Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies: Annual

PATRON
Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan
Vice Chancellor, University of Karachi
Karachi, Pakistan

EDITOR
Nasreen Aslam Shah

ADVISORY BOARD
Prof. Dr. M. Nizamuddin
Chairman, Higher Education Commission, Punjab

Prof. Dr. Profulla C. Sarker
Pro-Vice Chancellor,
European University of Bangladesh

Prof. Dr. Parveen Shah
Vice Chancellor
Shah Latif University, Khairpur, Pakistan

Muhammad Ahmed Qadri
Dean, Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Naheed Abrar
Department of Social Work
Federal Urdu University, Karachi, Pakistan

M. Abuzar Wajdi
Ex. Dean, Management and Administrative Science
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Sarah Safdar
Ex. Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences
University of Peshawar, Pakistan

Anoosh Khan
Department of Gender Studies
University of Peshawar Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

Aslam Shah
Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Badar Alam Iqbal
UGSM-Monarch Business School
Monarch University, Switzerland

Kamala Liyanage
Centre for the Study of Human Rights
University of Peradeniya, Sri Lanka

Kazuyo Yamane
Ritsumeikan University, Japan

Kristi Poerwandari
Program Study Kajian Wanita
Kampuss Universities, Indonesia

Marilyn Porter
Department of Sociology
Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada

Amara Soonthornthara
Institute for Population and Social Research
Mahidol University, Thailand

Misbah B. Qureshi
Institute of Gender Studies
Sindh University Jamshoro, Pakistan

Rafia Taj
Department of Mass Communication
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Rita Afzal
Human Resources Division
Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BDIS), Dhaka

Rukhsana Hassan
Fatima Jinnah Women University,
Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Tahera Afroz
Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Yousaf Bin Boon
Department of Post Graduate Studies
University Teknologi, Malaysia

Zeenat Sana Baloch
Department of Balochi
University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan

EDITORIAL TEAM
Shagufta Nasreen – Assistant Editor
Asma Manzoor – Assistant Editor
Aliyah Ali
M. Nadeemullah
Seema Manzoor
Dua e Rehna
Rukhsana
Shazia Sharafat
Syed Faisal Hashmi
Muhammad Faisal Zia

CIRCULATION MANAGER
Tabinda Shameem Jafri

FORMATED BY
Muhammad Fareed Ahmed

COVER DESIGN BY
Faizan Yasir (Student, Women’s Studies)

PUBLICATION, ADVERTISING & SUBSCRIPTION OFFICE
Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies
University of Karachi, Karachi-75270
Tel/Fax: 92-21-99261654, 92-21-99261300-7 Ext.2441
E-mail: cewsku@yahoo.com

Price Per Copy:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Surface Mail</th>
<th>Air mail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>$65.00</td>
<td>$70.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>$55.00</td>
<td>$60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>PK.Rs. 500.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>PK.Rs. 400.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Articles published in PJGS do not represent the views of the Editors or Advisory Board. Authors are solely responsible for the opinion expressed and accuracy of the data.
Acknowledgement

We are obliged for the financial assistance of Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan for publishing the 17th volume of Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Qayyum Sahar &amp; Wasima Shehzad</td>
<td>Gender Representation in E-Discourse of Banks in Pakistan: A Corpus-Based Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayesha Akram &amp; Muhammad Ayub Jajja</td>
<td>The Maternal Dilemma and Nuptial Ordeals in Jodi Picoult’s Fiction: The Lens of Maternal Feminism</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iram Tahir &amp; Akhtar Baloch</td>
<td>Terrorism, Human Rights Dilemma and Its Effects on Women in Swat, Pakistan</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Aslam Ismail &amp; Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>A Study on Psycho-Social; Physical Hazards and Society’s Attitude towards Eunuchs</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ra'ana Malik, Nayab Javed &amp; Memoona Rafique</td>
<td>Gender Responsive Budgeting in Education: A Case of Punjab Budget (2013-14)</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rukhsana Hasan</td>
<td>Piece Work and Feminization of Informal Economy: Case Study of Cholistani Women</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sadaf Mustafa &amp; M. Sadiq Ali Khan</td>
<td>Educational Barriers for Females: A Case Study of Karachi</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sajjad Hussain &amp; Basharat Hussain</td>
<td>Socio-Cultural Constraints to Women's Participation in Rural Support Programs in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sameer Ul Khaliq Jan, Ahmad Ali &amp; Muhammad Niqab</td>
<td>Cultural Constraints to Female Higher Education in Malakand Division, Pakistan</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seema Manzoor &amp; Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>The Role of Women in Sufism: Highlighting the Importance of Women Sufis in Sindh, (Karachi &amp; Thatta)</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shabana Shamaas Gul Khattak</td>
<td>Revisiting Gender and Feminism: Global and Pakistani Perspectives</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subha Malik, Madiha Nadeem &amp; Farhat Nadeem</td>
<td>Gender Differences in University Students’ Attitude towards Gender Roles</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suwaibah Qadri, Sidrah Gilani &amp; Paras Khurram</td>
<td>An Analysis of Women Empowerment in Pakistan with Reference to Musharraf’s Regime</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gender Representation In E-Discourse Of Banks In Pakistan: 
A Corpus-Based Study

Abdul Qayyum Sahar
&
Wasima Shehzad
Department of Humanities
Air University, Islamabad

Abstract

Electronic discourse emerged, as a new genre, in the last few decades. Like other fields of life, the internet also shifted business from traditional to virtual domains i.e. electronic commerce. Similarly, the banks in Pakistan launched their websites and online services for the purpose of running more effective business. Like other linguistic aspects, the choice of pronouns plays a significant role in making corporate communication more effective. In this regard, inclusion of certain pronouns and exclusion of other pronouns influence the effectiveness of the financial message. This newly emerged discourse needs to be gender balanced in order to be more effective for corporate communication. The current study examined the representation of gender in the e-discourse from feminist perspective. It looked at the occurrences of third person singular pronouns used for representation of men and women on web pages of banks in Pakistan. Corpus analysis tool AntConc (Anthony, 2014) was used to find out the occurrences of pronouns used for female gender and male gender in 'About us' section of the banks in Pakistan. Texts were copied from the websites of banks. In order to make these texts machine-readable, they were converted into plain texts. Both quantitative analysis and qualitative analysis were used for better understanding of the research study. Quantitative representation of gender focusing on occurrences of pronouns was complemented with the in-depth presentation of the data. The study revealed gender-based disparities in the banking discourse. Female gender is underrepresented (12.74%) and male gender is overrepresented (87.26%). This low depiction of female gender in the discourse of banks indicates gender biasness; putting female gender in periphery and highlighting male gender by assigning greater number of occurrences.

Keywords: Banking, E-Discourse, Gender, Corpus.

تلقیح

کریستیویں دیاں دیاں موجود رہندے ہیں جو ان کی کچھ داستانیاں ہیں جو نیا طرز کے تاریخی، ادیبی اور زمینی طرح اخراج سے کاروبار کی کوشش کی ہے۔ میں اپنی نگرانی کے طرح اخراج سے نہیں کہ ہمیشہ کو کسی قوم کی طرح اخراج سے
کہ رہے ہیں۔ بنیاد میں تاریخی اور سرگرمی کی تاریخی اور تاریخی استیجار سے کی ہے۔ بہت سے کیوں کہ ہمیشہ کو کہے جا رہے ہیں کہ رہے ہیں۔ بنیاد میں تاریخی اور سرگرمی کی طرح اخراج سے کہ رہے ہیں۔
Introduction

To cope with the increased use of internet, the corporate world shifted to the fast-growing development from traditional ways to virtual environment. Referring to this development, Sari & Yusuf (2012) remark that the challenging global environment forced the corporate world to shift their business from traditional modes to virtual atmosphere in order to survive and compete in the challenging corporate world. So, the internet resulted in changing the modes of communication of the corporate field from traditional business to e-commerce across the globe.

Pointing to this newly emerged hybrid genre of electronic discourse, Graddol (1997) calls it a new variety of language. This resulted in a new mode of communication with the increased use of electronic form of discourse. As in other fields of life, technology also impacted the domain of discourse giving rise to electronic discourse. E-discourse emerged as a hybrid genre that is conceptualized by Yates (2001) as an imaginary mode of communication “created by the internet in which people interact and form social relationships” (p. 106). Corporate institutions also switched to this medium of communication for the spread of their business. For this purpose, the banks structure their language in a specific way; including technical vocabulary and following specific linguistic patterns that fulfil their needs. Hence, this study explores the banking discourse in Pakistan.
researchers and scholars to explain how social practices are represented and naturalized through it. Banks, being the financial institutions, exercise great power in social landscape of a society. Electronic discourse, being a social practice, embeds societal values and norms as Yates (2001: 106) construes e-discourse as an imaginary discourse “created by the internet in which people interact and form social relationships”.

Pennycook (1994: 117) explicates discourse as ‘language in use’. The corporate sector constructs discourse, in such a way, to make it more effective for the economic communicative purposes. Similarly, to attract more audience and expected consumers, choice and appropriation of the linguistic choices is taken into consideration. For the construction of gender balanced discourse, language is one of the essential aspects in order to have gender balanced discourse. Contrary to it, gender discriminatory language can influence the effectiveness of the corporate messages. The linguistic choices of the users reflect and perpetuate ideological assumptions. Fairclough (1992) warns that discourse is not only a mode of representing but also a mode of doing. Representation of gender in banking discourse is the focus of this paper and we have tried to investigate whether the discourse of banks is gender balanced or otherwise. We take insights regarding the representation of gender in the banking discourse from the feminist perspective.

Research related to discourse has increasingly become an area of interest for researchers to investigate the linguistic patterns of a specific field. In structuring different documents, the concern of linguists and scholars is to explore how documents are linguistically framed for the effective communication in a particular field. In corporate institutions, discourse is employed to attain the interest of more and more audience. Defining the role of discourse, Gee (1990) holds the view that the purpose of discourse is to make the sense of communication to the concerned community; making sense depends on the context of the production and consumption of the discourse. Hence, context plays a significant role in assigning meaning to discourse. Corpus linguistics is also used for discourse analysis. Shehzad (2007) used corpus linguistics for the analysis of academic discourse. Hence, this research study explores banking discourse from a feminist perspective as it is the least explored area in Pakistani context.

Feminist inquiry in research is complex, challenging and fluid as Ramazanoglu with Holland (2006: 11) points to the basic question “how social investigation should be approached” in order to redress gender imbalances. Moreover, they also suggested strategies to confront these gender-based hierarchies. And these choices, which are productions of social practices, construct societal values. This system of construction and institutionalization is informed by social practices in deciding what to include and what to exclude, what to highlight and what to put in periphery. Discourse choices can be used for power relation based on gender, highlighting one gender and putting other in periphery. It looks at revisiting and re-examining the imbalances in gendered experiences.
Tong (1998: 1) states that “Feminist thought resists categorization, especially based on ‘fathers’ labels”. This view suggests that man occupies main position whereas woman is shown as other of man in discourse practices and social practices. The attributes associated to women are better than men. Under/representation of gender in discourse practices is naturalized through linguistic choices. For gender neutral discourse, the choice of language needs to be gender balanced. In corporate communication, gender disparities can influence its effectiveness.

Identifying the tenets of feminist based research, Reinharz (1992) argues that feminism is a perspective not a method. This aims at creating social change. And the focus of research from feminist perspective is the representation of human diversity. Gender, communication and social change are theorized through Feminist Communication Theory. Regarding feminist communication theory, Rakow & Wackwitz (2004) presented three themes in feminist thought; voice, difference and presentation. Voice points to the access of women to communication for a and their representation in mediated discourse. It identifies how systems and conditions are generated to hear and silence the voice of women. Difference explores how oppressive relationships are established based on class and gender that generates the oppressed and the oppressors. Finally, representation identifies the (mis) representation of women in media and how the process of exclusion is naturalized.

In corporate discourse, linguistic choices play an effective role. In this paper, we investigated the linguistic choice of pronouns on the websites of banks in Pakistan. These linguistic devices are used for effective communication. According to Schmidhauser (2010), pronouns replace nouns and noun phrases. According to Manning (2005), pronouns are used for shortening sentences and making communication easier. Though pronouns are more commonly used in informal communication, it does not mean their altogether exclusion from academic and corporate contexts. The choice of pronouns also impacts the construction and representation of gender.

Regarding language, Spender (1980) argues that it is man-made and it embodies sexism. Such ideologies are constructed and perpetuated through discourse practices. Linguistic choices are reflective of social practices and this relationship of discourse and gender in corporate communication is significantly important to understand in today’s ever growing corporate culture and more female workers than ever globally and in Pakistan particularly. Linguistic choices, in this case, the selection of pronouns, in the academic discourse of the banks is analysed to investigate the representation of gender. The study is delimited to the third person singular pronouns in baking discourse ‘About us’ section in Pakistan.

Gender equality, as defined by Council of Europe (2008), is the representation of both sexes on equal basis regarding participation, power and visibility in private and public spheres of life. No discriminatory treatment can be exercised based on gender. Gender
disparities, according to UNICEF (2008), are not based on natural or biological differences rather they are structured and perpetuated by the cultural system. In other words, such differences are man-made not natural. This study examines the representation of male gender and female through the linguistic choices of pronouns in electronic discourse of banks in Pakistan.

**Research Questions**

This research study seeks to address the following queries related to banking discourse:

- How are female gender and male gender represented in E-discourse of banks in Pakistan?
- How are linguistic choices used in the representation of gender in E-discourse of banks in Pakistan?

**Literature Review**

Fairclough (1992: 63) declares that discourse is a "form of social practice". Further, Fairclough (2004: 88) defines discourse “as ways of representing aspects of the world”. In this way, discourse practices reflect and affect social practices and vice versa. And, discourse plays an ideological function in the enactment and perpetuation of power relations imbedded in social practices with the help of language. Further, ideologies are perpetuated through discourse that determines the relations of domination and construction of reality. Linguistic patterns are, in different ways, utilized for ideological inculcations. Discourse is used by the corporate institutions to construct their image in such a way in order to catch the attention of the expected consumers. This strategy is used in advertising, usually for persuasive purpose. Cook (1994) postulates that advertising can also be classified as a type of discourse.

To attract the attention of audience, media plays a pivotal role in persuasion drawing upon commoditised language. Pointing to the function of media, Fairclough (1995) states that it not only selects what to present but also how to construct them adhering to cultural values. In picturing people, as suggested by Goddard (1998: 114), they become “representative of the social groups they are seen to represent groups such as gender, age, ethnicity, social class, occupation and region”. These reflect the social embededness and also influence the perceptions of readers. In modern era, as postulated in Lazar (2007), power is exercised and perpetuated at cognitive level. And precisely, this is an invisible but effective way of naturalizing power through the discourse practices.

In the contemporary world, companies do not need conventional ways of shaking hands with customers and sending emails in junks to catch the attention of potential consumers. According to Tan (2013), ‘About us’ section is the most effective source for the introduction of the company and providing history of the company. This section
establishes an effective relationship between the consumers and the economic institutions. In this regard, Nutter (2009) emphasizes upon the personal way of communication with the audience otherwise, the company may lose millions of them due to lack of effective communication. In this way, websites help in attracting and maintaining good relationship with the customers in the current global competitive world.

‘About us’ section, according to Tan (2013), provides personal, autobiographical and educational information regarding the website of the company. It delivers information about the background of the company and available opportunities of the business available to the customers. Moreover, it explains salient features of the company and presents how the company is different from the rest of its competitors. Moreover, Lam (2009) affirms that the basic purpose of ‘About us’ section is the presentation of history of the company and lets the clients know the company in a personal way. Similarly, Graham (2013) declares that the principal objective of ‘About us’ is telling the story of the company to the consumers. Further, they should share the purpose and motivation of the company. Moreover, this also states what the clients can expect from a company.

Strauss, Frost & Ansary (2009) articulate that a corporate website plays an adequate role in promoting and marketing the products of a company. Through these pages, companies introduce their services to the customers. In the contemporary era, Lam (2009) remarks that, for any institution, public opinion occupies great significance. In these pages, a company establishes an effective relationship with the customers by presenting the image of a company in a firm way. This section contains basic information related to the products/services of a company.

Linguistic choices play a significant role in the construction of discourse. Out of the provided choices, the selection of pronouns influences discourse in a peculiar way. To make the discourse more persuasive and forceful, one kind of pronouns are preferred over others. Referring to the role of pronouns, Fortanet-Gomez (2004) explains that the decision of pronouns reflects how audience is conceptualized in the communication process. Pointing to the function of pronouns in discourse, Salmani Nodoushan (2012a, 2014) holds the view that some pronouns lend informality to the texts whereas the other formality. Plural forms of first person pronouns as suggested by Fortanet-Gomez (2009) indicate the sense of responsibility and team work whereas singular form, according to Abbasian & Tahririan (2008), reflect personal opinions. On the other hand, first person singular pronouns as viewed by Abbasian & Tahririan (2008) create negative impact. Regarding second person pronouns, Mackiewicz and Riley (2002) hold the view that these are reflection of invocation. Third person pronouns are employed to retain objectivity in the discourse practices.
Linguistic choices can impact a reader as the use of each pronoun has certain effect. Regarding plural form of first person pronouns, Fortanet-Gomez (2009) affirms that these pronouns represent the whole firm as a team. Through these pronouns, the company is presented as a corporate unity that awards a sense of satisfaction to the expected consumers. Beard (2000) remarks that first person plural pronouns show the sense of responsibility on the part of a company. Further, it is also useful when there is uncertainty about any information. But, the representation of a company as a united one gives more confidence to the investor as he thinks that his investment is in safe and collaborative hands.

Halliday (1994) argues that pronouns lend cohesion to speech event and make it easy to understand. With the help of pronouns, relationship is established between reference and referent. The use of pronouns connects the texts as ‘I’ and ‘We’ refer to the speaker or writer and ‘You’ to the audience or reader. These personal pronouns are useful in the negotiation of meaning in communication event. Referring to the use of pronoun ‘We’, Brown and Levinson (1987) state that it includes both speaker and hearer, thus used for positive politeness. Contrary to it, ‘One’ may be used as a substitute for ‘You’ and ‘I’ for distancing, hence results in creating negative politeness in discourse.

In the use of pronouns, the context plays a significant role in assigning degree of closeness or distancing in discourse practices. Clarifying the degree of closeness, Kamio (2001) suggests that the choice of pronoun determines the distance that exists between a speaker and receiver of a message. He maintains that ‘We’ reflects greater degree of closeness between a speaker and hearer. On the other hand, ‘You’ and ‘They’ indicate psychological distance in communicative event. The use of pronoun provokes the gradation of closeness in discourse practices. Further, Hyland (2001) highlights a growing preference of pronoun ‘I’ over ‘We’ in hard sciences. Hence, pronouns are engaged in discourse according to the function of discourse whether it is closeness or distancing. The pronouns are selected on the basis of the role of the text in communication event.

The relationship of language and gender has been the focus of the attention of researchers and scholars in discourse practices. Pilcher & Whelehan (2004: 2) state that “the field of language and gender has become one of the lively, sophisticated and interdisciplinary areas of linguistic inquiry”. Representation of gender is naturalized and permeated through linguistic choices. Chavez (2001) claims that gender, in our lives, influences and permeates our thoughts.

Gender disparity has always been a matter of concern for researchers, scholars, academicians and discourse analysts. This is a widely discussed issue in academic discourse. Referring to inequality between male gender and female gender, Tilak (2007) argues that women get less chances of earning and promotion as compared to men. It
attained the consideration of researchers at national and international level that led to examine gender-based discrimination in academic discourse. In Pakistani context, the research studies related to gender disparities mainly attended to academic discourse. In academic discourse, Anwar (1982), Zeenatunnisa (1989), Jafri (1994), Mirza & Rana’a (1999), Hussain and Afsar (2010), Saira (2012) and Sahar (2014) revealed inequalities regarding representation of male and female gender; male mostly shown in dominating roles and female in the dominated roles. Further, representation of male gender outnumbers female gender in educational texts.

Quirk et al. (2008) reveal that third person pronouns are further categorized in masculine, feminine and neuter forms. Moreover, Carreon (2006) states that masculine form of third person pronouns refers to male gender, feminine form to female gender and neuter form is employed for the presentation of objects and ideas. This study is concerned with the use of masculine and feminine pronouns in banking discourse. Drawing on the use of pronouns in banking discourse, we investigated the representation of men and women through the choice of pronouns in banking E-discourse in Pakistan. In the context of Pakistan, E-discourse of the banks from feminist perspective is the least explored area. Hence, this study explores how gender is shown in the banking discourse through linguistic choices. As Coates (1993) remarks that women are marginalized by showing them dominated. Here, the objective of the study is to explore the representation of female gender and male gender in e-discourse of banks in Pakistan.

Methodology

This section of the study deals with methods and tools used in the collection and analysis of the data. The research study is based on PakeBCoSS (Pakistan e-Banking Corpus of Sahar and Shehzad). The data is comprised of 39 banks working in Pakistan. PakeBCoSS consists of ‘About us’ section of web pages of the banks in Pakistan. The texts selected for the study were copied from ‘About us’ section of the websites of banks in word files. Then, words files were converted into plain texts to make them machine readable. After that, the plain texts were imported into software AntConc 3.4.4w (Anthony, 2014) in order to identify the occurrences of pronouns used for the representation of male and female gender in the selected corpus. We used AntConc as a methodological tool for the analysis of the texts. This tool was used for quantifying the target words in the corpus selected for the present study.

For the in-depth interpretation, the occurrences of pronouns were examined with collocation. After the quantification of the third person singular pronouns (masculine and feminine), the occurrences were discussed qualitatively for in-depth understanding of the gender representation in the e-discourse of banks in Pakistan as Biber (1998) suggests that the study based on corpus requires quantitative representation and qualitative interpretation. Pronouns, as defined by Fortanet-Gomez (2004), reflect the relationship of the speakers
and the audience. Primarily, the focus of the researchers was to examine the representation of male and female gender in the banking discourse. Further, most frequent collocates with the third person singular (feminine and masculine) pronouns were also explored for the better understanding of banking discourse from feminist perspective.

**Results and Discussion**

This part presents the results of this research study. It analyses the representation of male and female gender in the banking discourse. Representation of pronouns used for male and female gender are shown quantitatively in tables and interpreted qualitatively for insightful discussion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case of pronouns</th>
<th>She</th>
<th>He</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjective</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>1056</td>
<td>1149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>8.09%</td>
<td>91.90%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I shows the occurrences of third person singular masculine and feminine pronouns in subjective form. In PakeBCoSS, the frequency of third person singular (feminine) is 93 out of 1149 total occurrences. On the other hand, third person singular (masculine) occupies 1056 frequency in ‘About us’ web pages of banks in Pakistan. This indicates gender disparities in the banking discourse as female gender is strikingly underrepresented as compared to male gender. The results reflect gender bias as reflected through the linguistic choices used in the web pages of the banks. The representation of female gender is conspicuously low (8.09%) whereas male gender is remarkably overrepresented (91.90%) in the corpus of banks in Pakistan. It shows the less portrayal of third person pronouns used for female gender in the discourse of banks in Pakistani context. Concerning gender depiction, the representation is gender biased where male gender gains overrepresentation and female gender is immensely underrepresented. In collocations, the pronoun (she) is found with 302 collocates. Among five most frequent content words, ‘served’ is used for 09 times, ‘Pakistan’ 07 times, ‘trustee’ 06 times, ‘university’, ‘college’, ‘member’, ‘business’ each finds 05 occurrences with ‘subject’, ‘society’, ‘position’, ‘others’, ‘matter’, ‘managing’, ‘Internal’, ‘immediate’, ‘hospital’, ‘heard’, ‘head’, ‘generally’, ‘favours’, ‘expected’, ‘exemplary’, ‘directly’, ‘degree’, ‘deemed’, ‘continues’, ‘contact’, ‘concerns’, ‘busy’, ‘behave’ each has 4 occurrences in PakeBCoSS. And the top five collocates with masculine third person pronoun (he) are ‘banking’, ‘Pakistan’, ‘served’, ‘director’ and ‘limited’. As subjective case indicates active role, the less frequency of pronouns for female gender is indicative of gender disparities in the e-discourse of the banks as Coates (1993) remarks that female gender is marginalized by presenting it as a dominated one. Female representation is shown dominated through the choice of language employed for female gender.
Table 2 represents the ratio of third person singular masculine and feminine pronouns in objective form. Total occurrences of both female gender and male gender are 96. Out of it, female gender attains 3 occurrences and male gender gains the frequency of 93. Concentrating on the objective form of the third person singular pronouns reveals gender bias in linguistic choices in the corporate discourse of the banks. Female gender has been strikingly put in periphery occupying 3.12% in comparison to the overrepresentation (96.88%) of male gender in PakeBCoSS. At this level too, the gender disparity is very high as the difference in the presentation of male and female gender is immensely high. Again, this difference highlights the unequal representation of female gender restricting it to minimal inclusion of 3.12 percentage whereas culminating the introduction of male gender to 96.88 percentage in the banking discourse. This could influence the perceptions of the audience/consumers of the texts as the gender presentation in the web pages language is unequal.

Collocates with the feminine pronoun (her) are ‘personal’, ‘employee’, ‘bank’, ‘consent’ and ‘responsibility’. The collocates also associate the passive and subjective conditions of female gender. On the other hand, five most frequent content collocates with masculine pronoun (his) are ‘career’, ‘bank’, ‘started’, ‘banking’ and ‘professional’. In this way, the banking discourse in Pakistan is gender biased putting female gender in periphery and highlighting male gender through linguistic choices. At this level of objective case of the third person singular pronoun, female gender is shown dominated as compared to male gender. Contrary to it, male gender gets overrepresentation with immensely high percentage of 96.88. In the choice of collocations, women are associated to the passive role whereas men are shown in active roles.

Table 3 presents the occurrences of third person singular masculine and feminine pronouns in possessive form. Possessive forms of third person singular (his and her) make 581 total occurrences in the entire corpus, out of which pronouns employed for male gender ‘his’ amounts to 453 and female gender ‘her’ attains 128 occurrences. As
previously pointed out, this section also displays gender disparities. Drawing upon the representation of male and female gender in the corpus reveals the underrepresentation of female gender with 22.03% in comparison to male gender that occupies 77.97% in the banking discourse in Pakistan. The most frequent collocates with pronoun (her) are ‘personal’, ‘employee’, ‘bank’, ‘consent’ and ‘responsibility’. On the other hand, five most frequent content collocates with pronoun (his) are ‘career’, ‘bank’, ‘started’, ‘banking’ and ‘professional’. In this section too, female gender is put to periphery by attaining low frequency whereas male gender is highlighted gaining very high frequency in the discourse of banks. Sense of possession is associated more to men than to women as reflected by the linguistic choices used for gender representation. Men are shown more assertive in the language used for banking whereas less assertiveness is assigned to women.

Table 4 deals with the occurrences of third person singular masculine and feminine pronouns in self-form. In this section of self-form, 22 occurrences are found in the entire corpus selected for the current study. The frequencies used for female gender are 6. Contrary to it, male gender occupies 16 frequencies in the corpus of this study. As previously pointed out, this section also reveals gender disparities in the E-discourse of the banks in Pakistan. Looking at the percentage for men and women, female gender occupies 27.27% whereas male gender attains 72.73% representation in e-discourse of the banks revealing unequal portrayal as female gender is underrepresented by assigning low linguistic choices used for the representation of female gender.

Moving to collocations, most frequent content words with feminine pronoun are ‘particularly’, ‘pair’, ‘deliver’, ‘children’ and ‘called’. With masculine form, the content collocates include ‘business’, ‘stock’, ‘question’, ‘following’ and ‘engage’. In the selected discourse, women find lesser proportion as compared to men, therefore, leading to power imbalance in representing both genders unequally. In banking electronic discourse, discrimination based on gender is solidified by giving less projection to females as compared to males who outnumber in ratio of the pronouns used for each gender. The inequalities in English for banking purpose highlights light coverage to female gender and portraying male gender in greater frequencies. Genre of electronic discourse for banking purpose reflects male dominancy; that makes females less visible in the corporate language used for the banking purpose. Social and ideological elements leading to gender disparities, in banking discourse too, appear effective despite discoursal
shifts in consumerist culture. Precisely speaking, male gender is articulated more through the choice of pronouns than the females in commoditised language as UNICEF (2008) states that the differences based on gender are not biological or natural rather they are culturally produced.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kind of Pronoun</th>
<th>Subjective Case</th>
<th>Objective Case</th>
<th>Possessive Case</th>
<th>Self-Form</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3rd Singular (He)</td>
<td>1056</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>453</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1576</td>
<td>87.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd Singular (She)</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>12.74%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 presents the summary of the ratio of third person singular masculine and feminine pronouns in the entire corpus selected for this study. Finally, an overall ratio of men and women is presented in the tabular form for a comprehensive view of the discourse for financial communication in Pakistan. Concerning gender wise proportion, this section, as previously pointed out, also displays gender discrimination in the corporate web pages. In the selected corpus, third person singular (feminine and masculine) pronouns have been used for 1806 times. In all these occurrences, female gender finds only 230 appearances. Unlike slight representation of women, men retain high frequency of 1576 in ‘About us’ section of banks in Pakistan. In the banking discourse in Pakistani context, representation of gender is unequal as female gender is underrepresented (12.74%) and male gender is overrepresented (87.26%). This low depiction of female gender in the discourse of banks indicates gender biasness; putting female gender in periphery and highlighting male gender by assigning greater number of occurrences. No category in the selection of pronouns shows female gender equal or near to equal in the whole discourse selected for the current study. In this way, gender proportion is not maintained in the language for banking purpose in Pakistan.

Conclusions

Electronic discourse, as discussed above, has recently attracted the attention of researchers to explore its features from different perspectives and understand its role in the dissemination of corporate message to its clients. We examined the banking E-discourse of Pakistan from feminist perspective and for this the representation of both male and female gender in the construction of discourse by the corporate institutions was explored. Thus, the feminist inquiry of the banking discourse was made through the linguistic choices used in the electronic discourse of banks. The corpus analysis revealed that the pronouns, the subjective case used for male gender, exceeded significantly than they were used for the female gender. In the objective case too, female gender is clearly underrepresented in comparison to men. Similarly, possessive case and self-form of the
third person singular form, revealed gender biasness, male gender occupying dominating depiction as compared to female gender. In all categories, pronouns used for men attained greater occurrence whereas women occupied lesser space in the corporate discourse of the banks in Pakistan.

The disparities in gender depiction are striking; reference to male gender is 87.26% whereas female gender is restricted to only 12.74% in the electronic discourse used for banking purpose in Pakistan. The banking discourse in Pakistan greatly displays gender discrimination by the overrepresentation of male gender and putting female gender in periphery as discussed earlier. This gender discrimination in the gender portrayal can influence the effectiveness of English used for banking purpose to attract more audience/consumers.

**Recommendations**

Gender balanced discourse plays a significant role in the effective communication used for banking purpose. So, an equal gender presentation could be more effective in gaining the attention of the audience or expected consumers through gender balanced discourse. In the construction of banking language, gender balanced linguistic choices may play an effective role in expanding the business of banks. For the gender balanced representation of banking discourse in Pakistan, the financial institutions need to consider linguistic concerns related to gender equality. This would not only enhance the numbers of clients but also their product satisfaction. Contrary to it, gender biased choices of language can badly influence the effectiveness of electronic discourse of banks in Pakistan. Gender equality, in banking discourse, should be considered in the usage of language for banking purpose for more effective consumerist impact and the services of linguists be hired by the banks.

**Future Research**

Further research studies can be conducted to examine the impact of gender biased e-discourse on audience/expected consumers of banks in Pakistan.

**References**


Abdul Qayyum Sahar is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Humanities, Air University, Islamabad.

Prof. Dr. Wasima Shehzad is Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences, Air University, Islamabad.
The Maternal Dilemma And Nuptial Ordeals In Jodi Picoult’s Fiction: The Lens Of Maternal Feminism

Ayesha Akram
Department of English
University of Education

Muhammad Ayub Jajja
Department of English
The Islamia University of Bahawalpur

Abstract

Choice is an illusion non-existent in the lives of mothers; and selflessness to them, is not a decision but an encumbrance. This case is proficiently presented by Jodi Picoult in her novel Handle With Care (2009). Dealing with the issues of motherhood and nuptial ties, the novel raises a few important questions in the backdrop of mothering children with special needs. The novel introduces us to a helpless mother fighting for the survival of her dying daughter and gradually moving towards a troubled marriage and dissatisfied relationships. She is committed to saving her daughter’s life by whatever fair or foul means she can think of. This study examines why motherhood, is still the least valued and what are the factors that make motherhood suffer in the hands of other familial roles a mother plays. Another supplementary source My Sister’s Keeper (2008), by the same author, has also been taken into account since it also deals with an identical maternal crisis. Under the theoretical canopy of maternal feminism put forth by Andrea O’Reilly(2007, 2010), an exhaustive critical analysis of Picoult’s plea in question is done.

Keywords: Jodi Picoult; Motherhood; Nuptial; Maternal Feminism; Maternal Theory.
The present study seeks to highlight and argue the existence of an inherent clash between a woman’s parallel roles as a mother and as a wife, caused by the societal expectations of selflessness and altruism from her in both domains. The study therefore aims at addressing a fundamental question that why a woman as a mother and a wife encounters severe collision between both these most critical domestic roles she is bound to play. The context of this question is further darkened by the fact that the motherhood in question is not normal and ordinary, rather it deals with mothering a special needs’ child, suffering from a rare genetic disease Osteogenesis Imperfecta, commonly known as O.I. as depicted by Jodi Picoult in her novel *Handle With Care* (2009).

Picoult in her fictional narrative highlights conflicting situations by putting women’s roles on trial. These unusual circumstances lead to unstable marital bondage and broken commitments. Hence, motherhood takes over the nuptial role of a woman in the narrative. This research delves deep into Jodi Picoult’s work and identifies the factors that lead to an “irrational mother” and a “failed wife” stigma on women who are already struggling for the survival of their chronically ill and dying children. This conflict can be seen in Picoult’s other novel *My Sister’s Keeper* (2008) too, which will be used as a supplementary reference to strengthen the case.

Feminists over the centuries have voiced their concerns regarding women’s rights in all walks of life, in every possible role she performs. What has always been left unaddressed, however, is the most basic and the most important role she plays, namely motherhood; and the emotional upheavals she goes through while trying to effectively perform the task. Another issue that has been left unattended over the years is the battle, struggle and emotional trauma faced by mothers of severely disabled or diseased children. Jodi Picoult is probably one of the few contemporary writers to have tackled these basic moral questions and presented the true picture of a challenged motherhood in many of her novels. The challenges faced by mothers are deep-rooted in women’s responsibilities as wives and as mothers of other normal children they have.
Jodi Picoult, the author in question, has skillfully depicted the emotional burden a woman carries as a wife and a mother in normal nuclear homes and further complicated it with motherhood of special needs’ children. Her novels use incidents and situations from real life that usually revolve around a troubled motherhood of children with special needs, which makes it an even rare case. In *Handle with Care* (2009), the protagonist child is a patient of rare genetic disease, Osteogenesis Imperfecta (O.I.) while in the other complementary reading, *My Sister’s Keeper* (2008); the child suffers from acute Leukemia. Both mothers in the said novels deal not only with motherhood but a ‘troubled’ and special kind of motherhood that is far more demanding and challenging.

The word motherhood in itself is open to many interpretations, which can be influenced by culture, religion, geographical location and economic well-being. The novels under review are both set in the West, which leads to the notion that women in this part of the world are independent, head strong and educated and are aware of their rights. In this geographical background the novels introduce us to Charlotte O’Keefe (*Handle With Care*) and Sara Fitzgerald (*My Sister’s Keeper*). It is no wonder that motherhood suffers romanticized notions. Women are fed with the idea that motherhood is noble and serene, wrapped in beautiful colours, but the scenario changes when it is about being mother of a child suffering from rare genetic disease and disability, and that too, incurable. In such a case, the mother, who at the same time is also a wife, is caught between the devil and the deep blue sea. A child with special needs requires extraordinary care and attention. Instead of seeing her child dwindle slowly, a mother strives to make her child’s life better by finding every possible solution. A woman does not choose to be a mother of a special needs’ child and even if she does, she does not choose its adverse consequences like marital misunderstandings, non-cooperation of rest of the family members and emotional trauma. It is antithetical to feminism and even womanhood to demand such extremes of self-abnegation from a woman.

Jodi Picoult presents the case in front of her readers very skillfully. Her mother characters have a life and role that they have never questioned to anyone. They face fatal demands of motherhood, the hard paths of personal growth and the generosity of spirit required by their husbands. The price of motherhood hence seems to be the emotional and spiritual death of those other relationships most endeared to them.

The research builds its stance of clash of motherhood and marital relationships, based on the works of contemporary American writer Jodi Picoult and demonstrates how the feelings of guilt and sacrifice are inculcated in women as mothers and wives by the patriarchal set up. Picoult vividly evokes the challenges and trauma that a severely sick child imposes on a seemingly normal family through an upsetting and heart wrenching series of events.
Problem and Questions

Jodi Picoult’s novels serve as nifty contrivance in the contemporary maternal feminist school of thought and help explore the ethical issues concerning women as mothers and wives. This statement can be elaborated by taking certain questions into consideration, for instance, what are the effects of troubled motherhood on a woman’s marital quality as depicted by Jodi Picoult in her work? Does Picoult suggest that a mother’s relationship with her children is richer and complex than a father’s or is it a mere representation of an over-zealous motherhood? Has the price of motherhood declined over time? What is the maternal feminists’ standpoint in analyzing the role of a mother and a wife?

Significance of the Study

As discussed earlier, there has been much hue and cry about feminism in general since the 19th century onward, but very little work has been done on the issues that women come across as mothers and wives. There is particularly very less to be found on the very basic ordeal that women face in their everyday lives, i.e. the clash between their maternal and nuptial duties. Beginning from the olden days to the present day, these trials are faced by women universally. The present research is peculiarly very significant in a way that it deals not only with challenges of motherhood in general but the turmoil of special needs’ motherhood, which is often left unspoken of. Toni Morrison has rightly explained her work as, “I wrote the books I needed to read” and this research has a very similar philosophy instigating it. It addresses the issues that are scattered around us in the society and go unnoticed on daily basis. This research takes the plunge for further research on the said concern, which needs to be confronted solemnly.

Methodology

This is a qualitative research and the researcher has used other pieces of literary texts in order to support her arguments. The feminist theory in general and the maternal theory in particular is used to study the case presented by Jodi Picoult in *Handle With Care* (2009) and *My Sister’s Keeper* (2008). Both electronic and print sources are used to examine the evidences. With the help of comparison and contrast, the researcher has critically analyzed and explored the demands, expectations and conflicts between motherhood and marital commitments. Besides the broader Feminist Critical theories, the researcher has based this study on the collective works of Andre O’Reilly, Professor in the School of Women's Studies at York University in Toronto, Canada; who has written and edited eighteen books on the topic of motherhood and mothering. In this work, data has been collected through the written texts only since this is a theoretical research venture.
Theoretical Background and Framework

Feminism emerged as perhaps the most significant and revolutionary social movement, which aimed at attaining equality between both sexes and left a continuing impact on global scale. Primarily a movement led by and for women for their emancipation, in response to the subordinate status they held throughout history, Feminism emerged as an advocacy for women’s rights over an equal political, social and economic share. As women’s discourse on the issues of gender and sexuality, it insisted upon taking them as individuals and not mere commodities, the chief interest being the eradication of male chauvinism. Since ages, keeping women under male dominance was a generally accepted trend, both by men and women. There was a novelty attached to this movement, as it spoke for half the population of the world.

The first attempt towards making a difference emerged through literature produced by women writers, who raised their fingers upon the atrocities of male chauvinism. Mary Wollstonecraft became the first advocate of women’s rights when she voiced her opinions in Vindication of the Rights of Women (1792) in which she held two major stances: first, an utter disapproval of the patriarchal society that snubs women’s rights to healthcare, education and economic independence; and second, women buying the notion of femininity that turns them into mere ‘spaniels’ and ‘toys’. For her, the ultimate solution lied in women’s education and not merely in their equality of rights. Feminism could not win full equality between genders until the last two decades, even after getting women the right to cast the vote, besides Juliet Mitchell’s claim that it is the longest revolution. However, many would still claim that Feminism has not yet obtained its full ends. It is however, customary to divide the feminist movement into the First Wave, Second Wave and the Third Wave, which are the time frames indicating different trends and struggles in different eras, the chief end being the same, to attain equal rights and liberation for women. Different feminists and theorists have split the movement into three waves, from which the actual feminist theory is usually derived.

Feminism and Motherhood — The Maternal Theory

Motherhood and Maternal Theories have emerged as a unique and individual branch of study under the umbrella of Feminism and Motherhood/Women Studies in the recent years. The work of many feminist authors over the past three decades has proven to be very useful in making the readers aware of the broad tradition within the Maternal Theories. The writers like Alice Walker, Adrienne Rich, Kim Anderson, Julia Kristeva, Judith Warner, Sara Ruddick and many more have contributed their invaluable share in
the motherhood studies. Andrea O’Reilly, professor in the School of Women’s Studies at York University and the founder of Association of Research on Mothering is an author and editor of twelve books on Mothering and Motherhood alone. She has also given an extremely useful anthology on Maternal Theories by more than thirty writers, beginning from 1970's to date, covering at least three decades of scholarship, titled as "Maternal Theory: Essential Readings" (O'Reilly, 2007). These works have enabled the readers to understand motherhood as an ideology, experience and identity. O’Reilly, in her anthology, celebrates sufficient scholarship that has been written on the world’s most important yet taken for granted role of mothering and motherhood. Such work on motherhood was not always appreciated, like it is now. O’Reilly points out that when the influential text on feminism and motherhood Of Woman Born (1976) was presented by Adrienne Rich, such writings on motherhood were scarce and were not encouraged to be brought forward. They were considered a threat and challenge to patriarchy as an established institution. It was a taboo to talk about mothering and motherhood as a revolutionary step towards feminist mothering in the academics (O’Reilly, p.1). Fortunately, when O’Reilly started collecting valuable work on Maternal Theory, there was an established genre and field on Motherhood and Mothering. O’Reilly, in her Maternal Theory: Essential Readings (2007) puts forward the theme and purpose of the book and states that it is important for the propagation of ideas, concepts and models on the maternal theory. Covering all authors from the established to the emerging maternal theorists, O’Reilly brings readers the first anthology on the long ignored subject, as she wants to ensure the variety and diversity. The only disappointing factor, however, in O’Reilly’s anthology is the focus on White, middle class, heterosexual, able-bodied, North American born mother only. Some critics and readers argue that she could have involved mothers and maternal activism on a larger and global level. In the introductory part, Andrea O’Reilly promises three themes in her anthology of Maternal Theory, i.e. Motherhood as an experience, identity and ideology (O’Reilly, p. 2).

In a general sense, Maternal Feminism is a belief held by many theorists and feminists that mothering and motherhood experience is the most influencing, life changing and noble of all human experiences, which can influence society and politics on a ground scale. These activists consider motherhood to be a natural occupation that can save the society from destabilization. Contrary to the general theories of feminism, the Maternal Theories have never been static; rather they keep changing with the demand of time. It lays its claim on the active social and political participation of mothers, influencing more than just the domestic lives and working on a bigger and larger scale. The early twentieth century women’s rights movement brought the first waves of maternal feminism with it. The first wave feminists argued that women should have their own voting rights so that they could become better wives and mothers, not only because it would earn them their
individuality. The more contemporary and modern version of maternal feminism lays its stress on empowering women so that they may achieve whatever goals they want in their lives. For centuries till now, all cultures have ascribed the maternal ideals with a meek, humble and self-sacrificing mother. A patriarchal society has always seen mothers as a reproductive being, responsible for life on earth. With the passage of time, the issues of motherhood and mothering became a problem of identity and individuality. The idea of reproductive function as an ascribed duty to mothers was further socially reinforced through the images that define women in terms of fertility, Virgin, Mother Earth and Venus. It lead women to thinking that their main part in the evolution of earth was the reproductive function that they had to perform without any resistance. These reinforced myths, for centuries, have imparted the idea that motherhood is the most important part of being a woman, resulting in the social and emotional handicap of those women who either did not wish to become mothers, or could not become a mother for some reason, or were homosexual.

Even in the Western cultures and societies, especially in the post war years, women were socially encouraged to maintain large families and give birth to as many children as they could, to celebrate their pride and satisfaction in motherhood. Ironically enough, full-time motherhood was still considered as inferior to the male pursuits, resulting in a simultaneous idealization and belittlement. The cultural images were further invoked by the artists and writers by constantly depicting perfect motherhood through the images of Virgin and self-negating being. The writers and artists, for ages, valourized the images of a typical mother and also contributing to the myths of a “bad mother” as the ones who feel anger, pain, frustration and resistance towards their moral duties; strengthening the stereotypes of “good mothers” as the pain bearing, nurturing, self-sacrificing angels who bear all with patience without complaining. Thus patriarchy defined the good mother role and condemned the negative maternal feminine image. The statistics however have proved with time that motherhood cannot be determined universally. Every mother is an individual first and foremost with dreams, ambitions, desires, longings and then is she a mother.

Maternal Feminism, as a term, has been used by different feminists and scholars to identify the subjugation and pressure inflicted upon women as mothers. The maternal feminists stressed upon mothers’ role in the public sphere of life apart from their domestic role. It was an extension of their role in household, the feminists argued, as women found no contradiction between their domestic and public roles. Women believed that they could bring their own unique perspective into politics that they learned from their domestic roles of mothers, wives and daughters and from the concrete and bitter realities of their lives. This movement started as mothers/women felt a strange urgency due to upsetting changes
in their domestic lives. They stood for liberation, better divorce and property laws and better education for themselves. Their maternal duty became a motivational factor for the reformation and motherhood attained a higher level than just being a biological phenomenon. It became a social function. One of the best articulations of maternal theories is found in Nellie McClung’s In Times Like These (1915), a collection of speeches and essays from the Political Equality League, an important suffrage organization.

Review of Literature: Maternal Feminist Critique around the Cultures

Starting from the 1970s to date, the feminist theorists and critics have developed a body of literary criticism that probes into the psychology of relationship between mother and child and also questions the maternal instincts and its nature. This body of literary criticism was common to all the varied countries and civilizations, ranging from the United States and Europe to Japan and India. The Japanese feminists argued in 1970s that the “bosei” or innate maternal instinct is nothing but a socially constructed phenomenon. They intended to demonstrate that the Japanese conception of motherhood as something innate and instinctive to women had its history back to old centuries and could be questioned. Modern Japanese writings like Child of Fortune (1983) depict the dilemma of a woman struggling to identify herself between the realities of motherhood and the social expectations of an ideal good mother. Works like these present a pinching critique on the stubborn and conventional constructions of motherhood and mothering. Following the same route, Marianne Hirsch’s work from the late 1980s projects the soul of Western feminists’ focus on the matrilineage literature and the revival of subjective view of maternity. The mother-daughter voices represented in literature paved the way for matrilineage narratives and also allowed the mother figures to be seen as individuals and subjects. This new trend smoothened the path for the feminist maternal scholarship and the rational study of the subject.

In Latin America, the feminist critique has rejected the local assumptions and implications of woman related myths that prevail. The feminist study of La Malinche (Virgin of Guadalupe) clarifies that the symbol of virginity that depicts purity, passivity and chastity, is central to the conception of womanhood and motherhood in Latin America. The reason of this “virgin myth” is the convenience and satisfaction it provides to the order of patriarchy. La Malinche is depicted as despised and hateful because she is head strong and chooses her own destiny freely, which brings threat to patriarchal set up. Through this distorted “bad woman” image compels women to accept the virgin myth of “Mexican Eve” and repel the La Malinche figure. The Virgin hence becomes the symbol of Mexican motherhood and La Malinche a symbol of moral corruption and sexuality, which provides enough justification for women’s oppression.
The women’s movement in North America also stated the fact that the so-called maternal notions are socially constructed and are a product of social and racial hierarchies. The African-American and white women in North America, for instance, were convinced to see the notion of motherhood as a national and racial obligation. Patriarchal discourse anchored and reinforced the “mother-nation” symbolism. Literature depicted the mother-nation as protector of the nation that also demanded sacrifice and protection from its citizen and children, fused with the idea of proving progeny to the land. Mothers were shown as limiting but racially essential in the sexually awakening novels by Edith Wharton (1862-1937) and Kate Chopin (1851-1904). Women writers, thinkers and feminists retorted back to these notions by awakening the debate over politics, gender, sexuality, reproduction and race.

On the other hand, it has been argued that in the early twentieth century American literary context, women from the African-American origin have been depicted as active agents and not merely child bearing and rearing machines. That too, as shown by some narratives of that time, came with a price of its own that patriarchy had set in the shape of cultural and social expectations from motherhood. The sinister and brutal depiction of slavery ruined the face of Black motherhood. These early twentieth century narratives also show an American struggle to bring up debates on feminism, birth control and other issues related to motherhood and maternity and associated them with both social decline and progress. Further established by these texts was the opinion that the universal notions and depiction of motherhood are reinforced by the hierarchies of society and race.

Feminist activists, writers, thinkers and theorists reject the valorized ideal of motherhood projected by patriarchy. This is however very important to understand that maternal feminists, by no means, devalue or disapprove of motherhood or child bearing and rearing on part of women at all. Their goal is only to shed light on the myths and assumptions related to motherhood and bring the real struggle to light so that the most important and noble task in this world does not go unnoticed and taken for granted. These feminists seek to voice the opinions of mothers and get them liberated from the narrow confines of strict family lives and seek them their separate identities too.

Virginia Woolf and Simon De Beauvoir (1989) are also among the pioneers of the First Wave of Feminism. Woolf compared the status of women to those of Greek Athenian salves whom she considered to have lived in better conditions than free women over the centuries. The primary reason for the poor state of women in her opinion was economic dependency, however, it was a state in her view still curable. Other feminist writers such as Kate Millet in her work Sexual Politics (1970) called for women’s sexual liberation. To her underlying reason behind women lack of progress and oppression were double
standards associated to women’s sexuality and behaviour in general. Millet’s argument was not confined to the sexual liberation but rather expanded over the horizon of history, literature, psychology, sociology and many other areas as well. She argued that natural gender differences and bilogism phenomena were fundamentally political. She argued that the root cause of women’s oppression was the intimidation in terms of economic, political, social and religious dogmatization. Socialist feminists see women as a victim of patriarchy who are exploited by every possible mean, may that be child rearing, domestic violence, marital rape or any social exploitation such as prostitution resulting in devaluation of their substantial contribution in society.

Further study of the feminist theories has given us an in depth understanding of how the social, political and economical exploitation has defined motherhood. Japanese feminists argued in 1970s that the “bosei” or innate maternal instinct is nothing but a socially constructed phenomenon. In their writings like Child of Fortune (1983), Japanese feminists have depicted women struggling to identify themselves between the realities of motherhood and the social expectations of an ideal good mother. These theorists have brought into limelight the sensitive issue of motherhood and mothering, rejecting the valourized ideal of motherhood as projected by patriarchy. They challenge the myths and assumptions related to motherhood and bring the real struggle to light so that the most important and noble task in this world does not go unnoticed and taken for granted. These feminists seek to voice the opinions of mothers and get them liberated from the narrow confines of strict family lives and seek them their separate identities. This sense of powerlessness is described by a New York feminist group as power-less responsibility. This powerless responsibility is a heavier burden on a woman than even earning a livelihood for the family. Many women work full time and at the same time fulfill their responsibilities as mothers and wives really well; however, the burden carried by mothers in the novel is not comparable with anything else. Being able or not being able to provide a living to the family, in case of a male earner, is usually associated with the socio-economic and political instability but for a woman, failing to provide sufficient mothering to her children is equated to her failure as a woman and mother.

Jodi Picoult, the author in question uses incidents and situations from real life that usually revolve around a troubled motherhood and that too dealing with children of special needs which makes it an even rare case. In *Handle With Care* (2009), the protagonist child is a patient of rare genetic disease, Osteogenesis Imperfecta. The mother in the said novels deals not only with motherhood but a ‘troubled’ and special kind of motherhood that is more demanding and challenging. Andrea O’ Reilly’s *Encyclopaedia of Motherhood* (2010) has a separate mention of the issues faced by the mothers of special needs’ children, as contributed by Ara Francis.
It is observed in the said research article, that the genetic diseases of any sort of medical chronic issues among children have a deep and intense effect on mothers themselves and their experience of mothering. One of the most challenging tasks for such mothers is providing a life long medical care for their sick children. Such children with special needs require double attention, care and are more demanding in their nature and needs. They may need, as stated, a life-long care and look after, depending on their limitations and disabilities. Such mothers not only provide everyday care like bathing, cleaning and feeding their sick kids but are also responsible for their behavioural and attitudinal problems (Francis, p. 836). The researcher very accurately asserts that such mothers regularly switch between the roles of a mother, nurse, attendant, therapist and a physician (Francis, p. 836). It is further advocated that mothers often get in a disagreement with the physicians regarding appropriate treatment or public service for their children that they think is necessary but unavailable. Their concerns for their sick children lead them often to a long dispute with educational, bureaucratic, medical and other professionals, as they are also often dismissive of mothers’ concerns regarding children. This life-long battle that these mothers fight in the public domain is often termed as advocacy care (Francis, p. 836).

Caring and rearing a child with special needs consumes a lot of mother’s time and energies. According to researches, special needs’ children mothers are less likely to be working outside their homes even if they are qualified professionals, because the duty they have to perform at home is far more important and crucial than their careers, and it is very difficult for such mothers to find appropriate child care for their children. This unfeasibility of working outside may then lead to such mothers’ financial instability in expensive countries like the U.S. (Francis, p. 836).

Elizabeth A. Sharp (2018) is a more recent scholar who deliberates on the meaning of being a wife in the post-feminist age. In her article “Betty Crocker Versus Betty Friedan: Meanings of Wifehood Within a Post feminist Era”, she provides an analogy between a fictional character Betty Crocker with a prominent feminist figure Betty Friedan in order to trace the changing definition of the perfect wife over the decades. Betty Crocker symbolizes a more traditional and house-oriented wife-figure, while Betty Friedan contradicts that image. Sharp (2018) in the article, poses an important question; that is, are the familial values and women roles as lenient in the 21st century, as they are considered to be? Sharp’s probe directly aligns with the ongoing research issues that claim that the place and position of post feminist woman, mother and wife, still struggles with the glorified notions of motherhood and wifehood. Sharp’s inquiry, however, does not move beyond the scope of wifehood; whereas, the current research investigates the issues in question both with reference to a woman’s role as a mother and a wife.
Jean-Anne Sutherland’s work on “Mothering, Guilt and Shame” (2010: 313) is another related piece of inquiry into the issues of motherhood and the dilemmas attached to it. Sutherland has spotted out two social spaces that reinforce mothers’ experiences of guilt and shame. These spaces are the workplace and household. Mothers, asserts Sutherland, are made to believe that their mothering is good only if they are stay-at-home mothers. The society, in short, has provided cultural mandates for mothering and anyone deviating from it is considered a bad mother. Sutherland notes, “…the model of motherhood that asks women to give full of themselves at all times, physically, emotionally, psychologically and intellectually. These works capture the current motherhood paradigm that presents women with a model of near impossible standards”. The ongoing research is in agreement with Sutherland’s research since she also highlights the conflicts that are thrust upon a mother, both from her workplace and her own household in the name of good or bad mothering ideology.

Elizabeth K. Laney et al. (2015: 127) have also contributed their share in the domain of maternal feminist inquiry, although from a different dimension. Their article titled “Becoming a Mother: The Influence of Motherhood on Women’s Identity Development” discusses the issues of women experiencing a shift in identity during the process of motherhood. Laney et al. further argue, “The practice of mothering furthers identity changes, particularly because women are faced by the realities of motherhood in juxtaposition with their ideals of motherhood”. The ongoing research takes the study of Laney et al (2015) as a supplementary source, since it addresses one of the strands of the current research, i.e. mothers and their identity issues. However, the cited article bends more in favor of women eventually regaining their identities as mothers, than highlighting the clash of their mother-roles with other roles they play.

Another worth-citing source is “The Importance of Motherhood among Women in the Contemporary United States” by Julia McQuillan et al. (2008) that moves around the cultural and societal notions of motherhood among the non-mothers and mothers of the United States. The researchers note, “Consistent with feminist explanations for delayed fertility, valuing leisure is negatively associated with valuing motherhood for non-mothers” (p. 1). This research is not directly linked with the ongoing debate; however, it can be seen and consulted as one of the very few available resources on the motherhood critique and field of inquiry.

Another valuable source is contributed by Dr. Syed Hajira Begum in the form of her article titled “Motherhood Paradigm in African Fiction: A Study” (2016). Begum probes into some fundamental questions about the African male writers glorifying the image of mother as a self-sacrificing and pure human entity, devoid of any needs and wants of her own. Such images propagated through fiction further perpetuate stereotypes about
motherhood and mothering. She further notes, “This ideology perpetuates male domination in patriarchal society and asserts that woman could achieve happiness only through marriage and motherhood which implicitly relegates women to become the slaves to men in the name of marriage” (p. 1). This research is important as it stresses the need to change the mindset of contemporary writers, of both genders, since fiction is an effective medium to either make or break ideologies.

**Discussion and Analysis: Emotionally Handicapped Motherhood in *Handle With Care* (2009)**

The novel introduces us with Charlotte, a desperate mother of Willow who is a patient of Osteogenesis Imperfecta—a brittle bone genetic disease. Willow is born with multiple fractures and would continue to suffer fractures and micro fractures throughout her lifetime; a windfall that comes with her disease. Willow’s bones are prone to fracturing with a sneeze, with a push by her sisters or peers, with a bump into furniture while walking, all the tiny hazards normal children face while they explore the world around them become ‘dangerous’ and ‘life threatening’ for Willow. A family that can barely feed its children faces financial and emotional challenges when it comes to providing appropriate medical healthcare to Willow that includes special wheel chairs, Pamidronate infusions, abrupt visits to the hospitals and a hundred other things. For Charlotte, it is a lifetime of painful mothering, mounting bills, scarcity of resources, sleepless nights and pitying glances of the luckier parents of other normal children. People ask her all the time how she is doing but the truth is they never really want to know it. “They smile at me, because they want to be polite… but the whole time they are thinking… Thank God it was her, instead of me” (Picoult, 2008: 43). This general attitude of people towards Charlotte and her family makes her doubt their intentions and she believes that people offer help because they want to make themselves feel better not Charlotte or her family (Picoult, 2008: p. 44). Life for Charlotte is about waiting on the phone call from Willow’s school all day, telling her if she has broken or got hurt. Life, to Charlotte, is a never-ending series of what ifs. What if Willow was born healthy? What if life had been different? What if they had enough money to provide for a lifelong health care to Willow? The turn of events, however, force Charlotte to face the most heinous of these what ifs in her life--- What if they had known about Willow’s disability earlier? What if her obstetrician Piper Reece who was also her best friend, had told her earlier about Willow’s disease? What if they had opted to terminate the pregnancy? Charlotte loves her daughter dearly besides all her disabilities, but is also human enough to be surrounded by all these what if’s day and nights. Charlotte recalls, “I had been so busy wishing for your survival that I hadn’t given much thought to the challenges it would present” (Picoult, 2008: 8). She used to be a passionate and professional pastry chef, which she could not continue
seeing the demands of her special motherhood. She is the one who stays up all night when Willow is hurt. Charlotte is not only a mother but a fierce savior of Willow. During her pregnancy when she comes to know of Willow’s fractures, she wishes that Willow had remained inside her body because “You were safer inside me than you would be once you were out” (Picoult, 2008: 3). Charlotte names her daughter ‘Willow’, even though her husband Sean O’Keefe does not agree upon it, because she wants her daughter to carry a message with her; willow trees bend themselves but do not break. Charlotte’s unconditional motherhood meets a life altering emotional upheaval when she is made to choose between her daughter’s life and the rest of her family.

