) explains that there is no one method of conducting discourse analysis, but rather different styles of research compatible with its social ontology. Thus, we are concerned with how, under what conditions, and for what reasons, misogynist discourses are constructed, contested and changed in the films on war on terror.

These discourses do form a backdrop against which our use of Critical Theory (CT) positions itself, for we are in agreement with a worldview that privileges the voice of the marginalized. Tyson (2006, p. 5) explains that CT often examines the ways in which women are psychologically and socioeconomically oppressed. It provides an analytical lens, drawing especially on the work of Jacques Derrida, to think logically, creatively, and with a good deal of insight into valued voice of the sufferers (Caputi, 2013:1-30). Derrida’s concepts such as the instituted trace or trace structure, différence and iterability form the basis for deconstructive strategy. He argues (1982:307-330) that trace is infinitely repeatable and alterable in different discourses, and that meaning is a product of différence (as cited in Howarth, 2000:41). The representation of Muslim women in comparison with Western Caucasian women (henceforth ‘the Western women’) contains traces of binary oppositions (as illustrated in figure 2) surrounding their everyday life unravel oppressive discourses that the Muslim women are experiencing. Moreover, différence mediates the way a meaning is produced by interplay of traces and deferment of certain practices. Caputi (2013:xvi) argues that the Derridean concept of difference is useful here as it highlights the fluid, contingent nature of truth claims, undermining the authority of any given position by drawing attention to its relationship with what has been silenced and marginalized. However, iterability is captured through repeatability and alterability of images and symbols used in different films. For indeed, regardless of my cultural affiliations and intellectual traditions I have carefully examined the ways women are silenced in the Muslim society.

CT is useful especially at the time when the USA is fighting a war on terror in the Muslim world and its relationship with the Muslim communities weighs more heavily on everyday life than ever before. CT helps answer the realities (which have been screened by various filmmakers) of the ever increasingly penetrated Muslim world. The theoretical conceptions laid down by CT forces me to contemplate the relationship between misogynist discourses and extremism at least in the remote regions (mostly not administered by the Islamic States in case). This relationship has been very well depicted
by Mansoor (2007) in his film “Khuda Kay Liye”. The study speculates that there is a kind of link between oppressive discourses and extremist practices. The films on war on terror mirror this link as well. Shaheen (2001) notes that films are a product of human experience and therefore they reflect human desire, conflict and potential. I interpreted films in the broader sense of the term to include all signifying systems, including dialogues, objects, actions and settings that give access to discursive practices constituted in the Muslim communities. Unlike the structuralists (Sassure, 1974; Levi-Strauss, 1977 and those cited therein) who deem meaning making is central to ‘structure’, the present study, however, de-centers meaning and assumes ‘signifier’ as the ultimate carrier of meaning, which signifies personal experiences (Derrida, 1976).

Data Collection

Hollywood had been quite popular and successful in presenting the post-war shared beliefs and experiences of American soldiers from various fronts e.g., Vietnam, USSR (now Russia) and the Middle East until 9/11 happened. The event had a great impact on the USA in particular and on the rest of the world in general. Filmmakers were no exceptions. They began to film on the experiences shared/leaked by Pentagon or American soldiers. The primary focus of these films is on war on terror in the Muslim countries. Among their experiences is a representation of women in these countries. The study investigates how the Muslims women are identified within the Muslim society and whether they can be compared with the Western women who remain in the hearts and minds of American soldiers and are assigned various roles. The data was drawn from four popular films (American Sniper-2014, Jarhead 2-2014, Zero Dark Thirty-2012 and Body of Lies-2008) on post-9/11 war on terror in the Muslim countries (such as Afghanistan, Iraq, Jordan, Pakistan, Oman, and Syria). A film acclaimed on the box office was considered to be popular. It tends to draw attention and interest of most of the viewers who give it rating. It is considered that a popular film is supported by a well thought out script. One of the reasons of the popularity of these films on the box office is that they showcase setting and background of the countries which have been in the news for their troubled history since ages.

Nature of Data

As it is shown in figure 1 the data was based on dialogues, acts, objects and settings. The dialogues were mainly in the English language and some in the regional dialects e.g., Arabic, Persian and Urdu. The tone of dialogues can be classified on formal and informal ends of the continuum. The acts were seemingly labeling characters who could be identified through their appearance and language easily. The objects used further symbolize them who they are. The settings in the films portrayed characters involved in their daily chores. The theme that emerges from these aspects i.e., dialogues, acts, objects and settings provide insight into hegemonic practices in the Muslim society.
Data Analysis

The theoretical frameworks elaborated in the section 2 lay the procedure for analysis. The analysis begins with a process of familiarization and subsequent labeling and sorting in commonly emerging discursive practices and their realization in language texts and multisemiotic texts. As elaborated in figure 1, the analysis procedure covers description and interpretation of dialogues, acts, objects and settings. The focus of analysis was on the selected texts, most rightly the representative texts, and their link with power relations and ideological processing of discourses. Fairclough (2010:78) rightly declares that discursive practices are the processes of text production, distribution and consumption. This has been affirmed by Siddiqui (2014) who deems the text a useful lens to mirror personal and social relations. Fairclough (1998) explains that a range of properties of texts is regarded as potentially ideological including features of vocabulary, grammar, style, presuppositions, implicatures and politeness conventions. In addition to the analysis of language texts, the study interpreted certain binary oppositions (e.g., oppressed/liberal, conservative/modern, dependent/independent and so on) and semiotics (e.g., object, gaze, and sound effects and so on) for patterns of meaning.

At the first stage, I analyzed language texts and multisemiotic characteristics of the selected text. The linguistic characteristics include investigation of forms and subsequently their meanings in the context. I tried to reduce the inherent complexity of what films cover by adopting, if not all possible aspects, but dialogues, acts, objects and settings ascribed in the oppressive discourses. The first stage of analysis was followed by
the second stage in which I interpreted the texts to explore the kinds of functions they serve by seeing how they are embedded within the social structures (e.g., oppressive vs. liberal discourses). The study dispenses what underpin such practices and anticipates what their implications are. Yanow (2014:5-23) maintains that meaning-making is the ultimate focus of interpretative approach. The approach helped in analyzing obstacles and potential means to surpass the oppressive discourses. I may not rule out the influence of my cultural experiences, beliefs and ideologies in the interpretation of the text.

Results and Discussion

Dialogues

As shown in figure 2, there is a huge contrast between the Muslim women and their Western counterparts. Such a contrast also exists between the Muslim and the Western society. The Muslim women are largely portrayed as oppressed, pre-modern, dependent, and with many-children in a patriarchal, conservative, radical, and backward society. In contrast to this, the Western women are shown liberal, modern, independent, and with two-children in a democratic, civilized and developed society.

![Figure 2: Women and cultural binary oppositions](image)

The voice of the Muslim women has been occluded which seems to blur the reality. In American Sniper, they were kept silent. However, they were trying to communicate both resistance and submission through body language (e.g., gaze and facial expression). When Mustafa’s (the Iraqi sniper) was leaving home to kill American soldiers, his wife could not say anything but she reacted through a ‘gaze’, which was perhaps anticipating terrible consequences. In the Body of Lies the gaze of Aisha when she was looking at Ferris being taken by Marwan demonstrates her helplessness. Keeping the Muslim women silent in the films seems quite a successful strategy to reveal their oppressed state of existence. In another setting while responding to Ferris who was suspecting Asia was tortured, Honi Pasha said, “she is a nurse. She gives blood every month”. The dialogue is reminiscent of inhumane treatment of women; a deep rooted issue in the Muslim society. As shown in Image 1, they remain either silent or wailing or pleading. It was shown that silencing discourses were achieved through coercion and hegemony.
As mentioned above, the Muslim women characters were not allocated dialogues in most of the cases. However, in the contexts in which they are engaged in talking, they seem to be representing new women under the Western influence or they are shown as living in the Western society. In *Jarhead 2*, Aanush, who graduated from the University of Cambridge, had been fighting for the rights of women in Afghanistan. Even though she was being tortured physically, her dialogues [1] with Mullah Nafees (Taliban leader) reflected how bold she was. The dialogue with Aanush left the Taliban leader speechless. When he could not respond he simply seized her face to show his aggression that reflects how women’s voice is usurped in patriarchal societies. This also reveals that education empowers women to speak for their rights without any fear.

\begin{itemize}
  \item **Talban:** Afghanistan does not need the Western influence and it has to come back to its own way of life which is the Sharia way of life.
  \item **Aanush:** What you’re preaching is nothing more than a perversion.
  \item **Talban:** You picked a wrong fight and for this you will die.
  \item **Aanush:** We will all die, some better than others. You may be able to kill me but you will never be able to kill an idea. In my place there will rise a thousand more. My paradise awaits me. But for you only hell awaits.”
\end{itemize}

Unlike the Muslim women who were portrayed with restricted social and family life, the Western women are depicted as performing a very crucial role in their family. Teya’s argument with Kyle at various occasions gives the impression that she has the freedom of speech denied to the Muslim women characters. She denounces him for not finding time for her when he is deployed on an important mission inside Iraq. In a phone call to him she complains, “I am sitting here by myself. Literally assembling baby cribs and you can’t even talk to me”. In another instance, her speech shows how American war on terror is disturbing the social and psychological health of her husband. She points out to Kyle, “Even when you are here you are not here. I see you, feel you but you are not here. If you think this war isn’t changing you, you are wrong”. In order to reduce his stress, she wants him to share his experiences. The films on terror do not set such precedence for the Muslim women to derive from in their family life.
There is no one but a Western woman (Maya) who helped hunt down Osama Bin Laden. Her dialogues with the station chief of CIA in Pakistan depict how brave she is. She is given very eloquent and powerful dialogues. Her character is a huge contrast with Aisha who is allocated the role of a working woman in Body of Lies. Unlike other Muslim women characters, Maya is resisting and challenging her male colleagues’ hegemony. Nothing could stop her to achieve her goal.

**Maya:** I really need to talk to you about briefing up surveillance operation.

**Chief:** We don’t have a surveillance operation... someone just tried to blow up Times Square and you are talking to me about some facilitator, some detainee seven years ago said might have been working with Al Qaida.

Maya: He is the key to Bin Laden.

**Chief:** I don’t fucking care about Bin Laden. I care about the next attack. You are gonna start working on the American Al Qaida cells. Protect the homeland.

**Maya:** Bin Laden is the one who keeps on telling them (terrorists) to attack the homeland. If it wasn’t for him, Al Qaida wouldn’t still be focused on overseas targets. If you really wanna protect the homeland, you need to get Bin Laden.

**Chief:** This guy never met Bin Laden. These guys are... working on the internet. No one has even talked to Bin Laden for 4 years. He is out of the game. He may be dead. He might as well be fucking dead but you know what you are doing? You are chasing the ghost. All the fucking network goes around you.

**Maya:** You just want me to nail some low level... You can check that box in your resume that says while you are in Pakistan you got real terrorists but the truth is you don’t understand Pakistan and you don’t know Al Qaida. Either give me the team I need to follow this lead or the other thing you are gonna have under your resume is being the first station chief to be called before congressional committee for subverting the efforts to capture or kill Bin Laden.

Contrastively, the Muslim women are shown largely submissive nonentities, dependent, and culturally conservative. They are restricted to choose even their life partners. For this, they have to look towards their elders who hold power to decide the course of their life. In Body of Lies, when Ferris shows interest in Aisha, she advises him in quite fractured English, “if you are going to insist on coming here to see me which is what you are doing my sister is going to want to meet you... My sister looks after me in matters that are non-medical”. Perhaps she was obliged to speak garbled English. Unlike Aisha, Teya in American Sniper is portrayed as a self-made and independent woman who meets Kyle in a bar, falls in love and decides to marry him. The Western women are dominating and independent in their dialogues. Moreover, the acts women were performing in the films on terror further explain about them.

**Acts**

The acts assigned to the Muslim women are mainly of wife and mother. They are found either with children or serving their husbands. In American Sniper, when the American soldiers raided a house the camera captures a woman and her children. Despite the
presence of her husband, she helps the children to calm down and serves dinner to the soldiers. Later she is shown collecting the cutlery for cleaning. In the same film Mustafa the Iraqi sniper’s wife is trying to make her baby sleep whereas her husband is preparing to kill the American soldiers. In *Body of Lies*, Basam’s wife, as shown in image 2 is preparing food for her child even though she is pregnant. Similarly, in this film, Pasha’s wife Suda is also shown serving food to her family. In another act she is called by Pasha to tie up his sleeves button. In the films on terror we can observe that the Muslim women are mainly involved in either nonpaid jobs or low paid jobs or self-employed jobs and home chores. These acts depict in general abrogation of their basic rights (e.g., speech, education and employment) in the Muslim countries the selected films are based on.

Image 2: Basam’s wife preparing food in *Body of Lies*

Muslim women are further pushed into terrorist activities. To associate them with Islam, such acts are combined with the recitation of Azan (call for prayer), rattling sound of tanks and marching of soldiers. This finding can be generalized over most of the films on war on terror. At the onset of *American Sniper*, while we hear Azan in the background along with the movement of American soldiers in a filthy and devastated neighbourhood of Iraq, a woman in *Burqa* as shown in image 3 appears through a door along with a child to attack them with hand grenade. She is being monitored by a man standing on the roof with a mobile phone. The act of terrorism by her is further dramatized through various semiotic devices and sound tracks. Even women wearing the traditional Muslim *Hijab/Burqa* are associated with terrorist activities. Perhaps, such acts refer to Islam as a bizarre ideology.

In contrast to the Muslim women, the Western women are portrayed as caring, brave, saviors, confident and hardworking. In *American Sniper* when Teya knows about Kyle’s hypertension, she argues with him to take proper rest and medication. In *Jarhead 2*, Annie, a marine solider, fights very hard along with other soldiers against Talibans to bring Aanush to the base camp. In *Zero Dark Thirty*, Maya proves to be very intelligent and brave while hunting down Osma Bin Laden with his associates in Pakistan and elsewhere. In *Body of Lies*, the Western women assist their male colleagues to pin down terrorists from the satellite station. It seems that these films draw a fine line between the Muslim and the Western women who are further distinguished through a set of fixed objects.

**Objects**

The Muslim women are shown suppressed through semiotic dimensions of social practice. They are usually identified with *Hijab/Burqa/Niqab* to symbolize their oppression in Islam. In *Jarhead 2*, Aanush veils herself especially while taking refuge from her own countrymen. It shows that the Muslim women are married to men who possess and
oppress them. In *American Sniper* they even wear *Burqa* in the presence of their immediate family at home, which shows that they live under the influence of an oppressive discourse that makes it obligatory for them to cover themselves. In *Zero Dark Thirty*, even Maya was observing *Hijab* while interacting with the Muslim males. Though *Parda* is a symbol of religion and culture, it is linked with terrorism. Certain events in the films are interpolated to highlight *Hijab/Burqa/Niqab* wearing women as associates of terrorists. In *American Sniper* a woman who informs Mustafa (the Iraqi Sniper) about the presence of American soldiers is in *Burqa*. In *Zero Dark Thirty*, a male terrorist gets himself discharged by wearing *Burqa* at the compound of a mosque in Rawalpindi, Pakistan. This perpetuates a negative image about *Burqa* that can be used in terrorist activities and mosque being a safe haven for terrorists. Shaheen (2000) also argues that more recently image-makers are offering caricatures of Muslim women covered in black from head to toe to depict them as unattractive and enslaved beings – solely attending men. The uses of certain religious and cultural tropes are exploited in the films to prove Islam as a fundamental ideology.

Muslim women are shown as captives in their homes. They are kept busy with household objects e.g., utensils and eatables as depicted through image 2. In case they are performing a role outside the four walls of their homes they are carrying explosives, gun, hand grenade and bags filled with eatables. As depicted in image 3, a woman covered in *burqa* is spotted by Kyle while passing an explosive object to a child to blow up American soldiers in the name of Allah. The finding is in parallel with Shaheen (2000:26) who reveals that the Muslim women surface as gun toters, or as bumbling subservients, or as belly dancers in Hollywood films on Muslim Arabs. Such objects seem to link them with terrorists. This gives the impression that they are too helpless to resist even the criminal activities. The purpose to show them along with these objects is to portray how submissive they are. They are dotted with eatables, goats, camels, and chicken. Eventually, they are denigrated as dehumanized caricatures.

![Image 3: Muslim woman passing hand grenade to her son in American Sniper](image)

On the other hand, we are shown the Western women with a completely different set of objects e.g., laptop/computer, paper & pencil and smart phones. They wear modern attire or uniform. In *Zero Dark Thirty*, Maya works on a computer and takes notes. None but she drives alone in the streets of Islamabad. In *Body of Lies*, the Western women work at the satellite station to assist their colleagues in hunting down terrorists. In *Jarhead 2*, Annie, as shown in image 4, is the USA marine who assists in the supply mission. She is
portrayed as a very strong soldier who fights hard to save Aanush from the clutches of Talibans. Though she has a daughter who is waiting for her return she is fighting fearlessly to terminate the bad guys. These images reflect the Western women diametrically opposite to the Muslim women. The portrayal of these objects draws a fine line between the West and the Muslim world in general. Even the settings they are shown in clearly explain the Muslim women.

Image 4: Annie with her colleagues rescuing Aanush in *Jarhead 2*

**Settings**

As it is evident in image 5, the Muslim women are mostly confined to a messed up setting of a home or a market. In the films on war on terror, women are shown doing green grocery from a donkey cart, waiting for their turn in the health center, or cooking food for the family. Aisha in *Body of Lies* is found in a number of contexts i.e., clinic, home, neighborhood and a market which showcase poor living conditions. Aanush in *Jarhead 2* is represented through devastated and disorganized settings while she speaks for the rights of women. In *Zero Dark Thirty* women are shown either at home or at market settings. The compound of Osma Bi Laden’s house is a perfect example of how women are limited to the four walls of the house. Such images mirror the oppressive discourses which enforce the ideologies of dominance, inequality, control and hegemony.

Image 5: Muslim women at the market setting in *Zero Dark Thirty*

In contrast to the settings in which the Muslim women are portrayed, the Western women appear in peaceful, clam and serene settings in these films. Image 6 from *American Sniper* verifies this finding. Moreover, this image picturizes a spectacular setting of the USA. On the contrary, we do not witness such a setting in the Muslim countries in case.
They are mainly depicted with war torn settings. The background melody and chirping of birds illustrate how happy the Western women are. All the films show the Western settings as clean, organized and mesmeric. Even the setting of the Western graveyard is better than the Muslim countries in subject. Such images reflect that the Western women are far better and prosperous than their Muslim counterparts who are spending abysmal life in the war torn society.

The forgoing discussion implies that Hollywood is trying to liberate the Muslim women by stimulating the feeling that their counterparts are more liberal, independent, civilized and disciplined. For example, Kyle’s wife in American Sniper, Maya in Zero Dark Thirty, Aanush in Jar Head 2 are shown role models for them. They are not just sex partners who can be denied freedom of speech and choice. They are shown as standing shoulder to shoulder with men while doing home chores, looking after children, and going for shopping along with fulfilling the responsibilities of professional life. Such images inject a powerful feeling in the Muslim women to raise their voice for sexual liberation. The emancipation of Muslim women through the Western ideology though a popular move is readily accepted by American viewers and tends to stimulate reaction and xenophobia in them.

The viewers who have never been to Afghanistan, Iraq, Jordan, Pakistan, Oman, and Syria find such films as one of the best sources of information. The common observation of an average young American is that the Muslim women are extremely suppressed. They always clamor for their rights. They get the right to education when Malala Yousafzai (Nobel Prize Laureate, 2014) or Sharmeen Obaid-Chinoy (Oscar award winning for best short subject documentary 2012 and 2016) struggled for them. It seems very difficult for common viewers to understand Islam and Muslims when their source of information is only confined to films. Alwan (2012:15) argues that this is especially problematic because films are situated as a reference point for audience who realistically have limited exposure to Islam. Russell (1988:114) explains when an actor says something that usually confers falsity as a truth, nobody says he/she is lying. McKee (1997:375) in the same vein says that audiences relate to characters as they are real. Thus, the films on terror as the only source of information about the status of women in a Muslim society can be very misleading.
The representation of Muslim women in the Hollywood films is unidirectional and simplistic which cannot be generalized over the entire population at least in the case of films on war on terror. Haeri (2010:278) argues that women in the Muslim societies are depicted is such a way that their life styles seem remote and far flung from the western women. Similarly, Ahmed (2010:1) states that there is asymmetrical presentation of the Muslim women in the international feminist literature as living inactive, oppressed life under the strict control of religion and misogynistic environment. Saigol (2011) explores the traditional concept of power relation between men and women which has undergone radical transformation. The representation of lop-sided women characters in the Muslim society is quite a popular narrative exploited by film directors and readily accepted by the audience. The blatant gender discrimination is not as widespread in the Muslim society as it is portrayed in the Western media. There is no denying the fact what is presented on the screen is based on real events but they are in sharp contrast with different cultures within the same society (Tyson, 2006, 2009, 2015).

Critiques (such as; Alwan, 2012; Wilkins, 2009; Semmerling, 2006; Shaheen, 2001, Said, 1978, and many referred therein) point out that Hollywood shows restraint to present a comprehensive picture of Islam. This study suggests that the emancipation of Muslim women through the western narrative remains limited unless it is backed up by true Islamic ideology that gives women rights similar to men in a just manner. This view is supported by Alwan (2012) who declares that this is an essential first step for filmmakers towards an accurate perspective of Islam that eventually reconnects viewers to a reality beyond politics, hype and fear. Shaheen (2000) also criticizes that most image makers do not have the religious, cultural or language background to understand Islam. There is a reason to believe that they may not be able to go beyond much established caricatures of Muslim women, which can perpetuate a widespread hatred and reaction among viewers. A growing strain of intolerance especially among young Muslims who are occasionally reported exercising extreme practices is in reaction to how they are portrayed/treated (e.g., The Guardian, 2014). Benali (2015:6) argues that “the lure of extremism can be very powerful when you grow up in a world where media seems to mock and insult your culture”.

Conclusions

The study helps to learn something important about the oppressive discourses in the Muslim Society. The Muslim women are seen as slaves, victims, helpless, ignorant and duped caricatures in the public and private spheres. Themes such as abrogation of women rights, suppression, lack of democracy, education and corruption in Afghanistan, Iraq, Jordan, Pakistan, Oman, and Syria are being recycled in the films on war on terror demand attention. There is every reason to believe that the images which are readily acceptable are usually repeated by the filmmakers. The strategy, though popular and
successful, obscures the capacity of viewers to formulate a genuine perspective about educated and professional Muslim women who live mostly in the urbanized settings and are capable of resisting and rejecting oppressive ideologies suggest no ideological mechanisms instrumental for achieving social cohesion. No doubt, the representation of ‘new woman’ like Teya in *American Sniper*, Aanush in *Jarhead 2* and Maya in *Zero Dark Thirty* along with those who are oppressed is a powerful strategy to resist dominant discourses. The strategy that apparently converges the Western centrism will achieve limited results unless it is supported by true Islamic ideology that simply equates the men and women in a just manner and allows mixed sex interaction without the self fabricated limitation of *Parda*. The strategy is squarely helpful in staunching extremist practices rooted in the patriarchal mind sets originally located mostly if not altogether in the rural Muslim communities and exposing oppressive discourses. The study suggests appropriating epistemological paradigms to reveal subversive gendered discourses in the Muslim society.

**References**


__________

Dr. Muhammad Shaban Rafi is Chairman in the Department of English Language & Literature, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan.
Construction Of Subversive Gender Identities: A Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis Of A Television Play, *Chal Jhooti*

*Nagina Kanwal*  
Department of English  
University of the Punjab Jhelum Campus

*Qamar Khushi*  
Department of English  
Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi

**Abstract**

This article examines the women’s construction of gender identities as a form of resistance in the presence of dominant discourses. Firstly, it aims to analyze the construction of gender identities which are not approved by the societal norms and yet helps women gain a position of power needed to survive in a male dominated society. Secondly, it seeks to describe and interpret the socio-cultural discursive practices responsible for inequities and the strategies adopted by the women for resistance and change. The data for the present study consists of a single episode television play “Chal Jhooti”. Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis (FPDA) and theory of performativity are employed to deconstruct the cross identities and to reveal the discourses underlying the mechanism of power in sustaining repressive social structures and hegemonic social relations. The findings reveal that women are multiply located in discourse as they adopt particular ways to resist certain dominant social practices. It also reveals that women’s construction and performance of masculine gender identity is not merely construed as their power but at the same time it is a reinforcement of men’s power as generally these gender crossings aggravate the essential dualism of the gender structure. The current study suggests that the presence of existing discourse of gender differentiation results in deviations from gender appropriate norms which are policed and intended as a mean to defy it.

**Keywords:** Subversive Gender Identities, Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis.

تَلْخِيْص

يَنيِّ مَناَهِيْ نَالَابْ كَارُوْن كَيْ مُوُبْوجُيَ مُنِّ فُوْنَأْتَن كَيْ مَرَأَطْيِ سُفْلَةَ طَنَأْتَ كَلّ كَأَمآكُ قُرْتَتْ تَيْه. إِن كُوْيِيْ الْجَبَارَي سُفْلَةَ اِسْتُوْرُيَ كَيْ مُجُوبُ كَرُوْنَيْ سُفْلَةً طَنَأْتَ كَلّ كَأَمآكُ قُرْتَتْ تَيْه. مُسْتُوْرُيَ كَيْ مُوُبْوجُيَ مُنِّ فُوْنَأْتَن كَيْ مَرَأَطْيِ سُفْلَةَ طَنَأْتَ كَلّ كَأَمآكُ قُرْتَتْ تَيْه
Introduction

Television plays are significant for studying discourse because media plays an influential role in shaping ideologies and reflecting the constituted identities. There are diverse ideological repertoires incorporated in individuals’ subject positions and identities, represented through the discourses which they come to draw upon in the course of their social lives. FPDA helps in exploring ways in which individuals successively negotiate their positions within competing discourses. It also enables the researchers to study individual moments of resistance and empowerment in the verbal and nonverbal interactions of people who might otherwise be seen and represented as victims (Baxter, 2006). It thus provides a possibility to study those instances and moments where there is a change in the form of defiance, contestations, and power reversals, possibly subtle or a direct shift in the status quo.

Gender depiction on media influences individuals’ views of gender in their own lives and among other media forms television plays are much influential in presenting the notions with the potential to make them sustained and standardized (Soza, 2014:20). Television plays are significant for studying construction and representation of identities through its
discourse because media plays a leading role in shaping ideologies and reflecting the constituted identities. Carter & Steiner (2003) explored gender construction in varied media forms and argued that in media discourse the discursive approaches to entertainment tell about the intricate ways media contributes to gendered subjectivities. Matheson (2005) in Media Discourses addressed the need to challenge and deconstruct the discursive representation of the social world in media, as discourses represent, interpret and construct reality which “structure both our sense of reality and our notion of our own identity” (Mills 1997:15). Soza (2014) pointed out the significance of studying media discourse for poststructuralist feminist scholars as it opens up a room for studying the influence of media in enabling and constraining the identities of women. Keeping the importance of media in present times and its role in depicting gender identities, the present study is an attempt to explore the intricacies of discourse, gender, and media to reveal the constitution of gendered subjectivities in Pakistani society and the resistance against the constituted discursive practices.

There are notable researches conducted in Pakistan on the subject of gender and feminism, a good number has targeted electronic advertisements and print media too. But there are only a few which have used the Feminist Post-Structuralist theory for their investigation. Juma (2017) conducted an action research in Karachi to engage teachers with Feminist Poststructuralist theory to open up the possibility of gender equity practice in Pakistani classrooms. Walters (2016) investigated the newspaper articles by using discourse analysis, a feminist poststructuralist, and postcolonial approach to identify the leading discourses about Yousfzai in the context of the United Kingdom. In the context of Pakistan gender is also investigated by using the theory of performativity, Rehman & Karim (2016) explored the gender binaries in Bapsi Sidhwa’s novels by adopting the perspective of Butler’s performativity theory. Khurshid (2012) studied Pakistani Muslim Women teachers through Butler’s Performativity framework in order to analyze the construction and performance of their educated subjectivities in a transnational women’s education project.

Hence no significant research on television plays was found which might have explored the resistant gender identities by using FPDA or theory of performativity. The present paper is an attempt to fill this gap and investigate the construction and performance of gender identities in a television play by employing Performativity and FPDA together.

The present study is conducted in Pakistani socio-cultural context where the discursive social practices define women’s position as the subordinate gender, since women are the gender allocated to physically weaker traits that depict them and classify their status. In this study Feminist Poststructuralist perspective is adopted to critically examine the
repressed meanings of gender within the text of a television play *Chal Jhooti* and the discourse of cross gender exhibition to dig for manifold meanings of femininity in the discourses of gender and media.

The study has twofold purposes, firstly, to examine the construction of gender identities which are not approved by the societal norms and yet helps women gain a position of power needed to survive in a male dominated society. Secondly, it seeks to describe and interpret the socio-cultural discursive practices responsible for inequities and the strategies adopted by the women for resistance and change.

The focus is on how language and discourses used in media co-construct the implications of gender and subjectivities and produce resistant discourses countering the dominant ones. Specifically, this study views discourses as mutually constitutive, herein the performative perspective helps to recognize how gender is enacted strategically to resist the normative constructions of gender by getting aligned with them and finally a poststructuralist view aim for the deconstruction of gendered subjectivities. Thus, the combination of a number of theoretical bases makes a significant contribution to the study of gender and discourse within the field of discourse analysis.

**Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis (FPDA) and Theory of Performativity**

There are diverse ideological repertoires incorporated in individuals’ subject positions and identities, represented through the discourses which they come to draw upon in the course of their social lives. Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis helps in exploring ways in which individuals successively negotiate their positions within competing discourses. It also enables the researchers to study individual moments of resistance and empowerment in the verbal and nonverbal interactions of people who might otherwise be seen and represented as victims (Baxter, 2006). It thus provides a possibility to study those instances and moments where there is a change in the form of defiance, contestations, and power reversals, possibly subtle or a direct shift in the status quo.