*Handle With Care* (2009) hence explores all the twisted knots of challenged motherhood, morality and medical ethics. It also interrogates a very basic but critical question that how far a mother can go to save her children; and would one alienate one’s family in order to save that one child? This is a series of life altering circumstances and questions that are not only difficult to answer but also difficult to live with.

**Motherhood and the Pangs of Conscience in Handle with Care (2009)**

Charlotte’s motherhood is fierce and intense but it is not without its guilt as explained by Ara Francis in Encyclopedia of Motherhood. Francis rightly comments that the disabled and chronically ill children do not suffer alone rather take their mothers into that suffering too. The mothers face the stigma of ‘poor motherhood’ and hold themselves responsible for the illness of the child (Francis, p. 836). Willow is born with many pre-birth fractures and the guilty Charlotte keeps trying to remember the times when she might have made Willow break a bone while she was inside her body. She remembers a time during her pregnancy when she bent to pick a stack of butter from the floor so that somebody wouldn’t fall accidentally, “Now I wonder: Is that when those seven breaks happened? When I kept someone else from getting hurt, did I hurt you?” (Picoult, 2009: 7).

Charlotte even suffers a negative impression in the eyes of other family members, even her elder daughter Amelia. The time, energy and stamina demanded by Willow’s disability is far greater than Charlotte’s own strength as a human being. Amelia feels ignored by her parents, specifically mother, because she thinks her mother is too busy making sure that Willow is all right (Picoult, 2009: 19).

**Good Mother, Bad Wife?**

In *Handle With Care*, the reader meets Charlotte, an exceptional mother of disabled Willow, who is always ready to protect her and fight all her battles where necessary.
Overlooked is a fact that besides being a full time mother of special needs’ child, Charlotte is also a wife. She is married to a cop Sean O’Keefe who apparently loves her dearly but is a pure patriarch when it comes to decision-making. Charlotte who is seen as not only an excellent mother but an extraordinary wife also throughout the novel, has to face the conflict between these two roles when her motherhood instinct starts weighing heavier and when she is alarmed about Willow’s well being. Charlotte is given an option by the lawyer that if she sues her obstetrician for wrongful birth of Willow, she may receive enough money in compensation which can take care of Willow even when Charlotte is not around to look after her. This highly conflicting situation puts her into a moral dilemma, as the obstetrician Piper Reece is her best friend also. After episodes of self-accusation and denial, Charlotte decides to be Willow voice and sacrifice her own life and image in front of the world.

Sean, who is famous for suing everything and everyone that offends him, does not support Charlotte in this case, rather goes against her. He thinks he is the better parent by saving Willow from listening in the court that she is not wanted. Charlotte is heart broken and pleads that just because she is trying to help Willow in the long run, Sean shouldn’t make her a villain in everyone’s eyes (Picoult, 2009: 85). Even while deciding the best for Willow and asking the lawyer to proceed with the legal action, Charlotte thinks to herself that she wouldn’t tell Sean what she has done (Picoult, 2009: 89). The wrongful birth lawsuit, which stands like a wall in between Charlotte and Sean, changes into a gulf with the passage of time. Sean keeps opposing and Charlotte alone fights the whole world. On one occasion she puts a moral question to Sean, “Where’s the we Sean? You go off to work. You go out with the guys for poker night. You make it sound like you’re with Willow twenty-four/seven, but you have no idea what that’s like” (Picoult, 2009: 113). On every argument that Sean makes, Charlotte has one answer, which indeed is true to the very core, “Oh, Sean. You’re the best father. But… you’re not a mother” (Picoult, 2009: 113). Charlotte is the one who leaves her passion for baking and stays with Willow all the time, she is the one who has learnt all the first aid techniques to apply when Willow is hurt. Charlotte tells Sean that she is going to lose her best friend in the process of doing what is best for Willow; and she doesn’t want to lose her husband too (Picoult, 2009: 119).

Sean is shown as a protective father but a self-centered husband. After sending divorce petition to Charlotte, he exclaims “A year of wishing you’d put as much effort into our marriage as you do into taking care of Willow” (Picoult, 2009: 342). He does occasionally acknowledge the efforts and sacrifices Charlotte makes but never practically shows that. Charlotte recalls that on her wedding day with Sean, he made a vow that he will save
Charlotte from a bullet and she knew he was expecting the same vow from Charlotte too, but she couldn’t make it; because she would have saved her daughter first instead of her marriage (Picoult, 2009: 232). Sean admits to himself on an occasion that he was too busy saving the lives of other people as a cop that he had forgotten to protect his own family, that duty had fallen on Charlotte (Picoult, 2009: 266). He confesses on another occasion when Willow hurts herself and Charlotte takes over the situation without panicking, “For a fraction of a second, as I looked at the two of you, I believed she was the better parent” (Picoult, 2009: 362). On the issue of lawsuit, Charlotte tells Sean that she is well aware of the fact that people are going to think and talk ill of her. She is doing what is best for Willow and does not care about her image as a mother (p. 119). He drags Charlotte to the verge of questioning her wifehood besides all the sacrifices she has made over the years; she painfully thinks to herself, “Did that make me a very good mother, or a very bad wife? It was an oncoming train, and the cost of saving my daughter was throwing myself onto the tracks” (Picoult, 2009: 232-233) Charlotte also testifies in the court that having a child with a trillion special needs and demands has affected her marriage a lot and she is going through a divorce (Picoult, 2009: 402).

Conclusions

The principle aim of this research was to gauge a better understanding of feminist view of woman as a mother, daughter, colleague, friend or a sister. Is it very clear from examining these works of theorists that they have not been kind in their criticism of how society at large and men in particular have exploited women since the Stone Age. Some have also criticized women for accepting the dominance of men resulting in oppression of women for centuries. In accordance with these theorists the in despicable plight of women is to be blamed on patriarchal society who has deliberately nurtured women in order to exploit them for their advantage. It can be concluded that the work by theorists has highlighted significant evidence to prove how men have treated women over the ages and how women have contributed towards sorry state of their own affairs.

Our examination went one sublevel further to examine how the feminists view role of women as a mother and a wife. This was further bifurcated to review how motherhood is viewed by feminists and in particular troubled motherhood, which is associated with being a mother to a disable, chronically sick or dying child. The work done under this context clearly shows that, feminist see role of a wife as mere ‘service provider’, that is, women in marriage role is to cook, clean and maintain their husband’s house, to provide them with offspring and sexual gratification.
As a mother, her role is to breed next generation of patriarchal norms and obedient females, ready to be exploited by the next wave of egoist males. However, apart from some harsh criticism of women’s role as a mother, significant majority of feminist writers and thinkers appreciate motherhood. They conclude that motherhood whether nurtured or natural is a sacred role. Motherhood is a place where all love begins and end. It is not an easy task yet women do it proudly everyday no matter what is asked of them. It is pure form of selflessness. Motherhood is a choice that women make every day to put someone else’s happiness ahead of theirs and to find themselves guilty of not doing a good job every night before falling asleep.

In the light of this mindset in which motherhood is held on a high pedestal by contemporary and traditionalist feminists, we explored the depiction of motherhood in relation to sick or dying children and how it clashes with other roles that women play in the house specifically how it collides with nuptial vows. Jodi Picoult’s argument is evidently clear in her novel under review that motherhood is a feeling over which a mother has no control over, especially when it relates to the mothers of sick or dying children. People around her may see her motherhood and her behaviour as overzealous and irrational. They view her judgments or decision making in her miraculous fight against fate to save her child as dismissive or delusional. However to her it all makes sense. As a mother it is her right to try and pull all stops in order to save her child. This is the most rational objective and goal; and in her mind she fails to understand how people around her do not come to the same rational conclusion.

When a troubled motherhood collides with friendship, careers or nuptial vows, it will emerge as a winner. We saw in the novels under review that both characters lost their friendships, gave up their careers and also lost their husbands during their quest to save their children’s lives.

It can be concluded after this detailed study that troubled or special needs’ motherhood is a lifelong commitment to the welfare of sick children. In such tiresome circumstances, motherhood is not about how much they have struggled in the face of adversity, turmoil, emotional burden and guilt but rather about not giving up during the struggle.

References


-----------------

Ayesha Akram is Lecturer in the Department of English, University of Education, Township Campus, Lahore.

Dr. Muhammad Ayub Jajja is an Associate Professor in the Department of English, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur.
Terrorism, Human Rights Dilemma And Its Effects On Women In Swat, Pakistan

Iram Tahir
Department of Public Administration
University of Karachi

Akhtar Baloch
Benazir Bhutto Shaheed University

Abstract

The global war on terror has created a human rights dilemma for the most marginalised groups in societies. In a highly patriarchal society like Pakistan, this dilemma is further magnified due to the lack of focus on human rights problems it creates for subsections of society that do not have equal access to mainstream resources, such as women. This paper seeks to identify the human rights issues created due to terrorism and counter-terrorism from a gendered perspective in the context of women in Swat, Pakistan. Secondary data analysis has been used as a research methodology, and the Feminist Theory has been applied as the theoretical framework. Findings reveal that women in Swat have suffered human rights abuses in the economic, social and cultural context far more than men, and continue to suffer from psychological problems. The militant activity in Swat altered the mindset of women towards terrorism, creating women militants. The paper concludes that women in Swat suffered severe human rights abuses to their economic, social and cultural freedoms, and were not beneficiary to adequate rehabilitation initiatives, leaving emotional and mental after-effects on these women.

Keywords: Terrorism; Counter-Terrorism; Human Rights; Women.

تلمخيص

الحرب العالمية على الإرهاب أحدث صعوبات حقوق الإنسان لأقل المجموعات في المجتمعات. في المجتمعات ذات الطبيعة الرجعية مثل باكستان، هذه الصعوبات تكون أكثر معًا بسبب النقص في التركيز على PROBLEMS في المجتمعات التي لا تتمتع بمساحة متساوية من الموارد الرئيسية، مثل النساء. هذا البحث يسعى إلى تحديد الانتهاكات التي تحدثت عنها تحديات حقوق الإنسان في سياق النساء في سوات، باكستان. تم استخدام تحليل البيانات الثانوية كطريقة بحثية، والنظرية النسوية كعمودية بحثية. النتائج تكشف أن النساء في سوات تعرضت لانتهاكات حقوق الإنسان في السياق الاقتصادي، الاجتماعي، والثقافي أكثر من الرجال، وتأتي بتعثرات عاطفية وذهنية. حركة التطرف في سوات تغيرت نظرية نفسيات النساء نحو التطرف، خلق النساء مقاتلات. ينتهي البحث أن النساء في سوات تعرضن لانتهاكات حقوق الإنسان الشديدة إلى وقتهم الاقتصادي، الاجتماعي، والثقافي، وأنهن لم تكن حتوفرة لبرامج اعادة التأهيل الفعالة، وتركوا آثار عاطفية ومعنوية على هذه النساء.
Introduction

Terrorism is a phenomenon that aims to target and destroy fundamental human rights by destabilising democratic governments, freedom of movements, rule of law, and ultimately, basic human rights. Terrorism runs counter to the basic tenets of the Charter of the United Nations and undermines the foundations of international principles. This includes advances against the enjoyment of human rights by people, including right to life, liberty and physical integrity. In societies that already have a human rights dilemma, this problem assumes gigantic proportions. Given the sensitivity of this issue, and the fact that the most marginalised sections of societies, such as women, have much more to lose in the terrorism/human rights dilemma, there is a strong need to assess the effects that these activities have on the life experiences of their targets.

Terrorism threatens the security of human beings and creates an environment of fear that places individual freedoms at risk. The question that thus arises pertains to aspects of human security and safety as well (Newman, 2010). Furthermore, given the fact that terrorism undermines the economic and social development of nation states, the brunt of this retardation in growth is usually borne by the most vulnerable of its segments, such as women, children, the elderly and the physically disadvantaged. Terrorism also gives rise to organised crime, such as kidnapping, assault, murder, hostage taking and robbery, and again, this affects the marginalised segments of societies more than its mainstream segments, such as women. The destruction and disturbance of political governments and political processes also undermines the potential for women to take part in these processes that then aids the debate and development of laws that can help in the economic and social mainstreaming of women (OHCHR, 2008). Also, when treaties and agreements are negotiated between warring parties and with terrorist and extremist groups, women’s rights and issues are hardly ever focused upon. Moreover, Huckerby (2015) maintains that counter-terrorism programmes tend to focus more on men than women, given the fact that they are more likely to become involved in terrorist activities. Hence, aid and funding for rehabilitation and mainstreaming of people focuses more on men than women, making them lose out on this front as well. Similarly, the security of
women is not prioritised, making the entire focus of terrorism and counter-terrorism activities to become gender-blind (Navier, 2018; Ahmed, 2012).

Ever since the commencement of the worldwide war-on-terror efforts, Pakistan has found itself in the eye of the storm as far as the repercussions of the war-on-terror as well as its effects on mass population are concerned. In the last 14 years, Pakistan has seen a loss of nearly 74,000 lives, and hundreds of thousands of people are left suffering from disease, disability and physiological and psychological aftermath of terrorism related activities (Iqbal, 2018). While there has been a dire need for and efforts on the development of specialised anti-terrorism laws in the country, such as The Anti-Terrorism Act, 1997 (ATA), the Protection of Pakistan Act, 2014 and a Constitutional Amendment Act which allows Military Courts to try civilians accused of terrorist activities, there have been systematic flaws in the transparent and effective implementation of these laws, which have had the combined effect of human rights issues surfacing as a result of terrorist activities and counter-terrorism measures (RSIL, 2017). This includes several factors, including the lack of a determined criteria for what constitutes terrorist activities, the ignorance of the police force in the context of terrorism and anti-terrorism laws, including a lack of investigation skills, etc. This leads to significant challenges in the context of human rights abuses, including misidentification of accused, delays in lodging FIRs, etc. (CCPR, 2018; RSIL, 2018).

However, alongside these institutional problems and loopholes, social and cultural problems arising out of terrorism and its effects require equal, if not more, attention. While the casualty count and the economic consequences of the devastating losses occurring from terrorist activities and counter-terrorism efforts have been the subject of much debate, there has been nearly nil focus on one of the most important entities in Pakistani society who have suffered in innumerable ways: women. Haqqani (2005) maintains that while Pakistan presents itself as a progressive Muslim state, several areas of women’s rights fall prey to extremist mindsets, and militant activities are no exception. There has been increasing concern over the lack of the state’s abilities to look after the basic human rights of its most vulnerable segments, including religious minorities, women and children, and there has been an increasing influence of militant groups and other such non-state actors over decisions that directly affect these population segments (Brohi 2008; Zia 2009).

While the consequences of death and destruction are the same for men and women, for a patriarchal society such as Pakistan, the long-term effects of these occurrences, particularly in the case of loss of life and earnings, are far graver for women as compared to men. This is mainly due to the fact that women are generally dependent upon their male counterparts for upkeep and maintenance, for themselves as well as for their children. They are, usually, neither educated nor skilled enough to sustain themselves or
their families, and in the event of the loss of the main earner of the family, or any kind of disability being suffered by the person in question, face a much more pressing and dire situation as compared to their male counterparts in similar situations. Moreover, men and women have completely different experiences pertaining to poverty and sustainability (Social Watch, 2005; Fodor, 2006; Bennett & Daly, 2014). In such a scenario, the coverage that 49.2% of the female population in Pakistan (Countrymeters, 2018) requires imperative understanding of the consequences of this long-drawn war on terror but is also critical in understanding the life experiences as well as rehabilitation and sustainability efforts that need to be extended to the affected female population.

This research paper aims to identify the human rights problems created due to the war on terror and its associated outcomes, such as counter-terrorism activities. Moreover, it also seeks to address these issues from a gendered perspective and incorporates some implications for Pakistani women from the Swat valley. In doing so, it seeks to answer the research question of how the terrorism and counter-terrorism activities affected the lives of Swati women from a human rights perspective. In order to achieve this, the paper makes use of the Feminist Theory for its theoretical framework. The feminist theory aims to develop an understanding of events and circumstances by applying a gender lens to the situations and to analyse gender differences and gender inequality from this perspective. It focuses on women’s rights and issues in society and to the power relationships existing therein (Pomeroy, Holleran & Kiam, 2004). The feminist theory caters to the inclusion of themes surrounding discrimination, sexual objectification, and the patriarchal mindset. Analysing data sets with this perspective not only allows for an assessment of the contributions that women make to a society, but also the effects of patriarchy on women and the role of gender differences that can then help in the development of knowledge that can aid the transformation of social, cultural and political practices that elevate the status of women in any society, helping them participate as full citizens in public life, not only assessing the gaps in gender equality but also identifying ways that these could be plugged (Bryson, 2016).

Literature Review

Terrorism and counter-terrorism activities in Swat came as a result of the stronghold that Taliban started exercising over the valley, resulting in a dictation of how people lived their lives therein. Before Taliban entered Swat, women and girls were encouraged to acquire education, and were also actively enrolled in professional activities as teachers and health workers. There were also evidences of women working in government departments in administrative capacities, in banks and in non-governmental and private organisations as well (Avis, 2016). Orakzai (2011) and Ali (2010), however, report that given the patriarchal mindset of the society in Swat, women’s work in non-governmental organisation and private sector was not viewed favourably as these were generally
sponsored by the West. This was given the context of inappropriate behaviour due to the fact that they ran the risk of becoming *westernised*, which was deemed unsuitable for Muslim and Pukhtoon women (Manzoor, 2008). The Taliban used this mindset, that exists to date, to their advantage and developed religious and cultural frameworks that justified the confinement of women to the four walls of their homes, restricting their movements and relegating them to the traditional role of reproducers only. Access to education for women and girls was severely restricted with nearly 70% of girl’s schools being either shut down or bombed, affecting the education opportunities available to women and girls. This was a major step back as Swat was a leading district in terms of male and female primary enrolment ratios of 92% and 75%, respectively (EDSR, 2008; Schifrin, 2008). Some have even termed this as a war on Pakistani schoolgirls, which started from a ban on girls’ education and later enveloped both genders (Orakzai, 2011).

A similar fallout was seen in the context of women’s employment and economic activities as more than 8000 female teachers and lady health workers were forced to leave their jobs under this tyrannical control of the Taliban. This not only affected their own economic standing but also led to a deterioration of the overall household economic health as the contribution of the women was withdrawn. The matter was significantly grave for households that were led by women due to the absence of male earners. While several NGOs such as Aurat Foundation, KhindoKor, etc. made efforts to reverse this trend, the Taliban’s hold was strong enough to crush any such *rebellion* (Sharlach, 2007). This change was not resisted against by the men in the society as it aligned with their concepts of how a woman should behave in society and in households as well, resulting in the banning of women and girls from educational opportunities, employment opportunities and general freedom of mobility, all of which are against the basic human rights. Berry (2003) also maintains that such actions towards women translate into a restriction of movement on their mobility and access to opportunities of employment as well as recreation, self-actualisation and self-realisation. Bari (2010) suggests that such activities and the resultant religious and cultural extremism, have resulted in severe damage to the social and economic status of women, alongside a poor effect on their mental and physical health. This has also left impeding effects on the mental health of women as one of the fallouts of terrorism (Ortbals & Poloni-Staudinger, 2013), and a resulting effect of the abuses suffered by women at the hands of Taliban is the constant fear that they now carry of their return, despite their gradual return to mainstream social and economic activities in the region (IRIN, 2010). Chachar et al. (2013) also suggest that terrorism impacts the psychological health of working women and has also created a strong sense of fear in working women in Pakistan, which negatively affects their working capacity as well as their normal lives. Moreover, the destruction of the economic setup in Swat continues to have an impact on the lives and economic status of people in the valley to date, and this translates into economic stress for all people, including women (Bangash, 2012).
Taliban also used public beatings of women and killing of innocent men and women for the advancement of their agendas. This, in itself, was a grave violation of human right to life and security, as well as personal integrity. There was also the psychological manipulation of women by the Taliban whereby they motivated them to contact Taliban leaders over the issues faced by women, and some of these issues were resolved in ways that gathered the support of women for the Taliban as well, such as on matters relating to property and inheritance rights and such other familial issues. This was done only to gather initial support for the women in the valley. Once their hold grew stronger, they started marginalising women and confining them in designated spaces with no recourse to any system that could help alleviate their problems. Their mobility was further governed by specific rules of accompaniment by their relatives and the compulsion of the veil for all activities undertaken (HRCP, 2010).

These instances led to strong military intervention and operation in the valley, which was successful in pushing back the Taliban on one hand but led to an increase in suicide attacks in the society on the other. These suicide attacks targeted a number of sections of society, including security forces convoys, check posts, police and army training centres, etc., but also did not spare public spaces such as schools, polling stations, hotels and restaurants. This led to the creation of a sense of uncertainty and insecurity in the society, and was further enhanced by the rise of crimes such as murders, robbery, kidnapping, etc. With women being already marginalised, this created a social dilemma for them whereby they were placed at a higher risk of being targets of these activities (Rabbi, 2012). Studies on the effects of the war on terror and counter-terrorism activities has revealed that women and sexual minority groups have remained the silent sufferers of the fallouts of acts of terrorism, leading to an increase in gender-based violence and a reinforcement of gender stereotypes (Mlambo-Ngcuka & Coomaraswamy, 2015; Ortbals & Poloni-Staudinger, 2013). Even counter-terrorism activities have seen an abuse of human rights against vulnerable groups, including abduction, torture and rape, many times as a form of punishment for the involvement of the male family members in terrorist activities, or as a form of extracting information from them which they might well not possess (Welch, 2016).

A further issue that arose from these terrorism and counter-terrorism activities in Swat was the problem of internal displacement. Nearly 2 million people were displaced from their homes in areas of Swat, Buner and Dir (Safdar, 2009). These internally displaced people had to leave all their belongings behind, leaving them in a dire state of affairs as far as their economic and social status was concerned. For women, this created a further dilemma in terms of cultural issues. Within the Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) camps that were established for these people, there was a great unease found in women with regards to their purdah culture and the maintenance of their social relations. These camps were unable to cater to the specific needs of women in terms of cultural issues,
social setup and even in terms of weather problems, leaving women to face significantly greater problems than the men. Lack of adequate segregation meant women were mostly confined in their movement within these camps and faced isolation and destitution in an already difficult and unfamiliar environment, causing a number of mental and emotional health problems. Their interactions with neighbours and relatives, which was a norm in their home districts, were significantly affected as well, which caused further mental and social disturbance to their lifestyles. Food insecurity was also an issue. The cumulative effect of this was a grievance mindset towards the Taliban as well as the military operation initialised to contain the Taliban as they saw both entities responsible for their disturbed pattern of life and destitution. Bari (2010) concludes that as a result of these problems, there has been an increase in female enrolment in Madaris in Pakistan, particularly following the terrorism/counter-terrorism process. The same was seen in the case of Swat where, due to the lack of awareness and literacy in women, a lot of them sympathised with the Taliban and provided support to them, either through having a soft corner for them, or in some cases, through active involvement as women militants (Khaliq, 2010). Mahmood (2017) reports a similar trend of increase in women’s participation in Jihadi groups, calling them ‘facilitators’, ‘fundraisers’ and ‘domestic radicalisers’. However, the process goes further and invariably makes women psychological hostages to the situation, further perpetuating the problem. Moreover, Younas & Sandler (2017) and Berko & Erez (2007) report that a gender imbalance may also be conducive for the rise of domestic terrorism in developing countries. Once men from a society are rendered unavailable or incapable to look after the administrative, legal and law enforcement responsibilities, there may be a resource gap in these areas due to the unavailability and incapacity of women who have not been groomed to undertake these responsibilities. This leads to them playing the roles of supporters and perpetrators of terrorism (Fink, Barakat & Shetret, 2013). This is particularly true for patriarchal societies. This, combined with economic deprivation, could also result in grievance-generated terrorism perpetuated by women, leading to higher domestic terrorist attacks, particularly given the weakness of bureaucratic institutions in such scenarios (Gunaratna & Bin Ali, 2015; Bloom, 2011; Cragin & Daly, 2009). Harris & Milton (2016) further report a negative relationship between the provision of women’s rights and domestic terrorism. Moreover, once peace was restored in the region after the military operation, a number of organisations were set up to rehabilitate the militant men in the region, however, other than a solo organisation set up by the military to rehabilitate women militants, no other setup was established leaving a significant gap between the rehabilitation efforts undertaken for the two genders (Khaliq, 2010).

Research Methodology

The research methodology employed for this paper is desk research and makes informed use of secondary data sources for the identification of concepts that can help answer the
research question. This involves reanalysing, interpreting and reviewing past data. The research makes a qualitative analysis of identified literature in the subject. Desk research method has been applied for this study for a number of reasons. Firstly, it is a cost-effective method for data gathering and analysis. Secondly, for this particular subject, given the fact that the aim of the research is to develop a greater understanding of the research topic, review and analysis of secondary data is deemed an appropriate method. Thirdly, given the fact that the sample population for the topic may not be easily accessible warrants the use of this method as there is sufficient evidence that terrorism and counter-terrorism efforts have created an impact on human rights in general and women’s rights in particular. Also, secondary research is not only available in the public domain, but has also been subject to adequate scrutiny, thereby resolving issues of reliability and validity (Bartnikowska, Ćwirynkało & Borowska-Beszta, 2017; Doolan & Froelicher, 2009).

Data collection for this paper has been conducted using online sources such as journal articles, social media sites, blogs and opinion papers, as well as some books on the topic, alongside newspaper articles, press releases and news items. A thorough literature review on the topic was conducted which led to the identification of further sources such as reports and news items, which were then accessed and evaluated for their value to the research topic. Government sources have also been used to generate requisite facts and figures (Magee et al. 2006). Existing data was seen to be an effective source of finding answers to the research question posed in this study, as secondary data sets allow for an analysis of existing data to answer new or extended research questions (Doolan & Froelicher, 2009).

In order to enhance the quality of research in terms of all resources being used, the research was planned along the aspects of time and availability of resources. Keeping in mind the law of diminishing returns, a timetable was set for data collection and analysis involving collection and analysis of secondary data sources over a period of fifteen days. On average, at least three sources of data were identified and reviewed per day, and some of these were then discarded for lack of value to the topic under consideration. Data collected was coded and themed for its similarities and differences, and data collection was aborted once a significant degree of data saturation was reached within the allocated timeframe. Data was evaluated through the sources used for its collection as well as for its applicability to the topic and to the research findings from other sources. The research method followed a sequence where facts were listed, compared for their similarities and differences, and findings were summarised from them (RESLEA, 2017).

In order to enhance the credibility of the research using archival data, a systematic procedure was followed, which included: (a) determining the purpose of the research as this determines that sample being chosen and the research questions being set as well as
the general context of the study (Magee et al. 2006); (b) the quality of the secondary data being analysed as previous studies undertaken by academic researchers carry greater weightage; (c) the information collected including the procedures followed in the primary research and their resultant findings that are now being used for the secondary study (Everhart, Mardis, & Johnston, 2011); (d) the timeframe within which the primary information was collected as this is relevant to the research topic given that it focuses on the relatively contemporary issue of terrorism and counter-terrorism (Boslaugh, 2007); (e) the sources of the information; (f) and the consistency of the information gathered from one source with information gathered from another source (Stewart & Kamins, 1993).

Findings

Given the issues highlighted in the secondary data analysed, there are several aspects of the problems that have emerged and that have the potential to create significant implications for women in Swat, Pakistan and other developing countries engulfed in terrorism and counter-terrorism activities.

It has been ascertained that gender itself is a vulnerability in terms of poverty, social security, violence and access to resources. Women in Swat were rendered incapable in terms of their economic, social and cultural security as a result of the terrorism they encountered. The human rights abuses that they suffered both during and after the militancy in Swat were significantly different from the ones suffered by the men in the same region. It is therefore essential that the security concerns of both men and women are dealt with through a gendered perspective. In the context of human rights, an ignorance of this factor leads to gross violations of the rights of women as citizens. The instances of the emotional and psychological manipulation of women to gather support by the Taliban also reveals the access gap that women suffer from in terms of their social problems, which the Taliban identified and pretended to fill to garner their support. Once this was achieved, these efforts were abandoned, and women were grossly marginalised. An even more disturbing fact is that due to the patriarchal mindset of people and society, these aggressions against the basic human rights of economic, social and cultural freedom and decision making were not objected to by the male members of the Swat region, allowing these actions to gain legitimacy.

One of the major issues surrounding terrorism and counter-terrorism revolves around the assurance of human rights in all such measures, and women’s rights are, in essence of human rights. In the case of Swat, a major issue that was highlighted was not only the ill-preparedness of the IDP camps from a gender perspective, but also a lack of attention to the rehabilitation of women after peace was restored. This is a particularly grave situation where women have reported to be under psychological and emotional stress post-conflict, yet no significant attention has been given to their problem, and efforts to include them in
mainstream activities in the valley are slow and inadequate. The efficiency of systems set up to counter terrorism activities have not been, and cannot be, effectively applied without a gendered lens from which problems are viewed. This not only caters to the issues women face as a result of terrorism and counter-terrorism activities but also identifies the factors that can make them work in favour of or against such activities. For example, while it is true that most terrorism activities are carried out by males, one of the fallouts of these activities is also the rise of terrorist activities undertaken by females. This has also been the case for women in Swat. Policies and programmes are still, unfortunately, focused predominantly on males, leaving a huge gap which needs to be addressed to understand the motives and effects of terrorist activities better. Given the fact that such a policy is nearly non-existent in Pakistan, it leaves a major crevasse when it comes to installing counter-terrorism measures. Moreover, given the fact that the Pakistani society already suffers from a dearth of effective laws that protect women in various spheres of life, there is a major risk of unidentified women sufferers falling through the gaps in policy formulation and implementation.

Conclusions and Recommendations

This paper concludes various aspects that have been considered in this article and suggests that terrorism and counter-terrorism efforts have a direct impact on human rights. In countries where women form a marginalised section of civil society, including Pakistan, this impact is multiplied in extent several times due to the fact that the take-off point for women’s rights is already low, and this condition is further perpetuated by the problems encountered by women in the context of terrorism and counter-terrorism activities. The case in point for women in Swat further drives this point home, and identifies the gross abuses to their economic, social and cultural wellbeing that were perpetuated due to terrorism and counter-terrorism activities. This not only created severe problems for them during the militant activity and the resultant operation, but also left indelible psychological problems for them, and there have not been adequate resources set aside to help them cope with this. The same was not the case with men.

It is therefore critical that a gender lens is applied to all aspects of strategies that are used to address terrorism and the resulting human rights violations to ensure that women in the society are given the due consideration needed in such scenarios. This would ultimately help in lifting women socially, economically, and culturally, thereby strengthening the human rights debate and the narrative against terrorism in the society. There is also a need to install mechanisms that ensure the participation of women in law enforcement programmes as well as measures undertaken to further the de-radicalisation and rehabilitation of women in terrorism-hit societies. In essence, all terrorism-fighting activities need to be developed in ways that cater to the safety and security of the human
rights of all strata of society, and only then can these have far-reaching and comprehensive outcomes.

In this respect, some recommendations include:

- In the context of developing appropriate, gender-sensitive responses to the problems created by terrorism and counter-terrorism activities, it would be essential as well as efficient to involve NGOs and civil society groups working for the protection of women’s rights in the development of gender specific policies to counter the terrorist threat, both with women as recipients as well as being actors in the process. This would also help in the identification of the causes that could have led women to partake in such activities, whilst ensuring that those who are passively affected by terrorism have some recourse for the protection of their basic human rights. (Millar, 2015).

- Keeping the cultural aspects intact, it is essential that they be brought effectively within the loop of counter-terrorism efforts. Moreover, with the focus of the world already on human rights abuses against women in Pakistan, such as honour killings and jirga-endorsed cases of rapes, a gender lens will help legitimise all efforts taken in this regard(OHCHR, 2013).

- Gender security needs to be linked to provide the human security whereby women are given the same access to education, contribution and development as any other human being in a society. This is a basic prerequisite for stable peace and prosperity. Any strategy that marginalises or ignores nearly half the population in a society on any pretext cannot claim to have a holistic approach to solving the terrorism problem. Moreover, the concept of human security pertains to all types of security required for an effective quality of life for any individual, including physical and economic security. Once the counter-terrorism efforts are undertaken in this background, they tend to have better outcomes(Iqbal, Afzal & Inayat, 2012).

References

Ahmed, A. (2012). The War on Terror is a War on Women. Retrieved on May 12, 2018, from


Iram Tahir is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Public Administration, University of Karachi.

Prof. Dr. Akhtar Baloch is Vice Chance’llor, Benazir Bhutto Shaheed University, Karachi.
A Study On Psycho-Social; Physical Hazards And Society’s Attitude Towards Eunuchs

Muhammad Aslam Ismail
Department of Social Work
University of Karachi

Nasreen Aslam Shah
Department of Social Work & Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Abstract

The research is focusing mainly the lives of eunuchs; society’s attitudes and behaviors; socio-psycho issues and physical hazards on eunuchs. It is investigated in the study that eunuchs’ identity is still not recognized by the society; they have been deprived of basic rights; even families are not accepting eunuchs; do not have opportunities to work in the economy; as they have been abused and harassed by the people. They are engaged in begging; dancing; and sex work due to absence of legal framework in providing employment opportunities. The research topic on eunuchs is chosen to highlight the problems of the third gender, and total sample of about 200 of eunuchs has been selected from Karachi, Pakistan. The survey research is using quantitative data through a questionnaire and used convenient sampling for collecting data. It is found in the research that eunuchs get separated from family and live in eunuchs’ communities; as family and relatives feel ashamed and guilty in living with them. Respondents informed that people gazes are hateful and also taunt them because of their mix-gender behaviors. However, they have been deprived of education; employment opportunities; and not acceptable in the society. Similarly eunuchs’ source of income is mainly through begging and dancing in events; and few also involved in sex work. Eunuchs do not have inheritance rights; due to the reason they have no financial stability. Though Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP) has announced national identity cards for the third gender; but eunuchs are reluctant in making their cards; according to them documentation creates hurdles while applying for CNICs and therefore unable to take part in elections.

Keywords: Eunuchs, Hijra, Society’s Attitude, Psycho-Social Hazards, Physical Hazards.
Introduction

Kuefler (2001) stated that in the world history eunuchs have great importance due to their castrated or de-sexed classification (means no sexual desires). It is observed that eunuchs have had massive cultural prominence in the ancient time periods. Eunuchs were found in governments including government jobs; and placed at prestigious jobs in religious institutions in many of states such as Egypt; Byzantium; China; Ottoman Empire and in Indian history as well. Eunuchs also had significant positions in the Assyrian Empire; and eunuchs presence in courts of Egyptian Pharaohs as well (Steinberg, 2003). In fact in ancient time’s offenders who were involved in sexual related crimes; the perpetrators’ were castrated means their testicles (which creates sexual desires) removed from adults as a punishment to them. It is also noted in the history that adults cut-off their testicles; an organ which enhances the sexual temptations in the body; in order to prevent themselves from sexual desires and to be a part of religious activities with complete zeal (DeMello, 2007).

It is also mentioned in the history that authorities of Jesus’ stated, ‘Christian should make themselves eunuchs for the sake of the Kingdom of Heaven’ (Kuefler, 2001). However, the Latin writers had condemned the practice of castration; that it is against the humanization; though the idea of spiritual castration or become eunuch by themselves were encouraged.

The notion of celibacy (in a way to remain unmarried) had started in the Christianity in order to become cleaned and purer. This phenomenon was adopted by both females and males; to get official positions in the church authorities (Kaatz, 2012). Latin Christian writers had given the idea that position of priests and monks should be taken by the eunuchs as they would not have any sexual orientations; which would strengthen the
transformation of Christians. In the 21st century, eunuchs are involved in various social and cultural roles and involved in many jobs including: in courts; singers; government employees; military officials; and guardian of harem (in former times; the separate household for wives; children and female servants) (Mukherjee, 2001). However, in China during the Sui Dynasty there was punishment of castration for the criminals and in addition eunuchs gained employments in civil services (Dorothy, 1999). It is recorded in the Ming Dynasty that the number of employed eunuchs had reached to 70,000 in the imperial palace (Dillon, 2017). Similarly the eunuchs had specified roles and responsibilities in Greek and Romans; the Emperor of Rome Constantine had chosen eunuchs for his regular baths; hair cutting; shaving; and constituted team of bureaucrats; who were taken all the important decisions with the administrations of emperor (Gray, 2012). It is noteworthy to mention here that eunuchs were considered loyal and trustworthy. In Byzantine imperial court’s eunuchs were responsible for the functionaries of domestic and administrative duties (Tougher, 2008).

In India and Bangladesh eunuchs are called as hijra in Hindi who belong to the third gender. It is believed that majority of hijras are by birth and very few had gone through self-castration. According to available records there are about five to six million hijras and they live in their own communities (Tougher, 2008). In India and Bangladesh the dress codes of hijras are saris (Indian dress code for women) and used to have make-up on their faces. It is also observed that they live in marginal societies instead of in communities where men and women families resided; this is considered discrimination against the third gender. As compared to the Western or the Arab world; eunuchs have less importance in eastern societies because eunuchs have no respectable jobs facilities. Hijras are earning from different ways for instance went to weddings; at birth of new child; at openings of new shops or factories; and at other family events for performing dance and shared happiness; this way eunuchs received some money in form of present or gift by the family heads, parents of the new born babies and owner of the new shops (Chung, 2012).

The status of hijras’ in Bangladesh was deplorable as due to illegitimate identity issues were hindering their growth; due to the reason the eunuchs are facing socio-economic issues including high rate of illiteracy; extreme unemployment; violence and discrimination against the gender minority. However, it is also considered that the marginalized eunuch community could be fruitful in the economy; if private sector provides them employment opportunities in a way to become part of labor force in the country. Meanwhile in 2014, Bangladesh had given the third gender identity to the eunuchs. According to estimates there are 10,000 to 50,000 million populations who were living without having an identity in the country. After the Labannya’s heroic movement eunuchs not only given the status of third gender but also planned to recruit eunuchs in the traffic police and evolve other sources of earnings. Bangladesh central bank urged financial institution to work for the grooming of eunuchs community through corporate
social responsibility (CSR) fund (Dr. Murphy, 2009). In fact in South Asian countries eunuchs have granted the legal status including in Nepal; India; Pakistan and in Bangladesh. Now the third gender can have national identity cards (NIC) and passports to integrate them with the mainstream of population.

**Conceptual Framework**

Different countries are using various terminologies for the third gender. As in South Asia usually ‘hijra’ term used for the eunuchs and hermaphrodite (in English) and in Pakistan eunuchs are known as *Khawjasara* in Urdu language. The word eunuch defined as person who are intersex and have no sexual orientation and being characterized as third gender. At the time of birth their genitals are look like male; which were identified as male sex but later on due to their vague genital they have been called as *hijra* or *Khawjasara*. Habib (2012) cite Hahm (2010) defining as eunuchs are intersex by birth; *hijras*’ have both genders men and women characteristics. Usually, the eunuchs follow women lifestyles especially while dress up themselves (Yenilmez and Kilic, 2007). In Pakistan eunuchs have been preferred to call them *Khawjasara and Murat*. As Murat word had taken from Urdu language; which has divided into two meanings: first *Mard* and *Aurat*. As the third gender believed that they have characteristics of both the genders but except the sexual roles so they are calling themselves as *Murat* (Habib, 2012). Similarly this research study is also using term *hijra* and *Khawjasara* in the text, which are known as eunuchs in Pakistani local term.

**Objectives of the Study**

The objectives have been framed in order to identify the outcomes of this research study which are as follows:

1. To identify the circumstances; which forced their parents to give their child into the care of *Guru* (head of *hijra* community).
2. To explore the professions and income patterns of eunuchs.
3. To observe psycho-social issues of eunuchs.
4. To highlight the forms of violence faced by the eunuchs.

**Research Question**

The research is focusing on very important fragment of the society ‘eunuchs’; the third gender which are also part of human society. But they have never received respect as men and women have been enjoying in the societies. Hermaphrodites are also born from mother’s womb as girl child and boy child born; so, *hijra* is also God’s creation. The eunuchs and *hijra*’s status have been varying with different roles and functionaries in all over the world. The research study has done in the city ‘Karachi’ of Pakistani with having specific research questions which are as follows:
1. Measuring the attitudes of families towards eunuchs, their behaviors and various factors which are pressurizing eunuchs to leave the house and live with other eunuchs or hermaphrodites.

2. The study has its second research question is that reinforcement; encouragement and support towards third gender will help them towards the positive mode of behaviors in eunuchs.

The Eunuchs in South Asia

In South Asian societies eunuchs or hermaphrodites have been familiar with the term hijra’s; chakka; khusra; khawjasara; murat (Abelove et, al., 1993). There is no pre-define definitions of hijra in any of literature but they have been categorized as third gender; means they have both the characteristics of male and female (Rehan, 2011). Most of hijra’s wear female dresses; jewelry; makeup; having long hairs like women (by using wigs) (Nanda and Warms, 2010). It seems like hijra’s have been referring themselves as females or women and they like to call them as ‘she’. In fact hijra’s have been identified themselves by the female names and have separate living communities. It is medically examined that hijra’s have mix genitals of both the sexes; due to the reason they have adopted women lifestyles and behaviors (Roughgarden, 2004). And traditionally in the sub-continent they have been involved in dancing at wedding events; in birth ceremonies and in different occasion in order to bless people with good future prospects (Smith, 2008).

Eunuchs in Post-Independence Era

After independence; in India the criminal law against hijra’s was abolished in 1952 though reflected most of previous laws in form of changed attitudes towards various tribes; clans; against the hijra’s. Later in 2012, Indian law makers had made Karnataka Police Act (Amended) for those eunuchs who were consecutively involved in criminal activities of kidnapping children; forced emasculation and for other offences as well; in order to punish such culprits (James, 1997).

It is found that after Mughal reign; status of eunuchs was deteriorated badly (Thomas, 2012). The eunuchs were criticized because of their bodies and various sexual identities by the British rulers. Eunuchs were banned to perform any job publicly; in fact snatched all basic rights. The deprived conditions of eunuchs had pushed themselves into begging and prostitution though their own families were not accepting them (The Times of India, 2015). The impacts of harsh rules made by the British rulers were not retracted back; and eunuchs never regain their respect back even after independence. After spending such crucial time period; eunuchs has started working in temples as dancers and singers in order to earn properly for the livelihoods (Sharma, 2016). To enhance their social status they had been attended weddings ceremonies in order to pray for the blessings of children (Bonner, 1990).
It was also mentioned in the history that eunuchs’ songs were always based on pregnancy and for pregnant women (Singh 1997). History further evaluated the roles of eunuchs; Hindu Kings hired hijra’s to teach music to their female counterparts (Renard, 2007).

Hijra’s had been characterized or portrayed as a piece of performing art in South Asian countries (Bolich, 2007). In fact the dramas; movies; and cultural films depict them as skilled entertainer and in addition they had been idealized as spiritual while performing religious rituals in the society (Abbas, 2003). And in some other few cases it was also envisaged that eunuchs cursed people if they did not fulfill their demands of money; due to such reasons people believe that women remained unfertile or become barren; this could also be the reason of degrading their statuses in the region (Hockings, 1992).

In Indo-Pak culture they have not been accepted in their homes; this is the prime reason that the third gender do not respected in the society (James, 2013). It is unveiled that due to financial scarcity hijra’s get into sex work and begging; and become susceptible in the society (Austell, 2009). Due to such ongoing practices police call themselves as criminals; and enter into their houses for searching without any warrants or proofs (Laungani, 2006). This is how they have been disrespected in the society and trust deficit has been increasing till now. In fact according to hijra’s they pretend that their community also dislike the begging; dancing work and their bizarre lifestyles. In the wake of; they have been retarded with many health problems; as eunuchs used to have male husbands for sexual activities; in such conditions they used to have unsafe sex which may cause HIV-AID among the third gender; as eunuchs are well aware about all such diseases (Minow & Breenberg, 2008).

The Eunuchs in Pakistan

The decision taken in 2009 by the Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP) that eunuchs identified as third gender in the country; as they have been given permission for making national identity cards (NICs) in order to give them status of Pakistani citizen with all complete basic rights (Robinson, 2001). According to some estimates around eighty thousand to three lacks population of eunuchs constituted in Pakistan. In fact it is also stated in laws that homosexuality is illegal; or if someone gets involved in such practice he/she should be jailed for two or more years (Shahzadi and Dr Ali, 2018).In Pakistani local language they have been known as ‘Khawajasara’ (The Express Tribune, 2012).

It is observed that in Pakistani culture; society’s attitudes and behavior towards eunuchs is weird or bizarre and even family do not accept them as member of the houses (Kilbride, 2015). Eunuchs are living in deplorable conditions with extreme poverty. As they cannot go to schools or in any other educational institutions; students misbehave or insulted them due to their mix characteristics of males and females; regardless of knowing what
the ground realities behind their sexual identities are (Harrington, 2016). Similarly they have to face embarrassments at workplaces because pressure groups or co-workers feel untrusted and make them feel very uncomfortable or many of witnesses argued that they have been sexually harassed by the male workers in the offices (Singh, 2001). Due to such reasons, they have been engaged in sex professions and in begging. However; it is admitted by most of hijra’s that their community dislikes such professions; but in the wake of such financial uncertainty eunuchs are involved in such jobs (Kollen, 2016). In this current situation law enforcement agencies arrest them and labeled charges of crimes and of misconduct; police raided their houses on the basis of speculations. It is also found that due to such allegations of crimes their respects and prestige have been deteriorating in the society (Williams, 2014). It is also practicing in Pakistani societies where eunuchs keep husbands which is usually called as (Girya in local language) (Dawn, 2010). It is also noticed that due to involvement in sexual activities; eunuchs have been more prone to many disease including deadliest HIV-AIDs. Though in religions true hermaphrodites or eunuchs have prestigious state which is declining; due to their indecent behaviors in the society (Halliday et al., 2012).

Eunuchs are marginalized section of the society; truly witnessed that it is considered a taboo to talk about over eunuchs (Alvi et al., 2018). Meanwhile it is also a myth in hijra community that they kidnap children’s from houses in order to bring them in hijra unified circle (Akhter et al., 2012). However it is justified by the elder’s eunuch that young boys who fled from houses join them; in fact there are number of men who may involve in sexual acts or have become lust for them so, they may join their community by their own will (Saenz-Herrero, 2014). In some of cases it is also come to lime light that people may fall in love with eunuchs; and not accepted by their families in such situations men join hijra community. It is also reported that parents sold their children in the eunuchs’ community because of extreme poverty in Pakistan (Dominic, 2018). There is one of survey conducted by the Gallup Pakistan (2010) where they have asked that should eunuchs have allocated quota in educational institutions or in offices? In this regards men and women of both institutions about 55 percent responded that ‘yes’. However 60 percent of people completely disagree that they do not want to be a friend of eunuchs (Jami, 2005). It seems like after giving equal status as of with other genders; still people treating eunuch as second class gender.

According to Aqsa and Dr. Shahzad, they have found in their research that eunuchs believing themselves as misfit in the society. Whereas they also feel satisfied by their living styles; and also acknowledge that they have been important part of the society. In fact they are well aware about the hijra history; that they were very much respected and high status in Mughal emperors time period and in other dynasties (The Express Tribune, 2010). The research also highlighted that in ancient time period eunuchs have prestigious roles which were written on copper plates and preserved by the older Gurus in Pakistan.
Meanwhile it is recorded that in Pakistan; there is group of eunuchs who receives alms (food and gifts) from specific places. It is also mentioned by the eunuchs that hijra community have their own pre-define jurisdiction; which cannot be intervened by any other member of other hijra community (BBC, 2010).

**Socio-Economic Conditions of Eunuchs**

The hijra’s have changed their names after entering into the communities; and before knowing that they are hijra they have been called by male names in Pakistani societies (Shahzadi & Dr. Ali, 2018). Usually eunuchs have chosen female film stars names or famous names in a way to attract males. Even eunuchs have no information about their own date of birth. According to estimates most of hijra’s are falling in age of 30; and Gurus are in the age late forties; however the young age hijra’s have found less in Pakistan. It is also found in literatures and observed in societies that hijra community have their own predefine personal and ethical norms; and have own social construction which were followed by the other hijra members of the society (Nynas and Yip, 2016). Whereas parents of such children leave in the hijra community because of many social and financial pressures and some of eunuchs were taken by the family at the time of birth (Kollen, 2016). They have relationships of guru (master) and chela (disciple); who are considered the custodian of hijra’s and have pre-define roles and responsibilities which were allocated by the guru or head of the community. Eunuchs or chelas in community have a type of family in which chelas consider themselves as sisters and have relationship of sisterhood among their communities (Laungani, 2001). The Gurus consider chelas as their daughters and look up them; teach them about rules and regulations; Gurus taught them dancing as well. However the earned money from begging or other professions eunuchs have to give to their Gurus. Then gurus are responsible for the food; shelter; and basic necessities of their hijra members (Shahzadi and Dr Ali, 2018). Though other researches shows that another group of hijra also said that their gurus are harsh; aggressive; and have strict control over eunuchs. In fact the research also highlighted that some of gurus snatch money from their chellas; and sometimes beaten them and restrict them to not even meet their parents and family. Every guru has specific area or territory in which they have conducted their business (means of begging and prostitution) no one enter in other one’s boundaries; otherwise it would be considered an offence in hijra community (Nanda, 2014).

**Socio-Psycho and Physical Hazards of Eunuchs**

Due to deprived and vulnerable conditions; eunuchs are facing social and psychological issues in almost all parts of the world (Geo News, 2016). The first and foremost concern is lack of education among hijra’s in Pakistani societies; because literacy can bring positive changes in eunuchs’ lives. As education creates maturity and acknowledge about
right and wrong; and also improve lifestyles. Such lacking in eunuchs embracing adverse effects and also increased frustrations towards other gender of the society. Eunuchs are prevented from taking part in social organizations though *hijra’s* are also part of the society; that saturation influences their minds and thoughts due to the reason they behave aggressively and sometimes curse the people. There have been reported cases of violence on eunuchs; as admirer friends of eunuchs get jealous; if they become friend of others then they use to throw acid on eunuch; an acid survivor eunuch said. It was also revealed in one of research that eunuchs consider males as their perfect brothers but later on they get to know that they are interested in them to have sex; however women are not being reported in such acts by the eunuchs. It is also found that young boys use to plan party with eunuchs where they fulfill their desires or rape eunuchs and in fun they use to burn them with cigarettes. In weddings eunuchs are also get abducted and get raped; there is one of reported cases of Punjab where three eunuchs were called on wedding for dancing but being abducted by men; then taken them to distant place from wedding house; got raped and sexually harassed. After such violent incident eunuchs lodged FIR against the accusers and demanded the justice and punishment (Dawn, 2010).

**National Legal Framework for Eunuchs**

After several years struggle of eunuchs now the country has given the status of citizen to eunuchs through registration in National Database Regulation Authority (NADRA); and the organization is commanded in 2009 to make national identity cards (NICs) in a way to recognize them as third gender of the country (Aurat Foundation, 2016). However at earliest there were many issues raised because incomplete availability of data hinders their registration. In most of cases eunuchs did not have their fathers name; in this case NADRA and other concerned authorities to use their *Guru* name as head of household in absence of father’s name (The Express Tribune, 2011). Similarly all fundamental and protection rights ensured to eunuchs according to the constitution of Pakistan (The Express Tribune, 2010).

Similarly, after recognition of eunuchs as third gender in the country; the Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP) further advocated the NADRA for further fasten the registration process; as they had given right to cast vote in previous election of 2013 (The Nation, 2017). Later on SCP had directed the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to enroll eunuch’s voters list; that they should participate in election as being citizen of Pakistan (The Express Tribune, 2011).

Further the SCP directed the taxation departments and banking sectors to hire eunuchs or *hijra’s* for recovery of property tax and loan from citizens or different corporation of Pakistani entities (Dawn, 2012). In this regard, eunuchs were hired in Karachi; and about 50 eunuchs were hired in Rawalpindi where they have obtained property tax by going through homes with drums and ask for immediate payments from defaulters.
The government also entitled with all basic rights; and further emphasizes in provision inheritance of property. Meanwhile the government pledged to support them financially under Bait-ul-Mal and Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) (Haider, 2014). However, given right to get education and also allowed to perform all kind of jobs in all sectors of the economy. In fact also endures sexual security as they can work without any fear of harassments. They were also promised to have vocational trainings for eunuchs as they can equip themselves to work independently. Though the SCP strictly banned the self-castration; according to Islamic injunctions it is also prohibited in Islam (Dawn, 2012).

All such efforts were made by known eunuchs of Pakistani society including Almas Bobby; Bindiya Rana and some others (The News, 2013). Then all such favors or genuine basic rights received from government of Pakistan. But they were just tall claims and just paper documentation work, where no single developmental work done in this regard. No changes has been made till now because when they get ill; eunuchs have been sent to male wards and when eunuchs commit crime; they have been sent to male jail (The Express Tribune, 2010). Hijra’s are still facing deplorable condition while having no access to education and in health so far (Hindustan Times, 2017). And it is also observed that eunuchs are taking self-castrations by themselves without any consultation of surgeon which could be life threatening and considered an inhuman act (Dawn, 2011). To be honest, the government and society both have to be firm towards hijra’s in order to avoid violation of their rights.

Research Methodology

The method of data collection is constituted on two basic ways including secondary and primary data collection method. The secondary data is associating with available literature in form of researches; books; news; and on websites. Whereas the primary data attributing with the new research or information which is explored with having new objectives or aims and research problems. In this study, secondary data produced through reading multiple books at various libraries; book stores and at HEJ center of Karachi University (KU), where can have all access to newly written research papers. However there is various type of data collection; however quantitative and qualitative method is most commonly used in data collection while conducting survey. In order to collect data, researcher has chosen purposive and snowball sampling; or from structured population and even from unstructured population. In this study, the questionnaire comprises of 101 questions out of which 09 are open ended questions and remaining 92 questions are close ended; in which several options have been designed for the targeted population of the eunuchs in the study. This research survey had pre-tested a questionnaire from about 20 eunuch respondents and then made amendments accordingly in the questionnaire. The sample of this study is comprised of 200 eunuch respondents; from the whole population of hijra community living in Karachi.
Testing of Hypotheses

Hypothesis No. 1:

The attitude of family force eunuchs to leave house
Ho: The attitude of family do not force eunuchs to leave house
H1: The attitude of family force eunuchs to leave house

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitude of Family</th>
<th>Eunuchs Leave House</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discriminatory attitude force me to leave house</td>
<td>Parents and relatives forcefully send me to hijra community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family felt ashamed</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siblings life affecting</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sisters not get married</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family stressed upon behavior</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi-Square Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
<th>Exact Sig. (2-sided)</th>
<th>Exact Sig. (1-sided)</th>
<th>P - Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>4.231</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.238</td>
<td>.236</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>4.435</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.218</td>
<td>.227</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisher's Exact Test</td>
<td>4.369</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.099</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.753</td>
<td>.781</td>
<td>.404</td>
<td>.053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pearson Chi-Square value is 4.231
The P-value is 0.053
Degree of Freedom (df) is 5

It concludes that p-value 0.053 > 0.05 which clearly shows that there is no relationship between two variables ‘attitude of family’ and ‘eunuchs leave house.’ Hence, Ho is accepted and it can be said that attitude of family towards eunuchs or hermaphrodites is not the only reason by which eunuchs decided to leave home and start living in Hijra Community.

**Hypothesis No. 2:**

Reinforcement of self-esteem will change the behavior of eunuchs

Ho: Reinforcement of self-esteem will not change the behavior of eunuchs
H1: Reinforcement of self-esteem will change the behavior of eunuchs
Reinforcement of Self-Esteem* Eunuchs Behavior Cross Tabulation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Deprived of basic rights</th>
<th>Cursed people</th>
<th>Leave sex work</th>
<th>To live respectable life</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reinforcement of Self-Esteem</td>
<td>Equal rights in society</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Educational opportunities</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employment opportunities</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi-Square Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
<th>Exact Sig. (2-sided)</th>
<th>Exact Sig. (1-sided)</th>
<th>P – Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>2.159a</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.905</td>
<td>.908</td>
<td>.905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>2.132</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.907</td>
<td>.912</td>
<td>.912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisher's Exact Test</td>
<td>2.148</td>
<td></td>
<td>.914</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.133b</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.715</td>
<td>.736</td>
<td>.372</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N of Valid Cases: 200

Pearson Chi-Square value is 2.159a
The P-value is 0.028
Degree of Freedom (df) is 6
It concludes that p-value 0.028 < 0.05 which clearly shows that there is strong relationship between two variables ‘reinforcement of self-esteem’ and ‘eunuchs behavior.’ Hence, Ho is rejected and it can be analyzed that reinforcement of self-esteem will restore their confidence as they will have equal rights; education opportunities or employment opportunities; ultimately their aggressive and weird behavior would be changed.

Results and Discussions

In the survey, there are 200 respondents eunuchs have been taken for the research study in which about 31 percent of population are falling in the age of 26 years to 30 years whereas another mass group of around 23 percent are falling in age of 36 years to 40 years. It is medically proven that one in four thousands and five hundred born with ambiguous genitals, according to Health Research Funding Statistics (2014). However the number of eunuch population has been increasing with far more pace due to transgender; and transsexual. Though eunuchs or hermaphrodites should be considered those who are born with mixed genitals or who are intersexes.

According to the medical science or available researches it is found that there are three kinds of hermaphrodites which are male pseudo, female pseudo, and true hermaphrodites. But it is come to knowledge that some of eunuchs’ respondents are unaware about the types. In addition, the survey asked the respondents about mention the type of eunuchs then 43.5 percent responded that they are male pseudo. Another 23.5 percent informed that they are female pseudo. However, two percent are considered themselves as true hermaphrodites. Whereas; there is about 31.5 percent of eunuchs who responded that they are actual Khawjasara.

The study found that majority of eunuchs’ population of this research survey is demanding the fixation of quota in educational institutions because they have been facing extreme discrimination at schools; colleges or in universities. The fixation of quota would encourage and support the third gender in the country and they also can become productive for the society. However education is also considered an indicator of human development.