FPDA is influenced by the ideas of the poststructuralists, Derrida (1987) and Foucault (1980), in relation to power, knowledge and discourses, the formalist, Bakhtin (1981), and the feminist work of Walkerdine (1998), and Weedon (1997). It shares similarities with CDA despite having quite different theoretical and epistemological orientations. After the publication of Baxter’s “Positioning Gender” in 2003, scholars have modified and extended FPDA methodology in different ways according to their own objectives. Kaur (2005) combined Performativity theory with FPDA while studying the
performances of gendered identities in online discussion boards as FPDA helps making a thorough textual investigation of the discourses competing with each other in the enactment of gender. Castaneda Pena (2008) adopted FPDA as a fundamental approach for analyzing the speech of pre-school children in Colombia, for micro analysis he drew upon CA while also applying a CDA critique. He found that FPDA offers micro-analytical tool to find ways in which a range of gendered discourses function intertextually and how the pre-school children, both male and female continually fluctuate their different subject positions in line with the different discourses. FPDA challenges the dominant approaches which “ground truth and meaning in the presumption of a universal subject and a predetermined goal of emancipation” (Elliott, 1996 cited in Baxter, 2003). In Davies (1993, 1994, 1995, 1997b) we find the application of Feminist poststructuralist theory as applied to educational domain those of teachers and students, Davies (2006) more recent application of this theory is on fiction. His concern is to liberate students from the constraints of prevalent discourses on gender (Davies, 1992). In Barrett, M. J. (2005) the major concern of Poststructuralist theorizing is that how discourse produce subjects. Fardon and Schoeman (2010) examined gender bias in history text books through feminist poststructuralist lens.

Our perception of biological sex is discursively produced but to a poststructuralist like Butler, there exists no pre-discursive identity. Such an outlook emphasizes on speech event itself which requires us to analyze the way ideologies of feminine and masculine speech are manipulated by the people in the constant production of gendered selves (Hall, 2000). Gender differences are established by and in discourse. Butler asserts that by uttering “I pronounce you, etc.” by the one not certified to do so is a subversive political strategy, as it is the performance of an unstable heterosexual norm which is all the times susceptible to appropriation (Salih, 2006:65).

Gender is an “act,” an outcome of a subtle and politically enforced performativity that is open to self-parody, and the exaggerated displays of “the natural” that, in their very amplification, expose their essentially phantasmatic status (Butler, 1999:187). Butler argues that construction is not opposite to agency; agency gets articulated through construction and becomes culturally intelligible. Tonissen (2014) in his work Challenging Gender Identities applied Butler’s notion of performativity and Gramsci’s theory about cultural hegemony in order to explore the portrayal of certain characters in the selected films that deviate from the appropriate gender norms. Kale (2011) examined feminist identity politics while taking Judith Butler’s perspective in questioning identity and its relation to gender politics. To achieve this purpose he
used qualitative research method and conducted semi-structured in-depth interviews for data collection.

Television plays are much influential in presenting the notions with the potential to make them sustained and standardized (Soza, 2014:20). Gender depiction on entertainment media influences individuals’ views of gender in their own lives. Carter & Steiner (2003) explored gender construction in varied media forms and argued that in media discourse the discursive approaches to entertainment tell about the intricate ways media contributes to gendered subjectivities. Matheson (2005) in Media Discourses addresses the need to challenge and deconstruct the discursive representation of the social world in media. As discourses represent, interpret, and construct reality which “structure both our sense of reality and our notion of our own identity” (Mills 1997:15).

Soza (2014) points out the significance of studying media discourse for poststructuralist feminist scholars as it opens up a room for studying the influence of media in enabling and constraining the identities of women. Specifically, the study of an entertaining television play Chal Jhooti, explores the intricacies of discourse, gender, and media to reveal the constitution of gendered subjectivities in society and the resistance against the constituted discursive practices. In Denby (2011) the general purpose of his thesis is an investigation of feminist postmodernism, the Combination of feminism with postmodern concepts as a means of challenging gender oppression.

There are notable researches conducted in Pakistan on the subject of gender and feminism, a good number has targeted electronic advertisements and print media too. But there are only a few which have used the Feminist Poststructuralist theory for their investigation. Juma (2017) conducted an action research in Karachi to engage teachers with Feminist Poststructuralist theory to open up the possibility of gender equity practice in Pakistani classrooms. Walters (2016) investigates the newspaper articles by using discourse analysis, a feminist poststructuralist, and postcolonial approach to identify the leading discourses about Yousfzai in the context of the United Kingdom. In the context of Pakistan gender is also investigated by using the theory of performativity. Rehman, S. & Karim, A. (2016) explored the gender binaries in Bapsi Sidhwa’s novels by adopting the perspective of Butler’s performativity theory. Khurshid, (2012) studied Pakistani Muslim Women teachers through Butler’s Performativity framework in order to analyze the construction and performance of their educated subjectivities in a transnational women’s education project. The present paper is an attempt to fill this gap and investigate the construction and performance of gender identities by employing Performativity and FPDA together.
Methodology

Research Design

The study combines Performativity Theory and Feminist Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis in order to analyze how gender is constructed and performed in the play and what are the different ways in which the characters actively construct, co-construct and de-construct gender identities.

Butler’s theory of Performativity (1990) provides the theoretical stance in framing this study. FPDA is used as an interpretative framework drawing upon Performativity theory which helps investigate the contestation of the discourses in the enactment of gender, while CA is used as a method of data analysis tool to investigate and interpret how gender identity is enacted and demonstrated, linguistically and para-linguistically as a form of resistance. The notion of contradiction between micro and macro analysis is denied by FPDA, as is demonstrated through the application of FPDA with CA the transcripts are analyzed micro analytically within the given context in which they occur and then using these as a reference point.

Due to the scope of the study and time constraints only one television play is taken through purposive sampling. The single episode play Chal Jhooti was aired on Hum TV in 2014; it has the duration of one hour and is downloaded from www.ytpak.com. The complete episode is transcribed and analyzed; the transcriptions of the scenes are given in appendices. The verbal and nonverbal aspects i.e. dressing, artefacts, posture, gesture and facial expressions are analyzed sequentially using CA, and the principles provided by FPDA which are denotative, connotative analysis and deconstruction.

Categories of Analysis

The categories of analysis are chosen keeping in view the theme of the play which focuses on the socio-cultural practices of society and the female contestation through deviant subject positions. After watching/examining the play, the discourse of gender differentiation, discourse of social class, cross gender discourse and discourse of resistance as the competing discourses to counter in the play were identified. The data is categorised under the following headings:

- Resistance to Stereotypical Subject Positions
- Male dominant Socio-Cultural Practices
- Deconstructing deviant identities

The data is presented keeping in the order of scenes by categorizing them in the diachronic way so the story would make sense even if one has not seen the play.
Data Analysis and Findings

The data for this study is taken from a play *Chal Jhooti* which is the story of a lower/middle class family consisting of three sisters i.e., Kuku, Jagu, Kashu (Kokab Ghazal, Zakiya Ghazal and Kishwar Ghazal respectively) their niece (Bushra); and of two men i.e., middle aged man (unnamed) and his teenage son (Tanveer) who live in the rented house of the three sisters. The sisters live on their own without having any male family member in the house. The father and his son Tanveer are of flirtatious nature and both are interested in Bushra. She also flirts with both of them but elopes with the father at the end. In the play, the three sisters have adopted cross identities (practices associated with men), which is reflected in their dressing and behaviour. It is only after analyzing the play that the actual motive behind their cross gender behaviour becomes obvious which is to protect themselves and survive with dignity in the world of men.

Gender differentiation happens to be a powerful discourse which construct characters’ talk in the play and the cross gender discourse as a way to counter it and cause power reversal. It reveals the constant process of negotiation for positions of power among characters or else resisting positions of powerlessness in accordance with the multiplicity of subject positions available to them.

Resistance to Stereotypical Subject Position

Scene 1

The denotative level of analysis of *Chal Jhooti* provides a concrete account of the happenings in the text, such as in the conversations among characters, while revealing different aspects with reference to the verbal and non-verbal interactions of the participants. The connotative level of analysis gives more penetrating, interpretative explanation of spoken discourse.

The utterance made by the man \(^1\) shows hesitation on his part in an absolute contrast to the response coming from the girl (Bushra). Nonverbally too the artefacts (spectacles), facial expression of both establish a disparity between them making the girl look more confident and bold whereas the man as a timid and nervous fellow.

The scene presents a common observable phenomenon in Pakistani society where men usually flirt with girls by making such offers. The girl is not shown in a stereotypical timid role of the one who would either feel shy or harassed rather the one who counters the man in a bold way. The response of the girl refutes the culturally-biased notions concerning women's submissiveness and lack of agency in their encounter with opposite sex. This is interesting to note how the non-conformist gendered discourse come into play
and remain impassive by the physical intimidation and indifference to the pressure and authority associated with male status within the society.

**Scene 2 in a Park**

The second scene of the play again establishes a discourse of gender deviation where the girl (Bushra) instead of employing ‘feminine’ speech styles, opts for more authoritative speech styles related to men; whereas, Tanveer is shown getting confused in the presence of a girl. The length of talk and particularly Bushra’s response in line 4 is noteworthy when she says:

_Thore motey ho lekin ho cute_ (Tanveer gets shy and starts biting nails), _ye sharmany waley larkon mein na muje chakkon wala touch lagta hai, paseena tau saaf ker lo…_. The para linguistic elements are also significant here including the pink shirt worn by Tanveer, his gestures of wiping sweat from his face and biting nails. All this establishes his timidity which is obvious through his body language. Whereas, Bushra’s body language, that is, her acts of chewing gum, looking directly in his eyes demonstrates her carelessness towards the meeting as well as her level of confidence which is again a deviation in a society where dating is considered morally wrong and still those girls who do it are typically conscious and careful of their act.

Discourse of class also places Tanveer in a powerless position here, when Bushra talks about her dress “_mein nahi silwati Ghareeb abad jaisay ilaqon sy mera tailor na Tariq Road per bethta hai, hai bohat mehnga…_” and when Tanveer talks about his inability to get the right (black) shirt due to load shedding which refers to his poor economic condition and thereby lower subject position due to his failure at maintaining masculinity and the attributes associated with it. Thus both the linguistic and para-linguistics establish contrasting subject positions in the discourse where the boy is in a powerless and the girl in a powerful position.

The commanding manner in which she seeks his response and the way she gives response to his query is interesting in terms of the established gender order in society where women hold subordinate position. In line 9 the characteristic discourse associated with such girls (who do dating) becomes obvious but she handles it successfully by answering him using the same discourse type and proving herself knowledgeable towards the kind they are, and then dealing with him accordingly by threatening him. Interestingly when she seems losing her position in front of Tanveer’s use of moral order discourse of society, she challenges him by showing him another side of moral order discourse where she could make him learn the lesson by calling people around to help her. This makes evident how strategically she maintains her position of power in the present discourse.
Scene 7

The scene where the man is shifting to the rented house is interesting in the sense that the cross gender discourse reverses the discursive practice of society as both the elder and 2nd sister are standing in their way and passing comments on the man and his son like the men in Pakistani society do on women. The performance of cross identities contributes to discourse of power reversal. Women being the owners as well as their enactment of male gender make their subject positions strong here. The traditional practice of covering head comes in and their power as a male counters it through an assertion in line 11 in response to 10 when the elder sister utters *tau hum bhi tau baithay hain baabay is ki hisaanat ke lye.* Bushra’s taunt is also an expression of power where she in an authoritative position passes a remark on Nabeel as a reminder of his act on the road. Power reversal is very much evident here where deviation from stereotypical norms gives female a privilege over male.

Scene 8

This scene again establishes a contrast of the discursive practices where it is usually seen men threatening women in Pakistani society. But here we could see quite the opposite where Bushra is in position of power through her bold and courageous manner and importantly this boldness is a result of her being the niece of three aunts performing successfully their cross gendered roles and establishing power through it.

Micro level analysis in FPDA brings out plurality of meanings and makes silenced minorities heard (Baxter, 2003). The character of Tanveer is an example of a silenced minority in society from various perspectives. First one is very obvious that he is dependent on his father both financially and psychologically. He has not gained maturity due to his father’s constant check and lack of liberty that the boys of his age usually demand. The end of the play makes his powerless position even more obvious where he was left with nothing but to perform cross gender (like women) which ironically matches with his existing helpless situation. The last scene also brings to mind the address term his father uses for him “putri” (daughter) which the women at home made fun of. The FPDA theoretician and practitioners i.e., Chris Weedon and Judith Baxter consider the possibility that male as well as female speakers both are marginalized and victimized in such cultural contexts where the traditional upbringing of children with lack of exposure and poverty results in social oppression, as in the case of Tanveer who is both emotionally and financially dependent. Both the genders are subjugated due to the relative powerfulness of competing institutional discourses save for gender differentiation working in those contexts.
Male Dominant Socio-Cultural Practices

Scene 3

This scene introduces two men, Sattar, who is a property dealer, and the middle aged man belongs to lower middle class who cannot afford high rent and demands the property dealer to arrange for such a house where apart from low rent presence of women is desirable. Here the discourse draws upon the society where though women occupy a subordinate position yet their company is sought after by men either rightfully or vice versa just for their pleasure. This exposes the objectification of women who should be around men in order to please them. The word ‘aurat’ seems to have sexual overtone here.

Scene 6

The discourse of resistance which in this case is cross-gender discourse when counters the societal hegemonic discourse, then it becomes difficult for society to accept it as it is considered against norms. As is evident through the man’s puzzled expressions after his encounter with the women and their boldness. Here the man is the representative of society and the three women represent those who while accepting that hegemony exists are successful in finding ways to counter it. They are successful in achieving empowerment by performing like the superior group (men) who has power.

A contrast is built through Sattar’s conversation where the actual role of a woman is brought into play and the power she has in the role of a wife, but this power is again refuted by the man (society) who sees it against a man’s ego to behave submissively towards his wife. The discursive practices in dominant discourses do not let/allow women to have agency. Despite recognizing the need for women they want to place them in an inferior position as it is against men’s status to acknowledge it as is made obvious in this discourse.

The scene continues when Sattar comes back and asks the man about his decision. The conversation brings to surface the hegemony found in society where the powerful can have their way. The women’s cross gender performance give them a little edge at certain times but their unacceptability on societal level is also a reality which makes them vulnerable. Their house is good but has a comparatively low rent as mentioned by Sattar in line 3. This makes obvious that women’s efforts could help them survive but could not get them an equal status in society as the man utters “yehan per rehne waley bilkul ghair
munasib hain”. Here the women are victims of multiple discourses i.e. social class, gender differentiation and social structure which render them compromise even on less money necessary for their subsistence.

**Deconstructing Deviant Identities**

**Scene 4**

A woman doing male genders both linguistically and paralinguistically is introduced in this scene is referred humiliatingly by the man when he utters, “ye kaya cheez hai?” (the man is there to see that woman’s house for rent). The woman’s (Kuku’s) choice of words “Bandriya” for his wife is rude to which the man seems surprised. Yet Kuku’s response point to an important fact that despite wives being considered in a powerless position in society, they have certain powerful positions as well depending upon the situation like final decision for the rental house in this case.

The performance of cross gender contributes to the double-voicedness and reformulation of hybrid gender identity in discourse The woman has agency here, her subject position as the owner of the house and the authority that comes with it and most importantly her unexpected gender deviant character intimidates the men and strengthen her powerful position. Her verbal and nonverbal behavior clearly establishes her dominant position in this discourse.

As the scene continues, the man tells the age of his son and also gives Kuku the assurance about his strong character that she will never get any complains about his son. Kuku’s response to his assurance was as violent to tell him that he (the woman) does not tolerate such things and will not care for his young son or he being a man. In response to her further query of reeking socks, the man tells that Sattar’s wife has a quarrel and is not at home, that’s why he is wearing socks for the last 20 days.

Gendered discourse of society is obvious where teenage is considered crucial for boys usually as they tend to get indulged in immoral activities at this age. Significant is woman’s cross gender discourse and her threatening language where she reverses the position of a man into a helpless being like woman, that if she gets any complain she won’t care for his being a man (conventionally it is said for women that one will not care (tolerate) for her being a woman). Then the discourse of hegemony is evident where firstly the wives are stereotypically seen as some quarrelsome entities who leave their home and husband as a result and secondly their duties as a house wife are naturalized where a man couldn’t even wash his socks if wife is not at home. Such a discourse establishes the role of a wife as a necessity of life whose presence is useful for successful running of affairs of home which simultaneously keeps her at both powerless and powerful position.
Scene 5

The scene starts with the man appreciating the home he has recently rented comparing it with the circumstances where it is getting hard to meet both ends. He in an attempt to be at good terms with the landlady tells her a story of his childhood where he mentions his pink frock and his beauty to which the landlady makes a satirical remark.

In this scene cross gendered discourse is at work as the audience’ (the landlady’s) interest is involved so the use of this discourse strategically helps her gain the position of power. As for the man he attempts to identify with them in order to gain their trust and good will by making use of this discourse “farak pehnati theen gulabi rang ka”. Multiple voices can be heard i.e. beauty associated with white complexion, the influence of west and then the critique of moral order is done implicitly which closes the topic.

The intervention of two other sisters (Juggu and Kashu) in the scene is significant as it further throws light on the discursive practices found in Pakistani society. Their nonverbals clearly establish a difference in norms associated with both genders where men move openly and women coyly while doing “pardah”. The groundings of discourse of resistance are in the hegemonic societal discourse where freedom to move and live in society is relative to gender. There the women intelligently make use of the cross gender discourse as their strategy is to resist and challenge the societal norms by turning tables on them. Agency is a key concept for Butler, as it implies the likeliness for challenging the law against itself to fundamental, political ends (Salih, 2006).

The cross gender discourse gave these women an agency to live fearlessly and boldly in male dominated society; the response of elder sister (Kuku) is significant in this respect when she responds to the utterance itna jawan jahan by saying o hamain kis baat ka khatra hai as there is no need to fear since they have adopted to perform like men so they are out of them. As Nietzsche made the claim, that “there is no ‘being’ behind doing, acting, becoming; ‘the doer’ is merely a fiction imposed on the doing—the doing itself is everything” (cited in Salih, 2006). Gender is a performance that brings into being a “masculine” man or a “feminine” woman. In line 9 the authority of the woman is a result of the power that comes with her being a landlady and he being the tenant and more importantly she being a male through her performance and cross gender discourse.

Scene 9

This scene reveals the sisters’ private life and their personal views towards their cross gender portrayal; it also illustrates the difference in power positions between subjects of equal rank. The youngest sister Kashu seems to be in a position of power in this discourse
as she is the one who is an earning source in contrast to the 2nd sister Jugu who because of getting over age could not earn through taking part in cricket team. This also exposes the bitter circumstances where the opportunities of employment are less accessible particularly to those who do not conform to societal norms and digress which bring its own consequences. Lines 5 and 8 point to the harsh reality of these women’s existence, as they are forced to make a choice of shifting their gender identity in an attempt to gain power and strive for an independent life. Yet despite being successful in their resistance, they often ponder about their confused identity. This also shows that their choice of cross gender performance was not by choice rather they were bound to do it as a challenge to male norms which proved a success as pointed in line 6 and 9. This scene very explicitly tells the reality behind the subversive construction of their gender identities which are adopted as a shield to guard them from society and the dominant social structure which consequentially place them in a relatively powerful and powerless position simultaneously at the same moment in time.

Hence, the analysis reveals the process of the shift of power across the range of speech events or even within a single speech event making the characters experience the moments of relative powerfulness or powerlessness. The deconstruction of discourses in the play reveals both the positioning of the women as relatively powerless individuals surrounded by a variety of prevailing societal discourses, but also comparatively powerful within alternative and competing social discourses. These women discursively work to contest being victimized by gender differentiation discourse, while creating for them a cross gender identity in a form of resistance. In their struggle to survive and be independent they resort to a wider range of existing economic and gendered discourses.

Discussion

Discourse and Presentation of Cross Gender Performance

When discourses produce subjectivities, their center of power mostly remains invisible and unchallenged; using FPDA and the principle of deconstruction help bring the imperceptibility of the constituted and constitutive on the surface. Deconstruction exposes not only the subjectivities produced by discourse but also the center of power that sustains them and remains invisible itself. It sets up procedures that help in demystifying the realities we create. As in the play there is constant interplay of power among the characters at a synchronic level which is deconstructed to see the processes of those dominating and being dominated or in this case to see how the women in the play resist and challenge the discursive construction of gendered subject positions.
A perverse sense of equality appears to be at work, where discursive practices place women in a subordinated position, and present them in media as sexually objectified group. The women by performing cross gender turn the tables on men, in this discourse of reversal, noticeable is the reverse use of idioms and phrases otherwise associated with women like in scene 4 the elder sister (Kuku) interestingly says *mein phir parwa nahi karun ga tumhare jawan betay ki ya tumhary mard honey ki*, and then in scene 5 *kahin aur muhn kala karo*. In similar lines Bushra threatens Tanveer in scene 7 *teray gol gol muhn pe tezab phaink dun gi*.

To uphold a dominant discourse, other meaningful discourses which provide understanding are marginalized and treated as unnatural or trivial as in the case of this play. The title *Chal Jhooti* itself is significant which at the outset point to the worthlessness of the being which is not considered serious rather taken as a trifle. This small phrase *Chal Jhooti* marks the bigger dilemma of constituting practices causing representations worthless or worthwhile. For that matter, one of the gripping elements of the play is its apparent humor through which is presented a grave reality of the society where the existence of women without male counterpart is not acceptable and so not compromised. In such circumstances women are left with no choice but to resist or surrender to those in power vis a vis male hegemonic social structure. The light hearted manner of presenting an issue of a serious concern itself establishes irony which is at work throughout the play at both linguistic and non-linguistic levels. The funny manner of depiction brings triviality to women’ power and a mocking sense could be sensed lurking beneath it. The reality shown at a synchronic level in the play is an outcome of the societal norms establishing themselves throughout the history at a diachronic level.

The analysis of cross gender performance in the play brings understanding of the intricate and distinctive ways in which our society designates gender norms. The gendered discourses in the play make a point that gender is shaped by and negotiated in discourse and does not exist pre-discursively, but and individuals potentially have the agency to change their discursive positions along with circumstances and requirements.

Feminist post-structuralism agrees with the social constructionist view that identities are enacted repeatedly. Thus gender has continually to be reaffirmed and openly displayed by constantly performing particular acts conforming to the cultural norms which define masculinity and femininity. In this regard those deviating from such norms must be understood and investigated to explore the intricacies of their discourses and performances. Deconstruction draws multiple interpretations from a text which is in line with poststructuralist’s view on disjointed identities and multiple meanings of texts. This is interesting to note the subtle manner in which media reveals the discursive constructions of gendered identities and the co-construction of those gendered subjectivities as a mean to counter them and retaliate. Along with other motives, the
study makes out the discursive practices in the society as barriers and these are the discriminatory practices that women with no male counterpart have to cope with and handle in their effort to survive in the society which has been a male dominated domain.

**Implications and Conclusions**

The discourse of gender differentiation is manifested acutely through the cross gender performance of women in the play. Women are presented as empowered in contrast to the men who are disempowered here and structurally, the players have been switched but the gender order is still hierarchical. The discourse of resistance competing with the dominant discourses asserts its power in specific circumstances for that time period but the general pattern remains the same. The societal order of discourse remains hegemonic by keeping the women in subordinate position as the symbolic depiction of Tanveer performing cross gender at the end of the play. He in performing the role of a girl is also performing the timidity and submissiveness associated with women.

The study of transgression and creativity is needed to be held precisely while keeping in the restraints and possibilities given by particular social constructions and practices. Or else, a celebration of agency loses its effectiveness, this must be considered that in some situations challenging the gendered expectations and going against them could end in reinforcement, rather than the abolition of the dominant gender order. Such as, women ‘doing’ power in any setting or men being timid can strengthen the dualism between genders. The masculinization of talk by women and the feminization of forms of masculinity may be perceived as redefining conventional standard fixed for women and men in some societies. However, generally these gender crossings not only facilitate but aggravate the essential dualism of the gender structure, as they are seen against the societal assumptions and behavioral norm of the ‘other’.

**End Notes**

1 The man is a reference to the central character of the story who remains unnamed throughout the play as representing “everyman” of the society.

**References**


Appendices

The main character of the play is unnamed and I referred to him as “the man” throughout the transcribed dialogues and in the analysis.

Resistance to Stereotypical Subject Positions

Scene 1 on the Road

(There are two characters i.e., a middle aged man and a young woman (Bushra) standing on a road)
The Man (wearing spectacles): ager bura na manyen tau juice chal ker peetay hain.
Bushra: (while chewing gum, a frowning gaze): sharam ker ly uncle.
Nabeel: naiki ka tau zamana hi nahi hai.

Scene 2 in a Park

(A boy (Tanveer) wearing a pink shirt is shown waiting and then getting enthusiastic while looking at the girl (Bushra), she looks composed while chewing gum)
1. Tanveer: Bushra?... mein Tanveer (she makes a sign of disapproval while looking at him),... tum itna nervous kyun ho rahi ho?
2. Bushra: wo pehli date hai na isi liye,... mein tumhein kaisi lagi?
3. Tanveer: Payari ho aur mein?
4. Bushra: Thore motey ho lekin ho cute (tanveer getting shy and starts biting nails), ye sharmaney waley larkon mein na muje chakkon wala touch lagta hai,... paseena tau saaf ker lo,(Tanveer wiping his face) ... pata hai meray saath yehi hota hai shuru shuru mein mein khud nervous hoti hun phir doorsron ko nervous kerna shur ker deti hun,... ( Bushra looking careless and happy) meray kapray kaisay hain, fitting achi hai na, mein nahi silwati Ghareeb abad, Ghareeb abad jaisay ilaqon sym era tailor na Tariq Road per betha hai, hai bohat mehnga lekin lush designs doondh ker lata hai my God, ... waisay bura na manina lekin muje pink type ky colour pehnany waley larkey badhey ghigay lagtey hain.
5. Tanveer (getting confused) : yeh tau bas mein ne wo jaldbazi mein hi pehan lye thy, mein ne tau black shirt nikali thi, lekin wo light chali gayi tau bas yehi... (Bushra making a bad face at it, Tanveer wiping sweat from his forehead)

Scene 2 Continued
7. Tanveer: Bas mein aur abu hain, ammi ka tau intaqal ho gaya hai, dada dadi Gujranwala hotey hain aur tumhare ghar mein kaun kaun hai?

9. Tanveer: hay ziada satti savatri mat bano meray samney, jis larkay nay tumhara number diya tha na us ne kaha tha badhi tight bachi hai.

10. Bushra: Acha bachu tera kazim wala group hai, wo tau hain hi sary ek number ke kameenay aur kangley, ullu ke pathay aaj ke baad muje phone kya na tau bas dekh lena (while taking his shirt into grip)

11. Tanveer: karun ga kisi ke baap ka der hai

12. Bushra: (taking off her shoes) maar maar ke na ganja ker dun gi, abhi chillaun gin aur bheer(crowd) ikathi ho jaye gi, chal ja… (he went off while screaming)

Scene 7

(The middle aged man and his son (Tanveer) shifting in, holding chairs in their hands)

1. 2nd sister: ooho tum logo ne tau nakhreeli begmat ko bhi maat ker diya hai
2. Man: oho putri dekh ke mera bacha chal chal
3. 2nd: tu ne tau motey lagta hai kha kha ke sирf pait ke musle bnaye hain
4. Man: (trying to ignore them) jaldi ker
5. 2nd: bahi hmara qasoor nahi hai, tumhari apni grip dheeli hai

(meanwhile they both encounter Bushra (their niece) on stairs)

6. Bushra: yeh dono kaun hain badhi phupho
7. Elder: in ko ooper ka ghar karaye per diya hai
8. 2nd: oye sar pe dupatta rakh
9. Elder: oye tu kab se mauvli faqeer hussain ho gaya
10. 2nd: abay larka jawan hai
11. Elder: tau hum bhi tau baithay hain baabay is ki hifaazat ke lye

(Bushra teases the man on their way to upstairs by referring to their previous encounter “juice piyye ga mangwa dun”)

Scene 8

(Bushra standing in the way, the man remembers her words “sharam ker ly uncle” while passing by, so avoiding any talk)

Bushra: (Threatning Tanveer) sun agar tu ne kisi kau bachu meray aur apni date ke baaray mein btaya teray gol gol muhn pe tezab phaink dun gi, janta nahi kis ki sm ki larki hun main.
Male Dominant Socio-Cultural Practices

Scene 3

2. The man: mitti aur kahtta theek ahi, saary hi mard hain koi aurat hi nahi.
3. Sattar: tau aap ne malik makan ki aurton ka kya kerna hai?

Scene 6

(The man looks so harassed and distressed while coming out of the building)
(Sattar is shown talking on phone with his wife)
1. Sattar: dekho Robina Allah pak ki qasam iman se bta raha hun jot um kaho gi wohi ho ga iman se bta raha hun
2. The man: oye sharam ker muaaf ker de, tu ne tau mardon ka naam dabo diya hai, oye aurtain bhi minnatein nahi kerti is terah, tera y ander na purani Nayyara Sultana ki rooh ghussi hui hai.

Scene 6 Continued

1. Sattar(to Nabeel): haan bahi kesa hai (ghar)?
2. The man: ye kesy Bengalion ki terah puch reha hai kesa hai, ye pooth keh teen ghabru mard jo andar mulakhra ludh rahe thy wo kesay hain, Allah Paak ki qasam un mein se dau key muhn itney (too much) badhay thy.
3. Sattar: Boss itny paison mein is elaqay mein is se ziada munasib ghar nahi mil sakta.
4. The man: magar yehan per rehne waley bilkul ghair munasib hain, agar ye teenon aurtain hain tau mein inhain aurtain manane se inkar kerta hun, mera inkar hai.

Deconstructing Deviant Identities

Scene 4

Giving bell at the door
A woman dressed like a man is coming and saying aa raha hun, aa raha hun
1. The man: ye kaya cheez hai?
2. Sattar: ooper waley portion ke lye karaye dar laya tha.
3. Woman (owner): o yar ye tum roz roz itny sab logon ko kyun le ker aa jaaty ho, (then asking from nabeel) oh tmhari bandrya kidhar hai.
4. The man: konsi baandri ji?
5. Woman (owner): o tumhari bivi, bahi fasiala tau usi ne kerna hai na, sab kuch dekha hai saath dekho ye roz roz ka chakar nahi paalty hum.

Scene 4 Continued

9. Woman (owner): hmmm betay ki umar kya hai?
10. The man: beta hai ji koi 18, 19 saal ka, mashaAllah badha hi shareef hai ji, ajkal waley larkon ki koi baat nahi hai us mein, kisi kism ki koi shakayat nahi ho gi.
11. Woman (owner): oye shakayt hui na tau taang pe taang rakh ke na cheer deyn gay, samagh gye hum koi aasra karnay waly log nahi hain bta dayn, dekho zyada guaranteean na do mein tafteesh karnay pea a gaya na tau tiya paancha ker ke rakh dun ga, mein phir parwa nahi karun ga tumhare jawan betay ki ya tumhary mard honey ki, samajh gaye….. ye kis key mozon mein se boo aa rahi hai
12. The man: ji is ki biwi lar ke maikay gayi hui hai, is ne 20 din se juraabain pehni hui hain.

Scene 5

1. The man: ghar tau badha aala hai ji hawadar bhi hai, karaya bhi munasib hai, aajkal karaye badhay ho gaye hain, banda daal roti karay ya karaye de, waisay kurta badha aala pehna hua hai aap ne, pichli Eid pe mein ne bilkul aisa kurta pehna tha…… bachpan mein meri maan jab bhi muje farak pehnati theen gulabi rang ka foran nazar lag jati thi muje, badha kamal rang tha bachpan mein mera, gaun mein sary kehtay thy Ashfaq Angrez lagta hai Angrez.
2. Woman owner: o angrez aaty jaaty hon gay gaaun main.
(There enters two women dressed like men)
3. 3rd sister: abay o sun agar yahan shift hona hai na biwi ke sath usay bolna hum se parda karey yahan teen mard rehtay hain, us ke bachgana sawalon se bhi duur rahen gay hum log
5. The man: 18,19 saal ka
6. 3rd sister: itna jawan jahan
7. Woman owner (taking her face into grip): o hamain kis baat ka khatra hai, hayn
8. 3rd sister: ye tau hai
9. Woman owner: sari sharayat bta di hain qabool ho tau aa jana nahin tau kahin aur muhn kala karo. (making gestures for him to leave the room, enacting and behaving like street boys)
10. The man: khuda hafiz gi
11. Woman owner: Allah hi hafiz (making a rude gesture to him to leave at once, then the 1st and 2nd started fighting with each other)
Scene 9

(2nd sister preparing tea in the kitchen, then shares it with the 3rd sister)
1. 3rd: kasam se jugoo ab ki baar mein gya na Lahore cricket match khelne ke lye teray liye bohat sari cheezain le ker aaun ga, teri pasandeeda naan khatayaan, aur lakshami chowk se masoor ki daal ka halwa, sardiyon mein kya maza deta hai.
2. 2nd: wo apni auraton wali cricket team mein mujhe bhi shamil ker le na, kasam se muj se bhi moti moti aur umer raseeda aurtein hoti hain cricket team mein
3. 3rd: teri umer nikal gayi hai
4. 2nd: pohka
5. 3rd: acha ghussa na ker, chor na ghussa, yar aik baat btaun badha hi ajeeb sa laga mujee aj, certificate nikal ker dekh raha tha, pta hai us pe kya likha tha, Kishwar Ghazal, aisa laga jaisay koi mein khusra hun, ek lamhey ke lye bhi mehsoos nahi hua mein eik aurat hun
6. 2nd: abbay jo auratein aurat pan bhool jati hain na un se badha draikola koi nahi hota mardon ko drane ke lye
7. 3rd: aur tu kaun hai Zakiya Ghazal, aur wo kuku Kokab Ghazal
8. 2nd: ye tarkeeb tau kuku ki thi logon ko drane ke lye mardon ko dhamkane ke lye us ne apna ye swang derha aur phir jis jis ko bhi zarurat padhti gayi us us ne ye swang derha. Abay hum jaisi maamooli aurton se na mardon ko chatpata sa swad aata hai, phir aqal shakal nahi dekhi jati
9. 3rd: abbay hum se kaanptey hain mard, hum log mardon se zyada haseen hain aur un se zyada taqatwar
10. 2nd: kameena hai (laughing)

Nagina Kanwal is Lecturer in the Department of English, University of the Punjab Jhelum Campus.

Dr. Qamar Khushi is an Assistant Professor in the Department of English, Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi.
The religious minority constitutes an anomaly within the discourse of national identity in Pakistan. They become an anomaly because their existence as citizens of Pakistan highlights the contradictions within the theory that, the State of Pakistan was created for the Muslims of the Indian subcontinent. Hindus are the largest religious minority in Sindh, but facing discrimination at all levels, i.e., economic, social, political, and legal. They are living as a second-class citizen of the country. While, the women who belong to these minority groups are facing double discrimination, firstly as a woman, and then as a Hindu. It is an exploratory research which was conducted in Narainpur (Karachi), which is one of the oldest residential areas of the city, and represents the largest population of Hindu minority, i.e., 60,000 to 70,000. The entire population of Narainpur comprises of poor and lower middle class, as most of the population works as sweepers, housemaids, laborers in KMC, and sellers. Interview schedule was used to collect data from the respective respondents. Result show that health conditions of the women of this locality needs improvement.

Keywords: Socio-Economic Conditions, Minority, Hindu Women, Case Study.
Introduction

According to Arnold M. Rose, “A group is a minority group if it is the object of prejudice and discrimination from the dominant groups, and if the members think of themselves as minority” (as quoted in Merton & Nisbet, 1961, p. 326).

When Pakistan and India came into being, massive migration took place. People from Pakistan moved to India and vice versa (Stump, 2008). In all this exercise, many chose to stay where they belonged (Svensson, 2013). It includes both, i.e., Muslims in India, and Hindus as well as Christians in Pakistan (Chan, Haines & Lee, 2014). These are the people, who are patriots, as they chose this country at the time when they clearly had the choice to move, but they chose not to. Now, it is our moral responsibility to work for their welfare and respect them as equal citizens (Afzal & Husain, 1974).

Pakistan was once a part of the multicultural and multi-ethnic Subcontinent. But, now as a non-Muslim minority, the Hindus have been rendered invisible (Gopal, 1994). So that the official narrative of the majority religion as a marker of national identity can be mobilized and validated. Pakistan’s official ideology constructs the Muslim subjects of the State as the only valid group of citizens (Chitkara, 1996).

The State is supposed to be an instrument of equality for all citizens. By declaring itself an Islamic Republic, the State of Pakistan has deployed major technologies of social and economic inequality against its non-Muslim subjects (Enid & Oklahoma, 2010). The constitution of 1973 itself has become discriminatory, because it patronizes the faith of the majority as the only valid faith. The people belonging to other religious communities, if religion can be considered as a dominant marker of identity, cannot hold any major and publicly influential administrative posts (Chitkara, 1997).

Pakistan is an Islamic country and the second state in the world after Israel, that came into existence on the justification and basis of religion. According to the last census, which was held in 1998, it is a country of approximately 140 million inhabitants, near to 97% whom are Muslims. The other 3% are minorities comprising of different religions.
There are mainly six minorities in Pakistan, i.e., Buddhist, Christian, Hindu, Ahmadi, Parsi, Sikh, along with the Schedule Castes (Census Report, 1998).

But, according to the CIA World Factbook (July 2016), the population of Pakistan is 201,995,540. While, the religious minorities represent about 3.6 percent of the entire population. At the same time, U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom has named Pakistan as one of the 13 countries where violence against religious minorities is common and condoned or supported by the government.

The Hindu community of Pakistan is around 1.60% of the total population, and their number is 2,111,271. In Karachi, which is a cosmopolitan city of more than 20 million inhabitants, the total population of the Hindu community is 84768 (i.e., 43959 males, 40809 females) which includes the Schedule Castes as per the Census Report, 1998.

In 1941, the population of Karachi was 4,35000 and the Hindus comprised 51% of this population. After partition, many Hindus migrated from interior Sindh and settled in Karachi, and the present population of Hindus mostly consists of migrants. In 1951, the population of Hindu community was just 2%. According to the last census of 1998, the population of Hindu community is 82028 which is less than 1%. It was pointed out in this research that the Hindus played significant role in the historical formation of the province of Sindh in Pakistan (Census Report, 1998).

The Hindu community is so assimilated within the culture of Pakistan that; it is difficult to recognize them as Hindus. In the past, the Muslims and Hindus showed respect for their others religious saints and holy places, but with the passage of time the situation has changed (Sabri, 1994). In the past, the Hindu community was well-off and had good businesses and jobs. Now, they have become poor and a vast majority is even living below the poverty line. Most of the Hindus are engaged in sanitary work in different government sectors and private institutions. The Hindu women in Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi are more vulnerable to the existing socio-economic structure, thus the leading trends of discrimination in the society have hindered the Hindu women to actively participate in the development process.

These religious minorities are the native species of the Sindh province, but facing discrimination at all levels and are living as a second-class citizen of the country. While, the women who belong to these minority groups are facing double discrimination, firstly as a woman, and then as a Hindu.

**Research Objectives**

- To find out the socio-economic discriminations with the Hindu women on the basis of religion.
To find out the reasons behind Hindu women’s poor socio-economic conditions.

Research Hypotheses

- There is relationship between insecurity and migration of Hindu community from Pakistan.
- There is relationship between less education and obtaining low level jobs.
- There is relationship between forced conversion into other religion and Sexual harassment.
- There is no relationship between forced conversion into other religion and Sexual harassment.
- There is relationship between Hindu caste system and early marriages of women.

Research Questions

1. What are the socio-economic conditions of Hindu women in Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi?
2. What are the major problems of the Hindu minority in Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi?
3. What are the general perceptions of the Hindu women in Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi regarding their socio-economic conditions?

Justification of the Study

This research will provide a new vision for emphasis on the ground realities along with the reasons behind Hindu women’s poor socio-economic conditions as well as discrimination on the basis of religion in Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi. This information can help to lay down the foundation for primary as well as secondary preventive strategies for the improvement of these vulnerable groups of women.

Theoretical Background

Power Conflict Theory

The power conflict theory describes the socio-economic state of under-marginalized strata of the population in terms of the economic disadvantages that ultimately lead to social decline. Power conflict may be defined as a struggle for control of scarce values. The scarce values may be economic in which one group seeks domination over another in order to take its wealth or labor at less than its recognized value.
The minority group may thus be enslaved or simply underpaid (Knapp, 1994, pp. 228-246).

Similarly, minorities in Pakistan have to face economic prejudice and they are also underpaid. The theory of power conflict is quite visible throughout the socio-economic and political history of the Indian subcontinent. After the emergence of Islam in the Subcontinent the Hindu majority started to suppress the Muslim minority in terms of economic benefits. Before the creation of Pakistan, the Muslims were a minority in India and the Hindus in majority and they were also the allies of the British rulers of that time.

After the advent of Islam and with the initiation of Islamic rule on the Subcontinent the original language was replaced by the Persian and Arabic at the official level. That was an indirect effort to suppress the social values of the Hindu society. Similarly, when the Hindu majority came to power, they opposed Persian and Urdu as the official languages of the Subcontinent (Ispahani, 2016).

This controversy even caused dreadful communal riots. When the Muslims became a majority, they started to get control over the socio-economic and political life of the minorities. It is a natural reaction that a group which has suffered injustice from the majority gives the same treatment when it assumes power (Malik, 2002).

From this historical and social example, the theory of power conflict can be directly related to the present study. Karl Marx is best known to explain the inter-group antagonism in terms of power conflict over economic values and issues. This theory is related to the present paper because, it also describes how the dominated minority group is kept away from economic equality and participation (Marx & Engels, 1998).

When there is a power conflict, the dominant group practically never seeks to exterminate the minority group; it seeks only its wealth, labor, prestige, and ascendancy. When the minorities are kept economically backward, ultimately, their social and political state decreases. This research paper is based on the sociological perspective that the minorities are suffering everywhere in our country. In Pakistan, direct and indirect efforts have been made to limit the role of minorities in the country. It seems that the majority does not want to give power to the minorities in terms of socio-economic development.
Theory of Colonialism

The theory of colonialism is also relevant to this study. Colonialism is a mechanism of governing over the mental, physical conditions, and resources of some nation or class. The theory of colonialism is divided into two kinds:

1. Internal colonialism.
2. External colonialism.

The theory of internal colonialism can be a relevant theory because, it highlights and emphasizes the exploitation of the socially suppressed strata of the population by the ruling or majority party (Bosworth & Flavin, 2007). As, they want to keep the minorities dependent on them and therefore, subject them to the socio-economic discrimination. In short, the current socio-economic situation or problems of the minorities may be viewed in the context of internal colonialism (Howe, 2002, pp. 18-20).

Literature Review

Violence, Memories, and Peace-Building: A Citizen Report on Minorities in India and Pakistan (2016) the book is written by Saleem Ahmed, Nosheen D'Souza and Leonard D'Souza. The researcher has described the socio-economic, politico-legal, and historical situation of the minorities. This book focuses on the questions regarding the emergence of the problem of minorities in the Subcontinent. The book is divided into two parts. The first part describes how the minorities took part in the freedom movement of Pakistan and later how they were gradually deprived and discriminated socio-economically as well as politically and the second part discusses the services of the minorities' in all spheres of life. This book also contains a brief information about the individuals belonging to different minority groups. Everyday Life of the Hindu Community of Karachi by Mr. Ghulam Mohiuddin (2001) It is the only research that has been carried out regarding the Hindu community in Karachi this research done in urdu and the objective of this research focuses on the socio-economic conditions along with the problems of the Hindu community in Karachi. This is an extensive research which covered almost all aspects of life of the Hindu community in Karachi. The main problems of the Hindu community identified are lack of education, lack of religious education, lack of religious institutional infrastructure and Unemployment. There are few middle-class Hindus in the professional fields, as it is difficult for them to join the Government institutions and especially the Armed Forces. While, the Hindu elite class enjoys good relations with the majority, but there is non-availability of religious education and training centers for the Hindu community. The social and political leadership of the Hindu community is not much influential and sometimes even self-centered. Hindus are considered as aliens who have connections and affiliations with the neighboring (unfriendly) country. It is evident from this research that, there is a strong need for effective leadership on social grounds for the development of the Hindu community. The Hindus must be considered loyal and they
should enjoy all the social and economic benefits. Shrinking Space: Minority Rights in South Asia (1999) this book edited by Sumanta Banerjee. It was published by the South Asia Forum for Human Rights. This book provides overall information about the socio-economic and political situations of the minorities in South Asian countries. This book provides a description about the term ‘minority’ unlike the other social scientists. The scholars argue that the term ‘minority’ is not a numerical concept, but is a related phenomenon of human rights and they extend the meaning and call it a ‘non-dominant’ and ‘disadvantaged’ group whether it is based on the premises of religion, language, or ethnicity. They are also of the view that, it is difficult to define the term ‘minority’ especially in the context of South Asia. As, there are minorities within minorities in the same religious fold, whether it is an officially recognized homogeneous minority religion. This book briefly describes the multi-dimensional problems of the minorities in different South Asian countries. According to this book, Islamic fundamentalism and legal discrimination have been the main cause that the minority groups have not been able to develop themselves. The fundamentalists do not only make the minorities, but also thereafter create a great tension between the different Muslim sects. Unjust legislation has forced the minorities into backwardness as they have not been able to find equal opportunities and space for the progress in socio-economic terms. In Pakistan, which is an ideological state, the minority issue is theoretical as well as socio-legal at the same time. Minorities in Pakistan (1951) edited by Mr. S.K. Gupta provides very useful information about the Hindu minority in Pakistan after independence. According to the Census of 1951 (Govt. of Pakistan), the minorities were 14.1% of the total population of Pakistan. They consisted of Hindus, Christians, Parsi, and Buddhists. The majority of the Hindu population lived in East Pakistan (which is now Bangladesh) and their percentage was 23.2% of the total population of East Pakistan. The writer has focused on East Bengal and hasn’t written anything about the Hindus in West Pakistan (which is now the Islamic Republic of Pakistan).

Research Methodology

The Present study is an exploratory research, because type of study permits the researchers to define her research problem and formulate her research answer more accurately. Due to sensitivity of this topic researchers used mixed method both qualitative and quantitative because the issues related to minorities and it is very sensitive. In present study the universe is selected of Narainpur, Ranchor Lines Karachi which is one of the oldest area of the Karachi city. A sufficient number of women are selected through systematic random sampling method. Structured interview schedule and case study method are used for data collection, 10% of total respondent will be case study and 90% interviews if total respondents are 89 then 05 are case study and 84 are interviews. The case studies indicate the determinants behind the socio-economic deprivation of Hindu women and also combines the factors incorporated with the causes, patterns, and
nature of their weak socio-economic conditions. In the current study researchers discuss, explains and interpret all aspects of the issue.

Testing of Hypothesis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table: 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Migration of Hindu community</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insecure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

H1= There is no relationship between insecurity and migration of Hindu community from Pakistan.
Ho=There is relationship between insecurity and migration of Hindu community from Pakistan.

Calculated Value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$): 5.37

Table value of Chi-square at 2df and 0.05 level of significance is: 3.84
As the calculated value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$) is greater than its table value at 2df and 0.05 level of significance, therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected and the original hypothesis is relationship between insecurity and migration of Hindu community from Pakistan is accepted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table: 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relationship between education and jobs level</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

H_o = There is no relationship between less education and obtaining low level jobs.
H_A = There is relationship between less education and obtaining low level jobs.

Calculated Value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$): 6.77
Table value of Chi-square at 2df and 0.05 level of significance is: 3.84
As the calculated value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$) is greater than its table value at 2df and 0.05 level of significance, therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected and the original hypothesis there is relationship between less education and obtaining low level jobs is accepted.

**Table: 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sexually Harassed</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(29.75)</td>
<td>(19.25)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(21.25)</td>
<td>(13.75)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$H_0$ = There is relationship between forced conversion into other religion and Sexual harassment.  
$H_A$ = There is no relationship between forced conversion into other religion and Sexual harassment.

Calculated Value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$): 15.271

Table value of Chi-square at 2df and 0.05 level of significance: 3.84

As the calculated value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$) is greater than its table value at 2df and 0.05 level of significance, therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected and the original hypothesis there is no relationship between forced conversion into other religion and Sexual harassment is accepted.

**Table: 4**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hindu Caste System</th>
<th>Yes, Extremely</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>44 (35.80)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(18.28)</td>
<td>(9.90)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>3 (11.19)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(5.71)</td>
<td>(3.09)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>47 (35.80)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$H_0$ = There is no relationship between Hindu caste system and early marriages of women.  
$H_A$ = There is relationship between Hindu caste system and early marriages of women.

Calculated Value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$): 18.90

Table value of Chi-square at 2df and 0.05 level of significance: 5.99
As the calculated value of Chi-square ($\chi^2$) is greater than its table value at 3df and 0.05 level of significance, therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected and the original hypothesis there is relationship between Hindu caste system and early marriages of women is accepted.

Case Studies

A Housewife

Mrs. Shanti is a 40-year-old housewife and belongs from the Hindu Gujarati community. She lives in a small house which consists of 2 rooms, with her husband and 4 children (three girls and a boy). She lives in Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi, and belongs to an indigenous family of the city, because her ancestors have been living in Narainpur even before the partition of the Subcontinent.

The husband of Shanti, Mr. Kashi Ram is the only bread earner of the family. He works in Karachi Municipal Corporation (KMC) as a sanitary worker. Shanti’s son has studied till matriculation, and her 3 daughters have completed only primary classes. She doesn’t have enough financial resources to support their further studies, but she is willing to send at least her son to college and even to the university for higher education, so they could get better employment opportunities and not end up in working as a sanitary worker or performing other less prestigious jobs.

She said that, when she was young, she was not allowed to attend the school from her elders, and still in her family girls’ education is not supported by the male members. She has worked hard to get permission to send her daughters to school, but now it’s very difficult to acquire permission to send them to college and university, because the social dynamics of Narainpur are not healthy. Vagabonds pass amusing remarks on girls and eve-teasing is very common. She added that, in the last three years, some girls of her community scuttled with the local boys and later got married to them, therefore education is not encouraged in her community specially for girls. Moreover, criminal activities are also one of the various hurdles in girls’ education and their employment.

She explained that the male dominance and lack of awareness among the masses are the main hurdles in the development of the women in her community. She said, “I am a witness of my whole life’s personal experience. I have never faced any kind of discriminatory behavior from the Muslim community, and they never treated me as a lower citizen on the basis of my religion.”

She also shared that, “There is an urgent need for the awareness program for both of the sexes, and we need to engage youth in constructive activities, so they can get busy in
their own activities and girls may feel free to step outside their houses. This way they can acquire education and play their effective role in the society for the development of Pakistan.”

**A Beautician**

Ms. Asha Velji is a 27 years’ lady. She has completed her Intermediate education as a private candidate. She is from the Kathiawari Hindu community and lives in Narainpur with her parents and belongs from the upper class. Her grandfather, Mr. Magi Velji was a counselor at Narainpur and has also served as the chairman of the local community. She represents the upper class and educated family.

She is engaged in her own community and is going to get married in December, 2016. She said that, they can’t marry out of their community, but there are no such restrictions on girls’ education and other social activities. She received full support from her family and community members during her education, but she lost interest in education after completing her Intermediate, as she was interested in pursuing the beautician course.

She shared that, “I never tried to get a job in a beauty parlor or to start my own business, because we don’t have the trend of females working before marriage in Narainpur. During my entire educational experience, I never faced any discriminatory behavior from my Muslim fellows, as they were always very humble towards me and other non-Muslims students. But, I do remember the behavior of one of my class teacher. She was our Islamic Studies teacher, and also taught ethics to the non-Muslim students. She was quite rude during the teaching and sometimes gave us severe punishment, even just for the nominal mistakes. She always use to grade us with very low marks in the class tests.”

She also shared, “I guess no religion teaches us discrimination and injustice. It all depends on people’s perception and the unawareness about their very own religion.”

She further added that, “If the Hindu community in Narainpur really wants to improve their daily lives, they have to educate their women as much as possible, because education is the only key to develop the community. As far as women remain uneducated and unaware, the real process of prosperity and development couldn’t be started in any community, especially in the context at Narainpur, where every girl and boy need education and awareness regarding the constructive social changes that are prevalent globally.

**A Retired KMC Employee**

Mrs. Damanti Kumari is a 60 years old widow and a retired KMC worker. She has worked 23 years as a laborer in the Engineering Department of KMC. She had 11
children, out of which six had passed away, while two boys and three girls have survived. She lives in a small two room house with her family.

After her retirement, her elder was adjusted in the seat vacated by her, while her other son is jobless. All of her daughters have been married. She shared that, her house is very old and damaged; therefore, the KMC authorities have issued her a notice to vacate the house immediately, as it can lead to any serious incident, but she is still living there, because she doesn’t have any other option.

She added, as in KMC department most of the employees at lower level jobs, such as sweepers, laborers, and other small jobs are non-Muslims. They are working without any health care facility or other benefits. But, still they are not getting their salaries, which have been the cause for dropout of many children from the schools, especially girls because parents can only afford to pay their sons fee, because it is a traditional thinking that boys will be the bread earner for their family in future, while the girls will settle down in other’s house after their marriage.

She further said that, for decades her community has been living in the same condition. She doesn’t feel any positive change among the people of Narainpur, in fact the young boys and girls of the area are getting more and more vulnerable each day due to lack of awareness, education, access to information, and media’s influence. Therefore, their general interest is towards watching movies, smoking, drinking, and flirting with the girls.

She also highlighted the issue of early marriages of girls in the communities of Narainpur. She continued, “Due to the indecisive local environment girls get married between the ages of 16 to 22 years, and become mother in early age, so they could not play their vital role in any socio-economic activities for the community, which is an unfortunate scenario.”

**A Housemaid**

Mrs. Bhawani Makhija is a 35-year-old lady and a housewife searching for the job. She is married to Mr. Lajpat, a KMC worker. She had three children, two girls and a boy, but her son died just after a few months of the birth. She is living in a one room house, which has only a bed, TV, and few crockery items.

She studied till middle standard and left school after her mother's death. She got married when she was 19 years old. After her marriage, she worked temporarily as a sweeper in the DOW Medical Center, Agha Khan Hospital, and in several houses. Currently, she is unemployed and searching for a new job.
She said, “My husband is not getting his salary for the last three months, therefore we had to take out our children from the school. Govt. Primary Mannar Mandir School is the only school in our area, which has the capacity to accommodate only 90 to 100 students, because of the existing faculty of eight teachers. All these teachers come from different areas of the city and the educational quality of this school is not satisfactory, because no government official has visited this school since long. Teacher absenteeism, lack of interest, discipline, damaged furniture, and unfurnished classrooms are the major issues of this school.”

She added that, she is very fond to send her daughters to the school and that’s why she is looking for a job. It’s very difficult to get a permanent job, and she always have been appointed for a very short term (i.e., three to four months) until the employer could get a better employee. The majority of the people are reluctant to appoint a Hindu at their houses for the domestic work.

She also shared that, while she was working as a housemaid, her salary was 3500 rupees per month for washing clothes, dusting, mopping, etc., as people don’t prefer her to clean their plates and dishes, and her cup, plate, and glass were kept separate.

A Case of Early Marriage

Mrs. Mangla is a 19 years old girl, and got married when she was only 17 years. She has a year-old daughter, and is a simple housewife living with her in-laws in Narainpur. Her husband, Mr. Ashok is 24 years old and works in a garment factory as a laborer.

Mrs. Mangla has studied till the 5th standard, because of the cultural constraints and traditional oppression. Her family was highly male dominated, and the general opinion regarding the girls’ education is that, girls have to settle down with their in-laws after marriage, so there is no such need to invest in their education.

She also shared that, around four years ago, five girls of her community eloped with the boys from the other castes, as simply they could not marry out of their caste because of the established norms. The respective girls belonged to Kathiawari community, which is the upper class of the Hindus in Pakistan, while the boys were from the lower class of the Hindus, i.e., the Mehngwar. Their living style and culture is also entirely different, as the males from the Mehngwar community use to drink, smoke, and they are also involved in domestic violence.

She added that, “Nine months ago, two girls took poison and died, because their parents did not agree for their inter-caste marriages. One of the girls, Geeta was also from my community, and was only 18 years old, while the other girl was from the Gujarati community.”
She revealed that, two years ago a girl named Luxmi from the Narainpur also converted into Islam and married to a Muslim boy. She never returned at Narainpur, as nobody knows where she is or what has happened with her, whether she is even alive or not. After this incident, her parents left this area and migrated to Badin because of the defamation.

She explained that, because of all such incidents her community committee members have decided to marry off their daughters as early as possible, which she thinks is one of the obstacles in the prospective development of the Hindu females in Narainpur. She is one of the various examples of this dilemma, while she was not ready for the marriage at the age of 17 and even wanted to continue her education at the school, but she never got permission for it and later she was forced to marry.

She also shared that, her husband is very loving and caring, but her father-in-law is quite strict regarding the old traditional values and religious observance. She is only permitted to go outside with her husband and mother-in-law. She is not allowed to wear ‘Shalwar Kameez’, and can only wear Sarri as her father-in-law doesn’t allow it. She also observes ‘Ghonghat’ in front of her father-in-law and brother-in-law. She expressed that, in her community there are various restrictions and limitations regarding the social activities of the women. All important matters are decided by men, and as a result the women are living in a miserable condition in Narainpur.

**Analysis of Case Studies**

The respondents have very small accommodations and are usually engaged in lower level jobs, such as sweepers and laborers, working without any health care facility or other benefits. They also complained about low salaries and the high unemployment rate. The majority of the people are reluctant to appoint a Hindu at their houses for the domestic work, as they don’t prefer them to clean their plates and dishes, even the utensils for Hindu workers are kept separate.

Low education of both the sexes, especially females is a serious problem as the respondents have a firm believe that education is the only key to develop their community. High school dropout ratio and the presence of a single school in the vicinity, along with teacher absenteeism, lack of interest, damaged furniture, and unfurnished classrooms are the major obstacles in this sphere.

The respective respondents also shared that some girls eloped with the local boys and later got married to them as simply they could not marry out of their caste because of the established norms. Because of this aspect, there have also been several suicide attempts. The respondents also complained about the abundance of vagabonds as well as eve-teasing along with other criminal activities at the community level, i.e., drugs usage and alcohol consumption. Moreover, early marriages, large families, male dominance, and lack of awareness are the hindrances in the socio-economic development of the Hindu community in Narainpur.
Conclusions

Narainpur, Ranchor Lines-Karachi represents the largest population of Hindu community in Karachi, i.e., around 60,000 to 70,000, and is one of the oldest localities in the city. The Hindu women in Pakistan are struggling with serious problems, such as discrimination, cultural assimilation, political oppression, exclusion from the development plans, forced conversion, non-availability of their religious education, language, as well as the lack of opportunities in the democratic participation. The community members of Narainpur are completely deprived of the health facilities as there is no dispensary, maternity center, and other community health care centers. The majority of the community members, and especially the females have only access to Civil Hospital and consult with private doctors those can afford. While, a few people of this area can afford private doctors. The education sector is also in a devastating scenario in Narainpur, as there is only one government school, i.e., the Govt. Primary Manner Mandir School. The streets in the colony are almost damaged and broken. Open manholes can be seen everywhere, and the people are living below the poverty line, i.e., without any basic facilities, such as access to clean drinking water, proper sanitation system, frequent power failures, etc. The past as well as the existing government has not played its role effectively, and the Hindu women are experiencing a very tough time in Narainpur.

Discussion

This study estimates the majority of respondents lived Before 1947, it means the majority of respondents are living in Pakistan before the partition of subcontinent. 56% respondent’s personal monthly income is between 10,000 to 12,000 monthly so the majority of respondents are from poor class. According to the research findings Table No 1 42% respondents are living with insecurities, it means the significant no of respondents are living with secure conditions but 42% who feel insecure is not negligible. 52% respondents are never faced religious discrimination but 48% respondents have faced discrimination on the basis of religion. Therefore Pakistani society is not reflecting there extremist approach rather than neighboring country. The results show that a significance no of respondents have cast their votes in election of Pakistan. 76% respondents thinks they are facing similar conditions as Muslim women are facing and 24% respondents thinks they differently treated. 57% respondents have access to private Hospitals. 70% respondents never faced any anti minority behavior, 30% respondents often faced this. The majority of respondents are never forced to convert in any other religion. 56% respondents are not migrated from Pakistan due to insecurity but 44% respondents want migrated due to insecurity this is also a significant no. The majority of respondents think Hindu Caste system is one of the reasons that Hindus bear many problems in their lives and are treated unequally even in their own social circle. The majority of respondents extremely supported this reason and demanded for proper legislation of Hindu marriages. The majority of
respondent not faced discrimination in acquiring job. As per data of the study, clearly shows 75% respondents agree that low level of education is the reason behind disempowerment in professional and social sphere of life. 61% respondents never faced sexual harassment on account of being a Hindu woman.