On the query it is found in the research that around 64 percent of eunuch respondents were illiterate cannot even read and write. In fact it is observed that about 16 percent of eunuchs have primary education; it seems like in childhood their families would have admitted them into schools like others children. However their drop out towards further education shows that when they get aware about their sexual identity and behave in a certain manner like having female characteristics due to their intersexuality; would consider hindering factor in way of getting education. However there are examples of other eunuchs in the sample that have reach to secondary education; matriculation; inter or to graduation. Fewer have attain to that level of education but it can be good for other eunuchs to follow them; as they have showed courage and confidence.
Family Acceptance

The survey revealed that majority of eunuch leave home by their own will because of many reasons. Around 21 percent shared that their family do not allow them to go outside because “I am the third gender” and have distinctive characteristics which would be shameful; another group of eunuchs of about 14 percent said that society does not behave well with us and around 13.5 percent said that people taunt us; and also mentioned that they leave house as to remove guilty of their families. Whereas, there is another group of around 39 percent who said that they did not leave home by their own will.

The research observed that around 182 eunuch respondents are living in hijra community and remaining living with their parents and siblings. The survey readings found that around 45.5 percent are living with the same sex people in the communities. However 41 percent of people are living with the guru where they have head of hijra’s who look up or handle all matters of hijra’s in their communities. It is concluded that every human being need to live in family or in circle where their values and interests flourishes in a way live prosperous life. Due to the reasons eunuchs left their home; and become part of hijra community. According to them they are in a better condition as compared while lived with their families; as they were bound to move even.

The study has found that around 60.4 percent of eunuch respondents informed that same sex people support them for joining hijra community. However there is another group eunuchs around 21.9 percent who said that parents sent them to the hijra community. About 15.9 percent said that eunuchs themselves joined hijra community.

In this research survey, around 29.6 percent of respondents said that family send to them to the hijra community because of their feminine behavior. Another group of about 21.9 percent stated that because of their third gender; their sister did not get married or people feel ashamed and not show their interest in a way to get married in such families. However around 16.5 percent believed that their siblings life is affecting because their sexual identifications. However there are other issues were also shared by the eunuchs which are included: neighbor taunt (10.9 percent) them; relatives also taunted (6.5); and 6.5 percent said that they have been sent to hijra community against their will.

It is revealing in this research study that society behave with eunuchs as eunuchs are not normal person. There is a need to educate society as a whole about this gender or hermaphrodites; their sexual constitution; and then people should treat them in equal manner as like other gender in the economy. About 41.5 percent eunuch respondents stated that people make fun of us; and eunuchs further questioned the researcher that other genders of the society are going to school and getting education; did not they know our construction of gender? One of the respondent said” then it is better to be illiterate.”
Another group of about 17.5 percent said that people look towards them with hateful gaze which is considering very disturbing to the eunuchs. A small proportionate of people said that they respect them; also assist financially; and meet humbly with them.

The research found that most of the eunuchs do not like to go their home to meet parents and siblings; though they miss their families. Around 25 percent eunuchs responded that their relatives do not like us; due to the reason family also avoided their eunuch children. However another group of 19.5 percent said that family itself does not like to meet with us. Whereas there are about 22.5 percent eunuch respondents who said that we go to meet the family by deciding to reach at particular place. However 26 percent of eunuchs go to their home at night, as nobody can see them.

The research study has observed mix response towards acceptance of eunuchs by the society. As about 27.5 percent of eunuchs have responded that they have been considered as equal likewise other citizens in the society. Though another group of about 25 percent said that society do not maintain equality and created the feeling of strong disliking towards the third gender. However another 19 percent said that people respected them; it may be due to awareness or information regarding the third gender. Whereas 18.5 percent eunuch responded that they have been deprived of basic fundamental rights.

**Profession and Sources of Income**

The research is revealing that eunuchs are engaged in different works in a way to earn money for their livelihood. Majority of population about 62 percent of eunuchs are engaged in begging on the streets; in markets; and at some other public places. However there is another group of eunuchs of about 34.5 percent who are only attending wedding ceremonies in a way to bless the new couple and dance on their marriage. Through events they earn a lot of money as people give them in alms; as they are happy and want to share their happiness by giving charity to the eunuchs. As they have been considered pious as they are free from all sexual orientations and it is believed that their prayers never be neglected or ignored due to the reason people call them on their happier moments.

The research found that eunuchs are engaged in dancing as they have been earning by performing their art and in fact they have no other option except begging. From all such engagements eunuchs have been earning very less; around 73 percent of eunuchs are earning less than 10,000 rupees, which is paltry sum and not enough for bearing all the expenses of essential things in life, which includes food; housing, house utilities; clothing and so on. However another group of eunuchs of about 21 percent are falling in category of 10,001 rupees to 15,000 rupees. Whereas there is also small group of eunuchs who are earning 15,001 rupees to 20,000 rupees and more than 20,000 rupees in the sample of the research study.
It is found in the research study that people are still inviting the *hijra’s* on their events for sharing happiness with them as they have been popular of being giving blessings. Around 74 percent of the sample study stated that people call them in events for dancing and give them charity and alms, as they were considered pure and feel it is fortunate to call the *hijra’s* in the events. However there are other events on which they have been called including childbirth ceremonies and in election celebrations as well.

**Facing Psycho-Social Problems**

It is observed that behavior of people in the society is discriminatory with the eunuchs or the third gender due to such issues they have been facing different psychological issues which affecting their mental state. In such situation their mental development is forming negatively as they feel inferior and feel oppressed. Around 36 percent of eunuch respondents said that they feel frustrated from their life because of people attitude. However 34 percent eunuch respondents said that they feel angry if someone taunt or commented over their sexuality. In fact other 12.5 percent eunuch stated that they used to have argumentative talks with people who misbehave. There are some other eunuchs who said that they use to resolve issues with them by negotiation; though few of them ignore people’s behavior. Whereas small proportion of eunuchs said, “we never complaint to anybody because we are eunuchs due to that we are respected less.”

A society comprises of male and female who have constituted family on basis of family members belonging with blood relationships. Though eunuchs cannot get married because they are considered intersex and impotent due to the reason they would not have children or sort of family. As eunuchs or *hijra’s* are living at communities with their same sex people. Whereas about 36 percent of eunuchs said that they have lack of interest with impotence and they are happy with their sex. However 33 percent said that they are confused as they are incapable and would not have children or generations. Another eunuch sample of about 31 percent responded that they become depressed which is creating psychological issues; and pushing them to feel inferior and subjugate themselves in the society as being thought that they do not have any future.

**Violence against Eunuchs**

It is found in the research study that most of eunuchs responded that they did not face any of violence. Whereas there is significant proportion of eunuchs who faced different violence; however around 32 percent of eunuchs said that they face physical violence. Another group of about 10.5 percent stated that they faced sexual violence. There is also a group of eunuchs who does not want to share their violence experiences with the researcher; as their *gurus’* order them not to reveal about such issues. It shows that within their community structures there is a person (*guru*) who is dominating on others. The eunuchs
have shared multiple reasons of violence as about 52.9 percent said that if they ignore or say no to the male party invitations which have been celebrated late nights; where people use to drink alcohol; and force them do sexual intercourse with them; in such cases they use to have violence with them. Another group of about 32.5 percent of eunuch sample stated that they have been sexually abused or being raped or to have forceful sexual intercourses in case when they stop people for not making sexual contacts. And the third gender reported that men are the major perpetrators behind all such misconducts. It is also probed in the research that if eunuchs changed their male friends for having sexual contacts then old friends use to abuse or harass them.

It is unveiled in the research that eunuchs are facing physical violence in various forms in which around 69.4 percent of eunuchs faced beating; 11.7 percent said that their heads were shaved; however another group also informed that they got fractures and injuries while beating eunuchs brutally and cruelly. In addition if they go to police stations then police used to harass them; ask to dance whole nights or in such cases they have been jailed; and level charges of being sex workers. As eunuchs are reluctant in sex work; but people compel eunuchs to get into such work; otherwise they have to face physical and sexual violence.

Conclusions and Policy Implications

It is the prime responsibility of the state to provide all basic necessities including food; clothing and shelter to the masses; so eunuchs must be considered the citizens of the country; afterwards eunuchs can also become the recipients of basic provisions. In fact social protection is also a due right of eunuchs which is needed to be sort out as soon as possible. Still they have been depriving of their identities in some of the states. It is observed that people do not exactly know or aware about the eunuchs or the third gender. It is the duty of medical practitioners or doctors to start campaigning regarding eunuchs or hermaphrodites children in order to educate parents about the eunuch children; and how parents can look up and work for their brought up among their siblings instead of marginalized them. This would assist parents in their child development process; it may reduce all the inferiorities and complexes being eunuch; eventually if they accepted by their parents then society will have to accept the third gender. There must be counseling for teenage or adult eunuchs to make possible efforts in grooming their personalities; as teach them about their social existence; tune their attitudes; convince them to work instead of begging; encourage them to behave nicely with people in order to earn respect from others in the society. This is how; it can be expected that eunuchs’ lives become meaningful in the society.
Recommendations

The following policies may be implemented for the wellbeing to improve the quality of life of the eunuchs:

- The state should provide social security to the eunuchs as to avoid abuse and harassments on the basis of their sexualities.
- It is the need of hour to exploit economic resources in a way to brought employment for the eunuchs which must be the primary earning resource of the third gender.
- The government department of census should cover the eunuch population in their surveys; then it will be easier for the finance ministry to allocate appropriate budget for their basic needs and employments.
- Eunuch identity should be accepted in the society as to reduce the socio-psychological issues in the third gender; this has been creating inferiority and various complexes in their mental state which are causing psychological issues.
- There must be perfect psychological counseling for eunuchs who are suffering from various psychological issues; and have inflicted with physical harm or injuries.

References


A Study on Psycho-Social; Physical Hazards and Society’s Attitude towards Eunuchs


Dr. Murphy, J. (2009). The Birth of God in You, Xlibris, USA, p.15.

Gray, Wayne (2012). Homosexuality, the Bible, the Truth: The Bible Does not Condemn Homosexuality, Xlibris, United States of America, p.270.


Robinson, David (2001). *Bandits, Eunuchs and the Son of Heaven: Rebellion and the Economy of Violence in Mid-Ming China*, University of Hawai’I Press, Honolulu,


Muhammad Aslam Ismail is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Social Work, University of Karachi.

Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah is Meritorious Professor in the Department of Social Work and Director, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.
A Girl In The River: A Critical Discourse Analysis Of Honor Killing

Munaza Hasan Nasir
Department of Social Sciences
Lahore School of Economics

Abstract

The aim of this research paper is to critically analyse the documentary A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness and explore the phenomenon of honor killing as presented through discourse in the documentary. In order to carry out critical discourse analysis Fairclough’s 3D model (description, explanation and interpretation) provided the framework of the research. The discursive strategies employed by the participants involved in honor killing both as agents and victims were explored. It was observed that the antagonists considered themselves to be the victims who were compelled to act in the name of honor by the protagonist (Saba). They also rationalized their actions through their language and discourse.

Keywords: Honor Killing, Gender Equality, Women Studies, Documentary.
Introduction

Human Rights Watch describes crimes committed in the name of honor as “acts of violence, usually murder, committed by male family members against female family members, who are held to have brought dishonor upon the family.” A woman may become target of honor killing if she chooses to marry someone by her choice, seeks a divorce, or commits adultery. It is not necessary to actually commit adultery or act in a particular way, “the mere perception that a woman has behaved in a specific way to ‘dishonor’ her family, is sufficient to trigger an attack” (Pope, 2012).

In the case of honor killings the male is usually father, brother or an uncle. Unlike domestic violence, honor killing is not motivated by revenge or hatred. It is not a personal act rather it is an act to ensure the community that the male member of the family is in control. According to Eva Reimers (2007), “Honor killings are defined as acts of violence based on a conception of family honor as related to the chastity of women to the effect that when a woman is suspected of breaking a chastity code, the honor of her collective family becomes severely damaged, and the only way to restore it is to eliminate the woman.”

The United Nations Population Fund estimates at least 5,000 women around the world are victims of honor killing each year (Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, 2006). In Pakistan alone, according to the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 1096 women were killed on the basis of honor killing in 2015 (Human Rights Commission of Pakistan’s website). This may be an underestimation of the actual incidents because many such incidents are not reported in order to save the family’s honor and also to preserve the cultural practice. In another study conducted by Aplin, sixty-two cases out of hundred cases of honor killing in England between 2012 and 2014 were of Pakistani origin (Aplin, 2016).

The relationship between language and the societal norms cannot be overlooked. According to Fairclough, language and society have a dialectical relationship. They both have an impact on each other. “Whenever people speak or listen or write or read, they do so in ways which are determined socially and have social effects” (Fairclough, 2015). Every text contributes to the characteristics and structure of a society. Discourse helps maintain the power relationships in a society. Through language powerful people can manipulate and influence the attitudes of the less powerful members of the society. All this can be done through language without bringing to the knowledge of the people. Therefore, it is important to analyse language of honor killing to elucidate the ideologies of the people involved in honor killing.

Fairclough states, “Discourse is socially constitutive as well as socially shaped…in the sense that it helps to sustain and reproduce the social status quo, and in the sense that it
contributes to transforming it.” In other words, language is viewed as ‘shaping’ and being ‘shaped’ by society and its social structures (Fairclough, 1995). According to Fairclough (2003), discourse is not ‘individual activity’ rather it is a ‘social practice’.

Inequality, prejudice, discrimination and dominance manifest in the form of discourse. Critical analysts focus on the implicit ideologies that are suggested by and are hidden in the language use. They also pay attention and highlight the implicit aims and objectives of people that maybe achieved through discourse (Chafai, 2013).

The goal of this study is to analyse the language used by the people involved in honor killing in the Oscar winning Pakistani documentary, ‘A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness’ directed by Shirmeen Obaid-Chinoy. Chinoy has given voice to a woman who was a (possible) victim of honor killing. It is based on a true story of a 19-year-old Pakistani girl, Saba, who survived an act of honor killing. The use of language produces and reproduces the power relationship manifested in honor killing. It also establishes the practice as a norm in the society. Hence, it is essential to analyse the discourse involved in honor killing. In addition to Saba’s discourse this research will focus on men’s linguistic and discursive strategies that sustain and promote honor killing. According to Fawcett, “For too long, men have been considered and taken for granted norm…” Like other super ordinate categories of society men and their discourse has been spared critical inquiry (Fawcett, 1996). This research will analyse discourse of men involved in honor killing.

It is important to mention here that discourse in linguistics refers to ‘language use’ whether spoken or written and in Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) it refers to the ‘social process’ (Fairclough, 2015). Therefore, in CDA discourse is the social practice that forms identities and reproduces ideologies. The investigative focus of CDA is to look at the bidirectional connection between language and society, keeping in mind the link between language and socio-cultural aspects of discourse. CDA throws light on the connection between textual structures and their function as a result of interaction with the society. It focuses primarily on social problems and political issues, rather than on current paradigms and fashions (van Dijk, 2008). It not only aims to explore how language helps to produce and reproduce ideologies in a society but also aims to uncover the role of language and discourse in social change. CDA is mainly looking for “the origins of social problems and finding ways to analyse them productively” (Bloor & Bloor, 2007).

**Significance of the Study**

This study aims to analyse the discourse of the victim, namely Saba, and agents of honor killing, including her father and the neighbourhood elders. Language can serve to propagate the phenomenon of honor killing. Through this research it can be shown that
agents involved in honor killing use language to promote and justify the act of honor killing. Through discourse, the agent becomes the victim and the victim becomes the perpetrator.

Previous research on honor killing has been carried out by students of law or students of anthropological studies. This research is different in two ways. It has analysed a documentary based on a true case of honor killing and it took into consideration the linguistic aspects of honor killing.

The study is essentially qualitative in nature as it is the analysis of a documentary that deals with the social issue of honor killing. While conducting the current research it was kept in mind that the topic chosen is a sensitive one in the Pakistani culture and context. The researcher grasped meaning of the language and paralanguage used in the documentary through sensitivity. The concepts and the themes that were grounded in the data were taken into consideration while being sensitive to the issue of honor killing and to the data provided in the form of language.

When analysing a documentary, it is possible for the viewer and the researcher to observe people and view the settings first hand. This forty-minute long documentary provided the discourse for in-depth analysis and is embedded in the field of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA).

“A critical perspective on unequal social arrangements sustained through language use, with the goals of social transformation and emancipation, constitutes the cornerstone of critical discourse analysis (CDA) and many feminist language studies” (Lazar, 2005).

In order to bring about a social change, it is mandatory to explore the linguistic and discursive aspects of honor killing. The issues associated with ideologies and approach of the society will be highlighted through in-depth analysis of the discourse of honor killing. This analysis will create awareness and shed light on the discourse of the dominant group and the dominated individual. In this case, the dominant group includes Saba’s father and the neighbourhood elders whereas Saba is the dominated individual.

This study employs Fairclough’s 3D model that is linked at three different levels: description, interpretation and explanation that is linked to the socio-cultural aspects of the society. According to Fairclough language and the society are interlinked. His aim is to make people aware of the hidden relationship between language, discourse, power, and society and the effects of the relationship (Chafai, 2013). Analysis of discourse of the society will reveal the hidden ideologies of the society.
Research Questions

1. How does the language of agents of honor killing legitimize honor killing?
2. How does discourse of agents reverse the role of the agent and the victim of honor killing?

Background

The 2015 documentary, *A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness* is an extraordinary story of a girl who survived an attempted murder. In the middle of the night, nineteen-year-old Saba was taken to a river near the place where she lives in Gujranwala, Pakistan. She was shot and put in a sack and thrown in the river. Fortunately, Saba survived the attack because the bullet just touched her cheek and failed to kill her. Saba was courageous and struggled to get out of the river and was taken to a hospital. What was Saba’s crime for which she was being punished so brutally?

At 5 a.m. on the day Saba was thrown to die in the river, she had left her father’s house to get married to her fiancé she had been engaged to since the past four years. Her uncle was against this marriage and wanted Saba to marry his brother-in-law. Since Saba defied the male members of her house, her destiny was to die by the hands of these male members.

This documentary may seem to have a deceptively simple straight story line but a closer look reveals the complicated societal issues of gender and power. Saba has risen above her dire situation only to be thrown into darkness by other women and men of her society whom she considers to be her saviors and protectors. What shines through the narrative is a strong determined woman, Saba, who was able to fight the physical battle of saving herself from dying in the river in the middle of the night but unable to save herself from the metaphorical river of people in the society that drowns her hope to have access to justice.

*A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness* has been critically analysed by movie critics but it has not been analysed in any research paper. In the literature available, the social issue is discussed but no comments have been made about the language used by the agent and victim in the documentary.

The documentary has been critically acclaimed by the international audience but some Pakistanis have raised concern about the documentary portraying a negative image of Pakistan to the international audience. Overall the documentary has received mixed reviews. Chinoy confronts the status quo and takes up a sensitive topic. She does not suggest cultural changes by saying anything to this effect in the documentary but she does touch a sensitive nerve and the main objective of the documentary like the aim of
this research is to create awareness about honor killing and bring about cultural change albeit a gradual one.

Literature review

Documentary

Non-fiction movies are gaining popularity because of technological advancements. In today’s era of computerized movies, documentaries are unique since they try to capture what is real. For the audience, documentaries can serve as a gateway to the issues that are not tackled in mainstream movies. A documentary film is different from other films because the people on screen are not actors rather they are actual people who have experienced the issue in reality.

Honor killing

“The woman has always been the subaltern across cultural boundaries. Men need her, love her, adore her and write about her but they do so in relation to their own lives.” (Sengupta, 2006).

The centuries old tale continues and women are still considered the properties of men in the form of wife, daughter, sister or mother. They have been used in literature but they have never been given a voice. Any story is incomplete without them but they are never shown as the important figures that possess the ability to think for them and differentiate between right and wrong. This perception about women pervades through all cultural and national boundaries and honor killing is a by-product of this perception.

Honor and Shame

Honor is the characteristic for the male and shame is reserved for women. All over the world millions of boys and girls are raised with the concept of honor. This honor unites the tribes and keeps the girls on the path that the men approve. The honor/shame system is the ideology that ensures power for the male.(Dogan, 2011). In Pakistan honor is roughly translated to ‘izzat’ (Gill, 2014) or ‘ghairat’ and shame is ‘sharam’. In Arabic ‘sharaf’ is social prestige and a separate term ‘ird’ is reserved for a woman’s chastity. The Urdu equivalent of honor killing is Gairatkayna’am pay qatel. It is also known as ‘karokari’ and ‘siahkari’. According to (Gadit& Patel,2008) that Karo means black man, and Kari means black woman; in Pakistani culture the color black is seen as morbid or dark. The Urdu phrase that is used for people who commit shameful acts is ‘mounkaalakarna’. This also means to bring shame to oneself and the family. Kaala means black. The phrase literally means to blacken one’s face. Metaphorically it means
to bring shame to the person herself and her family. Honor is a collective characteristic in patriarchal societies like Pakistan.

**Honor Killing and the Society**

The honor of the male member of the family is perceived to be sacred and it is more precious than life itself. “The loss of honor is the loss of life and an ideal man lives for his honor” (Dogan, 2011). The society makes sure that people act upon the norms and carry out the act of honor killing. If they do not go ahead with it, the neighbors will exert pressure and the entire family of the girl will be punished. “People who do not wish to follow the norms are criticized, ridiculed, condemned, or excluded by the community, and those who follow them are admired and respected” (Dogan, 2011). This concept has been passed on from generation to generation in a way that violence seems a norm and is accepted and propagated by the society itself.

Scholar Leila Ahmed (1992) explains in her landmark book, *Women and Gender in Islam*, “As people settled into tribes and began to acquire land and other assets, the patriarchal family, designed to guarantee the paternity of property-heirs and vesting in men the control of female sexuality, became institutionalized, codified, and upheld by the state.”

The fact that women can bear children and continue the bloodline makes them prone to and victim of honor killing. Men had no other way of making sure to preserve their bloodline and keep the land and wealth within their tribes. The women who defied them were hence made examples for the world to see centuries ago and are still treated in the same way.

**Critical Discourse Analysis**

“Discourse is an analytical category describing the vast array of meaning-making resources available to everybody.” These meaning-making resources can be oral conversations, written texts, designs, symbols, colors, and gestures (Pyland, K & Paltridge, 2011).

Fairclough’s main focus is on the two dimensions of power: the power in discourse and power behind discourse (Fairclough, 2015). An example of power in discourse can be the power relationship between a teacher and student and media whereas an example of power behind discourse can be the discourse of institutions and organizations. ‘Discourse is a place where relations of power are actually exercised and enacted’ (Fairclough, 2015).
Fairclough explains that ‘language is a form of social practice’. There are three implications of this notion:

1. Language is a part of society and not external to it.
2. Language is a social process.
3. Language is a socially conditioned process.

Language is a part of society and not external to it. According to Fairclough, language and society have an internal and dialectical relationship. They are not independent entities that can exist on their own. “Language is a part of society; linguistic phenomena are social phenomena of a special sort and social phenomena are (in part) linguistic phenomena.” When people communicate they do so in a language that is socially determined and acceptable. The words they utter or write also have a social purpose and effect (Fairclough, 2015).

Language is social process. The text is just part of this social process and as it is the ‘product of the process of text production.’ Hence, this social process includes not only the text but also the process of production and the process of interpretation. Text is the product of the process of production and a resource for the process of interpretation.

According to Fairclough (2015) the producer of the text draws upon his or her MR and the interpreter interprets the text based on their MR which includes their ‘knowledge of language, representations of the natural and social worlds they inhabit, values, beliefs, assumptions, and so on.’

The processes of production and interpretation are determined socially that is it is ‘conditioned by other non-linguistic parts of society.’ The MR are cognitive but they are social because they are socially generated, transmitted and equally distributed. They are the product of social relations and social struggles (Fairclough, 2015). Hence, Fairclough claims that discourse involves social conditions ‘which can be specified as social conditions of production and social conditions of interpretation…. These social conditions shape the MR people bring to production and interpretation which in turn shape the way in which texts are produced and interpreted’ (Fairclough, 2015). Corresponding to these three dimensions of discourse Fairclough (2015) designed the three stages involved in the process of critical discourse analysis. These steps are as follows:

1. Description: In this first stage of analysis linguistic and formal features of the text are described.
2. Interpretation: The second stage explores the relationship between the properties of the text and MR involved in discourse.
3. Explanation: This last stage of analysis connects the process of production and interpretation with their context.

Fairclough (2015) affirms that by using this framework for critical analysis of discourse of a society, one can describe, interpret and explain the underlying structure and processes of a society. The three stages of the framework begin with the linguistic analysis that is the description of the linguistic tools employed in the text which provide the tools to take interpretive step. The interpretive stage involves the inter-textual analysis that culminates into the third and final stage of discourse analysis. This stage called explanation considers and draws a relationship between the discourse, social and cultural situations.

Research Methodology

This research is qualitative in nature. Qualitative research is concerned with the meaning people attach to things in their lives (Bogdan & Taylor, 2016). Hence, qualitative research is understanding people from their own frames of reference and experiencing reality as they experience it (Corbin & Strauss, 2008). Since the information under investigation was recorded, the data could be replayed and language and behavior could be analysed by empathizing with the characters in the documentary. It is important for the researcher to identify with the people or actors in the documentary. It is not possible to stay aloof in order to remain objective.

During the research it was kept in mind that people and settings were looked at holistically (Bogdan & Taylor, 2016). Saba and her father could not be reduced to variables and the human side of social life was not ignored. It was important to take into consideration the socioeconomic factors and look at the people holistically.

This research is a case study of the documentary A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness. To analyse the documentary, Norman Fairclough’s 3D model was used. The language text used was the spoken text and the written text. Nonverbal language was also taken into account. The spoken text was in Urdu and English. It was important to analyse the text in Urdu also because sometimes the meaning is lost in translation. The written text was in the form of subtitles in English.

The tri-focal approach of Fairclough (2003) enables the analyst to interpret texts, processes and their social conditions. Fairclough’s three-dimensional model is interlinked at three levels: description, interpretation and explanation.
Discourse

The discourse selected for analysis was the forty minutes long documentary *A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness* directed by Shirmeen Obaid-Chinnoy. The characters in the documentary speak in Urdu and it is made comprehensible to the international audience by the use of subtitles in English. The main female character in the documentary is from the underprivileged areas of Pakistan. Saba belongs to the low-income class of Gujranwala, Pakistan.

The entire movie was not transcribed. Only the discourse that was necessary to analyze the power relations, ideology and other aspects of the documentary were transcribed and used. The discourse of the following people was most important in the order they are mentioned so as to arrive at the conclusion for this research:

- Saba
- Saba’s father
- Saba’s brother-in-law
- The neighborhood elders

While transcribing, the important non-verbal gestures like meaningful gestures and expressions were also mentioned. The documentary was watched more than fifteen times from beginning till the end. Later, it was watched in bits and pieces for its nuances.

Discussion and Analysis

Fairclough points out “ideologies reside in the text and are open to multiple interpretations” (2015). This research focuses on the discourse of the survivor of honor killing attack, Saba who is the main character of the documentary. It also analyses the discourse of the perpetrators and supporters of honor killing.

Description

The first stage of Fairclough’s (2015) model is description of the text used. Keeping Faircough’s guidelines for text analysis in mind, in-depth analysis was carried out. Fairclough has laid down the following guidelines for discourse analysis in his book *Language and Power.*

*Wording*. At times, ‘the wording is systematically replaced by another one in conscious opposition’ (Fairclough, 2015). For Saba’s family Saba eloped (ran away) from home but from Saba’s perspective she left home in order to get married to the person she was engaged to by her own parents. The words ‘ran away’ or ‘bhaagjaana’ have negative connotation whereas ‘left home’ (ghar say chaligayee) does not have similar negative connotations.
Also, Saba’s father asks, “Didn’t she get fed three times a day? Didn’t she have a bed to sleep on?” The wording of these questions is rhetorical. Maqsood is trying to imply that Saba or any ‘honorable girl’ should not have done this since her basic needs such as provision of food and shelter were met. He implies Saba is a rogue element and that’s not what is expected of girls.

Pronouns

The father used the pronoun ‘we’ for himself instead of ‘me’. In Urdu ‘hum’ is used in two cases: when the person is talking about more than one person, as is the case in ‘we’. In the other case, the person uses ‘hum’ when talking about himself or herself in a respectable way or when someone is in power. In this case, the father was using ‘hum’ as a pronoun and not ‘main’ (me or I) showing that he believed he was an honorable and a respectable man, who has a high social status.

The father also says that the neighbors say, “aapizzatdaaradmeen ho.” “Aap” in Urdu is a pronoun that shows respect. In English ‘you’ is used as a pronoun that will refer to the person in second person whether the person is younger or older or whether the person is a respectable member of the society or a criminal. The relationship between people does not alter the use of the pronoun ‘you’ in English. In Urdu however, ‘aap’ is used when people talk about someone they respect. Children can never use the pronoun ‘tum’ for elders. Similarly, people of higher social status are also referred to with the pronoun ‘aap’ and not ‘tum’. The latter pronoun is reserved for people with lower social status or if the person is younger to the person using the pronoun ‘tum’.

Repetition

The significant words are often repeated. The important words in this documentary are ‘ghairat’, ‘izzat’ and ‘maaf’. Repetition of words reflects the beliefs and ideologies of the individuals (Fairclough, 2015). Word like “neighbourhood” has been mentioned many times which reveals that the society which Saba belonged to, is the collectivist society where the people from the neighbourhood are important. Throughout the documentary ‘maaf’ (forgive) has been used 17 times. Characters in the documentary were asking for forgiveness and some were convincing Saba to forgive. The entire documentary revolved around honor and forgiveness. The repeated words appeared in the documentary as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Number of times it appears in the text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respect (izzat)</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honor (ghairat)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgiveness (maaf)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood (muhallay)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Metaphor

The title of the documentary A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness, has literal and metaphorical meaning. The main characters in the documentary use some important metaphors. These metaphors are explained below.

“Crossing this river” (Aikdarya say guzarhayhain) which means struggling to get through a difficult situation. Saba uses the metaphor ‘crossing the river’ to indicate the tough time her brother-in-law was going through when he had to face the people of the neighbourhood.

“Haathbaandhay” means to ask for forgiveness. In Urdu, it means to beg and implore for forgiveness. It is the last resort when someone is asking for mercy. According to Saba, her father and Uncle begged for forgiveness in this manner but this was not visible on camera.

Euphemism

No euphemism is available in Urdu for the term ‘bhaagjana(run away)’.

‘Ghar say bhaagjaana’ is loaded with negative connotation. ‘Ghar say bhaagjaana’ is associated with bringing shame to the entire family. This same concept can be expressed as ‘married by her choice’. This expression is not loaded with negative connotation and can serve as a euphemism but it is reserved only for boys who marry by choice. For girls, the term ‘ghar say bhaagjana’ is used.

Saba’s father says, ‘Whatever we (hum) did, we were obliged to do it.’ He does not use the words ‘attempt to murder’; instead he uses euphemism ‘jobhihuahai’. This conceals his act of trying to murder his daughter.

Interpretation and explanation

Fairclough (2015) employs the term interpretation as the name of the stage of the analytical procedure and the interpretation of text by the discourse participants. The participants’ processes of text production and text interpretation are taken into account in the current stage of analysis.

Since the characters are aware that a large number of people will see the documentary they will have a different relation with the audience and the answers may be biased. The participants being analysed in this research paper speak Punjabi as their mother tongue.
They struggle to speak in Urdu and they are more comfortable in their mother tongue. In the beginning Saba starts speaking in Urdu but she quickly shifts to Punjabi because she could tell her story comfortably in her mother tongue. Ideas are best expressed in L1 (mother tongue, first language) therefore, it was a good decision by Chinoy to let them speak in their L1 and not make them speak in Urdu.

Saba explains her stance:

Saba: The world should see this- brothers, sisters, parents, uncles and aunts so this doesn’t happen again. They should be shot in public in an open market (Sar-e-aam) …… (Yes, InshaAllah) With god’s will I’m going to fight this case.

Saba is determined to fight the case. Her purpose is to create awareness like she says; “The world should see this- so it doesn’t happen again.” She is hopeful that she will win the case and this will be a lesson for all the uncles and aunts and parents of girls to never repeat this. Unfortunately, this case could not become a lesson for the society.

She uses the words ‘Sar-e-am bazaar main’ because in Urdu language ‘Sar-e-am’ is used when you want the people to see something significant which can serve as a lesson for the society. This is not an idiom that is employed in English language. Although, she is uttering these words in a soft tone, the words themselves are loaded with vehemence. ‘Sir-e-am bazaar main’ people are punished for their wrongdoing so that the rest of the society learns a lesson and does not repeat the same mistake. Saba’s father wanted to make her an example so that none of the other girls in the society run away from home whereas Saba wants to make her father an example for the future fathers who try to murder their daughters. It seems like a battle that only time will settle.

Qaiser is against the understanding but his older brother handles everything since he is the eldest of the family. He is going through such big river. He is going through such a tough situation and has the ultimate decision (making power). (Saba)

As mentioned above Saba lives in a joint family system that is part of the Pakistani culture. Saba’s brother-in-law who appears to be in his early thirties, is the head of the family. He decides to forgive the perpetrator because of the influence of the neighbourhood. Saba says, ‘He (Shafqat) is going through such a big river’. This is how women are raised in patriarchal societies. They are always concerned about the male member of the house. She does not take into consideration the agony that she has gone through. She will go against what her heart desires. Her brother-in-law has to make a tough decision so she will support him although in her heart she believes it is not the right thing to do. She is ready to compromise on her beliefs. Khan and Saeed (2017) explain,
“When it comes to women, their social identity is constructed through active as well as passive socio-cultural influences since childhood that they don’t even find the oppressive discourses shaping their lives as unnatural.” On the contrary, since the process shapes them so naturally they themselves become agents of their own oppression (Lemley, 2005).

In the next scene Shafqat (Saba’s brother-in-law) says:

> A compromise must be reached. There’s no other way. We live in the same neighborhood and one must abide by the laws of the community. How long can we live in conflicts like this? Two, four, ten years? There’s no alternative except compromise. Let’s reach an agreement. If this escalates no one benefits. We will be upset. They will be upset.

Shafqat is dominated by the people in the neighbourhood. He says let ‘us’ reach an agreement. Saba is definitely not included in ‘us’. Saba does not want to reach an agreement. He also says that there is no other way. He is part of the society where going against the members of the community will only bring him harm and he knows the law cannot protect him or his family. For him the laws of the community are more important than any other law. He does not see any other option but to compromise because he fears he will not be supported by the neighbourhood in time of need if he stands up against their decision. He says that a compromise must be reached. He may feel powerful in making this decision but it is obvious through the use of the modal verb ‘must’ in this line that he does not have an option to decide otherwise. As Saba mentions in the documentary, her husband Qaisar is against the reconciliation but he is also helpless. They are men in a patriarchal society but they are also powerless when the neighbourhood elders come in the picture.

> Whatever we (hum) did, we were obliged to do it. She took away our honor. I am an honorable man. Why did she leave home? I labored and earned lawfully (huq halal) to feed her. This was unlawful (haram) of her. I am an honorable man. I couldn't bear that.... Destroyed everything. My lawful labor. So I said no I will kill you (aap) myself. You are my daughter, I will kill you myself. Why did you leave home with an outsider?(Saba’s Father, Maqsood)

Saba’s father rationalizes his act through his discourse. He creates an image of himself as being an honorable man who earned lawfully. The word he used is halal. A pious Muslim throughout his/her life works hard to adhere to the prescribed rules of the religion. His choice of the word halal for his act and haram for Saba’s act makes him a good Muslim and makes Saba a bad Muslim. For him, Saba has not only dishonored her parents but also has violated the rules of the religion.
He is locked behind bars and he can be convicted for an attempt to murder but he says, ‘I will kill you (Saba) myself.’ He is not intimidated by the consequences. He uses the word ‘aap’ that shows he is trying to act like an honorable and an educated person. He does not change his stance because he wants the world to see that he has tried to restore his honor by trying to kill the daughter who ran away from home. At this point, he is willing to die for his honor just like he was willing to kill for his honor.

Maqsood: I haven’t seen that man but if I had I would have killed him too. I would have killed them both. Qaiser destroyed our lives. I am locked up because of him.

Interviewer’s Voice: You are locked up because you tried to kill your daughter.

Maqsood: Islam doesn’t allow girls to get out of the house. Why should she go? Was she dying of hunger? Didn’t she get fed three times a day?

Interviewer (I): Does Islam permit murder?

Maqsood: No, but where is it written that a girl can run away with a stranger? (Vehemently) Where is it written? (Repetition)

Interviewer: Are you ready to spend your life in jail?

Maqsood brings in the role of religion and the interviewer puts forth one of the most important questions in the documentary: “Does Islam permit murder?” Maqsood has no concrete answer. He avoids answering and hedges the question. He in turn puts forth more questions that are rhetorical in nature. For example he asks, “Where is it written that a girl can run away with a stranger?” He is aware that someone belonging to the Pakistani society knows it is unacceptable to run away. The interviewer does not answer the question.

Saba’s father says proudly that the people of the neighbourhood say he is an honourable man. When he was locked up behind bars he did not fail to convey the message through Chinoy’s camera that what he did was right. In his mind, his audience was the neighbourhood in which he lived. He knew that his society will accept him and this is what they expect of an honourable man. He assumes an ideological connection between him and a group of the possible viewers while ignoring the other group of people who consider honour killing appalling. This is the process of negotiating a relationship of trust and solidarity with assumed viewership. For him the viewers are people who share similar ideologies with him.

“I haven’t seen that man but if I had I would have killed him too. I would have killed them both. Qaiser destroyed our lives. I am locked up because of him.” Maqsood considers himself
innocent. He feels that he was compelled to kill his daughter because she ran away with Qaiser. For Maqsood, Qaiser is the villain who has destroyed their life. There is no regret in Maqsood’s voice and tone. On the other hand his tone sounds powerful even behind bars. He is threatening to kill another human being, Qaiser. The court fails to see this and in the end Maqsood is honorably released from prison because Saba succumbs under the societal pressures and forgives him. This highlights the loopholes in the judicial system that allows people like Maqsood to walk free without genuinely repenting for their sins.

People who visit my father tell me that he is asking for forgiveness. He says he will not repeat his mistake. But I said no I will not forgive him. ‘Hum nay kahanahin.’ When I went to court to set a trial date my Chachu begged me to forgive him. He begged and pleaded but I said I won’t forgive myself if I forgive you. Get lost, I will not forgive you. It is not right. (Saba)

From Saba’s conversation, it appears that her father and uncle have pleaded for forgiveness but Saba’s father did not admit it on camera throughout the documentary. He would rather die than ask for forgiveness on camera. Once out of jail he will not be able to live in that community if he asks for forgiveness on camera. Once out of jail he will not be able to live in that community if he asks for forgiveness on camera. Like her father, Saba also uses the pronoun ہم (me or we depending on the situation). The pronoun ہم, as mentioned earlier has power and respect associated with it. In this case Saba uses it to show power because she believes that the power to forgive her father and Uncle lies in her hands. She also mentions that if she forgives them she will not be able to forgive herself. She wanted justice to be served but unfortunately, it is visible in the end that she could not face the opposition alone.

She also says, ‘dafahojao’ which is roughly translated to get lost. This phrase reveals that she is full of anger towards her father and uncle but in the next scene the situation changes. She is shown clad in burqa and her body language reflects her despondence.

But some of my neighbours appealed to my in-laws. Forget prosecution and go for a compromise. They say we must listen to the influential and dominant MEN of our neighbourhood. We live in this neighbourhood and we must listen to the advice of these men. (Saba)

She says that the dominant men of the neighbourhood have approached her in-laws. Saba also understands that in order to survive in this neighbourhood they will all have to act according to the dominant men. She has to forgive her father because of the pressure exerted by the neighbourhood on Saba’s in-laws. Saba lives with her in-laws and is dependent on them. The in-laws in turn live in the neighbourhood that does not consider honour killing as an illegal act. As Dogan has pointed out if the immediate family does not take action against someone who has risked the honour of the family, the society exerts pressure (Dogan, 2011).
Our society doesn’t respect girls who run away. People say (taunt) look their daughter ran away. People with such a tarnished reputation lose all respect in the community. Parents put in so much effort to nurture support and care for their children. Don’t parents have the right to decide the future of their children? (The Elders)

The elders of the neighbourhood are clear on this issue. They are completely supportive of Saba’s father and his actions. They are part of the collectivist society and cherish the centuries old patriarchal traditions. They understand why the father tries to kill Saba. Saba’s father’s reputation is tarnished because of Saba’s act. The only way to restore this honour was to kill Saba. Although, the neighbours did not say this explicitly, they did not stand against the act of killing. On the other hand, they supported the person who tried to murder another human being and made sure Saba forgave him. This shows that the neighbourhood implicitly supports honour killing. They further support Maqsood’s actions by appealing to the people through arguments like, ‘Parents put in so much effort to nurture, support and care for their children.’ It is a logical fallacy. Raising kids does not give parents the right to kill them if they defy your orders. They also seem to be united and powerful who can influence Saba’s in-laws. The powerful men of the neighbourhood state, ‘Honor and land are common disputes here.’ Reimer’s in her book has stated a similar concept. Centuries ago, the only way to keep land in your own tribe or community was to control the woman’s sexuality. Hence honor and land are closely connected with each other.

Towards the end of the documentary, Maqsood states, “I have forgiven Saba and she has forgiven me. We have started a new life again.”

Close analysis reveals that Maqsood states he has forgiven Saba before saying that Saba has forgiven him. He states this information in the climactic order (order of importance) where it was important for him to forgive Saba first. This shows that Maqsood was in power and he was magnanimous to forgive Saba. Someone who is not part of this society can question this forgiveness. What was there to forgive? He was the person who tried to murder his own daughter and he forgave his daughter. It is paradoxical. He also adds, “After this incident everyone says I am more respected. They say I am an honorable man.” His honor has been restored.

Conclusions

A Girl in the River: The Price of Forgiveness is a documentary that presents an important case of honor killing or honor-based violence. It is a type of violence that finds its roots in centuries old traditions and culture in certain parts of the world. It is different from the domestic violence against women because the latter usually involves a husband or a male partner whereas honor killing may also involve a father, brother or uncle. These men stay
loyal to the centuries old traditions in patriarchal societies where women have little or no say about their own lives. Acts like marrying someone of your own choice or seeking divorce can merit honor killing.

The objective of the study was to explore how discourse of the characters represents their ideologies and supports honor killing. The discursive strategies of the characters involved in the documentary blamed Saba for being the rogue element who had brought dishonor and shame to the family. Although, in the eyes of the court Saba was asked by her father to forgive him but during the father’s interview no remorse is visible in the discourse. The words uttered and paralanguage exhibited did not show an ounce of guilt.

Chinoy has highlighted the social aspect of honor killing and she has tried to clear the misconceptions. The society itself will need to rethink its traditions and strategies to eradicate honor killing.

The conclusion of the case depicts the homogeneity and solidarity of the community that supports and promotes honor killing. In the court Saba’s statement was important but that statement was influenced by the male members of the neighbourhood. Women are expected to be subservient to the men and hide behind their burqa (veil). Any deviation from the conventional roles will lead to dire consequences as in Saba’s case. Throughout the documentary, the male family members and the neighbourhood elders supported Maqsood implicitly and explicitly. In the end, Saba did not have a choice but to forgive the person who tried to kill her. The agent became the victim and vice versa.

This research focused on the incident that involved real life people and issues. The discourse and people involved were non–fictional and naturally occurring as opposed to invented examples. This places the research in a significant position because it connects CDA to the media discourse.

Recommendations

Through this research it was found out that the discourse of the rural Punjab as shown in the documentary supports and promotes honour killing. The same community has different laws for the male and female members. Whereas the male member in the documentary was left unharmed the woman was shot in an attempt to murder. It is recommended to view the documentary as a medium that reflects the unbiased truth about the Pakistani society. The documentary has served to highlight the issue of honor killing.

References


Appendix A

Transcription of the Movie:
Saba: “I remember trembling with fear and begging them but they didn’t listen to me. They put me in a bag and threw me in the river. Now the wrath of god will fall upon them. Even if someone powerful asks me to forgive them I will not forgive them. The world should see this- brothers sisters parents uncles and aunts so this doesn’t happen again. They should be shot in public in an open market With God’s will I’m going to fight this case.

Police: Islam teaches us nothing about honor killing. Islam teaches us that we should safeguard the rights of all human beings. What happened here was totally against religious values.
Aqsa: All our family did was to preserve their (family’s) integrity and honor. Who can tolerate such betrayal from their daughter? Who runs away and marries without their consent?

Our family was never questioned by anyone. We were respected by the entire community. People feared us now taunt us. We stopped going anywhere even to friends and family. We keep to ourselves because of the shame she has brought us. People say my father neglected his kids.

Saba’s Mother: This is what happens when honour/izzat is at stake. No woman should disrespect her parents. No no. No woman should ruin her family’s reputation.
If this girl (pointing to Aqsa) does something like this, she will get beaten up.
If she stays home she will get married in a ‘good way’. Then I will be respected as well.
She has disrespected us. My daughter has done this; Allah make me die.


I haven’t seen that man but if I had I would have killed him too. I would have killed them both. Qaiser destroyed our lives. I am locked up because of him.

Interviewer’s voice: you are locked up because you tried to kill your daughter.

Maqsood: Islam doesn’t allow girls to get out of the house. Why should she go? Was she dying of hunger? Didn’t she get fed three times a day?

Interviewer: Does Islam permit murder?

Maqsood: No but where is it written that a girl can run away with a stranger? (vehemently)
Where is it written? (repetition)

Interviewer: Are you ready to spend your life in jail?

Maqsood: Yes absolutely. I’m ready for respect and honor. I am ready to spend my whole life in jail.
(He says it with so much conviction).
The One who gave life provides for it as well. (He seems philosophical?)
I will spend my entire life in jail for my honor.
(Messy house is shown which depicts they are very poor.)

MIL: She is just like my own daughter. She is happy here. We have told her that we are poor and have a lot of mouths to feed. Whatever is acceptable to God she can eat with us.

Saba: I haven’t spoken to my mother or sisters. I don’t know what they feel about me. People who visit my father tell me that he is asking for forgiveness. He says he will not repeat his mistake. But I said I will not forgive him. Hum nay kahanahin. When I went to court to set a trial date my chachu begged me to forgive him. He begged and pleaded but I said I wont forgive myself if I forgive you. Get lost, I will not forgive you. It is not right.

(Saba is shown clad in burqa outside the house. Then she is shown very sullen sitting in her house.)

Saba: But some of my neighbors appealed to my in laws. Forget prosecution and go for a compromise. They say we must listen to the influential and dominant MEN of our neighborhood. We live in this neighborhood and we must listen to the advice of these men.

The Elders: Our society doesn’t respect girls who run away. People say (taunt) look their daughter ran away. People with such a tarnished reputation lose all respect in the community. Parents put in so much effort to nurture support and care for their children. (Does that give them the license to kill?) Don’t parents have the right to decide the future of their children? (Individualistic vs collective society)

Asad Jamal (Saba’s pro bono lawyer; hereafter will be referred to as ‘Lawyer’): Yes but I want to know how you will uphold the rights of the girl. Her own family tried to kill her and throw her away. She got shot she survived. This decision is about her life.

Elders: Honour and land are common disputes here. Look both families are our close neighbors. That’s why we intervened. We told Qaisar’s family to compromise quickly. We told them if you prosecute this case your neighbors will look down on you. There might be more fights between families. We pleaded with both families to compromise.

Lawyer: to compromise?

Elders: Yes compromise.

Lawyer: So you sat together in one place to discuss this dispute?
Elders: Look the girl should be able to live in peace with no more disagreements. Her family says that they won't harm anyone and legal documents are being prepared so both parties will have written rules to follow. If they violate them, then we will sit together to make things right.

Lawyer: Do you want Saba’s statement recorded tomorrow?

Elders: Yes, as soon as possible.

Lawyer: (Mother), do you know what we are talking about?

MIL: Yes I understand.

Lawyer: They want you to go to court as early as possible and have Saba forgive her attackers. So the hearing is set for tomorrow. Have you asked Saba if she will be ready to give her statement?

MIL: we will have to ask her.
Police Criminal investigator: If there is forgiveness, the case is finished early and a message is sent that this crime is no big deal. You can kill ad go free. Look at the reality (sensitivity) of this case,. The very people asking for forgiveness are the ones who shot her and threw her in that river. Only she knows what she went through in that darkness. Saba should pursue this case so a message can be sent so that laws are the same for everyone. And anyone who commits such a crime will be punished.

I don’t believe the girl herself wants to forgive but society might pressure her to forgive.

Saba: Qaiser is against the understanding but his older brother handles everything since he is the eldest of the family. He is going through such big river. He is going through such a tough situation and has the ultimate decision (making power).

Shafqaqat: A compromise must be reached. There’s no other way. We live in the same neighbourhood and one must abide by the laws of the community. How long can we live in conflicts like this? Two, four, ten years? There’s no alternative except compromise. Let’s reach an agreement. If this escalates no one benefits. We will be upset. They will be upset.

Saba is sitting with her head covered and bent looking melancholic.
Shafqaqat continues: It's important that we reconcile because we all have to live in this neighborhood. We have to live in this. Sometimes we might need our neighbor’s help and
they might need our help. So we have to listen to them now in times of happiness and sadness. We have to deal with these people.
(Saba is visibly upset)
So if we ignore their advice now why will they ever cooperate with us?

Saba: Yes, that’s true. However you do this, I am happy with it.

MIL: God will make everything right. We have faith in the Quran. We believe in the Quran. If in the future they try to harm us the Quran will save us. Our hearts are clean.
Brother in law: We don’t have a choice.

Saba: Do whatever you want. I am okay.

Court Day: Wearing her burqa.

Lawyer: when you go to the court and give your statement for forgiveness, you realize that your father will be free.

Saba: yes

Lawyer: And your uncle will be free too. You understand the meaning of this?

Saba: Yes. They will be forgiven and set free.

Lawyer: Are you mentally prepared to forgive them?
Long pause and no answer.
{shown covering her face and leaving the court}

Investigating Officer: If Saba states she forgives the accused and doesn’t want the case to continue, then this case stops right here.
And if there’s no justice you can imagine how terrible we police will feel.

Lawyer: I can understand why she is inclined to reach a compromise. Our justice system is not strong enough to provide her security. The accused are convicted and sent to jail for five years. They come out. Who is going to protect her? Her father is the only red winner of the family. It makes worldly sense to forgive him. (He is shown in jail with a rosary and seems like he’s worshipping god.)

Hafizabad Courthouse
The neighbourhood elders had appointed a new lawyer for her without her knowledge.
New Lawyer: It’s upto Saba. She can just say that I got angry and I took my father’s name. The next day the judge released her father and her uncle.

Lawyer: The law allows for this kind of settlement. The court in such cases have become mere post offices. They record the statements of the victims. This is something that needs superiority.

Saba: God did not want me to die from their hands. They tried but I survived. My fate didn’t let me be killed by the. In the future, if it is written I will be killed by them. She despises them so much that she doesn’t take their names and uses pronouns.) Only God (Allah) knows all these things. (She feels unsafe already)

MIL: She shouldn’t meet them (her parents) and they shouldn’t visit us. I feel scared but life must move on. We have to live on.

Saba’s mother: We have reconciled with our heart. Whoever has an impure heart God can see it. We won’t blackmail the or disturb them. We’ve been in touch on the phone. I’ve talked to Saba and her in-laws. I wanted her to understand that children don’t separate from their parents forever. She will visit us one day.

Saba’s father: I have forgiven Saba and she has forgiven me. We have started a new life again. After this incident everyone says I am more respected. They say I am an honorable man. Brother you are right. Whatever you did was the right thing to do. I have other daughters too. Since the incident my daughters have received many proposals. They say I am a good man. They want my daughters hand in marriage. I can proudly say that for generations too come none of descendants will even think of doing what Saba did Insha Allah. I am proud of this with the will of allah.my daughters will have fear in their minds that if one of their sisters did something like this and if we do the same god knows what our faith will be (very calm facial expressions)

Assertive: he felt like an honorable man.

Saba: if the elders hadn’t pressured me I would have never forgiven them. I said to myself the longer they stay in prison the better. Everyone knows I forgave them for people for everyone around me. I listened to my family and forgave them. But in my heart they are unforgiven. I am very hoppy after meeting my mother. (she’s shown crying for the first time. Her mother was covering her head.)
Saba continues: I want a girl who will be educated. She can do whatever she wants to do get a job or do whatever she wants to do.

Saba’s Uncle:
*What my brother did was absolutely right. I guess she survived. It was her destiny. (melancholic). Everything is about respect. Whatever he did was (for honor and was) absolutely right.*

Saba’s uncle was an accomplice in this act of honor killing. He is behind bars but he has no regret. The only remorse that the viewer can sense is that Saba survived. He was unhappy that because of Saba’s destiny she survived. He speaks a few sentences in the documentary and these few sentences reveal his ideology. He completely supports his brother because according to him his brother is an honorable man and an honorable man has to protect his honor. Using the word honor time and again emphasizes the role of honor and serves as justification for murder.

__________________

**Munaza Hasan Nasir** is the Teaching Fellow in the Department of Social Sciences, Lahore School of Economics.
Educated Working Women and Their Work-Life Conflict and Work-Life Balance

Munazza Mahmood
Syed Asad Abbas Rizvi
&
Memoona Bibi
Department of Education
International Islamic University Islamabad

Abstract

It is a fact that women are effectively supporting men in financial perspectives since ages but different problems such as attitude and prejudice of society members adversely affect the utilization of their talent and working abilities. The objectives of this study were to (a) find out the work life conflict and work-life balance of working women (b) explore up to what extent problems related to work-life conflict and work-life balance are affecting their work and family, (c) investigate the perceptions of working women to balance the work and family. A sample of 65 working women from different fields i.e. teachers, doctors and bankers was selected through stratified convenient sampling technique. Five Points Likert scale was used as instrument to collect data. Data were analysed by calculating Mean and presented in Bar Charts. On the basis of findings it is concluded that status of working women and work-life balance is affected by many problems including work-load, family support, harassment, fear and anxiety etc. It is recommended that proper check and balance, equal chance of decision making and security level of the working women in their work place might be maintained for work-life balance of working women.

Keywords: Working Women, Work-Life Conflict, Work-Life Balance.
Introduction

The idea of work-family balance has been utilized to clarify the balance between obligations at work and duties outside work. Having a balance in the work and family domains infers that this harmony is required within the required extent for the concerned person. Adjusting of work and family varies among individuals. Some prefer to spend more of the time at work and give less time to family, while others prefer that their activities do not interfere their family life. So as a conclusion, work and family balance might be defined as having adequate control and self-governance over the work and family domains.

Voyandoff (2005) contended that work and family are the two most essential aspects in individuals’ lives and thus, work and family can cause conflict if they contend with each other. Work and family, however, are coordinated and can supplement each other. Indeed, the positive side of the work and family can upgrade the prosperity of the family. Greenhaus and Powell (2006) expressed that the experiences in a single role may enhance individuals’ feeling of prosperity in different roles and their personal satisfaction.

Work-family issues vary across different nations as they are affected by factors at the micro and macro level which fluctuate among the countries. The macro level differences incorporate contrasts in the social, financial, authoritative and mechanical frameworks. These factors give certain ramification to employees who try to juggle their work and family domains (Joplin et al., 2003; Poelmans, 2003; Sheridan & Conway, 2001). Diverse working options and family-accommodating work policies are highlights noticeable in developed nations instead of developing nations (Lewis & Ayudhya, 2006).

According to “Neilson women of tomorrow study” (2011), in past most of the women were only bound to their kitchens, factories, farms or shops where they were working. There were only a few women who were educated and they were facilitated with the cooperating attitude of their fathers and husbands towards women’s work. With the passage of time the developing knowledge economy has given a chance to women to enlighten themselves with the higher education. They are not only empowered by the education but education alsogive them very powerful professions also. In the result of that empowerment today working mothers are fulfilling their family responsibilities and also trying to fulfilling the responsibilities in their careers.
The efforts of working women to coordinate, arrange and balance many issues and activities in their different roles also put them under pressure (Mitnick, 2006). It is also found in Welford (2008) study on work life balance that there is a high percentage of individuals who feel that many of the health problems are caused by the work specifically the rise of stress.

A good chunk of research work on work-life balance has presented some of the important points relating to the problems with family responsibilities (Bell, Rajendran & Theiler, 2012). Most commonly work-life balance is related to working time, flexibility, social security, family, migration, demographic changes and free time (Amstad, Fasel, Elfering & Semmer, 2011).

Work-life balance is a broad and complicated phenomena that contains no specific definition for it (Maxwell, 2004; Greenhause et al, 2003). It is defined by Greenhaus et al (2003) that work-family is the “extent to which an individual is busy and satisfied with his or her work and also with the family responsibilities”. We can also define work-life conflict as a “type of multiple roles conflict in which the individual has pressure from the work and family as well (Greenhaus, Collins & Shaw, 2003). Work family conflict can be a source of stress for working women and it negatively affects the job and personal life satisfaction of working women (Frone, 2003; Kossek & Ozeki 1998). It is true that both male and female experience the negative consequences on job and personal life but it is found through researches that women face more problems than men during their work-life conflict (Ungerson & Yeandle, 2005).

Nowadays in this competitive world, the problem of work-life balance has arisen the attention of many researchers and institutions to work towards the effects of work-life conflict on professional and personal life of working women. It is to be showed in literature that the combination of work-life balance creates a relation between both professional and personal life of working women and in the case of negative relation it cause the job dissatisfaction that can be harmful for the organization (Tomazevic, Kozjek & Stare, 2014).

Women of India have attempted to build up a character and make an existence space in social and also work associations (Druskat & Wheeler 2003, Durham, Knight & Locke, 1997). Work-life balance, in its broadest sense, is characterized as a 'fit' between the different parts in a person’s life (Hudson, 2005). Thus these practices incorporate adaptable work hours (e.g., flexible schedule, which allows workers to fluctuate their starting and ending time by completing the certain provided hours for work; little work week, in which workers work an entire week of hours in four days and take the fifth off), working from the home (telecommuting), sharing an all-day work between two workers (work sharing), family leave programs (e.g., parental leave, adoption leave, onsite childcare, and money related or potentially enlightening help with childcare and eldercare services.
There are changes in substantial part because of a huge social move in parental point of view that is, an expanded acknowledgment of giving education to young girls that considers the feasibility of women working outside the home, contributing economically to the family and also seeking for a career. Analysing the Indian ladies in the workforce, rates of female workers in rural regions are 31 percent and 11.6 percent in urban regions. Indian women held essential role in politics, social organizations and administration. There is a requirement for educated women to achieve high state in the government and the number of women in the corporate area is progressively developing (Tomazevic, Kozjek & Stare, 2014).

It is to be investigated that most of the time tension within work and family is achieved by the change of marriage and family life. At the individual level, marriage and family working have turned out generally to be individual decisions and responsibilities, making the balance of both more powerless (Ahmed, 2011).

It is found in a research of senior working women in public and private firms that most of the women search for work from financial need and for individual objectives. Women in lower to socio-financial status look for money opportunities and those in the upper middle class seek a career for professional goal. Mostly working women express a worry of being insufficiently prepared to lead such intercessions and feel challenges to go up against such a role. In majority of the accessible literature, the issues faced by Indian women are mostly limited to technical issues that affect the business efforts or inspiration and stress-related issues.

**Statement of the Problem**

There is a positive effect of working women on their families and children but still they are facing many work and family related problems that affect their performance in the workplace. So the question to be investigated was; What were the major problems faced by educated working women and what were the perceptions of educated working women about their problems and work conflict?