Recommendations

1. The government must take concrete initiatives for the betterment of the women of minorities.
2. Hindu politicians, religious leaders, and scholars must strive for the socio-economic upheaval of the masses.
3. The media should portray the significant role of the Hindu minority in the progress of Pakistan, and it should highlight the problems faced by Hindu women.
4. The government should also ensure full participation of the minorities in all spheres of social life by providing them with equal opportunities.
5. The Hindu community should try to establish their own education, medical, and other developmental institutions with the help of government, philanthropists, and professional donors.
6. NGOs and Civil society groups should raise awareness about the women’s socio-cultural and religious norms, along with the rights accorded by the constitution.
7. The women of the minorities should also be given their due share in family property which may enhance their socio-economic status.
8. The women should also be given equal rights to get proper education and be allowed to marry according to their choice.
9. The minority quota should be raised in government jobs, and extra seats should be allocated for the women of the minorities.
10. Unfortunately, the behavior of some Muslims towards the Hindu minority is not appreciable. Religious scholars must play their vital role in guiding them to abstain from any hatred or prejudice.
11. Due to socio-economic and political discrimination, the minorities are mostly considered suitable for sanitary work. They must be given proper economic facilities and job securities. Their wages must be improved and safety equipment should be given in order to protect them from health hazards.

References


____________________

**Dr. Naima Saeed** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Criminology, University of Karachi.

**Tansif ur Rehman** is Ph.D. Research Scholar in the Area Study Centre for Europe, University of Karachi.

**Hina Shahzadi** is Research Scholar in the Department of Criminology, University of Karachi.
An Assessment Of Trade Openness On Gender Inequality: An ARDL To Co-Integration Approach (A Case Study Of Pakistan)

Nooreen Mujaheed
& Azeema Begum
Department of Economics
University of Karachi

Abstract

The impacts of trade policies are ambiguous for male and females due to difference in social status, economic opportunity and control over resources in developing countries. Unfortunately, trade policies are gender blind and overlook female’s concern and objectives. It is fact that trade openness promotes economic development but it is still unclear its impact on females. The study investigates the impact of trade openness on gender inequality in case of Pakistan from the period of 1985 to 2015. We have taken gender inequality index generated by Ahmed and Bukhari (2007), foreign direct investment, trade openness, Female labour force participation, enrolment ratio of females, and government spending on health and education sector. After applying Autoregressive Distributed Lag Model (ARDL) to co-integration and Vector Error Correction Estimation (VECM) technique, the results demonstrate the sign of stationary of time series variables, and short run as well as of long-run equilibrium relation among variables. However, trade liberalization polices will be beneficial if its help to increase the export sector. Export sectors of Pakistan are on textile, clothing and mostly on agriculture products where mostly female are employed. Increasing share of government spending in health and education will indirectly affect the women health ability in order to enhance their social status and access over the economic recourses which can reduce the gender inequality in Pakistan.

Keywords: Gender Inequality, Trade Liberalization, Foreign Direct Investment, Government Expenditures.
Introduction

Over last two decades mostly economies are opening their markets and liberalize their economy through free trade agreement, investment, de-regularization of the private sector and financial market, and privatization of the state owned organizations and achieve the higher level of growth and productivity. It expands the employment opportunities in order to maintain living standard for both gender and also provides the equal opportunities to get the benefit from trade liberalization policies however, trade policy is recognized as gender neutral.

The impacts of trade policies are different for male and females in the economic activities due to difference in social status, access and control over the economic recourses. Unfortunately gender issues are not being considered after economic, social and cultural development and there is no any country who tried to take steps to eradicate the gender gap from societies (Saadia & Augusto, 2005). It is also surprising that the studies and research on trade and gender are comparatively new (Senapaty, 2003).

Although gender discrimination or gender inequality is very complex subject to study however, feminist theories have explained the position of women in labour market which reflects patriarchy and subordinate position of the women in society as well as in their family. (Anker, 1998). Moreover feminist argues that jobs which are classified as female occupation get lower wages than men occupations which is certainly based on sex discrimination rather than productivity and reflection of cultural discrimination against female’s worker. There is a direct negative effect between women right and trade policies and most of the time trade rules and policies damage the women rights (Mengesha, 2006). It is a fact that trade openness promotes economic development but its impact on women is still unclear.

Trade liberalization had improved empowerment of women and their livelihoods (Nordas, 2003) however overall benefits which acquired by men from trade liberalization is more than women (Mcgill, 2004) trade liberalization has made gender inequality worse and demoralized the status of the women (Margawati, 2007). Feminist economist Hoskyns (2006) and Seguino (2006) explain that gender issues should be an essential part of macroeconomics variables and economic development and economic growth could be effected by gender relation. Mostly development economist investigated the relationship between trade and gender such as. Korinek (2005) found that trade openness give employment opportunities to
female in developing countries however, it is still questionable that women’s share in paid employment will increase in export sector of the country especially.

Gender inequality can be studied through different perspective distribution of labour in term of paid and unpaid work, division of economic resources and employment separation in labour market, access to public services such as health and education and representation of women in the policy making. However trade policies were silent regarding gender aspect of employment and did not illustrate their implication on women, because the main purpose of trade liberalization was to increase the export and bring export-led growth in the economy, which could increase employment opportunity for both men and women and competition. However, in this whole process of trade liberalization the socio-cultural realities, problems and constraints on women economic activities had not considered.

Rest of the paper is designed as section 1 is introduction; Section 2 provides the review of literature. Data and methodology are given in section 3. Section 4 shows result and discussion. Finally Section four concludes discussion and provides policy implication.

Review of Literature

There are numerous studies which examine the effect of trade liberalization policies on employment of women and gender difference. Joseph (2014) provided the empirical and theoretical evidence on the relationship between trade liberalization and the informal economy. He studied that how the relation changes between men and women who are working in the informal economy. Existing theoretical evidence proves that trade liberalization did not yield gender neutral outcomes. It influences men and women extraordinarily due to disparities in labour market opportunities, which were related to their earnings and employment.

Shireen Alazzaw (2014), investigated the linkage between women’s labour market supply in the industry and manufacturing sector, the measure of manufacturing concentration and the trade policies regarding reforms always took place simultaneously. Results indicate that industry concentration is negative to women in the labour market. Furthermore, the impacts of trade liberalization vary depending on the level of absorption of female labour supply and the international competition. At initial level competitive industries always try to increase imports for setup new industries, consequently that increase imports were related higher gender wage gaps and lower female employment in Egypt. Chinhui Juhn et al. (2013) analyzed the underexplored area of gender inequality due to trade liberalization by using the establishment level data of Mexico. They tried to find the impact of reduction in tariff on female wage bill shares in blue-collar jobs. A decline in tariffs encourages domestic firms to update their technologies in order to enter in export market. New technologies require less physical skills so women employment and wages can increase in blue collar jobs however, there is less opportunities for females in white collar tasks.

Irene Musselli et al. (2012) evaluated the relationship between trade gender inequality and development of three different countries by using various methodologies. In the case
study of Cape Verde, he used micro data to examine the distributive consequences of trade policies on households especially on women. In second method they collectively used both qualitative and quantitative methodologies. The case study of Lesotho was based on interconnections of structural changes in the economy and trade policies and then shifting of female employment. In the case study of Gambia, they had emphasized on qualitative methods of investigation, with the aims to find out the role of women in export-oriented sectors specifically, for instance the fishery sector of Gambia, they found that commitments regarding gender equality and economic empowerment of women, and trade policy instruments are disconnected. Although every country has made commitments to increase gender equality at national level, however gender issues mostly disappear when other macroeconomic policies are designed and implemented along with trade agreement are negotiated.

Rashmi (2012) studied female access over health and education as the sign of gender inequality and analysed the gender inequality situation at state level. Further, the results indicate that at the sub-national level there is low level of gender inequality with some high level per capita income in few states. However, gender inequality was also very high in several high income states. High level of gender inequality was also detected in some states which attain high rank in the openness index. Asma Hyder et al. (2011) examined female and male labour force participation trends by using five census reports and the two Labour Force Survey reports for 57 years of Pakistan. They examined the impact of trade liberalization on labour force participation rates of male and females in wide occupational groups in Pakistan. They concluded that the gender gap has decreased as trade openness increased between male and female. The demand of female labour also encouraged due to changes in production composition of GDP. Rashmi (2010) examined that trade is actually substitute for free market, and as a result gender inequality and poverty of women can be effectively reduced in developing countries. First, he analyzed neoclassical theories and trade liberalization policies then observed the role of trade in correcting market; thereby trade make free markets more efficient in distribution of resources. Then he identified the gendered composition of free trade and tackled the main issues related to trade liberalization and women in LDCs. He revealed that free trade can reduce gender inequality within global capitalist structures but it requires more empirical investigation.

Alexander et al. (2010) studied the impact of trade openmess on female employment in manufacturing sector particularly, of 60 developed countries with high level of income and developing countries with middle income level from the period of 1985 to 2007. They found that relative employment of female decreased in developed countries but increased in developing countries. Zahra karimi, (2008) conducted an informal survey in the Iranian city of Kashan for investigating the impact of international competition on carpet weavers. Trade competition reduced the real wages of weavers and changed the labour force structure of the industries. He analyzed that the middle income people who belonged to this industry are leaving and poor Afgan migrants are taking their places. Moreover, in household level women are working as subordinate in weaving as employment, although economic globalization has improved Iran’s exports related to energy extensively, however major labour-intensive exports, particularly hand-made carpets, declined in last twenty year. The
results of survey illustrated that as an employment, carpet weaving is a sign of poverty which has very low earning than formal minimum average. Consequently now mostly women were not interested any more in carpet weaving industry, however low income families still relay on the carpet weaving. Naeem Ahmed et al. (2007) focused on gender inequalities due to liberalization of trade in case of Pakistan by using data from 1973 to 2005. They have taken per capita GDP, GDP ratio of import and export, ratio of number of girls school to number of boys school for determining of overall gender inequality in Pakistan. The regression results demonstrate a significant association of trade liberalization on over all gender inequality, particularly in the labour market of Pakistan. Rizwana Siddique (2007) analysed the gender dimension of impact of economic reforms using poverty indicators, trade liberalization policies and cut in government expenditures and explained that both policies hurt women as compared to men in Pakistan. In trade liberalization exercise she found that trade liberalization policies increases poverty to women among poor household and decreases in rich household relative to men. She suggested that education is most important variable which can help to reduce the poverty of women, wage income and time allocation and capabilities. Matthias Busse, al (2006) explored the global association of gender and trade by taking sample of 92 developed and developing countries. They focused on the study of comparative advantage in manufacturing goods but labor-intensive in nature. The results demonstrate that inequality in term of gender wage was directly associated with comparative advantage in labour-intensive goods, especially those countries which exports larger amount of these goods with huge gender wage gap. Moreover, other dimension of gender inequality such as educational attainment rates and labour force activity rates were inversely linked with comparative advantage in labour-intensive goods.

Pradhan (2006) found a positive relation between female employment and trade by analyzing Indian industry and plant-level data, and also found negative relationship between foreign technologies movement and female employment, and no link between Foreign Direct Investment and female employment.

Berik et al. (2002) investigated the impact of global competition due to openness in labour-intensive industries in both Taiwan and Korea. He found that wage gaps between men and women stretched during 1981 to 1999. Further strong regression results are for Taiwan which showed that rising import shares are directly related to increasing wage discrimination. Especially, this discrimination was registered in industries such as textile and electronic industries, where women are employed. However in case of Korea, a minor decline in export industries was uncertainly related to wage discrimination in industries against female ‘workers of these industries. Kucera (2001) studied the effects of trade liberalization on gender relative wages and employment using data from 1970 to 1996 for Germany and Japan. He pointed out that supply of female labour was identical between these two countries and but those industries where female workers are employed are characterized as “trade losers” in both countries. He found that impact of trade expansion was negative for women of manufacturing sectors in Japan but not in Germany, because of different trading partners. Japan was trading with non-developed countries. However, Germany was involved in trade with non-OECD countries intensively. Wood (1991) and Sanding (1999) have analyzed the impact of increase export and female employment in
An Assessment of Trade Openness on Gender Inequality: An ARDL to Co-Integration Approach
(A Case Study of Pakistan)

Export sector (manufacturing) during 1960-1985 and mid 1990s through cross sectional data of developed and developing countries and found a strong relationship between increase in employment of women in formal sector and increase in export.

Gender and development theory explained that impact of neoliberal trade policies and reforms is negative on women because of less access and control over economic resources for instance basic education, health facilities, training and skilled development and promotion in work places.

Methodology and Modelling Frame Work

On the basis of theoretical and empirical studies, we employ composite Gender Inequality Index, trade openness, Foreign Direct Investment, Public spending on health sector and education, female labour force participation, unemployment rate and primary and secondary enrolment rate of female. The functional form of model is portrayed as following:

$$GII_t = f(TOP_t, FDI_t, PSE_t, PSH_t, \%FLFP_t, \%UNEM_t, ENRL_t)$$

Where,
- $GII$ = Gender Inequality Index
- $FDI$ = Foreign Direct Investment (% of GDP)
- $PSE$ = Public Spending on Education (% of GDP)
- $PSH$ = Public Spending on Health (% of GDP)
- $FLFP$ = Female Labour Force Participation rate
- $UNEM$ = Unemployment Rate
- $ENRL$ = Primary and Secondary Female enrolment Rate

$GII$ gender inequality index which measure is gender discrimination among women and men in labour market health and education generated by Ahmed and Bukhari (2007), TOP is trade openness which has been calculated by (import+export)/gdp, FDI is foreign direct investment % of GDP, PSE and PSH are government expenditure on health and education as % of GDP, UNEM is overall unemployment rate and ENRL is primary and secondary rate of females.

$t = 1, 2, 3 \ldots n$ (time period from 1985-2015)

For experiential purpose, all variables have been converted in to econometric model. This specification of model provides efficient and consistent results without any biasness. The empirical equation is modelled

$$(GII)_t = \alpha_0 + \beta_1(TOP)_t + \beta_2(FDI)_t + \beta_3(\%PHE)_t + \beta_4(PSH)_t + \beta_5 L(FLFP)_t + \beta_6(UNEM)_t + \beta + \beta_7(ENRL)_t + e_t \ldots \ldots (2)$$

Where $\alpha_0$ is intercept and $\beta_1, \beta_2, \beta_3, \beta_4, \beta_5, \beta_6, \beta_7$ are the coefficient of variables $e_t$ is residual term.
(a) Data Source

In this study the time series data has been employed for the period 1985 to 2013. The data is taken from UNCTAD, global economy, World Bank Indicators, and Pakistan bureau of statistics, various publication of economic survey of Pakistan, Statistical Year Book of Pakistan 2010, and labour force survey. Study will estimate the relationship between GII and trade openness as well as nexus among the explanatory variables

(b) Methodology

Time series data from the period of 1985 to 2013 is being used in this study, and it is very necessary to investigate the stationary in the data. Because without investigating the stationary, the result will be spurious. Stationary in the data is investigated by using various number of unit root tests. In this study ADF by Dickey and Fuller (1979) and PP by Philiph- Perron (1987) have been used to check the stationarity in the data.

In the next step we have used ARDL to integration approaches to test the relation between core variables. Wide range of empirical researches is available, where researchers have applied Ordinary least squared (OLS) method to examine the association among macroeconomic series. The main obscurity with OLS method is that it is already assumed that residual term is normally distributed with zero mean and finite constant. Without investigating the stationary by using unit root test of the variables, Ordinary Least Square gives ambiguous empirical result which may be not helpful for policy analysis. Secondly, it is required to test the integrating order of the series while investigating co integration relationship between the variables. If time series data are integrated at level 1 then Johansson Co integration test can applied however, the situation is more complicated. Because some time series data are integrated al level and some at 1st difference of unit root test. That’s why ARDL to Co-integration Approaches (Pesaran and Shin (1999) and (2001) provide appropriate results. However, before applying ARDL, make sure that no any time series should be integrated at 2nd difference of unit root test.

The unrestricted error correction model (UECM) of autoregressive distributive lag modelling (ARDL) to Co-integration Approach is modelled as follows:

\[
\Delta \ln GII_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 T + \beta_2 TOP_{t-1} + \beta_3 FDI_{t-1} + \beta_4 PSE_{t-1} + \beta_5 PHS_{t-1} + \Delta \ln FLFP_{t-1} + \Delta \ln UNEM_{t-1} + \Delta \ln ENRL_{t-1} + \sum_{j=1}^{q} \beta_1 \Delta GII_{t-j} + \sum_{k=0}^{r} \beta_2 \Delta TOP_{t-k} \\
+ \sum_{i=0}^{x} \beta_i \Delta FDI_{t-i} + \sum_{m=0}^{r} \beta_m \Delta PES_{t-m} + \sum_{n=0}^{u} \beta_n \Delta PHS_{t-n} + \sum_{o=0}^{v} \beta_o \Delta FLFP_{-o} \\
+ \sum_{p=0}^{w} \beta_p \Delta UNEM_{t-p} + \sum_{q=0}^{r} \beta_q \Delta ENRL_{t-q} + \epsilon_t \quad (3)
\]
The null hypothesis of no co-integration is
\[ H_0 : \text{GII} = \text{TOP} = \text{FDI} = \text{PSE} = \text{PHS} = \text{FLFP} = \text{UNEM} = \text{ENRL} = 0 \]
And hypothesis of co-integration is
\[ H_1 : \text{GII} \neq \text{TOP} \neq \text{FDI} \neq \text{PSE} \neq \text{PHS} \neq \text{FLFP} \neq \text{UNEM} \neq \text{ENRL} \neq 0 \]

Although the diagnostic tests have also been conducted to test the problem of normality, serial correlation, conditional heteroskedasticity, and specification of the model after testing the ARDL to co integration testing model.

Once long run relationship between variables is established, it is necessary to find short run impact of trade openness on gender inequality in case of Pakistan. In doing so, we have applied Error Correction Method (ECM). The ECM is modelled as follows

\[
\Delta \text{GII}_t = \delta_3 + \sum_{j=1}^{n} \delta_j \Delta \text{GII}_{t-j} + \sum_{i=0}^{n} \delta_i \Delta \text{TOP}_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^{n} \delta_i \Delta \text{FDI}_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^{n} \delta_i \Delta \text{PSE}_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^{n} \delta_i \Delta \text{UNEM}_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^{n} \delta_i \Delta \text{FLFP}_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^{n} \delta_i \Delta \text{ENRL}_{t-i} + \text{ECM}_{t-1} + \epsilon_{t} \tag{4}
\]

Where \( t-1 \) ECM is lagged error term. It is the estimate of lagged error term which capture the speed of adjustment from short run towards long run equilibrium.

### Results and Discussions

Table: 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistical descriptive</th>
<th>ENRL</th>
<th>FDI</th>
<th>TOP</th>
<th>GII</th>
<th>PSE</th>
<th>PSH</th>
<th>UNEM</th>
<th>ENRL</th>
<th>FLFP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>71.53310</td>
<td>1.064828</td>
<td>10.03595</td>
<td>131.4481</td>
<td>2.445862</td>
<td>0.721379</td>
<td>5.248276</td>
<td>16.08276</td>
<td>16.08276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>72.19000</td>
<td>0.690000</td>
<td>7.284274</td>
<td>132.0400</td>
<td>2.560000</td>
<td>0.720000</td>
<td>5.100000</td>
<td>15.10000</td>
<td>15.10000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>78.40000</td>
<td>3.670000</td>
<td>36.48515</td>
<td>142.4700</td>
<td>3.100000</td>
<td>1.190000</td>
<td>7.800000</td>
<td>24.46000</td>
<td>24.46000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>64.59000</td>
<td>0.330000</td>
<td>4.111262</td>
<td>122.0416</td>
<td>1.720000</td>
<td>0.470000</td>
<td>2.600000</td>
<td>8.600000</td>
<td>8.600000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Dev.</td>
<td>3.8225876</td>
<td>0.876636</td>
<td>7.104520</td>
<td>6.136333</td>
<td>0.365166</td>
<td>0.197153</td>
<td>1.512477</td>
<td>4.620997</td>
<td>4.620997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-0.426823</td>
<td>1.843051</td>
<td>2.172679</td>
<td>0.135091</td>
<td>-0.254553</td>
<td>0.820521</td>
<td>0.740909</td>
<td>0.453194</td>
<td>0.453194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.965532</td>
<td>5.438346</td>
<td>7.891086</td>
<td>1.673049</td>
<td>2.266788</td>
<td>2.779850</td>
<td>2.313307</td>
<td>2.264913</td>
<td>2.264913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jarque-Bera</td>
<td>1.512345</td>
<td>23.60222</td>
<td>51.72254</td>
<td>2.215838</td>
<td>0.962785</td>
<td>3.192349</td>
<td>0.599756</td>
<td>1.582870</td>
<td>1.582870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probability</td>
<td>0.469460</td>
<td>0.000007</td>
<td>0.080000</td>
<td>0.330245</td>
<td>0.617922</td>
<td>0.202670</td>
<td>0.740909</td>
<td>0.453194</td>
<td>0.453194</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Estimated and tabulated by Authors

The descriptive statistics are explained in table no. 1. The outcomes depict that all the series have homoscedastic variance and normal distribution as indicated by Jarque-Bera statistics where the mean values of, FDI, TOP, UNEM, PSH and FLFP are more than median values which indicates tendency toward positive skew whereas the mean value of ENRL, PSE, and GII are less than median value which shows negative skew.
(a) Unit Root Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>1st Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ENRL</td>
<td>-2.045644</td>
<td>0.5521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>-5.070917</td>
<td>0.0027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLFP</td>
<td>-2.115267</td>
<td>0.5155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GII</td>
<td>-3.384740</td>
<td>0.0738</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>-3.890144</td>
<td>0.0280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH</td>
<td>-3.248545</td>
<td>0.0958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOP</td>
<td>-4.492504</td>
<td>0.0068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEM</td>
<td>-1.447457</td>
<td>0.8235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Estimated and tabulated by Authors

Critical Values at 1%, 5% and 10% level

The Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) unit roots test is used to check stationary in time series data. Table 2 describes the unit root test of all variable at level and 1st difference with trend and intercepts. At level, the values of ENRL, FLFP AND UNEM are insignificant however remaining variables are significant at 1 %, 5% and 10 % level. After taking unit root test at 1st difference, the probability values show that all variables are without trends with less than 5 % level. It is proved that all variables are integrated at I(1) which is confirmed by ADF test.

PP test is also used to check the trends in time series data. Table 3 shows the unit root test of all variable at level and 1st difference with trend and intercepts. At level, the values of GII, PSH and TOP are significant at less than 10 % critical value. However remaining variables are insignificant at level. After taking unit root test at 1st difference, the probability values of ENRL, GII and TOP are significant at 1 %. The values of UNEM and PSH are significant at 5 % level, and remaining variables are significant at 10 % critical values. It is proved that all variables are integrated at I(1) which is confirmed by Philips Perron test.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>1st Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ENRL</td>
<td>-1.846599</td>
<td>0.6547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>-1.441809</td>
<td>0.8253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLFP</td>
<td>-2.085616</td>
<td>0.5311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GII</td>
<td>-3.341208</td>
<td>0.0803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>-2.394426</td>
<td>0.3742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH</td>
<td>-3.364908</td>
<td>0.0767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOP</td>
<td>-4.426943</td>
<td>0.0079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEM</td>
<td>-1.531109</td>
<td>0.7940</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Estimated and tabulated by Authors

Critical values at 1 %, 5% and 10 % level
An Assessment of Trade Openness on Gender Inequality: An ARDL to Co-Integration Approach
(A Case Study of Pakistan)

Now ARDL approaches of Co-integration is being applied to determine the long and short run relationships. It has been already mentioned that the main assumption of ARDL is all variables should be co-integrated to the order of I(0) OR I(1) or both. In the first step, we have selected the lag length criteria on the basis of Akaike Information Criterion [AIC]. Because the computation of F statistic for Co-integration is sensitive to the lag length. After selecting the lag length we obtained ARDL model of Co-integration. The empirical outcomes of the ARDL model IS obtained by normalizing the gender inequality index are presented in Table-4 (ARDL(0,1,2,1,2,2,2,1) selected based on the AIC and long run relation on Table-5 (ARDL(0,1,2,1,2,2,2,1 and short run relationship in Table 6 (ARDL (0,1,2,1,2,2,1) selected based on the Akaike Information Criterion [AIC]).

Table 4: Estimated long run coefficients using the ARDL approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARDL(0,1,2,1,2,2,2,1) selected based on Akaike Information Criterion</th>
<th>Dependent variable is GII</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Variables</td>
<td>Coefficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOP</td>
<td>-.10384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOP(-1)</td>
<td>-.058669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>-.85355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI(-1)</td>
<td>1.3464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI(-2)</td>
<td>-.15601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEM</td>
<td>-.86222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEM(-1)</td>
<td>-.92498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLFP</td>
<td>.94357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLFP(-1)</td>
<td>-.63225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLFP(-2)</td>
<td>-.15134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH</td>
<td>-.27901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH(-1)</td>
<td>.90051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH(-2)</td>
<td>-.99037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>-.72299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE(-1)</td>
<td>4.1125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE(-2)</td>
<td>3.2730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENRL</td>
<td>-.43197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENRL(-1)</td>
<td>-.31470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>197.4640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>-.61209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R-Squared</td>
<td>.99822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.E. of Regression</td>
<td>.4580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DW-statistic</td>
<td>3.1831</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Estimated and tabulated by Authors

Table 4 demonstrates the ARDL model of integration which explains that the entire chosen variables have a long-term association with F-stat. 207.0670 and p-value 0.000. The significant values of trade liberalization and Foreign Direct Investment shows the significant relation with GII. However at first lag of FDI there is positive sign which shows positive association with GII but in second lag the coefficient sing turn again negative. The results
support the theory that increase in trade will help unskilled labour of developing countries which are mostly females. Trade openness will bring more opportunities for female not only in labour market but also in health and education sectors.

The unemployment rate has negative and significant relation with gender inequality which is opposite in our study. The reason is that female has less ratio as compared to man in total labour force. If unemployment decrease which allow opportunities for male due to physical and mental strengthen. So he gap between male and female labour force increases more in labour market indirectly increases gender inequality. Female labour force participation have no relation in current year and in second lag due to insignificant values however the results support that increase in female labour force participation could help in decreasing gender inequality in first lag. Increase in female labour force participation will decrease the female gap in employment. Mostly female of rural areas are engaged in agriculture sector and urban women are engaged in textile and garment industries, fortunately these are main exports of Pakistan. Increase in exports of primary agriculture and textile goods, will be beneficial for women to get more jobs with less skill and knowledge. More chance of employment will help women to access the other necessities of life and it will improve their economic power along with the ability to take part in decision making for their own interest and benefits. This will indirectly decrease the gender inequality of female and improve human development level among female public spending on health have no link with gender inequality in current and first lag however in second lag there is negative and significant relation which shows that increase in government spending on health will improve females health facilities in order to take more part in economic activities which will help to reduce gender inequality. Public spending on education has no relation in current lag. Female enrolment in primary and secondary education have negative and significant link with gender inequality, which proves that more enrolment in education by female will provide more opportunities in order to make them more skilled and improve their status in the society through more chance of getting jobs and employments. Increase in health and education expenditure by government will indirectly improve the health and skill of the women and they can take part in economic activities more actively. More access to health and education will improve human development level of women which indirectly decrease the gender inequality gap in these two areas.

Table: 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regressor</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Ratio</th>
<th>Prob</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOP</td>
<td>-.16251</td>
<td>.052593</td>
<td>-3.0900</td>
<td>.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>-1.0673</td>
<td>.34762</td>
<td>-3.0702</td>
<td>.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEM</td>
<td>-1.7872</td>
<td>.43220</td>
<td>-4.1351</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLFP</td>
<td>.15999</td>
<td>.30604</td>
<td>.52277</td>
<td>.617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSH</td>
<td>-11.7933</td>
<td>3.9223</td>
<td>-3.0067</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>5.6626</td>
<td>1.3497</td>
<td>4.1954</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENRL</td>
<td>-.74666</td>
<td>.24698</td>
<td>-3.0232</td>
<td>.019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>197.4640</td>
<td>17.1839</td>
<td>11.4912</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>-.61209</td>
<td>.12388</td>
<td>-4.9411</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Estimated and tabulated by Author
An Assessment of Trade Openness on Gender Inequality: An ARDL to Co-Integration Approach
(A Case Study of Pakistan)

The table above demonstrates the estimated long-term coefficients using an ARDL approach to co-integration, which illustrates that GII have much influence on Trade openness in the long run. Furthermore, GII have long term association with all selected variables in the model at 1% and 5% level of significance. However, there is no association between gender inequality and female labour force participation rate.

Table 6 represents short run association among the variables. For short run two criteria should be fulfilled that ECM value should be negative and significant. In the short-term analysis, The extent of coefficient of ECT depicts that the speed of variation from short run to the long run path. The coefficient value of ECM (-1) is -0.822 which is negative and highly significant, illustrates the high rate of adjustment from short run equilibrium towards long run equilibrium with none probability of error. This indicates that deviation from the long-term equilibrium is corrected by 82% over each year.

Table 7
Diagnostic tests

Number of diagnostic tests proves no evidence of serial correlation functional form error, Heteroscedasticity and normality effect in the model.
Conclusions and Policy Recommendations

The main objective of the study is to investigate the impact of trade openness on gender inequality of Pakistan by applying ARDL approaches for the period 1985 to 2013. Our empirical evidence has shown a negative relation between gender inequality index and trade openness. Government should consider trade openness due to female employment in agriculture and textile sectors. Trade openness will help to reduce gender inequality not only in labour market but also in health and education. As mentioned above, Pakistani trade policymakers assume that international trade is gender neutral, which gives less attention of gender considerations while formulating trade policies. In the comparatively democratic political government of Pakistan, business community, trade associations and large multinational have been considered as main stakeholders in discussion and negotiation of trade policy. Whereas females are mostly unable to connect in full argument on the technical matters related to import and export policies of the country. Changes in trade policy that can influence society at large should take into consideration and aspiration of female’s groups.

Capacity building to eliminate unfairness against females in society is crucial and fundamental aspect in the efforts to endorse gender equality in Pakistan. Females are considered beneficiary and victims of trade liberalization both, however, they have lack capability to obtain the benefits from or reduce the harmful shocks of trade policy. There is a need to empowering women in formulating trade policy which is need for sustainable long term economic development in the Pakistan.