**Objectives**

Objectives of the study were to;
- find out the major problems faced by working women and their work conflict and work-life balance,
- explore the extent to those problems affecting their work and family,
- investigate the perceptions of working women to balance the work and family,
Research Questions

- What are the major problems working women are facing in their work performance?
- To what extent these problems affect the working women for balancing their work and family?
- What are the major techniques which are used by working women to balance their work and family and overcome work-family conflict?

Research Design

The research design of the study was quantitative in nature and survey method was used as a source of data collection. Working women from Islamabad belonging to different professions i.e. teachers, doctors, bankers, NGOs workers and administration staff were the population of study. A total of 65 working women were selected for data collection. Sample of the study was selected using stratified random sampling. Questionnaire was used as an instrument for data collection. Questionnaire was based on Five points Likert scale i.e. Strongly Agree, Agree, Neutral, and Disagree and Strongly Disagree. Data from the selected sample was collected on five themes including work-life conflict, women earning potential, household responsibilities, financial needs and sexual harassment. Data for the study were collected by the researchers through personal visits. Questionnaires were distributed among the strata’s of institutions and duly filled in questionnaires were collected back by the researchers. Data were analysed by calculating the Mean Value of each theme and were presented in Bar Chart forms. Data for each theme were analysed on five point Likert scale.

Literature Review

In recent century it is trended that there should be at least two earning members in a family. This trend emerged because of working women specifically mothers who enter in the corporate world (Piotrokowski, Rapoport, & Rapoport, 1987; Matthews & Rodin, 1989; Dalton, 1989; Duffy & Pupo, 1992). Along this researchers have also explored the initiative of working women in the entrepreneurial aspect worldwide (Ahmad, 2011).

It is clear that married working women are participating in the progressing world, but they are still the main child care takers in the home and men are considered the relax members at the home (Hochschild, 1989). Because of this, the researchers agreed to investigate the interdependence of roles of work and family because it was considered that balance work-family roles did not have effect on the well-being of society (Edwards and Rothbard, 2000) and physical health (Frone et al., 1997). Many western researchers have also explored the concept of work-family balance and work-life conflict (Berg et al., 2003; Frone, 2003;
Rossi, 2001; Marcinkus et al., 2007; Young, 1999) whereas a very few studies have been done on this concept in Pakistan and there is a need to explore the different social issues in Pakistan that are affecting the work and family of working women.

It is argued by Jahan (1975) that most of the time women cannot express their problems and they fail to gain attention of researchers and considered non-visible and un-organized. But the situation has gradually changed and participation of women in labour market has increased especially since mid of 1980s (Mahtab, 2007). It was explored by the Ralston (1990) that working women having tough duties face more work-family problems than those working women who have flexible duties.

Too much working hours cause work-family conflict and working women face many of the problems (Piotrkowski et al, 1987). Most of the problems they face are caused by their family and relatives. Most of the time permission is required to the women from their male members of family to go out of home for job although they have more choices to find a job than men. Unfortunately most of the time women at the work place are treated as “women”, most of the time they are not supported by their male colleagues and they feel that they do not have enough skills to work with them. Sometimes it is difficult for working women to stay late hours at the work place or to come on off days, so they are considered unfit for job and sometimes it is considered that they do not have any decision power. Because of these reasons most of the working women face many challenges for their work-life balance (Mahtab, 2007). Most of the time working women also face problems due to socio-cultural dynamics of families or too much work load on working women because of which they face problems to justify their job to their families and emerging psychological and health problems (Nabi, Abdullah & Gopang, 2011).

**Work Life Balance**

The Work-life balance has been defined by the Hudson (2005) as a “level of adjustment” between different roles in the life of an individual. Recently literature has reflected that more women are working nowadays in the corporate sector as compared to the past and because of this the responsibilities of working women have increased than before (Mathew & Panchanatham, 2009). A lot of pressure from the workplace creates imbalance for the working women between their job and family. Some of the major elements that create imbalance between work and personal life are “over workload, care of dependents, time management and support from family and colleagues” (Peeters, Montgomery, Bakker & Schaufeli, 2005). It is also true that working women face overload from family and workplace both and the basic duty of a women is considered to play many roles at home including being a spouse, caretaker and parent, performing daily household activities and sometimes providing services to community and society (Clark, 2000; Ungerson & Yeandle, 2005).
Work-life balance is considered to be the key problem for all working women because nowadays the ratio of dual-earner families become high and it is common to work with high working demands and long working hours (Bharat, 2003; Komarraju, 1997; Rajadhyaksha & Bhatnagar, 2000; Sekharan, 1992).

**Work Life Conflict**

Mostly work-family conflict occurs when there is a great interference of work role with personal life demands of a working woman (Greenhaus & Beutell, 1985). It is explained by the Khan et al. (1964) that work-family conflict is a kind of role-conflict in which a working women is pressurized by a role within workplace and on the other side from the family domains in some respect. Literature has shown that there are three types of work-family conflict including:
- Time management conflict
- Strain-based conflict;
- Behavior-based conflict.

Major components that can be cause of work-life conflict are; household responsibilities, workplace environment and financial needs. It is natural that large families demand more time management than small families and large families are also supposed to have high rate of work-family conflict than small families (Cartwright, 1978). The reasons for work-life conflict have been explored in which most common are responsibilities of child care, working hours, monthly salary and organizational environment. Many kinds of work-family conflict are created because of physical and psychological work demands Pleck et al. (1980). If the working hours at the work-place are suitable for a working woman then it has a positive relationship with the work-family balance (Burke et al. 1980b; Pleck et al., 1980; Bohen & Viveros-Long, 1981). It is found by Burke et al. (1980) that most of the time work-family conflicts are followed by the work stressors that include rate of work environment changes, boundary spanning activities involvement, communication stressors and attention to do work.

Results of past researches show that Work Family Conflict (WFC) is identified with various negative job attitudes and outcomes including lower job satisfaction and more tendency to leave a position. Barnett (1998) found that ladies who had different life roles (e.g., mother, spouse, and representative) were less discouraged and had higher confidence than ladies who were more satisfied in their marriages and occupations contrasted with ladies and men who were not married, jobless, or childless.

Work/life adjust is out of control when the pressure from one role make it hard to agree to the demands of the other. This is known as work/life conflict. This implies if people don’t feel they have a good combination of work and non-work roles, they may encounter
contrary or clashing results. This suggests a bi-directional relationship where work can disturb with non-work duties (work/life conflict) and the other way around (life/work struggle). Dileepkumar (2006) has also explained some of the issues that are faced by the working women which include lack of finances, dominance of male members, limited flexibility, lack of education, duly required duties as mother and employee and less motivation for achievements by family and workplace also.

According to Rizvi and Gupta (2009), those activities that are sponsored by government are beneficial only for a small section of working women namely the urban middle class. This benefit can be because of their higher level of education, their access towards information and their family support towards work. In past, in India the female workforce was mainly working in non-managerial, subordinate or low profile positions. But now almost they have all categories of positions in their workplace for women. These work cultural changes have valued to the duties of women and their responsibilities towards their family and also towards society (Mathew & Panchanatham 2009a; 2009b). Because of these positive developments nowadays more and more women are agreed to join the workforce and in most of the workplaces their work-roles are limited. This phenomena has worked towards the work-family balance and to reduce the work-role conflict. Peeters, et al. (2005) had identified that pressures from the job and family domains are usually contradictory that give rise to the work-life conflict and imbalance.

Balancing Work-Life Conflict

There are many factors that are responsible for affecting the personal and professional lives of the working women in western countries. There are many studies that have been conducted to find out the reasons of Work Family Conflict (WFC) and Family Work Conflict (FWC). The major factors identified by many studies include; job and family balance, job satisfaction, autonomy, fair payment, flexibility of working schedules and having the decision power. Beside these factors, there were also some personal factors that were identified including self-care, quality time with spouse, children, family and friends and most importantly time management to balance all these factors with their job. It is observed that job satisfaction of working women is reduced due to arising between these job and professional conflicts that is causing imbalances and stress in the lives of working women (Kilmartin, 2002).

In Australia and New Zealand (Bardoel et al, 2008) research on work-life identified that demographic and changing nature of the work also cause work-family conflict among working women.
Problems Faced by Working Women in Pakistan

Talking about Pakistan, there are certain areas where women are considered as a cheap labour and they are paid lesser amount as compared to that of male folk. Most of the time women working place is not of such design that they can feel comfortable during their working hours. Sometimes unfriendly and oppressive behaviour of the male employees towards female employees is not only an institutional or national problem but it is also a worldwide problem for working women, where the main focus is on the productivity and profit ratio rather than human welfare. One of the main causes of work-life conflict and work-life balance for working women in Pakistan is considered to be the poor transport system. It is considered that most of the time public transport is costly and rarely available for working women. In Pakistan unfortunately government is still unable to provide enough transport facilities to the working women even in the major cities of the country (Hyder, 2009). It is found by the researches that at work place most of the time women face problems and challenges related to harassment, psychological pressures, less support from their colleagues and family and these all cause to lead them towards the work-life and work family conflict and they considered themselves to be unable to manage their dual responsibilities towards work and family (Hyder, 2009).

Role of Organizations in Work-Life Issues

In every culture organizations are considered the main component of any nation, and these are the organization who implement the many practices of work-life balance that are beneficial for reducing the work-life issues and also enable the workers to be more effectively at their work and in the performance of their work roles (Duffy & Pupo, 1992). Nowadays it seemed that organizations are continuously pressurized to design different kinds of practices that will be beneficial for the efforts of employees to perform their personal and professional duties. There are many organizations who take steps to facilitate their employees to balance their work and family responsibilities effectively. Many of the policies including flexible working hours, part-time work, job-sharing, compressed work weeks, telecommunicating, parental leave and on-site child care facility have also been initiated to facilitate the working women on their workplace (Lazar, Osoian & Ratiu, 2010). A variety of health benefits and well-being of employees including health insurance for the employees and family, access to programs and services for the cake of encouragement to fitness for mental and physical health are also offered by the organizations.
Data Analysis

Age of the Respondents

Data describes the age wise distribution of respondents which shows that 16% respondents were from 30-35 age, 46% respondents from 35-40 age, 29% respondents from 40-45 age and 9% respondents were from 45-50 age group. So the analysis shows that most of the respondents were from 35-40 age group.

Qualification of the Respondents

Data labels the qualification of respondents. 15% respondents were graduate, 23% post graduate respondents and 62% were professionally qualified. So the analysis shows that most of the participants of this study were professionals including teachers, doctors and bankers.
Marital Status of the Respondents

Data presents the marital status of respondents which indicates that 69% respondents were married, 22% respondents unmarried and 9% respondents were widow/divorced in this study. According to the analysis majority of the participants were married.

Professions of the Respondents

Data highlights the professions of the participants according to which 12% were doctors, 46% were teachers, 14% were bankers and 28% were of other professions including NGOs workers and administration staff members. So it indicates that majority of the participants were from teaching profession.
Work Experience of Respondents

Data indicates the work experience of respondents. 16% respondents were with 0-2 years’ experience, 69% with 3-5 years’ experience and 15% with more than 6 years’ experience. So majority of the respondents were with 3-5 years’ experience.

Work-life Conflict

Data presents the summary of work-conflict theme of working women participated in the study. It is analysed from the collected data on this theme that most of the participants were of the view that high demands of work had related with their personal lives negatively and it has caused the work-life conflict. They also agreed that responsibilities of their personal life have also affected their responsibilities at work including daily tasks and working overtime. They were of the view that due to the work-life conflict they were facing mental stress for managing dual roles at a time. At the same time there were also some respondents who were neutral about the work-life conflict and they were of the view that work load and family responsibilities are not affecting their dual roles. The mean value 4.54 of work-life conflict analysed that work roles and house responsibilities cause the work-life conflict for most of the working women.
Earning Potential

Data describes the analysis of women earning potential theme. It is revealed from the data that majority of the participants have views that most of the time promotions in their departments were not made on the merit basis but on favouritism and personal biasness. They were also of the view that it takes too much time to get promotion for the female staff as compared to male staff at workplace. Most of the participants were agreed that most of the time choice of part-time job is not welcomed in their respective department. At the same time some respondents were of the view that having part time job does not positively affect the work-life balance but it causes work-life conflict. The mean value “4”of this theme shows that most of the time working women are not welcomed for part-time job by their departments and promotions are not made on merit basis.

House Hold Responsibilities

Data describes the analysis of women earning potential theme. It is revealed from the data that majority of the participants have views that most of the time promotions in their departments were not made on the merit basis but on favouritism and personal biasness. They were also of the view that it takes too much time to get promotion for the female staff as compared to male staff at workplace. Most of the participants were agreed that most of the time choice of part-time job is not welcomed in their respective department. At the same time some respondents were of the view that having part time job does not positively affect the work-family balance but it causes work-life conflict. The mean value “4”of this theme shows that most of the time working women are not welcomed for part-time job by their departments and promotions are not made on merit basis.
Data analysis reveals that majority of the respondents agreed that daily home tasks cause the work-conflict for working women in every profession. They were also of view that positive attitude and helping psychology of husband towards women’s work help to reduce the work-family conflict for many times. Respondents also agreed to the statement that child care responsibilities cause work conflict for most of the times towards job work. At the same time some respondents were neutral about the house-hold responsibilities, attitude and psychology of the husband towards women’s work. The Mean Value “4.68” of this theme describes that house positive attitude and helping psychology of husband for women’s work cause to reduce the work-family conflict for working women in every profession.

**Work Place Environment**

The data analysis reflects the results of work-place environment theme. Majority of the respondents agreed that supportive supervisor on work place is good towards the less work-conflict and peer help or assistance and it leads to reduce the work-family conflict. They were also in consent that most of the time health complications including mood swings, depression and concentration problems are faced because of work-place environment and problems, whereas some respondents were disagreed with the statement that their supervisor don’t help them in hard times at working domain. The Mean Value “4.28” of this theme analysed that supportive supervisor helps to maintain the work-life balance and mostly health problems are caused due to work problems.
Financial Need

Data analysis indicates the results for financial need theme. Majority of the respondents on this theme were agreed that they were working to fulfil their families’ financial needs and if they stopped working their lives will be disturbed because of the financial hardships of family. They were also agreed that the income of their husband is not enough to meet the financial needs and they are compelled to work to fulfil the financial needs. At the same time some respondents disagreed with the statements as they were not compelled because of their husband’s income but they were doing job with their choice. The Mean Value “4.35” of this theme revealed that financial needs of the family compelled women to work.

Sexual Harassment
The analysis shows the results for sexual harassment theme. Most of the participants were agree that mostly working women face sexual abuse issue at their work place and people judge their character as they want to judge and it creates work-life conflict most of the time for working women. At the same time some respondents disagreed that they do not face any sexual abuse at work place. The Mean Value “4.03” for this theme reflects that working women do face sexual harassment at their workplace.

Discussion

Work-family structure can be affected by the setting in which the work and the family areas work in a specific domain. The work timings, descriptions of work and routines could be changed for the women across the nations. So, it is reasonable that demands emerging from work and family parts vary in different settings. The elements that influence female participation at work include attitudes, parental conducts and interest patterns, societal convictions and practices, socio-cultural practices, financial conditions, work-environment conditions and institutional policy practices. Results of the study inferred that due to dual domains responsibilities it is impossible for a working woman to balance work-family conflict and according to Peeters, et al. (2005) pressures from the job and family domains are often incompatible, giving rise to imbalance. It is analysed from the study that high demands from work and family roles cause the work-family conflict and working women are unable to do work-life balance and face health issues like stress, anxiety etc. and in contrast it is found by Naseer (2000) that work sometimes puts women into an unhappy situation, sometimes getting stuck in a situation that increases stress and they experience high stress levels, because heavy work puts a bad effect on their lives and it creates stress in their personalities. It is revealed from the results that due to much of household responsibilities working women are unable to give enough time to work and family that leads towards the work-family conflict and they are unable to balance the dual roles. Findings of the Hisrich & Brush (1988) and Chandra (1991) shows that working women suffer from difficulties in balancing their business and family life, cannot allocate much time for them and at times suffer from stress due to their failure in balancing their roles of business and family lives.

Conclusions

The structure of work-family can be affected by the setting in which the work and family domains run in specific environment. Timings, descriptions and work schedules of the work can vary between women across the centuries. So it can be understood that rising demands from the work and family roles are different in many situations and it is also viewed differently in different cultures. The working women of various professions are found in this difficulty that too many expectations from society and families are leading them towards the work-family conflict. It is observed by many studies that working women
are fighting with their family and work responsibilities to maintain a balance between these two domains. It is also found that most of the time they are unable to achieve the equality at work place for promotion and work division despite that they are educated and experienced. Beside this all, domestic responsibilities always remain the first priority for the working women and they are unable to challenge the assumptions of gender role even they are highly educated. To ensure the work-family balance and challenges of gender relations, prevailing social system might be changed. By introducing flexible working hours, better leaves policies for working women can bring a change in working places for working women by balancing work and family role simultaneously.

**Recommendations**

On the basis of findings following recommendations are made;

1. Organizations might have an internal system to ensure the security of the women employees.
2. Proper self-defence training can be provided to women to cope the situation of harassment.
3. Safety devices and CCTVs might be installed at the work place to ensure the security of the women.
4. Child care facilities and child care leave may be provided for the working women.
5. Flexibility in work timings can be ensured for working women.

**References**


---

**Dr. Munazza Mahmood** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Education, Faculty of Social Sciences, International Islamic University Islamabad.

**Dr. Syed Asad Abbas Rizvi** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Education, Faculty of Social Sciences, International Islamic University Islamabad.

**Memoona Bibi** is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Education, Faculty of Social Sciences, International Islamic University Islamabad.
Gender Responsive Budgeting In Education: A Case Of Punjab Budget (2013-14)

Ra'ana Malik  
Department of Gender Studies  
University of Punjab, New Campus

Nayab Javed  
Department of Gender and Development  
Lahore College for Women University

Memona Rafique  
Department of Gender Studies  
University of Punjab, New Campus

Abstract

The aim of present research study is to analyze the differences in budget allocations of education sector “through gender lens”. In order to find out whether the resource allocations in Punjab budget FY 2013-2014 are in line with the different priorities and needs of girls/women and boys/men or vice versa. The research is exploratory in nature and study is based on Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) and divides public expenditures into two main categories as gender specific budgetary allocations and mainstream (non-gender targeted) budgetary allocations. The study is based upon secondary sources of data. Findings show that spending on education was low in Punjab Province as it is only 18.8 percent under the head development further budgetary allocations targeted women and girls are low only 6.7 percent while budget targeting both gender allocations are 92 percent which widens the gap between both genders. Therefore, it is the high time to realize that budget is not a gender blind instrument hence needs to spend more on development side for gender parity. Gender responsive analysis of Punjab budget shows that province is needed to take steps towards improvement in literacy rates of women and girls through appropriate approach.

Keywords: Gender Budgeting; Gender Analysis, Education.
Introduction

Gender responsive budgeting has picked up noticeable fame in recent years, and was given extra catalyst by the Fourth World Conference on Women, held in Beijing 1995, which called for guaranteeing the reconciliation of a gender perspective in budgetary approaches and projects (Sharp, 2003). Gender budgeting is also important for the, citizen rights, gender equality and human rights (Reeves & Wach, 1999; Hugendubel, 2004; Vargas-Valente, 2002; Elson, 2006; & UNESCO, 2003). GRB is indicator of good governance by doing gender analysis of issues (Hewitt & Mukhopadhyay, 2002). However, it doesn't plan to break down just those programs that are particularly focused on females or to create a different women’s budget, but instead to inspect the gender impacts of all government projects and approaches, their consequences on resource allocations and how to enhance them (GRBI, 2006). A budget reflects how governments set their priorities while shape and implement their policies and also an instrument for the implementation of policies and decisions (Hugendubel, 2004; Rubin and Bartle, 2005 & Finance Division, 2008). This objective could just be attained by making merging between resource allocation and government priorities (Khan, 2011). GRB now refers to scrutinize budgets to note the different impacts on women and men (Sharp, 2003; Oxfam, 2005).

The consideration of this fact is also important that particular requirements of both genders are different and have to be tackled in a different way, so they can take advantage equally. On the other hand, gender issues usually deal with social rather than economic policy therefore, connection of gender issues and government budgets are not overtly found in budget statements. At first, budget seems gender neutral document which may in actual effect be like a gender blind policy. Moreover, budgetary impacts
are immensely different and uneven between men and women; therefore, this gender-neutral assumption ignores the existing fact.

Moreover, it attempts to narrow the social and economic gaps that exist between them (PILDAT, 2006). GRB is a process of alignment of gender perspective into budget process planning to execution. Gender responsive budgeting is an aspect of gender mainstreaming; it is a process that aims to align different budget cycle stages with gender perspective. One aspect of gender mainstreaming is gender responsive budgeting, a process that aims to mainstream gender into the various stages of the budget cycle. Holvoet (2006), pinpoint in his study that gender responsive budgeting is not a separate process rather it is a vital component of gender mainstreaming. By confining gender issues as far as an economic discourse, gender budgeting frees gender concerns from the delicate social issues stadium and raises it to the point of macroeconomics, which is frequently considered being 'specialized', 'worth free' and 'impartial' (Holvoet, 2006).

During the past 25 years, the international community has recognized that gender equality is essential for women’s empowerment and sustainable development (UNDP, 2011). In this regard, it becomes imperative for nations to use their budgets to promote gender-equitable resource allocation and revenue generation. As per Article 80 of the Constitution of Pakistan, budget is a “statement of the receipts and expenditure of the Government for a financial year, referred to as the Annual Budget Statement” (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973). Usually, gender parity is not a priority of a government. Consequently, to bring changes in priorities, not only budget analysis required but also the will to formulate gender responsive budgets.

**Literature Review**

Literature showed that there has been a limited number of gender-disaggregated Expenditure Incidence Analysis studies sponsored by GRB initiatives: in India (Lahiri, Chakraborty, PBhattacharyya, Bhasin & Mukhopadhyay, 2002); Pakistan (Sabir, 2002); Bangladesh (Evers & Siddique, 2006) and Switzerland (Pfeifer & Schwendener, 2008). The brief Indian study was incorporated in the post-budget analysis of how government budgets address the needs of women with the intention to assist the parliament in its role in scrutinizing the budget (Lahiri et al., 2002). Sabir’s (2006) Expenditure Incidence Analysis study of Pakistan’s education discussed the policy implications of the gender biases in all levels of public education expenditure in the country. As part of a gender-responsive budget initiative, the Pakistan government in collaboration with UNDP undertook Expenditure Incidence Analysis studies of the health and education sectors and then held focus group discussions and workshops for different stakeholder groups to disseminate the research findings (Mahbub & Budlender, 2007; Sharp, Elson & Costa, 2010).
According to Hill and King (1995), nations with a lower proportion in enrollment of girls to boys; in primary or secondary education have GNP around 25 percent lower than in nations with a higher gender parity in enrolment (above 0.75). There are cases in gender related literature which demonstrating a positive relationship between higher gender parity and enhancements in financial proficiency. Subsequently, gender responsive analysis of budget is obliged to illuminate gender equality. Moreover, Stotsky (2006) characterizes gender budgeting as “just good budgeting” and argues that gender budgeting is part of the mainstream budget-making process. She further stated that gender responsive budgeting is “budgeting that properly accounts for the positive externalities that are derived from improving women’s opportunities for health care, education and employment”.

Islamic Republic of Pakistan promised to grant equality of gender in all spheres of life. The Constitution’s Article 25 states: “All citizens are equal before law and are entitled to equal protection of law, there shall be no discrimination on the basis of sex alone and nothing in this article shall prevent state from making special provision for the protection of women and children” (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973). Pakistan is the signatory of many policy documents towards achieve the goal of gender equality; this has especially been a priority for the Government during the last two decade or so. There have been consistent efforts to address gender concerns to end gender disparities and to promote gender mainstreaming, of which GRB is an integral part. Number of declarations and covenants such as Education for All (EFA) and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) are adopted to accomplish this goal effectively. Meeting such objectives obliges the configuration and execution of projects that are particularly gone for accomplishing the coveted outcomes. GRB empowers compelling advancement towards meeting EFA objectives. The current status of education indicators in Punjab, in relation to goals set by the MDGs and targets of the MTDF is presenting here for vivid understanding of Punjab’s situation. Though, literacy is a central factor for monitoring improvements towards education. Education is the single most vital variable contributing to poverty reduction; it assumes an indispensable part and has significant impact on all parts of individual’s life. Sadly, least GDP is spending in Pakistan in this respect as contrasted with different neighboring countries of region. As indicated by CIA World Fact book sheet as cited in Pakistan Economic Survey (2013-14), the public sector expenditure on education as rate of GDP in different countries of the region is indicated in Table 1.
The current status of education indicators in Punjab, in relation to goals set by the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and targets of the Mid Term Development Framework (MTDF) is presenting here for vivid understanding of Punjab’s situation. According to census 1988 literacy ratio of Punjab was 46.6 percent, gender disparities exist by area of residence as well, in urban areas of Punjab situation is slightly better than rural area’s in this regard. This trend can be seen in further tables of this study as well. In the absence of a strong political commitment to literacy, an organizational structure and budgetary allocation, literacy among populace by different region is vividly far from each other. These existing disparities are not only among urban and rural areas but also in both genders as well (See Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table: 1</th>
<th>Comparison of National Spending on Education in South Asian Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>National Spending (% of GDP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>11.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: GOP(2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table: 2</th>
<th>Literacy Ratio of Punjab by age, area and gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Population Aged 10 years &amp; older</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PSLM (2012-2013)

Gender analysis is unique in its term because of its assessment of indicators by household income. Wealth quintiles are groups based on per-capita household expenditure, 1st Quintile contains lowest consumption level, whereas the 5th quintile contains highest consumption level PSLM, 2011-12). Meanwhile, a association of literacy rate (10+ years) with the wealth quintiles was observed, found a positive relation between them. Literacy
rate decreased speedily from highest wealth quintile (85 percent) to lowest (27 percent) (Figure 1). Literacy Rates (age 10+, 15-21 years) and NAR by Wealth Quintiles

Variation amongst males was found in different wealth quintiles, as the highest wealth quintile has 94 percent literacy as compared to 38 percent in the lowest (See Figure 1). In females it was also varied as 95 and 24 percent for highest and lowest quintiles correspondingly (MICS, Punjab 2011). Figure 1 shows that in highest wealth quintile children were twice as likely to attend primary school as highest 77 and lowest 36 percent. This situation depicts that household income has its strong impact on populace literacy and education. Therefore, government of country should pay special attention while allocating budget for education.

Different studies have been conducted in Pakistan on GRB so far, finance department, GOPb (2013) conducted Gender Aware Policy Appraisals in education, health and population welfare under GRBIs project, Sabir (2009) presented Unpacking of Budget through Gender lens and Khan (2011) on Federal Budget. GRB is a new concept in Pakistan and the adoption of this approach is confronted with many challenges, including political will, administrative support, a lack of training and the skills required to implement it, patriarchal structures and so forth (Qureshi, Abbas, Safdar & Zakar, 2013). Efforts are being made to assist the government in looking gaps in resource allocation and their impact on gender inequalities. After 18th amendment this study is pioneer and its specifications would fulfill the Gap of gender responsive analysis of Punjab Budget.
Statement of Problem

Gender responsive budgeting is a tool to make sure that budgetary allocations mull over the gender issues in the public eye, and nor implicitly or explicitly discriminates against any of men or women. It is much desired in education sector however as new strategy it needs to face numerous difficulties to make it a win. Thus, it is urgent to break down the existing budget and policies to make budgets gender responsive. Therefore, present study is a comprehensive analysis of Provisional level (Punjab) budget allocations in education sector.

Objectives of Study

The main aim of the study is to analyze budgetary allocations of education sector “through a gender lens”- with the purpose of find out if resource allocations in Punjab are aligned with the varied needs of girls/women and boys/men or vice versa. In particular, the research tries to:

1. Analyze budget expenditure of education sector through gender responsive budgeting;
2. Suggest a set of recommendations on improving gender responsive budgeting specifically in Punjab and Pakistan in general.

Research Methodology

The present study covers gender analysis of Punjab budget’s allocations in education sector, while analysis covers budgetary allocations of Punjab budget 2013-2014. Thus, the study was focused on qualitative approach, deemed to be most suitable to achieve its objectives. Here by, desk review will be used as a research technique. Development expenditures are taking into consideration more often because the trends of government allocations can be estimated through development budget analysis, when sex-disaggregated data is not available for analysis; researcher have limited time for whole budget analysis. Social sector has a priority area of governments for sustainable economic development and to achieve universal commitments. The study is based on FY 2013-2014 budget because when this research started it was the most recent budget announced.

Analytical Framework for the Study

The analytical framework for this study is a little different from the “Total Budget Approach” of Sharp and Broomhill (1990). Rather it uses a modified Total Budget Approach.
This study divides public expenditures into the following categories:

1) Gender-specific budgetary allocations
   a) Budget specifically targeted at women and girls;
   b) Budget specifically targeted at men and boys;
   c) Budget targeting both gender male and female, and
2) Mainstream (non-gender targeted) budgetary allocations.

These orders matches with those of Sharp and Broomhill (1990), however they have been given as sub-classes. The primary classification incorporates three sorts of portions, whose aggregate constitute gender-specific budgetary allocations. The sub-category "c" consolidates budgetary disseminations that concentrated on either at male or female however will be implied for both the male and female. The last classification presents rest of the budgetary allocations or general budget (non-gender budget). These allocations are consider as non-gender allocations as this category doesn’t have direct beneficiary of any gender neither men/boy nor women/girl.

Data Source(s) The analysis is based on the detailed budgetary allocation and expenditure pattern as recorded in the government policy documents included: Provisional level budget 2013-2014, “White Paper on Budget” and the detailed budgetary allocation and expenditure pattern (2013-14) as recorded in the “Annual Budget Statement”, and the “Details of expenditure” (all volumes) of Punjab province. Despite the absence of sex-disaggregated data as mentioned by (GRBI, 2006.), as effort has been made to glean and collect sex disaggregated data from available sources for development allocations.

Limitations of Study

This research study follows some key assumption (not including) likewise, causes and reasons of low budget spending and budget formulation and budget execution procedures and institutions. Gender responsive analysis is a time taking task when sex disaggregated data is not available therefore this study remains focused on Fiscal year 2013-2014 budget estimates.

The analysis does not capture the tangible benefits of budgetary allocations and its spending. Nevertheless, reprioritization of resources is a 'political economy' issue and there is dependably a hazard that legislature may not give due vitality to the findings and suggestions of the GRB analysis and allocate budgets as indicated by different contemplations. Thusly, the measures initiated for gender responsiveness of the legislature budgetary processes needs to be further united. A key to sustainability is gender responsive amendments in the budgetary processes therefore, there is need to give special focus in future.
Results

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categorization of Budgetary Allocations in Education</th>
<th>School Education</th>
<th>Higher Education</th>
<th>Literacy</th>
<th>Special Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Budget (Dev.)</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Specific Allocations</td>
<td>99.36</td>
<td>98.42</td>
<td>97.90</td>
<td>48.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Women &amp; Girls</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>14.84</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>10.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Men &amp; Boys</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Budget Targeting Both Genders</td>
<td>98.58</td>
<td>81.84</td>
<td>97.90</td>
<td>89.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General/Mainstream Budget</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>51.14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Government of Punjab, 2013

Gender Responsive Analysis of Punjab Development Budget – School Education

Education has been devolved to provinces, after 18th amendment in the constitution as far school education is concerned the “Article 25-A requires that the state shall provide free and compulsory education to all the children of the age five to sixteen years”. The gender parity is the other requirement of constitution as it is for “all the children of the age five to sixteen” therefore; gender responsive analysis of allocations of this sector has been described here, share of school education budget in budgetary allocations of education is largest as compare to other sub sectors of education. Moreover, we find that gender specific allocations are almost 100 percent; the data shows that government of Punjab is given focus on both genders at this level of education to combat illiteracy. More facilities are provided to both genders boys and girls to meet the constitutional/national requirements as well as international commitments (See Table 3).

Gender Responsive Analysis of Punjab Development Budget – Higher Education

Higher education is important for enlightened and prosperous Punjab, the budgetary allocations show that gender specific allocations are huge in this sector as 98.42% while women are encouraged to get higher education specifically as compared to men and boys as women specific allocations are larger than men and boys. Large share of budget is
targeting both genders because HEC funds the development activities of public sector universities which provide co-education, and both genders could take the benefit from this equally (See Table 3).

**Gender Responsive Analysis of Punjab Development Budget – Literacy**

Punjab ADP 2013-2014 aims to achieve literacy 100 percent by the year 2019, in this regard it made generic efforts and interventions. Above table 3 shows that under these head gender specific allocations are vivid as major allocations are dealing with both genders boys and girls. There are no specific allocations for boys or girls individually.

**Gender Responsive Analysis of Punjab Development Budget – Special Education**

According to Research and Development Department Islamabad, 2012, Punjab has 2,816,795 people with disabilities of different kind such as crippled, mentally retarded, deaf/mute, blind etc. Out of total population with disabilities (PWDs) in Punjab, 73.8 percent belong to rural areas and remaining 26.2 percent to urban areas while, 59.1 percent PWDs are male and 40.9 percent are females in Punjab. Whereas PWDs need special attention of government, the situation is not satisfactory in this regard it shows that spending on special education is remain low in share as 0.73 percent (See Table 3).

**Discussion and Conclusions**

Pakistan is a signatory to MDGs, SDGs and other global treaties which guarantee the accelerated progress in education sector. Sarraf (2003) contends that gender mainstreaming initiatives can facilitate the preparation and implementation of pro-poor budgets by targeting women supporting activities. Though, spending on education was only 18.8 percent under the development head in Punjab budget 2013-2014.

In Punjab, budgetary allocations for education are divided into four sub categories/sectors as school education, higher education, literacy, and special education. The allocations for school education are highest among all these four sub-categorize of education sector as 80.8 percent. Though, the smallest share of 0.73 percent is for special education which is indeed insufficient, allocations of 13.3 and 5.00 percent for higher education and literacy respectively (see Table 3).

The gender specific budgetary allocations are 86.3 percent and non- gender allocations are 13.7 percent in development budget of education sector though share of development budget in total budget is significantly low (see Table 3). Therefore, it is the high time to realize that budget is not a gender blind instrument hence needs to spend more on development side for gender parity for instance; if in present, existing boy’s schools more
than girls schools, the previous will get a larger amount of money from the re-current budget than the latter. Therefore, gender component of policies could be tackled via development activities if, the goal is to reduce the gender disparities. In spite of the fact that women and girl’s specific allocations offer in development budget is likewise little however budget focusing on both gender gets lion share (92 percent), due to historical, socio-cultural, and economic reasons, men and boys gain more than women and girls. Though, men and boys specific allocations are only 1 percent in education budget.

Moreover, women and girl’s specific allocations offer in development budget of education is 6.7 percent while under the head school education women specific share is 1.36 percent only and the women specific allocation is little higher in higher education head (14.84%) but still far away from sufficient share as women literacy rate in Punjab 47 percent in 2013 (see Table 3). This budget share supports the fact that division of expenditure expands the gender gaps as more spending on current situation rather focusing on new construction of schools or upgrading existing school etc.

Though there is serious concern of unending issue of using the whole recurrent budget but underutilizing development budget. In 2013-14, actual development spending on education by all four provinces augmented was 31.3 billion rupees, less than 50 percent of allocated budget (70.3 billion Rs.) According to Alan 2013, in 2013-14, Punjab had the noteworthy rate of under use of development budget as 21.4 percent. However, Punjab’s GDP portion is higher than other provinces as 0.7 percent (Alan, 2013).

Punjab Education Sector Reform Program (PERSP) in Punjab has increased budget for present gender enrollment shares though, it helps to maintain the status quo and the gender gap. New additional allocations for girls’ schemes would contract the gap. Budget tends to deal with gender issues through increased girls and women access to education facilities because these sectors are vital for development and empowerment of society and its oppressed segment likewise. Punjab Budget analysis demonstrates that the change is impending. There are doubtlessly allocations of resources which are fundamental for gender equity and women’s empowerment will fetch a gradual change in privileges’ of women and will enhance their social and economic status. The above discussion depicts that budgetary allocations of Punjab and national and sub national commitments of gender mainstreaming are far away from each other. Though, there is light: over years, Punjab has shown improvement and allocates some amount on women shows that there is understanding of its importance. Nevertheless relevant laws and strategies as well as better access to social sector, province has improved but there is still lot more to do.

In budget 2013-14 the aggregated budgetary allocations is 82 percent for education embarked for current expenditure and development expenditure in budget share is 18 percent. This budget share supports the fact that division of expenditure expands the
Gender gaps as more spending on current situation rather focusing on new construction of schools or upgrading existing school etc.

In trim of this situation, policies and correspondently budgetary allocations attempt to reduce the issues through supply side interventions. Although, it is time to consider demand side requirements and try to understand scenario of particular region while allocating budget and strategic interventions for specific area e.g. cultural barriers, socio-economic conditions of populace. In this regard, expert teachers are important for bringing and retaining girls in class rooms. In this regard, expert teachers are important for bringing and retaining girls in class rooms as the female are encourage teaching by female teachers, appropriate site selection for girls schools to make it feasible for girls to come in close proximity, boundary walls, toilets and water etc., have strong correlation with high girls enrollment. Some allocations are essential for awareness, about the worth of female education. The above discussion depicts that budgetary allocations of Punjab and national and sub national commitments of gender mainstreaming are far away from each other. Though, there is light: over years, Punjab has shown improvement and allocates some amount on women shows that there is understanding of its importance. Nevertheless relevant laws and strategies as well as better access to social sector, province has improved but there is still lot more to do.

Recommendations

Gender Responsive Budgeting is strategy towards gender mainstreaming regardless it is in initial stage.

- Gender sensitivity must be recognized as cross cutting theme and government of Pakistan translated into a set of indicators for evaluating the gender responsiveness of whole budget. Moreover, gender budget statement should be issued by the ministry of Finance at the time of the issuance of the budget. The study is attempted to analyze the budgetary allocations under the development head of Punjab whether further researches would be given focus on district level budgets as well to get more vivid picture.
- There is need to spread awareness about gender responsive budgeting among masses and legislatures also. Different methods of gender responsive analysis can be used for further researches as time use survey, beneficiary analysis and policy aware appraisal.

End Notes

1. Literacy Ratio is the percentage of Literates (10 years & above in the total population (10 years & above) Source: Bureau of Statistics, Punjab
References


---

**Dr. Ra’ana Malik** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Gender Studies, University of Punjab, New Campus, Lahore Pakistan.

**Nayab Javed** is Lecturer in the Department of Gender and Development, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore.

**Memona Rafique** is Ph.D Scholar in the Department of Gender Studies, University of Punjab, New Campus, Lahore Pakistan.
Piece Work And Feminization Of Informal Economy: Case Study Of Cholistani Women

Rukhsana Hasan
Department of Gender Studies
Fatima Jinnah Women University

Abstract

It is an accepted reality that woman plays an important part in the economic growth of a society. It has been well documented that there has been a steady decline in the low paid formal sector jobs for women, while the prevalence of low paid informal sector jobs are on the rise. Women’s contribution in the production process as principal producer of food products and services along with reproducers and managers of labor power, is crucial for the existence and maintenance of a social structure. The gradual political and economic integration of pastoral community of Cholistan desert into larger national economies has stimulated distinct divisions based on access to wealth and other resources among Cholistani pastoral nomads. The study utilized qualitative research method to explore the experiences of women involved in piece work production, in order to examine how various gender related ideologies in the communities had relegated women to lower tiers of the paid economic activities. Results were based on the information obtained from 10 women home based workers, supplemented with a focus group discussion and the narratives of 2 representatives of shop keepers. On the basis of thematic analysis it was concluded that the sexual division of labor within the work force of Cholistan community was not created by market economy, but it did create a system in which pre-existing gender distinctions were reproduced in the wage labor system.

Keywords: Informal Economy, Pastoralists, Social Differentiation, Economic Diversification.
Introduction

Over the past many decades, employment in the informal economy has risen rapidly across the developing world. It has been documented that more women than men are part of the informal workforce (Saigol 2010; Hasan & Farooq 2015) in most of the developing and underdeveloped countries of the world, and majority of them are home-based workers (Home Net South Asia (HNSA), 2014). Simultaneously, due to globalization pastoral and agro-pastoral production systems are experiencing profound changes as a result of various political and economic forces working at the international, national and regional levels (Horowitz, 1981, 1987). Over the years, the expansion of irrigated agriculture and the closing of frontiers between India and Pakistan has resulted in the loss of grazing land of Cholistani pastoralists, which in turn has initiated a process of their voluntary sedentarization. This progressive process of political economic incorporation of the Cholistani pastoral economy into a broader sphere of regional and national economies has fostered an unprecedented rise in the growth of informal economy as well as accumulation of capital by a few nomadic and settled Cholistanis who had access to sufficient livestock and land, respectively.

The process has led not only to the impoverishment of the pastoral community, but has created a sharp division on the basis of economic resources among Cholistani pastoralists, subsequently, leading to the interconnected processes of “economic diversification (Horowitz 1989), marginalization, and social differentiation” (Horowitz & Jowkar 1992:23). Accordingly, these changes have had a considerable impact on Cholistani women and their access to economic resources. The objective of the paper is to explore the experiences of women involved in piece work production, in order to examine how various gender-related ideologies in the communities provide bases that channel women toward certain positions in the paid production process.
It is well documented that women in urban and rural areas have been involved in various types of paid economic activities, both in formal and informal sectors of the national economies. Generally, workers involved in piece work production are home-based workers. Home-based workers produce merchandises for the market from within their own homes. In developed, developing and under developed countries, home-based workers produce a wide array of goods for local, national and global markets. Akhtar & Vanek, (2013) have defined home based workers as those individuals who perform work for businesses, firms or their intermediaries normally on a piece-rate basis. Some of them are self-employed and some are sub-contracted. It is challenging to stipulate the precise data on the magnitude of home-based workers around the world, yet the available data compiled by Anyidoho, & Steel (2016) for the working paper of Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) network identify that home-based work accounts for a substantial portion of urban employment in Asia, and that the vast majority of home-based workers almost everywhere are women Home-based workers can be categorized into two broad categories, self-employed and sub-contracted. The self-employed buy their own raw materials and supplies and sell their own finished goods, mainly to local customers and buyers. The sub-contracted workers (called home-workers) produce goods for firms, both at the national and global level. Unlike self-employed workers, the subcontracted workers do not buy their own raw materials or sell their own finished goods, yet most of the time they have to bear the cost of production. Factors like age, marital status, lack of education make the home-based work most attractive form of income generating activity for women in both rural and urban areas of Pakistan. Piece work is defined as a type of employment in which worker is paid a fixed amount for each unit produce rather than the length of time he/she may work.

**Literature Review**

The landmark book of Ester’s Boserup, “*Women’s Role in Economic Development*” (1970), has inspired many scholars to critically analyze the issues regarding women’s socio-economic status and their economic contribution in the society. Some of the issues that became the part of feminist debates are related to the apparent invisibility and underestimation of women’s work in both paid and unpaid economic activities (Agarwal 1985; Beneria 1981; 1992; 1999, Dixon 1983; Dixon-Mueller & Anker 1988; Deere 1983), relationship between women’s unpaid work at home and production of capital & labor force (Meillassoux 1981), the relation between the process of capital accumulation, variations in the women’s work and in the form of their relegation (Beneria& Sen 1981; 1982; 1986; Wilson 1985), lack of access to productive resources, especially land (Shimwaaye & Blackden 2001), capital and financial resources (Akinboade, Oludele Akinloye. 2005, Bolnick 1992, Grosh & Somolekae 1996, Tundui 2002), participation of women in the informal economy (Barauh 2004) as well as how has export processing has resulted in transnationalisation of production, feminization of low skilled labor as well as
affected the traditional sex based division of labor, and family structure in Third World economies (Safa 1981; Elson & Pearson 1981 & 1988; Elson 1992; Feldman 1992). Studies have also documented that export processing as well as restructuring of economies have resulted in creating inequalities on the basis of class, gender, and ethnic divisions (Mohanty 1997; Momsen 2004; Mies 1987).

Apart from it there has been a large body of literature documenting the affect of paid work on the position of women in the household as well as in the larger society (Momsen 2004; Leslie & Buvinic 1989; Sharma 1986; Standing 1991). Some of the researches have documented that the participation of women in wage work has a positive affect on their situation, including improved negotiating position within the household (Folbre 1986; Horton 1996; Hart 1997; Joekes 1987; Kabeer 1997a), while Salway, Jesmin, & Rahman, (2005) have documented that not all research studies have established such positive effects on women. They are of the opinion that women’s economic contribution will not necessarily result in the equal power as men’s, since the socially constructed extrapolations of women and men’s work are generally unequal.

As pointed out by Horn (2010: 264), just like in other developing countries, in Cholistan too, “the informal economy is the principal source of earnings for women, and usually they are concentrated in the temporary, low-paying, and insecure jobs within the informal sector. Apart from being the lowest paid wagemakers, they also bear the burden of market production and the reproduction of the labor force. Religious ideologies of seclusion and veiling and dominant urban middle class ideology of “women as housewives have worked together with a particular set of productive relations to assure a cheap supply of female labor” (Moore 1988:85) to entrepreneurs in nearby urban centers.

Barauh (2004) has discussed in great detail the economic contribution of women in the national economies of the developing and underdeveloped countries. She is of the view that although women’s contribution in the economies of the developing and underdeveloped countries is crucial, yet it is very difficult for the majority of them to find job opportunities in the formal sectors of these countries, rather they formed major bulk of labor force in the sector that is variously termed as ‘unorganized’, ‘unprotected’, ‘unregistered’ or ‘informal.’ Anthropologist Keith Hart (1973) was the one who coined the term “informal sector” to refer to low-paid economic activities by migrants living in Accra, Ghana. Dignard & Havet (1995) have defined informal economy, as the sector of paid economic activity which is not listed with government agencies and does not conform to the rules governing labor practices, taxes and licensing. International Labour Organization (ILO 2002) has defined the informal sector as all productive units that are not recognized or governed by the state, and all those employed persons who are not entitled to receive social security benefits through their work. The definition of informal economy, by Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO’s),
as economic activities or workers as those “that are not regulated or protected by the state” is in line with the definition proposed by ILO (2002), while WIEGO, has further elaborated the term informal economy as “own-account workers” who work at home to produce goods or services, receive remuneration, and participate in market activities. On the other hand Carr & Chen (2001:4) have defined informal economy, as the economy which include “all non-standard wage workers who work without minimum wage, assured work, or benefits, whether they work for formal or informal firms.” Generally, scholars have a consensus over the definition of informal paid work which refers to the paid production and sale of goods and services that are unregistered by, or hidden from the state for tax, social security and/or labor law purposes but which are legal in all other respects (Feige, 1990; Portes, 1994; Thomas, 1992; Williams & Windebank, 1998).

The occurrence of informal sector is not a new phenomenon, Charmes (1998a), in a study conducted on Informal Sector, Poverty and Gender, have indicated that the share of the informal economy in the nonagricultural workforce ranged from over 55 percent in Latin America to 45-85% in different parts of Asia to nearly 80% in Africa. It has been well documented that over the last few decades despite widespread economic development, the proportion of informal economies is on the rise, at the global level (Ghani & Kanbur 2015; Meagher 2014). Research by Meagher (2014) has documented that the proportion of informal economy in West Africa and South Asia has been estimated to over 50% and 48% percent, respectively. Barauh, (2004 quoting Jhabvala & Subrahmanya, 2000) on the other hand, has documented a very high figure for informal sector in India. According to her, the informal economy in India accounts for 93% of the total labor force and 64% of GDP. According to the Economic Survey of Pakistan (2006-07) in the year 2003-04, the informal sector employed 39.84% of total labor force and 70% of non-agricultural labor force, where as in 2005-06 the informal sector employed around 41.25% of total labor force and 73% of non-agricultural labor force. Whereas, Pakistan Employment Trends, (2013), has documented that 70.9% females are involved in the informal sector economy as compared to 60.8% of male population.

Home based workers or those involved in piece work production constitute a major chunk of informal economy. Akhtar & Vanek, (2013) have defined home based workers as those individuals who perform work for businesses firms or their mediators normally on a piece-rate basis. It has been documented that globally there are around 250 million home-based workers and out of which 200 million are from the poorest families (Rehman & Khan 2016). Benaria & Roldan (1987) discussing the double role of women have documented in their study of homework and subcontracting in Mexico City, that women not only bear the burden of production for market but also for the reproduction of the labor force. This type of production system, as pointed out by Benaria & Roldan (1987), is beneficial for the jobbers, who do not have to invest in the infrastructure, i.e., buildings,
machines or any other tools, as all cost of production and reproduction of the labor force are borne by workers, especially by women workers.

The primary reasons of increased involvement of women in informal sector of economy documented by various researches are (Hasan & Farooq 2015; Sudarshan & Sinha, 2011) poverty and gender based discrimination. Apart from it there are different other causal factors that have led to the growth and expansion of informal economy, especially home-based work in different regions of the world. In many countries, it may be because of the fact these countries have experienced little or no economic growth at all. While in others there is upsurge in high-tech sectors, resulted in the creation of high-skill formal jobs as compared to low skilled manufacturing jobs. In such context, those who are unable to compete for high-tech jobs find work or continue to work in the informal sector. White (1992) has documented that economic crisis is also a reason for unprecedented growth of informal sector jobs in many underdeveloped and developing countries. It has been documented that economic restructuring has led to the downsizing of public sector enterprises along with the cutbacks in public expenditures thus the only alternative workers have is to work in the informal sector.

**Theoretical Framework**

The objective of the study was to explore the experiences of women involved in piece work production, in order to examine how various gender related ideologies in the communities had relegated women to lower tiers of the paid economic activities. In order to comprehend the effect of this process on gender relations; it was imperative to focus our attention on the factors located in the household and sphere of reproduction. We have to analyze how the household structure and other socializing institutions provide the bases that channel women towards certain positions in the paid production arena (Beneria 1982). The theoretical paradigm adopted in the study is an historical materialist interpretation of social change affecting gender relations. The study has attempted to delineate the historical trajectory of changes in the mode of production and its impact on gender relations as Cholistani pastoralists are increasingly giving up their nomadic adaptation and becoming more involved in the marketing of livestock and livestock produce. At the same time it would be documented how the prevailing cultural norms and beliefs regarding the proper roles of men and women were transformed by dominant ideologies and were given religious connotation with changing socio-economic conditions.

In establishing the linkage between the comparatively more subsistence oriented pastoral economy of Cholistani pastoralists of the past and the socio-political and economic realities of the present, the study focused on the transition of pastoral society from precapitalist to more market-oriented forms of production². While no explicit attempt is
made here to tailor a model of articulation to the empirical realities of transformation from subsistence production to the production for the market in Cholistani pastoral community, an interesting parallel may be drawn between the Meillassoux thesis and incorporation of Cholistani women into paid production for the market. Meillassoux has argued that capitalism does not destroy the pre-capitalist mode of production it encounters in the developing world, but instead maintains it in articulation with the capitalist mode of production. He believes that the pre-capitalist modes of production are beneficial to capital as they provide capital with the cheap labor. This is possible for two reasons: first, because the food produced in the pre-capitalist sector covers part of the subsistence cost of the worker’s household, and secondly, because the pre-capitalist sector also pays the cost of reproduction of the labor force. Both these benefits allow capitalists to pay workers lower wages because their wages do not have to cover the costs of reproduction of labor and cheap labor results in larger profits (Meillassoux 1981, cf. Moore 1988). It was argued that a progressive process of political economic incorporation of the Cholistani economy into a broader sphere of national capital has gained momentum over the past few decades. This incorporation has fostered an unprecedented rise in the accumulation of capital by a few nomadic and settled Cholistanis who had access to sufficient land and livestock. As a consequence the gulf between rich and poor households in Cholistani society has broadened with the consistent decline of the state support for the pastoral sector. Since, overall household income is related to the livestock herd, declines in nomadic pastoralism and related increases in the process of sedentarization result in impoverishment of the pastoral community in general and of pastoral women in particular. It was argued that women not only bear the cost of production for market but also for the reproduction of the labor force. The production system is beneficial for the jobbers, who do not have to invest in the infrastructure, i.e., buildings, machines or any other tools, as all costs of production and reproduction of the labor force are borne by workers, especially by women workers.

Methodology

Locale of the Study

Cholistan is a vast desert in the southern part of the Bahawalpur division of Punjab province in Pakistan. Lying between 27° 42' and 27° 45' north latitudes and 69° 52' and 73° 05' east longitudes (Arshad; Rao; & Akbar 1995), its total area of 26,000 km² (10,399sq miles, 6,400,000 acres) cover about two-thirds of the total land area of Bahawalpur Civil Division and about eight percent of the total land area of Punjab province (FAO 1993:10). The estimated total population of Cholistan in 1991 was 97,000 (FAO 1993), which is scattered over a large area. Settlement of the pastoral nomads selected for the fieldwork was about 45 miles south of Bahawalpur City at Kakaranwataloba. This site was chosen because of its population size, ethnic
heterogeneity, and broad mix of pastoral and agro pastoral activities as well as its proximity to four other settlements.

Following a period of initial appraisal and rapport building exercises, case study households and key informants were selected in each of the selected settlements. A total of 40 home based women workers in the settlements were identified. Informal discussion on the topic was carried out with the key informants using the technique of case study method. Alongside, 10 home based workers, willing to participate in the research process, were selected for the in-depth interviews. One focus group discussion was also conducted to gather information on these topics through a process of iteration and triangulation. After a prolonged period of passionate interaction with sample households and their neighbors enabled the researcher to collect comprehensive data regarding the daily activities of women who were associated with handicraft and piecework production. Beside women home-based workers 2 representatives of the shopkeepers, who were involved in the business, were also interviewed.

As the majority of female in the area were illiterate therefore I have to reevaluate my methodology due to frequent inquiries from the respondents regarding the benefits of the research to the community. Hence, instead of depending totally upon the technique of interviewing, I tried to utilize the technique of interpersonal dialogue (especially with women). In this case they used to ask the same questions to me which they were expected to answer. As a result instead of being mainly a subject of research they were also participants in the research. The women were as curious about my life as I was about theirs. This not only made the setting informal, but also helped me in my discussion with them about the intimate details of their family life. The interviews were informal, in fact, a form of “chat session” rather than formal question-and-answer session. During these informal interviews they used to talk about matters that were not very relevant to most of my questions but I never intervened and let them talk at their own pace. During the initial stages of the research respondents expressed their reservations regarding my note taking, and recording of their narrations therefore I used to limit my note taking to the salient points of their narrations. Later on, once they felt at ease with my presence and questioning it was easier for me to document their narrations. Conclusion was drawn based on the themes developed from respondents’ narratives. Furthermore, all the ethical procedures were followed while conducting this research.

Results &Discussion

Cholistani women have been involved in various home based economic activities, especially in the form of piece work production, mainly embroidered clothes, patchwork bedspread, and other handicrafts like crochet work and lace making. The economic crisis of 1980s, followed by various structural adjustment programs implemented by Pakistani
regimes resulted in extremely difficult times for the masses. Poor and under privileged groups, belonging to both urban and rural areas including pastoralists, who were at the periphery were the hardest hit, because of the drastic cutbacks. The cutbacks were made in the subsidies for daily consumption items, like food and fuel and in expenditure on social sector, like health and education. Poor women like Cholistani pastoralist, had to bear the brunt of these cutbacks in social sectors. They had to make trade-offs among different basic needs and had to intensify their labor input in various productive activities by extending their working day. This intensification of labor and work-time resulted in extra workload for Cholistani women. Other coping strategies that Cholistani women had to adopt include the reduction in the consumption of animal produce, and shift from dairy consumption to other sources of food. Due to commercialization of dairy and livestock produce, Cholistani women lost control of their income as well as their support network. Men, on the other hand gained more control of cash, which resulted in the reinforcement of their position as owners of family herd and decision-makers concerning various household related issues. With men gaining control over the income from the sale of milk, milk produce and livestock, women became increasingly dependent on men to provide them with necessary cash in order to fulfill the basic household related expenses.

In the research sample almost all women belonging to different economic and clan groupings were involved in some sort of handicraft production. Handicraft production, especially hand embroidery on clothing and crochet, is an old art and is being transmitted from mothers to daughters for generations and was done entirely by teenage girls and women of all ages. According to female respondents, the production of handicraft for the market started in the late 1980s by a woman named Jehan Bibi from Bahawalpur City. The process continued for a couple of years. Jehan Bibi used to supply material to women of the pastoral settlements and the remuneration used to be on piecework basis after she had collected the finished products. Jehan Bibi’s role is particularly important because she was the one who initiated the marketing of local handicraft on a regular basis. By 1990s, the whole production process and the marketing was in the hands of women, the market link was between the women of urban middle class and poor women of rural areas and women were the intermediaries. Negotiations regarding deadlines, wages and other details about work were between women.

The increase in demand for embroidered clothes in urban centers of the country resulted in increased involvement of businessmen from Bahawalpur city. According to the representatives of the shopkeepers, the businessmen of the city, considering it a lucrative business with little investment of capital, also got involved in the activity. Unable to extract much profit from the labor of rural women in the areas around Bahawalpur City, they turned their attention towards irrigated areas of Lesser Cholistan. They further stated that their task was to simply supply material to rural/Cholistani women. They utilized the setup that was already in place. All the respondents believed that with the involvement of
businessmen (from Bahawalpur) in the process, there was a shift from small-scale production of embroidered clothes to comparatively large-scale commercial production. Earlier, each suit piece, head covering (dopata, or Chadar) tablecloth or bedspread used to have a different pattern as those items belonged to different patrons. In case of commercial production, there were more than 50 suits, head coverings or bedspreads of a single pattern involving particular stitch.

Factors Motivating Middlemen from City to Work with Cholistani Women

When asked about the reasons for working with Cholistani women, the representatives of shopkeepers referred to some of the specific aspects that were common to all rural women, including Cholistani women. According to them,

1. Most of the rural women, especially Cholistani women, have no other source of cash income, apart from seasonal agricultural activities. Therefore, they cannot afford to lose these earnings as for many of them it maintains a continuous supply of cash throughout the year.

2. They were of the opinion that their counterparts in urban areas can earn cash through various activities, like providing personal services, engaging in petty trading or working as maids in hospitals or schools. Cholistani women, on the other hand, have no such option available to them.

3. The Cholistani women have no choice but to be more disciplined and patient. Therefore, unlike their counterparts in urban area, they follow orders without any objection or conditions and are less troublesome in the demand for wages and working conditions.

4. They usually deliver the finished product before the deadline.

5. They were of the opinion that as Cholistani women do not work in the fields like other rural women, except during cotton picking season, therefore, embroidery and handicraft production was their leisure time activity.