These two areas are main part of our export which helps females to take part in economic activities with less skill and abilities. Even foreign direct investment also brings new technologies and knowledge however, it provides more opportunities of job developing country labour due to cheap cost of production and wages. Although there is need to open more technical colleges and institute for enhancement of female labour skills. Most women belong to rural areas of Pakistan where they have no or less facilities of health and education. The women of rural area participate in economic activities to help their male family members. However, the facilities regarding health and education in rural areas are very worse. Few hospital and dispensaries in villages with lack of medical staff and bad hygienic condition and schools with no teachers or less teaching staff are not enough to provide the basic rights to females. Government should make sure the availability of staff in both areas and bring policy for encouraging female enrolment at least secondary level of education. Female employment in agriculture and industry sector has also positive relation with composite gender inequality index. World Development Indicators (2014) illustrated that almost 74% of female workers in Pakistan are engaged in agriculture. In urban areas over 28% are connected with textile, wearing clothes and leather industries. Increase in employment will benefit women and it will decrease employment and wage gap if government take step in order to increase the opportunities for women. The effects of trade liberalization on gender inequality are still underexplored aspect in the trade literature especially in case of Pakistan. A reduction in tariff’s rates will increase more imports which will encourage to industries in order to update their technology and penetrate the export market.
An Assessment of Trade Openness on Gender Inequality: An ARDL to Co-Integration Approach (A Case Study of Pakistan)

References


---

**Dr. Nooreen Mujahed** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Economics, University of Karachi.

**Azeema Begum** is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Economics, University of Karachi.
Assessment Of Political Literacy Among Female Students At The University Of Balochistan

Rubeena Batool
Department of Gender and Development Studies
University of Balochistan

Musarrat Jabeen
Department of International Relations
National Defense University

Abstract

Political literacy is sited at the periphery of political empowerment designs the real driver for good governance. This paper assesses the prevalence of political literacy based on political knowledge-attitude-practice among the female students in the University of Balochistan. We used KAP (knowledge-attitude-practice) analysis method to create the primary data. The qualitative factors analysis allow us to deduct the decline in the strength of political literacy when it moves from thought to action; sequenced as political knowledge factor found 79%, political attitude factor found 58%, and political practice factor found 34%. The paper suggests that political literacy higher in knowledge and least in practices warrants the ineffectiveness of legally granted political empowerment to women in Balochistan. The policy makers may utilize this study for the effective women’s political empowerment to achieve good governance vis-à-vis incurring economic development in and around Balochistan.

Keywords: Political Literacy, Women’s Political Empowerment, Good Governance.

تلميح

يتضمن النص الكليه لمقالنا التفاعلات السياسية ضد الرؤية حسب النتائج. يؤكد النص في الطبقة الأولى أن التفاعلات السياسية ضد الرؤية محدودة. النص يشدد على أهمية الوعي السياسي في اتخاذ القرارات السياسية. النص يشير إلى الوعي السياسي كي يكون أقل عددًا وندرًا. النص يشدد على أن النتائج تظهر أن الوعي السياسي أقل عددًا وندرًا. النص يشير إلى أن النتائج تظهر أن الوعي السياسي أقل عددًا وندرًا. النص يشدد على أن النتائج تظهر أن الوعي السياسي أقل عددًا وندرًا.
Introduction

“The worst illiterate is the political illiterate, he doesn’t hear, doesn’t speak, nor participates in the political events. He doesn’t know the cost of life, the price of the bean, of the fish, of the flour, of the rent, of the shoes and of the medicine, all depends on political decisions. The political illiterate is so stupid that he is proud and swells his chest saying that he hates politics. The imbecile doesn’t know that, from his political ignorance is born the prostitute, the abandoned child, and the worst thieves of all, the bad politician, corrupted and flunky of the national and multinational companies.” Bertolt Brecht

Governance indicates the relationship between the governing and the governed regarding the resource management for collective good. Political literacy is resourceful sensibility to stage good governance referred to political empowerment comprised of political policies and political practices. We focus on political literacy (as practice) intensity in women after the increased women representation (as policy) in the political institutions of Pakistan-Balochistan since 2001. The individuals and groups feel empowered when they can work for & earn their social benefits and economic needs. This notion of empowerment is most of the time challenged while contested in different contexts in different ways by women particularly. The women are found dependent on normative power patterns of informal and formal institutions which impact their political empowerment. Legal empowerment of women is enabling factor to bring forth the change in prevalent political format of a society. We choose to assume the perspective of women empowerment based on socio-political process and association between political policy and practice by assessing the political literacy among female students in the University of Balochistan.

Post 9/11 Gender development literature focuses political development in Balochistan. Military operations were launched in different areas of Pakistan. Balochistan is one of the provinces where the consequences of these operations can be clearly seen, researches were found that address women issues related to armed conflict, security discourse in post 9/11 Pakistan-Balochistan (Rashid, 2009). Women empowerment in Balochistan through devolution plan 2001 is indicator of political development of Balochistan (Javed & Khan, 2006). “Women’s Empowerment in Challenging Environments: A Case Study from Balochistan”(Pterson, 2008) the article offers policies for women empowerment in traditional, ethnic, and religious setting. “Economic empowerment of women in the rural areas of Balochistan: World System analysis at Micro level in Anthropological perspective” (Mohyuddin, Anwaar, Rehann, Umbreen, & Mamonah, 2012), “Problems and Challenges Faced by the Rural Women: A Case Study of Balochistan” (Khoso, Shafique, Abidi, & Shaikh, 2011)
Researches on Pakistan local government system with reference to women political empowerment in Balochistan illustrate the process, number of women representatives, quota systems under the Musharraf Regime” (Graff, 2003). Jabeen & Iqbal (2010) issues related to women as councilors, and how the socio cultural norms and practices disregard gender development initiatives.

A report titled “Women Representation in Local Government in Pakistan: Impact Analysis and Future Policy Implications” by Yazdani, (2004) found obstacles in local government policy 2001; voters political literacy as capacity to make coherent choices, and decisions when voting and political freedom as the independent decision to vote or not.

To highlight political education of female voters NGOs reports emphasized on voter registrations, CNIC provision and mobilize them to cast vote. Another focus of NGOs is to educate the elected representatives about their roles and duties. We have done searches in both printed and on-line media and have not come across any similar work to Political Literacy among Female Students in the University of Balochistan.

As above facts it is assumed that political literacy promotes informed political participation. The study attempts following questions:

1. What is the significance of relationship between women political empowerment and political literacy?
2. What is informed political participation?
3. What is level of political knowledge among female voters?
4. How are the political attitudes among female voters?
5. What are the political practices among female voters?

This paper presents the general picture of policy based women’s political empowerment of Pakistan as indicating factor of good governance. The research covers discussions on political literacy among the females based on knowledge, attitude and practices as determining factor of women’s political empowerment. This study will help to develop informed political participation patterns.

**Literature Review**

Kaufman et al (2005) have noted that governance fashions a people to express interests, reconcile the differences and exercise the legal rights and duties. The World Bank (2004) counts empowerment of individuals and groups is to act upon the socio-economic desires for actual results. Cleaver (1999) found non clarity of empowerment; that how it can be related to different categories of people and groups particularly to women. Kothari (2001) established empowerment as the intensity of likelihood of an individual in a particular social context to promote his/her position. Batiwala (2007) estimated the empowerment is to change the socio-economic power process existing in a society.
Power is central to any conceptualizations of empowerment, and is at the very root of the term itself. In perspective of feminism Amy Allen stated that, “feminists who conceptualize power as empowerment do of course acknowledge that, in patriarchal societies, men are in a position of dominance over women; but they choose to focus on a different understanding of power, power as the ability to empower and transform oneself, others, and the world” (1999). Srilatha, Batiwala proposes that women’s empowerment involves challenging patriarchal relations, which in turn requires that women first recognize the ideology that legitimizes male domination and understand how it perpetuates their oppression. She further stated that this process of change does not necessarily begin spontaneously from the condition of subjugation; it must be ‘extremely induced’. She claims, “Women must be convinced of their innate right to equality, dignity and justice” (1994).

Feminism had a strong connection with women’s political empowerment. Modern feminist movements were originated with the cause of women’s political rights. These movements were divided into three waves. First wave refers mainly to women’s suffrage movements of the 19th and early 20th centuries in Great Britain and United States. During this movement activists focused on gaining women’s political power by given them right to vote. In Britain 1918 Act under the representation of people was passed granting the vote to women over the age of 30 and those who owned houses. Than in 1928 it was extended to all women over 21 years of age. In United States under the 19th amendment to the constitution in 1919, granting women the right to vote in all states.

Women’s movement activism in recent years has inspired feminists for at least two additional meanings of empowerment. One group expands its range to encompass informal politics and the dynamics of everyday life. Some scholars insist, for example, that social movements are a form of political participation at par with engagement inside the state (Baldez, 2002; Beckwith, 2007). The other group has adopted a notion of “politics” as any instance and or manifestation of power relations. They are not interested only in the politics of state and the politics of social movements but also the politics of language, the politics of exchange and the politics of representation (Krook and Childs, 2010).

Increased globalization, combined decentralization has posed major challenges to traditional configurations of political organization, creating new opportunities and constraints for feminist change. As a consequence, “politics” is now an even more diffuse entity, with new and developing arrangements that are not yet well understood. It is also observed by feminists that with women’s overall rates of education and labor force participation (McDonagh, 2002) as well as with levels of national socioeconomic development (Matland, 1998), attributed to modernization processes move into higher social and economic roles lead to greater influence in politics (Inglehart and Norris 2003).

There is an ongoing debate regarding the nature and importance of the gender gap in voting behavior. In addition to asking why women as a group might have political
preferences distinct from those of men (Studlar, McAllister and Hayes, 1998), scholars have probed the content of women’s political interests (Campbell, 2006) and sought to explain lower levels of political knowledge among women as compared to men, despite changes in the opportunities for women’s engagement in political life (Mondak and Anderson, 2004). Inclusion of women into formal politics to engender democracy, a big challenge for feminists has to develop a distinct political community of women and to articulate interest in and around gender-based injustices (Cornwall and Geotz, 2005). Another fundamental point in feminist view on the politics of women’s representation is that differences among women, such as class, race, ethnicity, generation etc. have great impact on their interests and priorities (Lovenduski, 2000).

This paper presents the general picture of policy based women’s political empowerment of Pakistan as indicating factor of good governance. The research covers discussions on political literacy among the females based on knowledge, attitude and practices as determining factor of women’s political empowerment.

**Good Governance**

UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan noted that “good governance is perhaps the single most important factor in eradicating poverty and promoting development”. Good governance bases on understanding of organizational structure and its performance. The organizational structure includes the arrangements of stated purpose, rules of governance, transparency and accountability in the diversity of contexts. Good governance referred by the WB deal with economic institutions and public sector in contact to regulation and accountability. Various project sponsors include election monitoring, political party support, combating corruption, building independent judiciaries, security sector reforms, decentralization, civil and political rights, and government responsiveness (Gisselquist, 2012). The evidence suggests that good governance is a process indicating the ability of a country’s governance institutions to build power, share trust, and information throughout society.

**Women’s Political Empowerment**

The representation of women in politics and their right to vote is termed as political empowerment (Lodigiani & Salomone, 2015). Konadu (2001) accords his concern that the state of women’s participation in politics and public decision-making is disappointing. Men have always monopolized and dominated decision-making positions. Constituting almost half of the world’s population and making half of the electorate, women do have an important role to play in politics. Despite dramatic global change in women’s political representation (Paxton et al. 2006) low percentage of women exercise their right to vote (women suffrage) that is detrimental to good governance (Farood, 2003). The national context of Pakistan is favorable to women’s participation in governance. It can be referred as policy and practice based women’s political empowerment.
Since 1973 Constitution, increase in women’s representation has been observed, initially 10 seats were reserved for females in the National Assembly, in the era of General Zia (1977-1988) seats doubled for females, General Musharaf (1999-2007) in his time increased the number of women’s seats in the National Assembly to an impressive number of 60 out of total 342. Local Government level: in the first local bodies elections held in 1959 under the military dictatorship of General Ayub Khan, women were not given any representation. However, in the subsequent Local Government Ordinances of Punjab (1979), NWFP (1979), Sindh (1979) and Balochistan (1980) seats were reserved for women in local bodies. Since 2001 33% high visibility of women in the local government system raised public interest and debate on the effectiveness of women’s representation.

Women right to vote initiated with the foundation of Pakistan in 1947. Despite this fact, women are found not practicing their right to vote; reason being the socio-political culture of the country. Due to in vogue patriarchal ideologies, women themselves do not consider politics as their legitimate sphere. Politics is generally perceived by women as ‘dirty practice’. The gender divide shapes public perception of politics as a male arena. Because of social perception of women’s primary roles as mothers and wives in the reproductive sphere, the family and society least bothers to strengthen women with social construct in political terms. Women’s subordinate position in the family and society is the key ideological barrier to women’s political participation in local governance. Women are not given equal access to opportunities and resources which results in their dependent social and economic status vis-à-vis men. Women in general do not have educational qualifications, independent financial means or social capital to enter into politics. Equality of women in politics is not on any party’s agenda. They are content with flaunting their few women leaders as evidence of their progressive politics.

It is found that the shortcoming to effectuate devolution plan 2001 to enhance women political empowerment was the failure to recognize, acknowledge and accurately define the surrounding environment, including not only the policy making but also the political, informational, social, cultural, religious, and economic elements of the environment. The ground level economic, social, cultural, psychological, and ethical dynamics determine the political empowerment among the gender patterns of society, and society/state political relationship. These dynamics arise as salient features before/during/after election scenarios. Policy making to empower women politically is important factor but the political literacy defined in terms of political knowledge, attitude and practice affecting outcomes must be grappled.

**Political Literacy**

Political literacy is a major determining factor of practice based political empowerment. Political literacy is potential to understand the political processes vis-à-vis ideas of social needs; it implies the ability and willingness to use political expertise in functional manner to participate in society for good governance.
This paper utilizes cognitive mobilization theory of political literacy, conceptualized as the potential for political participation. *Education and political involvement* mobilize political literacy as an internal process. The theory dominates says that education and political involvement act upon the individual to mobilize his or her mental capabilities dealing with politics. Campbell et al (1960) reported, “The education process is one in which individuals are constantly selected for passage to higher levels on the basis of existing intellectual capacities. It is the purpose of education to develop these capacities, so that a person who moves to higher levels is likely to employ different modes of thought in evaluating objects than someone of equal initial capacity. Sufficient involvement in politics may act as a fair surrogate for education in providing more efficient modes of organizing political perceptions”.

Political literacy can be measured regarding understanding party differences, basic political concepts and facts. Erikson et al, (1995) pointed out, “Electorate must be informed to maintain popular control, political literacy is central to empirical theories of democracy.” Westholm et al (1990) defined political literacy as “the basic concepts and facts that constitute a necessary condition for comprehending the contents of public debate.” Denver and Hands (1990) defined political literacy as “the knowledge and undertaking of the political process and political issues which enables people to perform their roles as citizens effectively.” Political literacy is the potential for informed political participation. Krosnick (1990) called this concept “political expertise,” and Zaller (1992) called it “political awareness,” the extent to which an individual pays attention to politics and understands what he or she has encountered.”

**Education Mobilizes Political Literacy**

To show case education as potential for political participation the Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) results are relied for this paper (see Table 1) established in 2004 by UNICEF in collaboration with the government of Pakistan. 27% population of Balochistan is literate. Literacy rate found highest in the capital city of Balochistan; Quetta Zarghoon (59%)/Quetta Chiltan (49%) and established least (below 20%) in Dear Bugti, Musa Khail, Kohlu, JhalMagsi. The results are particular to this research design because; 15-24 years of age is recommended for MDG’s and Education for All (EFA), this age group is more responsive to changes in education scenarios spurred by global practices through international institutions transcending national borders effecting literacy of local population and they reside in urban area.
Table: 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy Rate for 10 years and above</th>
<th>Balochistan</th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Rural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Political Involvement Mobilizes Political Literacy

In this paper political involvement initials with the political concepts and facts in contact to federal form of government, political party system, vision & mission of political parties, general and local bodies elections and female suffrage. It moves to political attitude identified as acquisition of CNIC, registration in voter’s list, constituency to vote, and the interest in political issues and debates. It describes political practice as knowing the trends of female voters to vote in general and local body elections, to persuade others to vote in the elections and the willingness to participate in political campaigns and debates in future.

The purpose of the study is to highlight the practices based women’s political empowerment for good governance. The specific objectives are as follows:

1. To assess the prevalence level of political literacy in the female students of University of Balochistan, Quetta
2. To make out the gap among the three stages of political literacy identified as political knowledge, attitude and practice.

Methodology

The methods applied in this research are:

- Analytical; for securing knowledge from secondary data documented in books, journals, and reports or printed online sources of knowledge
- Empirical; for generating primary data by using structured questionnaire

Conceptual Framework to Assess Political Literacy among Female Students of University of Balochistan

Political literacy may not be conditioned only with the political expertise but it is contextual to social construct of political behavior. Collective endorsement of political
literacy vital for women’s political empowerment proved by casting informed vote or participating in discussions and activities on public issues.

The conceptual framework of this research deals with prevalence of political literacy. (see Fig. 1).

![Conceptual framework to determine the correlation between women political empowerment and political literacy](image)

Source: self-extract

Fig.1: Conceptual framework to determine the correlation between women political empowerment and political literacy

**Methods of Data Collection**

Human behavior persists diversely to respond different challenges as per their societal and personal dispositions in contact to political empowerment. The design of this study tries to assess the level of prevalence of knowledge, attitude, and practice in contact to political literacy. By Consisting three components KAP activity was held in August, 2016.

**Questionnaires**

The designed questionnaire focuses practice based women’s political empowerment. The information secured by serving this questionnaire looks innovative to be added in the
secondary data. The questions move from thought to action to get the set objectives for this study. The facts tabled in this study are based on responses to questions.

In total, 140 females students were chosen by purposive sampling to assess the political literacy in University of Balochistan. Equally 70 respondents were selected from sciences and social sciences faculties. The structured questionnaire is composed of three stages of political literacy: political knowledge, political attitude and political practice (see Annexure 1).

**Observations**

Data collected through structured questionnaires was corroborated on the basis of personal observations.

**Data Analysis**

Data was analyzed by dilating frequency distribution to tabulate average as mode of each section.

**Findings and Analyses**

The guiding principle to design this research was: the policy based women’s political empowerment cannot lead to good governance, but must be driven by political literacy mobilized through political education and involvement. It is found that *legal political empowerment* cannot work without the support of social power patterns comprising formal and informal institutions. Likewise the general or formal education to promote political expertise cannot empower the women politically unless they have the political literacy determined by the willingness of women to become the active part of decision making for collective good. Political empowerment is the real strength for good governance is shaped by the prevalence of political literacy. An informed electorate is the prerequisite of democratic practices. Political literacy capacitates the citizens to express their interests, reconcile their differences and work out their legal rights and obligations. The study describes the findings in deductive style under three headings.

**Political Knowledge**

The study estimated the political knowledge of the respondents assuming that the existence of particular knowledge may help to show better attitude. The type of political knowledge measured is correlated to their political awareness as per acquired through the knowledge provided in the formal and informal institutions (see Table 1).
The study finds the highest content of political knowledge of 79% as compared to political attitude and political practice. It deduces that 70% of respondents know that Pakistan has federal form of government because frequently people talk about center province relations. While 89% population knows Pakistan Muslim League is ruling the country because media repeats this fact time and again. People lack the knowledge regarding vision of political parties that’s why only 66% know that Tehrik e Insaf pledges to change. People know more about general elections than the local elections; the results tell us 92% people know about general elections are held after every five years while 59% claim to know the local bodies elections after every five years. 96% respondents know that they have the right to vote; interestingly only 4% sounded the negative.

**Political Attitude**

Mental involvement in political knowledge turns into political attitude based on political perceptions and experience encountered in the political environment of a society. It is likely that a person with political knowledge gets ready to express his/her political behavior. This likelihood is measured by this study by putting four questions to the respondents (see Table 2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tell us that you reflect political concepts and facts in your attitude</th>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A1 Did you acquire your CNIC in order to cast a vote?</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A2 Are you registered in the voter’s list?</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A3 Do you know your constituency to vote in elections?</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A4 Do you take interest in discussions or debates about political issues?</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The political attitude stood second in overall results of the study that is 58% compared to 79% of political knowledge and 34% of political practice. 83% population acquired the...
CNIC to vote that is encouraging. Nonetheless they secured the CNIC but only 60% know that their name is in voter’s list; it is deduced that they are not committed to vote because they cannot vote if their name is not in the voter’s list. More so they do not realize that if they do not know their constituency; they cannot vote. The results indicate regarding question 3 only 40% respondents know their constituency while the 60% response is found negative. It is likely that the respondents as voters will behave irrationally for choosing right political leadership because they do not take interest in political debates on certain socio-political issues. It is established by the study that only 48% females take interest in political discussions.

**Political Practice**

Political knowledge and political attitude shapes the political practice of the electorate depending on the status of the voter in a society and her will to function as concerned citizen to contest the ideas of social needs in political processes. Mostly it is assumed that the education sources political empowerment but this study found the political empowerment in real terms only 34% the least output compared to the 79% political knowledge and 58% political attitude (see, Table 3).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prevalence level of political practices</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1</td>
<td>Did you vote in 2013 general elections of Pakistan?</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P2</td>
<td>Did you persuade others to vote in 2013 general election of Pakistan?</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>Did you vote in 2013 local government elections of Balochistan?</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>Did you persuade others to vote in 2013 local government elections of Balochistan?</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P5</td>
<td>Do you participate in discussions/debates on political issues?</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P6</td>
<td>Are you interested in participation in political awareness campaigns in future?</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The study found only 19% of the respondents voted in the general elections of 2013 and even lesser in the local government elections as the results indicate only 14% voting trend in this perspective. The persuasion practice is found 16% in general and 14% in local government elections that indicates the less importance of local elections for the electorate. Only 14% respondents participate in political discussions/debates and 24% are interested to participate in political campaigns in future. From this study it is pertinent to point out that formal education is not a benchmark to predict the political participation for empirical democracy.
Data collected from the two categories of the students Sciences and Social Sciences. At the start of the study it was expected that in higher education students more political literacy would prevail, however primary data shows that political participation does not depend on political knowledge and political attitude but it depends on willingness to use political expertise in functional manner to participate in society for good governance, Table 3 confirms this premise.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The results of KAP survey conducted in the University of Balochistan found 67% political literacy (accumulative of knowledge, attitude and practice) among the female students. The decline analysis allow us to deduct the decline in the strength of political literacy when it moves from thought to action; sequenced as political knowledge found 79%, political attitude found 58%, and political practice found 34% (see, Figure 2).

The social science students are found more responsive to the survey, it is suggested that social sciences should be taught to science students as well to become concerned citizens as everyone is driven and affected by political governance. The specific education regarding political literacy should be dispersed by conducting workshops, as formal education is found inadequate to nurture political know how in higher education students particularly the political attitude and practice. The outcome of this study is useful because it considers the female students of higher education the potential informal source of socio-political change to effectuate the women’s political empowerment articulated as
representatives and voters in the frameworks of formal institutions of national-provincial and local governance mechanisms.

The results of this study can be used to design a strategy for political literacy by more emphasis on political attitude and political practice that can be source of actual women’s empowerment leading to good governance. Women’s political empowerment styled for governance in Pakistan is developed by policymaking while society does not support women politicians because of reasons; they cannot become a politician as politics are considered for men, they are not financially independent, their role is mostly affiliated to men as wives, they fulfill the reproductive responsibility. Therefore political literacy has to be developed and dispersed to insinuate women in civil society to obvious women political empowerment in Balochistan. The study was conducted to describe the state of the art of political literacy among the female students of University of Balochistan. If the study is extended to different universities, and regions it may produce different results.

“It is not the most the strongest of the species that survive, nor the most intelligent, but the one most responsive to change.” (Charles Darwin 1809-1882)

End Notes
3 Leadership Development for Effective Women Councilors” by Aurat Foundation in 2003 And another report titled “performance of women parliamentarians in the 12th national assembly: a five year report” (Mirza & Agha, 2009)

References


Lovenduski, Joni (ed) (2000) Feminism and Politics, Volume II.


Annexure: 1
Assessment of Political Literacy among Female Students in the University of Balochistan

Questionnaire
This questionnaire is based on the ‘Knowledge Attitude Practice’ KAP analysis method.

| Social Sciences | Sciences |

Section ‘A’ (Political knowledge)
Tell us your understanding of the political concepts and facts.

• In Pakistan we have federal form of government, Yes No
• In Pakistan ruling party is “Muslim League N.” Yes No
• In Pakistan “Pakistan TehrikeInsaf” pledges to change the political dynamics of society, Yes No
• In Pakistan general elections are held after every five years, Yes No
• In Pakistan local government elections are held after every five years, Yes No
• In Pakistan every male and female of 18 years age have right to vote except GilgitBaltistan, Yes No

Section ‘B’ (Political Attitude)
Tell us that you reflect political concepts and facts in your attitude.

• Did you acquire your CNIC in order to cast a vote? Yes No
• Are you registered in the voter’s list? Yes No
• Do you know your constituency to vote in elections? Yes No
• Do you take interest in discussions or debates about political issues? Yes No

Section ‘C’ (Political Practice)
Tell us the practices you opt to reflect your political knowledge and political attitude.

• Did you vote in 2013 general elections of Pakistan? Yes No
• Did you persuade others to vote in 2013 general election of Pakistan? Yes No
• Did you vote in 2013 local government elections of Balochistan? Yes No
• Did you persuade others to vote in 2013 local government elections of Balochistan? Yes No
• Do you participate in discussions/debates on political issues? Yes No
• Are you interested in participation in political awareness campaigns in future? Yes No

Rubeena Batool is Lecturer in the Department of Gender and Development Studies, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan.

Dr. Musarrat Jabeen is an Associate Professor in the Department of International Relations, Faculty Contemporary Studies, National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan.
The Role Of Women Labourer In Agricultural Development Of Karachi, Sindh

Rukhsana
Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Nasreen Aslam Shah
Social Work & Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Abstract

Agriculture plays a very important role in providing food and raw material for industries that is why it is acknowledged as the back bone of agrarian societies. Globally, women contributed remarkably in the agriculture sector. Pakistani women are also playing an important role in the agricultural and economic development of the country. Although Karachi is famous around the world as a large metropolis and industrial sector, but the surrounding sub-rural areas also play a big role in the agriculture sector and women are also equal contributor of this sector. The objectives of this study to highlighted the role of women labourer in agricultural development of Karachi. The researcher used purposive sampling method to collect data through interview schedule from 200 women agricultural labourer of sub-urban Karachi. The findings of the study highlights that these women work equal as men but earn less. They work eight to nine hours daily in the farm but get only 100-120 rupees per day. They do not spend their income as their own choice. In addition, they work to increase their daily livelihood along farm work. The study concludes that introduction of new technical courses and training for agriculture and market requirements would help women farmers to improve their income and financial status.

Keywords: Agriculture, Women Farm Labourer, Economic Development.
Introduction

Agriculture plays a very important role in providing food and raw material for industries that is why it is acknowledged as the back bone of agrarian societies (Wasnik, 2006). Women contributed remarkably in the agriculture sector. According to FAO (2016) report, globally women play an important and central role in agriculture including employment and food production. Worldwide women contribute 43% of the agricultural labour force, ranging from 20% in Latin America to almost 50% in sub-Saharan Africa. Women also play a significant role in agriculture production in Europe and Central Asia, and form a valuable part of the agriculture labour force. The female contribution in agricultural labour force in Central Asia is 41%, Western Europe 32%, Eastern Europe 29% and Southern Europe 45% (FAO, 2016). In China, women constitute about 70% of the agricultural labour force and perform more than 70% of farm labour. In India, 75% of all women workers are in agriculture. Even in comparison with other business segments, women’s participation in agriculture is relatively increasing (Lu, J. L., 2011).

According to human development report, agriculture is still an important source of work, with 1.34 billion people worldwide working in or seeking work in agriculture (Human development report, 2015). According to the Asian development bank sub-index score, the highest female participation in the agricultural labour force in the South Asian region is in Nepal, which is mainly an agricultural society and majority of those engaged in agriculture are women working as unpaid family labour (Asian Development Bank, 2015).

Pakistan is basically an agricultural country where 70% of its population lives in the rural and sub-rural areas and 80% are involved directly or indirectly in agriculture. In Pakistan 48.65%, the total population consists of women and the majority lives in the rural and sub rural areas. Women have limited opportunities to work in rural areas of Pakistan. Pakistan has an estimated population of 180 million, of which only 12.51 million females have an employment of some sort (Mirza, 2014).

According to Pakistan labour force survey report, all women working inside or outside home, paid or unpaid work, and with no differentiation between rural and urban areas. In
urban areas women participate in the organized and formal sectors; while in rural areas women are involved both in the organized and unorganized sectors. They predominantly work in agriculture with men, but unfortunately their work is unrecognized and did not consider valuable (Labour Force Survey, 2014-15).

Karachi is the capital of Sindh province and is known as the major industrial city of Pakistan, which contributes 70% of its income as revenue to the federal government and plays a very important role in country’s overall economy. However, it is surrounded by fertile green area where fruits, vegetable, wheat, cotton, millet and betel leaf (paan) is also cultivated. This area known as Malir is famous for its vegetables and fruits which help to fulfill a large percentage of the food requirement of the people of Karachi. Banana and wheat cultivation has stopped due to unavailability of water. Agriculture is depended upon the water from the Malir River and wells in its catchment areas. Unfortunately, due to the lifting of gravel and sand from its river bed has caused a deficiency of water and this has badly affect the agriculture in the area (Nergus, 2005). In Pakistan, most of the farmer’s families are poor and the women of these families work together with their male family members and thus increase the overall family income. The situation is the same in Karachi’s agricultural areas, where women work along with men and participate in all farming activities.

Unfortunately statistics has never displayed the real contribution of women in the agricultural sector labour force, even though they have been responsible for processing and preparing food, collecting wood for fuel and fetching water, caring of family member and maintaining their home since ancient times. They work more than men the whole day and help in increasing their family income and saving, but this is not shown in national income. Women are involved subsequently in agriculture activities but their role remains invisible and appropriate statistics are not available. In fact, women were not awarded their wages which were received by their male family members (Brownlee, 1976). Even though women work more than men; their wages are paid to the head of their household (Braybon, 1981). Inadequate distribution and lack of access to decent work not only affects women and men but is also effected by age, education, ethnicity and social status as well. In fact, agricultural workers get seasonal employment for about half a year and often they have to migrate for employment. During the off-season, they found daily wages job in construction, labourer and, helper. However, women could not move anywhere. Although a large majority 60% of rural women are engaged in agriculture and allied activities but receive only 20.8% of the total income, while the remaining 69% get 40% because they are rural men (Hanif, 2015).

In rural areas women usually work for 16 hours a day, which includes not only field work but also household chores, fetching of drinking water and fuel for cooking. These poor women further suffer from victimization, manipulation and exploitation just because they are totally illiterate and unorganized. Being very poor and needy, they do not have any
other option but to accept work at very low wages and long hours. To make matters worse, these women also don’t have equal access to quality education, adequate health facilities and well paid job opportunities.

**Objectives**

The agricultural sector is the only area of work where women have access to without any social barriers imposed on them. The purpose of this research is to identify the role of women in the field of agriculture in selected areas of Karachi. This role is equally important, if not more than that of men; therefore, they deserve recognition which unfortunately is not given to them.

In this research, the researcher is trying to identify the economic condition of these women working in the agricultural field. It has been observed that despite working hard in the field, these women remain deprived and sub-servant to men in financial matters. The study was also designed to analyse the economic contribution of agricultural working women in household income and also examine the pattern of expenses and savings of agricultural women labour in the rural areas of Karachi.

**Review of Literature**

Presence of women in economic activities is not only important for raising the family income and reducing poverty but also is an important contributor to the economic development of every country. The number of women participating in the labour force is not the only concern but also their wages on equal basis. Globally women are still getting less than 78% of the wages given to men for the same labour and in similar situation in both the developed and the developing countries. Mostly women participate economically in the informal sector and in many parts of the world provide 70% of the agriculture labour and produce 90% of the food (Claros, 2005).

Many researches provide evidence that women participation in various agricultural activities having a complementary role sharing activities related to crop production and livestock production and management. Rural women actively participate in farming and related activities like livestock caring management and food processing. (Franzel-1992, Sharma- 1997, Mamun-ur-Rashid, Muhammad & Qijie- 2012, Arshad et al. 2013).

In fact, agricultural workers get seasonal employment for about half a year and often they have to migrate for employment. During the off-season, they found daily wages job in construction, labourer and, helper. However, women could not move anywhere. Although a large majority 60% of rural women are engaged in agriculture and allied activities but receive only 20.8% of the total income, while the remaining 69% get 40% because they are rural men (Hanif, 2015).
According to research study in Uganda, agriculture is the main source of income for rural households. It is also crucial and main profession of women and a huge majority 90% of rural women out of 72% of the total employed in agricultural field while only 53% rural men contribute in farming. The study highlighted some facts that women tend to be involved at all stages with men becoming more active close to market time but men are responsible for cash crops, and if unfortunately crops becomes unprofitable men tend to loss interest in it, and women may take over its control and look after it. Men control earnings and all profits (FAO, 2000).

In India, women are active participant and important contributors in the agricultural sector. Most of the women are energetic participants in non-agricultural activities, which comprise household-industries and private sector. Women participation in agriculture is increasing with time and women are now acknowledged with the status of “agricultural worker” but still faced discrimination on wages and working status (Ghosh, 2014). In Pakistan a vast majority of women engaged with agriculture and allied activities. According to labour force survey 2015 of Pakistan 73% female and 33% male participated in agriculture/forestry and fishing sector which 42% of total labour force participation of both sexes (IFSP, 2015).

Pakistani women works at the same time as mother, nurse, household employment, social worker, despite this her economic contribution is unrecognized and unappreciated. Both genders equally contributed as individuals in productivity but one gender faced bias in economic and social level. He added that most development planning is based on physical input and outputs which ignored the perspective of human resources and the social dimensions of agriculture. Instead of this make plans for all humanity (Zafar, 2003).

The rural farm women make all these products for export level as well, but are not aware of what the market needs and their value, either national or international level. They need to increase their income through non-farm income generating activities. Women are involved in off-farm income generating activities while also maintaining responsibility for family nutrition, food security and child care and bear the burden of farming duties along with household task (Abbasi S., 2005).

Arshad pointed out these facts in ‘The economic contribution of Pakistani women through their unpaid labour’ 2008. She disclosed that women’s countless involvement, as seen in household activities that includes preparing food, washing and ironing clothes, pick and drop of children for education, daily shopping for groceries, assisting children with their studies, caring for family members and besides all these activities, they also have to help in the economic well-being of their family (Arshad, 2008). Gul Hussan conducted a study in Karachi; he concluded that women actively participated in all farm activities along with their regular household responsibilities. They work without any
wages even when they are owners of land or share croppers. It is a fact that women worked better as compared to men. Mostly women are involved in crop harvesting like chillies, tomatoes, cauliflower, peas and falsa. Women also worked in the fields like sowing, transplantation and harvesting while ploughing, irrigation, preparing of land were the male responsibilities (Hassan, 2008).

Doreen Stabinsky, provided evidence livestock in the agricultural production in the region is undertaken by small holders, on very small land holdings, by women, with a remarkable dependence on fisheries for protein in several countries, and dependence on livestock for draft power, manure, milk, and food security and income as well. Besides farming livestock is also a major source of income in the region. The sale of livestock and related products is an important source of income for Nepal, 44.4 percent in the mountain areas and 47.6 percent in the rural hills collect cash income from livestock. In Bhutan, about 10 percent of the country’s population is dependent on yak based production and almost 86 percent farmers owned livestock. Farmers used animals for cultivation and transport and 68 percent household own different type of livestock, in Afghanistan (Stabinsky, 2014).

Similar as in our Pakistan around 49.1 percent to overall agriculture value added and about 11.4 percent to national GDP accumulate by livestock. Farmers have improved their livelihood through livestock farming. It not only holds a potential as an income generating source but also is a viable solution to the poverty, malnutrition, hunger and a sustainable income generating activity. It is the prime income generating source to support and uplift for farmers by means of production (Junaid, 2015).

**Methodology**

The present study is an exploratory and basic descriptive research. For this research, the universe of population is the agricultural areas of Karachi. First of all, those rural areas of Karachi were identified, where agriculture or farming is done which includes: Malir, Gadap and Bin Qasim towns. In the period of local government these areas were distributed in towns but now the government has changed the local body system into districts and the chosen universe is now called as district Malir. In these areas fruits, vegetables, cotton and feed are grown and the farming of animals is done. Along with men a large number of women are also engaged in work in these fields.

The research in hand has been completed using the quantitative and qualitative research methods. Questionnaire is necessary for both quantitative and qualitative researches. The questionnaire composed of 80 questions which are based on both open ended and closed ended questions. In open-ended questionnaire, the respondents are able to respond as per their own will, whereas in close ended questionnaire, the respondents are subjected to
restricted options. The questionnaire covers the various aspects of their lives and is designed to seek information regarding the following key areas of this research:

- Women agricultural labours personal profile like age, marital status, education number of children etc.
- Family profile of the working labour- nuclear or join, head of the family, family income, housing and living conditions.
- Work environment, wages and mode of wages, allied activities, working hour, holidays and extra allowances.
- Experiences of harassment at work place and within home verbal, physical and sexual violence.

For qualitative data of this research conducted in-depth interviews with some women. Case studies require a lot of time, detailed questioning during the time the women were busy working in the fields so it became even more tedious and difficult. That is why the researcher had to face a lot of difficulties in the completion of these case studies. Interviewing these working women during their fieldwork meant interruption in their work, which further resulted in loss of their wages. Interviewing them at home was also difficult as their domestic chores like looking after children, cooking and cleaning of their house, kept them busy and kept hindering the interviews. Five case studies are included in this research. Total 200 women, in agricultural areas of Karachi, who are connected to agriculture, were interviewed by using interviewing schedule. The researcher visited the agricultural areas of Karachi. Some interviews were conducted in homes, whereas, some in the fields or gardens of those areas. Once the data had been collected for the current study, the next step was its analysis. The conclusions are based on the results of data analysis. Statistical procedures were used in assembling, classifying, tabulating, and summarizing the numerical data.

**Results and Discussion**

Women constitute half of the population and their development reflects on the progress of a society. The status of women in a society is measured in terms of their level of income, employment, health, education as well as their role within family, community and society. Women are an energetic and productive work force in the Pakistan’s economy. The weak economic condition of a family demands that their women to go to work and play a role for increasing the income of the family. In selected rural areas of Karachi women were found to be multi-functional; working in houses, doing daily house hold chores, looking after livestock along with other income generating work like embroidery, stitching and making rillies. The present study is based on the interviews conducted with 200 agricultural women labourer.
Table: 1

Distribution of the respondents according to their age groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age of respondents</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15 to 20</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 to 25</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 to 30</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 to 35</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 to 40</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 to 45</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 to 50</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 50</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Above table is presenting the age of respondents. The eight age groups presented in the table number one the largest is of 31-35 years while 15-20 is the shortest, 133 respondents out of 200 fall in the range of 31 to above 50, it means 66.5 respondent over the age of 30. In this age most of the women are married, have four or five children, work on the farm, have house chores and child care as well. These figures identifies that there is no specific age among agricultural women worker, as women of all ages work in the field.

Table: 2

Distribution of respondent according to their academic qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Qualification</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Education is an important factor and helpful source for human development. Education helps in making the right decisions and in the empowerment of women. A good saying is that when you educate a man you only educate a person, while if you educate a woman, you educate a whole family. When a woman is educated they play an important role within the family, community and national economy. Educated women transfers in their children good manners, values, strong moral attributes and develop a healthy environment. But unfortunately, we do not give priority to education, especially girl’s education. Primary data shows that 97% of the women respondents are illiterate, while only 2.5% passed primary school and one passed middle school. Comparing this data with the literacy rate in Pakistan is very depressing, as the rural areas of a metropolitan city is the same as of any village. There are many reasons for this, such as lack of government schools, non-availability of male and female teachers and poverty. In most families, girl’s education is not allowed, while in some families education is not considered necessary for both girls and boys.
Table: 3
Distribution of the respondents according to their marital status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Marriage is a social contract which allows a man and women to live together and raise their family. The marriage is an important identification and recognition for both male and female of their new relationship with in the community. Marriage is a combination of social norms as well as religious obligation. It is also a very important ceremony in Pakistani society and married women are allowed greater freedom of mobility and work as compare to unmarried women. Child marriage is very common especially in rural areas. This happens even though the government has passed the child marriage restraint act and has advertised and campaigned for the awareness about this law. Table 03 shows that 64% of the women respondents were married, 21% unmarried, 10% divorced and 5% respondents widowed. The data also shows that a large number of women are working after marriage due to poverty as well as they want to share the financial burden of their husbands and families. Observation during this research shows that child marriage is not only common in the rural areas but also prevalent in the city as well. Most of these women got married at an early age of 14 to 15 years which means that the average marriage age in Pakistan has increased. This is the most fertile age of population growth. The changes in marriage patterns have a direct impact on fertility and population growth rate.

Table: 4
Distribution of respondents according to family structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family structure</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joint</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Joint family system is very common especially in rural or agricultural areas but due to modernization some want and like to have a nuclear family system. Table number 04 shows that 65% respondents live in a joint family system while 35% live as single families. Usually in urban areas trends are changing and most people preferred to live in a single family; but in rural areas the trend has not changed much. People living in a joint family system as it also support agricultural work. Living in a joint family system, women have more responsibilities and are beholden to their in-laws. Although women’s situations more or less same in these areas but those women who live in a single family system, have influence over their husbands and can do something of their own choices.
Table 5
Distribution of respondents according to their family monthly income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family income</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5000 – 7000</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7001 - 9000</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9001 – 11000</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above - 11000</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows that 53% respondents have a very low income of only seven to nine thousand rupees and in these days, it’s very difficult to meet their basic needs with such a very low income, while only 3% have income above 11000. Most people are living below the poverty line in Pakistan and these facts also highlighted in the millennium development goal of elimination poverty by 2013 by the government of Pakistan, which unfortunately has not been achieved.

Table 6
Distribution of respondents according to their personal monthly income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal monthly income</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000 - 3000</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3001 - 4000</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001 - 5000</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above - 5000</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women belong to the poorest income group in our society and even though they work hard, their income is very low. Facts show a very clear picture of women’s financial status. 51% respondents earn about three thousand monthly, 41% earn four to five thousand monthly, while only 7% respondents earn five thousand monthly. In 2011 the government of Pakistan fixed the minimum monthly salary at twelfth thousand for labourers but unfortunately this is not been implemented and the government is not doing anything about it.

Table 7
Distribution of respondents according to when they started agriculture work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Started agriculture work</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From childhood</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During studies</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After marriage</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7 shows that 83% respondents started working since childhood, 16% started working after marriage. This table indicates the prevalence of child labour is common in our society and a large number of respondents started working from their childhood. Due to engagement in paid work at an early age they could not go to school for an education. Their work helped in contributing to the family income.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work in the field</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table shows that most respondents, 76% work the year round on the farm while 24% do not work whole year. In off season, they do some other work like embroidery, croshiya, rilly making, and any other work that is available, but sometimes when they do not get any work or job, they faced critical situation and it is very difficult for them to fulfill their daily needs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work along with agriculture</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: 8

Table: 9

As per data 58% respondents do other works along with agricultural work while 42% does not any other work along agricultural work. Data shows that 56% respondent do embroidery, making Rilly and croshiya along with agricultural work, 22.4% do animal
husbandry, 15.5% are involved in indifferent works such as embroidery, croshiya, rilly, aalo chaat, chhana chaat, aalo chawall and sharbat. Data shows that 40.5% respondents do not do other work because they do not have any other skills, 35.7% respondents manage within their income while 23.8% do not have permission for other work. Women’s participation in agriculture is common and acceptable but in other sectors many families do not allow it. In rural or sub-rural areas women’s mobility is very limited; they do not have easy access to markets and cannot sell their products themselves. Their male family members run the marketing system and they cannot inform the women about new designs or market requirement. These skilled women do not get the right price although their work is very precious and valuable. There are few women who in charge of the whole process.

Table: 10
Distribution of respondents according to whether do they sell home based food item

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sell home based food item</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>27 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>73 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Home based items</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pickle &amp; chattni</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>41 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dry and sell vegetables</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20.4 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making jam</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13.0 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chhana chat</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18.5 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aalo chat</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.4 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>100 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 73% respondents they do not sell home based item while 27% respondents make and sell home based items and increase their income. Data shows that 41% respondents make pickle and chattni with mangoes at home for sale, 20.4% sell dry vegetable, and 18.5% make and sell chana chat. Along with their agriculture work, these women make these home-based items and their children sell outside and sometimes they sell at home themselves. Some women make these items on special occasion or holidays like Friday, Sunday, 14 August, Eid-ul-Fitr and Ramzan. These food items are very popular and profitable business in Karachi but these respondents live in poor localities and most of these people in their surrounding are from the same socio-economic group, that’s why they do not earn much income from their products.
Table: 11

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spend money as their own choice</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If yes then how

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food / household expensive</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothes or makeup</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On their children</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>35.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On their relatives</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If not then why

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Submitted to head of the house</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When asked about spending income that 33% respondents do not spend their income to their own choice while 67% spend their income on their own choice. Poverty is very common in the farm women and men as well. They do not have any choice except to fulfill their basic needs. So both genders are responsible for all household expenses. Data shows that in our society if women are working, they do not spend their income on themselves but prefer to spend it on their children or on their home. 50% respondents spend their income for food and household expensive, 35.5% spend it on their children, and 8.2% spend it on relatives, while only 5.9% spend on their own needs like clothing.

Table: 12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Access to wages of farm work</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>67.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>32.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If not then why

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family receive wages</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband receive wages</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>75.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 67.5% respondents receive wages for their work, while 32.5% do not receive separate wages for their work, as their wages are included in whole family wages. The figure indicates that women do not have access and control on their wages 75.4% respondent’s wages were received by their husbands and 24.6% by their families. This
reflects as a picture of women’s subordination or oppression. Women are not getting their work income although the work hard it. Researcher observed that in some areas where the whole family works together male, female and children, the women and children do not receive their wages; but the total amount is received by the head of the family, usually a male person.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Daily working hours</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 hours</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 hours</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>62.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 9 hours</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A large number of respondents, 62.5% for 9 hours, and 22.5% work for more than 9 hours while only 15% respondents work for 8 hours. Farm workers leave home at 6am or 6.30am, they have to reach the farm by 7 am as the distance from house to farm is a 30 or 40 minutes’ walk. They go to work by foot and no transport is used for this purpose. They work on the farm from 7am to 01pm with a break of one hour for lunch for which they go back home.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Earn equal wages as men</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>200</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to table 14 quantitative data gives a very clear picture of discrimination against women. In the first wave of women liberation movement, the feminist struggled for equal wages, now after a century the situation has not changed; women are still working for lower wages than men. All 100% respondent are not getting equal wages as men. This shows the control and domination on women’s perception because even though she does the same type of work as men, she is treated unequally and receives lower wages than men. Women do not protest against this discrimination as they think that males do more and harder work as compared to them.
Conclusions

This research paper explored the role of women agricultural laborers in development of agriculture of Karachi. Facts have proved that women participation is very essential for the development of the country. Women of Karachi continuously play an important role in the development of the city and country as well. This study also highlighted the participation of women in agricultural activities along household responsibilities. They play a vital role in agricultural activities such as preparation of land, crop production, managing and caring livestock and poultry. These women work in the field with male and actively participate in cotton picking, harvest and picking of vegetables and fruit. They also take care of animals such as feeding, milking, bathing and nursing. Almost women work eight or nine hours outside of home but they earn only three to five thousand monthly, gender wage gap affect women financial condition. The research paper also focused the obstacles which are the barrier to women agricultural labourers economically strong such as unpaid and care work in family they do not have much time to involve in paid work. They mostly work done without any wages. They could not involve in income-generating activities regularly. Women agricultural labourer exploited economically because they work hard both sides farm and home but receive earning very low. As per finding of this research in agricultural areas, women face barriers in land ownership, access to technological training, education and decision-making powers. It is a known fact that lack of education and technical skills has limited the employment opportunities for rural women and resulting in their increased level of poverty. Through education and development of technological skills would ensure an increase in employment opportunities and improve their status within the family and society.

Recommendations

The government, well-aware of the economic importance of the agricultural sector devises and implements policies for its productivity but these reforms did not come up with any significant results; as their policies are not backed by gender segregated data and have no provisions to facilitate the female productivity in agriculture.

1. Strengthen women farmer by providing them skill development trainings.
2. Highlighted the women participation in agriculture business and create new opportunities for them.
3. Introduce new technical courses in training institutes for women related to agriculture and market requirements such as usage of machinery, driving and computer skills.
4. Development of an irrigation system is needed to increase, both agricultural production and employment opportunities for women in agriculture and allied activities.
5. Establish a minimum daily wage act for women farmers and ensure its implementation.
6. Introduced marketing techniques and strategy to these women to develop their own business and increase their income.

References


FAO (2016). Climate Change, Agriculture and Food Security, FAO.

FAO. (2015). Women in agriculture of Pakistan, Islamabad, Pakistan, Food and Agriculture Organization, pp.17-18


---

**Ms. Rukhsana** is Teaching Assistant in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.

**Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah** is Meritorious Professor: Chairperson in the Department of Social Work and Director, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.
An Analytical Study On Role Of Trade Association For Women Entrepreneurship And Their Capacity Building

Shazia Sharafat
Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Nasreen Aslam Shah
Social Work & Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Abstract

The chambers and associations in Pakistan are mainly represented by men. Meantime the representation of women entrepreneurs is also gaining momentum. Women entrepreneurs have formed chambers in the country to explore potentials and create platform for resolving issues arising during undertaking businesses. The study identified that women have potential and are working hard. Yet they are at takeoff position to get success in expanding the business set-up and getting recognition. The government has brought some changes in the rules for establishing trade organization and allowed formation of separate chambers for women considering their participation in different businesses. It is observed that some efforts have been made by women members under the umbrella of Federation of Pakistan Chambers of Commerce and Industry (FPCCI) to organize conferences and roundtables to promote and explore business skill of women. The FPCCI, as the apex trade body of the country, organized national and international exhibitions in which they have given equal opportunities to women as men. However, women entrepreneurs are still facing problems due to lack of business knowledge while operating business.

Keywords: Business Associations, Chambers of Commerce and Industry, Women Entrepreneurs.
Introduction

The history tells women’s role restricted to family and bound to perform their duties being a mother or homemaker. Men’s role has been defined as bread earner and guardian of house. In short, a man brings goods while a woman converts for consumption purpose (Rani, 1996). (Agalgatti & Bhooshan, 2008) this traditional concept however changed with urbanization that increased the role of women. It changed the family structure with more importance to a woman due to education and participation in financial and monetary affairs of a house. In some instances women replaced men for managing household. Mechanization and automation are the major boost for women, which created opportunities for them, as such reduced the physical work that were meant for men. Smith (2013) stated that association of businessmen or traders can be defined as collective body of individuals having common interests in specific industry or sector of an economy.

Singla (2009-2010) showed that the trade and association conduct surveys and make publications for benefit of their members to understand the market needs. Simply, the functions of trade and associations can be defined as: to raise issues against government policies that are against businesses; compiling updated information and other resources and subsequently disseminate their members; imparting training to members for meeting challenges; and organize trade fairs to showcase their products. Busquets (2006) viewed that trade bodies have not only formed by major manufacturing sectors but the Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) have also set up their associations to show their presence in local and international businesses. Raghavan (1995) noticed that the free market economy and establishment of World Trade Organization (WTO) prompted the business community to form group at regional level for the improvement of trade. Such groups can be identified such as North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), Association of Southeast Asian Nation (ASEAN) and South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC.) As per available record of modern world, chambers were formally formed in Jersey and New York in 1767 that followed thousands of chambers and industries around the globe (Bennett, 2011). The list of trade bodies has expanded in short span of time and as per international chamber of commerce it has 12,000 registered members.

In Pakistan, Trade Organization Ordinance (TOO) was passed through a presidential order on December 31, 2006 in which it is permitted to create separate women’s chambers and commerce and industry. Moreover, after the formation of women chambers, separate laws were drafted into the Trade Organizations Act (TOA), 2013, which are similar to men.
According to Trade Organizations Rule (TOR) 2013, “women chamber” means a chamber of commerce and industry to represent women entrepreneurs as defined in clause (c) of subsection (2) of section 3; and “woman entrepreneur” means: (Ministry of Commerce, 2013)

(i) A sole proprietorship where the proprietor is a female; or
(ii) A partnership where the majority partners are female; or
(iii) An association of any kind where majority of its persons are female; or
(iv) A company where majority shares are held by females.

At present about nine women chambers have been established but those are also failed to make any pressure group for resolving issues of businesswomen. There must be reasons that women representing these chambers are under influence of male business leaders especially in their election for the top slot.

The modern world has recognized the importance of women and their role in economic growth. The contribution of women in developed nations has increased manifold. However, women are struggling in developing and under developed economies to show their presence. In recent past the government of Pakistan amended many laws to give protection to women at workplace and increase opportunities in mainstream business for women entrepreneurs. The private sector is also playing its role by giving due importance to women empowerment. Chambers and association play a pivotal role in resolving business issues of same interest group.

However, there are reasons to conduct the research because the trade bodies are not so far much successful in empowering women in activities related to trade and industry besides identifying causes of failure in cases of selected group of women and also analyze success in similar manner. Major objectives in the research are to make women fully aware about formation of chambers and associations and their role in business growth. In fact, to find such women entrepreneurs who have established separate women chambers across the country. Women should get benefit of such platform where they could discuss business issues or trade related problems with business community in order to resolve it professionally. The united groups of women in associations could advocate or oppose policies and legislations of their economic interest to the government. The collected data of women entrepreneurs must be circulated to statistical departments for adding women population in business sector of the country. It will not only create national businesswomen database but also show the improved strength of female-labour force.

The FPCCI being the national chamber has power to influence the policies of the government related to the economic activities of the country besides promoting gender equality for the advancement of trade and business. Recently, the business leaders have chosen women entrepreneurs as their managing committee members for having influence to empower the women related business activities. The apex body also conducted research on all the sectors of the economy for identifying the issues but it is unfortunate that despite tall claims of the FPCCI there was not a single working paper available
related to women business activities (FPCCI, 2014). On the other hand, the Karachi Chamber of Commerce and Industry (KCCI), the largest chamber in the country and representing the metropolitan city that contributes about 68% of the revenue to the national exchequer (Waleed, 2015). There are nine women chambers have been established so far but those are also failed to form any pressure group for resolving issues of businesswomen. There must be reason that women representing these chambers are under influence of male business leaders especially in their election for the top slot.

**Woman Entrepreneur**

Scholars are unable to make a suitable definition of ‘entrepreneur’, which can explain the meaning of this word. The term for women is defined as a woman who is capable of controlling business setup and family affairs at the same time.

**Trade Bodies and Chambers of Commerce and Industry**

An association is a group of businessmen and businesswomen to protect the common interests of its members. Chambers of commerce and industry are formed at district to national levels. A member of a trade body gets benefits for enhanced business activity. Investopedia (2014) defines: “Chamber of commerce plays an important role in local municipalities in promoting business activity and representing chamber members. At least at the local level, chamber of commerce members often meet to discuss and attempt to shape policy that relates to the business and overall economic environment. Members also receive the distinction of being a preferred local vendor, as well as listing on various municipal websites and literature.”

**Research Questions**

1. The basic research question of the study is: Are trade bodies helpful to women entrepreneurs when there are specific provisions in prevailing trade laws for women. How they get facilitated or availed such opportunities? To what extent trade bodies assisting businesswomen?
2. The second research question of the study is: changing economic conditions are leading women towards entrepreneurship. In many studies it has been highlighted that due to less education or confinement of women also a reason for working in a house, in traditional societies of Pakistan.

**Objectives of the Research**

- To explore potential women entrepreneurs with having skills to establish chambers and associations.
- To aware women entrepreneurs about the power of chambers and associations.
To suggest relevant statistical bodies to circulate relative field statistics to all stakeholders.
To empower women entrepreneurs for considering, supporting or opposing legislative or other government measures effective for an economic interest of women entrepreneurs.

Hypotheses

1. Role of trade associations is helpful in promoting business of women.
2. The changing economic conditions lead women towards entrepreneurship.

Review of Literature

Historic researches have highlighted that rising women entrepreneurship is emerged from gender awareness and increasing pressure of women’s movements. The enhanced women participation in economic activities led to creation of business chambers across the globe. The creation of business association resulted in importance of women in policy making. The experiences of the research findings are that there is prime importance to include women at different fora and bring at par with men (Stange, 2011).

It is also observed that the informal economic sectors are also major drivers in rising women entrepreneurship. The small scale, micro and SMEs business are one of those. The past literary work revealed that women have close connection with informal sector and lower income. To estimates about 50 percent of women are self-employed in the developing economies (Bahramitash & Espahani, 2016). International Finance Corporation (2004) estimates of MSMEs owned by women provide a similar picture and suggest that 40 percent women have owned out of 270 million of business units around the world. It is identified that most of women were engaged in the informal sector mainly associated with home based activities.

The research paper of OECD (2012) mentioned that the importance of business chambers has attracted women to have association in order function as an independent entity. The association with chambers attracts women because of linkages of those trade bodies with the government in negotiating the demands.

However, the women entrepreneurs are not successful so far from taking much assistance from business associations. The trade bodies are providing assistance to women entrepreneurs in displaying their products at fairs and exhibitions. Some of the serious work to empower women has come from public sector side, which is assisting women in micro and cottage industries and supporting them in their capacity building. (Commonwealth, 2002).
Entrepreneurial researches said that women have achieved the current status of their presence in economic growth after an untiring struggle. The contribution of women in developed nations has increased manifold. Their struggle in developing and least developed economies to show their presence is still continue.

Meanwhile, Grob (1992) stated that history has given importance to a woman as wife, mother and child-rearing. The history has also restricted women going from outside and must obey whatever their male relatives say. This makes women as submissive gender of that time. Women were not independent to their decisions.

Similarly, Simon de Beauvoir in her book ‘The Second Sex’ explains women as dependent to men not only by slavery but by all means and both the sexes were never attained rights on equal basis. In present world women are remained not able to take decision individually and independently despite the fact that the situation has started to change. Woman does not share the equality in legal rights to men in fact, in job markets men are highly paid than women (Duiker and Spielvogel, 2010).

Many of feminist researches has revealed that the great achievements in the history mainly attributed to men because of their authority on writing the history and women contribution was mostly neglected. In some cases women were given fair treatment but they were mostly confined to ignorable position (Pushkareva, 1997). Women were supposed to do household work besides working in farms and undertaking other manufacturing activities, which left no spare time in their lives. Men, in contrast, meant for war games and their almost all the activities related to it (Ember, 2003).

Forestell (2014) identified that the nineteenth century gave women rights to emerge in entire social life from politics to legal reforms, which enabled them to recognize themselves internationally. Kahle (2005) demonstrated that it is bitter reality of the history that women of eighteenth and nineteenth centuries had no civil rights under the law and they were treated as end of their rights after marriage and even they were not allowed to declare will or raise voice for their wages. Partly end of nineteenth century and start of twentieth century highlighted the women’s rights which also included the participation of women in trade unions for raising their voices for demanding rights at workplaces (Goodwin & Jasper, 2009).

In times of renaissance, many writers came up with women movements in order to attain equality and equity in the lives at all segments of life. Likewise, Mary Wollstonecraft published the first feminist treaties in the UK. ‘A vindication on the rights of women in 1792, she supported the social and moral equality of the sexes. In the US leading political figures also supported the campaign of women voting rights. A Vindication on the Rights of Women in 1792 termed that ‘Declaration of the Rights of Women’ as a wok which
could be called feminist. First wave of feminism can be referred to period of nineteenth and early twentieth century in the UK and the US which mainly stressed upon the rights of women’s suffrage.

Meanwhile, feminists in the year 1960 had started demanding women rights which period is known for beginning of second wave of feminist movement. The movement primarily focused on color, disability and transgendered people. Women had also been mobilized in opposition to the military government of General Augusto Pinochet 1970. In Chile, similar to other Latin American women campaigned for eradicating abuses, poverty, and sexism (Banaszak, 2006).

The third wave of women’s movement has been attributed to present time. The movement that was started in late twentieth century has been believed to be revived. Rory Dicker and Alison Piepmeier were professors of women’s studies, suggested that the third wave of feminism should involve women into politics, capitalism and information technology. Third wavers termed the movement for achievements and called failures of second wave (Rory Dicker and Alison Piepmeier cited in Richard, 2008).

Research findings have highlighted that the women of industrialization had been viewed in both ways in terms of gainers and losers. The employment of women has been viewed that industrialization had opened wider job opportunities and liberation (Verdon, 2002). In contrast, another view emerged on account of pessimism, that it had reduced opportunities for women work due to high demand of physical power, and leaving women to low-paid work and dependency on men.

Whereas, the country’s chambers of commerce and other development agencies such as United Nation Development Programme (UNDP), International Chambers of Commerce and Industry (ICCI) have launched many projects to strengthen businesswomen through arranging workshops; conferences in order to enhance marketing skills; exporting capacities for small business oriented women entrepreneurs. UNDP and United Arab Emirates (UAE) have conducted a study in Gulf States where they focus on awareness about roles; functions; and powers of chambers; in such a way that women entrepreneurs can use maximum opportunities in business chambers; associations; trade bodies. The organizations are guiding potential women entrepreneurs for establishing their own separate business chambers (UNDP, 2003).