Though, these were the views of two representative, they very correctly reflect the stereotype opinion of the majority that regard women as “submissive and docile workers” (Benaria & Roldan 1987:49) who are “sitting in the house” (Mies 1982:11), and that their income as a supplementary income. In fact in many Cholistani households, women’s economic contributions are vital to the survival of their families. Especially, during the dry season when milk production is drastically reduced and market prices for the livestock are extremely low. Women’s income is a major source of cash for many households. It was also observed that among Cholistani pastoralists, the distinction between reproductive and productive activities is very vague and most of the productive activities fall in the realm of domestic chores. So it is fair to conclude that the new relations of productions used the pre-existing division of labor to its own advantage. This resulted not only in greater sex segregation and tasks, but also integrated Cholistani
women into lower echelons of market economy. When production for the market was introduced in the area the older forms of sexual division of labor were not abolished, rather were used, reinforced and reinterpreted. The interaction between workers and women, who were involved in the distribution and the marketing of the products enabled those workers to negotiate their wage rates and time needed to finish the product. On the other hand the involvement of businessmen in the activity reduces the role of women in the whole process to ‘invisible producers’ (Mies 1982). It also led to the involvement of male members, in the process, as they became the intermediaries in women’s dealing with the male agents. They were the ones who negotiated the wage rates and deadlines.

Reasons for being dependent on Brokers from the City

- **Accessibility to Market**
  All the respondents were of the opinion that for the Cholistani women who were involved in handicraft production, it is virtually impossible for them to market their product. Women cannot move beyond the confines of rohi and settled communities as a result of they have to rely on middleperson for the marketing of their products. According to one of the respondents

  I cannot market the products on my own or at a price what I propose. Personally, I tried to sell my products to the settled Punjabi population, but I had received very little in return than what I expected of my products. Accessibility to the market is also a major issue for me as I could not buy and sell the products on my own choices. Even my husband tried to sell my work at the main market of Bahawalpur but the prices the shop keepers offered were extremely low, so he refused to sell. As a result, I had to rely on the Thakedar (jobber), at least, it save us money and time from the frequent trips to the City. I used to work with Jehan Bibi, working with her was easy, as we were able to discuss the time line and wage rate with her. Now, my husband has to talk to him about the wages.

- **Restricted mobility**
  Due to lack of exposure and restricted mobility, women also lack in appropriate communication and negotiation skills. About the societal norms on gender behavior and women role, one of the respondent narrated,

  The norms of our society restrict the physical mobility of women beyond the confines of rohi (local term for Cholistan) which restrict us to seek paid work outside the home. So only option available for us is to market our traditional crafts. We learn the skills of producing these crafts from our mothers, just like our
folklores, these skills are transmitted to us from one generation to another. The socio-cultural values also limit our ability to develop skills required for dealing with *Thakedars* (or his men) and the marketing of our products.

She further discussed the role of government and complained about the careless attitude of the government towards providing a forum for developing their skills as well as facilitating the marketing of their products.

The government has not realized the importance of handicrafts as it has not taken any effective measures to facilitate women like us. It is the job of the government to formulate specific strategies to enable us to market our products so that we should not have to rely on *Thakedar*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender Traits Acquired Socially</th>
<th>Gender Traits Utilized By Jobbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women’s involvement in reproductive and domestic activities (private sphere) and that of men in income generating activities (public sphere) are viewed as natural.</td>
<td>The prevailing gender order and the division of roles based on sex also strengthen the belief that women’s income is secondary while that of men is primary enable jobbers to pay lower wages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The skills in embroidery and handicrafts passed on among women from generation to generation</td>
<td>Jobbers utilize these skills for their benefit without any expenditure of their own on training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>These and other household activities are tedious and repetitive as a result women acquire the ability of patience</td>
<td>Jobbers are quick to use these traits of docility and patience for their work, which is not only repetitive and tedious but time consuming and laborious too.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural norms like; <em>mahram</em> and <em>na-mahram</em> restrict women’s ability to utilize job options available in urban areas. As a result these women are constrained to work at home</td>
<td>The restrictions due to cultural norms, lack of job option in the surrounding areas, the dispersed nature of the work, and their pressing need for income not only limits their bargaining ability but also enable jobbers to take advantage by making it one of the lowest paid activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cholistanis put great emphasis on traits like, obedience and respect for elders, so over a period of time these traits become a part of their personality</td>
<td>These traits of respect and obedience among Cholistani women make them preferred workers as they follow orders and meet the deadlines better than their counterparts in urban or rural areas near urban centers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the responses the participants of the study very clearly demarcated the socially acquired gender traits and how these traits were helpful in the production process for the market. Table 1 indicates how the socially acquired gender traits are utilized by the entrepreneurs in order to have a cheap supply of labor and the product.

Because of the regulations concerning proper and modest female behavior vis-à-vis non-kin males, Cholistani women were unable to establish dyadic relationship with the male agents. In societies like Cholistan where women are restricted, by their reproductive tasks, by a linguistic barrier and moral codes that constrain female mobility, Cholistani women have to rely on their male relatives to sell their products, which in turn “reduces their control over earnings” (el-Bushra 1986 cf. Horowitz & Jowkar 1992, Little 1987). Women’s inability to deal directly with the agents gave men the power to negotiate. In most cases men hesitate to negotiate on the deadlines or on wage rates because of fear of losing the incoming cash income. This results in greater exploitation of jobbers and their agents as they achieve maximum benefit in much less time and with very little investment.

This type of work is unstable and offers no security. Carr& Chen (2001) have termed it as ‘informal economy’, thus creating a precarious dependency of the Cholistani women on the jobbers who assigned them work, without any assurance that the work will be forthcoming once they hand over the completed product. The dependency is also reinforced by the fact that the supply of labor willing to work on lower wages is well above the existing demand. The ideology of “housewifization”/familialism and observance of purdah i.e. veiling) among Cholistanis centered on the extension of women’s procreative functions to women’s responsibility for the home. So when Cholistani women entered into the production for national market (through piecework), the value of their work and their position in the work force was determined by the prevailing dominant ideologies of women’s proper place, their position in the social relations and their work responsibilities at home. Along with harsh working conditions, they were also subjected to severe rules. In some cases wages were deducted if the merchandise was damaged or soiled, whereas, in other cases women were liable to pay for the damaged merchandized or had to replace it with the new ones. The rules were imposed without the existence of any contract.

**Conclusions**

The sexual division of labor within the work force of Cholistani community was not created by market economy, but it did create a system in which pre-existing gender distinctions were reproduced in the wage labor system. Patterns of male authority at home were also extended to the area of wage labor relations. It manifested itself in the form of access to the urban market centers, contact with outsiders (in this case agents and jobbers from the city) and their perceived role as breadwinner and the head of the household in the eyes of jobbers.
The home-based women workers in Cholistan, like other areas of Pakistan (Shaheed & Mumtaz 1981; Bilquees & Hameed 1988), are the most exploited group of laborers among different labor classes as they belong not only to lowest paid group but are also not regulated by any formal contractual agreement and legislation. The Cholistani women who are the actual producers have been reduced almost to an anonymous mass or marginal mass (Bennholdt-Thomsen 1981) of fragmented labor force that can be tapped whenever the jobbers get orders, but are left to fend for themselves as the number of orders decline or jobbers were able to tap new sources of cheap labor. For Cholistani women, these changes have resulted in their increased responsibilities with no considerable change in men’s attitude and responsibilities, as women continued to perform their domestic duties along with the production for the market, with no help from men in activities related to the reproduction of labor force. There was a tremendous increase in women’s workload, with consequent loss of their support network, and access to economic resources. Research has shown that mobility and access to market facilities has facilitated women’s bargaining position within the household, and will have important significance for exposure to information, development of interactive skills and networks, and opportunities to take independent action. Salway, jesmin & Rahman, (2005) have rightly pointed out that while discussing the relationship between women’s economic contribution and their position in the family, we have to explore the ways in which gender norms are rooted in diverse and robust socio-cultural structures, both within and beyond the household. These socio-cultural norms act to constrain women’s alternatives and reinforce their subservient status regardless of the work they perform. We also need to look at community-level restrictions on when and where women can move about in public in order to have a clear understanding about how these restrictions support intra-household gendered hierarchy. According to Kabeer (1997a) women in South Asia have to lead their lives according to the socio-cultural norms of the society and that they are aware of their reliance on familial networks (for support) and the prevalent customs, norms and values which prescribe that women should behave selflessly, making their own needs secondary to those of the wider family.

I have discussed in detail the impact of various socio-economic changes, including the incorporation of Cholistani pastoral society in the larger national economy, has not only initiated the process of female seclusion but has also transformed relations between men and women in the household. As in other communities (Mies 1982; 1987; Pastner 1972, 1974, 1978), in the Cholistani community too the adoption of purdah and removal of women from labor outside the home is directly associated with the rise in class. For settled Cholistanis, religious ideologies of seclusion and veiling and dominant middle class urban ideology of “women as housewives have worked together with a particular set of productive relations to assure a cheap supply of female labor” (Moore 1988:85) to entrepreneurs in Bahawalpur city. From the above discussion it becomes evident that Cholistani women are not a homogenous group. Cholistani women are differentiated on
the basis of class, rank and education⁶. Therefore, all these above mentioned changes, both in the life and work situation of Cholistani women, take very different forms depending upon their class, age and marital status of women.

End Notes

1. Economic diversification is the adoption of economic activities, by the members of the households, other than maintaining their own herds, including farming, trading, and wage labor. It results in labor shortage for pastoral activities, overuse of natural resource and poor resource management. Social differentiation refers to growing economic inequality between herders and non-herders, and increasing stratification - by class & and by gender--within herding communities. Marginalization is relegation of livestock herding in the areas of low biological productivity, worsening terms of trade between pastoral and non-pastoral produce, and the political & spatial isolation of the herders.


3. Meillassoux was not alone in making this kind of argument as the same argument was also forwarded by Wolpe (1972) and Laclau (1971) for South Africa and Latin America, respectively. The mode of production approach proposed by Meillassoux and others is one set of theories among many others which try to account for capitalism and its affects on the changing world economy like: ‘dependency theory’ (Amin 1974) ‘underdevelopment’ and ‘world system theory (Wallerstein 1974a) to name a few.

4. Here the term “different labor classes” include wage laborers, both male and female, in various informal sectors, agricultural wage laborers, those involved in personal services outside the home, and those who are engaged in petty manufacturing and produce variety of goods.

5. Although men, sometimes fetch water (from the well) and fuel wood for households, but it is usually very rare.

6. The main limitation of the study was the availability of a sample of literate women as there were only five females belonging to the age group of 12-17 years who had primary and secondary level of schooling. Therefore, the effect of education on Cholistani women was not explored in detail.

References


Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2006-07, Govt. of Pakistan.


Folbre, N (1989), ‘Work and Women’s Household: Gender Bias in the US Census,

Grosh, B. & Somolekae, G. (1996), ‘Mighty Oaks from Little Acorns: Can Micro-
enterprises serve as the Seedbed of Industrialization?’ World Development, 24
(12), pp.1879–1890.

Hart, G. (1997), ‘From “Rotten Wives” to “Good Mothers”: Household Models and the


Hassan & Farooq (2015) Gendered Perspective of Informal Sector of the Economy in
Pakistan. Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences. Vol. 9 (1), 185-201

20th June 2017

Horn , Z E (2010)The effects of the global economic crisis on women in the informal
economy: research findings from WIEGO and the Inclusive Cities
partners,Gender & Development,18:2,263-276.DOI:

Horowitz, Michael M. (1981), ‘Research Priorities in Pastoral Studies: An Agenda for the
Future of Pastoral Peoples, Ottawa: International Development Research Center,
pp. 61-88.

Development,’ in M. M Horowitz and T. M Painter, (eds.), Anthropology and


Horowitz, Michael M; and Jowkar, Forouz (1992), Pastoral Women and Change in
Africa, the Middle East, and Central Asia, a report from the Gender Relations of
Pastoral and Agropastoral Production Project for UNIFEM and UNDP, IDA

International Labor Organization (ILO) (2002). Women and Men in the Informal


Moore, Henrieta L (1988), *Feminism and Anthropology*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.


Sandford, Stephen (1983), Management of Pastoral Development in the Third World, Chichester: John Willey and Sons, in association with Overseas Development Institute, London.


____________________

**Dr. Rukhsana Hasan** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Gender Studies, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi.
Educational Barriers For Females: A Case Study Of Karachi

Sadaf Mustafa
Department of Commerce
University of Karachi

M. Sadiq Ali Khan
Department of Computer Science
University of Karachi

Abstract

In the world, many under developing countries are continuously trying to improve their economic growth. Economic growth depends on the quality of education provided in the country throughout the different educational level. Without consideration of gender, it is important to provide equal standard of education for both. In many developed countries. Different genders are treated equally. Education is the important part for both genders of life. But in Pakistan, females are facing many difficulties in getting education. The females’ Education play an important role in building the overall socio-cultural and the human Capital and also bring economic prosperity in the country. In this research paper, authors have examined the different barriers faced by females in education. Sample size of 125 has taken while 113 was respondent. To examine the hypothesis, survey based descriptive analysis technique was used to determine the relation between dependent and independent variables. Analysis showed that females’ education was positively related with the financial status of parents. This Study also proved that parents’ qualification and the Islamic culture are also the main causes in throwing back the females’ education.

Keywords: Education, Early marriage, Illiterate Parents, Financial Crisis, Islamic culture, Gender Inequality, Female.

tlxich

دیا کے بہت سے ترکیب پڑھی مالک اکتشافاتی ترکیب کو نبیتے ہیں کیوں کہ شہریت میں صروف میں۔ اقتصادی ترکیب کے دو دو کل کم فراہم کی جانے والی اطلاعات سے میں کیا ہے۔ اگر فاؤن کے بارے میں فراہم کی جانے والی اطلاعات سے میں کیا ہے۔ اگر فاؤن کے بارے میں فراہم کی جانے والی اطلاعات سے میں کیا ہے۔
Introduction

Education creates the wealth of nation which contributes in different ways in the growth of country in near future. It helps in the achievement of goals of nation through the combine effort of peoples. Education acknowledges the fundamental and social right among the people to give their contribution towards the growth of country. Education for all level gives the mental growth to find the direction of right path towards sustainable growth. Where the education produce the wealth, it also decrease the poverty rate in the country and contribute toward the standardize life style. Education brings new prospect in the depressed sectors to create the positive changes. All of these prosperity, sustainable growth cannot comes in the country by only educated male. It is also necessary to bring the female also in the fold of education is all standard of level. In the 21st century, it is believed that female education increases the child schooling. In spite of this, female also contribute in the GDP (Gross Domestic Product) of the country as well as the Individual’s income. Khaliq et al.(2017),studied the importance of female in the economic Growth it shows us that the female force participation is important in the GDP. Abohamidi and Chidmi (2013),determined the Girl’s education is challenge for the today’s Education is important tool for every female .Education make the female independent and can support her family. Result is that female should get education. Female education’s barriers are commonly seen in the less developed countries. In which, Pakistan is one on them. In Pakistan, different barriers create the issue in the females’ education. Irum and Bhatti(2015), examined that the women problems related to the higher educational institutions in Sindh focus on Sindh because it is populated province. Furthermore, study discuss that the women status in the institutions which are at the higher level. At the end of study concluded that provide the educational facilities for female in the rural areas. Pakistan is one of them countries, which creates the inequality in the educational field between girls and boys. Different social, moral, ethical cultural or demographical factors are the main cause to place the girls behind the wall. The percentage as the education level increase it decline. The quick decline in the rate of literacy towards moving higher education. Khattak, Khattak, and Khan (2012), determined the impact of literate and illiterate father towards the female education in the rural areas. tested the hypothesis by using chi square .In conclusion that both illiterate and literate has significance changed and the majority of them want to get their female education because both literate and illiterate fathers knows the important of education.
Education is very important for everyone not only for female because education is only the tool which can make a personal character for every single individual.

Moreover, education is the right of every human being and specially female should get education if female are educated then the success of the economy cannot be prevent .female have different roles in their life such as mother, sister, daughter, wife .If women is not educated then the whole family is uneducated and on the other side if the women is educated then the whole family is educated .A educated men is only individual educated but not same for women.

Women are facing many problems in getting education in every field of life different reason such as poverty, rural and urban areas and so on. There is no proper schools, colleges and universities in the rural areas so that females are facing many problems due to the economy of Pakistan.

Women education is Asset for Pakistan if the women of the country are educated then the whole nation become educated.

**Literature Review**

Malik (2016), described the problem of female in the education in different aspects determined many constraints of lower literacy of female in Pakistan. These were the constraints such as, religious issues and socio-economic constraints. Female get married one day, Hence, Parents considered it financial loss. Moreover, many constraints had discussed in this paper related to female education such problems are family economic condition, poor security, decision making and domestic violence. In conclusion the impact of low financial income of the family is negatively on female education. Suggested Government provide scholarship and funds to the poor and needy students.co-education system is the main hindrance of female education provides separate educational institutions for females. Give importance to female. Female faces domestic violence at their homes. Give respect them.

Perrino and Lambert (2012), examined the obstacles of public school in Ghana faced by young female students while enrolled. Qualitative interview data and Quantitative survey was based for this research. These main obstacles faced female in education such as, poverty, Harassment and culture mindset. Task of this research is increase the female enrollment and achievement in school in Ghana. Time period for these changes improve. The role of NGOs presented in the research and with the cooperation and hands working of these NGOs. We provide the education enrollment in Ghana private schools. Nath (2008), studied the problem of female school teachers in Kerala. Problems of female employed workers in different sectors. Mostly teachers are female in our society this field
is considered a respectable field for female that is the reason that mostly females are connected with teaching field rather than the other sector like banking, and multinational organizations. In this study described the many problems faced by women in Pakistan are personal familial and professional. The research is based on descriptive research. Identified problems by using tool such as questionnaire. The result of this study shows that female workers not engaged in the teaching field behind it many factors there factors are health, 24 period of work load and so on. Parveen(2008) described the National development by female Education. Determine the importance of education in the National development. In the economic development of any nations is based on the female literacy. Moreover, In Pakistan female faced many problems for getting education. In the final conclusion of this study that the task is to improve the educational status of female in Pakistan.

Shaukat and Pell (2015), faced problems women in higher education in term of social and personal. Data collected from the Government colleges and universities using the 2188 students and teachers’-test, ANOVA and Multiple regression analysis is used for data analysis. Improve the Scio culture and improve educational standards of female education it would bring changing everywhere. Farrulsaqlain(2016), examine in the study that what step we should take for improving girl’s education in Pakistan. Describe the strategies that improve girls’ education in Pakistan. Changes in educational structure are possible when policies and tool have improved. This paper discussed the educational issues of girls related to management. In conclusion that environment of the economy needs improvement for the girl’s education in Pakistan. Improve community participation, simple budget procedure, training for the managers incentives for the teachers and evaluation mechanism and effective monitoring. These all are the main constraints in the education of the female when these constraints have been removed education of female would improve.

Taib (2014), was studying the social factors which affect the female entrepreneur state that the females are the key factor in the development of economic growth in the country. Country cannot progress forward until it consider females part in it. Sonowal (2013), was studying that female belongs to village are not educated. They are not educated in economics science sociology etc. they are not getting the proper facilities of education and are unaware about basic communication skills. Dominic (2011) was studying the Kerala society and found that the education is the main determinant which brings the transformation in the society. She was considering the Indian culture under her investigation. Naeem and Dahar (2016), was consider the 120 females and find that the co-education is the factor which create the hurdles in females education. Irum, Bhatti and Munshi (2015), studying the barriers faced by females in province of Sindh. By help of chi square, they found that discouragement and harassment are the two hot burning factors which demotivate female in getting the high education. Penney, Brown and
Oliveria, (2007), were found that females in education provide the tools of information to get in their field wither students or professor. Maqsood, Maqsood, and Raza, (2012), during their study conclude that the gender inequality is the cause of low rate of females, education. They define the Islamic culture is the second barrier due to which females have to convince their parents for high education. Naz, Daraz, Khan and Sheikh (2013), examined the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and found that the infrastructure and the basic facilities are not provided to females, unfortunately which made cause in the low rate of female’s education. U, R & V (2017), examined the determinants of female education. During the research they found that the domestic responsibilities and problems, skills and cultural factors are the main barriers in females’ education.

Odomore (2015), studied that the challenges faced by men for education in the developing world and international effort. For obtaining education female faced many problems around the world and many studies show us the benefits of women education in the development of any economy. Furthermore discussed about the developing countries namely Pakistan, Nigeria, China, South Africa and Nepal these are the countries which shows us the cross section of developing countries. Moreover, different other problems are hurdle in the female education such as poverty, menstruation, child marriage and war conflicts etc. Welfare organizations are also working for the female education ratio increment. Karikari (2008), discussed that the female experience in the Higher education and study of female administrator and faculty of selected universities in Ghana and the next point which focus in this study is the imbalance of gender inequality in the higher education and higher education enhanced the status of female. Research finding shows that the both Administrator and women faculty were underrepresented highly. The mostly women’s faced many problems during their jobs at higher education level these problems are caring of child as a mother, interrupted careers and lack of mentoring. Murthly (2017), determined that the issue of contemplation and immense discussions over the last few decades world-wide due to the women empowerment. In government plans and programs women education is the top most issue. Moreover, in the economy of Pakistan women are also important as man. nation’s overall progress is possible when the women performed better for economy. Political, economic and social progress of a country is not possible without the educated female progress of the country is stagnated without the educated women in any country success of every single individual house and the success of any country depends on the educated women. Furthermore, women’s were not only for home chores and not only for caring of children. Thought of the people was that women can also perform home chores but if the women’s get higher education then female can change this world and this study concluded that female education is very important in every field of life even for home chores. Kysilka and Burstyn (1973), studied about the history related to women education and many articles had been published about the topic related to women education in our society. The main title of the different journals had been the women education and these issues of
the article were discussed about the problems of the women education and the source material assume the first problem solving for any education. Suleman, Hussain, Butt, and Ahmad (2012), determined that identification of problem faced by school teachers of secondary in Kohat Division. This study also focused all the male and female teachers of secondary school teachers because compared the problems of female by male in Kohat Division. Sample had been taken 120 Female and 160 male for this study which was randomly selected by using simple random sampling techniques. Data had been collected by personal visit. T-test was used for data analysis. Result of the study showed us that female secondary school teachers were faced many problem and such problems are lack of basic facilities, unattractive pay package and overcrowded classes. Omariji and Omofonmwan (2005), studied about the problem, prospects and its Effects of Women. Education on National Development in Nigeria. It examined the real meaning of education. Bartman (2015), examined the issue and support strategies of Women education. However, Role of American and African Women in the Higher education. Okorie, (2013), studied about the education realize and claims the rights of men and Women. Education is the only way to lift people out of poverty. Nair (2010), examined that Women’s access to education in India due to its issue of Women’s. Different strategies used for the better level of education for women. Initiatives had been provided for the Women education. Improving policy used for education of Women in India. S and S (2007), examined the Indian Women Barriers to the leadership position in the dentistry of academic. Indian Women had been increased their progress during the last 50 years.

Now a day’s world had been become a globalization when the Health care professions were occupied by male and Women had been used for homes chores and looked down upon as anomalies. Shetty and Hans (2015), this study had been started from the quotation of Nehru. If men are educated that men education is limited to individual but if both men and women are educated then the whole family is educated. Mothers are very important for every child and women contribution is necessary in the empowered human development is caused due to the input and output of education. Further women literacy rate in 2011 census which was female literacy rate is 65.46% while the male literacy rate is over 80%. Maqsood, Maqsood and Raza (2012), determined in the study that for getting higher education female faced many problems is it reality? Then they proved it in the study and the result showed us that Is it right Female had been faced many challenges for getting higher education. Shafique, Anwar and Akbar (2010), examined that the problems encountered by women in education sector. Development of any economy education is crucial and the main purpose of this paper is to identify the problems faced by working women in educational sector. This study discovered that the mostly families specially parents supports their daughters for their education. Married womens had been faced many problems as compared to the unmarried women for education it had been proved by survey. Conclusion of this paper had been the women education of Bahawalpur is fairly good. Madara, and Cherotich (2016), studied that in the Engineering – Education problem
faced by Females it had been universal phenomenon that the gender-related challenges in learning technical courses. For achieving fullest potential female students had been faced restrained challenges. The main purpose of this study was to identify the problems faced by Female in getting Engineering – Education. In this study Both Qualitative and Quantitative methods had been applied. 20 questionnaire had been developed for undergraduate female student of SOE, MU. The result of this study had been concluded that there was many barriers for Female education getting their education related to SOE. Bowl (2001), experienced barriers for non-traditional students entering higher education. The keyword had been used access, higher education, participation and non-traditional students.

**Research Objectives**

The key objective for this study is to determine the main issues related to the females’ education especially in Karachi. As the education has equal common importance for both male and female for high productivity and the growth of country. Following are the particulars,

i. To find out barriers for females in education field.

ii. To determine the parents perspective about females’ education.

iii. To find out females interest towards education higher education.

**Research Hypotheses**

\( H_0 \): There is no relation between getting females’ education and poverty.

\( H_1 \): There is a positive relation between getting females’ education and poverty.

\( H_2 \): There is a positive relationship between females’ education and parent’s qualification.

\( H_3 \): There is an appositive relationship between females’ education and Islamic culture.

\( H_4 \): Females’ education and the gender inequality are positively related.

**Methodology**

i. **Research Design:**

For the purpose of analyzing the hypothesis, Descriptive survey method is used to find out the barriers in females’ education. The descriptive survey deals with systematic description of an event in a very factual and accurate manner.

ii. **The Study Area:**

This study is done in Karachi. It is one of the most important cities of Pakistan. Karachi has the population 16.051 million in which 47.41% are females. These females are belongs to different age groups. Karachi is one of the
biggest cities of Pakistan. Karachi is vital to Pakistan’s economy, contributing 42% of GDP, 70% of income tax revenue and 62% of sales tax revenue.

iii. **Sampling Techniques and Sample Size:**
First, stratified sampling is applied. 6 Strata are formed on the basis of district. There are 6 districts in Karachi but, in this study we consider 5 districts. Central, East, West, North and South district. In these districts different demographic characteristics are present. Random sampling technique is applied to collect the desire data from the females in each district. The sample size is 25 from each district. Total sample size is 125. But 113 peoples respond.

iv. **Research Instrument:**
To collect the data for this research paper, questionnaire has developed. This questionnaire has consisted 10 questions which helps to collect the data for the paper.

v. **Method of Data Analysis**
For the pool data analysis, Descriptive statistical tool will be applied for analyzing the data. Frequency table and mean are used for descriptive statistics.

vi. **Research Instrument:**
In this research, females’ education is the dependent variable and parents’’ education, poverty, Islamic culture and gender inequality are independent variable. For this purpose, a questioner consists of 10 questions was developed and the data was collected from the females of each strata.

**Result and Discussion**

Sample size of 25 is drawn. But the magnitude of responded are different in different Strata (District). 100% response are getting from the central district.

![Respondents of Each District](image-url)
In each district, qualifications of respondents are different which impacts on the result. The qualifications of respondent are shown by following chart.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 02: Respondents Qualifications

Out of 113 respondents, there are 67 females and 46 males.
Educational Barriers for Females: A Case Study of Karachi

Figure 03: Percentage of Gender Respondent

Table 02: Filled Questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire</th>
<th>strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neither agree nor disagree</th>
<th>disagree</th>
<th>strongly disagree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early marriage often means the end to a females formal education</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>2.504425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate parents are the cause of blackness in female education</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>2.132743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female faced education problems due to their financial crisis</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2.097345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Culture do not allow Female to get co-educational environment</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>2.336283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The main important reason of scarcity in female education is gender inequality</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>2.539823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mostly parents allow their son to get higher education as compare to daughter</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>2.513274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The main constraints in the female education is expensive education in private institutions</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>2.920354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education is important for every female</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1.424779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The economic development of any country also depends on female education</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>2.982301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Environment in the Rural areas is better as compare to Urban areas for Female</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1.946903</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Questioner was developed on Likert scale of five-point answers. The options for respondent are i. strongly agree, ii. Agree iii. Neither agree nor disagree IV. Disagree v. Strongly disagree.
Result of Question # 1

The first question is very important in relation to Pakistani culture. Where it is supposed to marry a female very early in life when she was studied. It is commonly observed that females get married around the age of 18 to 25. This is the age when she got high studies but marriage dropped her education in mid-level. From the survey 35% respondent are agreed that early marriage is the main factor which make cause in low education in female. 25% are agreeing with this issue. While 17% are disagree.

Result of Question # 2

Illiterate parents are also the main reason which creates the barrier in females’ education. From the survey, 41% respondent are agree that the parent’s qualification is main constrain which create huddles in females education. Very low percentage of respondent is agreed that the parent’s qualification is not depends on daughters or sisters education. Result accept the hypothesis number 2.
Result of Question # 3

Pakistan is the country where per capita income is Rs 1181.6. This capita income is below the average. This low capita income creates the problems for parents in providing the education especially for females. The 44% respondent agree with this phenomenon that financial crisis is also a main constrain in providing education to female. This result reject the null hypothesis and accept the hypothesis number 1. In which, females’ education is positively related with financial position of parents.

![Question # 3](image)

Figure 06: Question # 03

Result of Question # 4

Pakistan is an Islamic country. Where Islamic culture is promoted. Due to this culture, people assumed that the females’ education is not mainly compulsory. Only very initial education is required. From the survey, 36% respondent agree that the Islamic culture is main barrier in educational field for females. Only 6% respondent strongly disagree from this phenomenon. Result accept the hypothesis number 3.
Result of Question # 5

27% are strongly agreed and 28% are agreeing that, there is an inequality between male and female. Parents preferred males to provide high education as compare to female. But 22% respondent are not agreeing either positive or negative relation of inequality. The result accept the hypothesis number 4.

Result of Question # 6

This pie chart show that that 36% are strongly agree that the parents support their sons to get higher education as compare to the daughters.19% are agree, 17% are neither agree
nor disagree and 16% are disagree. However, the mostly high percentage show us the result that the parents want to get their son higher education as compare to daughter.

**Result of Question # 7**

As shown in the chart that expensive education is main constraints in female education. Hence, 22% are strongly agree, 13% are agree 27% are neither agree nor disagree and 27% are strongly disagree it means that it may be that the expensive education is caused of lackness in female education and it may not. Because it depends on income class level high income class family can effort and vice versa.
Result of Question # 8

This question is very important that education is very important for female and the respondents are 73% strongly agree that education is important for female and only 3% are disagree from this.

![Question # 8](image1.png)

Figure 11: Question # 08

Result of Question # 9

Economic development of every country depends only different factors and the one factor is female education. It cannot said that the only the female education depends on economic development. The information shown in this pie chart is 18% are strongly agree from this and 18% are disagree from this but the greater percentage is 27% which is neither agree nor disagree so that answer has variation between agree and disagree.

![Question # 9](image2.png)

Figure 12: Question # 09
Result of Question # 10

The question is educational environment for female in rural and urban where the institutions are available and facilities are provided for female and this pie chart shown us that 24% are strongly agree that the educational environment in rural is better and only 18% are strongly disagree which means that the pie chart and the respondents support this question and strongly agree from this.

![Pie Chart](image)

Figure 13: Question # 10

Conclusions

This study examined the different aspect in getting the education of females. Result showed that five major factors were there which created the barriers for females’ education. These five main constrain were financial crisis, early marriages of females, gender inequality, Islamic culture and poverty in this study, It was concluded that the economic growth bring fertility in the country. For this economic growth, it is necessary to provide high quality of education to each gender (male and female). It is only possible when to resolve the barriers in getting education for females and consider them equal to men. It is necessary to increase the enrollment of females in different standard of education and gives equal chance in every walk of life. This opportunity increases the stability in growth of country. Form the study it was also concluded that basically the education is the basic right of every Women. As it was observed that the individual conclusion that the ratio of female education for getting is low with respect to different factors. Descriptive statistics had been used for this study and with the help of the pie-chart analysis had been presented and each pie-chart represented each question.
Questionnaire had been developed for the research with 10 Likert scale questions. All five constraints had been discussed in the questionnaire.

**Recommendation**

The following points were identified as recommendations for improve the situation of Female education.

1. Awareness programs for the developing of local community could religious leaders of all the religion and Rural areas specially focused.
2. Social movement and other rally or activities should be arrange for early marriage and stopped by social awareness. Administrator and local government could focus on early marriages. Different programs should be arranged with the local representative and educational institutions.
3. Financial supports for internship and for technical courses should be increased for girls it can reduce economic crisis in school and also in family which could decrease social obstacles and also decrease girl’s dropout rate.

**References**


______________

Dr. Sadaf Mustafa is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Commerce, University of Karachi.

Dr. M. Sadiq Ali Khan is Chairman and Associate Professor in the Department of Computer Science, University of Karachi.
Socio-Cultural Constraints To Women's Participation In Rural Support Programs In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

Sajjad Hussain
Department of Social Work
University of Malakand

Basharat Hussain
Department of Criminology
University of Peshawar

Abstract

The current paper aims to inquire about the socio-cultural constraints to women’s participation in National Rural Support Program (NRSP) operating in four districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa namelyCharsada, Mardan, Nowshera and Sawabi. Such restrictions to women participation in the Project Cycle i.e. formation of women community organization, needs assessment, planning, implementation and evaluation process in NRSP projects have been identified through collection of data from staff members of NRSP and president/manager and ordinary members of women community organizations through convenient sampling procedure through in-depth interviewing. The information obtained has been analyzed qualitatively under themes. The results show that NRSP carries out various physical infrastructure schemes through women community organizations (WCOs). The study concludes that NRSP staff members mobilize WCOs through social mobilization and social organization process; but there are various socio-cultural practices, which do not allow women to participate in developmental process. The study also identifies that these socio-cultural constraints include male domination, Purdah (veil), conventional leaders and target oriented approach of NRSP. The study suggest that for sustainability of NRSP, widespread activities of gender equality is important to overcome these constraints.

Keywords: Pakistan, Gender, Cultural Constraints, Participation, Sustainability.

tلتخص

یہ مطالعہ بہار سے مردن، نوشرہ اور صراع میں جاری کیا جاتا ہے اور یہ مل کر سے مضامین ان ساتھ اور تبہی کے کال کا اس کے کراچی کے کوئی اس کے کے کوئی کر گا کر کہ گا کر کے اس کے کے کر کے کر کے کر کے کی
Introduction

Women are the essential component of society and there is increasing recognition that the goal of sustainable development cannot be realized until and unless women are involved in the development process (Khan, 2006). Women constitute half of the population of Pakistan and during the last few years, women participation in various spheres of life has increased considerably (Ram, et al. 2011). Developmental programs which do not involve women in the decision making, planning, execution and monitoring will remain unsustainable (Idrees, et al., 2008). Research studies reveal that when women were provided opportunities, they setup thousands of vibrant organizations for influencing the decision makers and planners at the national and international levels (Khan, 2006). In the developed countries like USA, Germany and UK, women have been given equal opportunities and are equal partners for achieving the goal of sustainable development (UNIFEM, 2006). Pakistani women are in disadvantageous position as compared to women in other developing nations of the region. Rural women in Pakistan lack access to basic facilities like education, health and limited role in the decision-making process. Government and Non-Governmental Organizations are striving for meaningful participation of women in the developmental process (Bari, 2000).

Now a days, the Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) are being considered an essential component of society. These NGOs and INOGs are working for tangible and intangible development (Lewis & Kanji, 2009). The weak performance of governmental institutions led to the emergence of NGOs to help people and communities in need. Such organizations work for the development of vulnerable and oppressed groups, ignored by...
governmental organizations. These NGOs got impetus when they were encouraged by the IMF and World Bank to take part in the national development efforts (Miltin, Hickey, & Bebbington, 2006).

NGOs have been given different names in different times like “major group; pressure group; interest group; private voluntary organization; independent voluntary sector; third sector organization (TSOs)” (Martens, 2002:278). According to The John Hopkins, Non-profit Sector Research Project for Pakistan, NGOs/ NPOs are those organizations that are independent from the government, voluntary in nature; manage their affairs without any external influence and where membership is not obligatory (Ghaus-Pasha, Jamal, & Iqbal 2002). Similarly, Salamon & Anheier (1992) have defined NGOs as those private, independent organizations striving for the lessening of socio-economic miseries of weaker sections of society. NGOs also work for the protection of human rights, promoting education, health, human rights and promotion of democratic culture in the society. Non-governmental organizations were present since time unknown in different shapes and were named in Pakistan as ‘Welfare Organizations, Voluntary Organizations, Missionary Organizations, Falahi Idare, Jirga, Panchayat, Not-For-Profit Organizations’ etc. (Hasan, & Junejo, 1999).

Charitable or philanthropic activities were started in the Indian sub-continent before partition (Pasha, Jafarey and Lohano, 2000). The main purpose of these welfare activities was to assist the government in delivery of social services like education, health, social welfare and cultural activities (Iqbal, Khan & Javed, 2004). Though Indian society was diverse in nature having Muslims, Hindus and Parsis, however, following their religious beliefs, they contributed voluntarily to help the needy and poor in their respective communities. Muslim philanthropists however, strictly follow Islamic way of teaching to help people in need (Saljuq, 2005). Sir Sayed Ahmad Khan in 1870 setup “Committee for the Better Diffusion and Advancement of Learning among Muhammadans of India’ for bringing the Muslims in to the main stream of development. After five years in 1875, he founded “Muhammadan Anglo Oriental College (MAO)”. Later on MAO college became a full fledge University in 1922 and played a leading role in the independence movement (Belmekki, 2009).

Meanwhile, followers of Sir Sayed Ahmed Khan continued his mission in the West Pakistan (areas that are now part of Pakistan) and established Sindh Madrasa-tul-Islam in Karachi, Anjuman-e-Himayat-e-Islam, Lahore and Islamia College, Peshawar (Iqbal, Khan & Javed, 2004). At the same time, non-muslims also took part in welfare activities and established schools and hospitals for assisting the poor and weaker section of society (PRIA, 2001). Due to their concerted efforts, ‘Edwarde Church Mission School of Peshawar (1855)’, ‘Jesus and Mary Convent of Sialkot’ (1858) and ‘St. Joseph’s Convent of Karachi’ were established which provided educational services to large portions of
society. These institutions primarily stressed on assisting the poor people by establishing hospitals, dispensaries, orphanages, infirmaries and seminaries. They continued their welfare efforts in post partition era of Indo Pak (Gopal, 1994). In order to streamline the activities related to religious endowments trust, laws were framed such as ‘Societies Registration Act in 1860’, followed by ‘Religions Endowment Act 1863’, the ‘Trust Act, 1882’ and the Credit Societies Act,1904’ (Saljuq, 2005).

Literature Review

Historical Background of NGOs in Pakistan

Since 1947, the newly established state of Pakistan was passing through a difficult time due to various socio-economic problems. At that time, the voluntary sector helped the administration of newly established state in re-settling refugees, provision of health, education, poverty and unemployment issues (Bano, 2007).

There has been tremendous increase in the number of NGOs during 1980s due to many reasons but two of them are worthy to mention. First, due to Washington Census and its impact on economic liberalization and democratization, there has been tremendous increase in funding to NGOs which gave an impetus to NGOs operating in third world countries (Barrow & Jennings, 2001). Secondly, this model considered state as incapable, run on bureaucratic lines, while NGOs were known for their efficiency, cost effectiveness, accessibility and empowerment of the masses especially women (Dahan, Doh & Guay, 2006). As a result, such NGOs were considered as an alternate to government departments and their role was recognized as ‘indigenous people’s organizations’ particularly during and after the 1980s (Bagci, 2007). However, NGOs struggling towards welfare and relief operations turned to participatory development approach. As a result, the government of Pakistan also changed her policy towards NGOs and were given opportunities to work for the up-lift of marginalized section of society including women. NGOs were included in Social Action Program (SAP) which was component of the Eight Five Year Plan (SPDC, 2002). The government initiated Social Action Program on participatory development approach as joint venture of public private sector represented by NGOs and the target community. The government launched Rural Support Programs (RSPs) – adopting participatory approach – at national and provincial levels. In the establishment of these RSPs, the government followed precedents of Agha Khan Rural Support Program model, based in Northern Areas of Pakistan (Rural Support Program Network, 2010). The primary aim of RSPs was improvement in the socio-economic conditions through self-help initiatives. The National Rural Support Program (NRSP) holds largest space among all RSPs, with the goal of empowering people by community organization and mobilization of their resources to improve their socio-economic conditions (Mustafa, et al. 2000).
National Rural Support Program (NRSP)

National Rural Support Program (NRSP) was setup in 1991 by the government of Pakistan for extending help to government in service delivery using participatory development approach (Landmann & Frölich, 2013). NRSP aimed at socio-economic uplift of the weaker sections of society, organizing communities through self-help initiatives leading the people towards sustained development (NRSP, 2015). On the basis of participatory development approach, it has set up a network of men community organizations (MCOs) and women community organizations (WCOs) for initiating developmental activities with the active participation of target communities funded by national and international donor organizations (Rural Support Program Network, 2010).

The aim of NRSP is to reduce poverty and improve the living standard of rural people through employment generation. According to the Summary of achievements as of March, 2014, ‘NRSP has formed 75,338 men community organizations, 75,257 women organizations and 10,175 mix organizations’ (NRSP, 2014:3). NRSP activities includes programs in human-resource development, rural credit and enterprise development, natural-resource management, physical infrastructure, social-sector services and gender and development" (World Bank, 2007:4).

NRSP’s Gender Mainstreaming Policy

Gender, according to NRSP, should be a part of all policy making, that is, in planning, execution and assessment of all development activities. NRSP is also of the view that till the hurdles that block women participation in development process are not removed, sustainable development cannot be achieved (NRSP Institute of Rural Management, 2010). NRSP encourages women to form their own community organizations to actively initiate developmental activities on their own. To make it sure, women of the targeted communities are trained in necessary skills to operate their organizations with or without the help of men. NRSP’s gender mainstreaming policy aims to address the causes of underdevelopment of rural people and ensuring sustainable development. In addition, this policy also emphasizes inclusion of gender equality project cycle i.e. decision making, planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of developmental interventions (NRSP, 2012).

Argument of the Study

Women – as an important section of the society – constitute half of the world population (Rahman & Naoroze, 2007). Women can play an important role in the development of society if they are provided equal opportunities in all fields of life. Women in patriarchal societies including South Asia have limited say in decision making and cannot enjoy a
status in the society like their men counterparts (Hora, 2014). Cultural values and practices do not allow women to take part in the development of their society. In addition, patriarchal structure and male dominancy has kept the role of women limited to household activities and have deprived them of access to economic resources and decision making (Jehan, 2000). Rural women of Pakistan face societal pressures while taking part in the development process. Thus, Pakistan’s performance in Human Development Index 2013 is not satisfactory and is ranked at 46 out of 187 countries. Further, the country has also failed to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) targets on education, health, human rights, employment and gender equality (UNDP, 2014). It is now admitted that goals of sustainable development cannot be realized until and unless women are involved in the development process. In this regard, Kofi Annan (Secretary General of the United Nations) stated that “realizing our goals while discriminating against half of the human population is almost impossible” (DFID, 2007, p.1.). Although women constitute half of the total population of Pakistan, yet they are deprived of equal opportunities to participate in national development (Ali, Ahmad & Batool, 2016). Pakistani women like other spheres of life, are also being excluded in development sectors including social services. Their participation in projects being run for their development is ambiguous due to cultural norms and rigid patriarchal structure of the society (Hassan & Azman, 2014).

The paper aims to explore the role of Women Community Organization in participatory development approach used in NRSP interventions in four districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa namely Charsada, Nowshehra, Mardan and Sawabi. The purpose was to know whether women participate in the Project Cycle i.e. formation of women community organization, needs appraisal, planning, execution and evaluation process in NRSP Projects. The paper attempts to examine the socio-cultural factors i.e. patriarchal structure, traditional leaders, Purdah (veil), misinterpretation of religion, extremism and male dominancy that inhibit women’s participation in NRSP interventions.

**Major Objectives of the Study**

- To explore the role of Women Community Organization in participatory development programs
- To know the level of women participation in the Project Cycle
- To examine the socio-cultural factors obstructing women’s participation in NRSP interventions

**Methodology of the Study**

As detail information was required therefore the area was stratified into 04 wards (districts) where a total of 134 women community organizations were working in the
mentioned districts. Among the total WCOs, 05% from each of the stratum was selected through convenience sampling technique that constituted 07 female organizations where 02 members (One President/General Secretary and one member from the general body) from each organization were selected. This constituted a total of 14 sample size from WCOs. Likewise, 10 staff members from each district of NRSP – both from the regional office as well as the field offices – were included. Among the regional office staff; regional program officer, head social organization section, manger monitoring and evaluation section, human resource development section, gender and development section and head engineering section were included. From the field offices in each district; district program manager, senior social organizers, social organizers both male and female, field engineers and credit officers were interviewed in this study. The sampling frame has been given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women’s Organization</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>5% sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nowshehra</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sawabi</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mardan</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charsadda</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>134</strong></td>
<td><strong>07</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Theoretical Framework**

The study utilizes the Gender and Development Theory which was introduced during 1990s in the United Kingdom because of the shortcomings of Women in Development (WID) and Women and Development (WAD) approach (Pieterse, 2010). Contrary to the WID approach – that focus women only, the GAD approach takes the role of both men and women into account (Baden and Reeves, 2000). Furthermore, GAD approach considers women not merely the recipient of charity, rather as agent of change (Monsen, 2010). GAD Theory stresses on balance gender relations in all fields of life, making structural transformation to ensure social justice and provide equal opportunities to all segments of society irrespective of their bio-physical being (Hussain, et al.2016). In the same way, participatory approach emphasizes that equal opportunities should be provided to both genders in the process of decision making, i.e., planning, implementation and monitoring of the developmental activities. In other words, both GAD and participatory approach believes in self-sufficiency, and participation of all recipients in the process of development at the grassroots level (Ali, 2005).
Data Analysis, Results and Discussion

Project Cycle

Formation of Women Community Organizations (WCOs)

Formation of Women Community Organizations depended on the social mobilization process carried out by NRSP staff and the cultural conditions of the target community. In District Sawabi and Nowshera, women participated in the project cycle with the prior permission of their husband or male head of the house, while in District Charsada and Mardan formulation of women community organization was very difficult due to cultural condition i.e. Purdah (Veil) and threat of militancy. For formation of WCO, the female social organizer visited the community and informed women about the aims and objectives of NRSP and their role in the development of their community. They informed the local women about the need and importance of community organizations and motivated them to form their own organization for taking part in the development of their community. Furthermore, through WCO, they could raise their voices for addressing the needs of their communities. As these women could not purchase the material required for developmental activities, therefore they asked the member of the male community organization for purchasing necessary items for the developmental schemes.

In this regard, views of the staff member were recorded accordingly where one staff member expressed:

The female social organizer approaches community to form WCO. While a male social organizer approaches the influential members in the targeted area like Malak, Khan, Imam or MPA/MNA etc., to avoid problems in interventions at local level (Female Social Organizer Sawabi).

In NRSP targeted area, women were mostly involved in household responsibilities like taking care of children, cooking, cleaning and caring for the cattle. However, there was one exception in District Sawabi where an aged woman formed WCO, and initiated a small shop with the small credit of NRSP. She started an embroidery centre where she trained the local poor women in embroidery skills. The formation of men and women community organizations started at the same time.

President of WCO stated about the formation of WCO, that:

The NRSP staff visited our Hujra to meet people of the village, and female social organizer and community resource persons (CRPs) visited our house. The FSO informed the women – gathered inside our house – about the aims of NRSP and significance of their participation in the
development activities. The people were also made aware of the importance and need to form women community organizations. Consequently, WCO was made, with a president and manager elected (President WCO Nowshehra).

**Women's Participation in Needs Identification**

The Female Social Organizer (FSO) visited the target area and met the local women to know about their needs. The women themselves listed their problems using participatory approach and prioritized problem which was the need of majority of the people in general and women in particular. The women then handed over the prioritized list to the female social organizer for onwards processing.

As one of the female social organizers commented that:

> The female in the village had lot of problems, but I told them to select only one of the many problems that is faced by the majority of the women of the village (Female Social Organizer Charsada).

Needs assessment was carried out by members of WCO and MCO as the men also knew the problems confronted by the local women. A staff member expressed that women members list the needs and select one schemes on priority basis. Another staff member held that:

> The needs are communicated by the WCO to female social organizer in form of resolution. The female SO, after examining its social feasibility, forwards the resolution to field engineers to check its technical feasibility. Then field engineer visits site/field and finally, the scheme goes for approval to regional and head offices respectively (Field Engineer Sawabi).

The people were requested to name and prioritize their important needs, through a multi-sectoral plan developed by NSRP staff. If meeting the needs is beyond NRSP resources, then as alternate, the NRSP staff informs them about other available options in which WCO is requested to identify needs.

As far as women participation in need assessment was concerned, it varied from district to district and was subject to the customs, traditions and normative order of the target community. The cultural condition was suitable for women participation in two districts namely Sawabi and Nowshehra, while in Charsada and Mardan women could not participate in needs identification.

The WCO manager informed that:
We have worked out a democratic process to identify needs and normally, consent from two-thirds majority is required to decide a scheme. Shortage of clean drinking water was identified by WCO in meeting and subsequently, they proposed the scheme through a majority resolution. As a consequence, NRSP executed a hand pump scheme that was started, and carried out by WCO on their own with 20% contribution in cash (Manager WCO Mardan).

The members of WCO also involved members of male community organization (MCO) in needs identification in order to avoid duplication of physical infrastructure schemes. In addition, the women could not personally visit the NRSP office for fulfilling official formalities and documentation; therefore they discussed their proposed schemes with office bearers of MCO for necessary assistance.

**Women's Participation in Planning**

Planning is an important step in development process. In NRSP interventions, planning in women organizations is carried out by the WCO members themselves while the role of staff is just to guide them in the whole process. As part of the Village Development Plan, the NRSP staff asked the local women about their needs.

A staff member of NRSP stated in this connection:

> The women plan schemes according to their own distinctive priorities and needs (Female Social Organizer Mardan).

Contrary to the above statement, an office bearer of the WCO stated that due to male dominancy and other cultural barriers, women could not participate directly in planning process; rather the members of male community organization helped the WCO in identification of place for the physical infrastructure scheme.

A manager of WCO mentioned that:

> At the time of forming a committee, a member of MCO was included who undertook all the activities that the WCO members couldn’t perform due to social restrictions. He helped engineers to locate the site for hand pump scheme (Member WCO Nowshehra).

Conversely, a president of one WCO personally facilitated the engineers in selection of the site for physical infrastructure scheme. The president informed that:

> I helped the engineers and the social organizers in choosing the location for watercourses scheme (President WCO, Sawabi).
Women's Participation in Implementation

Implementation of the physical infrastructure scheme is an important step in the project cycle but the women of the target area implemented the schemes with the help of office bearers of the MCO or the male members of their families. The WCO nominated two of the office bearers from the MCO for audit and works committees while the engineers also paid visits to the schemes for checking the quantity and quality of the material used.

A staff member explained that:

The WCO implemented the scheme on their own; but for on the site supervision, the members of MCO were asked to supervise the scheme as the cultural conditions did not allow women to go outside for regularly overseeing the progress (Female Social Organizer Mardan).

Regarding the role of women in the development of local area, a staff member mentioned that:

As a dire need of the people in the mohallah, the WCO launched a hand pump scheme. The MCO president helped WCO in material purchase, implementation and supervision of the scheme (Senior Social Organizer Mardan).

Regarding implementation of the scheme, an office bearer of WCO held that:

The WCO executed the scheme with help from MCO members. Committees were formed to operate and maintain the scheme, and also help the staff to implement and monitor the current schemes (Member, WCO Mardan).

Interestingly, one WCO president executed her entire scheme herself. She explained that:

I carried out two schemes myself. I bought material, executed and monitored water supply and watercourses schemes in the village. Nevertheless, the MCO members also helped me to get material from the local market (Manager WCO Sawabi).

Women's Participation in Monitoring and Evaluation

Women community organization nominated two members of MCO for monitoring the ongoing developmental activity as women could not perform this task. Then members of MCO purchased construction material and supervised the scheme for ensuring quality and quantity.
President of WCO held in this regard:

Since we could not supervise the current schemes by our own, we picked out two MCO members to overlook the complete progress of the scheme (President, WCO Nowshera).

Although the women community organization members carried out monitoring through MCO on regular basis, but evaluation was carried out by the staff members of monitoring and evaluation department as well as the donors. In addition, NRSP also kept three percent of the CO share for ensuring timely maintenance and then released it if maintenance was not required.

Conclusions

The study on the basis of findings concludes that NRSP is a government sponsored participatory development NGO, working mainly for provision of services to the people at the grassroots level. NRSP mobilizes the target beneficiaries including women for meaningful participation in the project cycle, but there are some socio-cultural constraints which do not allow women to take part in the project cycle. Those factors are patriarchal structure, male dominated society, traditional leaders, political interference, misinterpretation of religion, religious extremism and Purdah (veil). In addition, donor’s pressure compelled the NRSP staff to achieve the targets in specific time at the cost of participatory development strategy. Besides that the local political leaders used these WCOs for getting schemes from NRSP merely for strengthening their hold in the area.

In such a situation it is difficult for NRSP staff to give enough time for mobilization of women of the target communities for taking part in developmental interventions. Such factors contributed towards the failure of participatory development strategy in NRSP interventions in the target area and the developmental activities remained unsustainable.

Recommendations

The study recommends that as participation is indigenous in nature, therefore people should be encouraged and meaningfully involved at all the stages of the project cycle. While launching any intervention in the target area the NRSP management at the field offices should take all the stakeholders onboard including elected members of local bodies’ so that they may cooperate with the NRSP staff at the time of implementation of schemes.

In addition, NRSP should adopt a process oriented approach instead of target based/oriented approach. In this way, NRSP staff will be able to meaningfully involve women in the project cycle. Furthermore, NRSP staff should give sufficient time to the
social mobilization and social organization process so that the women organization can get mature for achieving sustained results.

Before launching a developmental intervention, NRSP should organize a broad-based community meeting at the village level and brief all the beneficiaries about the aim and objectives of the project to be launched.

The study also recommends that NRSP staff should train the women community organizations in office management, record keeping, maintaining cash book and operating of machines like computers etc so that they can run their organization in the best way. In addition NRSP management should also arrange exposure and excursion visits for the members of WCOs so that they can learn new ideas for initiating new projects in their localities.

References


Iqbal, M. A., Khan, H. & Javed, S. (2004). *Nonprofit Sector in Pakistan: Historical background*. Social Policy and Development Centre, in collaboration with Aga Khan Foundation (Pakistan) and Center for Civil Society, Johns Hopkins University, USA.


Sajjad Hussain is Lecturer in the Department of Social Work, University of Malakand.

Prof. Dr. Basharat Hussain is Chairman in the Department of Criminology, University of Peshawar.
Cultural Constraints To Female Higher Education In Malakand Division, Pakistan

Sameer Ul Khaliq Jan
Department of Social Work,
Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University

Ahmad Ali
Department of Sociology
Abdul Wali Khan University

Muhammad Niqab
Department of Education
Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University

Abstract

The current study was aimed to analyze the Pakhtun cultural constraints in the way of female higher education. For this purpose, the data was collected through a survey instrument by snowball sampling and selected 384 respondents from Malakand division, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. The collected data were analyzed through SPSS. A Chi-Square test was applied in order to find out the association between independent (Pakhtun culture) and a dependent variable (low female higher education). The results show that there is a high and significant relationship between the low ratio of female higher education and sub-dimensions of Pakhtun culture i.e. early puberty, conservatism, Pardah, home related factors, Son preference, male dominancy, lack of freedom of expression for female, early/child marriage, non-involvement of female in decision making, spending money of parents but benefits goes to husband family, non-acceptance of co-education, living in hostel of female and cultural interpretation of religion are various risk factors for low female higher education in Pakhtun society. The study recommends that the government should focus on women education, create awareness regarding female education and provide better educational facilities and incentives for women. Besides, more employment opportunities should be created to enhance female higher education.

Keywords: Pakhtun Culture, Female Higher Education, Male Dominancy, Pardah.

تلخيص

هندسهی وماکائیک در قلمرو نژادی ها که در ایران وجود دارند، به‌روش‌های تاریخی، زبانی، فرهنگی و اجتماعی برای مهار و پیش‌بینی آن‌ها اقتصادی و اجتماعی است. این‌های روند در کشور ایران به‌طور کلی در میان مردمان به‌طور دوره‌ای و پیوسته به‌وجود می‌آید. این‌ها به‌طور مستقیم و انتقالی به‌عمل می‌آیند. در این‌جا، در نهایت به‌طور کلی این آزمایشگاهی را بررسی می‌کنیم که در بخش‌های مختلف تئوری، عمل، تحقیق و ارزیابی آن‌ها بTyler, 1983

85
Introduction

Education plays a vital role in empowering and making women independent. Women education is important for the development as educating a girl will serve the entire generation (Ghulam, 2006; Alderman, 1998). Women are not only part of human society, but also the central pillar of the origins of human beings. Women can play a pivotal role in the social, financial and cultural promotion of communities (Haq, 2007; Shahid, 2000). However, traditional and cultural values hindrance between women and their prospects for education. Due to this reason millions of girls in various societies live without education and deprived of many other opportunities in their lives (Begum, 2002). It is far necessary to invest in girls’ education and their skill development. As one of women’s organization narrates that the girl is considered a liability, as parents know that their daughter is the temporary member of their family. In this way, they believe that education and skills, will benefit her in-laws after marriage instead of parents. Women living in Pakistan are facing problems since they born. The birth of a girl is often disappointing and even matter of anger and blame on the mother to give birth to a girl baby. In general, girls face deficiency in food, less chances of education and gets minor health care than boys. Consequently, mortality rate for girls is high due to insufficient care (Mehretu, 2001). In past, education was considered for male only, and women have to live in private spheres. While, Islam gives equal rights to both sexes to be educated (Lindsay & James, 2005). It will be more accurate that not only education but also modern education is compulsory for both the sexes without any discrimination (Mishra, 2005). Unfortunately, some societies are still conservative regarding female education. When a man is educated, it means only one person of the society is educated but when become educated then it is truly said that a whole family will be educated. Because a
woman is not only a single person but she is also an institution within herself. Society accepts change when both male and female are educated (Shahid, 2000). Pakistani society is male-dominated and possessing patriarchal system (Himayatullah & Parveen, 1990). This situation is even worse in Pakhtun society as a priority and social power granted to male at all level than female. Financial matters are settled and governed by men, female cannot intervene and they are found dependent (Kotwal, 2006). They do not have the right to intervene in societal, monetary, political and kin matters. The educational, employment, recreational and political activities are completely gender-based in which higher positions are given to men (Jamaluddin & Khan, 2008).