The OECD had arranged conference on “Women Entrepreneurship in SMEs” in 1997, where different scholars and businesspersons have discussed about exploring ways to develop network of women entrepreneurs; technology diffusion; access to markets and encourage women to participate in business organization. Through all cooperation’s of business institutions trade and business related data must disseminate on regular basis to
women (OECD, 1998). This dissertation will find out that to which extent measures have picked up momentum for advancement of women in business and finance.

However, Mumba (2014) research study on “Empowering Women Enterprises in Africa: Investigating Information Access & Use of Information & Communication Technologies by women-owned enterprises in Zambia” identified that women entrepreneurs are lagging from business education and Information Communication Technologies (ICTs) to build strong business and business network. He believed that government should facilitate them or other stakeholders of the business community for their success because they have potential to run business independently. But due to lack of business knowledge or ICTs they are not growing at faster pace. He said in his research that women entrepreneurs should learn all such business knowledge from formal sources. It is envisaged that if businesswomen join trade bodies or any other formal business organization then business information and ICTs handling skills may become familiar and with the passage of time they may become professional businesswomen.

The research of Makombe (2006) on “Women Entrepreneurship Development & Empowerment in Tanzania: The Case of SIDO/UNIDO-Supported women micro-enterprises in the food processing sector” unveiled that Small Industries Development Organization (SIDO) and United Nations International Development Organization (UNIDO) are helping towards economic empowerment of businesswomen and explained factors that there should be liberty for using their own income; should contribute in household expenses; should have powers to own assets; should be a part of trade associations; should participate in trade fairs and must be aware about their legal rights. The findings identified that entrepreneurial trainings or business education sessions for women are fruitful in development of entrepreneurial activities. Women presence in trade associations and trade fairs are indications of economic empowerment. It gives impression that they need permanent assistance or shelter of advisory of any independent business/trade body in further development of business.

It is identified that women entrepreneurs are facing many problems such as financial issues; lack of management skills and so on but instead of this “There are some legal/administrative factors including access to policy maker, high amount of taxes and interest; bureaucracy and red tapes and overall legal regulatory environment.” There must be reforms in business laws, incentives, relief or ease in policies or taxes, microfinance should be available on easy interests for women entrepreneurs in order to bear the cost of doing business. In this regard, there must be a separate platform for women entrepreneurs for raising their voices. The study further added that human capital having zero knowledge has nothing do with the production (Wube, 2010). So, it is important that there must be trained labour force for producing goods and services. It is worthy that production must be innovative or different at feasible cost as there is high competition in domestic and international markets.
Many scholars argued that women’s position mainly benefited capitalism and capitalists (McGuire, 1994). The capitalists having benefits by creating huge job market for women at lower wages. Marsh (2008) cited Natasha Walter - the new feminism (1998) who has criticized postmodern and radical feminism and presented a different view of contemporary feminism. She believes that common cause exists for women to unite to achieve equality. According to her, many British women think feminism as convincing men are the biggest oppressors. Pakistani rural women groups working in agriculture economy and urban women working in private sector as cheap labourers. The Express Tribune (2015) news article stated that according to ILO estimates women earnings about 38.5% less than men in such sectors. It is oppression by the capitalists; even not providing any opportunities for growth and development of women. It is observed that women do not have any other option besides start some home-based works which need extra capital to start their own at small levels in order to get rid of working on low wages.

Challenges to Women Entrepreneurs

Dr. Vural (2011) mentioned that the rising population of educated women indicates the more women entrepreneurs. According to the data of Pakistan Education Statistics 2010-2011, boys’ enrolment in degree education was at 49.2% and girls’ enrolment was at 50.58% (Bhargava et al, 2007). However, socio-economy with the overlay of Islam, women are facing challenges while participating economic activities. Presently, the prime challenges for women included cash flows, lack of business management skills, unaware with government regulations (Hagan, 1998).

Lack of access finance to start a business is the major hurdle for women entrepreneurs. A research conducted by the International Finance Corporation (IFC) in the Middle East and North African countries (MENA) revealed that women entrepreneurs at small levels start their business from personal resources (IFC, 2004). Obtaining loans from formal banking channels is one of the milestones for women, as majority of them are not aware about the banking finance. Another study unveiled that Pakistani women also lack control over capital, land and business premises (World Bank, 2012).

These reasons limit women to the lower level investment and remained under capitalized system besides no urge to avail loan schemes of government regarding financing on easy conditions. In this state they are not able to reach their growth potential (Economist Publication, 2007). It is also observed that women entrepreneurs face discrimination from bankers. Further many women due to non-availability of collateral, they do not approach banks (Nirjar, 2011).

Roomi identified “Challenges faced by women entrepreneurs, included: access to capital/finance; lack of business management skills; government policy; registration; utility connections; tax harassment; lack of technical skills; purchase of raw material; availability of market; access to information technology.” Roomi also identified: “Gender
related challenges faced by women in Pakistan included: spatial mobility; choice of business; support of family; networking and trust building; acceptance of women’s authority; credibility (employees, customers, and suppliers); fear of failure; and time distribution between family and business (Roomi cited in Guy, 2008).”

Private Sector Fostering Role of Women Entrepreneurship in Pakistan

Directorate General of Trade Organizations (DGTO)

DGTO is an authority works under Ministry of Commerce, Government of Pakistan. It issues license to trade organizations/chambers of commerce/ associations and regulates trade policies. DGTO (2013) ensures that trade bodies must be supportive for all business sectors at all levels. In Trade Organization Act 2013 they explained the criteria for the formation of separate women chambers in the country.

Role of FPCCI in Development of Women Entrepreneurship

Lodhi (2015) highlighted that FPCCI is actively participating in advocacy for women entrepreneurship development and facilitation for their inclusion in trade and industry especially in making part of delegations for participating local and international exhibitions. In 2001, FPCCI launched initiatives for women entrepreneurs to bring them in mainstream business and established a standing committee for promotion of women entrepreneurs. In 2015 realizing the businesswomen prime importance in the economic sectors, FPCCI established “Central Committee on Women Entrepreneurs.” Each women chamber has voting right for the election of FPCCI as well as for a reserved seat of woman vice president slot at FPCCI.

List of Women Vice Presidents of FPCCI

The trade rule and act has reserved a seat for a woman vice president in FPCCI and the following are included: Dr. Shehla Javed Akram (2011), Begum Salma Ahmed (2012), Mrs. Rukhsana Jehangir (2013), Ms. Naima Ansari (2014), Ms. Fehmida Kauser Jamali (2015) and Ms. Sajida Zulfiqar (2016).

FPCCI Best Lady Exporter Gold Medal Award

Providing recognition to women entrepreneurs in order to encourage women owned businesses; the FPCCI has instituted a “Best Lady Exporter Gold Medal Award”, (The Express Tribune, 2010) which is awarded to a female entrepreneur who has shown more exports during the year export awards.
Women Chamber of Commerce and Industry in Pakistan

Center for International Private Enterprise (CIPE) research report unveiled that all women chambers representing the four provinces of Pakistan, are continuously working to encourage women entrepreneurs and facilitate in business operations where required through negotiations for bank loans and in developing contacts with various government departments. These chambers organize business orientation programs, workshops, and lectures, for the guidance of women entrepreneurs and also work to enhance quality consciousness of women-owned enterprises (CIPE cited in Nadgrodkiewicz, 2011).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women Chamber’s Name</th>
<th>Year of Creation</th>
<th>Founder President</th>
<th>President 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry (Lahore Division)</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Dr. Shehla Javed</td>
<td>Ms. Farah Jahangir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamabad Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Ms. Samina Fazil</td>
<td>Ms. Zakia Hashmi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry, Mardan</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>Ms. Sabina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry, Peshawar</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Ms. Sajida Zulfiqar</td>
<td>Mrs. Fitrath Ilyas Bilour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce and Industry, Multan Division</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Ms. Masooma</td>
<td>Ms. Humera Batool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry Quetta, Baluchistan</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>Mrs. Kulsoom Parveen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry Quetta, Division</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Ms. Fehmida Jamali</td>
<td>Ms. Aryana Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry Bahawalpur Division</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Ms. Elahi Rehmat Raj</td>
<td>Ms. Shireen Arshad Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karachi Women Chamber (KWCCI) District East</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Ms. Saeeda Bano</td>
<td>Ms. Syeda Saeeda Bano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industry South Zone, Karachi</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Ms. Farida Qureshi</td>
<td>Ms. Farida Qureshi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Data compiled from FPCCI Membership Booklet 2015)
Methodology

The self-administered questionnaire has been designed for obtaining inputs from the respondents to analyze the research problem. This research has conducted by both quantitative and qualitative methods in order to get powerful results from the research questions. A detailed questionnaire was designed for a selected group accordingly for evolving knowledge, that how or to what extent trade bodies are providing assistance to women entrepreneurs. Individual interviews were planned where only interviewer or interviewee will interact with each other where full control over time and confidentiality. Trade associations provided the members list of women entrepreneurs with complete information. All interviews have been conducted by the researcher by visiting their business outlets, residence and in trade associations. Whereas, in some of cases, a researcher even have approval letter from departments proof of conducting research would not be enough to get the information. In such situation, references of chambers’ officials and associations were required to conduct interview with sample of the research. The sample of women entrepreneurs has been divided carefully according to the size of trade associations: The research has obtained detailed interviews of 200 women entrepreneurs from five big business associations of Pakistan. The associations namely Federation of Pakistan Chambers of Commerce and Industry (FPCCI), Karachi Chambers of Commerce and Industry (KCCI), Site Association, Korangi Association of Trade and Industry (KATI), and Pakistan Software Houses Association (P@SHA). The study identified the state of businesswomen in trade bodies. And all these associations have representations of businesswomen at national and international levels. The obtained data further analyze through Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) in which variables have been tested through chi-square test of independence.
Table: 1
Testing independence of ‘women chambers promoting women in private sector’ and ‘success of business’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women chambers promoting women in private sector</th>
<th>Is business successful</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Yes) Organize meetings with other business persons</td>
<td>Count 23</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Yes) Organize exhibitions/conferences/workshops/seminars</td>
<td>Count 106</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(No) Trade bodies working for specific strata</td>
<td>Count 28</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(No) Not helpful in resolving financial matters</td>
<td>Count 3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>160</strong></td>
<td><strong>40</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpretation

$H_0$: women chambers are not promoting women in private sector due to the reason not successful in business.

$H_1$: Women chambers promoting women in private sector as business are successful.

Pearson chi-square value = 25.310

$df = 3$

$p = 0$ which is less than $\alpha (<0.05)$

Table: 2
Testing of independence ‘trade bodies identifying areas to equip women’ and ‘success of businesses’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trade bodies identifying areas to equip women for success</th>
<th>Is business successful</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Yes) I did very hard work</td>
<td>(Yes) Staff/Trade body/family supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Yes Count 45</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No Count 45</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>90</strong></td>
<td><strong>70</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interpretation

\[ H_0: \text{Trade bodies are not identifying areas to equip women for business success.} \]
\[ H_1: \text{Trade bodies are identifying areas to equip women for business success.} \]

Pearson chi-square value = 3.729
\[ df = 3 \]
\[ p = 0.15 \]

Table: 3

Testing independence of ‘Trade bodies encouraging women entrepreneurs for trademarks and patents’ and ‘Working for capacity building programmes’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trade bodies encouraging for trademark/patents</th>
<th>Chambers organize capacity building programs</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within 7 to 30 days</td>
<td>Within 90 to 180 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not helpful</td>
<td>Count 25</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organize seminars/ direct assistance</td>
<td>Count 69</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpretation

\[ H_0: \text{Trade bodies are not encouraging women entrepreneurs for trademarks and patents and impacts on capacity building of women entrepreneurs.} \]
\[ H_1: \text{Trade bodies encouraging women entrepreneurs for trademarks and patents and effects on capacity building of women entrepreneurs.} \]

Pearson chi-square value = 10.138
\[ df = 3 \]
\[ p = 0.0075 \]
Table: 4
Testing independence of ‘education’ and ‘reason of starting work’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Reason of starting work</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To increase income of the house/make life comfortable</td>
<td>For children education/unexpected necessity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matriculation</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpretation

H₀: Women are educated due to the reason start working.
H₁: Women education is not the reason of starting work.

Pearson chi-square value = 14.106

df = 6
p = 0.014

Table: 5
Testing if independence of ‘rising women entrepreneurship’ and ‘lower wages at work’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rising women entrepreneurship is a result of injustice in labour wages</th>
<th>Reason of starting work</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To increase income of the house/make life comfortable</td>
<td>For children education/unexpected necessity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rising women entrepreneurship is a result of injustice in labour wages</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interpretation

H₀: Rising women entrepreneurship is not due to lower wages.
H₁: Rising women entrepreneurship is due to lower wages.

Pearson chi-square value = 8.104

\[ \text{df} = 2 \]
\[ P = 0.0085 \]

Test 6

Testing independence of ‘First experience of work’ and ‘Work as an employee’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Is this your first experience * did you work as an employee before starting business</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Did you work as an employee before starting business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Yes) 1 to 6 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is this your first experience</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpretation

H₀: First experience as an employee then started work as an entrepreneur.
H₁: First experience of work as an entrepreneur to avoid working as employee.

Pearson chi-square value is 99.21

\[ \text{df} = 3 \]
\[ P = 0 \]

Results and Discussions

The trade bodies have been formed to protect private sector from wrong policies of the government and any new world order affected local businesses. At the same time chambers and association also play a critical role in promoting and protecting the rights and an individual businessperson. The changing business environment has increased the importance of women, especially due to their dominance in education and demand for economy of skilled labor. The trade bodies are aimed at promoting business activities of
both men and women. Historically, men are dominant in the economic arena and trade bodies give priority to their male members. But this approach has been changed due to multiple reasons and increased membership of women entrepreneurs. The rising induction of women entrepreneurs not only compelled the trade association to give attention but it also resulted in creation of separate women chambers. The finding of this research work revealed that though trade bodies were promoting the business activities of women entrepreneurs yet unable to resolve their financial matters. The dynamics of business have been changed over the period and women entrepreneurs require advanced skill and techniques to operate their businesses. It is identified that the trade bodies are so far not much helpful in capacity building of those businesswomen.

In table 1, the identified Pearson chi-square value is 25.310\textsuperscript{a} with 3 degree of freedom. The tabulated P-value is 0 which is less than \( \alpha (<0.05) \) therefore null hypothesis rejected. The cross tabulation and chi-square results show that there is association between women chambers promoting women in private sector and success of business. Therefore, it concluded that women chambers are promoting women in private sectors through organizing business meetings, conferences, exhibitions, seminars and workshops and running successful business. Its P-value shows that there is strong relationship between these two variables. Similarly, in table 2 the Pearson chi-square value is 3.729\textsuperscript{a} with 3 degree of freedom. The tabulated P-value is 0.15 which is more than \( \alpha (>0.05) \) therefore null hypothesis accepted. The cross tabulation and chi-square results show that there is no association between trade bodies identifying areas to equip women and business success. Therefore, it concluded that in this segment there were different responses received in terms of success of business. In this table there are two groups who believed that their businesses were successful due to their hard work. Another group attributed their success to support from family and friends. Its P-value shows that trade bodies are not identifying areas to equip women for business success. Therefore, the trade bodies required to expand the scope of working and acquire expertise of international standards to equip women with the advanced techniques for running their businesses on modern lines. However, the analysis of the two tables concluded that the P-value showed strong relationships between two categorical variables including women chambers promoting women in private sector as businesses are successful and trade bodies are encouraging women entrepreneurs for trademarks/patent through capacity building programmes. These two tested variables have dependency over successful businesses. Therefore, the hypothesis ‘Role of trade associations is helpful in promoting business of women’ is approved according to statistical significance in variables magnitude. In table 4, the Pearson chi-square value is 10.138\textsuperscript{a} with 3 degree of freedom. The tabulated P-value is 0.0075 which is less than \( \alpha (<0.05) \) therefore null hypothesis rejected. The cross tabulation and chi-square results show that there is association between trade bodies encouraging women entrepreneurship for trademarks and patents and working for capacity building programmes. Therefore, it concluded that trade bodies are encouraging
An Analytical Study on Role of Trade Association for Women Entrepreneurship and their Capacity Building

women towards trademark and patents through organizing different capacity building programmes for women entrepreneurs. Its P-value shows that there is significant relationship between these variables.

The research work also identified that wages have strong relation with the cost of doing business. In case wages increase in labor market the cost of a manufacturing unit increases and it becomes uncompetitive in the international markets. Therefore, for the long time the wages of the laborers were not increased as per to the inflationary pressures. The literature review pointed out that women were mostly engaged in non-skilled works in the past, which attract lower wages as compared to skilled work. In the recent times the dominance of female in education prompted them to acquire professionalism in sectors of the economy. This has changed the entire concept and women moved to entrepreneurship. It is observed that women are working in mainly in textile factories, especially in garments and finished products related activities. In these business activities, though, hard work is not required but the wages are very low. The women are breaking the barriers and attaining education and advanced skills and moving towards entrepreneurship. Though this is in the early stage but changing composition of men and women business activities, one can assumes the women will be able to accelerate their presence in future. The dominance in education was also due to lower wages of women in economic activities. The research finds that women who started their own businesses are well-educated.

The analysis of table 4 shows the Pearson chi-square value is 14.106a with 6 degree of freedom. The tabulated P-value is 0.014 which is less than α (<0.05) therefore null hypothesis rejected. The cross tabulation and chi-square results show that there is significant association between education and reason of staring work. Therefore, it concluded according to table results that all group of qualification had affirmed that they joined the work for earning to support their household economies. Its P-value shows that there is relationship between variables. Similarly, in table 5 the Pearson chi-square value is 8.104a with 2 degree of freedom. The tabulated P-value is 0.0085 which is less than α (<0.05) therefore null hypothesis rejected. The cross tabulation and chi-square results show that there is significant association between rising women entrepreneurship and lower wages at work. The large number of respondents believed that rising women entrepreneurship is due to injustice in labour wages. Its P-value shows that there is strong association between variable. It is concluded that the P-value determined powerful association between all three categorical variables including women education, first experience of work as an entrepreneur and rising women entrepreneurship have strong dependency over factors such as reasoning of work, want to work as an entrepreneur in a way to avoid working as subordinate or under lower wages. These economic changes are considering women to get into entrepreneurship instead of working as employee. Therefore, the hypothesis ‘The changing economic conditions lead women towards
entrepreneurship’ is approved according to statistical significance in variables magnitude. In table 6, the Pearson chi-square value is 99.21 with 3 degree of freedom. The tabulated P-value is 0 which is less than α (<0.05) therefore null hypothesis rejected. The cross tabulation and chi-square results show that there is significant association between first experience of work and work as an employee. Therefore, it concluded that most of women entrepreneurs never worked as an employee due to lower wages and were not interested in stereotype jobs due to the reason started own work. Its P-value shows that there is strong relationship between variables.

Conclusions

The thorough research of this study concluded that women entrepreneurs need unity to show their presence in mainstream economic activities. This unity should be regardless of their type of business, size of business, sectors of economy or irrespective of political interference. This networking should be based on gender equality and equity which will be helpful in removing all irritants. Trade bodies can be helpful in raising their voices as they are providing platform for representations yet such opportunity was not explored in true sense so far. There is need to develop a database of working women at government as well as private sector level to identify women and their economic activities. This data should be used for identifying the potential of existing expertise of businesswomen as well as creating room for new entrepreneurs.

Recommendations

- Women should be encouraged to participate in economic activities at all levels. Policies and laws should be evolved in this way that women belonging to rural and urban areas should come forward.
- Remove irritants in obtaining loans. The loan extending financial institutions should have clear policy without hidden charges on their advances.
- The minimum loan size for women entrepreneurs should be one million rupees considering the changing demand and cost of doing business.
- Women should be discouraged to import raw material especially those which are already available in the local markets.
- Establish centers at government as well as private sector associations for creating linkages between domestic women entrepreneurs with their foreign business partners.
References


Raghavan, S. N. (1995). Regional Economic Cooperation Among SAARC Countries, Allied Publisher Limited, New Delhi, p. XI.


An Analytical Study on Role of Trade Association for Women Entrepreneurship and their Capacity Building


Shazia Sharafat is Ph.D. Scholar in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.

Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah is Meritorious Professor: Chairperson in the Department of Social Work and Director, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.
Gender Construction And Media Narratives: Representations Of Gender In Animated Movies

Sumera Batool
Department of Mass Communication
Lahore College for Women University

Maria Naeem
Department of Media & Communication Studies, School of Social Sciences & Humanities
University of Management and Technology

Feroza Batool
Department of Gender Studies
University of the Punjab

Abstract

Media, as an important and powerful social institution, contributes in the construction and reinforcement of perceptions and beliefs about gender. The media images of gender have been found stereotypical and discriminated while there have been many debates on the under representation and biased treatment of gender related issues. This research study particularly analyzed how media narratives play a part in the construction of gender identities in animated movies. The study focused to investigate how femininity and masculinity have been build up in movies, which sort of roles have been assigned to both genders and which identities have been emphasized in the animated movies of Time Warner and Walt Disney during the time period of 2008 to 2013. Gender schema and social learning theories gave implications to the research findings. Both quantitative and qualitative content analysis of fourteen animated movies was conducted. The study concluded that there is stereotypical representations of gender in movies. The women are under-represented and usually negatively portrayed while the men have shown with more societal powers.

Keywords: Gender Construction, Media Narratives and Animated Movies.
Introduction

Media is an important part of everyday lives of individuals, while for people just some options affects how they perceive themselves and the world around. It is interesting to see how the media portrays and depicts the gender. Since media is such a big part of people’s everyday lives. The images of gender in media may consciously or unconsciously influence the individual’s mind. It is very unlikely to think that the media is not there in the lives of people but their ways of thinking and the way they perceive the world and themselves is influenced by media (Gauntlett, 2008). Much academic attention has been given to the ideas of femininity and masculinity that they are culturally constructed and have naturally to do with ideology and power structures. The terms like sex, male and female, are based on cultural behavior expectation. Thus the assumption that how members of society see themselves, how they are viewed, and even treated, by others is determined to a great extent by their media representation. In this way media builds the perceptions about others and even maintains certain beliefs about others by representing them in a certain way. However, now a days, it is clear to most media researchers that these effects of media must be studied not assumed. With special concern to gender construction, there have been numerous research studies that highlight the repercussions of televised media. Traditional or customary ideas of gender construction or representation are correlated to higher and advanced levels of exposure to TV (Williams 1981; England, Descartes & Collier-Meek 2011).

Beginning with early feminist writing, the media have been considered central social ‘players’ in this context. According to this argument, the media and the television in particular, present images of femininity (ies) and masculinity (ies) that do not simply reflect ‘natural’ sex differences, but actively participate in the symbolic discourse of gender, a discourse that is rooted in power relations. Importantly, mainly based on content analysis, these media representations- discussed particularly with regard to women- have been viewed as harmful images and as leading to sexist socialization, although some writers have cautioned of these effects being assumed rather than studied.
In recent years, it has become clear that such an approach might ignore the full picture whereas masculinity (ies) should not be perceived as unproblematic. In patriarchal societies, the roles and privileges accorded to women are inferior to those assigned to men, such as sexism plays a central role in continuing oppression of women. (Swami et al., 2010).

This research attempts to highlight why it is important to understand how the media represent gender and argues that constructions of femininity and masculinity are part of a dominant ideology that prescribes ‘proper’ behavior for men and for women (Goffman, 1976).

**Literature Review**

Hermes (2007) explored that how both sexes are being represented in media with different patterns and there is a proportionate difference in representation of male and female. Researchers who have reported on this aspect (Belkaoui & Belkaoui 1976; West 1984) explored that usually the images of women are stereotyped and portrayed as unemployed, have low income earnings and have limited purchasing power. Sometimes men are represented as criminal, clown, violent, child molesters and have lack of self-control when related to anger or sexual urges and the stereotypes can be associated to male children acting brutally.

Leaper (2000) stated that the TV has been acknowledged as a dominant source of social inspiration and influence on children’s gender perceptions. Furthermore, TV viewing has been associated with some pro-social besides belligerent behaviors (Calvert & Huston 1987). Gender depiction in children’s animated movies deserves much attention as the children start spending a lot of time on viewing animated movies and cartoons at a very early stage. As it has already argued, television content plays a major role in conveying the certain messages to children (Thompson & Zerbinos 1995). Children are well aware of the gender cataloging in animated movies. The gender role depictions shown in animated movies may influence children’s views, ideologies, beliefs, concepts and opinions about norms, relationships, social behaviors and gender (Oliver and Green 2001; Martin et al. 2002; Tonn 2008).

The literature argued for the powerful role of media and as a dominant source of social inspiration and influence on individual’s gender perceptions. Furthermore, Traditional or customary ideas of gender construction or representation were found correlated to higher and advanced levels of exposure to media. The literature emphasized that both genders
had been represented in media with different patterns and there was a proportionate difference in representation of males and females while usually the images of women have been stereotyped.

In the light of exiting body of literature the present study focuses on the representation and construction of gender in animated movies. The objectives of the study focus on:

- To explore whether men and women have been given equal representation in animated movies of selected time period
- To investigate which sort of roles have been assigned to both men and women.
- To analyze which identities have been emphasized for men and women in the animated movies of Time Warner and Walt Disney during the time period of 2008 to 2013.

Theoretical Framework

This study applies Gender Schema theory and Social Learning theory. Gender schema theory explained that how individuals become gendered in society and how sex-linked characteristics are maintained and transmitted to other members of a culture. Gender-associated information is predominantly transmitted through society by way of schemata, or networks of information that allow for some information to be more easily assimilated than others.

Social learning theory sheds light on this aspect that the behavior is almost learned by observing the environment. With the reference of this context, if the media performed their duty un-biased then media can be perfect teaching tool which have no competitor. Children observe the people around them behaving in various ways. In society children are surrounded by many influential models, such as parents within the family, characters on children’s TV, friends within their peer group and teachers at school. These models provide examples of behaviour to observe and imitate, e.g. masculine and feminine, pro and anti-social etc. Most children are regularly exposed to animated cartoons (Klein et al. 2000).

Therefore this study argues that the more the children are exposed to stereotypical materials, the more chances they will learn and adopt the social practices about the gender behaviours from the animated cartoons on television, which they use to watch during most of the time of the day. Therefore in the presence of hegemonic control of
state’s patriarchal ideology and through stereotypical portrayal, the young boys are trained to learn to be more active, intelligent and aggressive while the young girls were encouraged to become attractive as well as passive. Therefore due to the existing values about gender which is disseminated through animated cartoons it is quite possible that in the process of socialization, all these kind of stereotypical representation of gender could be resulted in inferiority and superiority complex in girls and boys respectively.

Besides these theories, Feminist theorists also argued that how the system of power and oppression interact which contributed in gender differences, inequality and oppression which are also the theme of this research work. According to many feminist theorists focus on how women have been marginalized and defined as “others” in patriarchal societies, they also suggested that gender oppression goes beyond inequality by referring that not only women different from or unequal to men, but in fact they are actively oppressed subordinated and abused by men. The basic focus points of feminist theorists are that gender stratification occurs when gender differences give more power and privilege to men and the patriarchy society organizes the society into complex relationship. Many people incorrectly believe that feminist theory focuses exclusively on girls and women and that it has an inherent goal of promoting the superiority of women over men. In reality, feminist theory has always been about viewing the social world in a way that illuminates the forces that create and support inequality, oppression, and injustice, and in doing so, promotes the pursuit of equality and justice.

Research Design

The methodology opted for this study is content analysis. Content analysis is a method for summarizing any form of content by counting its various aspects. The animated movies of Time Warner and Walt Disney from 2009 to 2013 are universe of study. Fourteen movies of Time Warner and Walt Disney from 2009 to 2013 which are named as frozen, brave, princess and the frog, tangled, Wall-E, Toy story 3, cars 2, Wonder Women, all Stars are Superman, Arjun: The warrior prince, Mars Needs moms, Winnie the Pooh, Up and The monster University have been selected as sample by simple random method. Dialogues, characters, nature of representation and theme were units of analysis. Dialogues were categorized as supportive, against, neutral while characters
were categorized as major, minor, background. The nature of representation and theme were analyzed as positive, negative and neutral.

Operationalization of the Terms

The theme and nature of representation in movies that established both gender as equal were considered as positive. The theme and nature of representation in movies that highlighted one gender over the other and established one gender as more powerful and dominant were operationalized as negative. The theme and nature of representation in which both genders were represented in un-biased manner and no such discrimination was highlighted between both genders has been termed as neutral. The dialogues which argued in the favour of basic rights of both genders were considered as supportive. The dialogues which portrayed one gender as dominant or oppressed and dependent were operationalized as against to any gender. The dialogues which were not suggestive in terms of favouring or opposing any gender considered as neutral.

The character around which the whole story of the movie revolves and all characters were linked to that lead or primary character was operationalized as major. The characters which were acting as secondary and were indirectly linked to the main story of the movies were considered as minor characters. The characters which do not had any link with the theme of story or whose presence or absence were not affective to the plot of the movie were called background characters.

Research Questions

1. Whether the women have been given equal representation as compared to men?
2. What identities have been represented in animated movies for men and women?
3. How media narratives play a part in the construction of gender identities in animated movies?
4. How femininity and masculinity have been built up in animated movies?
Quantitative Findings

**H1:** Women are negatively represented in these movies as compared to men.

**Toy Story 3 (2010)**

**Tangled (2010)**
Table: 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship between negative representation of women as compare to men</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>A symp.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>268.037a</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>237.143</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>8.470</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>414</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table demonstrated that the value of “P” is less than the level of significance which is 0.05. The outcomes verify that H1 is accepted.

H2: Women are under-represented in these movies as compared to men.

Table: 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship between under representation of women as compared to men</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>188.451a</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>183.217</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>67.566</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>414</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table 2 is supporting H2 as level of significance ‘0.05’ is higher than P value.

H3: Masculinity is being associated with societal power in animated movies

Table: 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship how societal power associated with masculinity</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>385.665a</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>278.445</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.237</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>414</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table 3 revealed that level of significance ‘0.05’ is greater than P value which affirms that H3 is accepted.

Qualitative Analysis

Qualitative content analysis is the method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or
patterns. The study employed the systematic qualitative analysis and interpreted the text under the developed themes.

The themes included are:

• Patriarchy
• Masculine and feminine attributes
• Commodification of women

**Patriarchy**

Patriarchy is characterized by current and historic unequal power relations between women and men whereby women are systematically oppressed. This takes place across almost every sphere of life but is particularly noticeable in women’s under-representation in key state institutions, decision-making positions and employment and industry. Male violence against women is also a key feature of patriarchy. Women in minority groups face multiple oppressions in this society, as race, class and sexuality.