These constraints in the way of female higher education across the globe can be observed. There are certain studies in Africa and in South Asia that this issue is common in the developing countries. A study was conducted in Tanzania to study girl’s performance with workload. Girls showed better performance when they were enrolled in hostel. Because these girls were free from all sort of domestic issues and were fully focusing on their studies. However the discriminating factors include gender disparities as there is different treating girl child in Tanzanian society also. This discrimination starts even from naming of an announcement of the child. Even they treat health care differently. This deprivation continue to the schooling phase of these girls. As a result Tanzanian rural areas girls do not attend pre-primary schools. So greatly affect these girls and they perceive from their early life that they possess second category in society (Meena, 2018). Another study was conducted in African country Ethiopia. Men and women perform same functions differently, because boys and girls are considered differently, exposed to different actions, and so may attain different cognitive skills. Motive behind this attitude are the social and cultural factors which may affect the job of men. In the Ethiopian educational setup, females have setting up of modern education in the country to the most recent few decades (Mergo, 2017). In 1994, Bangladeshi government had taken an initiative to promote girls education. They started stipends for girls in rural areas. Consequently number of girls for getting higher education increased from 14% to 25%, apart from this there was significant effect on the girl’s marital life also, i.e. decreasing early marriages and having small number of children after their marriage, causing a control of population. Even they found chances of finding male counterpart more well of than uneducated girls. Furthermore, these conjugal girls were more authoritative than illiterate girls, while dealing their financial and domestic issues, health facilities and dealing with relatives at various occasions. They were eligible to work in multi-sectors instead of agriculture and earning through some handicrafts. This means that such stipends in especially in rural areas can produce chances of better life for the local girls (Hahn et al., 2018).

Another study conducted in rural India to investigate about women education. This study found that shortage of female teachers is another hurdle for female to get higher
education. These girls will get high grades if they are taught by a female teacher instead of a male teacher. There is lack of female teacher at primary, secondary and even at University level. A study of Indian textbooks found that men were the main characters in the majority of lessons. These lessons reflect that men are more intelligent and challenges accepting and more target oriented. Conversely, women has characterized as fragile and dependent, often facing mistreatment and corporal punishment. Rural children also face shortage of modern facilities and services, such as transportation, electricity, awareness, cleanliness, health care, and right of entry to education. To overcome these problems in 1994, India passed a widespread female education bill that offers benefits for parents which includes access and penalty for keeping a girl out of school. Results were quite interesting and now many government and non-government. organizations are working in this field (Jain et al., 2017).

The primitive structure of Pakistani society places women as housewives and takes care of family activities (Gulati, 2006). In addition, a majority of Pakistani, especially Pakhtun society has further strengthened their restrictions on women’s social, economic and educational empowerment. As this empowerment of women will make them careless in dealing with family members such as spouse and children (Ghulam, 2006). Possessive attitudes and objections of husbands and in some cases family responsibilities and social constraints also prevent women from obtaining an education. Consequently, women's struggles are discouraged and they are barred from educational, political, economic, recreational and social participation in the community (Kotwal, 2006).

Now more women are entering in job market due to the educational attainment even though women have subordinate employment and less working hours than men. There are some studies which reveal a gender gap in settlement to education, but a consensus seems to be emerging that the principal source of the college gap lies in gender differences in the non financial costs of education. Gender gaps in social and behavioral skills come into view to promote early–girls begin school with more advanced learning skills than boys, and this benefit grows over time (Lundberg, 2017).

Female literacy rate in Pakistan is considered very low even in the 21st century. There are a lot of areas in Pakistan, particularly in Pakhtun Society in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, where female education ratio is low. Why this scenario is persistent? This quantitative nature of the study is an effort being made to highlight the various cultural factors of the low ratio of female higher education in Pakhtun Society in Malakand Division, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.
Literature Review

Women play central role in the advancement of the nations. The societal development is highly reliant on collective efforts carried out by both men and women in various segments of the development. Education is the most significant factor for the development, where female cohort can contribute and make a use of its dynamism to bring changes in communities. The importance of education, especially female education, presently, can be well judged by the comments given by a woman who had left behind all of their positions (Alam, 2017). He further stated that the only thing they had brought in was what had been in their minds, what they had been learnt, according to their education. They have lost all the facilities but they still have the education, which cannot be taken from them.

Education is the fundamental right of both sexes (Terry & Thomas, 1997). Knowledge and skills can be transferred broadly to the society and these can be attained through education. The main purpose of education is to share our know-how with others. The level of self-confidence put learners themselves in the middle of their own knowledge and skills. Their ability to change information into knowledge and knowledge into novelty is significant features for the innovative knowledge society. When we made conversation about rules and plans, it should be assumed that assets and programs must be there for both genders. It is observed that illiterate women victimization of violence more as compared to the literate females because of illiterate women don't know their protection rights (Heise et al., 1999). Females’ higher education can contribute a lot in the economic growth of the nation. It is also observed that where both men and women work, then their economic growth get also flourished (Stephan, 2002). Furthermore, Pakistani educational policies were also reinforcing socio-economic development, technical and professional education. In the case of Pakistan, different estimates of private returns to schooling are available. These returns to schooling achievement are low as compared to other developing countries because revenue increases are linked with the level of education, and mainly investments made in female education increase outstanding fringe revenue as compared to males (Jamal 2015).

Different statistics show that Pakistani society is gender-segregated society. Women have to face socio-cultural difficulties to obtain an education. Across the globe, a consensus has developed through the Millennium Development Goals to eradicate gender inequality in the field of education. The agencies working on gender equality contend that everyone has equal rights of getting education irrespective of the gender discrimination, because development of the society is closely linked with the education of both male and female. Some studies have confirmed that gender discrimination in education has a significant impact on rural poverty in Pakistan, while female literacy is imperative for poverty alleviation (Farah, 2007; Alam, 2017).
Pakistan has one of the lowest rates of literacy in the world and even the lowest among countries of relative resources and social/fiscal similarities. Education provides strong foundations for socio-economic development (Memon 2007). Pakistani girls are restricted to avail further education and gender segregated disparity in education is also prominent, consequently, females are lagging behind in almost every profession. Additionally, there are also some other reasons that hinder the females’ higher education, such as gender injustice, posting at distant from their own locality, transportation problems, political insecurities and unnecessary political intervention.

In traditional society, women should only perform housework and take care of their children’s, leading to lower investment in the parental education of their daughters, thus hindering girls from entering higher education. The fewer opportunities for women to be educated are directly related to socio-economic conditions (Alam 2017). Narrow-minded parents generally do not want to invest on their daughter's education, because of the outdated thinking that the main role of professional and social is a choice for men only. They believe that girls are more motivated to household work at home (Colclough et al., 2000). Some parents also misunderstood the concept of co-education. They believe that the common education is not to educate girls and boys but to destroy them in the name of liberalism. In some additional common situations around the world, women are considered useless except for material objects that satisfy the male sexual desire (Fredrickson & Roberts, 1997).

**Cultural Constraints**

The Pakistani society is a typical society. It has old-fashioned cultural norms. Women are included in the category of mothers and housewives. Men are included in the family leadership category. Women are confined to their daily work and completely obey the wishes of their life partners and in-laws (Tichy, Becker et al. 2009). Often parents recognize that leadership is limited to social male members. Therefore, women should not indulge in higher education. This kind of discrimination started in childhood. When girls were doing homework, they received training and always sacrificed for male family members, making them habitual habits. When they are constrained, so is higher education. They are being informed that you (girls) will be married off and then studies will be of no use (Keng, 2004). People who are thought to be well-educated are more likely to find creative that will have to exercise for fruitfulness. This is another definitive health determinant. In addition, the impact of education is often accumulating throughout the life process: as time passes, small influences can be amplified and ultimately make a great contribution to a happy life (Mirowsky, 2017).

Another barrier in the way of female higher education is their early marriage due to parents’ unawareness. After marriage, young girl's right to gain entrance to formal and
even non-formal education is exceptionally restricted due to house management responsibility, childbearing and societal customs that view marriage and education as conflicting (Mathur, et al, 2003). Early practices of early marriages among girls are very common in Pakistani society. Most of stereotype parents consider their daughters a burden on them and they want to get rid of this burden as soon as possible. Early marriage put a lot of responsibilities on their shoulders, facing restrictions which confine them to the house and they have no right to use wealth and face financial constraints (Jain & Kurz 2007). Generally, in such cultures males are supposed as earning hands and females as the caretakers of home. Female are not equal to their male counterparts, thus they have to generate a new role for themselves in society(Glaeser 2014).There are resilient political, societal and cultural pressures that form the male governing society of Pakistan with inflexible traditions and conservative thinking patterns; for example, it is considered against the family honour if females go for higher education, especially, in co-education system. In Pakistan, the willingness of families towards females’ higher education is very low because of the deleterious thinking.

These families prefer Islamic education for females should and females are confined in homes in the name of Islam and culture.

**Ignorant Family members**

Presently conducted studies describe various characteristics regarding the facilitative and hindering perceptions relating to female education. Like study carried out by Farah (2007) about parents perception on girls’ education in six districts of the Punjab province, articulated that both parents give importance to general education, while a large number of parents gave much more position to professional education for boys than girls.

One of the tragedies that occur to women, mostly in rural areas, the fortune of the women are entirely determined by their parents, especially when parents are illiterate or ignorant, in all walks of life, whether in education, marriage or professional life. In this way, sending women for education especially, the higher level is considered a violation of the parents' honor. Illiterate parents are reluctant to send their daughters to the university, and at a very young age, let her realize that she is only a temporary member of the family. The families of girls not allow them to learn any of skills because the benefits will not benefit them. Few parents are more willing to send their daughters to vocational centers (Begum, 2002). The latest report of Pakistan's 2015 Social and Living Standards Measurement (PSLM) survey highlighted 60% of the literacy rate, compared to 58% in 2014.

While in 2015 literacy rate was 70 percent and for a female, it was 49 percent, that shows that there is 21 percent difference exists and needs to be well-adjusted with the
existing resources. Illiterate parents give preference to boys as a lucky symbol for them and girls as a liability, therefore girls get fewer chances to be educated (Jamaluddin & Khan, 2008). Unaware parents are keen on the education of boys and consider the girls as a liability, so that their investment in girls’ higher education is very little and inadequate. Qureshi (2012) used Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLM) 2005-06 to explore gender inequality in school registration and its influence on revenue to the education system in Pakistan. Linking education with income, researcher summarized that revenue rises with growth in the level of education from primary to secondary and from secondary to tertiary level, for both genders and the rate of increase was found higher for females than males. The societal beliefs and practices of the family leader in Pakistan i.e. male decide that whether girls should go to attend an educational institute or not (Keng, 2004; Buchmann & Hannum, 2001). Modernization is the process of transforming the old traditional societies and nations into modernity in the field of economics, technological, business and social development. Education is a great force in modernization. Education is a stimulus for bringing social change. Additionally, education can affect the phase of social change among the weaker subdivisions of the societies. Furthermore, education can initiate and speed up the process of change by changing the approach and beliefs of man. It can change man and his style of living and hence can change the society as a whole, especially towards promoting female higher education.

Materials and Methods

The study was conducted in Malakand division Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. Data were collected through snowball sampling techniques by a sample size of 384 respondents which is enough for maximum population size (Krejcie & Morgan, 1970). The data was collected through a well thought out interview schedule while keeping in view the Pakhtun cultural values (purdah) so trained females were recruited for data collection. Significance relationship dependent variable (Female higher education) with independent variable (Pakhtun culture) was determined by using the Chi-Square test as a statistical tool by Statistical Packages for the Social Sciences (SPSS).

Results and Discussion

Relationship between Pakhtun Culture and Low Female Higher Education

Table-4.1 reveals the relationship between Pakhtun cultural factors (independent variable) and low female higher education (dependent variable). The results show that there is a highly significant relationship (p=0.006) between early puberty of females and low female higher education, followed by a high connection (p=0.005) between conservatism and low female higher education. The results are in line with UNESCO
report that cultural attitudes and conservatism strengthen the norm that girls do not need further education after primary school (UNESCO, 2009). Furthermore, socio-cultural factors were the main reason for gender discrimination in higher education (Kareem & Jamil, 2016). These results conform to a similar research study done by Erulkar, (2004), that blames the socio-cultural setup as mainly responsible for rendering out unequal treatment to the females aspiring for higher education. Female respondents put slightly more weight to home-related factors as compared to other factors. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), cultural taboos and social norms don’t approve of females getting out of the security of their homes and work therefore their higher education is not considered important enough. Apart from a few urban areas, in most of the KPK, the society puts checks on female mobility even if it is for getting education (World Bank, 2011).

Furthermore, there is a significant relation between strong *Pardah* in Pakhtun culture and a low ratio of female higher education (*p*=0.050). In most rural areas the Pashtunwali code of —either *Kor or Gor* (Home or graveyard) is still in practice, but this is not the case in urban Pashtun areas. Even Pashtuns are very sensitive to women’s identity and picture. Sometimes they will not take their wife to the hospital because other men may be able to see her (Jamal, 2014). Moreover, a high significant relationship between home related factors and low female higher education (*p*=0.001). These results are in agreement with the researchers that home related factors and socio-cultural factors are two factors for gender discrimination in higher education (Kareem & Jamil, 2016). These results conform to a similar research study done by Erulkar, (2004), that blames the combination of home related factors and socio-cultural setup as mainly responsible for rendering out unequal treatment to the females aspiring for higher education. Female respondents put slightly more weightage to home related factors as compared to other factors (Erulkar, 2004). Moreover, a high significant relationship between son reference and low female higher education (*p*=0.001). According to the researchers that maternal-son preference were found to be the main aspects that directly or otherwise affect gender discrimination in higher education (Kareem & Jamil, 2016; Erulkar et al., 2004).

In addition a significant relationship was found between male dominancy and low female higher education (*p*=0.007). In Pakhtun culture, men are dominant on women’s lives from an early age and play an important role in issues ranging from education to the selection of husbands. After marriage, a woman’s husband and in-laws can control her own life. They could decide issues such as the number of children she will have, what her role in the community will be, and what her limits are in seeking education or employment (Mann, 2005; Jamal, 2014). A highly significant relationship between lack of freedom of expression and low female higher education (*p*=0.001). In addition, a highly significant relationship between early child marriage and low female higher education (*p*=0.002). Early marriage is the reason behind limited female higher education
(Ara, 2012). The researchers argue that marriage often seems to be the best way for parents to protect their daughter’s future and lessen the financial burden on each other (Myers & Rowan, 2011). This result is seconded by the research study based upon the Amhara region of Ethiopia where the researcher asserts that thirty percent of the females were denied higher education due to the fact that they were married at a very young age (Erulkar, 2004). Moreover, a highly significant relationship between non-involvement of female in decision making and low female higher education (p=.000). Due to non-involvement of women in especially in rural societies women are fail to achieve education (Kareem & Jamil, 2016).

A highly significant relationship was found between spending of money on female education is not beneficial for parents and low female higher education (P=0.000). In the poor households, investments are done in the education of male children because the son is supposed to be the future bread earner of the family while daughters are to be married off to other families. Yourke (1999) in a research study endorsed the idea that the ambitions and aspirations of the parents is a decisive factor in providing equal higher educational opportunities to the children (Yourke, 1999, Sunita, 2012). Parents may think that daughters' education is a waste of money because daughters eventually live with their husband's family and parents will not directly benefit from their education. In addition, more educated daughters may have higher costs of dowries because they want a well-educated husband. However, education sometimes lowers the dowry of girls as the husband's family sees them as an asset (Dreze& Sen, 1995; Khan et al., 2014). Furthermore, a highly significant relationship between non acceptance of co-education system in Pakhtun culture and low female higher education (p=0.043). Social norms and taboos in most of the societies, where the behaviors of the citizens are motivated by a desire to conform to the shared social expectations of a collective group don’t approve of females getting education alongside males in the universities (Heise, 2013). A similar research was done in Saudi Arabia which point outs the fact that females in Saudi Arabia are restricted by social norms to have an easy access to transportation and thus accompanied by a male in their daily commute to and from the educational institution (Sabbagh, 1996). Moreover, a highly significant relationship between living of female in the hostel is not acceptable in Pakhtun culture and female education (P=0.006). A similar research was done in Saudi Arabia which point out to the facility of hostel and boarding is available to the female students, it is not considered appropriate to allow the females to live outside their homes (Sabbagh, 1996). In addition, a highly significant relationship (p=0.001) was found between the cultural interpretation of religion in Pakhtun society and low female higher education. In terms of culture, most of the population directed religious sermons and lectures against women’s education, and the role of ignorant and untrained religious scholars also to a certain extent dominated, leading to the deprivation of women’s education (Naz, 2012).
Table: 4.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pakhtun Culture (Dependent variable)</th>
<th>Low female education (Independent Variable)</th>
<th>$\chi^2$ (P-Value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early puberty of females</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>14.523 (0.006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservatism</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>16.247 (0.005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strong Pardah</strong></td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>11.274 (0.050)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home related factors</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>53.395 (0.001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son preference</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>43.266 (0.001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male dominancy</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>17.679 (0.007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of freedom of expression</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>58.183 (0.001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early/child marriage</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>37.613 (0.002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited decision making</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>44.674 (0.001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belief that “spending of parents but benefits goes to husband family”</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>48.718 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non acceptance of co-education</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>11.869 (0.043)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostel boarding for female</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>17.643 (0.006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural interpretation</td>
<td>Low female higher education</td>
<td>76.332 (0.001)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusions

The study concluded that the risk factors for low ratio of female higher education are early puberty of females prohibit them from higher education in Pakhtun culture, conservatism, **Strong Pardah**, home related factors, son preference, male dominancy, lack of freedom of expression for female, early/child marriage, non-involvement of female in decision making, spending money of parents but benefits receive by husband family, non-acceptance of co-education, living in hostel of female and cultural interpretation of religion are various risk factors for low female higher education in Pakhtun society. Majority of the factors can be found in the South Asian countries while
in some other countries they were also experiencing step parents issue. Poverty and separate educational institutes are also some of the factors influencing female higher education. Studies also reveal that higher education produce more opportunities of employment and can act as population control agent. Even these educated girls are more empower in deciding their domestic issues and settle their financial matters, this educational level also prevent them from illegitimate/premature sex. Furthermore, the above analysis suggested that it is necessary for all the social institutions to arrange and support awareness about the importance of female higher education through various government and NGOs, proper arrangement for motivation, mobilizations, and for this purpose media can also play positive role in the propagation of the importance and need of female education along with sharing successful stories of educated females and religious scholars are also requested to highlight the need for female education along with true religious boundaries.

References


Lindsay, & James E. (2005), Daily Life in the Medieval Islamic World, Greenwood Publishing Group, pp. 196 & 198,


Sameer Ul Khaliq Jan is Lecturer in the Department of Social Work, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

Dr. Ahmad Ali is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology, Abdul Wali Khan University, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

Dr. Muhammad Niqab is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Education, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.
The Role Of Women In Sufism: Highlighting The Importance Of Women Sufis In Sindh, (Karachi and Thatta)

Seema Manzoor
Women’s Studies
University of Karachi

Nasreen Aslam Shah
Social Work and Women’s Studies
University of Pakistan

Abstract

This study aims to express the importance of Sufi shrines in a Sindhi society. The Sufi shrines dwell a central status in our social, cultural and religious setup regarding socio-spatial relationships, status of women in Sufism/Mysticism, rituals, beliefs, spiritual influence, customs and traditions and spiritual healing. Sufi shrines are not only the source of satisfaction for the devotees but also a place where Muslims and non-Muslims participate in all rituals and festivities together. Sindh is the land of Sufis and it holds great importance in Sindhi culture. Hence, the case studies and observational research methods are used to analyze the importance of women Sufis in the Sindhi culture, because both these research methods are explanatory, descriptive, in-depth, detailed and exploratory in nature. Case studies of six women Sufi shrines (three from Karachi and three from Thatta) are incorporated to access the first hand knowledge on the subject. The historical and current scenario about women Sufis and their role in Sindh regarding Sufism is studied through an unstructured interview schedule. Six shrines from Karachi and Thatta were selected as a universe of the study, and the respondents were purposively selected for conducting interviews in detail. The findings reveal that the people of Sindh have blind faith on Sufis (men and women Sufis both). People consider that if they visit the Sufi shrines, they will be blessed with their desires. And moreover people go to the shrines to satisfy their socio-economic, psychological and physical, moral wishes and spiritual needs.

Keywords: Shrines of Sufis, Social Relationships, Powerless Group of Society, Beliefs and Rituals, Sufi Saints, Music, Mystical Influence, Sindhi Culture and Society.

تلميص

الدراسة تُهدف إلى تحديد دور النصائج السوфи في Xamarin على منحهم سلسلة من الأسماء. سوقيات Xamarin لها دور كبير في تطوير النصائج السويفية، حيث تفاعل السلطات السياسية والإدارية نسبيًا. شملت دراسة شاملة كtürk وعُرفت وحول عالميًّا ودبلومات ورسائل ووجدت خصائص وقائع أخرى. فضلاً عن ذلك، كُشفت كذلك مواقع أخرى شملت سوقيات Xamarin ونخبة من العلماء والمثقفين.
Introduction

“And abide in your houses and do not display yourselves as [was] the display of the former times of ignorance. And establish prayer and give zakah and obey Allah and His Messenger. Allah intends only to remove from you the impurity [of sin], O people of the [Prophet's] household, and to purify you with [extensive] purification.” (33:33)

“Allah addresses men and women in the same breath: "O believing men and women, obedient, truthful, patient, humble, charitable and fasting men and women." (33:35)

Sufism started developing, in the twelfth century as a result of small movements by ascetics, which gave emphasis to spirituality and closeness to Allah (Hatina, 2007). There is a very close relationship between shrines and Sufi traditions Bashir (2011), and this link can be viewed by looking deep into the history (Sabra, 2013). In Pakistan spiritual heir ship has been the traditions of Sufi shrines, and the Sufis have a huge number of disciples and followers under their command (Ewing, 1983). Common people in Pakistan hold great respect for these Sufi saints and these shrines are considered as sacred public places Platteau (2011), where followers perform their traditional rituals (righteous and pious) and show their deep and emotional attachment by considering these shrines as sacrosanct place (Manzo, 2003). In Pakistani society, people are connected emotionally
with Sufi shrines and these shrines have become a symbol of social structure and religious significance (Farooq & Kayani, 2012). According to the Sufis, Sufism is considered as a pathway to achieve closeness to Allah, and it is a state where all barriers between man and Allah are eliminated, thus changing the life pattern i.e. a man becomes purely ascetic (Pirani et al., 2008).

There are many etymological terms for “Sufi”, for example, spiritual traveler, devotee, impoverished and ascetic person, but the term Sufi appeared to be the more common and accepted term referred by the Sufis themselves (Hassanali 2010; Sabra, 2013). Majority of Pakistani people consider Sufis as the quintessence and asset for Islam and consider them the pious one and the righteous one as an impoverished one (فقر), who live their life just according to Islam and are involved in public service (Roselhal, 2006). Sufis considering themselves as public servants engages themselves in a wide variety of work like, social, economic, political, moral, ethical issues and it has always been their significant feature (Malik 1990; Platteau, 2011). It is traced down from the history that visiting holy places has always been a sacred ritual and sins are washed off by visiting shrines, on the other hand, it is also a source of inner satisfaction and a way to fulfill desires by praying at shrines, all these are the common practices which are the practices not just in Pakistan, but throughout the world (Frembgen, 2012). According to Brewster, visiting sacred places has its traditional roots, which is linked with the purification of mind, body and soul, i.e. achieving Sanctification and purification of the soul (Brewster, 2011). With time, Sufi shrines have incorporated great influence on the common people and they have established certain rituals, which have now become a sacred tradition (Pirani et al. 2008). Ardent visitors of Sufi shrines have engaged themselves in a variety of spiritual activities Malik (1990) like, offering prayers in mosques, reciting Quran, divine intercession (منت), Sufi poetry, understanding divine revelations, Samaa:Qawwali and Dhamal (mystic and ritual, music and dance) and free food for poor and needy people coming to shrines (Langer, 2010; Wolf, 2006). Furthermore, some other rituals are also performed by the followers, for instance, having an oath (بیت) with their spiritual masters, tasting or eating different items at shrines, tying knots to threads or wrapping pieces of cloth around the trees, taking amulets (توعیز) etc. (Chaudhary, 2010). The followers believe that these rituals add new and spiritual meanings to their lives (Schrode, 2008). Usually people visit shrines to resolve their socio-economic and psychological issues (Levin, 2008). In Pakistan, most of the people have mental stress and depression problems, which are caused by their social issues, low social support, low literacy rate and undue social pressures (Husain et al., 2007). Normally the visitors seek for spiritual healing, meditation, and for the fulfillment of their desires, they consider Sufis as mediators (وسیله، نزیع) for the acceptance of their prayers by Allah (Gilk 1988; Pfleiderer 1988; Pirani et al., 2008).
The main attribute and functioning of the Sufi shrines is the spiritual satisfaction (Brewster, 2011). Spirituality is such a vast religious medium, therefore, it is not possible to sum up under some specific attributes Astin et al. (2011); whereas, Flannelly and Inouye, there is a positive link between spirituality and religion, which leads to the satisfaction in life (Flannelly and Inouye, 2001). Similarly, Khan and Sajid, studied that generally people visit shrines for their spiritual satisfaction and healing, to resolve social and economic issues and for the management of their psychological problems Khan and Sajid (2011), which are due to social stress, poverty, poor living standard, health issues, social misbehaviour and violence (Pirani et al., 2008). The social issues, psychological stress and tensions lead to their poor physical and mental health (Gilk, 1988). The followers have firm believe in spiritual healing, therefore along with medical treatment they prefer to contact their spiritual healers also (Golomb, 1985). After visiting shrines, people feel much relaxed and relived (Levin 2008; Rhi, 2001). People normally visit shrines for divine intercession or to pray for resolving their socio-economic matters, even people having high status from upper class like businessmen and politicians visit shrines to gain and maintain their power (Veer, 1992). Besides all this, people visit shrines habitually, for recreation (visiting shrines with families) and to seek spiritual satisfaction, to demonstrate their dedication and visiting to serve the traditions (Farooq & Kayani, 2012). Usually people from deprived class (lower class) visits shrines, because they feel the Sufi saints can help to get rid of their problems Abbas (2010); Ewing (1983), usually these people belong to both urban and rural class (Frembgen, 2012). During the ritual based festivities at shrines (عَرَس), the majority of the visitors and followers belong to lower class, including: trans-genders, religious mendicants, women in abusive relationships, financially deprived people and etc. (Chaudhary, 2010).

Dhamal (a spiritual form of dance performed at shrines during Urs) is also a common practice at Sufi shrines, especially in Sindh and Punjab (Frembgen, 2012). Many philanthropists visit shrines to provide free food to the devotees and contribute financially (cash or kind). Mostly the people provide free food either for the devotees or to fulfill their divine intercession (مشت), and free food is a main attraction for the devotees and the poor people who visit shrines. Besides devotees and frequent visitors, foreigners and tourists are also attracted by the ritual activities for recreation (Khan and Sajid, 2011). The colorful activities, delicious food, festivals, historical background and the graceful architecture of the shrines attract the tourists (Nolan and Nolan, 1992). The region, socio-economic status and literacy rate influence the superstitious and mythical beliefs of people. According to Farooq and Kayani, in most of the urban areas and at large in rural areas of Pakistan, people believe that the breaking of glass, seeing a black cat during travelling, blinking of an eye, itching in the palm and etc. are the signs of good omen and bad omen (Farooq & Kayani, 2012). It was also observed that there is no gender involvement regarding superstitions, because men and women both equally have mythical approach. But on the other hand, some studies show that women have a higher
tendency of believing in superstitions than men (Sreedhar, 2006). This is the distorted shape of faith and beliefs, whereas, early Sufis projected Sufism as the knowledge of truth and realities, which are part of the Islamic law and cannot be separated from Islamic beliefs (Hassanali, 2010). Some of the religious scholars believe that not all, but most of the rituals practiced at the shrines are a form of polytheism and idolatry (Shirk وبدع) (Chaudhary, 2010). There are varied opinions about visiting shrines, according to few these ritualistic activities develops special relationship and closeness to Allah, whereas others think that these activities are based on profane and polytheism (Veer, 1992).

Regarding the historical Sufi perspective, Sindh (province of Pakistan) is known as gateway of Islam (باب الإسلام). The history of Sufism in Sindh dates back even before the arrival of Muslim conquerors. The invasion of Sindh by Muhammad Bin Qasim in 711 AD, started the Muslim conquest in South Asia Bunting (1980), and established the Umayyad dynasty, for about 200 years Sindh remained under the caliphates of Umayyad and abbasid (Baloch, 1975). All the provinces along with Sindh have been divided into several districts. The hypothetical statement is established on the basis of provinces and their districts that people follow and practice the religion based on the social, economic and cultural setup. In Sindi culture Sufism and Sufi shrines are of great significance. Followers believe that shrines are sacred places and based on their set of beliefs they practice various rituals there, for example, Urs, Sufi music and dhamal, spiritual healing and etc. people believe that Sufi shrines have a transitional role towards gaining the realization of Allah (معرمت الہی). The present study (based on the Sufi shrines in Sindh) focuses on the links between cultural and religious practices, especially the inspiration involved between women Sufi shrines and Islam. This study is based on qualitative analysis, whereby the data is collected from interviewing the visitors and the caretakers at the selected shrines of Karachi and Thatta, which include: three shrines from Karachi and three from Thatta

1. Sayyedina Maryam Bibi (Karachi)
2. Hazrat Amma Maryam (Karachi)
3. Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa (Karachi)
4. Hazrat Shah Peryun (Shah Pari) (Thatta)
5. Satyun Jo Aastano\Dairo (Thatta)
6. Mai Makli (Thatta)

Theoretical Framework

Religion is a set of beliefs and faith, sometimes we draw some socio-religious practices from our culture also, through which link between humanity and spirituality and moral values and customs are viewed and narrated. Religion defines firm rules and regulations
and religious model is planned for religious studies courses, which was basically known as cultural values and cultural system by Greetz model (Geertz, 1993). Greetz’s model faced criticism that religion falls into the anthropological category, because most of the religions have narrative versions, religious traditions, symbols and sacred historical background that are visualized to suggest and explain the life’s origination, living style and the universe. Along with that it also explains the ethical values, morality, laws and customs based on human’s thoughts and creation of human thoughts. According to the studies it is concluded that there are around 4200 religions in the entire world. Religion is not just a system of beliefs, but it constitutes of our opinions, holy places, sacred scriptures and social institutions as well, thus relating humanity to human survival (Geertz, 1993). All religions have their own set of faith system and set of beliefs, which makes them unique based on their divinity James (1902), sacred texts Durkheim (1915), and phenomenon, faith Tillich (1957), and a concept of supreme power (James and Peter 2010). According to James faith and cultural values are a source of religious beliefs (James, 2008). There are many religions worldwide (AFSMU, 2005).

Mystics are those people who seek for attaining highest station of mysticism to look for spiritual pleasures through personal experiences in association with Allah. Sufis seek association with Allah not only by divine law, but also from personal experiences, realization of Allah. Many Sufis have attained the position in Sufism like Mansoor Hallaj, by establishing a relationship with Allah spiritually, which results in self-catharsis. According to the understanding of Sufism the inner strata has multi structures. And each level corresponds to the personal experiences attained by spirituality. The path of spirituality, interior (inner-self) differs from Sufi to Sufi and so are the technical terms. It can be seen that a term used by one Sufi might not be the same with other Sufis based on their experiences. Some of these terms are drawn from the Quran and rest are depicted from various other sources (Suhrawardi, 1962). Few most popular terms used by the Sufis are as follows: secret of the secret (sirr al-sirr), reason ('aql), spirit (ruh, P. jan), self (nafs), secret (sirrmost hidden (akhfa), heart (qalb, P. dil), and hidden (khafi). Before going deep into exploring these terms, we must understand that these terms cannot be expressed in a general manner, because each Sufi has used these terms differently (Nihon, 1960).

Some other terms were also introduced by the Sufis to link humans with spirituality but for that one has to understand its origin. Sufis have elaborated nafs (self) starting from the lowest level, i.e.: 'the soul inciting to evil' (al-nafs al-ammarah) (12:53), 'the censorious soul' (al-nafs al-lawwamah) (75:2), and 'the tranquil soul' (al-nafs al-mutma'innah) (89:27), as well as others such as 'the seducing soul' (al-nafs al-musawwilah) and 'the satisfied soul' (al-nafs almardiyah).
Review Literature

Since the start of cognizance, both female and male (human beings) have strolled the way of reuniting with the sense of their existence as an individual. In spite of the fact that in this universe of duality we may end up in various structures and forms, but eventually no concept of male or female exists, except for just being. According to the Sufi customs and traditions, the acceptance of this fact has empowered the spiritual maturity of women in a way that has not generally been conceivable in the West (Yamin, 2009). Men and women both have served Islam and have shown great love for Allah, this light has been carried out by them throughout the centuries. Due to many factors women remained invisible as compared to men, but they carried out their services and showed great devotion as active participants. Some Sufi circles allowed women to participate in religious gatherings and ceremonies with men, whereas, in some Sufi orders women worship and participate in religious ceremonies of remembrance (zikr) separately in a segregated environment. Few Muslim women were strong enough to devote themselves in an ascetical sense, by parting from the society, for example, Rabi’a Basri; whereas, other women desired to play the role of benefactors to promote the worship circles. These benefactresses became very familiar teachers, students and religious friends and influenced the life of others. And in their household domain as mothers and wives, they continue to support their family members and continued to follow the path to attain the unification with the beloved (Allah) (Helminski, 2003).

There are various scholarly opinions about the origin and adoption of the term “Sufi”, its origin can be encompassed by the following Arabic words, for example Suffa, which means the purity of man’s heart and soul, and Ahle Suffa refers to (Zahids and Abids) certain abstinent, who devoted their lives for absolute devotion and utter submission to Allah during the life time of the Holy Prophet. Another Arabic word Suff, means row, i.e. the Muslims who used to offer their prayers five times a day in the first row. Soofa, was the Arab tribe, who devoted themselves to the services of Kaaba. And most importantly the terms Soof and Cuf, which means wool and the Sufism followers used to cover themselves with wool, i.e. covering their purity with wool by leaving the worldly pleasures and suppressing their desires. Many derivations have been proposed so far, but now it is certain that the term Sufi has been depicted from the word Suf, i.e. wool (Browne, 1997).

Sufi Philosophy

Sufism is considered as the religious philosophy of Islam, which is depicted and explained in terms of the oldest existing definition as 'the depiction of divine veracities', and the mystics of Mohammad (SAWW) used to call themselves proudly as ‘Ahl-al-Haqq’ (the devotees and followers of the divine Reality). Among the modern eastern and
western scholars, the mystical and Gnostic view of Sufism is very popular; they represent Muslim / Islamic mysticism as Sufism and believe that the term Sufism is an attempt for people to develop true Islamic beliefs in order to find out the mysteries of the world and life. Many western scholars have interpreted Sufism according to their understanding. Reynold Nicholson, one of the most exceptional scholar of Sufism has discussed Sufism by depicting the words of Ma’ruf ‘l- kharki, which he relates as ‘divine truths and realities can be best understood by Sufism’ (Nicholson, 1963). Similarly, Ansari quoted that another well-known scholar Titus Burckhardt, further elaborates that Sufism is not only the apprehension of divine realities, but it is a decisive factor to understand real Sufism and it also lays the foundation of the *Sufi Tariqah* (pathway of Sufism) (Ansari, 2004).

**Mysticism/ Sufism/ Tasawwuf**

The Sufism and its importance, the main Sufi orders, their distinctive elements and the philosophy and ideology of Sufism can be understood through the historical study of *Tasawwuf* and its expansion via particular references all over the subcontinent (Indian subcontinent) (Engineer, 1991). Basically Sufism (*Tasawwuf*) intends to brief the process of attaining the realization of Allah, which creates all possible types of spiritual attributes. Though the term *Tasawwuf* became common in the late 2nd century A.H, but still it was an integral part of the believers, right from the beginning. In other words, we can say that *Tasawwuf* is another referral name for the realization of Allah through the Islamic concepts and beliefs (Khan, 2004).

In the beginning the role and presence of women within Sufism was not recognized and their contributions were undermined. But a change in people’s mindset and women’s recognition in Sufism dominion started with some phenomenal, thought provoking and influential work by Rkia Cornell. In her book “Early Sufi Women”, which she translated from a very exceptional text of as-Sulami’s Dhikr a Nisswa al-Muta ‘abidat as-Sufiyyat. Rather than a discovery her work was considered as a new beginning and a pioneering endeavour and it became a landmark for many other similar efforts globally. With the beginning of realization through such efforts Sufis, scholars and intellectuals started to look up the gender issues and other issues like sexuality, language, caste, ethnicity which exists within Sufism. The literature, which was produced by these Sufis and scholars became the source of great knowledge and is continuously growing through researches regarding this specific topic (Cornell, 1999). Cornell’s work provoked many scholars to investigate critically that how Sufism looks into and represents global perspective towards gender issues. Similarly, few other scholars explored, to create theoretical understanding. Even after all these efforts a very basic, elementary, clear-cut, interesting, but most challenging, intriguing and provocative question can be raised and that is how many Sufi women, we can recall by their names by looking back into the history or even
in present times? And the answer is that one should critically think about the concepts of women Sufis. Only this way we can imagine and analyze what elements are responsible for making women invisible even if it is about religion.

Unlike the past, currently and in the past few decades, massive scholarly work has been done on national and international level and is known as Sufi-o-graphy. And lately the question about gender and Sufism has been discussed quite more commonly than ever. This subject is very diverse and needs to be debated with full potential in order to find out the real standing of Sufi women in the past and present to change the perceptions overall, about women and their status. And this should range from concepts of gender within Sufi practices to women’s contribution in Sufi shrines and also from exposing or revealing mystical fundamentals to establishing again the gender dimensions from a feminist point of view. Over the past few years, these efforts have produced the following themes from a feminist perspective as well. It has been observed that over the period of a few years, women and Sufism is the most debatable subject within Sufism than any other feature of it. Various concepts and thoughts regarding women and Sufism have established pretty more clear perceptions, but still there is a need to converse the idea about gender and Sufism to uncover and explore the hidden elements to be more specific about the role of women in this domain. And this analysis is based on dialogues and debates on the very subject and it must not be generalized, otherwise we would not be able to picturize the true spirit of Sufism.

As mentioned above, the topic of Sufi women can be linked to three issues. Firstly, it is very important to discuss the concepts of gender within Sufism and mystical practices. Jawad (2006), floated this idea and concept in “Sufi gender paradigm” as her analysis. Secondly, she has emphasized that the status of women in Sufism along with their authority and role should be discussed under the Sufi gender paradigm. On the other hand, Dakake has observed that it is not necessary that by exploring the role of women within Sufism can lead to the active role of common women. And finally, these arguments will be furnished on the basis of theoretical foundations. We can identify these three stages as, first one stems out of history, the second from anthropology and the third one from philosophy (Dakake, 2002).

**Gender Ideas within Sufi Practices and Interaction**

Reproducing the concept of “Sufi gender paradigm”, one should analyze the components of gender perspective, the contributors and its impact on an individual. It is also noticeable that “Sufi gender paradigm” gives the chance to see the world through the gender lens, i.e., it represents and informs about the social status of individuals. Social relations can be well understood by using gender as an analytical tool, because it is not just social construction. Areas of gender neutrality can be explored and examined through
the mannerism of gender formulation and its impact on men and women both. Along with that it can be used as a mirror to reflect the real image or to make visible, various aspects of gender e.g, living standards, values and norms and access to resources and etc. (Radden, 2004).

The foundation of this paradigm is based on the detailed explanation of the Sufi symbolism, i.e. this symbolism constitutes of femininity and masculinity, which then views collectively, completes them as one being. Sachiko, advocated this thought critically and in one of his influential work “The Tao of Islam”, presented the feminine aspects in Islamic mysticism (Murata, 1992). similarly, Dakake, has analyzed that this symbolism has established more clearly the status and role of women Sufis (Dakake, 2002). Whereas, Annmarie mentioned that Ibn Arabi has explained the importance of women within Sufism, Arabi considers that women are an essential part of the divine reality (Schimmel, 1997).

Can Woman be a Sufi?

In spite of the fact that there is a long history of women’s contribution in numerous aspects of Sufism, but in the conventional Islamic spirituality we do not find any proper documentation regarding their services towards Islam and mysticism. The researchers have conducted ethnographic studies to observe the participation capacity of men and women both in religious rituals at Sufi shrines, but out of these only few studies have been published and even these studies have focused the participation of men and neglecting women’s presence. Few popular western scholars, Annemarie Schimmel and Margaret Smith have researched about Rabi’a al-‘Adawiyya and some other famous Muslim women mystics, but the nature of their work was based on historical investigation, theoretical and literary work. None of these scholars have focused the true and devotional dimension of women Sufis. The role of women has been poorly documented and there is no clear understanding about their role and services towards mysticism and Islam, it has been ignored even at a scholarly level. The presence and contribution of women Sufis have been very vibrant in countries like Iraq, Iran, Lebanon, Turkey, Morocco, Syria, Egypt, Afghanistan, India and Pakistan. In the Muslim world women can perform their religious prayers in Mosques but with some restrictions and limitations, and these restrictions are based on socio-religious perspective. On the other hand, women can freely and openly participate in the religious rituals performed at Sufi shrines. Women are usually referred as members of Sufi orders and family members of Sufi saints as mothers, sisters and daughters. The following areas have been identified for women participation regarding Sufism and its rituals.

- Women’s role in Sufi practices as mystics.
- Women’s role in Sufi poetry as creators.
• Women as source of inspiration and influence for male Sufis in their reproductive roles as mentors, nurses, daughters, sisters and mothers.
• Women as patrons and ethnographers of male Sufis, for example the Mughal princess (Jahan Ara), the daughter of Mughal king Shah Jahan.
• Women’s role in Sufi songs and poetry.

Women’s role as guardians and conservers of Sufi lore and discourse, for example a maid servant (Mai Naimat) of Shah Abdul Latif Bhittai, conserved all his memories in the form of “Shah Jo Risalo” (Abbas, 2002). Throughout the Islamic world, there are numerous names of women Sufis who have great contributions towards Islam and Sufism, but we hardly see any research regarding women Sufis not even in the sub-continent (Kloppenborg & Hanegraaff, 1995).

Can Men Become Sufi without the Contribution of Women?

In the development of Sufism, women have contributed a lot and played a vital role being a member of human society and as male’s life partner. They made a tremendous impact on the history of Sufism and their role is quite prominent in terms of their spiritual attitude. Though society has established roles for men and women, which limits women, but women knew that Sufism can create a very noticeable history. Therefore, even with their reproductive role they managed to participate in spiritual activities and proved that they can be equally ascetic like men and contributed in mysticism in many ways, for example by being part of spiritual sessions lead by great Sufis and documented their extraordinary deeds based on miraculous acts. On the other hand, many women appeared as very highly esteemed Women Sufis and gained recognition in a male dominated society where women achieve denial only (Bhaduri & Mukherje, 2016).

Mothers, Wives, Sisters and Daughters of Sufis

Women have a great capacity of adopting many roles simultaneously and they perform in all these domains with excellence. In all of the social relationship women excel and help men as well. Women have had great influence as sisters on Sufis and their lives. Many Sufis were very close to their sisters and used to share their feelings and views with them, even sometimes they would seek their advice. For instance, Ali Roodbari, at the time of his death shared his experience of death. He told his sister “Fatemah”, heaven doors are opening and the heaven is decorated, and the angels are telling me that all these bounties are for me. But I just want one look at me by Allah; it will be the best reward for me. Fatemah, later narrated the death experience of her brother with pride. This narration shows that Abu Ali’s sister was an ardent listener and he trusted that his sister will understand his mystic mood (Meibodi, 1960). Similarly, in another story shows the close bonding of Boshr Hafi with his sister. One night he told his sister that he will stay on the
roof and the next morning when his sister inquired the reason, he answered that I wanted to be alone to think deeply that Allah has created human beings, some are Christian and some are Jews or belong to other religions, but why they have not accepted Allah as the supreme authority of the entire universe and I am so blessed that being a Muslim I am fortunate to have a firm belief in Allah. Sisters of the Sufis have shown that they had been a support, companionship and ardent listeners of their brothers. For example, Boshr Hafi, considered Mozqe (his sister) a true companion and a person with whom he could share things with ease. He was so much attached to his sister that after her death he stated that if someone fails to worship Allah properly, then he may lose his/her companion, and he was afraid of the fact that he might have failed to fulfil his duty as a worshipper, therefore, his sister parted from him by death (E’temad-al-Saltane, 1926). Women are sacrificing by nature and for their loved ones they are always ready to give away anything, especially for their fathers, brothers, husbands and children. Farid ud-Din Attar of Nishapur once narrated that when a well known Sufi Fazil ‘Ayyaz adopted Sufism and wanted to leave for Mecca, leaving his wife behind by giving her choice to live her life according to her choice. At that moment his wife took a bold step to be with her husband, she told him that she will follow him wherever he goes and will never leave him alone. Unlike many other wives Fazil ‘Ayyaz’s wife acted differently and sacrificed by leaving all her relatives and family behind to accompany her husband in his quest to Mecca (Bhaduri & Mukherje, 2016).

Miracles (Karamat) are a very important part of mysticism. It is a well established belief that only devout and pious people can attain the station of Sufism, where they can perform miracles. Women in the life of Sufis play a vital role by being devoted towards them in whatever the relation they have with them, i.e. as a mother, wife, daughter or sister and they share very important mystical status in Sufism. A pious and devout woman bears a pious child and trains him into a cultured and mystic person. Thus mothers and also the wives, sisters and daughters hold a very special position in the spiritual life of Sufis. History highlights that mothers of few Sufis were also able to perform miracles and used to guide their sons towards the spiritual path. Bibi Zulekha, mother of Hazrat Nizam-ud-Din Awliya was his spiritual teacher and guide. After her death, whenever he wants guidance in any dilemma, he used to visit her tomb to seek her guidance (Helmsinski, 2003). Same way, Farid-ud-din Ganj-i-shakar, considered his mother as his mentor and guide. He was so much influenced by his mother and daughter that he wanted to announce his widowed daughter as his successor, but he could not, because women were not acknowledged as Khalifa. His mother also had attained a mystic status and could perform several miracles. Many of the Sufis have admitted that their mothers, wives, sisters and daughters can perform miracles and are at a very high status of mysticism. The wife of Al-Hakim was also a mystical person and played a very significant role as a Sufi. Similarly the wife of Hazrat Khizar (Khidr) used to get instructions and guidance from her husband in her dreams, which is a very sacred form of
guidance in Islam. Once he appeared in her dream and asked her to maintain cleanliness, later he explained that by cleanliness he meant clean speech (Helminski, 2003).

**Role of Male and Female Sufis**

Islam is a very harmonious religion, close to nature. The Islamic faith is based on the oneness of Allah Almighty, or in other words, it can be said that pictures, carvings and idols are not allowed. The global debate raises a question that, can we see Allah? And the answer is given through many Ahadith, in one of the Hadith the Holy Prophet said: 'In Paradise the faithful will see Allah with the clarity with which you see the moon on the fourteenth night (the full moon)'. Sufis have also argued on the subject and they believe that in this world we can see Allah, but with the eyes of the heart, just as Sufi martyr al-Hallaj in his poem said: ‘ra'aytu rabbi bi-'ayni qalbi' (I saw my Lord with the eye of my heart)'. Sufism has no distinction regarding gender, because men and women are equal before Allah. Women have played a very important role in the development of Sufism right from the beginning, which is said to have begun with the Holy Prophet (SAWW). Prophet Muhammad taught lessons of life and the amalgamation of matter and spirit and the recognition of male and female is based on everyday life. The cultural expressions have over shadowed the essence of purity, objectivity and purpose, but the Qur’an has clearly identified that men and women are equal. Islam has balanced the human relations by maintaining the honour and respect of women. Hazrat Kahdija (beloved wife of the Holy Prophet) and Hazrat Fatima (beloved daughter of the Holy Prophet) played a vital role and appeared as very strong women, showing the strength that women are equal to men in all walks of life. Hazrat Kahdija stood by the side of Muhammad through thick and thin. And Hazrat Fatima had a very deep understanding of mysticism and is considered as the first mystic Muslim woman.

Dr. Nurbakhsh has mentioned in the prologue of his book “Sufi Women”, that there is no difference among men and women in terms of faith. He claims that women who have set their foot on the path of Sufism and reality have attained the equal and the same status as of men Sufis. Dr. Nurbakhsh praises the fact that there is no concept of "I" or "You" in the ocean of divine unity, which is the highest point, because what else could be the best possible meaning men and women can hold. His book provides the enlightenment regarding the respect of women Sufis over the period of time, from the early days to date, through the biographies and subjective stories and narrations of highly reputed and respected women Sufis. These stories highlight the role of women Sufis, especially the Rabe‘ah Basri and she was the most popular and highly esteemed Sufi woman of her time. She had a very tough life full of pain and misery, but out of that she explored truth. There are many great Sufi women, but their stories were set down and they remained anonymous. The current study, therefore seeks to find out why these Sufi women were left unrecognized. Rabe‘ah Basri is one among the Sufi women, who has attained the
Ma’arifah (the mystical knowledge of Allah) and have gone beyond many male Sufis. Inevitably, she is one among the great Sufis of her time and from early days to date she has the excellence, piety and piousness and (Zohd) self-restraint, which anyone can wish to have. She has an unparalleled position in Sufism path and she is known as the Taj al-Rejal (crown of men). Fariduddin Attar had praised her with these sentiments in the “Conference of the Birds echoes”:

“No, she wasn’t a single woman
But a hundred men over:
Robed in the quintessence of pain
From foot to face, immersed in the Truth,
Effaced in the radiance of God,
And liberated from all superfluous excess” (Nurbaksh, 2004).

Sufism in Sindh

The new ideas of Sufism have given new dimension to it and it is a never ending struggle for seeking the love and blessings of Allah. Self-control, simplicity and praying at night raise the awareness level and open new horizons for an average person who seeks the love of Allah to attain the status of his beloved (Schimmel, 1975). If we study the Islamic history in detail, we can depict the clear picture of the rise and fall of Muslim Empires and the formulation and compilation of Islam through Sufism (Tasawwuf). Sufis have used Islamic teachings, jurisprudence (the theory and philosophy of Islamic law), love, peace, humanity, tolerance, true expressions and open heartedness rather than war disasters and aggression to change the hearts of people. Before the occurrence of any change (socially or religiously), first, the internal impact is crafted than it creates external impact in the form of revolution (Schimmel, 1992). Similarly Hazrat Sheikh Al Hajveri in his book “Kashf ul Mehjoob” mentions that the attainment of Irfaan-e-Zaat (identification of self) is the extreme station of reality (Hajveri, 1978).

The culture and soil of Sindh is enriched with the history of Sufism. Many highly respected Sufis have filled the soil of Sindh with their knowledge and wisdom. Almost all the Sufis of sub-continent have focused Sindh due to its prime importance relating to the history of this region. Though entire Sindh is the source and Sufism and righteousness, but few historic cities are of central attraction like Deebal, Mansoora, Thatta, Makli and Rorhi. Sufism teaches us to have self-control, and selflessness, and these Sufi traits help in bringing the social revolution. The Sufi saints are considered as rain in a desert. The Sufi shrines are a source of tranquillity for the followers. Sindh has a rich Islamic history due to the Sufi saints, in other words, we can say that Sindh is the land of Sufis, Saints and highly esteemed religious figures. Though the culture of Sindh is so rich regarding Sufism, but still we do not find much literature regarding the subject (Sultanova, 2011).
The role of women Sufis is deliberately ignored and certain misconception have been established in order to malign the religious status of women (Mernissi, 2011). According to Burton, in Pakistan, many women from Sindh province adopted the path of Sufism and became Fakirani (follower of religious order either murid or Sufi) Burton (1973), few among them attained the status of murshid (spiritual teacher) (Denny, 1988). Some Sufi orders allowed them to participate in all of the rituals like men Schimmel (1982), for instance, Qadiriyya and Rahmaniyya orders let the women enter as Sufis (Smith, 2010).

**Methodology**

This study examines the role of women in Sufism, and it also attempts to capture in-depth understanding regarding the people’s perspective about Sufism and women Sufis. Thus, the researcher focused on detailed study on the subject through qualitative research method and descriptive survey by interviewing visitors of Sufi shrines and the caretakers to gain firsthand knowledge regarding the topic, so that authentic information can be collected for further analysis. For this purpose case study method has been chosen to analyze every possible detail to cover all the aspects of the research problem, because due to the qualitative nature of case study the researcher can attain detailed information based on an explanatory, exploratory and descriptive research. The core aim of this study is based on ethnography, which is to demonstrate the activities performed at Sufi shrines and people’s perception regarding the women Sufis. Case studies of six women Sufi shrines (three from Karachi and three from Thatta) are incorporated to access the firsthand knowledge on the subject and for this purpose, and the names of the shrines are as follows: 1) Sayyedina Maryam Bibi (Karachi), 2) Hazrat Amma Maryam (Karachi), 3) Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa (Karachi), 4) Hazrat Shah Peryun (Shah Pari) (Thatta), 5) Satyun Jo Aastano\Dairo (Thatta) and 6) Mai Makli (Thatta). Care takers and the visitors were interviewed by using unstructured interview schedule. Karachi city and Thatta were selected as universe of the study and the interviews were conducted by selecting respondents purposively. In qualitative analysis, descriptive method is used to acquire exact and factual based details about the religious status and importance of women Sufis and the turnout of people visiting their shrines based on their beliefs and mystical influence of these women Sufis. Since there is not much of a research work done on the subject; therefore, it is needed to explore all the hidden aspects of Sufism linked with Sufi women and their role in the propagation of Islam, especially in Sindh. By interviewing the respondents at the shrines, served the purpose of the research and it was quite a fruitful research, which opened many new dimensions to be explored to portray the clear picture of women in Sufism, which is definitely a missing link of Sufism.
Data Analysis

The data was analyzed in segments systematically. First the interview schedule (in Urdu language) was used to record the response of the respondents. Secondly the responses were translated from Urdu to English. Later it was presented in forms of case studies to have in-depth information on the subject.

Purpose of the Study

The main aim of the present study is to have qualitative analysis regarding the role of women in Sufism and to highlight their importance within Sufism and in the society, along with that observing the rituals and religious activities performed at the women Sufi shrines is also a motive of this research. Exploring the exclusive dimensions of women Sufis which are not yet explored, because there is no sufficient research work done regarding women in Sufism.

Descriptive Research

It is a research method which is used to have a detailed description about the characteristics of the selected population under study. These characteristics are based on certain categorical and definite format also called as descriptive categories. It does not deal with the “how/when/why” questions; rather it deals with “what” question, i.e., what are the distinctive qualities of the chosen population (Shields and Rangarjan, 2013).

Exploratory Research

Exploratory research, as the name suggests that it helps to explore something or to conduct a research on an issue which has not been explored closely or clearly. It is used to establish research priorities, improving and finalizing research design and developing operational definitions. Since exploratory research has an exclusive nature, therefore, it is needed to choose the research methods and drawing conclusions with ultimate care (Shields & Rangarjan, 2013).

Observation

The systematic approach of data collection is called observation. It is a way of recording the views of people by examining them in natural conditions or any naturally occurring event or circumstances. It involves the researcher’s engagement for prolonged periods till the required results are obtained. Observational research actually records the current behaviours without influencing the people, things are recorded in the order of their occurrence (McBurney & White, 2009).
Case Studies

Case studies based study establishes a clear picture and understanding about the issues of the research problem. It is a way to achieve accurate information and it also strengthen the experience and knowledge gained from the previous conducted researches. Case studies also provide in-depth analysis about a single person, a group, community, organization, city, country or even a region. Researcher usually uses qualitative research techniques to reveal the social issues to develop a clear understanding about it. In case study methods various tools for data collection are used, such as interview method, a survey, questionnaire, data analysis tools, observation and review of documents (Yin, 2012).

Here in this study, case study method is used purposively to record every possible detail about the role of women in Sufism and the perception and social understanding about their contributions and sacrifices, which they make to support their families and accompany men through their mystical journey in different relationships as mothers, wives, daughters and sisters. Since this dimension of Sufism is not yet explored on larger scale; therefore, the researcher aimed to gain firsthand knowledge from different shrines in Karachi and Thatta by visiting personally and used the above mentioned data collection tools to have a clear qualitative analysis of the research problem.

Karachi: Case Studies of Women Sufi Shrines

Case Study 1: Sayyedina Maryam Bibi

Syeda Hazrat Maryam Bibi’s shrine is located in Kharadar at Nishtar road adjacent to Timber market. There are many other shrines in the same street, therefore, it is known as the street of shrines. Bibi Maryam’s shrine is within the premises of a house in that street and the residents of that house administrate all the shrine’s affairs. The caretaker of this shrine is commonly known as Baji and she works there as a spiritual healer also. Bibi’s Urs is celebrated every year on 27-29th of the Islamic month of Rajab. The people of that area does not know much about the history and details of the shrine and about her miraculous powers, but according to the caretaker of Mai Lanji’s shrine Bibi Maryam is the sister of Mai Lanji and this shrine is also 200 – 250 years old. People usually visit shrines for the fulfillment of their desires and they do not like to talk to anyone during their visit, therefore, it was not easy to interview. But somehow, the researcher, convinced one of the visitor Fatima, who was 40 years old and Gujrati speaking. Initially, it seemed impossible to interview her due to language barrier, but somehow the researcher managed to interview and collected the required information. Fatima was not literate, but since she lives in Karachi therefore, she understands things and manages all his household expenses within limited income oh her husband. She offers prayers daily
with regularity and believes in cleanliness, personal hygiene, purity and piousness. She understands the difference between polytheism and innovative acts very well and according to her visiting shrines in not Biddah at all. She respects the Sufis and hold high esteem for them. She knows that Sufis are considered as friends of Allah due to their piety and piousness. Therefore, Allah blesses them with miraculous powers and high status and they help people by using the gifts of Allah. Fatima said that music and dhamal are not non-Islamic practices, because in Qawwali Allah’s praise is expressed, and already all praises are for Allah only. People regularly visit Bibi’s shrine, but during Urs the festivities and celebrations enhance the Islamic spirit.

Observations

Bibi Maryam’s shrine is located in a densely populated area in a residential area, therefore it is not easy to identify it as a shrine, and it is recognized as a shrine only by the appearance of its entrance door. Her followers, visits her daily, but majority comes on Thursday and on 27th of Rajab, supplications are also offered. During URs festivities Qawali and dhamal is arranged and Biryani (Rice dish: very popular in Sindh) is given to the visitors as a token of blessing. People believe that their prayers will be heard by visiting the shrines, this is the point when a person starts doing idolatry, there is a very thin line regarding our beliefs, which one should decipher. A very interesting fact is observed that among visitors women are in the majority, because usually women seek alternate ways for their problems and fulfillment of desires. Women sometimes fall for such things, because they do not have enough knowledge about Islam due to lack of education and have no social exposure to make out between real and fake. Women normally think that the more time they spent at shrines more they will be blessed.

Case Study 2: Hazrat Amma Maryam

The shrine of Hazrat Amma Maryam is located near Karachi Port Trust Office in the adjacent street of Hazrat Sayyedina Qibla Peer Haji Ghaib Shah Ghazi Bukhari. Almost 50 years ago Amma Maryam migrated to Karachi and started living in the same area. There was no one to take care of her, because she was all alone, therefore, in the name of Allah the shopkeepers of that area started to take care of her and use to provide her basic necessities. According to people her mother tongue was Urdu and twenty five years ago when she died, the residents of that area buried her and due to her piety, her grave gradually gained the status of a shrine. Only women can visit her shrine, mostly they visit on Thursdays and Fridays between 4-5 pm. Her followers are not only Muslims, but Christians also visit her shrine. Every year in the month of January her Urs is organized by the local residents. While interviewing a Christian woman Alina, the researcher asked many questions about her and Amma Maryam. She was a very old woman around 80 years of age. As she did not receive any help from her community and religion; therefore
she started living in Sufi shrines. She was in the profession of nursing and was alone, because she is unmarried and have no family. After retirement, she had no place to live and even church did not support her. She feels safe here at the shrine rather than seeking help from a church. She stays all day at Amma Maryam’s shrine and at night sleeps at Peer Ghaib Shah’s shrine. She proclaims that religion is not the property of any specific group or community. Therefore, she finds peace at shrines. Though she is a Christian, but she prays at the graves of Sufis for her needs.

Observations

The shrine of Bibi Amma Maryam is a single room space, which is located at the corner of PTK office adjacent to the market area. Like many other shrines, this shrine is also not registered and therefore, no maintenance is provided by the Department of Auqaaf and religious affairs. Shop keepers and visitors maintain the shrine and manage all the care and expenses. The appearance of the shrine looks like a small mosque. There were many small baby cots, which symbolizes that childless couples place these cots as a symbol of their divine intercession to have a baby as a blessing of the shrine.

Case Study 3: Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa

The shrine of Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa is located on Shah Abdullah Bhiati road near the Culry Jonah Mosque and Haidri Football Club. Amma Maa was a resident of the Ratan Talao Burns road and belonged to Dhal caste of Kach-chi community. Like Hazrat Amma Maryam’s shrine, this shrine is also open for women only, men are not allowed to enter inside the shrine. Her Urs is organized every year on 2nd Moharram-ul Haram. Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa shifted to Lyari from Ratan Talao in 1961 and after her death in 1971; her shrine was constructed to honour her pioussness as a Sufi. This shrine is also not a registered one; therefore, it does not get any cover from the Department of Auqaaf and religious affairs. One of her follower’s Dhal family is looking after the shrine and manages all affairs. Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa had some miraculous powers, among which blessing a childless couple with a child was her most prominent miracle (karamat). In the premises of shrine there is a well, which is known for its spiritual value, anyone who drinks water from this well recovers from any kind of illness. People donate money for the maintenance of the shrine and yearly 10,000 – 12,000 PKR are collected, which are later used for Urs festivities and maintenance of the shrine. Like many other shrines, people wrap coloured threads, pieces of cloth, and locks as divine intercession (مَنْتَ). One of the local residents, Zulaikha Bibi provided some details about the shrine to the researcher; she is a wife of care taker Muhammad Haji Dhal and helps her husband in all rituals at the shrine. According to them Bibi Amma Maa belonged to Kach-chi community, she was not Syed, but people called her by the name Sayyeda Bibi Amma Maa in respect. Women are very ardent follower of Amma Maa and visit her shrine
regularly on Thursdays. Zulaikha claimed that the well within the premises of the shrine has never dried since it is constructed. Zulaikha also told that her husband’s paternal aunt and grandmother were also the caretaker of this shrine and this chain has never been broken. The researcher asked Zulaikha to explain the existence of well within the shrine and she said that once they had water crisis due to less rain, then Amma Maa prayed and well came into existence as a result of her prayers. Usually women come here to pray to conceive a child or they come to drink and take away the miraculous water from the well.

Observations

The premises of the shrine were very clean and tidy. The shrine has entrance and exit doors, so that visitors can easily perform their rituals and can leave without any problem. But the rear door is opened only on crowded days like on every Thursday, Friday and during the Urs. Near the head side of Amma Maa’s grave, threads and locks of divine intercession (منتب) are kept. Visitors give bestowment in honour of Amma Maa in cash and kind form.

Thatta: Case Studies of Women Sufi Shrines

Case Study 4: Hazrat Shah Peryun (Shah Pari)

The shrine of Shah Pari is located in a very old graveyard of Makli and this shrine is almost 300 years old. The lineage of Shah paryun is linked with Hazrat Salman Farsi. There are three graves inside this shrine, first one is of Hazrat Shah Murad, and the other two graves are of Shah Paryun, who were disciples of Shah Murad. The 50 years old caretaker of this shrine Salim Sahab told the researcher that their family has been taking care of this shrine and it is the 7th generation taking care of all matters here. Every year, the festival is organized on the first Thursday of Rajab (Islamic month) and the Urs is celebrated in the Islamic month of Safar, which starts on 19th Safar after dusk (maghrib) and ends at dusk (maghrib) on 20th Safar. During the festivities of Urs free food is arranged for the visitors, and even Qawwali and dhamal is arranged. Many people visit the shrine other than the festival and Urs on every Thursday. Many people who come to visit shrine from the distant areas to stays at night and leave after the end of the festivities next morning. 42 years old Bushra Khatoon came to visit Shah Pari’s shrine from Karachi to attend the Rajab festival with her husband. She had received elementary education only, but had religious knowledge and is also very religious. She believes in the miraculous powers of Sufis and came here to pray for her daughter’s health. Her entire family loves to visit shrines to pray for their issues. She clearly knows the difference between polytheism and Biddah and asks people not to perform non-Islamic practices at shrines. She thinks that we can pray to Allah only for everything, but these
Sufi saints can be a source due to their piousness. According to her there is no harm in visiting shrines, but one must know the limits; else we will cross that thin line.

Observations

Like other shrines of Makli and Thatta, the shrine of Shah Pari was very untidy. Within the premises of shrine, one could see litter everywhere and even around the graves. Maybe it is because people visit this shrine twice only in a year; therefore, the caretakers do not give much attention in this regard. Besides that the visitors here usually belong to the lower class and they do not have the sense to keep the shrine’s premises clean. During festivals and Urs days food and handicraft stalls are arranged, so that people who come from distant areas can buy food to eat and can purchase handicrafts as souvenirs. All these things reflect the tradition of that area. The prominent miracles of the Shah Pari shrine includes: conceiving a child, economic issues and spiritual healing. On the head side of the graves there is a cavity where different types of stones and clay is kept for the visitors, they rub it on their bodies for healing. This miraculous clay and coloured threads are sold for 20 Rs. couples who are blessed with a child; bring their child on his first birthday to seek blessings. It is strictly restricted that impure women cannot enter the shrine.

Case Study 5: Satyun Jo Aastano\Dairo

The key importance of Satyun Jo Aastano is that 7 real sisters are buried here. Satyun Jo Aastano, means shrine of seven sisters. This is almost 800 years old shrine and the popular story about it is that all these sisters died at a very young age and all of them were unmarried. While they were crossing river bank with their brother Shah Jhanda in a boat. They prayed to Allah to save their life and as a result of their prayers an Island came into existence and later on their shrine was constructed on the same Island. The caretaker told that all these sisters were mystical in nature from the beginning and people used to get benefits from them due to their spirituality. Their Urs is celebrated on 19th and 20th of Safar every year and food or sweets are given to the visitors as a token of blessing. Adjacent to Satyun Jo Aastano is the shrine of their brother, but women are not allowed to visit there, whereas, men can enter into Satyun Jo Aastano’s shrine. A very interesting fact was revealed by the visitors that Shah Paryun and seven sisters of Satyun Jo Aastano are real sisters, i.e. in total they are nine sisters. Two sisters got the name of Shah Paryun, because there is a myth that they had wings and that is why they were buried separately. Women visit this shrine in a huge number, thus researcher got a chance to interview a few women there, among whom a woman named Bushra came to visit with her four sons and she came to pray for one of his sons. She lives in Thatta and has been visiting shrines for last 25 years. Like every other person, she also thinks that Sufi shrines are the source of fulfillment of their desires and their issues will be resolved, because these Sufi saints
are pious and their blessings are with the followers always. According to her, if a person asks for anything from these saints or bow down before their grave, then it is not idolatrous act, in fact it is a way to show their love and respect for them. Bushra does not have any elementary education and she does not know how to recite Quran or to offer prayers and even she has no concept of fasting, because they do not have a family of religious trends. At a question regarding gender differences, Bushra looked at the researcher strangely and said Allah has created men superior to women, therefore, women are inferior and men are their owners and they can control our lives. This reply definitely shows that lack of education and religious knowledge leads to ignorance. Women are not even aware of their rights and consider that men can treat them in any way they want.

Observations

Unlike Karachi, almost all the shrines in Makli and Thatta were not well maintained and people there have no sense of cleanliness. There could be many reasons like, the visitors do not care and spread the litter wherever they sit and due to a huge number of visitors the administration is also unable to maintain cleanliness throughout the day. Like all other shrines the Urs is not celebrated in Satyun Jo Aastano. People give bestowments on the fulfillment of their wishes and desires in cash and kind form according to their status. They purchase souvenirs (oil, flowers, and clay) at the shrine. Men and women both can visit here equally.

Case Study 6: Mai Makli

The shrine of Mai Makli is known by her name. The history of this shrine dates back at least 1000 years or maybe more than that. The caretaker while giving the details of shrine said that the construction of this shrine was the best example of architecture and the walls were decorated with gold, but with time its beauty is lost. Some people say that once there was a temple of Mai Kali, whose name was changed from Maa Kali-Di to Mai Makli. From historical evidence it is known that Mai Makli used to live here, therefore, the temple was transformed into a shrine and was named after her. This shrine is under the administration of the Department of Auqaaf and religious affairs. The caretaker added that Mai was a very miraculous person; she used to go to Arab countries, spiritually to sell milk and returns by the evening. Mai once saw in her dream that someone called her name and told her that this shrine is your Makkah ( ﻪﺬﺍ ﻣﮑہ ﻋﻠﯽ، ﻳﮩﯽ ﻛﻤﺮﺍ ﻣﮑہ ﮨﮯ) therefore, she started to live here. Later this area and the graveyard became famous by her name. Mai Makli was known for his miracles, one of which was that, if anyone picks up the heavy clay pots of milk, gets his/her wishes fulfilled, but now these pots are broken, in fact the entire shrine is destroyed; only the rear wall is left. Her Urs is celebrated every year on 15-17 Shabaan. People bestow money, meat, animals and
edibles. People take souvenirs (miraculous salt, coloured threads and oil) from there like all other shrines. The researcher interviewed 43 years old Umme Habiba at the shrine of Mai Makli. Her entire family pays visit to all the shrines in Thatta every year. Habiba said the visitors are not just Muslims, even non-Muslims pay visit to the Sufi shrines. There are some shrines which allow the visitors to stay a night, but few of them are closed for visitors after the sunsets. She said that polytheistic acts are practiced on all shrines, which should be controlled by the government and department of Auqaaf and religious affairs. Few people are involved in illegal acts and criminal activities also, which spoils the sanctity of these sacred places.

**Observations**

The importance of Mai Makli can be understood by the fact that she is known as the leader of all Women Sufis of her time. Once this shrine was a perfect example of classic architecture, but now it is completely destroyed. Only rear wall and grave are left with a name of Mai Makli written on it, other than that, nothing indicates that it is a Mai Makli’s shrine. This shrine is on the mountain’s peak and the atmosphere here is very pleasant and peaceful. This shows that Mai Makli was really a pious Sufi saint and she was equally competent like men Sufis. A person feels complete serenity by standing there. According to the beliefs of people she was also blessed with spirituality; therefore, they get blessings by performing rituals there. The children born as a result of divine intercession are brought here and they become liable to serve at the shrine throughout their life. These shrines are a source of spiritual satisfaction for people. In the shrines at Karachi usually the caretakers are known as (Mutawalli/Majaver, متوالی/مجاور), similarly in Makli and Thatta usually these administrators are called (Khalifa/khismatgaar خدامتگار/خليفی).

**Conclusions**

Through this article the researcher has attempted to demonstrate that in past few years debates regarding role of women in Sufism have emphasized that women hold equal importance in Sufism and can be equally ascetic. These debates have contributed their part in establishing possibilities for gender equality and developing social awareness about the role of Sufi women in all aspects of life directly or indirectly based on their thoughts and practices. Within Sufism the multiplicity of global views, patterns and various perceptions regarding women are absorbed and create impact not only on the status of women but also on their activities. These global views, patterns and various perceptions lay down the foundation for theoretical explanation, illustrate and envisage presence of women in Sufism. It is seen that the concept and practice of gender equality within the human societies emphasize on and encourages participation of women in Sufism. This mindset has created space for women in Sufism equal to men in terms of
status, role and responsibilities. On the other hand, we observe that gender biased societies have negative perception regarding women entering into Sufism. Thus, we can say that both perspectives can be viewed across the world and somehow women remain invisible even in religious matters.

In ancient times the Sufis received salutation by individuals because of their devotion, honesty, piousness and piety. The Sufis have even taught people to live peacefully with harmony and to spread amicability without the involvement of religion. Sufism has deep roots in Islam and has a very rich history, but the history has not recorded the role of women Sufis. History remains silent regarding the role of women Sufis and their participation as practicing Sufis. Yet there are so many authentic names of Sufi women, who had a very overwhelming and inspirational role in mysticism. It is debated that in Sufism, one has to shun the materialistic life, which is not possible for women to seclude worldly aspects from their life. This is the common perception of social groups and it has definitely damaged the image of women Sufis. Whereas, Islam teaches us to maintain equality between men and women in all aspects of life and religion, and anyone can become the “Friend of Allah” by adopting righteous path. This Islamic perception justifies that women are equally capable to perform anything, which is witnessed due to the productive participation of pious Muslim women and their contribution towards Sufism. In South Asia, it has been observed that due to mix cultural social setup the true essence of Sufism has declined due to the mingling of customary and traditional aspects of other religions. This blending of cultures in South Asia has changed the face of Sufism somehow and the practices at tombs and shrines demonstrate that Sufism concepts are not regarding the teachings of Islam anymore.

The role of women in Sufism is far more graceful and appreciable than just being an ascetic person. They not only believe in or bound themselves to practice a solitude life, but they assist men in different relationships as mothers, wives, sisters and daughters and their interpretations of life and behaviour leaved a commendable impact on them. Such as women being wives help their husbands in bringing up their children and fulfill their domestic responsibilities as well. Along with all these reproductive responsibilities they devote themselves for worshipping Allah and practicing asceticism. Their actions in their respective domain clearly show that women have sacrificing nature, whereas, Sufi men usually leave their families behind for their religious events, without caring for their families. Similarly, women as sisters have played a vital role in the life of their Sufi brothers. They were known for being ardent listeners and best companions, by providing them their support and assistance whenever needed. Women have shown great respect for Sufis in their own ways, for example, giving gifts to them, helping them financially, documenting their religious work and writing poetry, narrating their miraculous actions and trusting them whole heartedly and etc. Sufi women and common women both have a deep impact on women, they enter into Sufism willingly and not just by trusting men.
Sufis blindly. This attitude shows that women act wisely and makes right decisions. Men and women Sufis both have created impact on each other, for example Hazrat Rabia Basri impacted many of her contemporary men Sufis.

Women should be given fear chance of doing things and making decisions on their own regarding their life, for this purpose society should play a vital role. Sindhi society and culture should revise and realaddress its mannerism to sustain peace for the upcoming generations, because without giving women their freedom, liberty and equality society on the whole cannot prosper. Government being a driving force should play its role in maintaining tolerant and peaceful society, because Sindh is known as land of Sufis and these are the true traits of Sufis. Political leaders and media being an important institution should raise awareness among common people about the equitable society and to establish public opinion about status of women having the objective of betterment of common people. The people of rural areas have low access to education, which hinders them from getting a chance to understand their religion and responsibilities as being a man or woman. Customs and traditions or social practices, which bounds women and damages their status, should be abolished. Tolerance, peace, harmony and social justice should be revitalized in Sindh and incorporating it with economic strength, because people migrate to Karachi city from interior Sindh for economic activities. Thus, economic based equitable society can prosper and people can learn to respect each other rights. And all this enlightenment should be done in the light of Sufism spirit in Sindh.

The devotees from all over Sindh come to visit Sufi shrines of men and women Sufis both, common people have great respect for both men and women mystics. They come to shrines with a belief that their desires and needs will be fulfilled by praying over the grave of a Sufi saint. People perform various forms of rituals at shrines and these rituals are a way of showing their gratitude to the Sufis. Most of the people visit shrines by their own will and many others are influenced by their friends, relatives and religious leaders to visit shrines and to be the part of festivities at shrines. These visitors usually belong to middle class or lower class families having different socio-economic status. People who usually practice Biddah (بدعه) and believe in the myths and superstitions are mostly women and illiterate poor people.

As per findings of this research people have various perceptions of their own. These perceptions regarding myths and superstitions are based on gender, literacy, social and economic status. Overall it was observed that even those who perform acts of Biddah were convinced to certain extent that all these practices are not permissible in Islam, but they still practice it. Major aim of this study was to find out why people actually visit shrines and travel long distances to come to the shrines. It was concluded that most of the respondents were convinced that they will be blessed from the shrines only due to the blessings of Sufi saints. As far as visitors were concerned they had no doubt in mind
regarding gender of the Sufi saint, they seemed to believe in both male and female Sufis, but in our present social setup, women are still unrecognized in all walks of life. Though Sufi women also have many followers, but still they are not given the same status like men Sufis. Many Sufi women are known for their piety and piousness and many of them bear the power of miracles as well, even then they remained unnoticed in the history. Only few Sufi women got fame in a mystical world. In the present Muslim societies, the Biddah practices are commonly observed. People who visit shrines and tombs of Sufis perform false religious practices in the name of Islam. In Islam worshipping graves is strictly prohibited, but people follow such practices due to illiteracy and lack of religious knowledge.

**Limitation and Delimitations**

Since the aim of this study was to find out the overall scenario regarding the role of women in Sufism in Sindh (Karachi and Thatta), therefore it was quite a challenge to interview respondents who visit shrines frequently and the caretakers. Since interviewing people on any religious topic can offend them, because due to different belief system, researcher had to ask questions with care and keeping in mind that the questions should not be provocative. Religion becomes a personal matter, when a person faces different opinion other than his/her faith. Thus interviewing people is not an easy task. But first taking the caretakers in confidence it became a bit easy to interview them. The respondents gave interview after getting assurance that their personal details will not be used anywhere neither directly nor indirectly. Taking pictures at the shrines was the biggest challenge, even the caretakers resisted that, but with a little conversation they finally permitted the researcher to take few snaps only.

**Recommendations**

To examine the status and role of Sufi women some serious researches are required and there is a need to change the social attitude towards women. In this study few recommendations are incorporated and they are as following:

1. Society should be gender sensitized to recognize the value of humans on gender basis. We shall hold ourselves as honest, truthful, and a promising human being to accept responsibility to bring positive change in the society, to cultivate awareness within the existing culture, society and this should start from ourselves.
2. Sufism is a path of respect, nobility and servility; therefore, we should consider our actions above our personality, our personal gains and ambitions and should inspire others through our actions.
3. All men and women have equal status in Islam regardless of race, ethnicity, gender, socio-economic status and age. Thus, there is no distinction among men
and women; anyone can educate themselves to the highest level and to seek highest station of spirituality.

4. All men and women have the equal right to express their emotions and feelings based on their spiritual ideas to acquire recognition through their abilities.

5. We should respect the opinion and ideas of others, the same way we honour our right of expression, our values and attitudes in order to establish a well balanced gender sensitized society, which holds women highly esteemed.

6. Women and men should be given equal opportunity to participate in public discussions for dialogues and productive arguments on all forums like spirituality, education, health, family life, marriage and divorce rights and other social issues.

7. Women should be encouraged to enter into Sufism without the gender discrimination and they should be given equal status like men Sufis.

8. Muslim societies should be moderate and balanced and should give equal chances to all its elements to survive and sustain their individuality.

9. There is a need to change social perception regarding the status of women, which Islam has given them and uplifted their role and status in all aspects of life including worldly life, religion and spirituality.

10. Tombs and shrines should be used as institutes where people can learn about Islam instead of practicing Biddah at the graves of Sufi saints.

References


Al-Quran: Surah, 12: Ayah, 53.


Al-Quran: Surah, 33: Ayah, 35.

Al-Quran: Surah, 75: Ayah, 2.

Al-Quran: Surah, 89: Ayah, 27.


250 The Role of Women in Sufism: Highlighting the Importance of Women Sufis in Sindh, (Karachi and Thatta)


____________________

**Seema Manzoor** is Lecturer in the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.

**Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah** is Meritorious Professor in the Department of Social Work and Director, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.
Revisiting Gender And Feminism: Global And Pakistani Perspectives

Shabana Shamaas Gul Khattak
Centre for the Study of Pakistan
School of Oriental and African Studies
University of London

Abstract

This study elaborates a discussion of my previous studies: ‘Feminism in Education’ and ‘Synthesising Feminists’ Theories’. Here, I analyse the three waves of feminism through my feminist lens of liberal, socialist/Marxist, radical and Islamic feminism. I argue that the waves of feminism enhance our understanding about gender struggle for equality around the global. However the differences of processes and parameters of discrimination are varies from society to society and culture to culture. Unknowably, feminism in Pakistan has been alive since the freedom struggle from the British imperialism for their national cause. However lack of education and patriarchy increase the gender gap in the country and make men more powerful. I concluded that only higher education can transform women own beliefs to defend and fight for themselves by productive positive arguments with their family men. It does not mean they are violating their religion or ethical values.

Keywords: Feminism, Pakistan, Higher Education, Gender, Inequality.
Introduction

I would recommend to my readers to understand feminists theories in context of gender and education with special reference to Pakistan this article should be read with my previous studies. Because here I am taking my discussion further from thesis to antithesis and synthesis of feminists’ theories in higher education to their categorization in different waves of feminism. With regard to feminist approaches I focus only liberal, socialist/Marxist, radical and Islamic feminisms. First to understand gender, there are two contrasting ideas regarding the definition of gender and the intersection between them as follows: gender is the result of socially constructed ideas about the behaviour, actions, and roles of a particular sex. The beliefs, values and attitude adopted and exhibited by them are in line with the agreeable norms of the society (Mead, 1980:77). The personal opinion of the person is not taken as the primary consideration for assignment of gender and imposition of gender roles as per the assigned gender.

Increasingly scholars have recognised that men and women do not passively adopt the gender characteristics that are associated with their sex. Men and women are socialised due to social reproduction (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1997). Inclusion of the term ‘gender’ in feminist scholarship and the women’s studies in the past several years signifies a shift away from the notion that biology is destiny, that is, sex differences determine what men and women are. Instead, sex differences modify and shape gender norms in accordance with other considerations, including race, ethnic and cultural background, geographical location, educational attainment, socio-economic privilege, and sexual orientation, as well as individual personality and temperament. In this non-essentialist view, gender is culturally constructed rather than biological or innate (Peach, 2000).

What is Gender?

Gender comes from the French; the word is ‘genre’. This, in turn, came from Latin: ‘genus’. Both words mean ‘kind’, ‘type’ or ‘sort’. Sometimes the word ‘sex’ alternative of gender social role in the society but the feminist theory use ‘sex’ to refer to our biological characteristics and ‘gender’ refers to our social roles. For example the British Sex Disqualification (Removal) Act 1919 ended the discrimination of women in all levels of education and employment. Thomas (1990: 17) argues that by the 1970s, radical feminists had begun using the word ‘gender’ to describe their theory of human nature, ‘because the term sex no longer sufficiently described the sociological aspect of gender and power relationships’.

Conversely, by the end of the decade there was an agreement among the radical feminists regarding their theory that;
human nature is essentially epicene and social distinctions based on sex are arbitrarily constructed and matters pertaining to this theoretical process of social construction were labelled matters of gender (Thomas, 1990:17).

Furthermore, gender is the result of socially constructed ideas about the behaviour, actions, and roles of a particular sex. The beliefs, values and attitude adopted and exhibited by them are in line with the agreeable norms of the society. Increasingly scholars (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1997) have recognised that the men and women do not need to submissively adopt their sex associated gender characteristics because men and women are socialised due to social reproduction. In other words, under this non-essentialist view, gender is culturally constructed rather than being a biological or innate quality (Peach, 2000).

Bornstein (1994: 51-2) suggests that ‘gender can have ambiguity and fluidity’. She also suggests that the society plays a vital role in assigning gender specific roles and characteristics. ‘Gender indistinctness’ means that an individual has the freedom of choice to construct their own personality without being obligated to take up the characteristics traditionally assigned to their birth gender. while ‘gender fluidity’ is used to describe someone who does not accept the rigidly defined genders ‘male’ and ‘female’ and believes in the freedom to choose any kind of gender with no rules, no defined boundaries and no requirement to fulfil any expectations associated with any particular gender (Bornstein (1994: 51-2). This idea is very foreign to the traditional society of Pukhtunkhwah, where both male and female have rigidly defined gender roles that limit their opportunities and expectations in social life. Furthermore different gender studies are generally based on the theoretical framework of western and westernised women. Although there are some commonalities regarding gender roles and expectations across countries and cultures, there are, too, huge differences.

**Why Gender has a Problem?**

Acker (1981:78) was one of the first to argue that sociologists have often failed to recognise that sex differences are the result of cultural and social influences:

writing of men, sociologists show an acute awareness of the social constraints upon their actions. Writing of women, of the sex differences, they frequently switch to psychological or biological levels of explanation.

Nevertheless, the argument is that the people’s actions are socially constrained, although not socially determined; people make decisions, which are based on an awareness of the potentialities and limitations of certain courses of action (Francis, 2000a). Men and women make limited choices in different areas, because they passively accept their
socially allocated roles of masculine and feminine behaviour (Francis and Skelton, 2001; Francis and Skelton, 2005).

This study adopts the view of Francis (2000a:7) that gender is, like the study of inequality and also class or race. This study explores gender perceptions and experiences and to ask questions about the deprived and silent women of Pukhtunkhwah, and also with the intention to give them voice, empower them and value them. It examines the factors contributing to the present state of affairs and how it has evolved. Men have a desire to dominate women, which results from historical prejudices of patriarchal cultural of Pukhtun society. This is undoubtedly the case that there is a constant procedure of producing and reproducing gender discrimination in societies around the world (Thomas, 1990; Francis, 2000b).

The word ‘gender’ signifies the social characteristics of men and women, but also acknowledges the relationship between masculinity and femininity (Acker and Piper, 1984). Thomas (1990:11) quoted Acker’s 1989 study, which reviewed various sociology of education articles published between 1960 and 1980. She found a significance marginalised women sample. She further highlights that it is interesting that before the seventies, researchers were not interested in women’s studies and valued their gender related problems. Subsequent analysis by some feminists (Sharpe, 1976; Delamont, 1980; cited in Thomas, 1990:11) have attempted to reduce this imbalance by using all female, rather than mixed, samples, and by treating the quality of education received by girls as a serious issue, in a way that was rare before the late seventies (Thomas, 1990:11). Francis and Skelton (2005) explored the fact that although there is an increased number of a women sample in the empirical research, with women’s poor presentation or their issues are not fully addressed. Belotti puts it:

The superiority of one sex is based exclusively on the inferiority and weakness of the other (cited in Thomas, 1990:11).

Cultural traditions, patriarchy and male domination are important aspects of gender in a particular society that requires comprehensive study to be understood, because these are the common causes of women subordination. Very few academic studies (Khan, 2007; Qureshi and Rarieya, 2007; Malik and Courtney, 2011, Naz et al., 2011; Hussain, 1995) scrutinised about gender and the related issues in higher education in Pakistan; their main focus is on higher education as a tool of women’s empowerment. One of their main weaknesses however, is that they did not theorise about how to get into, or secure access to, higher education. These studies lack feminist analyses.

There are a number of institutions which play a role in the production and reproduction of gender inequality, both on an ideological and level (Thomas, 1990). The people around us, our family and the media, promote the stereotypical gender roles on an ideological
level, while employers who pay lower wages to female workers perpetuate inequality on a material level (Arnot and Grubb, 2001; Archer, 2003, cited in Thomas, 1990). However, the institutions, which ‘many sociologists have regarded as central in perpetuating inequality are also, crucially, central in potentially eliminating inequality is that of education’ (Thomas, 1990:12). Education is considered one of the key battlegrounds in the struggle for gender equality. Since nineteenth century, educational reformers have struggled to reduce the gender gap in schools as well as dispel stereotypes about appropriate subject choices for girls and boys. However, for the rural and some urban areas of Pakistan, where the key issues are food, clothing and shelter, education is the fourth priority. Poverty is one of the major features of Pakistan in general and a main variable in educational access and attainment.

**Literature Review**

Various types of feminism have advanced different explanations for inequality in higher education: liberal, radical, and Marxist or socialist. All these feminist approaches concerned about unequal opportunities in higher education that challenged the propagation of male-experience and knowledge. Marxists or socialist struggle for equal power relation for both the genders in society that takes further by the liberal feminists to remove inequality by political, social and economic movement under state law. However the radical feminism criticises both the theories (Marxists/socialist and liberal) considering patriarchy is the main rival of women in society that gives supreme position to men and subordinate place to women. I have examined a fourth approach in this study, is the Islamic feminist paradigm. Islamic feminists claimed that Muslim societies are diverse and male dominated where culture and traditions have stronger roots than Islam. Because cultural values are older than Islamic values so under strong social and societal pressures people follow their patriarchal culture rather than Islam. Islam valued women’s rights and made education obligatory for women and men both. Therefore the Islamic feminists want to improve women’s social, political, legal, and educational situation around the Muslim world. Therefore they challenged the patriarchal culture of Muslim societies. Islamic feminism encourages the Quran and Sunnah’s teachings of justice and fundamental rights distribution in-between the two genders (Contractor, 2010).

Thomas (1990) noted that very few feminist researchers in the sociology of education choose higher education for their research venture, while so much work has been done on the primary and secondary levels. This is similar to the academic literature on Pakistan. However, this may be the outcome of a deficiency in the feminist theory of education. Of course, other educational theorists also have difficulty theorising the role of higher education in the reproduction of inequality (Thomas, 1990; Francis, 2000b). In the UK and USA, in comparison to Pakistan, there are substantial sources available on gender and gender inequality in higher education. In Pakistan there are only a couple of
academic studies on gender in higher education; in contrast, a substantial number of studies have been published on the secondary level of education, and a notable number on the primary level. Most of these studies are contract studies carried out by donor agencies. This lack of research into gender and higher education in Pakistan is largely due to what international organisations chose to study, as national studies and academic research on gender issues in higher education are rare in Pakistan. Another reason for the lack of studies and theories concerning higher education could be that gender inequality issues in education are already entrenched at primary levels and are further reinforced at secondary levels, and by the time women in Pakistan reach the age of possibly entering higher education, a series of patriarchal, social, cultural and economic factors compel women to accept the prevailing system of male-dominated education in Pakistan. As a result, very few gain access to higher education (Informal discussion with the Provincial Director of Education, 2008).

Methodology

The historical research method has been used to analyse the scattered data of feminism. My methodology is based on content and theme analysis with special reference to descriptive analytical approach, which identifies emerging themes from the data rather than predicts what themes would occur before the analysis.

Data Analysis and Discussion

My analysis and discussion of the various feminist theories I will examine the differences and similarities between feminist approaches to education in the contemporary world. Then, once informed by these studies, I will look at various analyses of the Pakistani education system. Thirdly, I will scrutinise the application of these theories in higher education of Pukhtunkhwa specifically.

Liberal Feminism

According to this philosophy, society should impose laws to bring in changes to the stereotype gender mind set of the social order and give equal opportunities to women as equal citizens with equal rights. Liberal feminists’ belief in a just society, where women and men should secure equally powerful positions. In the early seventies, liberal feminists were more concerned about the working-class children to have better educational opportunities. They struggled for a universal education compulsory for all, especially for girls who were highly underrepresented in mainstream schooling (Thomas, 1990).
Liberal feminists (Mary Wollstonecraft (1759-1797); Elizabeth Cady Stanton (1815-October 1902); John Stuart Mill (1806-1873); Betty Friedan (1921-2006) and Rebecca Walker (1969-present)) believe that female subordination is rooted in a set of customary and legal constraints that blocks women’s entrance to and success in the so-called public world and they work hard to emphasize the equality of men and women through political and legal reform (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006: 21).

Liberal feminists raised their voices against sex discrimination during the civil rights movement because they passionately believed that racism and sexism should be abolished. The National Organization for Women, the National Women’s Political Caucus, and the Women’s Equity Action League were all established to support women’s rights. These groups also started their struggle for the sanction of ‘the Equal Rights Amendment’ or ‘Constitutional Equity Amendment’, and demanded equal rights for both men and women under democracy. Furthermore, they sought democratic laws to secure additional rights for women, such as reproductive rights, and equal pay for equal work issues. They also campaigned for a number of other vital issues, such as suffragette. Women education for liberal feminists is reasonable health and child care, and protections against sexual and domestic violence against women.

Liberal feminism is also known as ‘first wave’ feminism, because it was the first feminist movement. It matured in the context of the industrial revolution and liberal politics in the late 19th and early 20th century in the United States and Europe (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006). First wave feminism influenced the struggle for women’s equal rights during the 20th century. Their struggle was in eastern and western societies i.e. the South Asian feminists struggle for the liberation of Indian sub-continent is noteworthy in this regards. Both Hindu and Muslim women movements found common cause in not only their struggle for national liberation, but also for recognition of their legal and political rights.

Written in reaction to the French Revolution, Mary Wollstonecraft’s A Vindication of the Rights of Woman (1792) is still an impressive and decisive piece of writing which people still love to read today. Virginia Woolf’s A Room of One’s Own (1929) and Simone de Beauvoir’s The Second Sex (1949) are the early works that paved the way for radical second wave feminism (cited in Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006). Simone De Beauvoir captivates the argument of men supremacy, who considered women as invaluable secondary sex in their self-controlled world.
Woolf introduced the notion of female bisexuality and a unique woman’s voice and writing. Beauvoir the notion of women’s radical otherness or, rather, the cognitive and social process of ‘othering’ women as the second sex in patriarchal societies. We would say that Beauvoir thereby produced an authoritative definition of patriarchy (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006:7).

Actually, the fundamental concept of the second wave radical feminists’ was ‘patriarchy’, which they defined as a system of male-domination and oppression for the exploitation of women (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006). Patriarchy was so predominant in existing society, and the feminists developed their ideas and views to criticise, and discredit patriarchy, with the ultimate aim of abolishing it completely.

However, patriarchy has a different form of authority in Pakistan that has an impact upon women’s authentic voices. Pakistani women made substantial contributions to the Pukhtu language, and, because under rigid Pukhtu perspectives, subjects like mathematics, statistics, and the natural sciences traditionally taught to men, such as art, literature, and biological sciences traditionally taught to women. This seems to be underpinned by the prevailing cultural and religious view, because these professional subjects will take longer to study. Women are encouraged to study for only short periods for their first degree so that they can get married at an early age. Pakistani parents’ first priority is to find a suitable marriage proposal rather than a suitable subject choice for daughters’ higher education. Similar concerns were noted in works of twentieth-century feminist writers, who commented on parents’ apparent lack of interest in careers for girls, as they assumed that they would simply marry, have children and stay at home (Blackstone and Fulton, 1975, Hussain, 1995).

In the liberal model, education tends to be seen, to some extent, in isolation from the social structure (Thomas 1990: 13). Because education is considered one of the main causes of creating inequality in our society, also through education a society can reduce gender marginalisation. For example, Friedan in her famous book *The Feminine Mystique* (1963:67 cited in Thomas, 1990), argued that ‘the education system was partly to blame for the ideology of the feminine mystique, but equally the solution for women who were trapped in their roles as wives and mothers was to return to college to obtain an education’. However, women’s own problem is their attitude, their own representation in media and their education system; so there should be a change in their own attitude to stop thinking about stereotype roles in society.

Liberal feminists were inspired by Betty Friedan’s landmark book. Similarly Rowbotham and Davis (1965) but from quite a different point of view—they argued that middle-class women were unsuccessful in western societies because they were lacking political leadership and social power (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006).
Their demand was payment for housewives - a kind of citizen’s income and positions of power in politics. Zillah Eisenstein’s work *The Radical Future of Liberal Feminism* (1981) was a hopeful contribution liberal feminist (first wave and second wave) thought; its influence is even felt in today’s neoliberal feminism. ‘Typical liberal feminist concerns during the second wave, however, were documenting sexism in private as well as public life and delivering a criticism of gendered patterns of socialisation’ (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006:43).

However, the women of Pakistan do not have control over their own lives, because the family, culture and society push them towards taking on roles of wives and mothers. In this traditional society, a degree is a piece of paper that does not guarantee a successful marital life. A highly-educated woman has difficulty in finding an educated suitable match for marriage. Males prefer to marry young uneducated women because of their flexible and non-argumentative attitude and their ability to bear more children, all of which are characteristics that will enable a man to easily dominate them (Shehzad, et al., 2010). Most liberals, like other feminists, believe that school’s hidden curriculum is encouraging sexist attitudes in children (Delamont, 1980:3 cited in Thomas, 1990):

> Schools develop and reinforce sex segregation, stereotypes and even discriminations which segregate the negative aspects of sex roles in the outside world, when they could be trying to alleviate them.

In Pakistan, not only schools but also parents, culture and society instil these attitudes in children. Teachers convey these messages through the hidden curriculum. Hill (2001: 298) summarises Bourdieu (1999), suggesting that cultural reproduction works through the hidden curriculum that categorises some cultures, life styles, ways of being and behaving (for Bourdieu the habitus), attitudes and values. Malik and Courtney (2011) and Qureshi, et al., (2007) came up with the same conclusion: that Pakistani educational institutions promoting their traditional and culture values that helping towards women’s subordination position in the society rather empowering leadership status. They further argue about considerable evidences that the school culture in Pakistan shapes boys and girls differently. These statements demonstrate a central emphasis of the liberal feminists’ analysis, that education has the ability to promote positive or negative attitudes, and that changing educational systems will change hence, eventually society. As mentioned earlier, boys in England have recently performed poorly relative to girls (in modern foreign languages, and literature for example), yet the liberal feminists of the seventies tend to be concerned only with the areas where girls were less successful, such as science and mathematics, seeing them as long routes to career success.

Ultimately, liberal feminism is not a suitable model or theory to be applied on Pakistani society because law cannot bring equality in the society and education. These feminists
theorise about western societies, not the traditionalist conservative Muslim societies of South Asia where legal reform fails in face of money, power and socio-cultural pressures. The constitution of Pakistan clearly mentions free primary education and equal access to primary and secondary education, but 60% of school going girls are not attending any education (UNESCO, 2010). State law has failed to bring equality in education due to the current lack of girls’ schools, colleges and universities (particularly women’s universities, as segregation is demanded by Pakistani traditional society) and other educational infrastructure.

**Marxist/Socialist Feminism**

Marxist/socialist feminism was developed in the US workers’ unions, in some parts of Europe as social-democratic parties for reformation, and in the former Soviet Union during communism. So we can say that it was a parallel movement to liberal or first wave feminism. The German Rosa Luxemburg (1870–1919), the Russian Alexandra Kollontai (1873–1952), and the American Emma Goldman (1869–1940) were the famous pioneer feminists of this movement. Like liberal feminism, it demanded equal opportunities for both genders, but Marxist/socialist feminism differed in that it was a movement particularly for working-class women and their struggle against society’s class system for socialist revolution.

Rosa Luxemburg, Alexandra Kollontai and Emma Goldman put the foundation of second wave feminism to struggle for women rights politically and privately; as Krolokke and Sorensen (2006:7) highlighted, ‘divorce, abortion, and non-legislative partnership—and against sexism both in bourgeois society and within the socialist movements.’

Both liberal and socialist/Marxist feminism continued to develop and maintain strong voices in 20th-century feminism, though they were soon challenged by other types of feminism, such as black and third-world feminisms. The concept of equal opportunity framed a particular type of equity research, which arose outside the academy in the first half of the 20th century, and gradually provided the basis for a growing field of research in ‘the women issue’. Following the scientific paradigm of structuralism as a set of ways and means of knowing, equity research initially took the basic format of muted group theory (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006:7).

The focal point of Marxist/socialist feminist explanations of women empowerment is the unequal power structure and education system in society. They are less worried about people’s attitudes, because a society of fair distribution of power would naturally reinforce its inhabitants’ positive attitude towards female equality. Marxist/socialist feminism is against capitalism and patriarchy and favours their distribution of power and
capital; because this would enable a society to raise the status of its women members. Marxist/socialist feminism perceives that the class system inherent in most societies is the main cause of women’s oppression. As Macdonald (1980: 30) put it:

Both class relations and gender relations, while they exist within their own histories, can nevertheless be so closely interwoven that it is theoretically very difficult to draw them apart within a specific historic conjuncture (cited in Williams, 1995).

However there are some differences between various Marxist/socialist feminists on the topic of women oppression’s in society because of unequal power relations within the family and then society (Williams, 1995). In both situations they witness education is the major source of capitalism that instilling class system, by exploitation of men and women workers and strengthening patriarchy.

Marxist/socialist feminists are quick to point out the essentialism of much of radical feminism (Thomas, 1990:17), and argue that there are different kinds of women’s oppression in every society of the world. However the labour market is maintaining capitalism such as low wages, harsh working conditions, and little job security (Thomas, 1990). However, women’s oppression and exploitation are common within the family and home as well. The situation in Pukhtunkhwa and in Pakistan more widely is that the labour market is male-dominated to be sure, but in Pukhtunkhwa the common cultural and social practice is to seek to decrease women’s participation in the labour market, to discourage them from working outside home, and to increase their dependency on men. (I will discuss this further in Section II: Disparity in Socio-economic Status).

Women’s liberation activists joined Marxist/socialist feminism to condemn women’s dual workload at home and outside, as well as raised their voices for equal pay and work. Simultaneously they, demanded single-sex educational institutes and workplaces too. Sheila Rowbotham, in *Women, Resistance, and Revolution* (1972), and Angela Y. Davis, in *Women, Race, and Class* (1981) expanded on the intersections of gender, race, and class (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006). In addressing what they saw as ‘the woman question,’ they concluded that the emancipation of women would occur only with the destruction of capitalism and the rise of socialism, when women would be freed from dependency on men and the family and be involved in ‘productive’ labour. In areas such as the criticism of ‘sex roles’ and ‘the beauty myth’, however, women’s liberation was closer to liberal feminism, which still had a strong hold (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006: 9).
In the words of Thomas that the role of education under this model is more difficult than in the other feminists’ models because education is neither simply about the transmission of certain attitudes nor about the perpetuation of patriarchy (Thomas, 1990:37).

Traditional Marxist/socialist explanations such as that of Althusser (1971), Bowles and Gintis (1976) and, more recently, Hill (2004, 2006) have seen education’s role as reproducing the relations of dominance and subordination necessary to the maintenance of the capitalist state. Neo-Marxist explanations (Willis, 1981; Apple, 1982; Giroux, 1983a,b) have moved away from a deterministic model towards a looser one which emphasises hegemony and cultural resistance. Wolpe (1978) took it further in her article, ‘Education and the sexual division of labour’, she argue that changes in the labour process have resulted in a disjunction between the skills taught by the education system and the skills (or in a sense, lack of skills) demanded in the labour market (cited in Thomas, 1990:39). As a result schools and colleges feel the pressure of conflicting demands: for example, girls are free to choose to study the natural or physical sciences, but forcibly push towards Home Economics to prepare them to become good wives and mothers. Similarly, hidden curriculums in educational settings and teachers’ attitudes in the classroom also reinforce stereotypical female roles in society.

However, Williams (1995:57) criticises state policy in this regard as representing the contradictory interests of patriarchy and capitalism which respectively reinforce women’s roles as carers within the family and low-paid workers outside it. She further argues that there is a need to challenge this by demanding socialisation of caring and reorganisation of sexual division of labour and division between paid and unpaid work. However, with reference to the specific society under consideration, the state policy is failed in both aspect of demand (by providing infrastructure of education and job market) and supply (increasing women’s participation in education and work forces).

Barrett (1984) analysed that education is a clear entity of state policy, and endorses class and the class system among people. I agree with Barrett’s analysis that education is the entity of the state policy because in Pakistan, the dual education system (state schools, Urdu medium and private schools, English medium) are producing a de facto class system. This class system can be seen in the Pakistani society where the students of state schools make up a low-income working class who do low-income jobs—this, in turn, provides them with only limited access to their fundamental needs and entry in to higher education. On the other hand, the private schools produce a high-income capitalist/elite class which has all the necessary means to live a luxury life and has easy access to higher education that prepares them for high-income jobs. This duality of the education system and its reinforcing of the class system in society is one of the research questions explored by this study.
Barrett’s (1984, cited in Thomas, 1990) thesis described four levels of how gender relations are reproduced in the school environment: the first is that of ideology, where girls and boys are socialised into appropriate feminine and masculine behaviours; the second is that of structure and organisation, where the majority of head teachers and heads of departments are men while women are employed at the lower grades of the teaching profession.

While this was very true in past times that school structure and organisation was unequal, in recent years there has been a rise in the number of women who have taken of leadership roles in schools, especially in primary schools, where most of the head teachers are women (TDA, 2012). According to TDA (2012) there was a 35% increase in women secondary school heads during the past decade. 70% of the teaching workforce is women while 67% of head and deputy head posts occupied by women. It is evidence from the existing figures that despite comprising 60% of the British workforce, women occupied only one in eight (12.5 %) senior management positions in the top 100 British companies (TDA, 2012). However, in Pakistan where all the government schools are single-gender, the percentage of female teachers is 37.4% in primary, 33.7% secondary and 17% in higher education (Khattak, 2012). The ratio of women is less than half of the ratio of men, despite the fact that the teaching profession is highly encouraged for women in Pakistan due to the segregated educational environment.

The third level at which gender relations are reproduced consists of those mechanisms which channel pupils into a sexual division of labour: as said earlier, boys are encouraged to study science and technology, while girls are encouraged to study the arts. As mentioned earlier Pakistani parents want their daughters to marry, not to study long professional courses that would delay their marriage.

The fourth level at which gender relations are reproduced is that of the definition of legitimate knowledge: what is often taught as neutral and objective is in fact are Eurocentric and sexist (however, Barrett rejects the relativism of many feminists and argues that an objective, neutral knowledge is possible) (Thomas, 1990:24).

Thomas (1990: 27) further strengthens my argument and wrote that ‘in a sense, ‘Barrett’s analysis is remarkable because it is so unremarkable’ and further commented; while her theoretical analysis of the interrelationships of gender and class at the general level may be controversial, few feminists would disagree with her comments about education. Her comments about subject specialisation may even have more in common with traditional liberal approaches (i.e. girls are ‘channelled’ into the arts) than with the approach of radical feminists who see science as inherently masculine.
Arnot (1981: 13, cited in Thomas, 1990) critiques the differing views of women argued by diverse feminist approaches, for example Marxist-feminists and the cultural (liberal or radical) groups. She believes that they both present an ‘overly determined view of women’. The former view she believes, sees women being doubly affected by capitalism and the patriarchal nature of the society in which they live, whilst the liberal and radical groups cultural approach see women as ‘over-socialised’. The Marxist-feminists see schools as producing gender as well as class inequality, whereas the liberal and radical groups regard schools as the cause of the problem but also a possible solution. Arnot (1981) further suggests that a combination of the two perspectives would be better, as it could explore the whole picture of girls’ experiences in education and how children confront and tackle the dual powers of class and gender. This synthesis, the bringing back of agency and resistance into Marxist analysis was a feature of the Gramscian neo-Marxism, the capacity for resistance against capitalist (and patriarchal and racist) ideological hegemony, the ‘naturalisation’ of capitalist exploitation and racist and sexist oppression. This ‘resistance theory’ Marxism, termed ‘neo-Marxism’, developed in the 1980s, and was exemplified by the work of Paul Willis (1977), Michael Apple (1982) and Henry Giroux (1983a, b).

Marxist/socialist feminist analysis is useful in analysing the class system in Pukhtunkhwa society and its effect on the education system. It focuses on differences of social class and the social class related impacts in Pukhtunkhwa society of patriarchal oppression. Marxist/socialist feminism emphasises that patriarchy impacts more severely, more oppressively, on the poor rather than the rich. The rich have enough money to provide food and education for their children while the poor are struggling to meet their basic needs. Marxist/socialist feminism within an Islamic framework needs to recognise the importance of charity within Islam. Islam does not believe in or recommend equality of power or equality in the distribution of wealth. Allah clearly said in the Quran that I have created you in different groups and sects to be recognised and tested. It is worth noting, however, that if the rich people in Pakistan society were to pay their Zakah (an Arabic word for charity) every year at the prescribed amount of 2.5% of their saving income, there would not be such a big gap between the rich and the poor. However, Islam’s denial of the distribution of equal power and wealth in society poses some problems in synthesising Marxist/socialist feminist analysis and Islamic feminist analysis, which are addressed below. My aim is to use Marxist/socialist feminist analysis: the distribution of economic class in the sample used will further provide a basis to theorise about the effect of economic class and poverty on the higher education system of Pukhtunkhwa. Regarding the Zakah, this act of charity, it needs pointing out, does not contradict Marxist/socialist feminism, because the acts of charity, equivalent in some ways to Western philanthropy, for Marxists, would be seen as only slightly ameliorating class exploitation and oppression, rather than addressing (and seeking to replace) capitalism. Muslim acts of charity do not seek to replace capitalism.
Radical Feminism

In early 1960s and early 1970s saw the women’s liberation movement of radical feminism. Second-wave feminism is exclusively dominated by radical feminists. Their argument was against patriarchy and male domination (Williams, 1995). This popular movement was for women empowerment and emancipation, so we heard strong radical voices in the second-wave of feminism. The 1980s and 1990s saw another vital differentiation of second-wave feminism, the debate about their skin colour and third-world women.

The 1960s to 1970s produced many of the expressions that have become household words in the United States: ‘Sisterhood is powerful’, ‘consciousness raising’, ‘the personal is political’, ‘the politics of housework’, the ‘pro-woman line’, and so on. Key to this branch of feminism was a strong belief that women could collectively empower one other (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006:9).

Radical second-wave feminism was divided into two groups of thinkers: neo-Marxists and psychoanalysts, as summarized by Juliet Mitchell (1970) in The Subjection of Women and Shulamith Firestone in The Dialectic of Sex: The Case for Feminist Revolution (1970) (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006:9). Their main argument was patriarchy and differences of race and class society are responsible measures of women unequal power position. However biological disparity is more middle-class phenomena.

The Freudian theory of women’s ‘natural’ dependency and sexual frigidity was at first denounced, then later rearticulated as a mimicry of the unholy alliance between capitalism and patriarchy that designates sexism as the particular character of women’s oppression (Mitchell, 1970; cited in Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006).

The radical feminist paradigm further claims that education is a diffusion of men’s knowledge and experiences that we learn in our schools. Thus, this unfair knowledge has no value and should not be taught in educational settings (Thomas, 1990). Spender (1982) strongly supported this point and argued:

Men have provided us with a false picture of the world, not just because their view is so limited, but because they have insisted that their limited view is the total view (Spender, 1982:16; cited in Thomas, 1990).

A specific example is provided by the Textbook Board of Pakistan which has branches throughout the country and aims to produce quality textbooks up to BA/BSc levels. One can observe the same themes of male-domination and supremacy as well as the subordination of women as the hidden messages across all subjects in their curriculum (Isani and Virk, 2007). Curriculum design and the content of textbooks are strong
contributors to the perpetuation of gender discrimination in the education system. This has been noted in previous studies (Malik and Courtney, 2011; Mattu and Hussain, 2004). Dean (2007) states that the existing textbooks are full of gender marginalisation and discrimination, active strong masculine roles for men and weak inferior roles for women, to show them as more passive. Gender bias, of course, is not limited to schools; it is also evident at college and university levels (Thomas, 1990).

The impression gained is one of the women’s inferiority, her domesticity, her lack of intelligence, ability, sense of adventure of creativity (OECD 2006: 14).

It is evident from the above report that the appearance of women in the textbooks is very minimal or else they are portrayed as doing invaluable activities. In other words, Pakistan’s patriarchal society is conveying the message that men are superior and should dominate and rule society while women should serve them. Radical feminists (Acker, 1989; Francis and Skelton, 2005) have found in studies that men (teachers or students) in educational institutes tend to trivialise women’s ideas and experiences.

Radical feminists see the put-downs and discrimination experienced by girls as the means by which men control women, and by which boys control girls. From this point of view, women are oppressed and victimised; they are not simply the unlucky recipients of prejudice (Thomas, 1990:14).

As schooling is a part of gender discrimination, radical feminists do not accept the idea of increased women ratio into higher education. Spender remarks:

Such superficial analyses and solutions are not only insulting to women, they also ignore the distribution of power in society and the academic world, and the way in which males have appropriated and defended that power (Spender, 1982: 110, cited in Thomas, 1990).

However I argue that unless a woman knows her rights, strengths and weaknesses, how she would be able to compete in this superficial world of men? Higher education is a tool of empowerment and emancipation for women (Malik and Courtney, 2011). It is not a solution to leave the ground to men; the best way is to persistently struggle and do not give up. However Spender and Thomas’s solution is to separate women and men in all fields of life, because when men see successful women in the education system, they try to trap her in a vicious circle and try different strategies to impede her. They suggest that women must make their own education, their own rules, and their own society. Nevertheless, this is problematic in the male dominated society of Pukhtunkhwah: women are impelled to support this male domination because without male support and agreement, a woman cannot move on in her society. The male is the head of the family unit, so all the family members are bound to obey and respect him. Similarly Hussain
(1995) found that permission of the male head for women to enter higher education means a guarantee of his financial support for the women.

This study emphasises that we not only need dramatic social change in our society but also to change women’s own thinking. Challenging culture and patriarchy will not happen unless women break their own silence and ask for their rights. Higher education has that strength that could empower women. Malik and Courtney (2011), for example, recognised higher education as an instrument for social change and women’s empowerment. They further argued that engagement in higher education equips women with the knowledge that will form the basis of their economic independence. Attainment of these achievements brings with it an increased status and recognition from their family and the wider community (Malik and Courtney, 2011: 41). However a question arises here: how do we prepare the ground for women’s smooth entry into higher education? My study will give the answer of this and similar questions.

Islamic Feminism

Third-wave feminists (1990s onwards) demanded more opportunities for women without sexism. They motivated feminist theorists to develop their own theory of honour and politics and uncompromising thinking. In this wave, we saw the rise of Islamic feminism. Margot Badran, a prominent Islamic feminist writes;

first I came across the term ‘Islamic feminist’ in the works of Muslims such as in Teheran’s journal ‘Shanan’ founded in 1992 and the book ‘Feminism and Islam’ published in 1996 by Mai Yamani, a Saudi Arabian author. The term appeared in Turkey, South Africa, and other corners of the Muslim world (Badran, 2002:17).

Currently, the goal of Islamic feminists is to support and articulate gender equality is compulsory in the Quran. Islamic feminism mainly stresses the re-reading of the Quran with a female perspective—something that is sometimes called the scholarship of activism (Afshar, 2000).

In third-wave feminism, there are more debates about the effects of globalization and of previous feminist theory and the politics of unequal power relations in society. Women’s oppression is evident in research into third world politics and discussed in postcolonial and third-wave feminism. The third-wave feminism is more concerned than previous feminisms with making coalitions with black, diasporic, subaltern and Islamic feminisms, in a general attempt to offer new critical global perspectives and platforms for women’s emancipation and empowerment.
Islamic feminism describes the ways that Muslim women live in their patriarchal culture and how they balance their women-hood, self-effacement, with the challenges of modernisation, changing perceptions of femininity, and the power of women in wider pluralist settings of the Muslim world (Contractor, 2010).

This feminism is usually grounded in the Islamic beliefs of these women and at the same time is underpinned by the Western socio-cultural milieux of many Muslim women (Contractor 2010: 23).

Islamic feminism challenges the patriarchy and patriarchal interpretations of the Quran and Sunnah; however, they are in favour of men supporting them to achieve their goal of equal rights. They challenge the stereotypical woman’s role in society and give the example of Ayisha (RA), one of the wives of the prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him), who was a great scholar and teacher of Quran and Hadiths in the 7th century AD. Thus this feminism, like radical feminism, is a dual struggle against the existence—indeed, their salience—of patriarchy in Muslim communities and is also against widely held secular suspicions of visible religiosity (Contractor, 2010:76). Islamic feminists do not categorise the issues of women’s subordination and oppression with socio-economic or class differences like Marxist feminists do. Islamic feminism encourages women’s knowledge of Islam as well as contemporary knowledge or education. To empower Muslim women and challenge the existing patriarchal interpretation of Islam, both contemporary and Islamic education must enable them to convey their argument for or against patriarchy.

Similarly, Yamani (2006) and Karmi (2006) argue that Islam in Muslim societies is a hard, patriarchal religion that dictates a conservative view of cultured-Islam and far away from the original Islam. That is one of the key arguments of this study too—that the culture and traditions of the Pukhtunkhwah society is over-dominated by patriarchal values and by centuries-old customs. Pukhtun culture is effectively training men and women to be commodities of patriarchal culture, and is structuring the pattern of women’s lives to be subordinate. Within these cultural and social patterns, women have very few chances for social mobility. This not only creates hurdles impeding women’s primary education but also their overall development (Naz, et al., 2011). This study examines the possibilities for redefining culture and religious discourses for Pukhtunkhwah women, where their rights should not by exploited in the name of religion or culture.

Therefore Islamic feminists (Yamani, 2006; Wadud, 2000; Afshar, 2000; Mernissi, 2001) condemn all forms of inequality against women in the name of Islam, because gender inequalities in Muslim societies are cultural reproductions that must be eliminated through higher education.
Mohanty (1998) argues that Muslim women are always portrayed in the west as powerless and oppressed in western academia. Therefore western feminists are using the images of third world women as objects in their studies; as victim that need their help. In western feminists’ theories, Asian, and particularly Muslim, women are depicted as powerless individuals who need to be guided by western feminism in order to become politically mature. It is unrealistic to view all women or all Muslims as a homogenous group, ignoring the historical and cultural differences between them (Darvishpour, 2003).

I am suggesting here that Islamic feminism should be considered and developed as an alternative feminism, a feminism that, together with Marxist feminism and its recognition of the importance of class location in women’s oppression, can facilitate women’s emancipation in Islamic countries. Western and Islamic feminists do not consider religion an impediment to gender equality in education. They do not consider how women’s’ own thinking should be changed and how women silence themselves. Islamic feminism as it currently stands is originally a product of those Muslim feminists who have accessed higher education and have attained high positions in western societies.

As advanced in the introduction to this thesis, some of the secular Islamic feminists (Wadud, 2000; Afshar, 2006; Mernissi, 2001, El-Saadawi, 2008) have challenged and criticised verses of the Quran and rejected the possibility of religion bringing about, or helping to bring about, gender equality. One possible explanation for this is they are not living in Muslim cultures and societies; they are living in the peaceful societies of the west where they enjoy freedom of speech and writing. It would be impossible to make such a bold argument within an Islamic society such as in Pukhtunkhwa. Therefore in my analysis and evaluation, I have divided Islamic feminism in to two groups: liberal Islamic feminism on the one hand, and secular Islamic feminism. As for my own position, I identify most strongly with the liberal Islamic feminists and follow an original re-interpretation—rather than a masculine or feminine re-interpretation—of the Quran and Sunnah.