In the animated movies the men were shown as the rulers and the decision makers in every sphere of life. As in the ‘toy story 3’ the theme of the story revolves around the concept of team work. The leader of the first team is “Cow boy” while the other male characters which were included in the group such as buzz also had the right to take decision. The leader of the other team was also male character named ‘Bear’. The concept engendered through this theme was if there is any tricky or complicated situation, males were there to find the solution, while the female characters had to follow the decision. The female characters were depicted as incompetent to get a solution for a problem and just to obey the decisions taken by men.

In another movie ‘Brave’ female character named ‘Princess Merida’ who was also the lead character of the movie has been represented in the movie as a confident and a bold girl, who want to take decision of her life by her own without the interference of anyone even her family. Her interests included archery and horse riding, which were considered as men oriented and not suitable for women.

She faced social pressure to change her life style as being women she should be getting marry. But Merida chooses to defy. Her parents continue to insist her but she stick to her decision and want to find some other way on her own basis. That’s why Merida was portrayed in this movie as a rebellion girl. The representation of Merida has been shown as a transformed women who ultimate obey the decision of her parents and to get marry to reveal that it the ultimate task of a women to make family and modesty to follow the set norms and traditions. This shows the stereotypical representation of women that in a way strengthens the stereotypical thinking patterns of society.
Masculine and Feminine Attributes

Gender is our social and legal status as girls and boys, women and men. Gender attributes is how you feel and express your gender. There are some certain attributes which are attached to specific gender and are learnt from observation of the surrounding such as society especially media. The traits which usually relate to men are strong, courageous, goal oriented and independent while women are generally perceived as beauty conscious, dependent and a passive sexual commodity.

In the movie ‘Frozen’ when the princes Anna went to protect her sister princess Elsa and even ‘Flynn’ protect her in every difficult situation he rescue her life. By representing such images for women and constructing belief that woman always need men for protection and they are dependent on men for social security and sustainability. The movies also set the beliefs about women as conscious about appearance and beauty and such stereotypical images has been emphasized rather than appreciating their talent. The women were not seen as a normal human identity but as a sex symbol. As in the movie ‘Brave’ suitors are interested in the appearance and the physical beauty of Princess Merida. No one among them cares about the talent and the other qualities of princess because they are treating her like an award to win and their major goal is just to get the princess. Yet all the suitors are tested on the basis of their skills, as it is generally perceived that men should be skilful and tactful.

Same as the case in the movie “Arjun: the Warrior Prince” where the princess has been treated as a trophy and princess “Daruppadi” was given to Arjun as a reward for his successful completion of mission. The princess has been represented as to encourage or console to Arjun. This movie constructs the beliefs that being women they should be more conscious or concerned about their looks or physical appearance rather than other qualities because it is the only quality that is socially expected and demanded. If a woman has strong character and is talented but not good in appearance then these qualities are not considered worthy enough to be appreciated by the society.

Commodification of Women

Commodification of women refers to the way women ideas and icons are appropriated for commercial purposes, emptied of their political significance and offered back to the public in a commoditized form – usually in media. Almost in every selected movie, the women have been represented as commodity or a sex object, who had to appeal and satisfy their opposite sex or they can be treated like a reward for a male on their achievements. In return female got a reward of romance and love from the opposite sex. In many movies ‘Arjun; The Warrior Prince’, ‘All Stars Superman’, ‘Princess and the Frog’ the female characters has been shown as sex object.
Discussion and Analysis

The study investigated how femininity and masculinity have been build up in movies, which sort of roles have been assigned to both genders and which identities have been emphasized in the animated movies of Time Warner and Walt Disney during the time period of 2008 to 2013. Gender schema and social learning theories gave implications to the research findings.

Whether the women have been giving equal representation as compared to men?

The data suggested that in the animated movies from 2009-2011, male major characters were 32.8%, males minor characters were 41.09%, and male background characters were 26.0%. As the percentages of female major characters are 27.7, female minor characters were 33.3% and female background characters were 38.8%. So, the males had been represented more frequently as compared to females which showed that male characters were having more visible role in movies and women characters were less representative. Such difference in representation also depicted gender roles segregation in society that women are not engaged in visible and leading roles. So media is also reinforcing stereotypical segregation of gender roles.

What identities have been represented in movies for men and women and how media narratives play a part in the construction of gender identities in animated movies?

The results argued that men have been attributed as determined, bold, courageous, carrier oriented, independent, strong and brave while the women as to perform just household duties, to look after the home, sexy in appearance, beauty and weight conscious, delicate, feeble and independent. The analysis suggested that only men have the leadership power, and the women have to depend on men for their every single task. The theory ‘Gender Schema theory’ explained that the sex linked characteristics are maintained and transmitted to the other members of culture with the help of schemata or the network of information. So, in that manner the trait that the men should be dominant to women have been transmitted to the viewers and the animated movies are playing a very important role in this respect. Such kind of gender roles’ representation is also contributing to existing discriminatory and stereotypical roles for women. As in most of the societies, women are considered inferior to men and treated as they do not have the ability of leadership and contribute in decision making roles. In those movies women were showed as sex object and engaged in private sphere as compare to men who are showed as symbol of power and authority.
How femininity and masculinity have been built up in animated movies?

The research findings argued that the movies construct such identities for women that depict them as dependent gender, sex objects by determining the specific tasks for them as domestic duties to perform and a source of pleasure for men, while men as powerful, independent and strong. As the ‘social learning theory’ described that Individuals learn the behavior through observation and when they are exposed to the movies they observe and ultimate learn the identities represented by movies. By these ways movies come to determine the specification for both genders. Femininity was linked with the attribution of beauty to create sex appeal for men and Masculinity was specified with bravery and power to win the hearts of women to rule them. Such kind of women representation reflected the normative role of women in society and strengthening the stereotypical image of women as being inferior to men.

Conclusions

The study concluded that the animated movies construct the images of men and women and are source of socialization of its viewers by representing and emphasizing certain specific gender related attributes. Movies narratives play an important part in the image building and beliefs about the gender and gender roles. The results argued for the unequal and stereotypical treatment of women and women related issues that constructed the images for women as to perform domestic duties, sex commodity, beauty and weight conscious, delicate, feeble and independent whereas the men have been attributed as determined, bold, courageous, carrier oriented, independent, strong and brave. The women have been under represented and men have been overrepresented in comparison to each other. Most of the movies represented women in stereotypical roles and showed her inferior to men. Movies also promoted public private dichotomy of roles among gender.

References


---

**Dr. Sumera Batool** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore.

**Maria Naeem** is Lecturer in the Department of Media & Communication Studies, School of Social Sciences & Humanities, University of Management and Technology.

**Feroza Batool** is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Gender Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore.
Challenges Faced By Women Orphans’ Caregivers: A Qualitative Study

Sundus Yousuf
Institute of Clinical Psychology
University of Karachi

Bushra Khan
Department of Psychology
University of Karachi

Abstract

Wellbeing of an orphan caregiver affects the child-rearing practice, which in turn could affect the growth and development of the orphaned child. Challenges faced by women orphan caregivers make caring a more extraneous task. A qualitative study was designed, to investigate the challenges faced by women orphan caregivers. Data was collected from SOS children village, an internationally recognized orphanage located in Karachi, Pakistan. An open ended interview was conducted with 17 women orphan caregivers employed at the organization through interview schedule. Various themes were identified. Two major themes indicating challenges were identified; professional or organizational level and personal level that were further divided in sub themes and analyzed. Results indicated that caregivers themselves were abandoned and suffered from psychological disturbances and lacked in awareness of effective coping skills. Orphan caregivers faced distress due to inability to effectively handle hectic routine at the orphanage, low salary, and lack of knowledge and skill to address diverse needs of all children. Overall, caring for orphans is a challenging job and it is recommended that orphan caregivers are provided with professional support to cope with psychological issues; and training on caregiving knowledge and skills to effectively handle children with diverse needs. This could eventually help in improving wellbeing of the caregivers and enhancing overall development of the orphans.

Keywords: Women Orphans’ Caregivers, Challenges, Qualitative Study, Pakistan.
Caregiving of orphans is an extraneous job (Hlabyago & Ogunbanjo, 2009). Therefore, the well-being of the caregiver is essential and has a huge impact on the upbringing of the child. A substantial amount of research is done on the well-being of the orphans. (Juffer & Series, 2008; Zhou, 2012; Zhao et al., 2010; Killian & Durrheim, 2008; Radcliff, Racine, Huber & Whitaker, 2012; Makame, Ani & Grantham-McGregor, 2002). Nonetheless, few researches are done on caregiver’s psychological wellbeing (Bachman et al., 2008).

Natural disasters, acts of terrorism, migrations, fatal diseases such as HIV AIDS and other afflictions of life bring with itself many miseries and hardships to handle. To care for the orphans several orphanages are established under governmental and non-governmental organizations. According to Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (2007). An orphan is defined as a child under age 18 who has lost at least one parent (maternal orphans, paternal orphans) or both the parents (double orphans). Beside this definition, there is also a term of ‘Social Orphan’ which is used to refer a child, whose parents are alive but do not take the responsibility of providing the parental care (Dillon, 2009). The reasons for widespread social orphan hood are social, cultural, economic and often a combination of these factors. Children often become social orphans due to alcoholism, neglect and abuse (Firsava, 2012). Also, often legal or social barriers separate the child from parental love and sometimes family conflicts; divorce, violence.
and abuse leave behind the children to live apart from the safe and protected environment of home (Excluded children, 2010). The orphanages usually take care for both, ‘orphans’ and ‘social orphans’. Although the innocent child is not responsible for being orphan, orphan-hood brings with itself many misfortunes. The society looks down upon the orphans and feels no guilt in snatching their basic rights because they lack parental support (Abebe, 2009). It is, therefore, the duty of state to provide shelter and support to such deprived children. Often this task is fulfilled by non-governmental organizations with the help of corporate sector, government and wealthy philanthropists of the society.

The best care for deprived and misfortunate orphans can be guaranteed only when physical, psychological, social and emotional health care is monitored by the organization in which they are living in (Juffler & Series, 2008). Community based home groups provide the best psychosocial care for the orphans (Hong, et al., 2011). Physical health encompasses proper nutritional daily diet, medical checkups, resources of proper sanitary system and physical exercising and gaming opportunities. Social wellbeing comes from intact social setup that helps children shield from social stigma. Emotional health is ensured only when the child knows that he is being loved and there is a place on earth where he/she can act independently without any apprehension. Psychological fitness of the orphan is the sum of all above mentioned factors. Moreover, the psychological wellbeing of the child is also associated with the mental health of the care giver.

**Review of Literature**

Wellbeing of caregivers plays an important role in child development. Mentally disturbed care providers possess potential of negative impacts on the child-rearing practice. They may fail to understand child’s cries, react in hostile manner, and practice inconsistent disciplinary methods, unable to understand the emotional state of the child. This inability could affect the child’s growth and mental health. Several outcomes of studies indicate a predictive relationship between better child’s developmental status and social and mental skills in later life with caregiver’s responsiveness and secure attachment styles. (Avierzer, Sagi, Resnick, & Gini, 2002; Bradley, Corwyn, Burchinal, McAdoo, & Coll, 2001; Landry, Smith, Swank, & Miller-Loncar, 2000; Hellenthal, 2006).

Studies conducted on mothers as caregivers revealed that maternal anxiety and depression is related with increased chance of anxiety, depression, attention deficit, and oppositional defiant disorders among 3 year old children (Meadows, Mc Lanahan, & Brooks-Gunn, 2007). Several research results indicate that marital discord and maternal stress has a significant impact on child’s behavior and adjustment. Children who belong to violent families have more internalizing behavior problems, are more aggressive and bad tempered (Holden & Ritchie, 1991). Mother’s stress may result as ‘emotionally unavailable mothers’ (Dunn, 1988), which causes low adrenocortical stress reactivity in
children (Sturge-Apple, Davies, Cicchetti & Manning, 2012). Moreover, maternal stress may manifest ‘diminished mothering’ (Walker, 1979). A study examined the child-rearing patterns in depressed, abusive, and normal mothers revealed that depressed and abusive mothers are found to be inconsistent, hostile and protective and utilize guilt inducing methods. Abusive mothers synchronize it with harsh authoritarian practices. (Susman et al., 1985; Rakow, et al., 2011). Moreover, depressed mother’s children lacks in social, psychological, and cognitive domains. They themselves are at risk for depression and other psychiatric illness such as conduct disorder (Burke, 2003). There is generally a dearth of studies showing relationship of behavior of orphan caregivers in institution and the orphans’ overall wellbeing. However one study where grandmothers raising their orphaned grandchildren reported elevated level of stress in grandmothers as compared to biological mothers. Caregivers’ experienced stress was linked to advanced age and extensive, new adoptive roles now occupied by grandmothers (Oburu, 2005).

Worldwide comparatively more researches are done on the well-being of the orphan child as compared to orphan caregivers. Most reported researches are on the orphans due to AIDS; for example in Malawi (Chirwa, 2002), Ethiopia (Abebe & Aase, 2013), Zimbabwe (Howard, et. al., 2006), Cape Town (Cluver & Gardner, 2007), Botswana (Miller, et. al., 2005). These researches outnumber for the Sub-Saharan countries, as prevalence of HIV aids is most amongst these countries. Very few studies have been conducted (Hlabyago & Ogunbanjo, 2009; Guqa, 2012; Thielman, Ostermann, Whetten, Whetten, O'Donnell, & Positive Outcomes for Orphans (POFO) Research Team, 2012), especially in Pakistan. A study was conducted to investigate behavioral problems of children living in orphanages deduced that orphan children are at greater risk for behavioral and conduct problems if the caregiver is suffering from depression or anxiety. Such caregivers direct children with higher number of commands and criticism, who in turn respond in a non-compliant and deviant behaviour (Lassi, Mehmud & Syed, 2010).

Considering the vital role of orphans’ caregivers in the children holistic development and dearth of a detailed study to know the perspective of orphans’ caregivers, the aim of the current qualitative study was to explore experiences and challenges of women working as caregivers of orphans in an orphanage.

**Methodology**

Study was conducted at the internationally recognized orphanage SOS village (a registered non-governmental organization) located in Karachi, Pakistan. This orphanage makes an effort to fulfil physical, emotional, social and academic needs of orphans. It provides safe and spacious physical and social environment and orphans are taken care by female caregivers who provide care to them on 24/7 basis. The orphanage has been divided into 4 sections called as Neighbourhood (Mohallas). Each neighbourhood has 4
homes which is taken care by one caregiver. The orphanage has 18 caregivers where, 16 caregivers provide care to orphans while 2 remain standby in case any need for orphan care arises. Besides salary, organization provides caregivers with food and shelter.

**Participants**

17 female orphan caregivers, employees of SOS village Karachi, were interviewed individually. Participants were approached through purposive sampling technique. Their age ranged from 23 to 51 years (mean=35). Most of them were divorced (N=10) while others were either widowed (N=3) or unmarried (N=3). These women resided in SOS, and other than a salary they were provided with the food, shelter, clothing, and permission for their own child to reside with them (out of 17, 5 caregivers had children who lived with them in the institution).

**Measures**

Besides socio-demographic information that included age, marital status, number of children, salary and benefits. An open-ended interview schedule was developed in accordance with the purpose of this research (please refer to the appendix). The interview schedule was reviewed by the psychologists and piloted on two caregivers working in another similar orphanage.

**Procedure**

The purpose, objective, methodology and interview schedule was discussed in detail with Director of SOS orphanage and consent to conduct the study was taken. Verbal informed consent was taken from the caregivers before conducting the interviews. Moreover permission for audio recording interview was also taken. 12 caregivers allowed recording the interview while for rest of interviews written notes were taken. Each interview lasted for 60 to 90 minutes. Essential probing was done when the caregivers were not able to define their problems adequately and when they were reluctant to open up and discuss their challenges.

**Analysis**

Interviews were transcribed and written notes were rechecked for completion. Authors discussed and analyzed all interviews in detail. Themes were identified and further classified into major and sub-themes.
Results

Almost all caregivers belonged to broken homes; have passed through some trauma in the form of physical or sexual abuse, faced death of some significant figure on whom she was dependent economically, socially and emotionally.

Life History of Caregivers

Around half of the women caregivers had a history of unsuccessful marriage. And they were also abandoned by their families in specific and the society in general. Few of them had long-suffered physical abuse from their husbands and were tyrannized by their husbands and often mother-in-laws too. One woman reported, “I lived and tolerated the loose character and brutality of my husband for 7 years”. After this long period of oppression she decided to leave him. Her two twin daughters are still with father and her case is under trial in court. One woman did court marriage with a man who was already married. Afterwards he showed no concern for her and the child, so she decided to leave. One lady stayed for 5 years with a man who was extremely suspicious, brutal to the extent that once he blew up her head by hitting her hard. In another story, husband didn’t care for the wife and never showed interest in her rather beat and accused her. One woman told, “After 5 months of marriage my husband said to me now I can no longer afford you” and gave divorce. One woman was infertile and due to this her husband married her cousin without her consent. Another woman was rejected by the man after ‘Nikah’ because according to him she was not beautiful. She was also not supported by his father and had worst ties with step-mother. Three women did not have such history. Rather their husbands died their natural death. And they found SOS village a safe place to be employed and support themselves and their child to continue their livelihood. One woman was herself an orphan child, raised in the village. Now she is working as an employee there. She said, “My father was a great man. After his death no one supported us and I still feel very deprived.” According to another woman caregiver’s history, successive traumatic events in her life left her unmarried and she works there in order to support herself and her family. One woman told that her husband was a schizophrenic patient. She was not told this before marriage. She expressed, “I tolerated him and helped in his treatment, but after several years, I and my brothers became hopeless with his recovery and I decided to leave him”. Another woman was forced to married to an old man who already had 7 children. Her husband was good for nothing. All her life she struggled hard, did jobs and cared for her and her husband’s children. After arranging marriages of all 7 children, when she was left alone she found SOS a safe place to live in. Her words were, “I was scattered; SOS saved me”.

Reason of Joining Orphanage as Caregivers

Most of the women caregivers approached the organization through some relative or friend. Only two caregivers got to know about the organization through newspaper
advertisement. Some were shifted from other regional SOS villages. Caregivers reported that they joined SOS to get a secure job along with the protective environment, food and shelter.

The major reason is the safety that the organization ensured in a safe and healthy environment; “The most important thing for a woman is security and respect” reported most of the caregivers. Also the lenient policy of the organization which not only allowed caregivers to keep their biological children with them but also provide them all facilities that entertain other children.

**Challenges Faced by the Caregivers**

They reported number of challenges that they were facing while working in the orphanage. We have thematically divided them into two main categories as challenges at organizational and personal levels that included thematically linked sub categories.

**Professional and Organizational Level**

**A Hectic Routine**

Caregivers work 24 hours and seven days a week. It involves completion of lot of chores. A busy day starts in the morning. As narrated, “We have to prepare breakfast for all 10 children prepare them for school. When they are off to school we have to clean up the entire house, prepare lunch for the children. When they are home we provide them with lunch, help them complete their homework, teach them good manners, resolve their issues and then again prepare for them the dinner. All the day is busy and hectic. I get really tired”. This hectic routine results in creating stress and sometimes distress amongst the caregivers.

**Diverse Needs of Children**

Caregivers reported that usually they found difficulty in managing challenging children, especially ones who were aggressive, non-responding or hyperactive. One mother said, “children are very hostile, aggressive and non-understandable...don’t know how to better deal with them”.

**Low Stipends**

With ever rising inflation in the country, caregivers demanded an increase in their salary packages, one caregiver said, “I’m worried about my salary. It’s very less and not enough as compared to our work”. Most of the caregivers were also worried about the continuity
of their job as one caregiver reported, "We have no job security, we can be fired anytime". Most of the mothers lacked foresight and future planning for their lives.

Personal Level

Reliving Traumatic Experiences

Women caregivers reported that the hectic routine prove to be blessing in disguise. They tend to forget their traumas and thought less about themselves when they were busy in their tasks. However, when at night they got free from their work, they relived all the past memories and felt helpless and lonely. Some often experienced crying spells as well.

Lack of Awareness of Effective Coping

Investigating the coping strategies for dealing with their problems it was disclosed that most of the caregivers avoided thinking about their problems and engaged in different activities. One caregiver said that, "I read books or listen to songs." One caregiver said that, "I engage myself more with my orphan children." Five caregivers reported that they find their relaxation in the night prayers. They put all their grievances and complain in front of God. By this act they feel much relieved.

Experiencing Psychological Issues

Upon telling their life history 6 caregivers revealed that they had suffered through severe depression. Amongst them some also had taken medication for depression prescribed by the local general physician. Two caregivers informed that when they were passing through the trauma they had attempted suicide. In few caregivers, element of extreme fear still prevailed. For example, one caregiver said that "I fear that only if for one day I will leave the premises of SOS village, I will be killed." Another caregiver expressed, "I fear that all the traumas might come back." One caregiver with history of sexual abuse frequently cried at petty issues and she herself did not know the better way to soothe herself and cope with the feeling of disgust in her. Feeling of loneliness was also a common complain of most of the caregivers.

Discussion

Orphan care giving is a demanding task; and doing that job with challenges makes it more difficult. Our study brings out number of important themes that highlights the challenges women orphans’ caregivers are facing; be it at professional or personal level that could influence the quality of work.
Low income was found to be an important concern, especially when they compare with the amount of time and energy they invest. Provision of quality care to orphans is a necessary requirement for caring the vulnerable population in orphanage. Low salary may not only affect caregivers’ level of motivation to provide quality caregiving services but may also cause movement of the employees to other organizations, causing a scarce of staff available to work in orphanages. According to the results of an experimental study, enhanced services and increased monthly stipends and imparting value and meaning in the workers can increase their retention rate in the job (Chamberlain, Moreland & Reid, 1992).

Handling diverse needs of children require skilled and trained staff, especially when children have emotional or behaviour problems (Lassi, Mehmud & Syed, 2010). Our findings showed that women orphan caregivers joined the organization because it provided them basic amenities and they lacked prior knowledge and skills required to work with children in orphanages, consequently they found challenging to deal with children with behaviour difficulties. Studies have been found that lack of sufficient skills in handling of orphans could lead to negative effects, for example a study carried out by The Nelson Mandela Children’s Fund indicated that due to lack of parental guidance, orphaned children were at risk of developing delinquent and anti-social behaviors and could emerge as less productive member of the society (Schonteich, 2002). Moreover a study in China also revealed that illiterate caregivers were more likely to have delinquent children and emphasizes on the parenting skills of the caregivers (Sun, Li, Ji, Lin, & Semaan, 2008). On the other hand provision of caregiving by trained orphan caregivers could lead to better physical and mental development among orphans (Groark, Muhamedrahimov, Palmov, Nikiforova, & McCall, 2005).

Child care is a demanding task and performing it continuously could be exhausting. Joint United Nations program (UNAIDS 2008) highlighted that the physical and psychological effects of caregiving on female caregivers’ health are not recognized as women usually disregard their own wellbeing and sanity, consequently it could lead to emotional stress. Our study also revealed that Women orphans’ caregivers were expected to perform their duties without breaks that could help them rejuvenate. Although they reported that they try best to do their jobs as it helped them to temporarily forget their traumatic past, but continuous work could lead to emotional stress (UNAIDS 2008).

It was interesting to find that all caregivers had a history of personal trauma and most of them belonged to broken families, faced abuse and domestic violence, and some even suffered from psychological illnesses as well. It was reported that they still re-live those negative moments that affect them psychologically. In addition to that they tried to divert their painful emotional experiences by engaging in work or performing religious rituals and lacked strategies that could help them effectively cope with their emotional issues.
Researches indicate that not only caregivers’ poor health be it physical (Thielman, Ostermann, Whetten, Whetten, O’Donnell, the Positive Outcomes for Orphans (POFO) Research Team, 2012) or mental (Lassi, Mehmud & Syed, 2010) influences the health and behaviour of children but it could also lead to poor quality of caregiving (Lovejoy, et. al., 2000; Lassi, Mehmud & Syed, 2010). Provision of psychological counseling and guidance could help caregivers better cope with their problems.

Moreover, the women working as orphans’ caregivers are themselves rejected by their family members and are deprived of the relationships they used to have. According to Relational-Cultural Theory, which was conceived after the work of Jean Baker Miller (1976) and is aligned with feminist movements in psychology, healthy relationships plays an important role in maintaining psychological wellbeing (Comstock, Hammer, Strentzsch, Cannon, Parsons, & Il, 2008). These caregivers regain their chance of involving themselves into growth-fostering relationships by taking care of orphans. Communicating and acknowledging their important contribution in orphans’ lives could not only strengthen their bond with orphans but could also enhance their level of job satisfaction.

A good reputable and managed organization faces fewer problems. SOS village is one such example that rendered as a model facility for orphaned children (Lassi, Mehmud & Syed, 2010). However, dealing with human lives and catering the issues of such a vulnerable population itself predict for many psychological, social and emotional issues. Unbiased exploration of problems and then pondering upon the best possible solutions can be a useful step towards moving one step forward. Because psychological health of orphans’ caregivers and lack of emotional support could affect development of the child (Groark, McCall, & Fish, 2011; Thielman, et.al, 2012).

Considering the current situations where many children are getting orphaned due to war, illness, disaster or death of parents or parental abandonment it was interesting to note that there is a dearth of literature that focuses on in-depth understanding of the challenges faced by the orphans’ caregivers working in the orphanages. Most of the studies were done on orphans due to certain reason like HIV AIDS. Especially in Pakistan only one study reported the psychological status of caregivers (Lassi, Mehmud & Syed, 2010) but its finding was based on the quantitative data. To best of our knowledge our study is the first to report a detailed account of women orphan caregivers’ experiences and highlight their challenges in Pakistan.

**Conclusions**

Our study explored the experiences of women caregivers who were involved in providing care to orphans. This study highlights their various personal and organizational
challenges that included their poor psychological well-being, lack of stress coping skills, lack to caregiving skills, and low salary with exhausting and demanding job. Our study emphasizes the importance of understanding and addressing the needs of women caregivers that could improve caregiving process and eventually could influence better all-round development of orphan children.

**Recommendations**

Following are the few recommendations based on the findings of our research:

- Caregivers’ financial and administrative needs should be addressed because it could enhance their motivation and commitment to continue working as professional orphan caregivers.
- Training on caregiving skills and handling children with difficulties need to be provided as it could improve quality of care giving.
- A series of mental health workshops could be arranged for the women caregivers that could include areas on stress management, time management and ways to enhance resilience.
- Individual counselling sessions should be provided to caregivers with the history of trauma. Also women with any psychiatric symptoms should be consulted the mental health experts.

**Acknowledgements**

We thank all the women orphan caregivers who participated in this study and shared their life experiences in detail. We appreciate the permission and facilitation provided by the director of SOS children’s village, Karachi in the conduct of this study.

**References**


**Appendix**

**Interview Schedule**

Q.1. Tell something about your own self.
Q.2. Why did you start working in the orphanage?
Q.3. Did you face any challenges while working as caregiver? If yes, could you please share in detail?
Q.4. Q4. How do you deal with such challenges?

_________________________

**Sundus Yousuf** is M.Phil Scholar and Internee in the Institute of Clinical Psychology, University of Karachi.

**Dr. Bushra Khan** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Psychology, University of Karachi.
Call for Papers

Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies
Publication of the Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies
University of Karachi

Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies is launched under the patronage of Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Vice Chancellor University of Karachi by the Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies, University of Karachi. Main objective of the Journal is to generate and disseminate knowledge regarding gender issues nationally and internationally with a critical perspective. Its aim is to promote consciousness and awareness about gender equity and balance in human interaction including academic work. In this regard, the journal explores what is meant by gender needs and gender perspective and how these can be best met. This publication in currently published only in English language however, in view of our national needs, the abstract is translated in urdu as well. Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies is indexed in EBSCO. It is recognized by Higher Education Commission (HEC) in ‘Y’ category.

The Journal Would Publish

- Interdisciplinary research in the field of Gender Studies.
- Research on curricula, course outline, reading list and teaching strategies related to Gender Studies.
- Review of books, film and theatrical performances.
- Reports on National and International conferences, symposia and workshops etc. on Gender Studies.

Guidelines for Submissions

- Submissions are invited in English language.
- Two copies of the manuscripts, single-spaced, and printed on one side only should be submitted on A4 size paper.
- A soft copy of the paper on CD or through e-mail should also be sent.
- Title page of the paper should be typed separately and should include the author’s name, full mailing address, phone number and email address.
- The length of the paper should be between 3500 to 5000 in words.
- Paper must have at least 32 to 35 references of books and research papers published in journals.
- An abstract of the paper no more than 200 words must be submitted along with the paper. The abstract should be followed by key words. An Urdu translation of the abstract and keywords is also required.
- The papers should include references (endnotes) and bibliography.
- Authors are responsible for creating graphs, tables, and charts, if required in their paper.
- Authors are required to submit a signed covering letter stating that the paper has not been published earlier or has not been submitted for the purpose of publication to any other journal or volume. Authors are solely responsible for the factual accuracy for their contributions.

Citations and References

Notes and references should follow APA style for citation. Some examples are as follows:


Web page:

Contact address:
Professor Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah
Director, Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies &
Editor, Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies
University of Karachi
Phone: 92-21-99261654
E-mail: cewsku@yahoo.com
Last date for submission: 31st December, 2017
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title of the publication</th>
<th>Name of the author</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td><em>Sufi Khwateen</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah, Dr. Asma Manzoor, Seema Manzoor</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi &amp; Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td><em>The Ageing Home-Based Women-Workers in Karachi</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Higher Education Commission, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Department of Social Work University of Karachi, &amp; Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td><em>Women Issues: Analytical Researches</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td><em>Bridging the Gaps: Research at the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah (compiled and edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Dept. of Social Work, Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan and University of Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td><em>Directory of Alumni of the Department of Social Work and the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah (compiled and edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Dept. of Social Work, Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan and University of Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td><em>Pakistan Mein Self-Employed Women: Ek Jaitsa.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah (edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan and University of Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td><em>Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies Volume: I – XIII 8 March, 2008 onwards</em></td>
<td>Patron: Prof. Dr. Muhammad Qaiser, Vice Chancellor, University of Karachi</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td><em>Female Home-Based Workers: The Silent Workforce.</em></td>
<td>Dr. Khalida Ghaus (edited)</td>
<td>ILO and Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td><em>Directory of Experts and Resource Persons in Women and Development in Pakistan</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Tahera Aftab (edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td><em>Literacy for the Girl of Today, the Woman of Tomorrow.</em></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Tahera Aftab (edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>