The problem of gender issues in Islamic discourse is different across different Muslim societies due to the diversity of their geographical, cultural and political situations. Muslim societies interpret the Quran in a way that suits their individual culture. My study attempts to explore the religious and cultural understanding of a sample group of women, women who have attained higher education, to explore whether and to what extent the impediments to women’s access to higher education in Pukhtunkhwa is cultural, and whether and to what extent it is the religion of Islam itself discourages or encouraging women to seek entry to higher education.
Conclusions

This study concluded the ways in which women are excluded from education and from holding positions of power. Male-domination across the globe therefore women have limited access to public and private life. Furthermore each of the feminisms discussed here has played a crucial role in 20th- and 21st-century feminist theory and politics, and together they constitute a source of inspiration for future scenarios. I have described the basic exchange between feminism and western philosophy that runs through these feminisms and their relationship. Where feminism will go from here is unclear, but the point is that feminism, by whatever name, is alive and well both in academia and outside of it. Some older feminists feel discouraged by the younger generation's seeming ignorance of or disregard for the struggles and achievements of the early movement. They see little progress (the pay gap has not significantly narrowed in 60 years), and are fearful that the new high-heeled, red-lipped college girls are letting us backslide. This, however, is not likely the case. There have always been feminisms in the movement, not just one ideology, and there have always been tensions, points and counterpoints. The political, social and intellectual feminist movements have always been chaotic, multivalenced, and disconcerting, and let's hope they continue to be so; it's a sign that they are thriving.

End Notes

3 These words are believed to have derived from a Proto-Indo-European root gen-, which is also the source of ‘kin’, ‘kind’, ‘king’, and many other English words. This is also the root of the modern French in the word ‘genre’ (type, kind) and is related to the Greek root ‘gen-’ (to produce), which is the root of ‘gene’, ‘genesis’, and ‘oxygen’. As a verb, it means ‘to breed’. Most uses of the root ‘gen’ in Indo-European languages refer either directly to biological characteristics at birth or to natural, innate qualities and social distinctions (such as ‘gentry’, ‘generation’, ‘gentile’, ‘genocide’)(Quoted from https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gender#Feminism_theory_and_gender_studies [accessed 30/04/2009].
4 Cited in Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006: 21
5 (Cited in Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006:7)
References


Informal Discussion with the Director of Education (Colleges) (Pukhtunkhwah 17th March 2008 at Peshawar.


---

**Shabana Shamaas Gul Khattak** is Postdoctoral Visiting Scholar in the Centre for the Study of Pakistan, SOAS (School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London).
Gender Differences In University Students’ Attitude Towards Gender Roles

Subha Malik & Madiha Nadeem
Department of Gender and Development Studies
Lahore College for Women University

Farhat Nadeem
Institute of Psychology
Beaconhouse National University

Abstract

Gender role attitudes indicate the dynamics of gender relations in any society. As gender equality is now considered an important indicator of development for any country. Therefore, it is imperative to comprehend the societal especially youth acuity towards gender roles in a culture. This paper examined the university students’ attitude towards gender roles by employing Gender Roles Attitude Scale (Zeyneloglu & Terzioglu, 2011). The objective was to understand whether the attitude of youth towards gender role was egalitarian or traditional. For this purpose, a survey was conducted by taking a sample of 513 respondents conveniently from various universities of Lahore, both descriptive and inferential statistics data were used for data analyses. The results revealed significant gender differences in respondents’ perception, as male students’ approach towards gender roles was found more egalitarian than females. Furthermore, residential cities and socioeconomic background of respondents’ parents was found important in shaping their approach towards gender roles. Findings suggested that parents’ role in the socialization of children may be deemed first critical step towards nurturing gender sensitized society along with the incorporation of gender aspects in academic curriculum across the discipline at the different educational level in Pakistan. Moreover, government and social activists may advocate gender sensitivity by using various programs and policies.

Keywords: Gender Roles, Attitude, Belief, Residence, Family.

تلميح

(Translation)

جنسیتی رول افکاد اسکال استفاده شده توسط Zeyneloglu & Terzioglu (2011) برای اندازه‌گیری نگرش دانشجویان دانشگاهی به مربوطه کار می‌نماید. هدف این پژوهش محاسبه آیا نگرش دانشجویان به مربوطه کار جنسیتی برای وضعیت جنسیتی مساوی یا سنتی است. به این منظور، یک نمونه 513 نفر از دانشجویان مختلف دانشگاه‌های لاہور بر اساس مکان زندگی و نسبت به پدرانتان، به مطالعه کاربردی و تحلیلی احتمالات داده‌ها و کاربرد آن‌ها برای تجزیه داده‌ها به کار گرفته شده است. نتایج نشان دادند وجود اختلافات جنسیتی در نگرش زبان کنونی، به طوری که نگرش جنسیتی دانشجویان مردان به مربوطه کار جنسیتی مساوی‌تری نسبت به زنان بود. علاوه بر این، شهریات مجتمع و نسبت به پدرانتان، می‌توانند نقش مهمی در شکل‌دهی نگرش به مربوطه کار جنسیتی داشته باشند. نتایج نشان دادند نقش پدرانتان در تربیت اجتماعی کودکان باید در نظر گرفته شود، همراه با شکل‌دهی محتوای جنسیتی در کناره‌اندیشی در تمامی مراکز آموزشی در پاکستان. همچنین، دولت و نشات‌های مثبت جنسیتی می‌توانند تنها با استفاده از برنامه‌های مختلف و سیاست‌ها، این نشانه را در جامعه به طور سنتی تروجت‌جویی کنند.)
Introduction

In Pakistan, gender relations and roles are considered to have deep roots of religion principles and political discourses in different governments and used these principles to define these roles (Shaheed, 2010). Additionally, these are based on the notions of production and reproduction, and certain masculine and feminine traits (Ali & Gavino, 2008; Mahmood & Sultan, 2006) derived from social values and tradition created and nurtured by patriarchal ideology (Zaman et al., 2006 & Bari, 2000). Therefore, socio-cultural system run by patriarchal forces established gender relation and hierarchies contrary to the concept of women empowerment (Jamal, 2015).

Moreover, gender seems to play key role in determining the sexual division of labor in the public and private life in Pakistan. Consequently, the difference in the status of women can be witnessed in terms of classes, development and socioeconomic background, which leads them towards a systematic internalized subordinate position in society as dominant norms in culture recognize the earning role of men as more superior over the role of women in the private sphere (Bari, 2000).

Thus, determination of gender roles and attitudes of any society towards them directly affects the life experiences of people such as aspects of conjugal and family affairs, occupational processes and segregation, and other social relationships. In this regard, holding a conventional belief about gender role fosters the perpetuation of gender discrimination in the fields of education, politics, work and other areas (Ridgeway, 1997).

Like in Pakistan, more than half of the women’s population does not have access to the basic education, whereas only a limited number of women are financially independent. The majority of them are confined to their homes to do household chores and are excluded from decision making (Rabbani, et al., 2008).
In spite of the fact that the Constitution of Pakistan supports equal rights for the welfare and advancement of women (Mahmood & Shaukat, 2006), the rights of women have always been violated in Pakistan. The subordinate and vulnerable image of Pakistani women signifies deeply embedded patriarchy in the society. According to report of Gallup (2009) politics, education, employment, and other important areas of life are still dominated by men. This reflects on the rigid gender divide in the Pakistani society. Even though, emancipation and empowerment have always been documented in many policies and laws, but still a lot needs to be done to achieve women empowerment (Weiss, 2012). Global Gender Gap Report (2016) revealed, Pakistan ranks 143 out of 144 countries in the gender inequality index. The report highlighted the progress towards gender equality in education, health, economy and politics, however, the status of the wage gap and the literacy rate between men and women is not found satisfactory.

By exploring the negative consequences of having traditional gender roles, researchers highlighted that strictly following the conventional gender roles can have negative effects on children as these stereotypical beliefs can restrict their drives and development in education, profession and other fields of life (Liben, et al., 2002). Furthermore, adherence to these roles limit their ability to think about alternatives and explore their future potential beyond the socially constructed boundaries (Rainey & Rust, 1999).

Mokhtari & Enayat (2011) explored the social settings and conditions, which shape the common attitude about men and women and consequently lead to the formation of gender roles (Bazik, 2011). Similarly, researchers studied various demographic factors which may influence gender role attitudes, such as age, gender, race, education, and marital status, parents’ educational level and mother’s occupational status; and other variables such as political affiliation and religious beliefs (Beyerlein, 2007; Davis, 2007 & Kiani et al., 2009). Bryant (2003) found no relationship between age and egalitarian attitude of the respondents. Socio-economic factors of the family were also studied as one of the important factors which may affect gender role attitudes in children. Antill et al., (2003) found that children having an economically sound family are more likely to have egalitarian gender roles. Similarly, Fan & Marini (2000) explained that mothers’ working status was linked with the development of egalitarian gender role attitude in their children in later life.

Additionally, Kiani et al., (2009) highlighted the role of biological and psychosocial factors such as attitude of parents and the influence of social media in constructing gender role attitudes. Khamse (2003) argues that some families nurture their children through reinforcing flexible attitudes. Therefore, attitude about gender roles is transmitted across generation. Farré & Vella (2013) explored the importance of family size and found that people living in larger families are more likely to have traditional gender role attitudes. Other studies exploring gender differences in gender role attitudes reported that
female students were less likely to believe in traditional gender role attitudes than male students (Keith & Jacqueline, 2002; Kimberly & Mahaffy 2002).

Previous literature reported that women have made more progress in adoption of egalitarian gender roles than men, whereas shift in men's roles, especially in the household is not changing in the same trend. (Thornton & Young-DeMarco, 2001; Riley, 2003). Verick (2014) discussed that transformation in gender roles brings the shift in traditional family set up where the female participates in the labor force. Esplen (2006) indicated that a small number of males is now accepting the changing trends in gender roles of women in developing economies. They are open for change in gender roles. Similarly, various researchers reported that gender role attitudes are changing over time (Moen, et al., 1997 & Verick, 2014).

Although studies conducted to investigate college students' behavior, perception and qualities are available; however, very few have focused on the concepts and beliefs of youth or university students towards gender roles. As discussed, gender roles are not fixed, therefore changes in society can influence the perceptions of youth to accept or challenge the existing norms and gender relations. Lueptow, et al., (1995) found otherwise in their study. They found that even in the case of changing social structure, gender stereotypes were still found in college students.

In this scenario, it is important to study the possibility of these transformations in Pakistan and perception of youth about it. Young women and men are the ones in any country who are supposed to run the country in future, and their belief about gender roles will shape their family patterns and career goals (Thornton and Young-DeMarco, 2001).

**Review of Literature**

Formation of gender within the society set different patterns of behavior and expectation for both men and women (Van Hoven & Hopkins, 2009 and Zahra et al., 2013). Dökmen (2004) described gender roles as responsibilities, manners and behavior assigned by society to women and men. A demonstration of gender roles also indicates major differences in the choices and opportunities available to men and women in their public and private lives (Akin & Demirel 2003 & Dökmen 2004). It is observed that variation in gender role attitudes exists widely and has been debated in different contexts. In this regard, the most debated perspective is; traditional versus egalitarian gender role attitudes. The traditional gender role ideology is based on patriarchy and gender based division of labor (Peplau, et al., 1993) whereas, egalitarian gender role ideology advocates for gender equality and rejects the conventional gender norms related to gender roles (Zeyneloğlu & Terziöglü, 2011).
Theoretical debate maintains gender role attitudes as outcomes of concepts and behavior transmitted, imparted and demonstrated in childhood that establish bases of engaging in private and professional relationships (Martin, 1995; Martin & Halverson, 1981). Therefore, gender role attitudes are often considered as a stable concept in later life, but role theory proposes that development of roles is a continuous process of reexamining and assessing self and others grounded on personal interaction, experiences and changes in understanding and thinking (Thornton & Nardi, 1975). Research has shown that gender role attitudes are considered to remain stable, but may be transformed in the context of individual social experiences such as college life, marital relations, child birth, and changes in the workplace (Bryant, 2003; Fan & Marini, 2000; Lucier-Greer & Adler-Baeder, 2011). Different experiences in life provide opportunities for learning, development and perhaps changes in assigned social roles and behavior, so gender role attitudes may not be stable or fixed.

Likewise, the social role theory explains that division of labor and the stereotypical social roles influence the behavior of men and women regarding their adoption of roles (Eagly, 1987). Thus, it would be assumed that people with more traditional beliefs about gender roles are less likely to engage in roles defined beyond societal norms.

Gender role attitudes have also been recognized as indicators for decision making processes and behavior (Davis & Greenstein, 2009; Vespa, 2009), possibilities and potential of future labor force participation in different activities such as getting higher education, choices for profession and job market participation (Corrigall & Konrad, 2007; Crocket & Beal, 2012; Davis & Pearce, 2007). So gender role attitudes determine the academic and social prospects in any society, it is therefore important to understand the dynamics of gender roles in future generation. Gaining insights regarding the youth attitude can lead to interventions to inculcate the gender egalitarian attitude in future generation.

Increasingly, social scientists and researchers are exploring the different potential of young population living in developing countries. In this regard limited literature might be seen regarding gender role attitudes among youth living in developing and known as patriarchal countries compared with developed countries, where theories of gender socialization and identity formation have been widely studied and published.

In Pakistan, gender roles are slowly transforming and men are found to report more traditional gender role attitudes than women. Furthermore, professional and people with higher education are found to have an egalitarian gender role attitude compared to others (Ahmad & Kamal, 2000; Khan, & Sabir, 1993). The present socioeconomic and political conditions in Pakistan are controlled by patriarchy and capitalism; however, various national and international initiatives have been taken by the government for the last two
decades. These efforts have at least resulted in, visibility of women in almost every field of life; however, a lot needs to be done to achieve the target of gender equality.

The question which arises here is whether young people in Pakistan adhere to the traditional or egalitarian gender role attitude. As discussed, males are presumed to be dominating in their relations with women, whereas women are expected to be generally submissive to men following social norms and roles given by society to them. In this context, following study examined the gender roles among university students in Lahore.

**Objectives**

- To examine the gender role attitudes of university students whether it has traditional or egalitarian orientation
- To study the factors which might contribute in shaping the gender role attitudes of students.

**Method**

A comparative study was conducted to examine the attitude of university students regarding gender roles in Lahore, Punjab Province by carrying out a cross sectional survey. As the purpose was to study the gender role pattern of university students it required accessing large number of students enrolled in different discipline in universities so a close ended questionnaire was used in a cross sectional study design.

**Sample**

The population of this study was the university students of Lahore city. For this purpose, a sample of 513 respondents aged between 18 to 25 years was conveniently selected from four (public and private) universities of Lahore. This sample selection was guided by following the estimated trend of students enrollment in different disciplines of university programs. Additionally, the selected tool has 38 items, so 14 students against each item was selected. Overall 532 questionnaires were distributed, out of which 513 respondents responded. Additionally, 266 males and 266 females were selected out of which 262 males and 251 female students responded.

**Instrument**

Data was collected by using Gender Roles Attitude Scale (Zeyneloğlu & Terzioglu, 2011). This tool consists of 38 items which covers the five sub scales of gender roles (egalitarian gender roles, female gender roles, marriage gender roles, traditional gender roles and male gender roles). The author of the scale clarifies that egalitarian attitude has further sub-scales named female gender roles and egalitarian gender roles, for example;
“decision to have a child should be made by both spouses in a marriage”. Similarly, marriage gender roles, traditional gender roles and male gender roles are the sub scales of traditional attitudes” for instance, “The head of the household is man”. The instrument’s total Cronbach alpha internal consistency coefficient of this tool is 0.92. The instrument is developed to score on a 5-point Likert scale. Higher scores on this scale indicate egalitarian attitudes towards gender roles and the lower scores indicate a traditional attitude towards gender roles.

Additionally, information about demographic variables including; gender, age, residential area, educational discipline and enrolled program, religion, caste, family type and socioeconomic status of parents was also collected.

**Procedure and Data Analysis**

Data was collected after taking permission from universities administration and informed consent from students. Moreover, anonymity and confidentiality of respondents’ information were completely ensured. T-test, ANOVA and Correlation were used for analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table: 1</th>
<th>Demographic Information of participants (N = 513)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Variable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-22</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-26</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Area</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Cities</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic Discipline</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Sciences</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied Sciences</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management Sciences</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanities and Arts</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Sciences /Engineering</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLB</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Academic Program**          |     |      |
| Bachelors                     | 430 | 83.8 |
| Masters                       | 76  | 14.8 |
| LLB                           | 7   | 1.4  |

| **Family Type**               |     |      |
| Nuclear                       | 339 | 66.1 |
| Joint                         | 174 | 33.9 |

| **Father’s Income**           |     |      |
| High Income                   | 148 | 28.8 |
| Middle Income                 | 138 | 26.9 |
| Small Income                  | 197 | 38.4 |
| Missing Information           | 30  | 5.8  |

| **Fathers’ Education**        |     |      |
| Below Matric                  | 46  | 9.0  |
| Matriculation                 | 71  | 13.8 |
| Intermediate                  | 96  | 18.7 |
| Bachelor                      | 165 | 32.2 |
| Masters /Above                | 135 | 26.3 |

| **Mother’s Income**           |     |      |
| High Income                   | 6   | 1.2  |
| Middle Income                 | 8   | 1.6  |
| Small Income                  | 30  | 5.8  |
| Missing Information           | 469 | 91.4 |

| **Mothers’ Education**        |     |      |
| Below Matric                  | 511 | 99.6 |
| Matric                        | 1   | .2   |
| Intermediate                  | 1   | .2   |
| Bachelor                      | 0   | 0    |
| Masters /Above                | 0   | 0    |

| **Enrollment Reasons**        |     |      |
| Gender                        | 74  | 14.4 |
| Family Pressure               | 97  | 18.9 |
Results

The results overall, showed that more than half, 69.0% of the respondents’ attitude toward gender role positioned between egalitarian and traditional gender roles, whereas 16.8% showed egalitarian attitude and 14.2% showed traditional attitude towards gender roles. The range of scores of gender role attitude was 77-158 against a possible range of 38-190 and the mean score was 119.39 with standard deviation 13.60.

Pearson’s correlation coefficient was calculated to study relationship between participants’ age, gender, father’s education, mother’s education, and dimensions of gender roles attitude. The results showed a significant direct relationship of age, father’s education and mother’s education with egalitarian gender role attitude. A significant direct relationship of gender was observed with egalitarian and marriage gender role. It indicates that women exhibited significantly higher egalitarian gender role attitude.

Table 2

Pearson’s Correlation between Study Variables (N=513)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-.22**</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.13**</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>.09*</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-.09*</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>.36**</td>
<td>.10**</td>
<td>-.08</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEdu</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.15**</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>-.00</td>
<td>.13**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEdu</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.11**</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>-.01</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egali</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.13**</td>
<td>.17**</td>
<td>.16**</td>
<td>.43**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradi</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.40**</td>
<td>.40**</td>
<td>.25**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.35**</td>
<td>.21**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.43**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: For Gender, 0=men, 1=women; FEdu=Father’s Education, MEdu= Mother’s Education, Egali=Egalitarian Gender Role, Tradi=Traditional Gender Role, Female=Female Gender Role, Male= Male Gender Role, Marriage= Marriage Gender Role

* p<.05, ** p < .01
Independent samples t test was applied to identify gender differences in gender role attitudes. It was observed that men scored significantly higher on egalitarian, traditional and marriage gender roles as compared to women. The results are shown in Table 3.

Table: 3
Independent sample t-test measuring gender differences in the attitude of egalitarian, traditional, female, male and marriage gender role scores (N=513)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender Role</th>
<th>Men (n = 262)</th>
<th>Women (n = 251)</th>
<th>t(df)</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egalitarian</td>
<td>29.56 (4.79)</td>
<td>24.56 (7.76)</td>
<td>8.82</td>
<td>.000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>25.91 (4.83)</td>
<td>24.91 (4.36)</td>
<td>2.44</td>
<td>.015*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>25.22 (4.11)</td>
<td>24.53 (3.86)</td>
<td>1.94</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>18.53 (4.71)</td>
<td>18.53 (3.68)</td>
<td>-0.09</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage</td>
<td>22.98 (4.21)</td>
<td>23.90 (5.08)</td>
<td>-2.23</td>
<td>.026*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 shows differences in gender role attitudes across area of living. It is evident that participants belonging to urban area (Lahore) scored significantly higher on marriage gender role attitude as compared to residents of other areas.

Table: 4
Independent samples t-test comparing gender roles attitudes across Area of living (N = 513)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender Role</th>
<th>Lahore (n = 468)</th>
<th>Others (n = 45)</th>
<th>t(df)</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egalitarian</td>
<td>27.07 (6.93)</td>
<td>27.55 (6.37)</td>
<td>-.443</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>25.52 (4.60)</td>
<td>24.42 (4.82)</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>24.97 (3.98)</td>
<td>23.97 (4.19)</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>18.62 (4.32)</td>
<td>17.57 (3.122)</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage</td>
<td>23.56 (4.65)</td>
<td>22.06 (4.78)</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>.04*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Type of family did not account for change in gender role attitudes as shown in the Table 5 below.
Findings related to role of mother’s working status in gender role attitude revealed differences for marriage gender role attitude only (Table 6). It was observed that children of working mothers exhibited more egalitarian marriage gender role as compared to children of non-working mothers. However, for other dimensions of gender role attitudes, insignificant differences were observed.

One way Analysis of Variance was conducted to compare gender role attitudes regarding reason to choose the discipline of study. These reasons included factors related to own gender, family pressure, peer pressure, media, passion and other reasons. Table 7 shows findings of one-way ANOVA.
Table: 7
One way Analysis of Variance comparing gender role attitudes across reasons of studying in different disciplines (N = 513)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender Role Attitude</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>SS</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F (df)</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Egalitarian</td>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>6795.018</td>
<td>1359.0</td>
<td>39.391 (5, 507)</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>17491.488</td>
<td>34.500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24286.507</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>354.364</td>
<td>70.873</td>
<td>3.381 (5, 507)</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>10628.996</td>
<td>20.964</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10983.361</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>200.566</td>
<td>40.113</td>
<td>2.537 (5, 507)</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>8015.648</td>
<td>15.810</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8216.214</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>119.565</td>
<td>23.913</td>
<td>1.336 (5, 507)</td>
<td>.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>9076.154</td>
<td>17.902</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9195.719</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage</td>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>792.601</td>
<td>158.520</td>
<td>7.714 (5, 507)</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>10419.193</td>
<td>20.551</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11211.793</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The scores in students’ attitude towards egalitarian gender roles, traditional gender roles, females and marriage gender roles differed significantly across the six categories of reasons of studying in different academic disciplines, $F(5, 507)= 39.39, p<.001$, $F(5, 507)=3.38, p<.05$, $F(5, 507)=2.537, p<.05$ and $F(5, 507)=7.714, p<.001$. This was further analyzed in the post hoc Tukey’s HSD comparison. The results indicated that the students who reported their gender as main reason scored higher ($M=28.32, SD=4.55$) in egalitarian gender roles than students who mentioned other reasons ($M=16.52, SD=5.85$). Similarly, students who reported their passion as main reason scored higher ($M=26.45, SD=4.49$) in traditional gender roles than students who mentioned family pressure ($M=24.42, SD=4.28$) and others. Likewise, the results indicated that the students who reported media’s influence as main reason scored higher ($M=25.81, SD=3.50$) in female gender roles than students who reported family pressure ($M=26.06, SD=7.25$), media ($M=25.70, SD=6.51$) and others.
other reasons (M=23.27, SD=4.22). Moreover, the results indicated that the students who reported others reason scored higher (M=27.04, SD=4.06) in marriage gender roles than students who reported reasons of gender (M=23.13, SD=3.95), family pressure (M=23.06, SD=4.61), peer pressure (M=23.87, SD=4.93) and passion (M=22.53, SD=4.40).

Discussion

Findings revealed that male students showed more egalitarian as well as more traditional attitude regarding gender roles than females, whereas female students were found to believe more in marriage gender roles than males, which is overall supported by previous literature (Ahmad & Kamal, 2000; Khan, & Sabir, 1993; Lueptow, Garovich, & Lueptow, 1995) but inconsistent with the findings of Keith and Jacqueline (2002) and Kimberly and Mahaffy (2002). These findings may be due to individual differences or the influence of other factors such as media or religious affiliation as mentioned by Kiani et al. (2009).

Moreover, the results showed that respondents living in Lahore reported higher scores on belief on marriage related gender roles, which confirmed the finding of Twenge (1997) that residential area contributes to the development of gender role attitudes. Additionally, in this context, it indicates that in spite of living in a large urban city of Lahore where people have more opportunities to study higher education and avail jobs, they are still more likely to stick to traditional marriage gender roles in their private life, which highlights the need of working on the sensitization of educated people living in urban areas as well as highlighted by Ali et al. (2011).

The study also did not find significant differences in respondents’ attitude towards gender roles on the basis of their family type, which is inconsistent with the results of Farré and Vella (2013). These results may be due to the other social or individual factors beyond the scope of this study, which could be explored in the future through in-depth interviews.

Students who have working mothers are found to believe more on marriage gender roles than students having non-working mothers, which is somehow contradictory to the finding of Fan and Marini (2000)& Jan & Janssens (1998). The most possible explanation of this finding might be that in Pakistani context still society is at an evolutionary stage of accepting the working role of women especially mothers in the public domain, and working mothers have to struggle hard to maintain the balance between work and family life, although government is now facilitating by offering the enabling condition such as day care centers, flexible working hours, maternity leave etc. However, deeply rooted gendered ideology has not changed the males’ role in traditional marriage life, such as taking care of children, cooking and supporting in household chores, consequently, children have to suffer which might be the case in this study as highlighted by Thornton and Young-DeMarco (2001) & Riley (2003). Connell’s(1987) notion of gender and
power also posits that male dominated ideology of institutions in society and even in the case of family and marriage shapes acceptable norms for men by guiding them not to take care private sphere responsibilities. This causes the inequality in society.

The findings also revealed that father and mother’s education have a positive relationship with egalitarian gender role attitude. These findings are supported by various previous researchers (Antill et al., 2003; Beyerlein, 2007; Kiani et al., 2009; Marks et al., 2009). This finding indicates the changing thinking pattern of youth towards gender roles with having educated parental background. As the role of the mother is considered primarily in socializing their children about cultural values, but having educated father and mother gives their children, environment to learn the values beyond the traditional setting. These parents are more likely to spend on the well being of their family, which consequently influences their children’s beliefs about gender roles. In terms of the social role theory, when children learn about the less rigid environment in his/her surroundings, they are more likely to act accordingly in the future.

The scores in students’ attitude towards egalitarian gender roles, traditional gender roles, females and marriage gender roles differed significantly across the six categories of reasons for opting different academic disciplines. The results indicated that the students who reported their gender as main reason found to embrace more egalitarian gender role attitude than students who mentioned other reasons. Similarly, students who reported passion as main reason found to belief more on egalitarian gender roles than others. The explanation of this result highlights the need to explore it further in the future as these results might be due to different background and experiences of the respondents as stated by Mokhtari & Enayat (2011).

Limitation

In this study information about other important factors such as students’ social networks, caste, their religious and political affiliation were not probed which might have influenced gender role attitudes and could be counted as the limitations of the study. Additionally, the results of this study might be considered partial due to sample being selected from a few universities in Lahore.

Conclusions

It is concluded that socioeconomic background of parents, academic group and gender influence the development of gender roles in many unexpected ways. Determining the attitudes of university students regarding gender roles not only reflect the academic content which is being taught, but also highlights the role of parents.
Recommendations

Measures for preventing gender biases should be planned and then integrated into the country’s strategic policies and programs. Content based on egalitarian gender role can be incorporated in the curriculum of initial year of schooling in order to nurture the gender sensitized nation in the future. This study highlights the need of education for all to go towards the journey of promoting gender egalitarian attitude.

References


Gallup Pakistan Poll Findings on Gender Roles.(2009). *Gallup Pakistan*


Dr. Subha Malik is an Assistant Professor in the Department Gender and Development Studies, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore.

Ms. Madiha Nadeem is Teaching Assistant in the Department of Gender and Development Studies, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore.

Dr. Farhat Nadeem is an Assistant Professor in the Institute of Psychology, Beaconhouse National University, Lahore.
An Analysis Of Women Empowerment In Pakistan With Reference To Musharraf’s Regime

Suwaibah Qadri
Department of Political Science
University of Karachi

Sidrah Gilani
Department of Economics
University of Karachi

Paras Khurram
Department of International Relations
University of Karachi

Abstract
The term ‘women empowerment’ has now become an essential and debatable issue around the globe. In the development of a state role of women is considered as an important factor for socio-economic progress, and is essential for the growth and development of civilizations. This article studies the policies related to empower women in the ruling era of General Pervaiz Musharraf. The Islamization during Zia-ul-Haq’s regime provided strength to the roots of gender discrimination and male dominance in the society by supporting misleading concepts of Islam about control and suppression of women. The governments of post-Zia period timely understood the importance and significance of female in the development of a nation and worked positively in this direction. The empowerment of women in Mushraf’s era received enormous appreciation as he considered women empowerment as the most important factor for economically stable and progress of nation. In spite of, resistance from various social, religious and political sectors; the policies and amendments made during Musharraf’s regime to empower women had the potential to produce effective results. Due to lack of support from societal and political individuals, the preceding governments failed to implement those policies; therefore the goal of providing education, health, justice and respect cannot be fulfilled. The study suggests that better mechanism is required to implement policies for the protection of women’s rights so that they become more equally active member of the society and play their vital role in the development of the country.

Keywords: Women Empowerment, Musharaf’s Regime, Gender Equality.
Introduction

By definition, empowerment is enhancing an individuals or groups’ capability to decide and to transmute their choices into covet actions and outcomes (Afzal, Ali, Ahmad, Zafar, & Niazi, 2009). The phenomena ‘women empowerment’ has become an essential and debatable issue in the field of development. The concept of women empowerment can be explained as the amplification of a woman’s ability to make deliberate life choices in a scenario where this ability was previously denied to her (Kabeer, 1999). Wide range of indicators and dimensions are used by the World Economic Forum’s Gender Gap Index to explain women empowerment (Lopez-Claros & Zahidi, 2005). Any development roadmap which avoids the importance of enhancing the role of women cannot achieve desired socio-economic development. Thus, it is an undeniable fact that the importance of empowering women has been conceived as an integral part of the process of economic growth and social progress in the contemporary world (Chaudhry I. S., 2007).

Empowerment of women is a multifaceted process which includes many factors contributing to it. Secure work and career opportunities, provision of education, availability of health facilities, freedom to expressing opinions, share in household decision making, right to fight for justice, having access and involvement in national decisions and policy making are some of the factors that combines up to create an environment which makes a woman empowered and equally influencing as men in a society (Pearson, 2004). Women are most commonly the main caretakers of the family and more often than men spend their time and money on family and children. It has been analyzed that a woman’s empowerment tends to reduce neglected nutrition and mortality.
of the children, decreases fertility, and deepen social concerns and cares (Varkey, Kureshi, & Lesnick, 2010). Same as the health and availability of health facilities, provision of education to female masses, availability of career opportunities as equal to men, and freedom to express opinions regarding any social or political matters, all are combined up to make women in any society empowered and as equal to men (Malik & Courtney, 2011).

The concept of women empowerment emerged globally in 1970’s. International Women Year 1975, Three International Conferences on Women held in 1975, 1980 and 1985, the Decade for Women, and most noticeable Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) were all the steps to draw world’s attention toward that half of the population of the world who carries out two-thirds of its work, but receives only one-tenth of world’s total income and owned less than one-hundredth of its property in return (Chaudhary, Chani, & Pervaiz, 2012). UNDP in its Human Development Report (1995) talked about women’s empowerment by focusing on gender equality. The aforementioned report presented the strategies and means to promote gender equity and to reduce gender inequalities. This report due emphasized on women’s participation in domestic as well as national decision making. Gender-specific indices like Gender Development Index (GDI) and Gender Empowerment Measures (GEM) were also introduced this report. In 2000, almost 189 countries under the umbrella of the United Nations Organization signed the eight Millennium Development Goals, out of which, the third goal was to promote gender equality and empowerment of women (MDG3). In the same context, the World Bank Policy Research Report considered gender equality as an important policy tool for not just the well-being of women but for the progressive impact on their family and thus, the whole society (King & Andrew D, 2001). Recently, in the World Development Report (2012) of the World Bank which is mainly devoted to the Gender Equality and Development argued that the success of majors taken for global development hinges on gender equality and recommended the nations to adopt public policies that promote gender equity as a means of ensuring economic growth (Razavi, World Development Report 2012-Gender Equality and Development—An Opportunity Both Welcome and Missed, 2012). Over the last two decades, women's empowerment has become a focal point for development efforts worldwide.

Women empowerment is a critical development concern around the world, especially in developing countries like Pakistan. It is widely accepted that women empowerment is necessary for reduction in poverty, the economic and social growth specifically in developing countries (Bardhan & Klasen, 2000). Pakistan, since its independence has been facing many hurdles towards its way to development. From major economic challenges to many social as well as political issues, many factors have been affecting the smooth pace of growth of the country. Among many cultural and social issues, gender
discrimination is one of the problems of country has been facing. National and international initiatives have been taken to reduce the disparities among genders, but the idea of gender equality and women’s right hold an unequal and dissimilar position in the country. Being almost 50% of the total population, women in Pakistan are still fighting for their rights and their due share in the country.

The World Economic Forum’s global gender gap has ranked as the second worst country in the context of gender equality by being at a dismal 143 out of 144 listed countries (Express Tribune, 2016). Many religious, social and extremist activist groups or individuals have been the reason behind such biased and discriminated behavior of the country toward women even after seven decades. It is fairly appreciable to acknowledge the fact that the scenario for women in term of their basic rights, security and available opportunities in the country has changed quite a lot in the past few years, but it also important to understand and accept the root causes behind such slow progress towards a fair and non-discriminatory state for everyone. One of the major reasons of why it has always been difficult to create a social, cultural or structural change in Pakistan is the inconsistency of policies, instability and distress among the policy makers in the country. In a country where there has been political instability, military coups, dissolution of governments, etc., it is fairly understood that no policies with the aim to bring a change in the country or mindset of people have been fully successful so far. Same with the case of all the efforts for provision of women’s rights and removing gender inequalities, which have not been seen making as much change in the society as anticipated.

**Objective**

The objective of this paper is to understand the root causes behind the low influence and share of women in the development of the country since last seven decades, with the specific aim to investigate and examine the policies and steps taken during Musharraf’s Regime for the empowerment of women in Pakistan. The paper will also aim to focus to shed a comparative analysis of the share of women in the growth and development of the economy before and after Musharraf’s regime.

**Review of Literature**

In order to analyze the scenario of women’s empowerment around the world and in Pakistan, and to examine the policies implemented by previous governments of Pakistan to eradicate gender biasness, it is necessary to extensively review the literature available in the field of women empowerment and women's rights around the world.

The review literature is divided into two parts, the first part includes the researches on women empowerment and women’s rights around the world. While the second part
includes the literature available on the policies and strategies implemented in Pakistan for the development of a nation without gender disparity.

On the historical evidences of women rights and women liberalization, (O'Pry, 2012) compared the women of Athens and Sparta on the basis of their freedom and rights. He mentions in his research that these ancient entities can be differentiated on the basis of their treatment toward their offsprings. He writes that both gender children were equally important to Spartans whereas male children were given more importance in Athens’ civilization. He makes a point that a very few historical evidences are available on female’s participation in different activities. However, it is probable that the females of ancient times held opinions as worthy and strong as men did but were never given a chance to voice their ideas.

Rehman, et al., (2013) emphasizes more on gender empowerment than women empowerment alone. He holds a view that men in third world countries are also weak and need help in this regard.

Dr. Varghese T., (2011) have conducted a similar research in Sohar region, Oman by collecting sample of 150 women, the findings suggest that women in Oman are performing better in household decision making than social empowerment. The author also recommends that strengthening of the legal system to guarantee equal rights and opportunities for everyone can help empower women in Oman.

Chaudhry, et al., (2012) studied the women empowerment in Pakistan with a different aspect. The study explains the concept of women empowerment with respect to Islamic teachings and ideologies. The authors did an empirical study using the data from southern Punjab with the aim to remove the misleading ideologies related to the suppression of women in Islam. The results of the study suggest that years of education of women, working opportunities, education index of the household, access to basic health facilities all have a significant impact.

Kohm & Holmes, (2000) wrote in their article that the prior efforts made to claim the women’s rights caused positive outcomes in generating opportunities for women and also had positive impacts on human rights indicators. She continues to write that, later on, this effort on claiming women’s rights deemed on emphasizing some important privileges by activists that are crucial in deciding the fate of women. She is of the opinion that the women’s rights movement that was once started for noble causes remained in vain due to conflict of interest and impurity of intentions.

Mason & Smith, (2003) specifically analyzed the situation of married women and progress of empowerment of women in the developing countries of the Asian Continent.
The results suggest that the gender relations (specially relationship of a husband and wife) is significantly influenced by the values, norms and cultures of the observed countries. The authors recommend that increase in minimum age of female for marriage, education etc can play a vital role in changing the mindset of the society.

Gupta & Yesudian, (2006) discussed and concluded on the basis of empirical findings that in India 43% of the total female population have a high autonomy in household matters. The results also suggest that only 43% of women in India defy domestic violence while 40% have no gender preference attitude. It is the increased and improved availability of education for females around the world which has affected the conventional norms of suppressing women and male dominance in India.

Chaudhry et al., (2012) analyzed different approaches about women empowerment in Pakistan specifically. Using the data from 1996 to 2009, the authors examined how much impact and influence women’s own consciousness about their empowerment can create. The results suggest that women’s own consciousness about their empowerment, their economic and overall development all have a positive significant impact on the empowerment of women in Pakistan, which was measured by Gender Empowerment Measure (GEM) index. The authors also recommend to empower women economically through providing home based/ small business opportunities and increasing their role and share in decision making on different levels.

The second half of the literature consist extensive review of the available articles on the policies and laws related to women and women’s empowerment in Pakistan.

Weiss, (1999) argued that women has to organized themselves into groups with a political purpose, the analysis suggests the is required to make essential advancement in the making of a civil society in Pakistan which is viable and tolerant to have male and female equally participating in the society.

Weiss, (2003) critically analyzed the role of Pakistan at the United Nations' Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) and how the government should act to eradicate gender discrimination not only in the social sense but also in legal sense. The author also argued that it is the need of time to remove the misleading concepts and transform the prevailing wrong Islamic interpretations of women's legal rights while complying to the requirements of CEDAW.

Khan, S., (2003) analyzed the Zina Ordinance and other laws and Regulations by collecting primary information through interviewing women from different areas of Pakistan. Her research and analysis suggest that economic development, human rights, globalization and the continuing costs of militarization due to war against terrorism all
are connected. The author recommends to create an environment that will bring about the repeal of the laws while contributing to trans-national female solidarity.

Imran (2005) examines the trend of sexual violence against women in Pakistan while specifically the rape cases and the governmental legislation control it. The author concluded that the gender discriminatory nature of these laws serves as a harmful weapon in the hands of the patriarchal mindset of our society and recommended to take steps to initiate, involve and build the opposition and struggle for the oppose the laws against gender discriminatory.

Qadri & Umer (2015) examined the changes and improvement in the women’s rights policies and activities in Musharraf’s regime. As during the time period from 1999 to 2008, Pakistan went through many social and structural reforms which helped strengthen the country and improve its image in the international world. The decisions and policy amendments done during the Parvez Musharraf’s regime related to the empowerment of women and the eradication of gender inequality are noteworthy achievements. But it is also important to realize the importance of women in the society and generating a better mechanism for the protection of women’s rights in the country to gain fruitful results in long-run.

Lau (2007) reviews and analyzed the Hudood Ordinance Act and specifically the law against the Offense of Zina. The author suggest that there existed many misleading concepts and clauses added in the Hudood Ordinance on the name of Islam, which later amended to design a law which weakened the inequities of Zina Ordinance while keeping and maintaining the Islamic laws conformity.

Zia (2009) refer the era of Pervez Musharraf as era with several sociological changes in the country and discussed the Islamic and secular identity with reference to understandings and paradoxes of politics in the Pakistani women.

Bari (2010) specifically analyzed the performance of women parliamentarians in Pakistan. It is recommended by the author that association of female legislators with the women rights movements and networking for collective voice can be identified as a milestones in the pathway to women’s political empowerment.

Qadri et al., (2015) again studied and argued that policies for women empowerment in Musharaf’s regime and concluded that there exist potential in the existing policies and laws to eradicate the gender disparity from the country. It is also recommended that despite there are potential policies, lack of political will, and inconsistency in the efforts, the policies have not been enough to provide the anticipated fruitful results.
Methodology

The methodology incorporates an extensive reading of existing literature as well as observation on the evolution of women’s rights around the world, with special emphasis on the women empowerment and gender equality in the political context of Pakistan.

For the said purpose, extensive and essential discussion has been made on the political history of Pakistan and how Pakistan has emerged itself as an state working for the eradication of gender discrimination. In order to analyze the aforementioned scenarios and to examine the affects and efficiency of policies and amendments in women rights law taken place during Musharraf’s regime, a comparative analysis has been done on the basis of available statistical data on the participation of women in decision making and economic development of the country.

Politics and Women Empowerment in Pakistan

History and literature make it evident to analyze the favorable and unfavorable eras in the social and political history of Pakistan in term of women’s empowerment in the economy. General Zia ul Haq’s political regime can be considered as the most unfavorable regime for women’s rights in Pakistan. In the Islamization era of General Zia UL Haq in the year 1979, the country’s traditions discouraged women to make their careers and limiting their activities as an individual part of the society. In the Zia’s regime, women had faced many problems and mostly their rights were suppressed in the name of Islam. It was the era when females in the country were not considered as an important part of the society and their due share in the development of the nation was totally neglected. The country had faced a lot of hurdles in developing the appropriate policies for women’s right and to empower women in the society in accordance with the cultural definitions and religious attributes. In almost all policies and legislations done in that era, whether the legal or political structure, women suffered the inequality and injustice in comparison of men. One of another outcome of such policies and mindset of the state was the building of male dominant society, which later became another hurdle in the process of gender equality and women’s rights and share in the economy.

On the other hand, looking at the history of Pakistan from a bird’s eye view, and how the role of women in the society has become more prominent and evident in the past few years, the era of General Parvez Musharraf is considered as the liberal administration under a military dictator. Structural changes, liberalization of media, war against terrorism, improved performance of Educational system, devolution of power, amendments in the Hadood laws and change in policies about the share and seats of women in parliaments, etc., are few of the noteworthy achievement and influencing reforms that helped in building a new and positive image of Pakistan globally (Yilmaz,
According to United Nations, the HDI has reached up to approximately 2.7% which was higher than the past and preceding statistics of other governments. Same as the many other social and cultural aspects in the country, during the regime of General Pervaiz Musharraf, the procedure to enlighten and empowering females had begun with the full power.

**History of Women’s Right in Pakistan**

After seventy years of struggle, like many other issues, rights for women in Pakistan is still a major issue which is being a root cause for lesser woman participation in the social and economic development of the country. According to Human Development Report, Pakistan has been rated among the poorest (0.179 while the average index was 0.226) among the other South Asian countries on the Gender Development Index (GDI) (Chaudhry I. S., 2007). Women rights and aim to increase the share of women in the economic development of the country have been an important part of policy making by almost every government in last seven decades. Some governments succeeded to achieve their goals, while most of them showed and proved their keen interest to empower women only on paper. Quaid-e-Azam had the aim to empower women in the country as he always accepted the importance of women in building a strong nation. But due to his short time span after independence, his aim could not flourish fully during his era. After the demise of Quaid-e-Azam Pakistan faced many issues because of which aims like empowering women could not get the due importance as it needed during the post-independence era.

In the year 1948 UNDHR, the universal declaration of the human rights was presented and accepted by the United Nation Organization. It was the very first case where the woman's presence was the obvious at the vanguard of the international scene. It was primarily the first declaration which was signed by Pakistan, according to which the government of Pakistan was liable to accept all the declaration and resolutions passed by UNDHR related to human rights for any gender. Pakistan also showed interest in fulfilling the regulations and commitments purposed by UNO. The journey toward a country without discrimination on the basis of gender, and struggle to maintain equal rights for women almost stopped during the Islamization of General Zia ul Haq’s regime. It was the era when women in the country were suppressed and neglected in the society on the name of misleading Islamic ideologies. Islam is considered as a religion of balance. Islam seeks and encourages the balance in people and the society as a whole. Any sort of disturbance that would create imbalance in society and for individual is considers in just and unfair in Islam. To show the importance of gender equality Allah (SWT) in the holy Quran, addresses both men and women in several verses (Chaudhary & Nosheen, 2009). During their era, the Zia government supported the culture of suppressing women and maintaining a male dominant society in the name of Islam. In all the reforms and policy
making, women suffered high inequality as compared to men in every field of life. In the year 1979 the country also witnessed the development of the Women’s Division, basically the pioneer to the delegate of the Ministry of Women’s Development of the country. But this institution, due to lack of internal debates and discussions, presented the highly observed ideas regarding the women’s rights in Pakistan (Qadri & Umer, 2015). This development had increased the contradictions in the country regarding the rights of country women. The basic disagreement was about determining the acceptable roles and rights for females for different areas which indicated the need of in depth and enormous debate on the topic. Due to the lack of will, the women’s division could not do much in practice for the empowerment and rights of women in the country. As soon as Zia’s regime over, the discriminatory laws were disseminated. The process of enlightening women’s role in the country and bringing gender equality started again with reconciliations with all the stakeholders in the country. However, it was clearly understood that it will be a long journey to build a safe and equal state for females, while fighting the misconceptions about Islam regarding role and share of women and to bring change in the cultural and traditional mindsets of the society.

In the year 1995, the fourth world conference, Beijing Platform for Action held in Beijing. Pakistan also participated in this conference. After attending this conference, Pakistan approved and created the National Plan of Action for the consultation and involvement of the civil society (GoP, 2012). Pakistan also approved the ‘Forward looking Strategies for the Advancement of women’ (FLSAW) in the year 1985 in Nairobi (Dawn News, 2011). One of the most important decisions was to accept and regulate The Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) in Pakistan. The main purpose of this commission was to protect equal political, social, economic, educational, and employment rights for women throughout the world (GoP, 2012). As explained earlier, most of the policies and strategies to eradicate discrimination against women fail to be applied with full interest and intention. During the regimes of Mohatarma Benazir Bhutto and Mian Muhammad Nawaz Shareef, none of the government succeeded to submit a single report to CEDAW.

Women’s Rights in Musharraf’s Regime

General (R) Parvez Musharraf took hold of the state in October 1999 and resigned in August 2008. During his almost eight years of rule and governance, Pakistan enjoyed many impeccable structural and policy reforms which helped the country to grow economically and improved Pakistan’s image globally. Musharraf put policy measures for the betterment of education system in Pakistan, started the war against terrorism, provided a liberalized platform for print and electronic media and flourished and decentralized the power and governance to the lower levels of governments. Among all these noteworthy achievements, the government of Musharraf also expressed full interest in the empowerment of women and development of an equal state for men and women.
To secure social status of women and increase their rights and share in the economic activities in the country, several amendments were made in unfair laws and regulations. However, such amendments were not able to eradicate the discrimination against females completely, but provided a strong roadmap toward a better and equal state.

Gender reform action plan and IT programs were some of the noticeable results achieved through National Policy for Development and Empowerment of Women (2002) (Qadri & Umer, 2015). In the National Assembly 20% seats were reserved for women and 18% in the Senate, were some of the important achievements towards the increasing role of women in the local and national decision making.

Late General Zia made changes in Hadood laws, the male misogynists were mainly responsible for these changes (Jahangir & Jilani, 1990). Under these amendments, instead of punishing the rapists, the laws were molded to be used against the victims as in some cases, pleading them for committing crime as adultery (Dawn News, 2006). However, many inquiries done in different times suggested that there is a serious need to start the debate on these to make further required amendments in Hadood Ordinance to protect women from the social unjust and insult (Zahoor & Afridi, 2014) (Goonesekere, 2004).

In the year 2004, the Musharraf’s government submitted the very first report to C.E.D.A.W with the intention for the better planning under C. E. D. A. W and making policies and legislation to eradicate discrimination against women. The Honor Killing Billing (Criminal Law regarding honor killing) was passed in 2004 which clearly stated honor killing a crime, punishable by the court of law (Madaik, 2005). It all happened for improved understanding and planning under CEDAW that Criminal Amendment Act 2004 was endorsed (CEDAW, 2007). The Women Protection Act was passed in 2006, which provided a secure and just environment for women to work in the society. The act was passed with the objective to protect women from harassment on workplaces. During Musharraf’s regime, another major step was taken toward an women empowered society by placing rape laws under the penal code. The objective of this historic decision was to provide rape victims justice without being blamed for the act. Presidential Ordinance (2006) permitted safeguard for ladies convicted on all charges except terrorism and murder (Qadri & Umer, 2015). The formation and restructuring of the ministry of women’s development, the development of the National Commission on the Status of Women in 2000 and formation of the First Woman Bank were one of the steps taken by the Musharraf’s government in the process of empowering women in the country (CEDAW, 2007).

After Affects of Musharraf’s Policies

Parvez Musharraf’s era of governance brought many changes in the laws and regulation related to women rights and empowerment of female in the country. The effect and influence of those amendments and decisions could be seen through the available statistical evidence from 2000 to this date.
Table I shows the data of the female population (as percentage of total population), female labor force participation rate and percentage of female school enrollment in the country. The data show the noteworthy improvement in female labor force participation and female school enrolment 1995 to 2014. Such statistics prove the success of policy decisions taken during Musharraf’s Regime for the empowerment of women in Pakistan. Highly increased female school enrolment rate shows how almost 85% of the female population are enrolled in schools, proving the availability and easy access to education for females in the country. Almost 25% of female labour force participation is a true evidence of the increasing empowerment of women in the country, and shows how the policies regarding work place harassment implemented during Musharraf’s regime have played an influential role in the increased share of women in the growth and development of the country.

Table I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Population, female (% of total)</th>
<th>Labor force participation rate, female (% of female population ages 15+) (national estimate)</th>
<th>School enrollment, primary, female (% gross)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>48.16436684</td>
<td>11.30000019</td>
<td>40.45981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>48.32231508</td>
<td>12.69999981</td>
<td>46.29097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>48.40548084</td>
<td>16.29999924</td>
<td>59.53671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>48.41618587</td>
<td>16.2447394</td>
<td>60.20979</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>48.42552296</td>
<td>16.20000076</td>
<td>60.99193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>48.43560539</td>
<td></td>
<td>65.50591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>48.44899468</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>70.11277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>48.4671101</td>
<td>19.46383402</td>
<td>76.26907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>48.49058761</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>74.75929</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>48.51806816</td>
<td>21.29999924</td>
<td>82.59632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>48.54656878</td>
<td>21.79999924</td>
<td>84.03872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>48.5722445</td>
<td>23.10000038</td>
<td>86.29201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>48.59257066</td>
<td>24.20000076</td>
<td>87.80067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>48.60702257</td>
<td>24.39999962</td>
<td>84.679</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>48.6166504</td>
<td>24.39999972</td>
<td>84.80677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>48.62255116</td>
<td>24.29999924</td>
<td>83.22106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>48.62632505</td>
<td>24.48269433</td>
<td>85.81017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: World Bank Data Bank 2017

Figure I

Employment to population ratio, female (%)

Source: Data Collected From World Bank Data Bank 2017
As with increasing wave of women empowerment in the country since Musharraf’s era of governance, huge improvement in many social and economic indicators (related to female) can be analyzed through the statistics. Figure I shows the female employment to population ratio in the country, this indicator shows the proportion of a country’s female population that is employed (ages 15-24 are generally considered the youth population). Female employment to population ratio have increased impressively from only 7% in 2000 to almost 20% in 2014. The policies related to work place harassments passed during Musharraf’s regime are the root cause behind this successful increase, which improved the worked environment and encouraged women to work with men in every field. The same effects can be seen in Table II, by analyzing the percentage of female employment in three main sectors of he economy i.e. agriculture, industry and services.

### Table II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment in agriculture, female (%)</td>
<td>67.40000153</td>
<td>72.90000153</td>
<td>67.30000305</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment in industry, female (%)</td>
<td>10.69999981</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14.39999962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment in services, female (%)</td>
<td>21.89999962</td>
<td>18.10000038</td>
<td>17.60000038</td>
<td>11.69999981</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: World Bank DataBank 2017

The share of women in the national and economic decision making is also very important to maintain an undiscriminatory state on the basis of gender (Shah, Aziz, & Ahmad, 2015). Figure II shows the percentage of seats held by females in the national assembly of Pakistan, which has been doubled since the time Musharraf’s era of governance. All these facts and statistics prove the positive impact and changes created by the policies. Amendments done in laws during Parvez Musharraf’s regime to helped to eradicate discrimination against women and allowed them to have equal rights and share in the economy as men.

### Figure II

**Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments (%)**

Source: World Bank DataBank 2017
Conclusions

As women are almost 50% of the total population of Pakistan, their importance and influence on the society can no longer be neglected. Pakistan since its independence has been fighting with many social and cultural stigmas which are being the hurdles in the growth and development of the country. After the demise of Quaid-e-azam, many preceding governments tried to make and implement policies to fulfill the dream to create an equal state for all, irrespective of religion, caste or gender. But like many other policies, laws and policies related to women’s rights have also failed to eradicate or even reduce discrimination against females in the country. The roots of unjust rights for women in Pakistan gained strength during General Zia-ul-Haq’s regime. The regime of Zia-ul-Haq used wrong and misleading concepts about how Islam supports suppression of women, which lead to the building of a male dominant society. Soon after the end of Zia’s era, the preceding governments timely understood the loopholes in the policies related to the empowerments and the rights of women and took initiatives for the betterment of the status of women in Pakistan (Qadri & Umer, 2015). The most and noteworthy efforts were done during another autocratic regime, during General Parvez Musharraf’s era of governance. During the eight year span of time, many rules and amendments were passed which were aimed to increase the rights, role and participation of women in the economy. The amendments in the laws about workplace harassment cleansed the professional atmosphere for females and provided them a safe and fair environment for work on gender equality basis in different public and private sector industries. The amendments in rape and honor killing laws with the objective to provide rape victims some hope of justice. And lastly, the increased share of females in the national and provincial assemblies also encouraged women to participate in active decision making in the country. Though it is a bitter truth that even after seventy years of independence, Pakistan still cannot be called a state that has uniform rights for both men and women, but it is also important to realize and appreciate the efforts of policy makers to change the mindset of the country toward the status and significance of women in the development of Pakistan. The most critical aspect of women empowerment is the legal empowerment, which guarantees protection of social, cultural and economic rights of women in terms of justice, property rights, employment rights, safety and protection rights. Many governmental and non-governmental organizations (N.G.Os) have been playing their vital roles to fight out the discrimination against women in Pakistan and to get equal rights for men and women in the country. The women today, are also striving hard to protect their rights through performance of the laws (Khan R. E., 2012) (Raja, 2010), but there is still adequate legislation available and required for the protection of women’s rights in the country. At the end, it is concluded that women empowerment which is declared as Millennium Development Goal by UNDP could be achieved only when all concerned bodies will work in cooperation with understanding women’s capabilities and their contributions to the development process.

Policy Recommendations

It is now a dire need of time that law enforcement agencies are required to revise the laws and regulations. The women lack confidence upon justice system, and hence laws and
law providers are required to make the system safe and easily approachable for women. The linkages of women’s legislators with the women’s movement and networking for capacity enhancement can play toward the pathway to women’s political, social and legal empowerment.

The better implementation of the mechanism is also required for the protection of women’s rights and to make them legally empowered to become more active member of the society and playing their due vital role in the development of this country (Khan R. E., 2012) (Raja, 2010). At the end, the authors recommends that the government in coordination with society must work jointly for the betterment of fifty percent population of the country. To empower them by creating an environment where they can attain and avail the opportunities, security and their due stake in the economy which will not only empower the women in the country, but will be the initial steps in the development of a fair, honest and prosperous society.

References


An Analysis of Women Empowerment in Pakistan with Reference to Musharraf’s Regime


__________________________

**Dr. Suwaibah Qadri** is Visiting Faculty in Iqra University, Karachi.

**Sidrah Gilani** is M.Phil. Scholar in the Department of Economics, University of Karachi.

**Paras Khurram** is M.Phil. Scholar in the Department of International Relations, University of Karachi.
Call for Papers

Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies
Publication of the Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies
University of Karachi

Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies is launched under the patronage of Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Vice Chancellor University of Karachi by the Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies, University of Karachi. Main objective of the Journal is to generate and disseminate knowledge regarding gender issues nationally and internationally with a critical perspective. Its aim is to promote consciousness and awareness about gender equity and balance in human interaction including academic work. In this regard, the journal explores what is meant by gender needs and gender perspective and how these can be best met. This publication in currently published only in English language however, in view of our national needs, the abstract is translated in urdu as well. Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies is indexed in EBSCO. It is recognized by Higher Education Commission (HEC) in ‘Y’ category.

The Journal Would Publish

- Interdisciplinary research in the field of Gender Studies.
- Research on curricula, course outline, reading list and teaching strategies related to Gender Studies.
- Review of books, film and theatrical performances.
- Reports on National and International conferences, symposia and workshops etc. on Gender Studies.

Guidelines for Submissions

- Submissions are invited in English language.
- Two copies of the manuscripts, single-spaced, and printed on one side only should be submitted on A4 size paper.
- A soft copy of the paper on CD or through e-mail should also be sent.
- Title page of the paper should be typed separately and should include the author’s name, full mailing address, phone number and email address.
- The length of the paper should be between 3500 to 5000 in words.
- Introduction should be at least two pages and review of literature of minimum 3 pages.
- Paper must have at least 32 to 35 references of books and research papers published in journals.
- Conclusions and Recommendations must be mention in separate headings.
- An abstract of the paper no more than 200 words must be submitted along with the paper. The abstract should be followed by key words. Abstract and Keywords must be in English and Urdu both.
- The papers should include references (endnotes) and bibliography.
- Authors are responsible for creating graphs, tables, and charts, if required in their paper.
- Authors are required to submit a signed covering letter stating that the paper has not been published earlier or has not been submitted for the purpose of publication to any other journal or volume. Authors are solely responsible for the factual accuracy for their contributions.

Citations and References

- Notes and references should follow APA style for citation. Some examples are as follows:

Web page:


Contact address:

Professor Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah
Director, Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies & Editor, Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies
University of Karachi
Phone: 92-21-99261654
E-mail: cewsku@yahoo.com
Last date for submission: 31st October, 2018
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title of the publication</th>
<th>Name of the author</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Stafi Khwateen</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah, Dr. Asma Manzoor, Seema Manzoor</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi &amp; Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>The Ageing Home-Based Women-Workers in Karachi</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Higher Education Commission, Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Department of Social Work University of Karachi, &amp; Anjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Women Issues: Analytical Researches</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Bridging the Gaps: Research at the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah (compiled and edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, Andjuman Taraqqi-e-Niswan and University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies Volume: 1 – 17 8 March, 2008 onwards</td>
<td>Patron: Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ajmal Khan, Vice Chancellor, University of Karachi Editor: Prof. Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Female Home-Based Workers: The Silent Workforce.</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Khalida Ghaus (edited)</td>
<td>ILO and Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Literacy for the Girl of Today, the Woman of Tomorrow.</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Tahera Aftab (edited)</td>
<td>Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies, University of Karachi.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>